9. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The planning system in the region has gone through many transformations particularly with the implementation of decentralization of the planning and expenditure assignment to the wereda level. The decentralization of the planning function believed to improve and enhance the development pace, promotes participation and empowers the communities and stakeholders at sub regional level, mobilize resources that enable to implement programs at lowest cost and for other social, political and economic reasons. Decentralization not only favored for its too many social, political and economic benefits but also for its potential to enhance community resource mobilization and participation. Decentralization however is effective only when there is adequate capacity to finance, too many demands arising from the local governments, to staff each level with required skilled manpower and adequate logistics.

In the last five years, many efforts have been made to build the capacity of the emerging planning institutions at kebele and wereda level through the government capacity building and regional regular programs. Kebeles and weredas have relatively developed the ability of planning, budgeting, monitoring, evaluation and information management than the pre reform period. Community participation is encouraging and improving over years with significant contribution for implementation of a number of community projects. The government also supports the weredas through the block grant for the implementation of the government and wereda priority programs. On the other hand, the weredas are also struggling to finance their development needs through own revenues by expanding and reforming their tax base. Institutions have been developed to support and strengthen the overall goal of decentralization and decentralized planning.

With the expenditure assignment and decision-making power to the weredas, the BOFED also developed organizational structure in 2000 EC to create viable procedures and to strengthen the relationship of the planning institutions at sub regional level and that of the sector offices. The four core pillars of planning have been reviewed for any constraints they have in planning cycles, the manpower requirements, the working processes and procedures, the standards and expected results. The study comes out with the recommendations to strengthen the four functions. Some of these recommendations include the separation of monitoring and evaluation from planning, the central role of the information management system, the extension of the planning work to the kebele level, the supportive capacity building of the ZOFED and the necessary capacity building requirements at the kebele, the wereda and zonal level. The recommendation also gave significant power for the weredas in decision making with regard to all planning activities including priority setting, budget allocation, monitoring and evaluation of NGO activities, technical support and training of the sector offices and other stakeholders active in development planning.

Following this recommendations, the Bureau also tried to conduct a series of orientation workshops to acquaint the sub regional planning institutions with the current restructuring of the planning functions. However, the overall short run outcome of all BPR recommendation was not to expectations. Capacity limitation is critical at all levels. A number of wereda institutions have inadequate skilled manpower. Some of the weredas only fulfilled half to two third of their total manpower requirements. Transport and communication facilities are also lacking for effective planning, monitoring and evaluation as well regular information flow. The majority of them have inadequate computer even to conduct the routine planning, data collection and reporting tasks of planning.

The information management both in the planning and sector institution was not strengthened and suffer from critical shortage of manpower, budget, communication facilities and appropriate

linkages as well and from the outcomes of the none institutionalized information demand and flow. Most of the weredas could not produce the stated statistical and information outputs in desired quality and regularity. Data for annual budget allocation is even obtained through a series of calls and meetings with the sector institutions. Monitoring and evaluation system at sub regional level also suffers from similar constraints. Structures at kebele level are not accountable to WOFED. They also have inadequate trained manpower. Technical support from all institutions is inadequate and training on relevant subjects is not effective. Furthermore, budgeting and budget exercise is a critical area of concern for the overall performance of the wereda economies. Budget allocation is inadequate for the majority of sectors. Operating cost is below expectations and less than five percent of the budget allocated for the weredas in 2001. Both government grants and wereda revenues are growing at marginal rates compared to excessively increasing demands, rapidly expanding institutions and the demand for more skilled manpower. Capital budget is also very low and in similar period about 3.7 percent. Most of the wereda institutions have no capital budget at all to strengthen their capacities. Shortage of logistic supply is critical bottleneck for almost all weredas in the region. The majority of the weredas have inadequate computers, communication and transportation facilities and even furniture and office space.

Despite significant and complex capacity and budget problems in all weredas, they struggle to achieve the stated sustainable development goals through rationing the available financial resources among the many wereda institutions, which are increasing in number from year to year with inadequate manpower, budget and logistics. The ZOFED also shares similar problems. Except for its channeling function, ZOFED has no more tangible contribution to either planning or monitoring and evaluation. Its mandate is also limited not only due to structural rigidities but also lack of adequate skilled manpower, logistics and budget.

In conclusion, without significant capacity building and adequate budget weredas could not be expected to accomplish the planning, budgeting, monitoring, evaluation and information tasks to the desired level. Much capacity building activities should be in place to improve the current low capacities and inefficiencies through not only allocation of grants but also through special and effective capacity building programs implemented by the regional government. Critical consideration is also important between the social, economic, political benefits of expanding similar government institutions in all weredas without due consideration and in-depth scrutiny of the consequences of expanding new institutions and increasing number of weredas, zones and kebeles. The role of some institutions such as ZOFED should be clear and transparent not only for effective decentralization but also for the main reason of saving the scarce financial resources currently facing the weredas. Reform in structural linkage is also important particularly between WOFED, BOFED, and wereda sector offices with regional bureaus. Increasing budget allocation for weredas may not be a feasible short run solution. But without due consideration, weredas could not shoulder the responsibilities vested in them to manage the major development sectors. Allocation of skilled manpower for the existing social infrastructure and facilities, emerging offices and institutions is of at most priority which may need special regional government programs. Transportation and communication facilities should be available to capacitate the institutions and to strengthen the linkages and collaborative action.

