

**MINISTRY OF CONSTRUCTION AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT  
ULAANBAATAR CITY GOVERNMENT**

**IMPROVEMENT FOR PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION SKILLS OF  
ULAANBAATAR MASTER PLAN, SUB-PROJECT 2**

**THE SECOND PHASE OF PROJECT ON CAPACITY  
DEVELOPMENT IN URBAN DEVELOPMENT SECTOR  
IN MONGOLIA (MUGCUP2)**

**PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT  
(THE SECOND YEAR)**

**JANUARY 2019**

**JAPAN INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION AGENCY (JICA)**

**ALMEC CORPORATION  
TAMANO CONSULTANTS CO., LTD.  
ORIENTAL CONSULTANTS GLOBAL CO., LTD.**

<b>EI</b>
<b>JR</b>
<b>19-007</b>

**MINISTRY OF CONSTRUCTION AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT  
ULAANBAATAR CITY GOVERNMENT**

**IMPROVEMENT FOR PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION SKILLS OF  
ULAANBAATAR MASTER PLAN, SUB-PROJECT 2**

**THE SECOND PHASE OF PROJECT ON CAPACITY  
DEVELOPMENT IN URBAN DEVELOPMENT SECTOR  
IN MONGOLIA (MUGCUP2)**

**PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT  
(THE SECOND YEAR)**

**JANUARY 2019**

**JAPAN INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION AGENCY (JICA)**

**ALMEC CORPORATION  
TAMANO CONSULTANTS CO., LTD.  
ORIENTAL CONSULTANTS GLOBAL CO., LTD.**

Exchange Rate

Currency	Rate
U.S. Dollar (USD1 = ¥)	113.385
Mongolian Tugrik (MNT1 = ¥)	0.04377

(JICA Exchange rate on December 2018)

# Table of Contents

- I. Basic Information of the Project ..... 1
  - 1. Country ..... 1
  - 2. Title of the Project ..... 1
  - 3. Duration of the Project (Planned and Actual) ..... 1
  - 4. Background (from Record of Discussions(R/D)) ..... 1
  - 5. Overall Goal and Project Purpose (from Record of Discussions(R/D)) ..... 2
  - 6. Implementing Agency ..... 2
- II. Results of the Project ..... 3
  - 1. Results of the Project ..... 3
  - 2. Achievements of the Project ..... 7
  - 3. History of PDM Modification ..... 11
  - 4. Others ..... 12
- III. Results of Joint Review ..... 12
  - 1. Results of Review based on the DAC Evaluation Criteria ..... 12
  - 2. Key Factors Affecting Implementation and Outcomes ..... 16
  - 3. Evaluation on the results of the Project Risk Management ..... 19
  - 4. Lessons Learnt ..... 20
- IV. For the Achievement of Overall Goals after the Project Completion ..... 22
  - 1. Prospects to achieve the Overall Goal ..... 22
  - 2. Plan of Operation and Implementation Structure of the Mongolian side to achieve Overall Goal ..... 23
  - 3. Recommendations for the Mongolian side ..... 24
  - 4. Monitoring Plan from the end of the Project to Ex-post Evaluation ..... 25
  
- ANNEX 1: Results of the Project ..... 27
- ANNEX 2: List of Products (Report, Manuals, Handbooks, etc.) Produced by the Project ..... 51
- ANNEX 3: PDM (All versions of PDM) ..... 52

# Project Completion Report

## I. Basic Information of the Project

### 1. Country

Mongolia

### 2. Title of the Project

Project Title	Improvement for planning and implementation skills of Ulaanbaatar master plan
Sub-project 2 Title	The Second Phase of Project on Capacity Development in Urban Development Sector in Mongolia (MUGCUP2)

### 3. Duration of the Project (Planned and Actual)

Duration	February 2015 – December 2018
----------	-------------------------------

### 4. Background (from Record of Discussions(R/D))

Ulaanbaatar City has a continually increasing population. In 1998, it has around six hundred fifty thousand (650,000); it grew to around one million three hundred twenty thousand (1,320,000) by 2012-an average annual growth rate of 5.2%.

Generally, rapid population growth leads to urban problems, and Ulaanbaatar City is no exception; housing supply in the city has lagged behind. About 183 thousand of households with 930 thousand population live in "ger" areas, residential areas without basic infrastructure and services except power supply. The city's ger areas have continuously expanded as large numbers of the nation's nomadic groups have steadily moved into the city. As a result, urban sprawl has become a concern in Ulaanbaatar. The situation is even worsened by uncontrollable air, soil, and water pollution, which is basically caused by coal used for heating and toilets without wastewater treatment.

Although Ulaanbaatar City had formulated its master plan six times since 1954 by adjusting based on actual economic and social circumstances, implementation of Ulaanbaatar's master plan was not well enough depending on political, economic, social and other factors in the last 20 years. However, the Master Plan 2020 was approved by the Parliament in February 2013. Since then, the Ulaanbaatar City Government has been trying to formulate the mid-term implementation plan of the Master Plan (MP) 2020, but it has not yet completed.

Besides, the City Government has been paying much effort to improve the ger areas by urban redevelopment (URD) as well as to reconstruct old apartments in the center area

of the city. The City Government has selected 21 projects of re-planning and development of ger area (ger-to-apartment projects), out of which 18 projects were launched by the private sector under the control of the City Government. The City Government has also been making preparation for re-organization of ger area land projects (land readjustment projects) through basic study on ger area residents' demand for improvement of their living environment. The City Government is establishing basic regulations to implement the URD projects. Furthermore, the draft Law on URD is now tabled by the Parliament. However, in spite of those efforts for URD of the city, there have been no successful urban development projects completed and no firm system and mechanism of urban development projects.

### 5. Overall Goal and Project Purpose (from Record of Discussions(R/D))

	Original Expression (R/D)	Revised Expression (The Minutes of Meeting (M/M) dated 7 Oct. 2016)
Overall Goal	Urban functions and residential environment of <u>UB</u> City are improved through planned urban development based on the <u>Ulaanbaatar City MP2020</u>	Urban functions and residential environment of <u>Ulaanbaatar (UB) City</u> are improved through planned urban development based on the <u>Ulaanbaatar 2020 Master Plan Amendment and Development Approaches for 2030 (UB MP2020) approved by the 23rd Parliament Resolution in 2013</u>
Project Purpose	Capacity of urban planning and urban development project implementation contributing to upgrading residential environment is enhanced	

### 6. Implementing Agency

Ministry of Construction and Urban Development (MCUD) (Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, Strategic Policy and Planning Department, Construction and Public Utility Policy Department, Construction Quality and Safety Operation Policy Department, Agency of Land Affairs, Geodesy and Cartography (Agency for Land Administration and Management, Geodesy and Cartography (ALAMGaC), presently), State's Housing Corporation (TOSK))

Ulaanbaatar City Government (Strategic Policy and Planning Division (Policy and Planning Division, presently), Capital City Governor's Office; Capital City Master Planning Agency (Urban Planning and Master Planning Agency, presently); Ger Area Development Department, Ger Area Housing Project Corporation (Ger Area Infrastructure Department (GAID), presently two organization merged); Property Registration Department (Land Department, presently partially separated); Road Department, Urban Planning and Architecture Design Institute (Urban Planning Design Institute (UPDI), presently), City's Housing Corporation (NOSK))

## II. Results of the Project

### 1. Results of the Project

#### 1-1 Input by the Japanese side (Planned and Actual)

Value of Input	439.73 million Japanese Yen*
Dispatch of Experts	<p>1 person (long term 7 man-month (M.M.) until September 15, 2015): Chief Adviser</p> <p>12 persons (short term 73.12 M.M. in total) (see Annex 1 (1))</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Team Leader/ Urban Redevelopment Project/ Legal System related Urban Redevelopment</li> <li>- Deputy Team Leader/ Urban Redevelopment Project/ Legal System related Urban Redevelopment</li> <li>- Urban Redevelopment Project/ Rules and Regulations</li> <li>- Land Readjustment Project</li> <li>- Infrastructure Planning/ Architect</li> <li>- Infrastructure Planning (3 persons)</li> <li>- Real Estate Evaluation Method/ Compensation</li> <li>- Project Finance/ Housing Finance Mechanism</li> <li>- Training Planning/ Advocacy Planning (2 persons)</li> <li>- Training Planning/ Advocacy Planning/ Institutional Development</li> </ul>
Acceptance of Trainees	16 persons (short-term training in Japan country)
Provision of Equipment	359,599 Japanese Yen for multi-function photo-copy machine
Field Operation Cost	15.943 million Japanese Yen* for project assistants, translation, holding seminars and training sessions, expendables, etc.

Note: \* The amount includes the ones for both Sub-projects 1 (SP1) and 2.

#### 1-2 Input by the Mongolian side (Planned and Actual)

- (a) Services of MCUD's and UB City's counterpart (C/P) personnel and administrative personnel as the members of Joint Coordination Committee and Working Groups (see details in Annex 1 (2)).
- Ministry of Construction and Urban Development (MCUD)
    - Urban Development and Land Affairs Department,
    - Strategic Policy and Planning Department,
    - Construction and Public Utility Policy Department,
    - Construction Quality and Safety Operation Policy Department,
    - ALAMGaC

- Ulaanbaatar City Government
  - Strategic Policy and Planning Division (Policy and Planning Division, presently), Capital City Governor's Office;
  - Capital City Master Planning Agency (Urban Planning and Master Planning Agency, presently);
  - Ger Area Development Department, Ger Area Housing Project Corporation (GAID, presently two organization merged);
  - Property Registration Department (Land Department, presently partially separated);
  - Road Department,
  - UPDI
  - NOSK
- (b) Suitable office space with necessary equipment or tables
- (c) Supply of meeting rooms
- (g) Available data (including maps and photographs) and information related to the Project
- (h) Running expenses necessary for the implementation of the Project including per-diems for C/Ps to travel to aimags

### 1-3 Activities (Planned and Actual)

Original Activities (R/D)	Revised Activities (M/M dated May 25, 2018)	Status
5-1: Conduct comparative study on on-going projects and analyze issues (scheme A)	5-1: Conduct comparative study on on-going projects held in Ulaanbaatar and analyze issues (scheme A)	5-1: Clarified the target area
5-2: Review current status and achievements and analyze issues (Scheme B, C)	5-2: Review current status and achievements on other urban redevelopment projects held in Ulaanbaatar and analyze issues (Scheme B, C)	5-2: Clarified the target area
	5-3: Review current status and analyze issues on urban redevelopment projects (3 schemes) planned in Aimag level	5-3: Newly added based on the request from the MCUD because the URD law needed to be applied in the nationwide.
/	6-1: Review current status of housing market and analyze issues	6-1: Newly added to clarify the output already included.
	6-2: Analyze housing demand and supply for the medium term	6-2: Newly added, considering the over-supply housing market situation of Ulaanbaatar.
	6-3: Formulate Ulaanbaatar's housing policy for	6-3: Newly added, considering the over-supply housing



Original Activities (R/D)	Revised Activities (M/M dated May 25, 2018)	Status
	low-income households	market situation of Ulaanbaatar.
<p>6-1: Review urban redevelopment policy from the viewpoint of realization of UB MP2020 and revise the policy (if necessary) (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>6-2: Clarify costs for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects for 5 years including infrastructure cost (Scheme A, B, C)</p>	<p>7-1: (same as on the left – i.e., change in numbering only)</p> <p>7-2: Clarify costs for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects until 2020 including infrastructure cost (Scheme A, B, C)</p>	7-2: Clarified the term.
<p>7-1: Select a model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p>7-2: Formulate local unit utility plan (Scheme B)</p> <p>7-3: Support preparation of the model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p>7-4: Support implementation of the model project(s) (Scheme B)</p>	<p>8-1: (same as on the left – i.e., change in numbering only)</p> <p>8-2: (same as on the left – i.e., change in numbering only)</p> <p>8-3: (same as on the left – i.e., change in numbering only)</p> <p>Deleted</p>	Was deleted because the model project sites were selected in the June 8 2017 JCC and no time to reach to the stage of project implementation.
<p>8-1: Draft relating rules for the operation of urban redevelopment law</p> <p>8-2: Formulation or revise UB city's rules and standards necessary for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>8-3: Develop implementation handbooks of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>8-4: Standardize project</p>	<p>9-1: Draft relating norms, standards, rules and regulations for the operation of urban redevelopment law</p> <p>9-2: Provide advice for amending the draft Urban Development Law</p> <p>9-3: Provide advice on Urban Redevelopment Law to be approved by the Parliament</p> <p>Deleted</p> <p>9-4: Provide advice for implementation of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, C)</p> <p>9-5: (same as on the left – i.e., change in numbering only)</p> <p>Deleted</p>	<p>9-1: Changed terminology.</p> <p>9-2: Newly added based on the request from the MCUD.</p> <p>9-3: Newly added based on the request from the MCUD.</p> <p>Was deleted because not suit the situation</p> <p>9-4: Newly added to clarified the outputs already included.</p> <p>Was deleted because not suit the</p>

Original Activities (R/D)	Revised Activities (M/M dated May 25, 2018)	Status
planning and project execution (Scheme A, B, C) 8-5: Propose promotion measures for sales and purchase of properties developed by urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)	Deleted	situation.  Was deleted because not suit the situation.
9-3: Establish a method of citizen participation in urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C) 9-4: Formulate PR tools of urban redevelopment projects for promoting public understanding (Scheme A, B, C) 9-5: Disseminate urban redevelopment policy to public (Scheme A, B, C)	10-3: (same as on the left– i.e., change in numbering only) 10-4: (same as on the left– i.e., change in numbering only) 10-5: (same as on the left– i.e., change in numbering only)	
10-3: Analyze the current status and issues regarding the implementation capacity of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C) 10-4: Conduct a survey of citizen satisfaction level as to UB city administrative services 10-5: Propose the improvement of the organization structure of UB city and government organizations concerned (including the implementation structure of urban redevelopment projects) 10-7: Implement training programs in UB city about Urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C) 10-8: Implement training programs in Japan about urban redevelopment (one time)	11-3: (same as on the left– i.e., change in numbering only) 11-4: (same as on the left– i.e., change in numbering only) 11-5: (same as on the left– i.e., change in numbering only) 11-7: (same as on the left– i.e., change in numbering only) 11-8: (same as on the left– i.e., change in numbering only) 11-9: Prepare training course content on urban redevelopment. 11-10: Provide training for trainers on urban redevelopment.	11-9: Newly added based on the needs of capacity building to be able to implement URD projects as alternatives of the model project. 11-10: Newly added based on the needs of capacity building

Original Activities (R/D)	Revised Activities (M/M dated May 25, 2018)	Status
		to be able to implement URD projects as alternatives of the model project.

Note: 1. Activities other than the above belong to SP1.

2. Scheme A: Re-planning and development of ger area, Scheme B: Re-organization of ger area land project, Scheme C: Old apartment reconstruction project

## 2. Achievements of the Project

### 2-1 Outputs and indicators

Outputs	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Achieved Values
5: The current status and issues regarding urban redevelopment projects (3 schemes) are clarified.	Current status and issues regarding urban redevelopment projects	Achieved. 5-1: Analyzed issues of ger-to-apartment projects conducted in the city through interview from the ger area development department of the Ulaanbaatar government and project implementation bodies, the conducted study on satisfaction of the target area residents, and site visits. 5-2: Reviewed project implementation status and analyzed issues of land readjustment (LR) and old-apartment reconstruction (OA) projects from the ger area development department and master plan (MP) agency of the Ulaanbaatar government and site visits. 5.3: Visited aimag centers of Choir in Govisumber, Darkhan in Darkhan-Uul, and Erdenet of Orkhon with the C/Ps, and reviewed current status and analyzed issues on three urban development schemes through interviews from aimag officials, a project implementation body and site visits.
6: Ulaanbaatar's housing policy for low-income households is formulated. (Sub-project 2)	Ulaanbaatar's Housing policy for low-income households is formulated	Achieved. 6-1: Reviewed status of housing market and analyzed issues through literature review, interviews from real-estate companies, and the conducted study of housing market in Ulaanbaatar. 6-2: Analyzed housing demand and supply through the conducted study of housing market in Ulaanbaatar. 6-3: Formulated Ulaanbaatar's housing policy for low-income households (LIH), named UB's housing and infrastructure development sub-program, with NOSK (City's housing corporation). This was approved by the City Council on February 27, 2018.
7: Ulaanbaatar's urban redevelopment	Ulaanbaatar's urban redevelopment policy and	Achieved. 7-1: Reviewed URD policy in UB MP 2020 and

Outputs	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Achieved Values
policy and medium-term implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 2)	medium-term implementation plan is formulated	discussed the policy with the Ger Infrastructure Development Agency (GAID) of the Ulaanbaatar City government. 7-2: The GAID and the Master Plan agency prepared the cost for URD projects for five years as part of Ulaanbaatar's housing policy for LIH with NOSK.
8: Re-organization of ger area land project(s) is(are) promoted through model project(s). (Sub-project 2)	Project plan of re-organization of ger area land model project(s) is prepared	Partially achieved because Activity 8-3 of preparation of the model projects was stopped. The possibility to achieve this output is low unfortunately. 8-1: Two model project sites of Chingertei 7 <sup>th</sup> Khoroo (Ch7) and Sukhbaatar 18 <sup>th</sup> Khoroo (SB18) were selected in the sixth JCC meeting in June 2017. 8-2: Since the city government has proposed and has been constructing the infrastructure service center (SC), local unit utility plans have been formulated for Ch7 and SB18, led by the GAID. 8-3: MUGCUP2 team supported to prepare the draft project plan and replotting plan. However, the activity has stopped. The reason is that the city has not proposed the project site boundaries of Ch7 and SB18 to the city council for their approval and that the LR project has not been properly explained to the residents of the model project sites. On the other hand, MUGCUP2 proposed the housing policy for LIH to promote LR projects. The MCUD started to discuss it to realize.
9. Implementation methodologies of urban redevelopment projects are established	Seven rules and regulations of the Urban Redevelopment Law is approved Handbook for urban redevelopment project is prepared	Achieved. Six rules and regulations related the URD law got approval, but the rule and regulation on LR project process and the handbook for practitioners on URD have not been finalized yet. However, the possibility to achieve this output is high. The handbook for practitioners will be finalized by the end of the project, and the last rule and regulation of land readjustment process is drafted and expected to get the Minister's approval shortly. 9-1: Six out of seven rules and regulations are in force. These rules and regulations are as follows: 1) selection of project area (Minister's decree No.84 on May 11 2016); 2) tripartite contract agreement (Minister's decree No.125 on July 5 2016); 3) process of ger-to-apartment project (Minister's decree No. 126 on June 30 2016); 4) process of OA (Minister's decree on July 5 2016); 5) compensation (Cabinet Order No. 222 on July 9 2018); and