References

BoFED (2008a). Proposal on "Strengthening Multi-sectoral Development Planning in Oromia Region. Addis Ababa

BoFED (2008b). Oromia National Regional State in Brief. Part II. Addis Ababa

BoFED (2008c). Manual on Business process Re-engineering on Monitoring and Evaluation on Plan Implementation. Addis Ababa. (Oromiffa)

BoFED (2008d). Manual on Business Process Re-engineering of Coordination, Monitoring and Evaluation of NGOs. Addis Ababa. (Oromiffa).

BoFED (2007). Mid-term Review of A Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty (PASDEP), 2004/2005-2007/08. Addis Ababa.

Guimaraes. J.D.C (1998). Planning for Resource Poor Regions in a Globalizing World: Implications for Practice and Training. In *Regional Development Dialogue*. Vol. 19 No. 1

Kuklinski. A. (1975). Regional Development, Regional Policies and Regional Planning. In *Regional Disaggregation of national Policies and Plans*. The Hague.

SRDPO (2003). Strengthening Regional Development Planning in Oromia Region-Ethiopia. Ethio-Italian Joint Programme. 2003 update of the October 2000 Programme Document. Addis Ababa

Wen. G. (1997). The Grassroots Approach to Regional Development: A Global Review of Recent Trends and Concepts. The United nations. Washington D.C.

World Bank(2004). Project Appraisal Document on A Proposed Credit to the Federal Democratic Republic Of Ethiopia for A Public Sector Capacity Building Program Support Project. Report No 28191_ET Washington

www.worldbank.org/PSCAP/five_year_action_plan_v1.pdf.

JAPAN INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION AGENCY

STUDY OF STRENGTHENING MULTI-SECTORAL DEVELOPMENT PLANNING IN OROMIA REGION

A JOINT PROJECT OF JICA/BOFED

ANNEXES TO MAIN REPORT

Addis Ababa

Addis Ababa	Ethiopia	October	2009

WABEKBON Development Consult Plc
Addis Ababa
Ethiopia

ANNEX I: LIST OF DOCUMENTS AND DATA COLLECTED FROM ZONES, WEREDAS AND KEBELES

LEVEL	PLANNING	BUDGETING	INFORMATION MANAGMENT	MONITORING AND EVALUATION
ZONE	West Hararge Zone, 2001 Annual Plan	2001 Budget-West Hararge 2001 Budget-West Arsi 2001 Budget-Arsi Zone 2001 Budget-East Shewa 2001 Budget-Jima 2001 Budget-East Wellega 2001 Budget-East Hararge	Socio-Economic Profile- W.Hararge Socio-Economic Profile-W.Arsi Statistical Abstract- W.Hararge	2001 Annual Report-west Hararge
WEREDA		All Weredas of East Hararge All Weredas of West Arsi All Weredas of Arsi All Weredas of Jima All Weredas of East Wellega All Weredas of East Shewa Recurrent and capital budget of 21 weredas All Weredas of West Hararge	Socio-Economic Profile-Kokosa Socio-Economic Profile-A.Negele Socio-Economic Profile-Asasa Socio-Economic Profile-Adaba Socio-Economic Profile-Nanasabo Socio-Economic Profile-Kore Socio-Economic Profile-Lume	
KEBELES	Available for east Shewa, west Hararge and west Arsi zone weredas but not collected	Available for east Shewa, west Hararge and west Arsi zone weredas but not collected	Available for east Shewa, west Hararge and west Arsi zone weredas but not collected	Available for east Shewa, west Hararge and west Arsi zone weredas but not collected

ANNEX II: LIST OF PEOPLE AND ORGANIZATIONS CONTACTED (WEST ARSI, EAST SHEWA AND WEST HARARGE ZONES)

NO	NAME	RESPONSIBILITY	TELEPHONE	WEREDA
1	KEDIR SADDO	HEAD, GEDEB ASSASA WOFED	251911	GEDEB ASSASSA
2	GIRMA MIDHAKSA	COORDINATOR, HEALTH EXTENSION, WHO	251-911017932	GEDEB ASSASSA
3	TADELECH LEMA	PME WORKER, WHO	251-912239992	GEDEB ASASA
4	MOHAMMED BEKER	PME WORKER, WOFED	251913196891	GEDEB ASASA
5	GEZAHEGN ZEBENE	HEAD, WOARD	251-913208554	GEDEB ASASA
6	ALEMAYEHU REGASSA	HEAD, WOE		GEDEB ASSASA
7	IBRAHIM AHMED	HR, WOE		GEDEB ASASA
8	AMINA HAJI	STATISTICIAN, WOE		GEDEB ASASA
9	WELIYI GEDA	ENGINEER, WWRO		GEDEB ASASA
10	TILAHAUN DESTA	PME, WOFED	251916115009	SHASHAMANE
11	MOHAMED AMIN	MANAGER, AWASHO DHANKU KEBELE	251916000057	SHASHAMANE
12	JEMAL KEDIR	MANAGER, FAJI GOLE KEBELE	251-916870005	SHAHSAMANE
13	BATTERY DURO	HEAD, WOWRD	251911044510	SHASHAMANE
14	MUSTAFA HINSENE	PROCESS OWNER, PME, WOE	251-911545882	SHASHAMANE
15	MIDHEKSO JABESSO	HEAD, WOARD	251916831458	SHASHAMANE
16	FIKRE SELASSIE LEGESSE	PLANNER, WOARD	0916837864	SHASHAMANE
17	KEDIR EGO	HEAD, WOH		SHASHAMANE
18	TAYE DUBRE	WORKER, PLANNING, BUDGETING, M&E		SHASHAMANE
19	MUSTAFA WAKO	EXPERT, PLANNING AND BUDGETING, ZWRO	0913054341	WEST ARSI ZONE
20	DIRIBA REGASA	EXPERT, PME, ZOE	0911086757	WEST ARSI ZONE
21	TEFERI KESHA	EXPERT, M&E, ZOFED		WEST ARSI ZONE
22	YIGEZU RUKA	WORKER, AGRICULTURAL EXTENSION AND CROP PROTECTION, ZOARD	251916013666	W.ARSI ZONE
23	BONTU KEDIR	FACILITATOR/SECRETARY, ZOH	251916859821	W.ARSI
24	AYALEW TAMBO	WORKER, PME, WOFED		ARSI NEGELE
25	YOUSUF AMAN	WORKER, PME WOFED	251913195989	ARSI NEGELE
26	TIGIST SILESHI	WORKER, PME, WOFED	251913012869	ARSI NEGELE
27	BELETE GETACHEW	ENGINEER, WOWRD	251461162508	ARSI NEGELE
28	HAMID HORDOFA	MANAGER, SAYO MAJA KEBELE	251910668330	ARSI NEGELE
29	FEYISO AMBO	MANAGER, ADABA TITA	251911854080	ARSI NEGELE
30	WARISO DHAKABO	ADMINISTRATOR, ADABA TITA KEBELE	251916063567	ARSI NEGELE
31	SHODHE TIBESSO	PME, WOARD	251911061770	ARSI NEGELE
32	KEDIR GEDELA	HEAD, WOFED	251911917274	SHASHAMANE
33	ISA KEDIR	PME, WOFED	251916857920	SHASHAMANE
34	MEKONNEN ASEFA	EXPERT, PLANNING AND DOCUMENTATION, WOE	0910321697	ARSI NEGELLE
35	ARAGAW BLISE	EXPERT, WOH		ARSI NEGELLE
36	TIGIST TEKELE	PLAN AND DATA WORKER, ZOFED	251912159250	WEST ARSI
37	BONSA DHABI	DATA PREPARATION, ANALYSIS AND DISSEMINATION WORKER	251912169348	A/TULLU, JIDO KOMBOLCHA
38	HAILU MIDHEKSA	PME, WORKER, WOFED	251913598208	A.TULLU, J.KOMBOLCHA
39	BIZUNESH ALIYU	MANAGER, ODA ASHURA	251916017071	A.TULLU, J.KOMBOLCHA
40	ZELELEW SISAY	EDUCATION PLANNER, WEO	NO	A.TULLU, J.KOMBOLCHA
41	HAJI OGATO	HEAD, FOOD SECURITY	NO	A.TULLU, J.KOMBOLCHA
42	DEREJE JIRRE	PME, WOARD	NO	A.TULLU, J.KOMBOLCHA

43	HAILU GEBRE	EXPERT, WOH	0913145767	A.TULLU, J.KOMBOLCHA
44	HAJI HAKETO	ACTING HEAD, WOARD		A.T J.KOMBOLCHA
45	ASRAT DIRIBA	EXPERT, WATER SUPPLY, WWRO		FENTALE
46	ASRAT ASEFA (Mrs)	EXPERT, PLANNING AND BUDGETING, WWRO		
47	IBRAHIM AHMED	PME, WOARD		FENTALE
48	MOHAMMED JEYLAN	PROCESS OWNER, WOE	0911773931	FENTALE
49	DEJENE MERGA	WOFED, PME	0910487173	FENTALE
50	JUNEIDI ABBAS	PME, WPDA	0911376035	FENTALE
51	WEREKITU BIRRU	MANAGER, GOLA KEBELE	0911957627	FENTALE
52	GELANE TADDESSE	MANAGER, BENTI	0912247880	FENTALE
53	BEDILU TSEHAY	HEAD, E.SHEWA ZOFED	0916820644	ADAMA
54	DESALEGN DENGETA	OWNER, E. SHEWA ZoFED	0911907522	ADAMA
55	ALEMAYEHU HERO	HEAD, WOFED	0911708575	FENTALE
56	AYELE WASSE	PME, WOFED	0910845940	TULO
57	MUKTAR ABDELA	PME, WOFED	0912202151	TULO
58	FASIL ADANE	HEAD, WOFED	0911834003	TULO
59	BELETE GETACHEW	ENGINEER, WWRO	0461162508	ARSI NEGELE
60	ABDELA USMAN	WORKER, PIM, WEO	0910411429	TULO
61	TEKABE KINFE	HEAD, WWRO	0913400713	TULO
62	TIGLU ZEKARIAS	WORKER, PME, WOFED	0910915012	TULO
63	HORDOFA BEYENE	ADMINISTRATION AND SERVICES	0913239930	TULO
64	TIRUNESH GUDETA	WORKER, PME, WWRO	0913835067	TULO
65	MOHAMMED ALIYI	WORKER, PME, WOFED		HABRO
66	DECHAS SHIBRU	PME, WOFED	0912435811	HABRO
67	ASADI SHEMSEDIN	WOFED	0913742744	HABRO
68	TAJU HASSEN	MANAGER, MELKA BOLO KEBELE	0915032579	HABRO
69	SHERIF YUSOUF	HEAD, WHO	0911357966	HABRO
70	IDOSA REGASA	HEAD, WOE	0910216404	HABRO
71	ADUGNA WAKJIRA	HEAD, WWRO	0912016191	HABRO
72	MEBRATU REGASA	PLAN AND HRA, ZOE	0911727646	W. HARARGE
73	BEKELE SILESHI	WORKER, CD AND MALARIA CONTROL, ZHO	0913712845	W. HARARGE
74	GELAN MO'AZEM	DEPUTY, ZHO	0912303689	W. HARARGE
75	HAILU TADDESSE	PBS, ZOFED	0910627690	W. HARARGE
76	TADELE SEYOUM	CD, MALARIA CONTROL, ZHO	0913920238	W. HARARGE
77	ABDULHAKIM ABDELA	HEAD, ZOARD		W. HARARGE
78	KEBEDE GENBA	PME, ZOARD	0911757945	W.HARARGE
79	MAME DESTA (Mrs)	ZOARD		W. HARARGE
80	SULTAN MOHAMMED	HEAD, ZWRO	0913161365	W.HARARGE
81	YESUNESH DABA	PME, ZWRO	0913009908	W.HARARGE
82	ASFAW TESEMA	PME, WOARD	0911729009	LUME
83	ASTER TESHOME	OME, WHO		LUME
84	SOLOMON TESFAYE	PROCESS OWNER, PME, WOFED	0913251669	LUME
85	DIRIBE GIRMA	PME, WOFED	0912016584	LUME
85	ALEMNESH MOGES	IM, WOFED	0912252084	LUME
87	BELAY TESHOME	PME, WOFED	0913220438	LUME
88	YASIN QUMBI	MANAGER, ARIFETA JOGOLA KEBELE	0910382673	LUME
89	ASRAT TOLOSA	PEDA, WEO	0911751385	LUME
90	MEKONNEN NEGASH	STATISTICIAN, WEO	0911964315	LUME