Outputs	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Achieved Values
		<p>6) land contribution (approved by the Cabinet and waiting for finalization). The first draft of the last one for process of LR project was prepared.</p> <p>9-2: The MCUD has prepared the draft Urban Development (UD) Law and comments were provided by the MUGCUP2 team. However, the further discussion has not been held.</p> <p>9-3: MUGCUP2 team provided advice for the process and the URD Law was approved by the Parliament on June 26, 2016.</p> <p>9-4: Provided advice for implementation of URD projects based on needs from C/Ps of the MCUD and the city government, such as monitoring, and for preparation of rules and regulations on the process of monitoring of ger-to-apartment and OA projects (Scheme A, C)</p> <p>9-5: Developing implementation handbooks of URD projects for practitioners through training working group (WG).</p>
<p>10. Citizen participation and provision of information to the public are promoted.</p>	<p>(1) The number of opportunities that PR tools of urban development projects are used</p> <p>(2) The number of PR tools distributed</p> <p>(3) The level of understanding of target households on re-organization of ger area land project</p>	<p>Achieved.</p> <p>10-3: Indicated a method of citizen participation into the handbook of URD project. However, it was not applied in implementation of the model project, so Indicator 3 was not applicable.</p> <p>10-4: Four PR tools of movie and pamphlet were prepared for: 1) introduction of URD law; 2) OA project; 3) ger-to-apartment project; and 4) LR project. The PR tool of introduction was uploaded on the websites of city government, MP agency and the GAID for public. The movie of old apartment reconstruction project was uploaded on the website of MP agency. As for pamphlet, approximately 900 introduction versions were distributed various training for professionals, aimag officials, and residents, and for old apartment reconstruction project version, approximately 250 were distributed to residents. As for ger-to-apartment and LR projects' pamphlets and movies were newly prepared so no distribution was done.</p> <p>10-5: The formulated UB's URD policy as part of UB's housing and infrastructure development sub-program was put in the city's website.</p>
<p>11: Capacity for the formulation and promotion of the implementation of urban redevelopment projects is enhanced.</p>	<p>(1) Improvement of urban redevelopment project's implementation capacity based on self-evaluation</p> <p>(2) Training course content for urban redevelopment</p> <p>(3) The number of trainers</p>	<p>Achieved.</p> <p>11-3: Collected information on the current status from C/Ps and analyzed issues regarding the implementation capacity of URD projects.</p> <p>11-4: Satisfaction survey among residents involved in ger area apartment development projects was conducted.</p> <p>11-5: Proposed the improvement of the</p>

Outputs	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Achieved Values
		<p>organization structure of the GAID of UB city for implementation of ger-to-apartment and LR projects.</p> <p>11-7: Conducted five training programs in UB city about URD projects, focusing on LR project. Total 304 officials from the national, aimag, and city level received the certificates. Besides, in total 12 training sessions were conducted on LR as part of OJT for the model projects for officials of the Ger Area Housing Project Corporation and the GAID. However, many officials who were training in the Ger Area Housing Project Corporation changed after 2016 election, as well as officials of the GAID who were trained.</p> <p>11-8: Conducted training program in Japan in February 2017 and total 16 participants joined from the MCUD, ALAMGaC, the city, and UPDI. The result of the questionnaire after the training showed positive reactions that the participants deepened their understanding on the URD projects in Japan and housing policy for low-income households.</p> <p>11-9: Prepared training course contents and became a part of state's specialist certificate courses, conducted by the Union of Mongolian Architects.</p> <p>11-10: Provided training of trainers on URD through the training working group through preparation of the handbook for practitioners and PR tools and conduct of practice training. 17 people received the certificate for completion of the practice training.</p>

Note: Outputs other than the above belong to SP1.

## 2-2 Project Purpose and Indicators

The “capacity of urban planning and urban development project implementation contributing to upgrading residential environment is enhanced” was achieved based on the assessment of objectively verifiable indicators in the PDM. The achievements of the Project Purpose at the time of this evaluation are summarized in the following table.

Project Purpose	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Achieved Values
Capacity of urban planning and urban development project implementation contributing to upgrading residential environment is enhanced	<p>(1) Improvement of knowledge and capacity for the formulation and promotion of the implementation of urban redevelopment projects</p> <p>(3) Utilization of handbooks for the training related to urban</p>	<p>Indicator 1: Achieved.</p> <p>Knowledge and capacity for formulation of URD projects among the officials was enhanced through training program in Mongolia and Japan, OJT for preparation of the model project plans, various WG meetings, including sub-WG meetings and rules and regulations WG meetings, and trainers' training.</p>

	<p>redevelopment projects</p> <p>(5) Proposal of re-organization of UB City government functioning effectively to conduct Urban Redevelopment Projects</p>	<p>Indicator 3: Partially achieved. The handbook for the implementation of URD projects has been prepared in 2018. The members of the training WG prepared and utilized it for the practice training in the process of preparation of the training materials. However, it has not utilized as a textbook of the training program on URD.</p> <p>Indicator 5: Achieved. Re-organization of UB City government functioning effectively to conduct URD Projects was proposed to the UB City government.</p>
--	--	--

Note: Objectively Verifiable Indicators other than the above belong to SP1.

### 3. History of PDM Modification

Modifications in the PDM relative to MUGCUP2 were made in the following JCC meetings: 4th JCC held in April 27, 2016; 6th JCC held in June 8, 2017; and 7th JCC held in May 25, 2018. The context of these respective modifications area shown in the table below. (Please see more details in Annex 3.)

Parent Document	Date of Signing	Revision Concerning Sub-Project 2
M/M on the 4th JCC	April 27, 2016	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• One output about Ulaanbaatar’s housing policy for low-income households (LIH) was added as Output 6. Accordingly, three activities were added under it.</li> <li>• Output 7 was clarified.</li> <li>• Some activities under Outputs 5 and 9 were added: Activity 5-3 “Review current status and analyze issues on urban redevelopment projects (3 schemes) planned in Aimag level”; Activity 9-2 “Provide advice for amending the draft Urban Development Law”; Activity 9-3 “Provide advice on Urban Redevelopment Law to be approved by the Parliament”; and Activity 9-5 “Provide advice for implementation of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, C)”.</li> <li>• Minor terminology changes were made for Activities 5-1, 5-2, and 9-4.</li> </ul>
M/M on the 6th JCC	June 8, 2017	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Activities 7-2 and 9-3 was clarified.</li> <li>• Following activities were eliminated: Activity 8-4 “Support implementation of the model project(s) (Scheme B)”; Activity 9-4 “Revise UB city’s rules and regulations necessary for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)”; Activity 9-7 “Standardize project planning and project execution (Scheme A, B, C)”; and Activity 9-8 “Propose promotion measures for sales and purchase of properties developed by urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)”.</li> <li>• Activities 11-9 and 10 were added, related to</li> </ul>

Parent Document	Date of Signing	Revision Concerning Sub-Project 2
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· establishment of a training course for URD.</li> <li>· Objectively verifiable indicator 4 for Project Purpose was revised and indicator 5 was added. As for Outputs 6, 7, 8, 9 and 10, the indicators were revised. As for Output 11, new indicators were added.</li> <li>· Some means of verification for Outputs were added.</li> <li>· Important assumptions were added for Overall Goal and Project Purpose. The first important assumption of Project Purpose was revised.</li> </ul>
M/M on the 7th JCC	May 25, 2018	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Third indicator of Project Purpose was modified.</li> </ul>

#### 4. Others

##### 4-1 Results of Environmental and Social Considerations (if applicable)

Categorization	Category C
Reasons for the Categorization	It is assumed that, at the ex-ante evaluation stage, there will be no environmental impact, since the project is to contribute to the improvement of planning capacity of the URD project plan.

##### 4-2 Results of Considerations on Gender/Peace Building/Poverty Reduction (if applicable)

MUGCUP2 paid attention to poverty reduction matter because most of the residents in ger area are under the 30 percentiles of the income level, i.e. LIHs decided in the Ulaanbaatar's affordable housing policy. It conducted the housing market survey, including demand and supply projection, and proposed housing support policies for LIHs to the government of Mongolia.

### III. Results of Joint Review

#### 1. Results of Review based on the DAC Evaluation Criteria

##### (1) Relevance

Relevance is high. The project started based on the UBMP 2020. URD issues were also addressed in Section 2 of the Mayor's Action Plan 2016-2020. The UB city council approved the housing and infrastructure development sub-program in February 2018, which was prepared through the project activity and stipulates the necessity for the URD project.

##### (2) Effectiveness

Effectiveness is high since the Project Purpose was achieved as mentioned in Section II. 2-2. Some project activities however were only partially completed. The



uncompleted activities were the followings.

Two activities of MUGCUP2 were not fully achieved. First, the planning stage of the LR model project activity (Activity 8-3) was stopped. The JICA Project Team (JPT) supported preparation of the draft project plan and replotting plan for two model project sites and explained them to the C/Ps through various meetings and trainings. However, the Ulaanbaatar city government were not willing to have meetings with residents on the LR issue, especially on the expounding of the principles of land contribution. Second, the formulation of the rules and regulations related to LR (Activity 9-1) were delayed. Among the seven rules and regulations, the last one, which touched on the LR project process has yet to be approved. The first draft has just been prepared and is expected to be finalized for submission to the MCUD minister by the project's end. The PR tools of LR and the handbook for practitioners do not reflect the approved rule and regulation, though the contents are linked with the draft one. To conduct the LR model project, the rule and regulation was required to be prepared in the early stage of the project. This became an excuse for the GAID not to conduct LR in the model project sites. However, since the LR project process rule and regulations is expected to be approved sometime soon, the city government is expected to apply it for their project.

On the other hand, due to difficulties in the conduct of the model project, the JPT proposed the establishment of a training module and the provision of a training program for trainers (Activities 11-9 and 11-10) in the June 8 2017 JCC meeting. The training module became part of the state's professional certificate course. The module is expected to substantially help in the enhancement of the capacity of the officials and professionals implementing URD projects. More than 20 trainers have already been trained, so they are also expected to utilize their know-how in the community meetings to help promote the URD projects.

### (3) Efficiency

Efficiency is fair. The actual project cost exceeded the planned costs though the project duration was within the bounds of the project timetable.

	Plan based on the Ex-ante Evaluation Paper	Actual
Duration	September 2014 – December 2018 (Total 52 months)	February 2015 – January 2019 (Total 47 months)
Project Cost*	340 million Japanese Yen	439.73 million Japanese Yen

Note: \* The amount includes the ones for both SP1 and 2.

Although completion of each project activity required a longer period, compared to

the original planned schedule, almost all activities were completed within the project duration. Activities were modified based on real projections. Some activities were deleted due to differences with actual praxis and new ones were added. During the project, the amount of MUGCUP2's project cost increased by 61.16 million Japanese Yen. This is mainly for increasing M.M. of Japanese experts as follows.

Timing	Amount (Japanese Yen)	Reason
December 2015	36.08 million	Increased M.M. and the number of trips for the expert of leader/urban redevelopment project/legal system related urban redevelopment, deputy leader/ urban redevelopment project/legal system related urban redevelopment, LR project, project finance/housing finance mechanism, and project cost analysis. The reason for increase of M.M. is as follows.  In the 3rd JCC in June 2015, C/Ps requested to add activities including to analyze issues to apply URD in the aimag level and formulation of UB's housing policy for LIH (but reflected in the PDM revised in the 4th JCC in April 2016).
March 2016	2.85 million	Increased M.M. and the number of trips for the expert of project finance/housing finance mechanism. The reason for increase of M.M. is as follows.  For Output 6 about formulation of UB's housing policy for LIH, which was added in the 3rd JCC in June 2015 (reflected in the PDM in the 4th JCC in April 2016), C/Ps requested to conduct a detailed analysis for the LIH by housing type and deeper discussion with C/Ps.
August 2017	22.23 million	Increased M.M. and the number of trips for the all experts assigned in the second year contract between JICA and JPT. The reason for increase of M.M. is as follows.  In the 6th JCC in June 2017, project activities were reviewed as indicated in Section II. 3. The reasons of the major changes were adjustment of delay of activities, change of C/Ps as a result of the 2016 election, and modification of activities in PDM.

#### (4) Impact

Impact (achievement of the Overall Goal within three years after completion of MUGCUP2) is high.

The project produced the following outputs, which in turn, would promote the implementation of the URD projects and lead to attainment of the Overall Goal.

- The URD law was approved by the Parliament;
- Rules and regulations of the URD law was formulated;

- The training module on URD was established as part of the state's professional training courses;
- Trainers were trained;
- UB's housing and infrastructure development sub-program was approved by the city council;
- PR tools of movies and pamphlet for residents to explain about the URD law, ger-to-apartment project, old apartment reconstruction project, and ger area LR project; and
- A URD handbook for practitioners will be formulated by the end of the project.

Moreover, besides the above, the housing support policy for LIHs, which the JPT proposed, is important to encourage ger area residents to rebuild their houses and improve the housing conditions by connecting to utility services. This housing support policy for LIHs will promote implementation of the LR projects. The MCUD has started discussion to realize this policy.

## **(5) Sustainability**

Sustainability is fair.

### 1) Policy and Institutional Aspect

URD related policies have yet to substantially change. Although the UB city government has started formulating the new master plan for 2040, issues related to ger area development and the reconstruction of old apartment buildings are serious, and their priority is high. Since the legal framework to implement the URD projects was established in the project, they also help promote the achievement of the Overall Goal.

### 2) Organizational Aspect of Implementation Body

Department in charge of ger area development (currently the GAID is in charge) was established in 2013 particularly for the ger area redevelopment in the UB city. Since ger area development is a priority issue of the city, the department continues to work on the issue.

There is still a lot of room for improvement, however. The JPT has recommended the reorganization of the GAID such as the establishment of a project management unit per project. It would help oversee the project throughout the project period and identify a responsible person for each URD project. This will help in the smoother

implementation of the URD projects when the GAID reviews the organization based on MUGCUP2's recommendation.

### 3) Technical Aspect of Implementation Body

Capacity of the C/Ps, especially the GAID staff, is still not enough to plan and implement the URD projects. Because the monitoring capacity of the government is also weak, the government still finds difficulty to act on the required countermeasures when a project gets stuck.

But the hope is great that the proper transfer of the needed skills and knowledge would be successfully transferred to the necessary personnel and staff due to the establishment of the URD training module. The URD training module has become part of professional certificate course and its textbook was prepared to properly expand the knowledge of trainee and foster competent URD specialists. During this process, aside from conducting lectures, the C/Ps contributed in the preparation of PR tools, handbooks, and training materials. Through these activities the initial batch of trainees deepened their understanding of URD and they are now expected to conduct training programs as trainers. This will give a chance to expand the knowledge about URD widely to the specialists.

### 4) Financial Aspect of Implementation Body

The city government plans to construct 50 SCs in the next two years. It has requested budget of 10 billion MNT for five SCs each for next year. The city has the willingness to apply the LR method as part of the SC projects. Integrated SC and LR projects should be implemented.

## **2. Key Factors Affecting Implementation and Outcomes**

### **(1) Policy Aspect**

The 2016 election had a great impact on the C/Ps' personnel and the city government policy. The pursuit of a URD program was the priority of the Ulaanbaatar city government following the UBMP 2020 when MUGCUP2 commenced. The city government implemented the ger-to-apartment project scheme based on a city ordinance passed in 2013. After that, old-apartment reconstruction project scheme was also started based on another city ordinance. After the commencement of MUGCUP2, the Ger Area Housing Project Corporation tried to make plans for LR projects with the supports of MUGCUP2 based on the URD law.

The 2016 elections however resulted bringing to new administrators to the city government. Part of Section 2 of the Mayor's Action Plan 2016-2020 addresses URD. The new Ulaanbaatar city government focused on the infrastructure development in ger area, especially SC project, which is considered as unit infrastructure written in PDM of this project. The two model projects of Chingeletei 7th khoroo (Ch7) and Sukhbaatar 18th khoroo (SB18) were selected as LR model project sites, and LR and SC projects were supposed to be implemented in the identified areas through an integrated manner. However, the SC projects were implemented first and the LR model projects were not launched because the budget for the LR projects were not secured. The JPT continuously explained the necessity and mechanism of LR to the GAID director and heads of respective departments as well as their staff. The JPT also regularly consulted the MCUD for their supports to encourage the city government to apply the LR approach. Despite these efforts the necessary actions have yet to be taken.

## **(2) Institutional Aspect**

Inconsistencies of the C/Ps were notable throughout the project period. The number of C/Ps who have been continuously working with MUGCUP2 since the beginning is only eight out of 27 WG members. There is none left among JCC members.

Turnover of decision makers among C/Ps was also frequently changed throughout the project period. For example, the director of urban development and land affairs policy implementation coordination department of MCUD, one of the major C/Ps changed five times, including the period of interim director. Even after their appointment, they were very busy to get familiar with their work and almost had no time to interact with members of the JPT.

It should also be noted that one of the major causes for the delay of project activities was the 2016 elections and the resulting changes in the composition of government organizations and officials, especially in Ulaanbaatar City. The shift from the old organization to the new organization and knowledge transfer took some time. This caused the delay in the appointment of new members to the MUGCUP2 WG. The first WG meeting after the election was held on March 23 2017, nine months after the 2016 national election.

Ulaanbaatar's Ger Area Development Department and Ger Area Housing Project Corporation, both of which used to be the major departments implementing the ger-to-apartment and LR projects respectively, were merged and became the GAID. The officials of this new department were mostly new and not familiar with the URD law, URD projects, and even urban development in general.

The selection of the model projects (Activity 8-1) took two and half years after commencement of MUGCUP2. Therefore, PDM was adjusted to eliminate the activity of “support implementation of the model project(s)” in the June 2017 JCC meeting. The first reason was because the new city government after the 2016 election changed the model LR project sites in spite of the fact that the model sites had been studied deeply before the governmental change. The second was because it took time for the new government to process the organizational arrangements and to make the corresponding decisions regarding the model sites. Even after that meeting, activities for planning the model projects (Activity 8-3) and other activities, including the preparation of the rules and regulations (Activity 9-1) and the training of trainers related activities (Activities 11-9 and 11-10) were conducted very slowly.

Delays in the formulation of the rules and regulations related to LR also had negative efficiency. The disruptions also caused delays in the preparation of PR tools of LR (Activity 10-4) and the handbook for practitioners (Activity 9-6). As a result, these materials were not utilized enough in the conduct of the various training sessions and the model projects.

Formulation of draft seven rules and regulations of the URD law was originally scheduled for completion by December 2015 in M/M in October 2014. The MCUD established the WG to prepare the draft in October 19 2015, a half year after commencement of MUGCUP2. After that, the WG members were changed four times in October 2016, February 2017, August 2017, and April 2018 (see Annex 1 (2) 3)). The JPT repeatedly gave similar inputs. As of December 5, 2018, only the first draft of the last one on the LR project process has been formulated.

Due to the frequent changes in the composition of the C/Ps, including members of various WGs, inputs from the JPT as well as the training of same contents were frequently repeated. The positive aspect of this redundancy was the benefit of repetition for a number of specialists on the LR scheme. But the negative aspect was that the depth of their understanding was still lesser than the JPT expected at the beginning of the project.

### **(3) Technical Aspect**

Due to the frequent changes of C/Ps as mentioned above, the same training programs had to be repeated several times. There were difficulties in the enhancement of the technical capacities through a step-by-step manner.

#### **(4) Financial Aspect**

The city's and MCUD's budgets for implementing the two LR model projects of Ch7 and SB18 were not secured in 2018. On the other hand, the SC projects in the same sites were budgeted. This meant that one of the important assumptions in Project Purpose in PDM was not satisfied.