91	ABEBE TADDESSE	WORKER, ZOE	0911821652	EAST SHEWA
92	TESFAYE KASSA	WORKER, ZOE	0911360753	EAST SHEWA
93	MOTUMMA TOLOSA	PME, ZOARD	0221114453	EAST SHEWA
94	TIBEBU TEREFE	HEAD, ZOWR	0916820663	EAST SHEWA
95	AYELE BEKELE	ZOH		EAST SHEWA
96	ABEBE SHEWANGIZAW	ZOH	0911362292	EAST SHEWA

ANNEX III: LIST OF PERSONS AND ORGANIZATIONS CONTACTED (EAST WELLEGA AND JIMA ZONE)

No.	Name	Name of Office	Zone/Woreda	Responsibility	Telephone
1	Ato Bekele Jalala	ZFEDO	East Wollega Zone	ZFEDO head representative	0576617235
2	Ato Tesfaye Sirna	ZFEDO	East Wollega Zone	Plan data organizing expert,	0576617439
3	Ato Zerihun Tamiru	ZFEDO	East Wollega Zone	Plan and budget expert	0576617439
4	Ato Teshale Beyene	ZFEDO	East Wollega Zone	M&E	0576617439
5	Ato Ayana Moroda	ZFEDO	East Wollega Zone	PME, PROCESS OWNER	0576617439
6	Ato Urgesa Tilahun	ZFEDO	East Wollega Zone	Plan and Data management	0576617439
7	Ato Kasahun Dibaba	ZFEDO	East Wollega Zone	M&E	0576617439
8	Ato Regasa Gobosho	Zone Education Office	East Wollega Zone	Plan representative	0576615186
9	Ato Habtamu Siyum	Zone Health Office	East Wollega Zone	Plan expert	0576616213
10	Ato Guluma Weyesa	WFEDO	Guto Gida Woreda	Head,	0576611118
11	Ato Gemeda Merga	WFEDO	Guto Gida Woreda	Plan and budget head	
12	Ato Dereje Desta	WFEDO	Guto Gida Woreda	Plan expert	
13	Ato Zegeye Buli	WFEDO	Guto Gida Woreda	Plan expert	
14	Ato Amsalu Nado	WFEDO	Guto Gida Woreda	Plan and budget expert	
15	Ato Desalegni Iticha	WFEDO	Guto Gida Woreda	Information management	
16	W/rt Lelise Bayisa	WFEDO	Guto Gida Woreda	Monitoring and evaluation	
17	Ato Feyyisa Irena	WFEDO	Guto Gida Woreda	Human Resource Development	057661118
18	Ato Negera Jira	Woreda OARD	Guto Gida Woreda	Plan and program head	0576614816
19	S/r Eyerusalem Yohanes	Woreda Health Office	Guto Gida Woreda	Plan and program expert	0576611086
20	Ato Fiqru Adisu	Woreda Rural Road Office	Guto Gida Woreda	Representative	0917819213
21	Ato Geremu Hordofa	Woreda Rural Water supply	Guto Gida Woreda	Representative	0576616075
22	Ato Eshetu Kasa	Woreda Education Office	Guto Gida Woreda	Plan and program head	0576611132
23	Ato Amanuel Temesgen	Dune kane kebele	Guto Gida Woreda	Kebele manager	
24	W/rt Shibire Dhugasa	Dune kane kebele	Guto Gida Woreda	Kebele Development Agent	
25	Ato Dawit Yonas	Dune kane kebele	Guto Gida Woreda	Kebele DA Supervisor	
26	W/ro Susi Tolera	Dune kane kebele	Guto Gida Woreda	School director	
27	W/rt Biqiltu Bekele	Dune kane kebele	Guto Gida Woreda	Health Extension Worker	
28	W/ro Gelane Waqiwaya	Dune kane kebele	Guto Gida Woreda	Public Organizer	
29	Ato Ayana Tadesse	Dune kane kebele	Guto Gida Woreda	Development Agent	
30	W/rt Fasika Terefe	Dune kane kebele	Guto Gida Woreda	Development Agent	
31	Ato Deselegn kebede	Fayyinera kebele	Guto Gida Woreda	Kebele manager	0917849637
32	Ato Ambese Wekeshum	Fayyinera kebele	Guto Gida Woreda	Model farmer	
33	Ato Gebesa Fufa	Fayyinera kebele	Guto Gida Woreda	Fayyinera school Director	0911064867
34	Ato Demera Ulfina	Fayyinera kebele	Guto Gida Woreda	Youth Association head	0917130567

No.	Name	Name of Office	Zone/Woreda	Responsibility	Telephone
35	Ato Werekeneh Gemechu	Fayyinera kebele	Guto Gida Woreda	Development Agent	
36	W/ro Berehane Abdisa	Fayyinera kebele	Guto Gida Woreda	Women Association head	0917034805
37	Ato Zayada Teshome	WFEDO	Sibu Sire Woreda	Head	0576680015
38	Ato Adugna Etefa	WFEDO	Sibu Sire Woreda	Monitoring and Evaluation	0576680725
39	Ato Tefera Lemessa	Woreda Agriculture	Sibu Sire Woreda	Plan and program head	0576680005
40	Ato Gizaw Geleta	Woreda Education	Sibu Sire Woreda	Plan and program head	0576680028
41	Ato Birhanu Meseret	Woreda Health office	Sibu Sire Woreda	Plan and program head	0576680029
42	Ato Abdisa Yadeta	Woreda Water office	Sibu Sire Woreda	Electrician	0576680387
43	Ato Mihretu Shigute	Woreda Road office	Sibu Sire Woreda	Forman	0576680394
44	Ato Fiseha Melese	Woreda Road office	Sibu Sire Woreda	HR	0576680394
45	Ato Nigatu Merga	WFEDO	Sibu Sire Woreda		0576680725
46	Ato Barsisa Afeta	WFEDO	Sibu Sire Woreda	Planning and Budgeting expert	0576680725
47	Ato Beley Kiflu	WFEDO	Sibu Sire Woreda	Socio-economic planning expert	0576680725
48	Ato Tesfaye Werekenh	Chari Jarso Kebele	Sibu Sire Woreda	Kebele Chairmen	0917075803
49	Ato Alemeyehu Begna	Chari Jarso Kebele	Sibu Sire Woreda	Kebele Manager	
50	Ato Aduyna Gulesha	Chari Jarso Kebele	Sibu Sire Woreda	Development agent	0917089321
51	Ato Deniel Tedesa	Chari Jarso Kebele	Sibu Sire Woreda	School Director	0911083067
52	W/ro Lemlem Fekedu	Chari Jarso Kebele	Sibu Sire Woreda	Health extension worker	0917039505
53	Ato Mulugeta Tamiru	Lelisa Kebele	Sibu Sire Woreda	School director	
54	Ato Fiqadu Borena	Lelisa Kebele	Sibu Sire Woreda	Development Agent	
55	W/rt Felekech Asefa	Lelisa Kebele	Sibu Sire Woreda	Health Extension Worker	
56	Ato Geremewu Gutu	Lelisa Kebele	Sibu Sire Woreda	Kebele Administrator	
57	Ato Tesfaye Asefa	Lelisa Kebele	Sibu Sire Woreda	Kebele manager	
58	Ato Alemayehu Asefa	Lelisa Kebele	Sibu Sire Woreda	Kebele Security head	
59	W/ro Gete Chali	Lelisa Kebele	Sibu Sire Woreda	Chairman, Women Association	
60	Ato Fayisa Abera	WFEDO	Jima Arjo Woreda	Head representative	0576670004/28
61	Ato Mulugeta Olana	WFEDO	Jima Arjo Woreda	M&E Process owner	0576670004/28
62	Ato Mulatu Bore	WFEDO	Jima Arjo Woreda	HR	0576670004/28
63	Ato Fiqadu Bekele	WFEDO	Jima Arjo Woreda	M&E Process owner	0576670004/28
64	Ato Gadisa Brihanu	WFEDO	Jima Arjo Woreda	M&E Process owner	0576670004/28
65	Ato Nagari Kejela	WFEDO	Jima Arjo Woreda	Plan and budget Process owner	0576670004/28
66	W/rt Gedese Berehanu	WFEDO	Jima Arjo Woreda	Monitoring & evaluation expert	0576670004
67	Ato Wajera Chemeda	WFEDO	Jima Arjo Woreda	Planning and Budgeting expert	0576670004