### **3. Evaluation on the results of the Project Risk Management**

For the key factors of (1) Policy aspect and (4) Financial aspect addressed in the previous section, the JPT conducted a meeting with the vice-mayor to discuss the possibility for the city to apply LR into the model project sites. In the meeting on February 9, 2018, the vice-mayor agreed and signed the memorandum of understanding (MoU).

The city still did not take the required actions to conduct the LR project based on the URD law, so the JPT had a meeting and sent a letter to the vice-mayor indicating the need to take the required actions in March 26, 2018. Their reply came just before the May 25 2018 JCC meeting. It addressed their agreement to apply LR based on the URD law. This included getting approval from the city council for the project site boundaries and conducting residential meetings to explain about the LR project plan.

The JPT prepared the draft project plan and the first draft replotting plan for each model project site of Ch7 and SB18. It explained them to the GAID director, heads of divisions, and their staff continuously to encourage them to carry on the required activities based on the URD law. JPT also had a meeting with planning department of the MCUD, which was in charge of budget allocation of SC project in SB18, to explain about the draft project and replotting plans of SB18. However, the GAID as well as the MCUD still did not act on the recommendations even in October 2018. The JICA Project issued another letter on October 24, 2018 to vice-minister of the MCUD and vice-mayor of the UB city. The reply came from the Ulaanbaatar city government on November 20, 2018. The GAID indicated that the LR replotting plan would be used as reference in 2019.

For the key factors of (2) Institutional aspect and (3) Technical aspect in the previous section, after the 2016 national election, the JPT in cooperation with the MCUD and ALAMGaC conducted an introductory training in URD for the new department officials in October and November 2016. In addition, since the middle of November 2016, the JPT had been able to gain office spaces in the GAID for smoother technical transfer, this was in addition to the one in the MCUD. This enhanced the relationship between the JPT and the new department for a while.

Besides, those in the decision-making levels, and in order to help address the issues that arose from the 2016 elections, C/Ps were invited to join the training in Japan held on February 5-18 2017. The training was very effective, and the outlook of the C/Ps evidently changed after the training. Their understanding of MUGCUP2 increased as well as their knowledge on URD projects. Their involvement in MUGCUP2 activities noticeably improved after that.

However, these efforts did not continue long. The officials of the GAID became busy in the implementation of SC project and they seem unwilling to spend time for MUGCUP2, which was interpreted as being out of their scope of work. Moreover, activities became slower due to resignations and the appointment of the new incoming director in the end of 2017 and a key head of division in July 2018.

Formulation of the URD law related rules and regulations worked smoothly until the election. Four rules and regulations of selection of project area, tripartite contract forms, process of ger-to-apartment project, and process of old-apartment reconstruction project were approved. However, after the 2016 election, the activity slowed down. The JPT explained the importance of continuity and requested preparation in the early stage to implement the LR model projects and to formulate the PR tools and the handbook for practitioners during the several JCC meetings. It was noted in the M/Ms as of June 2017 and May 2018 to accelerate the activity to complete the formulation. However, even these M/Ms did not help, and the fifth rule and regulation of compensation approved in July 2018, two years after the election, as well as the sixth one of land contribution in November 2018.

Since the LR model projects did not work, it was found out that enhancing capacity of C/Ps to achieve the Project Purpose as addressed in the PDM was difficult as it was expected. The JPT proposed to add activities establishing a training course on URD and train trainers in the June 2017 JCC meeting. However, it took a time to initiate the activity and finally the WG for preparation of the training was formulated in April 2018, ten months after the decision. Trainers were trained but the quality was not enough due to the limitation of time. Considering the practice, only two staffs who used to work in Ger Area Housing Project Corporation and later worked as MUGCUP2 staffs, could fully explain the planning process, including replotting.

#### **4. Lessons Learnt**

##### **(1) Secure the necessary budget for the model project during the project formulation**

As one of the preconditions and important assumptions of PDM, it is written that the



“Mongolian side allocates necessary budget for the Project” and “the budget will be provided for urban development projects in UB city” respectively. However, this has not clarified in the Record of Discussions (R/D). The budget for the LR model project remains unsecured even in 2018 and for 2019. Preparation of budget was the biggest reason for the Mongolian side why the model projects were not selected and they did not proceed.

For the smooth implementation of model projects, it is important to ensure the budget in the project formulation stage and stipulate this in the R/D. It is also necessary to clarify conditions for project cancelation in case a budget cannot be secured.

Along with the city government budget the financial arrangement for the model project implementation should be considered at the time of project formulation. Because the Mongolian government always involves budget shortage, other financial sources should be discussed between the Mongolian and Japanese sides before the project starts.

## **(2) Request to appoint the proper counterparts for effective project implementation**

In the Ulaanbaatar city government, the organization in charge of implementation of the old-apartment project is the redevelopment division in the MP agency and ger-to-apartment and LR projects is with the GAID. The latter two projects under the GAID had faced difficulties. MUGCUP2 found out that the GAID is short of specialists with backgrounds in architecture, land management, urban planning/development, and engineering, factors and skills required for urban development. These backgrounds are also important for those in the decision maker levels. Thus, JPT assumes that it might be difficult for them to understand the concept of the LR scheme as well as its importance and usefulness. It is important for the city government to appoint officials with specialties in architecture, land management, urban planning/development, and engineering and other related fields.

Additionally, it is important to appoint the core members for the model project implementation. MUGCUP2 established the model project sub-WG with members from various organizations. However, they are not in the position to implement the model project directly, so their involvement in the actual work was limited. Besides, there were the appointed C/Ps in the Ger Area Housing Project Corporation before the 2016 election. Yet, no core members were appointed in the GAID after the elections. It is necessary to appoint a core C/Ps in the implementation of the model

projects.

If the above aspects were not satisfied, that means that the preconditions set in the PDM that “Mongolian counterpart personnel for the Project are properly assigned” were far from achieved. One possible solution to avoid such situations is to clarify conditions for cancelation of the project in the project formulation stage, addressed the above (1).

### **(3) Importance to demonstrate the output of the model project**

In Mongolia, people tend to follow and apply the new things when they see a good example and they tend to emulate it. It was very important to implement the model projects as a demonstration for the promotion of the LR scheme based on the URD law with the quality control by the JICA experts.

Major interests of the decision makers in the government is to implement a project that will be visible within the four years of their elected terms. However, LR projects generally require a time for the public involvement and consensus building before and during the project implementation. Thus, the need to design a model project as compact as possible is important. One that is realistically manageable thereby increases the possibility of its implementation within the project time.

## **IV. For the Achievement of Overall Goals after the Project Completion**

### **1. Prospects to achieve the Overall Goal**

The Overall Goal (Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar City are improved through planned urban development based on UB MP2020) is expected to be achieved to some extent.

In February this year, the city council approved “the housing and infrastructure development sub-program of the capital city”, which can be regarded as the mid-term plan of urban redevelopment in Ulaanbaatar city. This sub-program shows programs and related indicators of (1) housing for low- and medium-income families, (2) rental housing, (3) development of new residential areas and new towns, (4) urban redevelopment projects targeted by the Project, and (5) network extension of heating, electricity, water supply, sewerage and so on. The program implementation period is five years from 2018 to 2022. As the program outcome is the same as the overall goal of the Project, if the outcome of this sub-program is achieved, the overall goal of the Project is also achieved. Besides, the city government is going to launch the revision of UB MP2020 to formulate the Ulaanbaatar Master Plan 2030, which needs to start with

monitoring work of the current UB MP2020 implementation plan.

In the Project, a meeting of the State-City Joint Working Group (SCJWG) for monitoring the UB MP2020 implementation plan was not held and the LR model projects were not launched. However, during monitoring method and model project deliberation processes, a lot of methods and plans were proposed, regulations and rules regarding urban redevelopment were established, and technical manuals for urban development project implementation based on the urban redevelopment law were created. Through these activities, training textbooks were developed and the training programs were established. Furthermore, housing policy for low-income households was proposed so that urban redevelopment projects promote housing supply for low-income people. Based on these achievements, the promotion of implementation of urban redevelopment projects is expected.

It is certain that Mongolia is moving forward on the overall goal by the realization of the said sub-program and the revision of the master plan. There is no doubt that the institutional base and capacity development brought by the Project will contribute to it.

## **2. Plan of Operation and Implementation Structure of the Mongolian side to achieve Overall Goal**

The following factors, which were not completed during the project period, are the required actionable things for the Mongolia government in order to achieve the project's Overall Goal.

### **(1) Legal and Policy Aspect**

- 1) To formulate the remaining rule of LR project process and get approval from the minister of the MCUD
- 2) To reflect the concept of URD in Ulaanbaatar's new Master Plan for 2040
- 3) To establish a law enforcement environment that can carry out projects without being affected by politics

### **(2) URD Project**

- 4) To study deeply about possibility of implementing the LR model projects, including SB18, based on the URD law, its rules and regulations, and the handbook on URD for practitioners and implement the model project with mutual consent of land right holders
- 5) To ensure the required budget to implement LR model project in the state and city levels

- 6) Based on the URD law and its rules and regulations, to update the monitoring data, review the conduct of the ger-to-apartment projects based on the data, and take appropriate actions, including the aspect of cancelation
- 7) To monitor ger-to-apartment project on a regular basis
- 8) To introduce the rent housing to the old-apartment projects that no private company appear in the bidding

### **(3) Capacity Development and Promotion of URD**

- 9) To conduct the URD training program as part of professional training course, utilize the handbook for practitioners that was prepared under the MUGCUP2 and trainers who have been trained during MUGCUP2
- 10) To conduct URD training for officials of the Ulaanbaatar city government in charge of URD project on a regular basis
- 11) To ensure the stability of the workplace of officials who participated in the training held during MUGCUP2. Also, to strengthen future training activities
- 12) To explain to residents the benefits of a URD project, utilizing pamphlets and movies of PR tools

### **3. Recommendations for the Mongolian side**

The followings were the recommendations of the JPT to the Mongolian C/Ps:

- (1) There is a need to study more the LR schemes and its applicability in Ulaanbaatar. During the project, understanding of C/Ps on the LR scheme was unfortunately not enough. The JPT was expected to review and modify the LR scheme through the implementation of the model projects. However, it could not accomplish such a task because it was not applied in the selected model projects. Thus, the Mongolian side needs to continue the study and modify the scheme to suit them to the reality in the actual field. Moreover, how to integrate the LR scheme with the SC project needs to be studied. Then, if they think the scheme is applicable, the potential model projects should be selected from the beginning to ensure the ability to creating public lands respecting residents' willingness;
- (2) To provide the proper budget and implementation of the LR model projects selected based on the above recommendation (1). The costs for the LR projects consist costs for basic design, formulation of draft project plan, formulation of project implementation plan, infrastructure design and construction, including roads,

wastewater treatment, water, heating, street lights, etc., various compensation, earth work, earth improvement and so on;

- (3) To encourage practitioners and experts to take the URD training module, organized by the Union of Mongolian Architects, and deepen their understanding of URD project, especially for the planning stage, which is critical in project implementation. To achieve the above recommendation (1), it is important to increase the number of practitioners and experts who have better understanding of the URD projects;
- (4) The JPT proposed an organizational restructure for the GAID in the city government for it to properly manage and operate urban redevelopment. It is recommendable that the Ulaanbaatar city government should apply this recommendation;
- (5) To appropriately monitor the progress of the URD project and share information with the public; and
- (6) The JPT proposed the housing support schemes for LIH. It is strongly recommended that the MCUD transform this into policy, which can form a basis for URD projects, especially in allowing residents in connecting with better infrastructure services (see Monitoring Sheet Ver. 7 on July 13, 2018).

#### **4. Monitoring Plan from the end of the Project to Ex-post Evaluation**

To monitor MUGCUP2 further by JICA after the completion of the project, the following points are recommended:

- (1) Formulation of the rule and regulation of the LR project process and its approval from the minister;
- (2) Progress of SC projects and application of the LR scheme based on the URD law;
- (3) Whether a detailed budget includes a detailed cost for the URD projects. The costs of URD projects include infrastructure design and construction costs, compensation and relocation costs, etc.;
- (4) Whether the process of the URD project follows properly the URD law and its rules and regulations. It is also important to ensure if the plans of the URD are formulated and implemented based on the discussion with land right holders;
- (5) Apply the MUGCUP2's proposed housing policy for LIH as a government policy;
- (6) Progress of the old-apartment projects and introduction of the rent housing to the projects that no private company appear for the bidding. Some old-apartment

reconstruction projects apply the city mayor's ordinance, and the other projects commenced after receiving the Minister's order 126 on July 5 2016 apply the URD law;

- (7) Progress of the ger-to-apartment projects, including review of the projects based on the URD law and its rules and regulations and actions taken. All ger-to-apartment projects currently implementing are commenced before the URD law approval so implemented based on the city mayor's ordinance; and
- (8) Conduct of URD training program to form part of professional training course, utilizing the handbook for practitioners that was prepared under the MUGCUP2 and trainers who have trained in MUGCUP2.

# ANNEX 1: Results of the Project

(List of Dispatched Experts, List of Counterparts, List of Trainings, etc.)

## (1) List of Dispatched Experts

Position	Name	Company	Trip	2015												2016												2017												1st Contract Year		
				Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug								
Leader/Urban Redevelopment Project/Legal System Related to Urban Redevelopment	K. Nagayama	Almec	Original Plan																																					6.33		
			Revised Plan1																																					6.83		
			Revised Plan2																																					4.63		
			Actual																																					4.20		
Deputy Leader/Urban Redevelopment Project/Legal System Related to Urban Redevelopment	R. Sasaki	Almec	Original Plan																																					8.33		
			Revised Plan1																																					9.33		
			Revised Plan2																																					11.10		
			Actual																																					10.63		
Urban Redevelopment Project/Rules and Regulations	T. Kudo	OCG	Original Plan																																					3.00		
			Revised Plan																																					3.00		
			Actual																																					2.90		
Land Readjustment Project	M. Matsui	TSC	Original Plan																																					9.17		
			Revised Plan1																																					11.17		
			Revised Plan2																																					11.97		
			Actual																																					11.90		
Infrastructure Planning/Architect	S. Ishikawa	OCG	Original Plan																																					4.50		
			Revised Plan																																					1.13		
			Actual																																					1.13		
Infrastructure Planning	F. Kuwahara	OCG (SRK)	Revised Plan																																					1.53		
			Actual																																					1.70		
Infrastructure Planning	E. Edo	OCG (SRK)	Revised Plan																																					1.47		
			Actual																																					1.30		
Infrastructure Planning	I. Mori	TSC	Original Plan																																					3.00		
			Revised Plan																																					3.00		
			Actual																																					3.00		
Real Estate Evaluation Method/Compensation Mechanism	S. Shirouma	TSC	Original Plan																																					4.67		
			Revised Plan																																					4.67		
			Actual																																					4.63		
Project Finance/Housing Finance Mechanism	M. Iwasaki	Almec (KRI)	Original Plan																																					3.00		
			Revised Plan1																																					4.50		
			Revised Plan2																																					4.50		
			Actual																																					5.63		
Training Planning/Advocacy Planning	M. Kojima	Almec	Original Plan																																					4.00		
			Actual																																					1.40		
Training Planning/Advocacy Planning	N. Ohno	Almec	Revised Plan1																																					2.60		
			Revised Plan2																																					1.00		
			Actual																																					1.00		
Training Planning/Advocacy Planning/Institutional Development	O. Abe	Almec	Revised Plan																																					1.60		
			Actual																																					1.50		
Project Cost Analysis	K. Ozawa	Almec	Original Plan																																					3.00		
			Revised Plan																																					4.00		
			Actual																																					4.00		
Work in Mongolia																																								Original Plan	49.00	
																																								Revised Plan	56.13	
																																								Actual	54.93	
Work in Japan	T. Kudo	OCG	Original Plan																																					0.00		
			Actual																																					0.10		
			O. Abe	Almec	Original Plan																																					0.00
					Actual																																					0.10
Total																																							Original Plan	49.00		
																																							Revised Plan	56.13		
																																							Actual	55.13		

ICC Meeting	ICR	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS
Training																																										
Reporting																																										

Legend:   
 : Work   
 : Work for other projects   
ICR: Inception Report WP: Work Plan   
MS: Monitoring Sheet I/R: Project Implementation Report   
C/R: Project Completion Report

	Position	Name	Company	L e v e l	Trip in Y2	Year 2												Year 2	
						2017				2018								Mongolia	
						9月	10月	11月	12月	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct
M o n g o l i a	Leader/Urban Redevelopment Project/Legal System Related to Urban Redevelopment	K. Nagayama	Almec	1	Plan	6													2.30
				Actual	7														2.00
	Deputy Leader/Urban Redevelopment Project/Legal System Related to Urban Redevelopment	R. Sasaki	Almec	2	Plan	7													5.10
				Actual	10														5.40
	Land Readjustment Project	M. Matsui	TSC	2	Plan	7													6.23
				Actual	8														6.23
	Infrastructure Planning	F. Kuwahara	OCG (SRK)	4	Plan	1													0.50
				Actual	2														0.50
	Real Estate Evaluation Method/Compensatio n Mechanism	S. Shiroma	TSC	5	Plan	1													1.03
				Actual	1														1.03
	Project Finance/Housing Finance Mechanism	M. Iwasaki	Almec (KRC)	3	Plan	2													1.00
				Actual	2														1.00
	Training Planning/Advocacy Planning/ Institutional Development	O. Abe	Almec	4	Plan	5													1.83
				Actual	4														1.83
	Work in Mongolia												Plan (Mongolia)	18.00					
													Actual (Mongolia)	18.00					

JCC Meeting																					
Training																					
Reporting																					

Legend  : Work  
 : Work for other projects



## (2) List of Counterparts

### 1) JCC

Organization	At the Outset (March 17 2015)	First Revision (March 24 2016)	At the Completion (September 22 2016)
Joint Coordination Committee	<p><b>Chairperson:</b> Ms. G. Baigalmaa, Vice Minister of Construction and Urban Development</p> <p><b>Vice Chairperson:</b> Mr. S. Ochirbat, Deputy Mayor of Ulaanbaatar City responsible for Urban Development and Investment issues</p> <p><b>Secretariat:</b> Mr. M. Batbayar, Interim Director, Department of Urban Development and Land Affairs, Ministry of Construction and Urban development (MCUD) Mr. S. Bayarbaatar, Director of Strategic Policy and Planning Division (SPPD), Governor's Office (GO), Ulaanbaatar City Government (UBCG)</p> <p><b>Members:</b> Ms. N. Narangerel, Director, Debt Management Unit, Development Finance and Debt Management Department, Ministry of Finance Mr. U. Otgonbayar, Director, Strategic Policy and Planning Department, MCUD Mr. B. Baasan, Director, Construction and Public Utility Policy Department, MCUD Mr. Ts. Ganbat, Director, Construction Quality</p>	<p><b>Chairperson:</b> Ms. M. Bolortuya, Director, State Administration and Management Department, and Interim State Secretary, MCUD</p> <p><b>Vice Chairperson:</b> Mr. S. Ochirbat, Deputy Mayor of Ulaanbaatar City in charge of Urban Development and Investment issues</p> <p><b>Secretariat:</b> Mr. B. Uuganbayar, Interim Director, Department of Urban Development and Land Affairs, MCUD Mr. S. Bayarbaatar, Director, SPPD, UBCG</p> <p><b>Members:</b> Ms. N. Narangerel, Director, Debt Management Unit, Development Finance and Debt Management Department, Ministry of Finance Mr. Kh. Batbold, Interim Director, Strategic Policy and Planning Department, MCUD Mr. L. Chinzorig, Interim Director, Construction and Public Utility Policy Department, MCUD Mr. Z. Enkh-Orgil, Director, Construction</p>	<p><b>Chairperson:</b> Mr. Sh. Lkhamsuren, Vice Minister of Construction and Urban Development</p> <p><b>Vice Chairperson:</b> Mr. P. Bayarkhuu, Vice Governor of Capital City in charge of Infrastructure and Ger Area Development</p> <p><b>Secretariat:</b> Mr. B. Gunbold, Director, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD Mr. G. Ulziibayar, Director of Policy and Planning Division (PPD), Governor's Office (GO), UBCG</p> <p><b>Members:</b> Director, Debt Management Unit, Development Finance and Debt Management Department, Ministry of Finance Director, Strategic Policy and Planning Department, MCUD Director, Public Utility Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD Director, Construction and Construction</p>

Organization	At the Outset (March 17 2015)	First Revision (March 24 2016)	At the Completion (September 22 2016)
	<p>and Safety Operation Policy Department, MCUD</p> <p>Mr. A. Amarsaikhan, Director, Urban Planning Division, Agency of Land Affairs, Geodesy and Cartography (ALAGaC)</p> <p>Mr. J. Batsaikhan, Director, Land Management Division, ALAGaC</p> <p>Mr. R. Gankhuyag, Director, Cadastre Division, ALAGaC</p> <p>Mr. N. Natsagdorj, Chief Architecture of Ulaanbaatar City and Director of Master Plan Agency of Capital City (MPACC)</p> <p>Mr. Sh. Gankhuyag, Director, Ger Area Development Department of Ulaanbaatar City</p> <p>Mr. B. Zagdsambar, Director, Cadastre Unit, Property Relation Department (PRD) of Ulaanbaatar City</p> <p>Mr. D. Bayasgalan, Deputy Director, Road Department of Ulaanbaatar City</p> <p>Mr. S. Tsakhiur, Director, Urban Planning, Architecture, and Design Institute of the Capital City (UPADI)</p> <p>Mr. A. Lkhagvadorj, Director, Ger Area Housing Project Corporation, Local Owned Enterprise of the Capital City</p> <p>Mr. Mutsumi Sato, Head of JICA Mongolia Office</p> <p>Mr. Takeo Ochi, Project Manager</p>	<p>Quality and Safety Operation Policy Department, MCUD</p> <p><u>Mr. A. Khurelshagai</u>, Director, ALAGaC</p> <p><u>Mr. O. Odbayar</u>, Chief Architecture of Ulaanbaatar City and Director of MPACC</p> <p>Mr. Sh. Gankhuyag, Director, Ger Area Development Department of Ulaanbaatar City</p> <p><u>E. Ariungerel</u>, Head of Legal Division, PRD</p> <p>Mr. D. Bayasgalan, Deputy Director, Road Department of Ulaanbaatar City</p> <p>Mr. S. Tsakhiur, Director, UPADI</p> <p>Mr. A. Lkhagvadorj, Director, Ger Area Housing Project Corporation, Local Owned Enterprise</p> <p><u>Mr. B. Telmen</u>, <u>Director</u>, <u>City's Housing Corporation (NOSK)</u></p> <p>Mr. Mutsumi Sato, Head of JICA Mongolia Office</p> <p>Mr. Takeo Ochi, Project Manager</p>	<p>Material Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p>Director, Agency for Land Administration Management, Geodesy and Cartography (ALAMGaC)</p> <p>Chief Architect of Ulaanbaatar City and Director of Urban Planning and Master Plan Agency of the Capital City</p> <p>Director, Ger Area Infrastructure Department (GAID) of the Capital City</p> <p>Director, Land Affairs Office of the Capital City</p> <p>Director, Road Development Department of the Capital City</p> <p>Director, Urban Planning, UPADI</p> <p>Mr. Mutsumi Sato, Head of JICA Mongolia Office</p> <p>Mr. Takeo Ochi, Project Manager</p>

## 2) Working Group

Organization	At the Outset (March 17 2015)	First Revision (March 24 2016)	At the Completion (February 17 2017)
Working Group for Sub-project 2	<p><b>Project manager:</b> Mr. M. Batbayar, Interim Director, Department of Urban Development and Land Affairs, MCUD</p> <p><b>Secretary:</b> Ms. E. Dondmaa, Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD</p> <p><b>Members:</b> Ms. Yu. Dorjpagma, Senior Officer in charge of Real Estate Market and Foreign Investment Division, Strategic Policy and Planning Department, MCUD Ms. G. Bolormaa, Senior Officer, Strategic Policy and Planning Department, MCUD Mr. D. Belegsaikhan, Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD Mr. M. Gantumur, Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD Ms. E. Ariunnyam, Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD Mr. P. Enkhmandakh, Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD</p>	<p><b>Project manager:</b> Mr. B. Uuganbayar, Interim Director, Department of Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy, MCUD</p> <p><b>Secretary:</b> Ms. E. Dondmaa, Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD</p> <p><b>Members:</b> Ms. Yu. Dorjpagma, Senior Officer in charge of Real Estate Market and Foreign Investment Division, Strategic Policy and Planning Department, MCUD Ms. G. Bolormaa, Senior Officer, Strategic Policy and Planning Department, MCUD Mr. D. Belegsaikhan, Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD Mr. M. Gantumur, Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD Ms. E. Ariunnyam, Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD Mr. P. Enkhmandakh, Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD</p>	<p><b>Project manager:</b> Mr. B. Gunbold Interim Director, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p><b>Secretary:</b> D. Belegsaikhan, Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p><b>Members:</b> Senior Officer, Policy and Planning Department, MCUD Ms. E. Dondmaa, Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD Ms. M. Gantumur, Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD Mr. B. Nyamdash, Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p>

Organization	At the Outset (March 17 2015)	First Revision (March 24 2016)	At the Completion (February 17 2017)
	<p>Ms. B. Goyosaikhan, Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD</p> <p>Ms. B. Oyunchimeg, Senior Officer, Construction and Public Utility Policy Department, MCUD</p> <p>Ms. R. Batchimeg, Senior Officer, Construction and Public Utility Policy Department, MCUD</p> <p>Mr. Z. Enkh-Orgil, Officer, Construction Quality and Safety Operation Policy Department, MCUD</p> <p>Mr. A. Khurelshagai, Director of ALAGaC</p> <p>Mr. A. Amarsaikhan, Director, Urban Planning Unit, ALAGaC</p> <p>Ms. D. Bolormaa, Senior Officer, Urban Planning Unit, ALAGaC</p> <p>Ms. G. Munkhtsetseg, Senior Officer, Integrated Management and Cooperation Unit, ALAGaC</p> <p>N. Munkhuu, Senior Officer, Land Management Unit, ALAGaC</p> <p>Mr. B. Galmandakh, Senior Officer, Cadastre Unit, ALAGaC</p> <p>Ms. D. Shurentsetseg, Senior Officer, Strategic Policy and Planning Department, MUB</p>	<p>Ms. B. Goyosaikhan, Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD</p> <p>Ms. B. Oyunchimeg, Senior Officer, Construction and Public Utility Policy Department, MCUD</p> <p>Ms. R. Batchimeg, Senior Officer, Construction and Public Utility Policy Department, MCUD</p> <p>Ms. G. Tsermaa, Officer, Construction Quality and Safety Operation Policy Department, MCUD</p> <p>Mr. A. Amarsaikhan, Director, Urban Planning Unit, ALAGAC</p> <p>Ms. D. Bolormaa, Senior Officer, Urban Planning Unit, ALAGAC</p> <p>Mr. J. Batsaikhan, Director, Land Management Unit, ALAGAC</p> <p>N. Munkhuu, Senior Officer, Land Management Unit, ALAGAC</p> <p>Mr. B. Galmandakh, Director, Cadastre Unit, ALAGaC</p> <p>Ts. Byambajargal, Senior Officer, Strategic</p>	<p>At the Completion (February 17 2017)</p> <p>Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p>Ms. U. Badamsuren Senior Officer, Engineering Infrastructure Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p>Ms. O. Enkhuyaa, Senior Officer, Public Utility Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p>Ms. B. Oyunchimeg, Officer, Public Utility Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p>Ms. R. Batchimeg, Senior Officer, Public Utility Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p>Ms. G. Tsermaa, Officer, Construction and Building Material Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p>Mr. O. Odbayar, Director, Urban Planning Division, Agency for Land Administration Management, Geodesy and Cartography (ALAMGaC)</p> <p>Mr. J. Davaabaatar, Director, Land Management Division, ALAMGaC</p> <p>Mr. B. Galmandakh, Director, Cadastre Division, ALAMGaC</p>

Organization	At the Outset (March 17 2015)	First Revision (March 24 2016)	At the Completion (February 17 2017)
	<p>Ms. B. Sarnai, Officer, Strategic Policy and Planning Department, MUB</p> <p>Ms. Enkhjargal, Officer, Law and Legal Division, MUB</p> <p>Ms. B. Tserenbaljid, Director, Infrastructure Division, MPACC</p> <p>Mr. M. Nyambayar, Director, Re-planning Division, MPACC</p> <p>Mr. B. Zagdsambar, Director, Cadastre Division, PRD</p> <p>Mr. M. Enkhbaatar, Director, Foreign Relations and Cooperation Division, Ger Area Development Department</p> <p>R. Battsolmon, Economist, Planning and Research Division, Road Department</p> <p>Ms. G. Narangerel, Chief Engineer, UPADI</p> <p>Ms. A. Buyandelger, Director, Re-planning and Monitoring Division, Ger Area Housing Project Corporation</p>	<p>Policy and Planning Department, MUB</p> <p>Ms. B. Sarnai, <u>Deputy director</u>, Capital City Housing Corporation (NOSK)</p> <p>Ms. S. Enkhjargal, Officer, Legal Division, MUB</p> <p>Ms. B. Tserenbaljid, Director, Infrastructure Division, MPACC</p> <p>Mr. M. Nyambayar, Director, Re-planning Division, MPACC</p> <p>Mr. B. Zagdsambar, Director, Cadastre Division, PRD</p> <p>Mr. M. Enkhbaatar, Director, Foreign Relations and Cooperation Division, GADA</p> <p>R. Battsolmon, Economist, Planning and Research Division, Road Department</p> <p><u>Ms. Ch. Regzmaa</u>, Chief Engineer, UPADI</p> <p>Mr. A. Buyandelger, Director, Re-planning and Monitoring Division, Ger Area Housing Project Corporation</p>	<p>Officer, Policy and Planning Division, UB City Government</p> <p><u>Mr. A. Enkhmanlai</u>, Deputy Director, NOSK</p> <p>Ms. S. Enkhjargal, Officer, Legal Division, UB City Government</p> <p><u>Ms. B. Oyuntuva</u>, Director, Infrastructure Planning Division, MPACC</p> <p>Mr. M. Nyambayar, Director, Redevelopment Division, MPACC</p> <p><u>Mr. Ch. Ochir</u>, Director, Land Management and Planning Division, Land Office of the Capital City</p> <p>Mr. B. Munkhbaatar, Director, Policy and Planning Division, GAID</p> <p>Mr. M. Enkhbaatar, Officer, Policy and Planning Division, GAID</p> <p><u>Ms. J. Davaasuren</u>, Director, Policy Coordination Division, Road Development Agency of the Capital City</p> <p>Ms. Ch. Regzmaa, Chief Engineer, UPADI</p> <p>Mr. G. Batkshig, Head of Division, UPADI</p>

### 3) Housing Policy Sub-Working Group

<b>SWG Leader:</b> Director, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD	B.Gunbold
<b>Members:</b>	
Officer, Policy Planning Department, MCUD	E.Batbold
Senior officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD	E.Dondmaa
Senior officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD	D.Belegsaikhan
Senior officer, Public Utilities Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD	O.Enkhtuya
Officer, Policy Planning Division, UB City Government	B.Byambasuren
Head of Chief Architect's Office, MPACC	T.Ganzorig
Head of Urban Redevelopment Division, MPACC	M.Nyambayar
Head of Policy Planning Division, GAID	B.Munkhbaatar
Officer, Policy Planning Division, GAID	B.Ulziibayar
Deputy Director, NOSK	A.Enkmanlai
Senior officer, NOSK	T.Otgonjargal
UPDI	E.Erdenemunkh
Deputy Director, TOSK	D.Enkbold
Executive Director, MIK	D.Gantugs
MUGCUP2	Iwasaki Masayoshi

### 4) LR Model Project Sub-Working Group

<b>Secretary:</b> ALAMGaC	B. Bolormaa
<b>Member:</b>	
Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD	B. Goysaikhan
Public Utility Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD	R.Batchimeg B. Oyunchimeg
Public Utility Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD	U.Badamsuren
Policy and Planning Division, UB City Government	B.Byambasuren
Re-planning Division, MPACC	I. Narantsetseg
Architecture Division, MPACC	Ts. Erdenetsetseg
Infrastructure Division, MPACC	E. Ganpurev
GAI	M.Munkhbaatar D.Davaadulam
NOSK	A. Enkmanlai A.Enkhhand
Land Department, Sukhbaatar District	D.Sugar
Land Department, Chingeltei District	J. Munkh-erdene
Urban Planning Division, UPDI,	Ganbat
MUGCUP2	Minoru Matsui

## 5) Rules and Regulation Working Group

Organization	At the Outset (October 19 2015)	First Revision (October 26 2016)	Second Revision (February 17 2017)	Third Revision (August 30 2017)	At the Completion (April 23 2018)
Rules and Regulation Working Group	<p><b>Working Group Leader:</b> S. Magnaisuren, State Secretary of MCUD</p> <p><b>Sub-leader:</b> B. Uuganbayar, Interim Director of the Department of Urban Development and Land Affairs, MCUD</p> <p><b>Secretary:</b> E. Dondmaa, Senior Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD</p> <p><b>Members:</b></p>	<p><b>Working Group Leader:</b> Sh. Lhamsuren, Vice Minister of Construction and Urban Development</p> <p><b>Sub-leader:</b> S. Magnaisuren, State Secretary of MCUD</p> <p><b>Secretary:</b> E. Dondmaa, Senior Urban Development and Land Affairs Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p><b>Members:</b> S. Amartuvshin, Interim Director, Legal Division, State Administration Management Department, MCUD</p>	<p><b>Working Group Leader:</b> B. Gunbold, Interim Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p><b>Secretary:</b> D. Belegsaikhan, Senior Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p><b>Members:</b> G. Bolormaa, Senior Officer, Policy and Planning Department,</p>	<p><b>Working Group Leader:</b> Sh. Lhamsuren, Vice Minister of Construction and Urban Development</p> <p><b>Sub-leader:</b> S. Magnaisuren, State Secretary of MCUD</p> <p>B. Gunbold, Director, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p><b>Secretary:</b> E. Dondmaa, Senior Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p><b>Members:</b> S. Amartuvshin, Officer, Legal Division, State Administration Management Department, MCUD</p>	<p><b>Working Group Leader:</b> Sh. Lhamsuren, Vice Minister of Construction and Urban Development</p> <p><b>Sub-leader:</b> S. Magnaisuren, State Secretary of MCUD</p> <p>B. Gunbold, Director, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p><b>Secretary:</b> E. Ariunnyam, Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD</p> <p><b>Members:</b> S. Amartuvshin, Officer, Legal Division, State Administration Management Department, MCUD</p>

Organization	At the Outset (October 19 2015)	First Revision (October 26 2016)	Second Revision (February 17 2017)	Third Revision (August 30 2017)	At the Completion (April 23 2018)
		D. Belegsaikhan, Director, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD	<u>MCUD</u> E. Dondmaa, Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD	MCUD	E. Dondmaa, Consulting Architect of Urban Planning
	Ts. Enkhmandakh, Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD	P. Enkhmandakh. Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD	P. Enkhmandakh. Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD		
	B. Goyosaikhan, Senior Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD	B. Goyosaikhan, Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD	<u>MCUD</u> B. Goyosaikhan, Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD	B. Goyosaikhan, Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD	Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD
	E. Ariunnyam, Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Department, MCUD	B. Nyamdash, Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD	B. Nyamdash, Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD		



Organization	At the Outset (October 19 2015)	First Revision (October 26 2016)	Second Revision (February 17 2017)	Third Revision (August 30 2017)	At the Completion (April 23 2018)
	MCUD	MCUD	<p>MCUD</p> <p><u>U. Badamsuren, Senior Officer, Engineering Infrastructure Policy Implementation, Coordination Department, MCUD</u></p> <p><u>O. Enkhuyaa, Senior Officer, Public Utility Policy Implementation, Coordination Department, MCUD</u></p> <p><u>R. Batchimeg, Senior Officer, Public Utility Policy Implementation, Coordination Department, MCUD</u></p> <p><u>B. Oyunchimeg, Officer, Public Utility Policy Implementation, Coordination Department, MCUD</u></p> <p><u>G. Tsermaa, Officer, Construction and Building Material Policy Implementation, Coordination Department, MCUD</u></p>		<p><u>Ts. Bayarbat, Senior officer, Administration, Management and Cooperation Department, Agency for Land Administration, Management, Geodesy and Cartography (ALAMGaC)</u></p>

Organization	At the Outset (October 19 2015)	First Revision (October 26 2016)	Second Revision (February 17 2017)	Third Revision (August 30 2017)	At the Completion (April 23 2018)
	<p>G. Munkhtsetseg, Director, Integrated Management and Cooperation Unit, ALAGaC</p> <p>D. Bolormaa, Senior Officer, Urban Planning Unit, ALAGaC</p> <p>S. Densmaa, Specialist at Dept of Land Management, ALAGaC</p> <p>S. Enkhjargal, Officer, Law and Legal Division, MUB</p>	<p>O. Dulguuntuul, Senior officer, Management and Cooperation Agency for Land Administration Management, Geodesy and Cartography (ALAMGaC)</p> <p>D. Bolormaa, Senior officer, Urban Planning Division, ALAMGaC</p> <p>S. Densmaa, Officer, Land Management Division, ALAMGaC</p> <p>S. Enkhjargal, Officer, Legal Division, UB City Governmen</p>	<p>O. Odbayar, Director, Urban Planning Division, Agency for Land Administration Management, Geodesy and Cartography (ALAMGaC)</p> <p>J. Davaabaatar, Director, Land Management Division, ALAMGaC</p> <p>B. Galmandakh, Director, Cadastre Division, ALAMGaC</p> <p>S. Enkhjargal, Officer, Legal Division, UB City Government</p> <p>B. Oyuntuva, Director, Infrastructure Planning Division, Urban Planning and Master Planning Agency of the Capital City (UBMPACC)</p>	<p>O. Dulguuntuul, Senior officer, Administration, Management and Cooperation Department, ALAMGaC</p> <p>D. Bolormaa, Senior officer, Regional and Urban Planning Division, ALAMGaC</p> <p>S. Densmaa, Senior Officer, Land Management Division, ALAMGaC</p> <p>S. Enkhjargal, Officer, Legal Division, UB City Government</p>	<p>O. Dulguuntuul, Senior officer, Administration, Management and Cooperation Department, ALAMGaC</p> <p>D. Bolormaa, Senior officer, Regional and Urban Planning Division, ALAMGaC</p> <p>J. Chingim, Officer, Regional and Urban Planning Division, ALAMGaC</p> <p>S. Enkhjargal, Officer, Legal Division, UB City Government</p>