No.	Name	Name of Office	Zone/Woreda	Responsibility	Telephone
68	Ato Demke Tola	Woreda Rural Roads	Jima Arjo Woreda	Forman	0576670378
69	Ato Asmara Diriba	Woreda Water Office	Jima Arjo Woreda	Technician	0576670031
70	Ato Legese Debela	Woreda Education	Jima Arjo Woreda	Plan and project Process Owner	0576670006
71	Ato Wakijira Chemeda	WFEDO	Jima Arjo Woreda	Plan and Budget Process Owner	0576670004/28
72	Ato Garuma Ejerso	Woreda Agriculture	Jima Arjo Woreda	Plan and project Process owner	0576670007
73	Ato Abebe Geleta	Woreda Health Office	Jima Arjo Woreda	Plan and budget Process owner	0576670051
74	Ato Akalu Shifera	Woreda Health Office	Jima Arjo Woreda	HR	0576670051
75	Ato Tilahun Feyisa	Wayu Kumba Kebele	Jima Arjo Woreda	School Director	
76	Ato Obsa Worku	Wayu Kumba Kebele	Jima Arjo Woreda	Security head	
77	Ato Mekonen Chali	Wayu Kumba Kebele	Jima Arjo Woreda	Kebele manager	
78	W/rt Tinsae H/Giorgis	Wayu Kumba Kebele	Jima Arjo Woreda	Health Extension Worker	
79	Ato Debela Tefera	Wayu Kumba Kebele	Jima Arjo Woreda	Development Agent	
80	Ato Temesgen Workneh	Wayu Kumba Kebele	Jima Arjo Woreda	Development Agent	
81	Ato Kejela Bulcha	Hinde Kebele	Jima Arjo Woreda	Kebele manager	0576590002
82	Ato Kelebesa Fufa	Hinde Kebele	Jima Arjo Woreda	Model farmer	
83	W/rt Sinteyo Degefa	Hinde Kebele	Jima Arjo Woreda	Health extension worker	
84	Ato Emiru Gutama	Hinde Kebele	Jima Arjo Woreda	Areb Gebeya School Director	0917078250
85	W/rt Tejitu Tesfa	Hinde Kebele	Jima Arjo Woreda	Health extension worker	
86	W/rt Yetnebersh Temesgen	Hinde Kebele	Jima Arjo Woreda	Health extension worker	0911928286
87	Yedesa Dega	Hinde Kebele	Jima Arjo Woreda	Youth Association head	
88	Faruki Abadura Abakoyas	ZFEDO	Jima Zone	Head	
89	Ato Geremew Diga	ZFEDO	Jima Zone	PME Process Owner	0471111193
90	Ato Tefera Hunde	ZFEDO	Jima Zone	Data Process Owner	0917822433
91	Ato Mulatu Kenea	ZFEDO	Jima Zone	M&E Process owner	0917822959
92	W/ro Birtukan Abagaro	ZFEDO	Jima Zone	HR	0913394783
93	Ato Akib Abafogi	ZFEDO	Jima Zone	Facilitator	0911950794
94	Ato Mosisa Abdisa	ZFEDO	Jima Zone	M&E process owner	
95	Ato Awel Abagidi	Health Office	Jima Zone	Plan and program Process owner	0917803304
96	Ato Wakgari Tilahun	Zone Health Office	Jima Zone	Plan and program Process owner	047115122
97	Ato Nazif Abdul Hakim	Zone Rural Roads	Jima Zone	Head	0917801086
98	Ato Jemal Abamegal	Zone Water Supply	Jima Zone	Representative	0471111231
99	Ato Zewudu Alemayehu	WFEDO	Goma Woreda	Head representative	0472214107
100	Ato Abdu Kedir	WFEDO	Goma Woreda	Plan and Budget process owner	
101	Ato Firdisa Olijira	WFEDO	Goma Woreda	Plan and Budget process owner	
102	Ato Desalegni Regasa	WFEDO	Goma Woreda	Plan and Budget process owner	