Organization	At the Outset (October 19 2015)	First Revision (October 26 2016)	Second Revision (February 17 2017)	Third Revision (August 30 2017)	At the Completion (April 23 2018)
	M. Nyambayar, Director, Re-planning Division, MPACC  D. Urantsetseg, Senior officer, Land possession, Use and Registration Division, MPACC  Ya. Bolor, Specialist, Legal Department, MPACC  E. Ariungerel, Director, Legal Division, Property Relations Department  A. Lkhagvadorj, Head of GHP Agency  A. Buyandelger, Director of Re-planning and Monitoring Division, GHP  Ch. Shinetsetseg, Manager, GHP Agency  Sh. Gankhuyag, Head of Ger Area Development Agency	M. Nyambayar, Director, Redevelopment Division, UBMPACC  E. Davaanyam, Director, Legal Division, UPMPACC  Ch. Ochir, Officer, Land Ownership and Management Division, Land Office of the Capital City  Aranjin, Chief engineer, GAID of the Capital City  B. Munkhbaatar, Director, Policy and Planning Division, GAID of the Capital City	M. Nyambayar, Director, Redevelopment Division, UBMPACC  Ch. Ochir, Director, Land Management and Planning Division, Land Office of the Capital City  B. Munkhbaatar, Director, Policy and Planning Division, GAID	M. Nyambayar, Director, Urban Redevelopment and Master Plan Agency of the Capital City (UPMPACC)  E. Davaanyam, Director, Legal Division, UPMPACC  Ch. Ochir, Director, Land Ownership and Management Division, Land Office of the Capital City  B. Munkhbaatar, Director, Policy and Planning Division, GAID of the Capital City  M. Enkhbaatar, Officer, Policy and Planning Division, GAID of the	M. Nyambayar, Director, Urban Redevelopment and Master Plan Agency of the Capital City (UPMPACC)  E. Davaanyam, Director, Legal Division, UPMPACC  Ch. Ochir, Director, Land Ownership and Management Division, Land Office of the Capital City  B. Munkhbaatar, Director, Policy and Planning Division, GAID of the Capital City  M. Enkhbaatar, Head of Division of Construction License, Mongolian

Organization	At the Outset (October 19 2015)	First Revision (October 26 2016)	Second Revision (February 17 2017)	Third Revision (August 30 2017)	At the Completion (April 23 2018)
	Area Development Agency	<p>Capital City</p> <p><u>Ch. Regzmaa, Chief engineer. UPADI</u></p> <p><u>Ts. Erdembayar, Chair, Board of Directors, Association of Urban Redevelopment Project Implementers</u></p>	<p><u>J. Davaasuren, Director, Policy Coordination Division, Road Development Agency of the Capital City</u></p> <p><u>Ts. Byambajargal, Officer, Policy and Planning Division, UB City Government</u></p> <p><u>Ch. Regzmaa, Chief Engineer, UPADI</u></p> <p><u>G. Batkhisig, Head of Division, UPADI</u></p> <p><u>A. Enkhmanlai, Deputy Director, NOSK</u></p>	<p>National Construction Association</p> <p>Ch. Regzmaa, Director, UPADI</p> <p>D. Gangabaatar, Associate Professor, Doctor of Law, School of Law, National University of Mongolia</p> <p>B. Bayarjargal, Director, Mongolian Institute of Certified Appraisers NGO</p> <p>Ts. Erdembayar, Chair, Board of Directors, Association of Urban Redevelopment Project Implementers</p> <p>B. Batchimeg, Lawyer, Member of Mongolian Lawyers Association</p> <p>B. Chinzorig, Specialist of Resettlement, ADB</p>	<p>National Construction Association</p> <p>Ch. Regzmaa, Director, UPADI</p> <p>D. Gangabaatar, Associate Professor, Doctor of Law, School of Law, National University of Mongolia</p> <p>B. Bayarjargal, Director, Mongolian Institute of Certified Appraisers NGO</p> <p>Ts. Erdembayar, Chair, Board of Directors, Association of Urban Redevelopment Project Implementers</p> <p>B. Batchimeg, Lawyer, Member of Mongolian Lawyers Association</p> <p>B. Chinzorig, Specialist of Resettlement, ADB</p>

## 6) Training Working Group

**Manager:** S. Magnasuren State Secretary, MCUD

**Secretary:** E. Ariunnyam Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD

<b>A. Sub-WG of Old Apartment Reconstruction Project</b>			
Leader	1	M. Nyambayar	Head of Urban Redevelopment Division, MPACC
Member	2	B. Amartuvshin	Legal Division, State Administrative Management Department, MCUD
	3	O. Enkhtuya	Senior Officer, Public Utility Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD
	4	O. Odbayar	Director, Urban Planning Division, ALAMGaC
	5	B. Byambasuren	Officer, Policy and Planning Division, UB City Government
	6	M. Chimeddorj	Officer, Land Management and Planning Division, Land Department
	7	D. Bayartsetseg	Officer, Land Department, Bayangol District
	8	Ch. Regzmaa	Head of UPDI
	9	Ch. Batzul	Project leader, TOSK
<b>B. Sub-WG of Ger-to-apartment Project</b>			
Leader	1	D. Bolormaa	Regional and Urban Planning Division, ALAMGaC
Member	2	Ts. Bayarbat	Senior Officer, Administrative Cooperation Division, ALAMGaC
	3	S. Densmaa	Officer, Land Management Division, ALAMGaC
	4	S. Enkhjargal	Officer, Legal Division, , UB City Government
	5	Ya. Bolor	Officer, Legal Division, MPACC
	6	L. Otogonbaatar	Officer, Land Management and Planning Division, Land Department
	7	T. Ganchimeg	Officer, Land Management and Planning Division, Land Department
	8	G. Ariunzaya	Officer, Land Management and Planning Division, Land Department
	9	B. Azjargal	Head of Administrative Division, GAID
	10	Ch. Otogontsetseg	Officer, Legal Division, GAID
	11	B. Hulan	Architect, UPDI
	12	M. Nomun	Architect, UPDI
	13	B. Munkhgerel	Architect, TOSK
	14	M. Enkhbaatar	Head of Construction License, Mongolian National Construction Association
	15	B. Batchimeg	Lawyer, Member of Mongolian Lawyers Association
<b>C. Sub-WG of LR Project</b>			
Leader	1	B. Munkhbaatar	Director, Policy and Planning Division, GAID of the Capital City
Member	2	B. Goyosaikhan	Officer, Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Implementation Coordination Department, MCUD
	3	R. Batchimeg	Public Utility Policy Implementation Coordination Department,

			MCUD
4	O. Dulguuntuul		Senior officer, Administration, Management and Cooperation Department, ALAMGaC
5	J. Chingim		Officer, Regional and Urban Planning Division, ALAMGaC
6	B. Oyuntuya		Head of Infrastructure Division, MPACC
7	G. Davaajav		Senior Officer, Policy and Planning Division, GAID
8	J. Bayasgalan		Chief Engineer, UPDI
9	G. Ariunaa		Coordinator, MUGCUP2
10	G. Bayartuvshin		Specialist, MUGCUP2
11	Kh. Jambota		Specialist, MUGCUP2
12	E. Dondomaa		Consulting Architect of Urban Planning

### (3) List of Trainings

#### 1) Training in Japan

Training	Date	Number of Participants	Agenda
Training in Japan	February 5-18, 2017	16	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· To learn three URD project schemes in Japan, i.e. URD projects, LR projects and old apartment reconstruction projects;</li> <li>· To learn urban development administration system in Japan; and</li> <li>· To learn housing policies for low-income people and policy implementation mechanisms in Japan.</li> </ul>

#### 2) Training in Mongolia

Training	Date	Number of Participants	Agenda
First Training	September 22-24, 2015	65	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Mechanisms for URD</li> <li>· Current situation and issues of URD implementing in Ulaanbaatar</li> <li>· Site visits of URD projects</li> <li>· Situation of housing market and importance of housing policy for low- and middle-income households</li> </ul>
Second Training	March 7, 9, 10, 2016	63	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Project framework and planning</li> </ul>
Third Training	December 6-7, 2016	64	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Mechanisms for URD</li> <li>· Current situations and issues on URD being implemented in Ulaanbaatar</li> <li>· Introduction of the Urban Redevelopment Law and its rules and regulations</li> </ul>
Fourth Training	May 22-24, 2017	67	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Mechanism on URD</li> <li>· Rules and regulations on the URD Law</li> <li>· Current situations and issues on URD implementation in Ulaanbaatar</li> <li>· Project framework and planning</li> </ul>

Fifth Training	November 20-24, 2018	61	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Outline of URD</li> <li>· Outline of project framework and planning</li> <li>· Methodology of replotting planning</li> </ul>
----------------	----------------------	----	---

Note: The number of participants refers to those who participated more than half of the training sessions.

### 3) Training for the Departments in Charge of Land Readjustment Projects

Sr	Date	Number of participants	Agenda
1	June 12, 2015	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Kick-off for F/S of Ger Area LR model projects (8 projects)</li> <li>· Review of current draft plans of model project</li> </ul>
2	July 24, 2015	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Training for case study of project frame for Ger Area LR project</li> <li>· Process and methodologies of case study</li> </ul>
3	August 4 and 5, 2015	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Discussion of result of case study of 8 model projects</li> <li>· Finding issues and revision point of project frame</li> </ul>
4	October 20, 2015	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Case Study of estimation of re-plotting lands</li> </ul>
5	December 2, 2015	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Discussion of revised project frame of 8 model project</li> </ul>
6	Mar 15 and 18, 2016	20	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Outline of URD</li> <li>· Mechanism of Ger Area LR project</li> </ul>
7	October 13, 2016	18	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Background of the URD Law, including issues on URD and outline of MUGCUP2</li> <li>· Outline of URD</li> <li>· Outline of the URD Law</li> </ul>
8	November 15, 2016	17	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Rule and regulation on project site selection</li> <li>· Rule and regulation on ger-to-apartment project</li> </ul>
9	March 29-31, 2017	8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Project framework and planning</li> </ul>
10	April 7, 2017	8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Possible indicators to compare unit infrastructure systems</li> </ul>
11	June 15, 2017	13	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Comparison of unit infrastructure design</li> </ul>
12	March 12, 14, 16, 2018	17/22/24	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Preparation of project framework and land replotting</li> <li>· Consensus building</li> </ul>
13	April 18, 2018	9	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Purpose and contents of draft implementation plan for LR</li> <li>· Practice to present the draft implementation plan in residential meetings</li> </ul>
14	August 31, 2018	11	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Replotting planning</li> </ul>
15	November 30, 2018	6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Monitoring of ger-to-apartment projects</li> </ul>

#### (4) List of Meetings

##### 1) Working Group

Meeting	Date	Number of participants	Agenda
First WG Meeting	18 March 2015	28	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• JPT's presentation of MUGCUP2's work plan and discussion with the counterparts.</li> </ul>
Second WG Meeting	25 May 2015	18	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• JPT's presentation of major issues they found in urban redevelopment projects.</li> </ul>
Third WG Meeting	15 September 2015	27	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Review current plan of ger area land readjustment (LR) projects and orientation of the feasibility study (F/S)</li> <li>• Progress of the F/S for the model area of ger area LR projects</li> <li>• Progress and activity plan of MUGCUP2</li> </ul>
Fourth WG Meeting	18 November 2015	29	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Result of market survey conducted by MUGCUP2</li> <li>• Issues to consider in preparing housing policy for low income households</li> <li>• Progress and activity plan of MUGCUP2</li> </ul>
Fifth WG Meeting	10 December 2015	29	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Issues for infrastructure planning on ger area LR projects</li> <li>• Progress of F/S of model projects and selection of the priority projects</li> <li>• Basic direction of the policy and medium term implementation plan of UB's redevelopment</li> <li>• Progress of preparation of rules and regulations of the Law on City and Town Redevelopment</li> </ul>
Sixth WG Meeting	February 4, 2016	26	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• MUGCUP Progress and Schedule</li> <li>• Progress of Contract Work for DDMP from Master Planning Agency of Capital City (MPACC) of the Ulaanbaatar City Government</li> <li>• Progress of Contract Work for Eight Land Readjustment (LR) Project Sites from the Capital City Housing Corporation (NOSK)</li> <li>• Progress and Corporation Mechanism to Carry on LR Projects</li> <li>• Collaboration Mechanism to Prepare Ulaanbaatar's Housing Policy for LIH</li> </ul>
Seventh WG Meeting	April 26, 2016	12	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Results of the Satisfaction Survey among Residents Involved in Ger-to-Apartment Project</li> <li>• Progress of LR Project Sub-Working Group (SWG) Activities</li> <li>• Progress of Ulaanbaatar's Housing Policy for LIH SWG Activities</li> <li>• Progress of the Preparation of Rules and Regulations of URL</li> <li>• MUGCUP2's Progress and Schedule</li> </ul>
Eighth WG Meeting	March 23, 2017	28	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Outline of MUGCUP2 activities and progress;</li> <li>• Challenges and next activities; and</li> <li>• Introduction of PR tools.</li> </ul>



Meeting	Date	Number of participants	Agenda
Ninth WG Meeting	April 6, 2017	13	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Discussion on the preparation of the PR tools.</li> </ul>
10th WG Meeting	May 11, 2017	12	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Discussion on the contents of the PR movie.</li> </ul>
WG Retreat	June 3, 2017	15	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Discussion on the contents of the PR tools (movie and pamphlet).</li> </ul>
11th WG Meeting	June 6, 2017	27	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Progress of MUGCUP2 activities;</li> <li>• Issues and measures of MUGCUP2 related activities; and</li> <li>• LR Model Project site selection.</li> </ul>
12th WG Meeting	June 13, 2017	23	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• LR Model Project site selection;</li> <li>• Unit infrastructure;</li> <li>• Land valuation for land readjustment (LR) project;</li> <li>• Ulaanbaatar City's draft housing program by NOSK (Ulaanbaatar City Housing Corporation); and</li> <li>• Housing policy for low-income households (LIHs).</li> </ul>
13th WG Meeting	June 27, 2017	11	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• PR tools</li> </ul>
14th WG Meeting	July 31, 2017	14	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Review of final version of PR movie and draft pamphlet</li> </ul>
15th WG Meeting	October 10, 2017	15	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Progress and schedule from September 2017</li> <li>• Progress and schedule of Rules and Regulation Working Group</li> <li>• Progress and schedule of Model Projects</li> <li>• Issues related to Unit Infrastructure Service Center</li> <li>• Preparation of the PR tools, handbook, and training course</li> </ul>
16th WG Meeting	January 31, 2018	22	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Progress and schedule of Rules and Regulation Working Group</li> <li>• Result of Study on Service Center (Unit Infrastructure)</li> <li>• Progress and schedule of Model Projects</li> <li>• Handbook and training course on Urban Redevelopment</li> </ul>
17th WG Meeting	April 24, 2018	15	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Progress and schedule of Rules and Regulation Working Group</li> <li>• Progress and schedule of Model Projects</li> <li>• Preparation of the public relations (PR) tools, Handbook, and Training Course on Urban Redevelopment</li> </ul>
18th WG Meeting	May 14, 2018	14	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Progress and schedule of MUGCUP2</li> </ul>
19th WG Meeting	May 29, 2018	15	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Share the decisions of the 7th JCC meeting</li> <li>• Schedule from June to achieve the decisions</li> </ul>
20th WG Meeting	July 18, 2018	15	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ger-to-apartment project video scenario</li> <li>• Old apartment reconstruction project video scenario</li> </ul>

Meeting	Date	Number of participants	Agenda
21th WG Meeting	July 30, 2018	14	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Updated scenario of Old apartment reconstruction project video</li> </ul>
22nd WG Meeting	September 4, 2018	19	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Presentation and approval of Ger-to-apartment project video</li> <li>Presentation of scenario of Old apartment reconstruction project video</li> <li>Presentation and approval of Old apartment reconstruction project pamphlet</li> </ul>
23rd WG Meeting	October 25, 2018	18	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Presentation and approval of Old apartment reconstruction project video</li> <li>Presentation and approval of Ger-to-apartment project pamphlet</li> <li>Preparation of Ger area land reorganization video and pamphlet</li> </ul>
24th WG Meeting	November 1, 2018	17	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Presentation of scenario of Ger area land reorganization project video</li> <li>Progress of MUGCUP2 project</li> </ul>
25th WG Meeting	November 14, 2018	8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Approval of scenario of Ger area land reorganization project video, and check the video making process</li> </ul>
26th WG Meeting	December 4, 2018	19	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Discussion on the LR project pamphlet</li> <li>Evaluation results of MUGCUP2</li> </ul>

## 2) Sub-Working Group

Meeting	Date	Number of participants	Agenda
First Housing Policy SWG Meeting	April 5, 2016	14	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Purpose of the SWG</li> <li>Scope of work and schedule</li> <li>Review of analysis in the past</li> <li>Discussion on LIH housing policy and measures</li> <li>New projection methodology for detailed profile</li> <li>Overview of current projection methodology</li> <li>Discussion on providing the “controlling total” for URD policy/plan</li> </ul>
Second Housing Policy SWG Meeting	April 21, 2016	11	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Progress of housing projection</li> <li>Definition of target group</li> <li>Minimum housing standard</li> <li>Necessity of rental housing units</li> </ul>
Third Housing Policy SWG Meeting	May 23, 2016	14	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Housing policy of MCUD and the Ulaanbaatar city government</li> <li>Housing policy categories by types of housing policy for LIH</li> </ul>
Fourth Housing Policy SWG Meeting	May 26, 2016	9	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Progress of housing projection</li> <li>Discussion on outlines of housing policy for LIH</li> </ul>