No.	Name	Name of Office	Zone/Woreda	Responsibility	Telephone
103	Ato Birhanu Milku	WFEDO	Goma Woreda	Monitoring and Evaluation	
104	Ato Endale Abebe	WFEDO	Goma Woreda	Plan and Budget process owner	
105	W/rt Tringo Kasa	Land Use and Environmental Protection	Goma Woreda	Expert	0472211969
106	W/ro Kadija Yesuf	Land Use and Environmental Protection	Goma Woreda	Expert	0472211969
107	Ato Abinet Desalegni	Woreda Agriculture	Goma Woreda	Plan expert	042211178
108	Ato Abdurkarim Nasir	Rural Road office	Goma Woreda	Head	091470330
109	Ato Mekonnen Bekele	Livestock Development, Vet Service and Marketing Agency	Goma Woreda	Input process Owner	0472211223
110	Ato Tahir Ibsa	Woreda Health	Goma Woreda	Epidemic Process owner	0472213522
111	Ato Demis Adem	Keso Hiti Kebele	Goma Woreda	Administrator	0471190085
112	W/rt Nunu Alemayehu	Keso Hiti Kebele	Goma Woreda	Health Extension Worker	
113	Ato Ahimed Aba Jihad	Keso Hiti Kebele	Goma Woreda	Kebele manager	
114	Mohamed Jemal Abatemam	Keso Hiti Kebele	Goma Woreda	Administration and Security	
115	Ato Mohamed Husen	Keso Hiti Kebele	Goma Woreda	Development Agent	
116	Ato Alemu Sadeka	Keso Hiti Kebele	Goma Woreda	School director	
117	W/rt Alemnesh Workineh	Keso Hiti Kebele	Goma Woreda	Development Agent	
118	W/rt Zuber Awel	Gonji Elibu kebele	Goma Woreda	Kebele Manager	0913321447
119	Ato Naiamo Basame	Gonji Elibu kebele	Goma Woreda	Kebele Chairman	0917807121
120	Ato Geleb Jemal	Gonji Elibu kebele	Goma Woreda	Kebele Cabine	0917809372
121	W/ro Rabiya Usman	Gonji Elibu kebele	Goma Woreda	Development agent	0472214410
122	Ato Kamer Abba Temam	Gonji Elibu kebele	Goma Woreda	Development agent	0913 441108
123	W/rt Jamila Temam	Gonji Elibu kebele	Goma Woreda	Health extension worker	0913469790
124	Ato Feyidi Taju	WFEDO	Kersa Woreda	Head representative	0471130011
125	W/ro Meskerem Turi	WFEDO	Kersa Woreda	Facilitator	0471130416
126	W/ro Tsehay Kitila	WFEDO	Kersa Woreda	HR	
127	Ato Mustefa Yeba	WFEDO	Kersa Woreda	PME Process owner	0911038031
128	Ato Umer Aba Gojam	WFEDO	Kersa Woreda		
129	Ato Abdisa Edesa	WFEDO	Kersa Woreda	Plan and Budget Process owner	
130	Ato Ajai'o Ababor	Woreda Water Supply	Kersa Woreda	Representative	0917807237
131	Shek Zakir Aba Dibe	Babo Sarte Kebele	Kersa Woreda	Kebele Administrator	
132	Ato Nasir Abaligidi	Babo Sarte Kebele	Kersa Woreda	Kebele manager	
133	Ato Negash Abagaro	Babo Sarte Kebele	Kersa Woreda	Youth Association Chairman	
134	W/ro Zumera Shek Abdela	Babo Sarte Kebele	Kersa Woreda	Women Association Chairwoman	
135	Ato Rashad Abadula	Babo Sarte Kebele	Kersa Woreda	Development Agent	
136	Ato Barjila Badega	Kitimible Kebele	Kersa Woreda	Chairman of kebele	0913129712

No.	Name	Name of Office	Zone/Woreda	Responsibility	Telephone
137	Ato Bezeb Abba Feta	Kitimible Kebele	Kersa Woreda	Kebele Cabinet	
138	W/rt Ekilema Sheik Aliyi	Kitimible Kebele	Kersa Woreda	Health extension worker	0917007723
139	Ato Awel Abba Jebel	Kitimible Kebele	Kersa Woreda	Youth association head	0917011472
140	Ato Abduerkarim Abba Gero	Kitimible Kebele	Kersa Woreda	Model farmer	
141	W/ro Fatuma Abba Jebel	Kitimible Kebele	Kersa Woreda	Women association head	0917010676
142	Ato Ahemd Abba Fira	Kitimible Kebele	Kersa Woreda	Kebele manager	0910067040
143	Ato Muhamad Amin	Kitimible Kebele	Kersa Woreda	Model farmer	

STRENGTHENING MULTI-SECTORAL DEVELOPMENT PLANNING IN OROMIA REGION

A JICA/BOFED CAPACITY BUILDING PROJECT

DATA COLLECTION FORMATS AND RESPONSES AT WOFED, KEBELE AND ZOFED

ANNEX IV:
RESPONSE SHEETS

WABEKBON DEVELOPMENT CONSULTANTS PLC

ADDIS ABABA
ETHIOPIA
OCTOBER 2009

Abbreviations

BP	Budget Planning
BPS	Budget Planning Support
ES	Experience Sharing
IE	Information Exchange
IH	Implementation Hurdle
JBP	Joint Budget Planning
JME	Joint Monitoring and Evaluation
JTW	Joint Team Work
KC	Kebele Council
KM	Kebele Manager
LS	Logistics Support
MA	Modification of allocations
M&E/ME	Monitoring and Evaluation
MG	Group meeting
MGMT	Management
MS	Multi-Sectoral Planning/management support
OC	Oromia Council
PDP	Participatory Development Planning
PTG	Planning Technical Guidelines
QD	Qualitative Data
RDP	Regional Development Planning
RA	Reallocation
SD	Secondary Data
TB	Technical Budget manual
TM	Technical Meeting/manual
TSP	Technical Support
WA	Women's Association
WAO	Wereda Administration Office
WCAB	Wereda Cabinet
WCBO	Wereda Capacity Building Office
YA	Youth Association
ZCBA	Zonal cabinet
ZS	Zonal Sectors

ANNEX: IV-I

PART I

SECTION I-IV

WEREDA FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OFFICES
(13 WEREDA FEDOs)

DEVELOPMENT PLANNING, BUDGET PLANNING, MONITORING AND EVALUATION, INFORMATION MANAGEMENT

PARTI SECTION I
THEMATIC FOCUS AND KEY INFORMANT DISCUSSION-DEVELOPMENT PLANNING
WEREDA FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OFFICE and SECTOR OFFICES