Meeting	Date	Number of participants	Agenda
Fifth Housing Policy SWG Meeting	June 14, 2016	11	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Results of housing projection</li> </ul>
First Model Project SWG Meeting	April 19, 2016	40	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Discussion of inception reports and progress of planning work of private companies</li> <li>Discussion of land evaluation method for LR project</li> </ul>
Second Model Project SWG Meeting	April 28, 2016	15	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Infrastructure planning of LR projects</li> </ul>
Third Model Project SWG Meeting	May 6, 2016	13	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project schedule and transfer rules and regulations from the city ones to the one newly prepared following the URD Law</li> </ul>
Fourth Model Project SWG Meeting	September 22, 2017	8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Schedule of LR SWG</li> <li>Topographical Map and Land Data of LR model project</li> <li>Building Survey of LR model project</li> <li>Discussion for Next Steps</li> </ul>
Sixth Housing Policy SWG Meeting	November 27, 2017	13	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Funding requirement and simulation of LIH housing measures</li> </ul>
Fifth Model Project SWG Meeting	December 05, 2017	16	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Topographical Map, Land Data and Building Survey</li> <li>Concept of Land Re-plotting Plan for Ger Area LR Project</li> <li>Draft Land Use Plan for Candidate of Ger Area LR Project</li> <li>Discussion for Next Steps</li> </ul>
Sixth Model Project SWG Meeting	March 20, 2018	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Progress of LR model project</li> <li>Proposal of LR model project plan</li> <li>Discussion for Next Steps</li> </ul>
Seminar on Housing Policy	March 22, 2018	32	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Presentation on MCUD's housing policy</li> <li>Presentation on UB City's housing policy implementation</li> <li>Presentation of role of housing policy for development of Ulaanbaatar</li> <li>Presentation on housing measures for LIH</li> </ul>
Seventh Model Project SWG Meeting	June 19, 2018	9	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Progress of LR model project</li> <li>Re-plotting plan for LR model project, and the challenges</li> <li>Discussion for Next Steps</li> </ul>
Eight Model Project SWG	December 3, 2018	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Progress of Ch7 project</li> </ul>

### 3) Rules and Regulations Working Group

Sr.	Date	Number of participants	Agenda
1	November 11, 2015	19	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Kick-off meeting</li> <li>The rules and regulations of the redevelopment law to be</li> </ul>

Sr.	Date	Number of participants	Agenda
			<p>discussed first</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Group formation to prepare each rules and regulations of the Law on City and Town Redevelopment</li> <li>· Rules on (1) Land Contribution, (2) Compensation, (3) Project Area Selection, and (4) Tripartite Contract Agreement Form would be drafted based on the previous draft rules prepared by ALAGaC</li> </ul>
2	November 18, 2015	17	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Each group was expected to present draft rules and regulations. Instead, the members individually expressed their opinions. The WG chairperson asked the members to prepare drafts by group. Four sub-groups for the abovementioned four rules were formed</li> </ul>
3	December 4, 2015	17	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· The draft rules and regulations on land contribution was presented and discussed. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The major discussion was about the level of the rules and regulations; what points need to be included in rules and regulations in the national level, and what points need to be done into the rules and regulations of the UB City and Aimag levels. There was also a question if Aimags solely, with no experience to conduct redevelopment, can manage the preparation.</li> <li>- Each sub-group had prepared the first drafts.</li> </ul> </li> <li>· They would collect comments from JPT and other related organizations regarding the first draft rules.</li> </ul>
4	January 29, 2016	20	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· WG would have an intensive session on February 17 and 18, 2016 to revise the first draft based on the comments from JPT and relevant organizations.</li> </ul>
5	April 20, 2016	16	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· The four rules under preparation and the three rules to be drafted were discussed</li> <li>· Sub-groups were established for the project implementation process rules of the (1) Ger-to-Apartment Project, (2) Ger Area Land Readjustment Project, and (3) Old Apartment Reconstruction Project.</li> <li>· The sub-groups would draft the said three project implementation process rules based on Ulaanbaatar city's approved rules and ALAGaC's related rules.</li> </ul>
6	May 5, 2016	15	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· The WG would have an intensive session on May 19 and 20, 2016 to draft the three process rules.</li> </ul>
7	November 30, 2016	17	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Progress of preparation of the rules and regulations</li> <li>· Discussion on how to proceed to the next activities and persons in charge</li> </ul>
8	December 20, 2016	17	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Advice from JPT about rules on compensation</li> <li>· Discussion on revising the rules on compensation</li> <li>· Explanation about changes in rules and regulations on old-apartment reconstruction projects by the MP Department of Ulaanbaatar City</li> <li>· Discussion on revising the rules and regulations on old-apartment reconstruction projects</li> </ul>

Sr.	Date	Number of participants	Agenda
9	February 03, 2017	14	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Compensation policy and practice from ADB</li> <li>· Discussion on draft rules and regulations on compensation</li> </ul>
10	March 31, 2017	16	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Discussion on draft rules and regulations on compensation</li> <li>· Advice from JPT about rules on land contribution</li> </ul>
11	April 11, 2017	18	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Public opinion on the rules on compensation</li> </ul>
12	April 14, 2017	17	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Public opinion on the rules on compensation</li> </ul>
13	May 12, 2017	14	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Discussion on draft rules and regulations on land contribution</li> </ul>
14	August 09, 2017	8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Discussion on draft rules and regulations on compensation</li> </ul>
15	September 12, 2017	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Introduction of PR movie of the URD law</li> <li>· Grouping of sub-working group members</li> <li>· Explanation on compensation on immovable property</li> </ul>
16	November 29-30, 2017	13	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Discussion on draft rules and regulations on compensation</li> </ul>
17	December 5, 2017	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Discussion on draft rules and regulations on land contribution</li> </ul>
18	December 7-8, 2017	9	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Discussion on draft rules and regulations on land contribution</li> </ul>
19	January 23, 2018	15	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Japan's methods and types for calculating compensation in scope of land reorganization project</li> <li>· Discussion on comments from Cabinet members, Governor of the capital city and MUGCUP2 Project of JICA for the draft rules and regulations on compensation</li> </ul>
20	January 25, 2018	17	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Japan's methods and types for contributing land in scope of land reorganization project</li> <li>· Discussion on comments from Cabinet members, Governor of the capital city and MUGCUP2 Project of JICA for the draft rules and regulations on land contribution</li> </ul>
21	March 20, 2018	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Meeting with only lawyer members of the WG to discuss about the draft rules and regulations on compensation</li> <li>· Dr. Nagayama and Mr. Matsui from the Project Team participated in the meeting, and shared opinion</li> </ul>
22	May 17, 2018	21	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Working group meeting after re-establishment</li> </ul>
23	June 07, 2018	9	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Comments from Cabinet members, Governor of the capital city, ALAMGaC, MUGCUP2 Project of JICA for the draft rules and regulations on land contribution were discussed and reflected during a retreat meeting.</li> </ul>
24	June 13, 2018	6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Comments from Cabinet members, Governor of the capital city, ALAMGaC, MUGCUP2 Project of JICA for the draft rules and regulations on compensation were discussed and reflected during a retreat meeting.</li> </ul>
25	June 26, 2018	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Discussion on draft rules and regulations on compensation</li> </ul>
26	July 26, 2018	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Discussion on draft rules and regulations on land contribution</li> </ul>
27	August 24, 2018	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>· Discussion on draft rules and regulations on land contribution</li> </ul>

Sr.	Date	Number of participants	Agenda
28	September 04, 2018	3	• Discussion on draft rules and regulations on land contribution
29	September 11, 2018	4	• Discussion on draft rules and regulations on land contribution
30	September 25, 2018	4	• Discussion on draft rules and regulations on land contribution
31	October 29, 2018	8	• Discussion on draft rules and regulations on land contribution

#### 4) Training Working Group

Sr.	Date	Number of participants	Agenda
1	March 27, 2018	15	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Purpose of training for trainers (TOT)</li> <li>• Preparation of handbook</li> <li>• TOT activity schedule</li> </ul>
2	April 19-20, 2018	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Explanation about TOT activity</li> <li>• Explanation about the URD Law</li> <li>• Preparation of PR tools</li> <li>• Preparation of handbook</li> </ul>
3	May 29, 2018	17	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Progress of handbook preparation</li> <li>• Discussion on curriculum/ TOC of the handbook</li> </ul>
4	June 21, 2018	14	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How to prepare the project framework</li> <li>• Discussion on handbook and curriculum</li> </ul>
5	June 29, 2018 (only with group leaders)	5	• Feedback on the first draft of the handbook prepared by counterparts
6	September 06, 2018	19	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Preparation of handbook</li> <li>• Training course on Urban Redevelopment for Trainers</li> </ul>
7	October 04, 2018	22	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Organization of trainers' training on urban redevelopment</li> <li>• Organization of practice training for trainers</li> <li>• Preparation of handbook</li> <li>• Progress of preparing old apartment reconstruction video</li> <li>• Comments for draft ger-to-apartment pamphlet</li> <li>• Preparation of LR video and pamphlet</li> </ul>
8	October 17-19, 2018 (only trainers who were satisfied with the qualification)	5	• Practice training 1
9	November 13, 2018	12	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Organization of practice training for trainers</li> <li>• Progress of preparation of LR video scenario</li> <li>• Comments for draft handbook</li> </ul>
10	November 28-30, 2018	16	• Practice training 2

## ANNEX 2: List of Products (Report, Manuals, Handbooks, etc.) Produced by the Project

Sr.	Date	Title
1	July 2015	• Work Plan (English/ Mongolian)
2	August 7, 2015	• Monitoring Sheet Vol.1 (English/ Mongolian)
3	December 25, 2015	• Monitoring Sheet Vol.2 (English/ Mongolian)
4	February 2016	• Report on Hosing Market Survey (English/ Mongolian)
5	May 2016	• Report on Satisfaction Survey among Residents involved in the Ger-to-Apartment Project (English/ Mongolian)
6	June 30, 2016	• Monitoring Sheet Vol.3 (English/ Mongolian)
7	December 29, 2016	• Monitoring Sheet Vol.4 (English/ Mongolian)
8	June 30, 2017	• Monitoring Sheet Vol.5 (English/ Mongolian)
9	August 2017	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Completion Report (The First Year) (English/ Mongolian)</li> <li>• PR tools (Introduction) (Pamphlet) (English/ Mongolian)</li> <li>• PR tools (Introduction) (Movie) (Mongolian)</li> <li>• Rules and Regulations of the Urban Redevelopment Law (Draft) (English/ Mongolian)</li> <li>• Urban Redevelopment Policy (English/ Mongolian)</li> <li>• Materials for Joint Coordination Committee and Working Group Meetings, and Trainings (The First Year) (English/ Mongolian)</li> </ul>
10	December 28. 2017	• Monitoring Sheet Vol.6 (English/ Mongolian)
11	July 13, 2018	• Monitoring Sheet Vol.7 (English/ Mongolian)
12	December 2018	• PR Material of MUGCUP2 (Japanese/ Mongolian)
13	January 2019	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Project Completion Report (English/ Mongolian)</li> <li>• PR tools (Old-apartment Reconstruction) (Pamphlet) (English/ Mongolian)</li> <li>• PR tools (Old-apartment Reconstruction) (Movie) (Mongolian)</li> <li>• PR tools (Ger-to-Apartment) (Pamphlet) (English/ Mongolian)</li> <li>• PR tools (Ger-to-Apartment) (Movie) (Mongolian)</li> <li>• PR tools (Land Readjustment) (Pamphlet) (English/ Mongolian)</li> <li>• PR tools (Land Readjustment) (Movie) (Mongolian)</li> <li>• Rules and Regulations of the Urban Redevelopment Law (as of December 2018) (English/ Mongolian)</li> <li>• Discussion Paper on Institutional Development (English/ Mongolian)</li> <li>• Handbook on Urban Redevelopment for Practitioners (English/ Mongolian)</li> <li>• Materials for Joint Coordination Committee and Working Group Meetings, and Trainings (The Second Year) (English/ Mongolian)</li> </ul>

### ANNEX 3: PDM (All versions of PDM)

#### (1) Ver. 1 (at Minutes of Meeting on October 7 2014)

Project title: Improvement for Planning and Implementation Skills of Ulaanbaatar Master Plan

Whole project term: 2014 – 2018 (4 years and 3 months)

Sub-project 1 title: Project on Capacity Development in Implementation Planning of Ulaanbaatar Master plan

Sub-project 1 term: 2014 – 2016 (2 years)

Sub-project 2 title: The Second Phase of Project on Capacity Development in Urban Development Sector in Mongolia

Sub-project 2 term: 2014 – 2018 (4 years)

Target area: Ulaanbaatar City, MONGOLIA

Applicant: Ministry of Construction and Urban Development, Ulaanbaatar City Government

Narrative summary	Objectively verifiable indicators	Means of verification	Important assumptions
<p>Overall Goal (Sub-project 1 and 2)</p> <p>Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar (UB) City are improved through planned urban development based on the Ulaanbaatar 2020 Master Plan Amendment and Development Approaches for 2030 (UB MP2020) approved by the 23rd Parliament Resolution in 2013</p> <p>Project Purpose (Sub-project 1 and 2)</p> <p>Capacity of urban planning and urban development project implementation contributing to upgrading residential environment is enhanced</p>	<p>The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (Heating, Sewerage, Water Supply)</p> <p>1) Improvement of knowledge and capacity for the formulation and promotion of the UB MP2020 implementation plan and the implementation of urban redevelopment projects</p> <p>2) Approval of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>3) Utilization of handbooks for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects for daily work</p> <p>4) The re-organization of UB City government functioning effectively to conduct the UB MP2020 Implementation Plan and Urban Redevelopment Projects</p>	<p>-Reports / Statistics</p> <p>- Interview</p> <p>- Questionnaire</p> <p>- The approved UB MP2020 Implementation Plan</p> <p>- organization chart</p>	<p>- Policy of implementation plan and urban redevelopment will be continued</p> <p>- The budget will be provided for urban development in UB City</p> <p>- Urban redevelopment law is approved</p>



<p>Outputs</p> <p>1: The current status and issues regarding UB MP2020 implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 1)</p>	<p>1. Current status and issues regarding UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>	<p>- Reports - Record of meetings and workshops - Questionnaires</p>	<p>- All the departments of UB City relating to the formulation of the UB MP2020 Implementation Plan participate in the Project</p>
<p>2: Policy objectives and planning principles about the UB MP2020 implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 1)</p>	<p>2. Policy objectives and planning principles about UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>		
<p>3: UB MP2020 implementation plan (2016-2020) is formulated. (Sub-project 1)</p>	<p>3. UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>		
<p>4: A monitoring method of the UB MP2020 implementation plan is established. (Sub-project 1)</p>	<p>4. Monitoring method of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>		
<p>5: The current status and issues regarding urban redevelopment projects (3 schemes) are clarified. (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>5. Current status and issues regarding urban redevelopment projects</p>		
<p>6: Urban redevelopment policy and medium-term implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>6. Reflection of urban redevelopment policy and implementation plan to UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>		
<p>7: Re-organization of ger area land project(s) is(are) promoted through model project(s). (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>7. Implementation of a re-organization of ger area land project</p>		
<p>8: Implementation methodologies of urban redevelopment projects are established (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>8. Implementation of urban redevelopment projects specified in UB MP2020</p>		
<p>9: Citizen participation and provision of information to the public are promoted. (Sub-project 1 and 2)</p>	<p>9. Improvement of result of questionnaires about citizen participation and provision of information to the public conducted in 2015 and 2018</p>		
<p>10: Capacity for the formulation and promotion of the UB MP2020 implementation plan and the implementation of urban redevelopment projects is enhanced. (Sub-project 1 and 2)</p>	<p>10. Improvement of urban redevelopment project's implementation capacity based on self-evaluation</p>		
<p>Activities<sup>1</sup></p> <p>1-1: Analyze the current status of the urban development trend</p>	<p>Inputs Japanese experts;</p>		

1 Scheme A: Re-planning and development of ger area, Scheme B: Re-organization of ger area land project, Scheme C: Old apartment reconstruction project

<p>1-2: Review existing plans in terms of urban development including the UB MP2020</p> <p>2-1: Organize the team framework in UB city to formulate the implementation plan</p> <p>2-2: Formulate policy objectives for the realization of the UB MP2020</p> <p>2-3: Formulate priority issues for the realization of the UB MP2020</p> <p>2-4: Formulate sectoral policies (Ministry level, City level)</p> <p>2-5: Formulate finance policies for the realization of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>3-1: Coordinate ministerial projects with ministries concerned</p> <p>3-2: Sort out individual projects and set each project's cost</p> <p>3-3: Formulate a finance plan for the realization of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>3-4: Formulate the draft implementation plan and adjust it to finalize</p> <p>3-5: Make necessary modifications to the implementation plan</p> <p>4-1: Set up monitoring indicators</p> <p>4-2: Study issues and problems of monitoring the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>4-3: Establish a monitoring structure in UB city</p> <p>5-1: Conduct comparative study on on-going projects and analyze issues (scheme A)</p> <p>5-2: Review current status and achievements and analyze issues (Scheme B, C)</p> <p>6-1: Review urban redevelopment policy from the viewpoint of realization of UB MP2020 and revise the policy (if necessary)</p>	<p>Sub-project 1:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Urban Planning</li> <li>2) Urban Development Management</li> <li>3) Administrative Management</li> <li>4) Cost Analysis</li> </ol> <p>Sub-project 2:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Land Re-adjustment Planning / Urban Redevelopment Planning</li> <li>2) Utility Planning (Heating, Sewage, Water Supply)</li> <li>3) Real Estate Evaluation</li> <li>4) Urban Redevelopment Relating Laws / Housing Finance</li> <li>5) Training Planning / Public Relations Planning</li> </ol> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Training of counterpart including training programs in Japan</li> <li>- Necessary equipment</li> </ul> <p>Mongolian side;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Provision of office and equipment</li> <li>- Telephone line and internet connection</li> <li>- Appointment of counterparts</li> <li>- Counterpart budget: administrative cost including transportation and utility</li> </ul>	<p>Preconditions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mongolian counterpart personnel for the Project are properly assigned.</li> <li>- Mongolian side allocates necessary budget for the Project.</li> </ul>
---	--	---

<p>(Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>6-2: Clarify costs for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects for 5 years including infrastructure cost (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>7-1: Select a model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p>7-2: Formulate local unit utility plan (Scheme B)</p> <p>7-3: Support preparation of the model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p>7-4: Support implementation of the model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p>8-1: Draft relating norms, standards, rules and regulations for the operation of urban redevelopment law</p> <p>8-2: Formulate or revise UB city's rules and regulations necessary for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>8-3: Develop implementation handbooks of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>8-4: Standardize project planning and project execution (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>8-5: Propose promotion measures for sales and purchase of properties developed by urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>9-1: Hear and take in citizen's opinions in the process of formulation of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>9-2: Provide information about the formulated implementation plan to citizens</p> <p>9-3: Establish a method of citizen participation in urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>9-4: Formulate PR tools of urban redevelopment projects for promoting public understanding (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>9-5: Disseminate urban redevelopment policy to public (Scheme A, B, C)</p>	
---	--

	<p>10-1: Organize knowledge sharing seminars in terms of capacity-building of organization and personnel of Japanese local governments</p> <p>10-2: Conduct capacity assessment about the UB MP2020 implementation plan (finance, policy, organization structure)</p> <p>10-3: Analyze the current status and issues regarding the implementation capacity of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>10-4: Conduct a survey of citizen satisfaction level as to UB city administrative services</p> <p>10-5: Propose the improvement of the organization structure of UB city and government organizations concerned (including the implementation structure of urban redevelopment projects)</p> <p>10-6: Organize seminars/workshops in UB city for improvement of UB city administrative management</p> <p>10-7: Implement training programs in UB city about Urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>10-8: Implement training programs in Japan about city administrative management and urban redevelopment (one time respectively)</p>
--	---

**(2) Ver. 2 (at 4<sup>th</sup> JCC meeting on April 27 2016)**

Project title: Improvement for Planning and Implementation Skills of Ulaanbaatar Master Plan

Whole project term: 2014 – 2018 (4 years and 3 months)

Sub-project 1 title: Project on Capacity Development in Implementation Planning of Ulaanbaatar Master plan

Sub-project 1 term: 2014 – 2016 (2 years)

Sub-project 2 title: The Second Phase of Project on Capacity Development in Urban Development Sector in Mongolia

Sub-project 2 term: 2014 – 2018 (4 years)

Target area: Ulaanbaatar City, MONGOLIA

Applicant: Ministry of Construction and Urban Development, Ulaanbaatar City Government

Narrative summary	Objectively verifiable indicators	Means of verification	Important assumptions
<p>Overall Goal (Sub-project 1 and 2) Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar (UB) City are improved through planned urban development based on the Ulaanbaatar 2020 Master Plan Amendment and Development Approaches for 2030 (UB MP2020) approved by the 23rd Parliament Resolution in 2013</p>	<p>The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (Heating, Sewerage, Water Supply)*</p>	<p>-Reports / Statistics</p>	
<p>Project Purpose (Sub-project 1 and 2) Capacity of urban planning and urban development project implementation contributing to upgrading residential environment is enhanced</p>	<p>1) Improvement of knowledge and capacity for the formulation and promotion of the UB MP2020 implementation plan and the implementation of urban redevelopment projects 2) Approval of the UB MP2020 implementation plan 3) Utilization of handbooks for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects for daily work 4) The re-organization of UB City government functioning effectively to conduct the UB MP2020 Implementation Plan and Urban Redevelopment Projects</p>	<p>- Interview - Questionnaire - The approved UB MP2020 Implementation Plan - organization chart</p>	<p>- Policy of implementation plan and urban redevelopment will be continued - The budget will be provided for urban development in UB City - Urban redevelopment law is approved</p>
<p>Outputs 1: The current status and issues regarding UB MP2020 implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 1) 2: Policy objectives and planning principles about the UB MP2020 implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 1) 3: UB MP2020 implementation plan (2016-2020) is formulated. (Sub-project 1) 4: A monitoring method of the UB MP2020 implementation plan is established. (Sub-project 1)</p>	<p>1. Current status and issues regarding UB MP2020 implementation plan 2. Policy objectives and planning principles about UB MP2020 implementation plan 3. UB MP2020 implementation plan 4. Monitoring method of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>	<p>- Reports - Record of meetings and workshops - Questionnaires</p>	<p>- All the departments of UB City relating to the formulation of the UB MP2020 Implementation Plan participate in the Project</p>

<p>5: The current status and issues regarding urban redevelopment projects (3 schemes) are clarified. (Sub-project 2)</p> <p>6: Ulaanbaatar's housing policy for low-income households is formulated. (Sub-project 2)</p> <p>7: Ulaanbaatar's urban redevelopment policy and medium-term implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 2)</p> <p>8: Re-organization of ger area land project(s) is(are) promoted through model project(s). (Sub-project 2)</p> <p>9: Implementation methodologies of urban redevelopment projects are established (Sub-project 2)</p> <p>10: Citizen participation and provision of information to the public are promoted. (Sub-project 1 and 2)</p> <p>11: Capacity for the formulation and promotion of the UB MP2020 implementation plan and the implementation of urban redevelopment projects is enhanced. (Sub-project 1 and 2)</p> <p>Activities<sup>2</sup></p> <p>1-1: Analyze the current status of the urban development trend</p> <p>1-2: Review existing plans in terms of urban development including the UB MP2020</p> <p>2-1: Organize the team framework in UB city to formulate the implementation plan</p> <p>2-2: Formulate policy objectives for the realization of the UB</p>	<p>5. Current status and issues regarding urban redevelopment projects</p> <p>6. Ulaanbaatar's Housing policy for low-income households</p> <p>7. Reflection of urban redevelopment policy and medium-term implementation plan to UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>8. Implementation of a re-organization of ger area land project</p> <p>9. Implementation of urban redevelopment projects specified in UB MP2020</p> <p>10. Improvement of result of questionnaires about citizen participation and provision of information to the public conducted in 2015 and 2018</p> <p>11. Improvement of urban redevelopment project's implementation capacity based on self-evaluation</p>	
<p>Inputs</p> <p>Japanese experts;</p> <p>Sub-project 1:</p> <p>1) Urban Planning</p> <p>2) Urban Development Management</p> <p>3) Administrative Management</p> <p>4) Cost Analysis</p>		

2 Scheme A: Re-planning and development of ger area, Scheme B: Re-organization of ger area land project, Scheme C: Old apartment reconstruction project

<p>MP2020</p> <p>2-3: Formulate priority issues for the realization of the UB MP2020</p> <p>2-4: Formulate sectoral policies (Ministry level, City level)</p> <p>2-5: Formulate finance policies for the realization of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>3-1: Coordinate ministerial projects with ministries concerned</p> <p>3-2: Sort out individual projects and set each project's cost</p> <p>3-3: Formulate a finance plan for the realization of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>3-4: Formulate the draft implementation plan and adjust it to finalize</p> <p>3-5: Make necessary modifications to the implementation plan</p> <p>4-1: Set up monitoring indicators</p> <p>4-2: Study issues and problems of monitoring the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>4-3: Establish a monitoring structure in UB city</p> <p>5-1: <u>Conduct comparative study on on-going projects held in Ulaanbaatar and analyze issues (scheme A)</u></p> <p>5-2: <u>Review current status and achievements on other urban redevelopment projects held in Ulaanbaatar and analyze issues (Scheme B, C)</u></p> <p>5-3: <u>Review current status and analyze issues on urban redevelopment projects (3 schemes) planned in Aimag level</u></p> <p>6-1: <u>Review current status of housing market and analyze issues</u></p> <p>6-2: <u>Analyze housing demand and supply for the medium term</u></p> <p>6-3: <u>Formulate Ulaanbaatar's housing policy for low-income households</u></p>	<p>Sub-project 2:</p> <p>1) Land Re-adjustment Planning / Urban Redevelopment Planning</p> <p>2) Utility Planning (Heating, Sewage, Water Supply)</p> <p>3) Real Estate Evaluation</p> <p>4) Urban Redevelopment Relating Laws / Housing Finance</p> <p>5) Training Planning / Public Relations Planning</p> <p>- Training of counterpart including training programs in Japan</p> <p>- Necessary equipment</p> <p>Mongolian side:</p> <p>- Provision of office and equipment</p> <p>- Telephone line and internet connection</p> <p>- Appointment of counterparts</p> <p>- Counterpart budget: administrative cost including transportation and utility</p>	<p>Preconditions</p> <p>- Mongolian counterpart personnel for the Project are properly assigned.</p> <p>- Mongolian side allocates necessary budget for the Project.</p>
--	--	--

<p>7-1: Review urban redevelopment policy from the viewpoint of realization of UB MP2020 and revise the policy (if necessary) (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>7-2: Clarify costs for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects for 5 years including infrastructure cost (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>8-1: Select a model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p>8-2: Formulate local unit utility plan (Scheme B)</p> <p>8-3: Support preparation of the model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p>8-4: Support implementation of the model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p>9-1: Draft relating norms, standards, rules and regulations for the operation of urban redevelopment law</p> <p>9-2: <u>Provide advice for amending the draft Urban Development Law</u></p> <p>9-3: <u>Provide legal advice for implementation of urban redevelopment project</u></p> <p>9-4: <u>Revise</u> UB city's rules and regulations necessary for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>9-5: <u>Provide advice for implementation of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, C)</u></p> <p>9-6: Develop implementation handbooks of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>9-7: Standardize project planning and project execution (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>9-8: Propose promotion measures for sales and purchase of properties developed by urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>10-1: Hear and take in citizen's opinions in the process of formulation of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>10-2: Provide information about the formulated implementation plan to citizens (i.e. Leaflet, WEB site, etc.)</p>	
---	--



		<p>10-3: Establish a method of citizen participation in urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>10-4: Formulate PR tools of urban redevelopment projects for promoting public understanding (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>10-5: Disseminate urban redevelopment policy to public (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>11-1: Organize knowledge sharing seminars in terms of capacity-building of organization and personnel of Japanese local governments</p> <p>11-2: Conduct capacity assessment about the UB MP2020 implementation plan (finance, policy, organization structure)</p> <p>11-3: Analyze the current status and issues regarding the implementation capacity of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>11-4: Conduct a survey of citizen satisfaction level as to UB city administrative services</p> <p>11-5: Propose the improvement of the organization structure of UB city and government organizations concerned (including the implementation structure of urban redevelopment projects)</p> <p>11-6: Organize seminars/workshops in UB city for improvement of UB city administrative management</p> <p>11-7: Implement training programs in UB city about Urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>11-8: Implement training programs in Japan about city administrative management and urban redevelopment (one time respectively)</p>
--	--	--

Note: \* In Ex-ante Evaluation Paper, there are two objectively verifiable indicators for the overall goal; which are (1) the number of project implemented based on the UB MP2020 implementation plan and (2) the number of citizens living in houses with utility services (Heating, Sewerage, Water Supply). However, as the result of the discussion with the Mongolian side, the Project adopted only indicator (2) as mentioned above.

### (3) Ver.3 (at 5<sup>th</sup> JCC meeting on October 7 2016)

Project title: Improvement for Planning and Implementation Skills of Ulaanbaatar Master Plan

Whole project term: 2014 – 2018 (4 years and 3 months)

Sub-project 1 title: Project on Capacity Development in Implementation Planning of Ulaanbaatar Master plan

Sub-project 1 term: 2014 – 2018 (4 years and 3 months)

Sub-project 2 title: The Second Phase of Project on Capacity Development in Urban Development Sector in Mongolia

Sub-project 2 term: 2014 – 2018 (4 years)

Target area: Ulaanbaatar City, MONGOLIA

Applicant: Ministry of Construction and Urban Development, Ulaanbaatar City Government

Narrative summary	Objectively verifiable indicators	Means of verification	Important assumptions
<p>Overall Goal (Sub-project 1 and 2) Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar (UB) City are improved through planned urban development based on the Ulaanbaatar 2020 Master Plan Amendment and Development Approaches for 2030 (UB MP2020) approved by the 23<sup>rd</sup> Parliament Resolution in 2013</p> <p>Project Purpose (Sub-project 1 and 2) Capacity of urban planning and urban development project implementation contributing to upgrading residential environment is enhanced</p>	<p>The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (Heating, Sewerage, Water Supply)</p> <p>1) Improvement of knowledge and capacity for the formulation and promotion of the UB MP2020 implementation plan and the implementation of urban redevelopment projects 2) Approval of the UB MP2020 implementation plan 3) Utilization of handbooks for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects for daily work 4) The re-organization of UB City government functioning effectively to conduct the UB MP2020 Implementation Plan and Urban Redevelopment Projects</p>	<p>-Reports / Statistics</p> <p>- Interview - Questionnaire - The approved UB MP2020 Implementation Plan - organization chart</p>	<p>- Policy of implementation plan and urban redevelopment will be continued - The budget will be provided for urban development in UB City - Urban redevelopment law is approved</p>

<p>Outputs</p> <p>1: The current status and issues regarding UB MP2020 implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 1)</p>	<p>1. Current status and issues regarding UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>	<p>- All the departments of UB City relating to the formulation of the UB MP2020 Implementation Plan participate in the Project</p>
<p>2: Policy objectives and planning principles about the UB MP2020 implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 1)</p>	<p>2. Policy objectives and planning principles about UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>	<p>- Reports - Record of meetings and workshops - Questionnaires</p>
<p>3: UB MP2020 implementation plan (2016-2020) is formulated. (Sub-project 1)</p>	<p>3. UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>	
<p>4: A monitoring method of the UB MP2020 implementation plan is established. (Sub-project 1)</p>	<p>4. Monitoring method of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>	
<p>5: The current status and issues regarding urban redevelopment projects (3 schemes) are clarified. (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>5. Current status and issues regarding urban redevelopment projects</p>	
<p>6: Ulaanbaatar's housing policy for low-income households is formulated. (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>6. Ulaanbaatar's Housing policy for low-income households</p>	
<p>7: Ulaanbaatar's urban redevelopment policy and medium-term implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>7. Reflection of urban redevelopment policy and medium-term implementation plan to UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>	
<p>8: Re-organization of ger area land project(s) is(are) promoted through model project(s). (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>8. Implementation of a re-organization of ger area land project</p>	
<p>9: Implementation methodologies of urban redevelopment projects are established (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>9. Implementation of urban redevelopment projects specified in UB MP2020</p>	
<p>10: Citizen participation and provision of information to the public are promoted. (Sub-project 1 and 2)</p>	<p>10. Publication tools to citizens (i.e. Leaflet, WEB site, etc)</p>	
<p>11: Capacity for the formulation and promotion of the UB MP2020 implementation plan and the implementation of urban redevelopment projects is enhanced. (Sub-project 1 and 2)</p>	<p>11. Improvement of urban redevelopment project's implementation capacity based on self-evaluation</p>	
<p>Activities<sup>3</sup></p>	<p>Inputs</p>	

3 Scheme A: Re-planning and development of ger area, Scheme B: Re-organization of ger area land project, Scheme C: Old apartment reconstruction project

<p>1-1: Analyze the current status of the urban development trend</p> <p>1-2: Review existing plans in terms of urban development including the UB MP2020</p> <p>2-1: Organize the team framework in UB city to formulate the implementation plan</p> <p>2-2: Formulate policy objectives for the realization of the UB MP2020</p> <p>2-3: Formulate priority issues for the realization of the UB MP2020</p> <p>2-4: Formulate sectoral policies (Ministry level, City level)</p> <p>2-5: Formulate finance policies for the realization of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>3-1: Coordinate ministerial projects with ministries concerned</p> <p>3-2: Sort out individual projects and set each project's cost</p> <p>3-3: Formulate a finance plan for the realization of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>3-4: Formulate the draft implementation plan and adjust it to finalize</p> <p>3-5: Make necessary modifications to the implementation plan</p> <p>4-1: Set up monitoring indicators</p> <p>4-2: Study issues and problems of monitoring the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>4-3: Establish a monitoring structure in UB city</p> <p>4-4: Review the contents of UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>4-5 Monitor implementation of UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>5-1: Conduct comparative study on on-going projects held in Ulaanbaatar and analyze issues (scheme A)</p> <p>5-2: Review current status and achievements on other urban redevelopment projects held in Ulaanbaatar and analyze issues</p>	<p>Japanese experts;</p> <p>Sub-project 1:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Urban Planning</li> <li>2) Urban Development Management</li> <li>3) Administrative Management</li> <li>4) Cost Analysis</li> </ol> <p>Sub-project 2:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Land Re-adjustment Planning / Urban Redevelopment Planning</li> <li>2) Utility Planning (Heating, Sewage, Water Supply)</li> <li>3) Real Estate Evaluation</li> <li>4) Urban Redevelopment Relating Laws / Housing Finance</li> <li>5) Training Planning / Public Relations Planning</li> </ol> <p>- Training of counterpart including training programs in Japan</p> <p>- Necessary equipment</p> <p>Mongolian side;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Provision of office and equipment</li> <li>- Telephone line and internet connection</li> <li>- Appointment of counterparts</li> <li>- Counterpart budget: administrative cost including transportation and utility</li> </ul>	<p>Preconditions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mongolian counterpart personnel for the Project are properly assigned.</li> <li>- Mongolian side allocates necessary budget for the Project.</li> </ul>
---	--	---

<p>(Scheme B, C)</p> <p>5-3: Review current status and analyze issues on urban redevelopment projects (3 schemes) planned in Aimag level</p> <p>6-1: Review current status of housing market and analyze issues</p> <p>6-2: Analyze housing demand and supply for the medium term</p> <p>6-3: Formulate Ulaanbaatar's housing policy for low-income households</p> <p>7-1: Review urban redevelopment policy from the viewpoint of realization of UB MP2020 and revise the policy (if necessary) (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>7-2: Clarify costs for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects for 5 years including infrastructure cost (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>8-1: Select a model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p>8-2: Formulate local unit utility plan (Scheme B)</p> <p>8-3: Support preparation of the model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p>8-4: Support implementation of the model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p>9-1: Draft relating norms, standards, rules and regulations for the operation of urban redevelopment law</p> <p>9-2: Provide advice for amending the draft Urban Development Law</p> <p>9-3: Provide legal advice for implementation of urban redevelopment project</p> <p>9-4: Revise UB city's rules and regulations necessary for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>9-5: Provide advice for implementation of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, C)</p> <p>9-6: Develop implementation handbooks of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p>	
--	--

		<p>9-7: Standardize project planning and project execution (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>9-8: Propose promotion measures for sales and purchase of properties developed by urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>10-1: Hear and take in citizen's opinions in the process of formulation of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>10-2: Provide information about the formulated implementation plan to citizens (i.e. Leaflet, WEB site, etc.)</p> <p>10-3: Establish a method of citizen participation in urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>10-4: Formulate PR tools of urban redevelopment projects for promoting public understanding (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>10-5: Disseminate urban redevelopment policy to public (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>11-1: Organize knowledge sharing seminars in terms of capacity-building of organization and personnel of Japanese local governments</p> <p>11-2: Conduct capacity assessment about the UB MP2020 implementation plan (finance, policy, organization structure)</p> <p>11-3: Analyze the current status and issues regarding the implementation capacity of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>11-4: Conduct a survey of citizen satisfaction level as to UB city administrative services</p> <p>11-5: Propose the improvement of the organization structure of UB city and government organizations concerned (including the implementation structure of urban redevelopment projects)</p> <p>11-6: Organize seminars/workshops in UB city for improvement of UB city administrative management</p>
--	--	---

<p>11-7: Implement training programs in UB city about Urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>11-8: Implement training programs in Japan about city administrative management and urban redevelopment (one time respectively)</p>		
--	--	--

**(4) Ver.4 (at 6<sup>th</sup> JCC meeting on June 8 2017)**

Project title: Improvement for Planning and Implementation Skills of Ulaanbaatar Master Plan  
 Whole project term: 2014 – 2018 (4 years and 3months)  
 Sub-project 1title: Project on Capacity Development in Implementation Planning of Ulaanbaatar Master plan  
 Sub-project1 term: 2014 – 2018 (4 years and 3 months)  
 Sub-project 2title: The Second Phase of Project on Capacity Development in Urban Development Sector in Mongolia  
 Sub-project2 term: 2015 – 2018 (4 years)  
 Target area: Ulaanbaatar City, MONGOLIA  
 Applicant: Ministry of Construction and Urban Development, Ulaanbaatar City Government

Narrative summary	Objectively verifiable indicators	Means of verification	Important assumptions
<p>Overall Goal (Sub-project 1 and 2)            Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar (UB) City are improved through planned urban development based on the Ulaanbaatar 2020 Master Plan Amendment and Development Approaches for 2030 (UB MP2020) approved by the 23rd Parliament Resolution in 2013</p>	<p>The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (Heating, Sewerage, Water Supply)</p> <p>1) Improvement of knowledge and capacity for the formulation and promotion of the UB MP2020 implementation plan and the implementation of urban redevelopment projects</p>	<p>-Reports / Statistics</p> <p>- Interview            - Questionnaire            - The approved UB MP2020 Implementation Plan</p>	<p>- Housing demand is enough to sustain implementation of urban redevelopment projects.            - Policy of implementation plan and urban redevelopment will be continuously applied.            - The budget will be provided for urban development in UB City.            - The UB City is willing to implement implementation plan and urban redevelopment projects. <del>will be continued.</del>            - The budget will be provided for</p>
<p>Project Purpose (Sub-project 1 and 2)            Capacity of urban planning and urban development project implementation contributing to upgrading residential environment is enhanced</p>			

	<p>2) Approval of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>3) Utilization of handbooks for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects for daily work</p> <p>4) The re-organization of UB City government functioning effectively to conduct the UB MP2020 Implementation Plan and Urban Redevelopment Projects</p> <p>5) Proposal of re-organization of UB City government functioning effectively to conduct Urban Redevelopment Projects</p>	<p>- organization chart</p>	<p>urban development projects in UB City</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Urban redevelopment law is approved</li> <li>- Urban redevelopment law related rules and regulations are approved.</li> </ul>
<p>Outputs</p> <p>1: The current status and issues regarding UB MP2020 implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 1)</p>	<p>1. Current status and issues regarding UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>	<p>- Reports</p>	<p>- All the departments of UB City relating to the formulation of the UB MP2020 Implementation Plan participate in the Project</p>
<p>2: Policy objectives and planning principles about the UB MP2020 implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 1)</p>	<p>2. Policy objectives and planning principles about UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>	<p>- Record of meetings and workshops</p> <p>- Questionnaires</p> <p>- Ulaanbaatar's Housing policy for low-income households</p>	
<p>3: UB MP2020 implementation plan (2016-2020) is formulated. (Sub-project 1)</p>	<p>3. UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>	<p>- Project plan of re-organization of ger area land model project(s)</p>	
<p>4: A monitoring method of the UB MP2020 implementation plan is established. (Sub-project 1)</p>	<p>4. Monitoring method of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p>	<p>- Seven rules and regulations of the Urban Redevelopment Law</p>	
<p>5: The current status and issues regarding urban redevelopment projects (3 schemes) are clarified. (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>5. Current status and issues regarding urban redevelopment projects</p>	<p>- Handbook for urban redevelopment project</p>	
<p>6: Ulaanbaatar's housing policy for low-income households is formulated. (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>6. Ulaanbaatar's Housing policy for low-income households is formulated</p>		
<p>7: Ulaanbaatar's urban redevelopment policy and medium-term implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>7. Reflection of urban redevelopment policy and medium-term implementation plan to UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>Ulaanbaatar's urban redevelopment policy and medium-term implementation plan is</p>		



<p>8: Re-organization of ger area land project(s) is(are) promoted through model project(s). (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p><u>formulated</u></p> <p>8. <u>Implementation of a re-organization of ger area land project</u>  <u>Project plan of re-organization of ger area land model project(s) is prepared</u></p>		
<p>9: Implementation methodologies of urban redevelopment projects are established (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>9. <u>Implementation of urban redevelopment projects specified in UB-MP2020</u>  1) <u>Seven rules and regulations of the Urban Redevelopment Law is approved</u>  2) <u>Handbook for urban redevelopment project is prepared</u></p>		
<p>10: Citizen participation and provision of information to the public are promoted. (Sub-project 1 and 2)</p>	<p>10. <u>Publication tools to citizens (i.e.-Leaflet, WEB-site, etc.)</u>  1) <u>The number of opportunities that PR tools of urban development projects are used</u>  2) <u>The number of PR tools distributed</u>  3) <u>The level of understanding of target households on re-organization of ger area land project</u></p>		
<p>11: Capacity for the formulation and promotion of the UB MP2020 implementation plan and the implementation of urban redevelopment projects is enhanced. (Sub-project 1 and 2)</p>	<p>11.  1) <u>Improvement of urban redevelopment project's implementation capacity based on self-evaluation</u>  2) <u>Training course content for urban redevelopment</u>  3) <u>The number of trainers</u></p>		

<p>Activities<sup>4</sup></p> <p>1-1: Analyze the current status of the urban development trend</p> <p>1-2: Review existing plans in terms of urban development including the UB MP2020</p> <p>2-1: Organize the team framework in UB city to formulate the implementation plan</p> <p>2-2: Formulate policy objectives for the realization of the UB MP2020</p> <p>2-3: Formulate priority issues for the realization of the UB MP2020</p> <p>2-4: Formulate sectoral policies (Ministry level, City level)</p> <p>2-5: Formulate finance policies for the realization of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>3-1: Coordinate ministerial projects with ministries concerned</p> <p>3-2: Sort out individual projects and set each project's cost</p> <p>3-3: Formulate a finance plan for the realization of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>3-4: Formulate the draft implementation plan and adjust it to finalize</p> <p>3-5: Make necessary modifications to the implementation plan</p> <p>4-1: Set up monitoring indicators</p> <p>4-2: Study issues and problems of monitoring the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>4-3: Establish a monitoring structure in UB city</p> <p>5-1: Conduct comparative study on on-going projects held in Ulaanbaatar and analyze issues (scheme A)</p>	<p>Inputs</p> <p>Japanese experts;</p> <p>Sub-project 1:</p> <p>1) Urban Planning</p> <p>2) Urban Development Management</p> <p>3) Administrative Management</p> <p>4) Cost Analysis</p> <p>Sub-project 2:</p> <p>Land Re-adjustment Planning / Urban Redevelopment Planning</p> <p>Utility Planning (Heating, Sewage Water Supply)</p> <p>Real-estate Evaluation</p> <p>Urban Redevelopment Relating Laws / Housing Finance</p> <p>Training Planning / Public Relations Planning</p> <p>- Training of counterpart including training programs in Japan</p> <p>- Necessary equipment</p> <p>Mongolian side;</p> <p>- Provision of office and equipment</p> <p>- Telephone line and internet connection</p> <p>- Appointment of counterparts</p> <p>- Counterpart budget: administrative cost including transportation and utility</p>	<p>Preconditions</p> <p>- Mongolian counterpart personnel for the Project are properly assigned.</p> <p>- Mongolian side allocates necessary budget for the Project.</p>
---	---	--

4 Scheme A: Re-planning and development of ger area, Scheme B: Re-organization of ger area land project, Scheme C: Old apartment reconstruction project

		<p>5-2: Review current status and achievements on other urban redevelopment projects held in Ulaanbaatar and analyze issues (Scheme B, C)</p> <p>5-3: Review current status and analyze issues on urban redevelopment projects (3 schemes) planned in Aimag level</p> <p>6-1: Review current status of housing market and analyze issues</p> <p>6-2: Analyze housing demand and supply for the medium term</p> <p>6-3: Formulate Ulaanbaatar's housing policy for low-income households</p> <p>7-1: Review urban redevelopment policy from the viewpoint of realization of UB MP2020 and revise the policy (if necessary) (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>7-2: Clarify costs for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects <del>for 5 years</del> <u>until 2020</u> including infrastructure cost (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>8-1: Select a model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p>8-2: Formulate local unit utility plan (Scheme B)</p> <p>8-3: Support preparation of the model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p><del>8-4: Support implementation of the model project(s) (Scheme B)</del></p> <p>9-1: Draft relating norms, standards, rules and regulations for the operation of urban redevelopment law</p> <p>9-2: Provide advice for amending the draft Urban Development Law</p> <p>9-3: <u>Provide advice for Urban Redevelopment Law to be approved by the parliament. Provide legal advice for implementation of urban redevelopment project</u></p> <p>9-4: Revise UB city's rules and regulations necessary for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>9-5: Provide advice for implementation of urban redevelopment</p>
--	--	--

<p>projects (Scheme A, C)</p> <p>9-6: Develop implementation handbooks of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p><del>9-7: Standardize project planning and project execution (Scheme A, B, C)</del></p> <p><del>9-8: Propose promotion measures for sales and purchase of properties developed by urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</del></p> <p>10-1: Hear and take in citizen's opinions in the process of formulation of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>10-2: Provide information about the formulated implementation plan to citizens (i.e. Leaflet, WEB site, etc.)</p> <p>10-3: Establish a method of citizen participation in urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>10-4: Formulate PR tools of urban redevelopment projects for promoting public understanding (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>10-5: Disseminate urban redevelopment policy to public (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>11-1: Organize knowledge sharing seminars in terms of capacity-building of organization and personnel of Japanese local governments</p> <p>11-2: Conduct capacity assessment about the UB MP2020 implementation plan (finance, policy, organization structure)</p> <p>11-3: Analyze the current status and issues regarding the implementation capacity of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>11-4: Conduct a survey of citizen satisfaction level as to UB city administrative services</p> <p>11-5: Propose the improvement of the organization structure of UB city and government organizations concerned (including the</p>	
--	--

		<p>implementation structure of urban redevelopment projects)</p> <p>11-6: Organize seminars/workshops in UB city for improvement of UB city administrative management</p> <p>11-7: Implement training programs in UB city about Urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>11-8: Implement training programs in Japan about city administrative management and urban redevelopment (one time respectively)</p> <p>11-9: <u>Prepare training course content on urban redevelopment.</u></p> <p>11-10: <u>Provide training for trainers on urban redevelopment.</u></p>
--	--	---

**(5) Ver.5 (at 7<sup>th</sup> JCC meeting on May 25 2018)**

Project title: Improvement for Planning and Implementation Skills of Ulaanbaatar Master Plan

Whole project term: 2014 – 2018 (4 years and 3months)

Sub-project 1title: Project on Capacity Development in Implementation Planning of Ulaanbaatar Master plan

Sub-project1 term: 2014 – 2018 (4 years and 3 months)

Sub-project 2title: The Second Phase of Project on Capacity Development in Urban Development Sector in Mongolia

Sub-project2 term: 2015 – 2018 (4 years)

Target area: Ulaanbaatar City, MONGOLIA

Applicant: Ministry of Construction and Urban Development, Ulaanbaatar City Government

Narrative summary	Objectively verifiable indicators	Means of verification	Important assumptions
<p>Overall Goal (Sub-project 1 and 2)</p> <p>Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar (UB) City are improved through planned urban development based on the Ulaanbaatar 2020 Master Plan Amendment and Development Approaches for 2030 (UB MP2020) approved by the 23rd Parliament Resolution in 2013</p>	<p>The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (Heating, Sewerage, Water Supply)</p> <p>1) Improvement of knowledge and capacity</p>	<p>-Reports / Statistics</p> <p>- Interview</p>	<p>- Housing demand is enough to sustain implementation of urban redevelopment projects.</p> <p>- Policy of implementation plan and urban redevelopment will be continuously applied.</p> <p>- The budget will be provided for urban development in UB City.</p> <p>- The UB City is willing to implement</p>

<p>Capacity of urban planning and urban development project implementation contributing to upgrading residential environment is enhanced</p>	<p>for the formulation and promotion of the UB MP2020 implementation plan and the implementation of urban redevelopment projects</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2) Approval of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</li> <li>3) Utilization of handbooks for the <del>implementation of training</del> related to urban redevelopment projects <del>for daily work</del></li> <li>4) The re-organization of UB City government functioning effectively to conduct the UB MP2020 Implementation Plan</li> <li>5) Proposal of re-organization of UB City government functioning effectively to conduct Urban Redevelopment Projects</li> </ol>	<p>- Questionnaire</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The approved UB MP2020 Implementation Plan</li> <li>- organization chart</li> </ul>	<p>implementation plan and urban redevelopment projects.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The budget will be provided for urban development projects in UB City</li> <li>- Urban redevelopment law is approved</li> <li>- Urban redevelopment law related rules and regulations are approved.</li> </ul>
<p>Outputs</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1: The current status and issues regarding UB MP2020 implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 1)</li> <li>2: Policy objectives and planning principles about the UB MP2020 implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 1)</li> <li>3: UB MP2020 implementation plan (2016-2020) is formulated. (Sub-project 1)</li> <li>4: A monitoring method of the UB MP2020 implementation plan is established. (Sub-project 1)</li> <li>5: The current status and issues regarding urban redevelopment projects (3 schemes) are clarified. (Sub-project 2)</li> <li>6: Ulaanbaatar's housing policy for low-income households is formulated. (Sub-project 2)</li> <li>7: Ulaanbaatar's urban redevelopment policy and medium-term</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Current status and issues regarding UB MP2020 implementation plan</li> <li>2. Policy objectives and planning principles about UB MP2020 implementation plan</li> <li>3. UB MP2020 implementation plan</li> <li>4. Monitoring method of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</li> <li>5. Current status and issues regarding urban redevelopment projects</li> <li>6. Ulaanbaatar's Housing policy for low-income households is formulated</li> <li>7. Ulaanbaatar's urban redevelopment policy and medium-term implementation</li> </ol>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Reports</li> <li>- Record of meetings and workshops</li> <li>- Questionnaires</li> <li>-Ulaanbaatar's Housing policy for low-income households</li> <li>- Project plan of re-organization of ger area land model project(s)</li> <li>- Seven rules and regulations of the Urban Redevelopment Law</li> <li>- Handbook for urban</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- All the departments of UB City relating to the formulation of the UB MP2020 Implementation Plan participate in the Project</li> </ul>

<p>implementation plan are clarified. (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>plan is formulated</p>	<p>redevelopment project</p>	
<p>8: Re-organization of ger area land project(s) is(are) promoted through model project(s). (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>8. Project plan of re-organization of ger area land model project(s) is prepared</p>		
<p>9: Implementation methodologies of urban redevelopment projects are established (Sub-project 2)</p>	<p>9. 1) Seven rules and regulations of the Urban Redevelopment Law is approved 2) Handbook for urban redevelopment project is prepared</p>		
<p>10: Citizen participation and provision of information to the public are promoted. (Sub-project 1 and 2)</p>	<p>10. 1) The number of opportunities that PR tools of urban development projects are used 2) The number of PR tools distributed 3) The level of understanding of target households on re-organization of ger area land project</p>		
<p>11: Capacity for the formulation and promotion of the UB MP2020 implementation plan and the implementation of urban redevelopment projects is enhanced. (Sub-project 1 and 2)</p>	<p>11. 1) Improvement of urban redevelopment project's implementation capacity based on self-evaluation 2) Training course content for urban redevelopment 3) The number of trainers</p>		
<p>Activities<sup>5</sup> 1-1: Analyze the current status of the urban development trend 1-2: Review existing plans in terms of urban development including</p>	<p>Inputs Japanese experts;</p>		

5 Scheme A: Re-planning and development of ger area, Scheme B: Re-organization of ger area land project, Scheme C: Old apartment reconstruction project

<p>the UB MP2020</p> <p>2-1: Organize the team framework in UB city to formulate the implementation plan</p> <p>2-2: Formulate policy objectives for the realization of the UB MP2020</p> <p>2-3: Formulate priority issues for the realization of the UB MP2020</p> <p>2-4: Formulate sectoral policies (Ministry level, City level)</p> <p>2-5: Formulate finance policies for the realization of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>3-1: Coordinate ministerial projects with ministries concerned</p> <p>3-2: Sort out individual projects and set each project's cost</p> <p>3-3: Formulate a finance plan for the realization of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>3-4: Formulate the draft implementation plan and adjust it to finalize</p> <p>3-5: Make necessary modifications to the implementation plan</p> <p>4-1: Set up monitoring indicators</p> <p>4-2: Study issues and problems of monitoring the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>4-3: Establish a monitoring structure in UB city</p> <p>5-1: Conduct comparative study on on-going projects held in Ulaanbaatar and analyze issues (scheme A)</p> <p>5-2: Review current status and achievements on other urban redevelopment projects held in Ulaanbaatar and analyze issues (Scheme B, C)</p> <p>5-3: Review current status and analyze issues on urban redevelopment projects (3 schemes) planned in Aimag level</p>	<p>Sub-project 1:</p> <p>1) Urban Planning</p> <p>2) Urban Development Management</p> <p>3) Administrative Management</p> <p>4) Cost Analysis</p> <p>Sub-project 2:</p> <p>Land Re-adjustment Planning / Urban Redevelopment Planning</p> <p>Utility Planning (Heating, Sewage Water Supply)</p> <p>Real-estate Evaluation</p> <p>Urban Redevelopment Relating Laws / Housing Finance</p> <p>Training Planning / Public Relations Planning</p> <p>- Training of counterpart including training programs in Japan</p> <p>- Necessary equipment</p> <p>Mongolian side;</p> <p>- Provision of office and equipment</p> <p>- Telephone line and internet connection</p> <p>- Appointment of counterparts</p> <p>- Counterpart budget: administrative cost including transportation and utility</p>	<p>Preconditions</p> <p>- Mongolian counterpart personnel for the Project are properly assigned.</p> <p>- Mongolian side allocates necessary budget for the Project.</p>
--	--	--



		<p>6-1: Review current status of housing market and analyze issues</p> <p>6-2: Analyze housing demand and supply for the medium term</p> <p>6-3: Formulate Ulaanbaatar's housing policy for low-income households</p> <p>7-1: Review urban redevelopment policy from the viewpoint of realization of UB MP2020 and revise the policy (if necessary) (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>7-2: Clarify costs for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects until 2020 including infrastructure cost (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>8-1: Select a model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p>8-2: Formulate local unit utility plan (Scheme B)</p> <p>8-3: Support preparation of the model project(s) (Scheme B)</p> <p>9-1: Draft relating norms, standards, rules and regulations for the operation of urban redevelopment law</p> <p>9-2: Provide advice for amending the draft Urban Development Law</p> <p>9-3: Provide advice for Urban Redevelopment Law to be approved by the parliament</p> <p>9-4: Revise UB city's rules and regulations necessary for the implementation of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>9-5: Provide advice for implementation of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, C)</p> <p>9-6: Develop implementation handbooks of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>10-1: Hear and take in citizen's opinions in the process of formulation of the UB MP2020 implementation plan</p> <p>10-2: Provide information about the formulated implementation plan to citizens (i.e. Leaflet, WEB site, etc.)</p> <p>10-3: Establish a method of citizen participation in urban</p>
--	--	--

	<p>redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>10-4: Formulate PR tools of urban redevelopment projects for promoting public understanding (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>10-5: Disseminate urban redevelopment policy to public (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>11-1: Organize knowledge sharing seminars in terms of capacity-building of organization and personnel of Japanese local governments</p> <p>11-2: Conduct capacity assessment about the UB MP2020 implementation plan (finance, policy, organization structure)</p> <p>11-3: Analyze the current status and issues regarding the implementation capacity of urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>11-4: Conduct a survey of citizen satisfaction level as to UB city administrative services</p> <p>11-5: Propose the improvement of the organization structure of UB city and government organizations concerned (including the implementation structure of urban redevelopment projects)</p> <p>11-6: Organize seminars/workshops in UB city for improvement of UB city administrative management</p> <p>11-7: Implement training programs in UB city about Urban redevelopment projects (Scheme A, B, C)</p> <p>11-8: Implement training programs in Japan about city administrative management and urban redevelopment (one time respectively)</p> <p>11-9: Prepare training course content on urban redevelopment.</p> <p>11-10: Provide training for trainers on urban redevelopment.</p>
--	--