No	Indicators/Questionnaires	GEDEB ASASA	SHASHAMANE	ARSI NEGELE	ARSI NEGELLE JIDO KOMBOLCHA	FENTALE
1	What is the type of planning you are currently exercising	Multi sectoral	Participatory development planning	Multi-sectoral	Participatory DP	PDP
2	If participatory planning, when did you adopt it?	In 1995	1996	1995	2000	2000
	Why it is so important to adopt participatory planning?	Identify community needs, ensure sustainability and ownership	Community needs, ownership, participation, sustainability and relevance	Community needs, ownership, participation, sustainability and relevance	Ensure ownership, relevance and sustainability, participation	??
3	Who are stakeholders in planning?	Sector offices, ZOFED, BOFED, kebeles, wereda council, wereda cabinet	Sectors, ZOFED, BOFED, wereda cabinet, wereda council, private sector, others	Sectors, kebeles, cabinet, council, ZOFED	Community, sectors, various committees and structure, NGOs	All sectors, all kebeles, NGOs, planning and research institutions
4	Who participate in actual planning exercises?	Virtual committee (ineffective), kebele manager, inspection and supervision committee, sectors (27), WOFED	WOFED and sectors	WoFED, sectors, kebeles	WOFED, sector, community	All sectors, kebeles, WOFED
5	Is the participation of stakeholders in planning adequate?	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
6	If no, what are the reasons?	The planning system of sectors is weak, shortage of manpower, inadequate skill and experience				Awareness, experience, facilities
7	What are the responsibilities of each stakeholder in planning?	As stated in the BPR	As stated in BPR	As stated in BPR	As stated in the BPR	As stated in BPR
8	How do the WoFED coordinate different stakeholders during planning?	Letter of call, consultation and discussion, plan and budget appraisal, others	Letter of calls, information and data gathering, consultation and discussion, information exchange, plan and budget appraisal	Letter of calls, information and data gathering, consultation and discussion, information exchange, plan and budget appraisal	Calls, information gathering, consultation and discussion, information exchange, plan appraisal	Calls, information, consultation, exchange, plan appraisal, others

9	Is the WoFED efficient in coordinating the stakeholders?	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
10	If not what does it lack?	Manpower, decision making power, technical expertise, support from ZOFED and BOFED, communication, skills and adequate professional composition of the staff				Support from the cabinet, support from ZoFED and BoFED
11	Are all processes and procedures indicated in BPR for panning fully adopted? (multi sectoral or single sector planning?)	No	Yes, but it is not as such as it is exaggerated	Yes, but delayance is common	yes	No
12	If not indicate some of the reasons?	BPR does not consider current capacities, lack of financial and human resources, inadequate communication and linkages between institutions, others	There is no adequate capacities to accomplish BPR 100% as stated in the BPR	Delayance		Inadequate attentions from sectors
13	What type of planning are you preparing, and for which years?	Annual plans (1995-2002), medium term plan (1998-20020	Annual plan since 1996 and medium term plan of 1998-2002	Annual 1995-2002, medium term plan, 1998-2002	Annual and medium term	Annual plan
14	What type of inputs/instruments are you using for planning purposes?	Previous years plan implementation reports, guidelines (outlines of the plan) and patchy indicators	BPR planning documents	BPR guidelines, various plan documents from ZOFED< BOFED	BPR guidelines, various documents from planning	Technical, operational, BPR and other plan documents, manuals and guidelines
15	If positive for no. 14, who prepared them and which year?	BPR guidelines	BPR guidelines by BOFED	BPR from BOFED	BPR 2000 and 2001	BOFED
16	Are these inputs adequate for technical planning purposes?	No	No	No	Yes	Yes
17	If no, what do they lack	No manual or guideline at all	Poor in content and scope	Content and scope, lack technicality		
18	Have you planning indicators for annual or mid term planning?	Yes	No	Yes, budget allocation formula data	Yes	Yes
19	Are these indicators detailed, aggregated and adequate?	No		Yes	No	No
20	What is the maximum aggregation level of the indicators?	sectors	Sectors	Sectors	Sectors	kebeles
21	Who prepare these indicators?	sectors	sectors	Sectors	WOFED, ZOFED,	WoFED, wereda

					BOFED	council/cabinet
22	Have you adequate capacity (skill, experience, etc) to prepare detail and SMART indicators?	No	No	No	Yes	No
23	From where do you draw these indicators?	Sector plans	Sector plans	Annual plan documents, long and medium term plans, M&E documents	Plan, ME documents	Plan docs
24	When do you start planning?	Up to 15 days up from BPR	July to August	May to June 30	July	
25	How many times does it take to complete a planning document?	15	60	60	360	
26	Does this time consistent with that indicated in the planning BPR/manual?	Yes	No	No delayance	Yes	Yes
27	If not why?			Delayance from sectors		
28	What is the schedule for planning?	April to May	July-august	May to June	June to July	Jan to June
29	Is your planning consistent with available resources?	No	No	No	Yes	No
30	Are plans consistent with the fundamental problems of the wereda?	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
31	Is there a practice of linking the plans with the fundamental indicators such as food insecurity, poverty, environmental degradation, and other MDG indicators etc?	No	No	Yes, indirectly	Yes	Yes
32	What are the basics of planning?	Infrastructure gap, financial resources	Infrastructure gap, socio-economic contraints	Infrastructure, constraints, financial resources	Infrastructure, resource potential, socio-economics, political motive, financial resources	Infrastructure, potential, contraints, politics, Financial resources
33	How many times do you revise the plan before approval?	Twice	Twice	Twice	Twice	4
34	Have you standard plan appraisal criteria?	No	No	No	No	no
35	What are these criteria	No				
36	Who approves plan in the wereda?	Wereda council	Wereda council	Wereda council	Wereda Council	council
37	Is there an adhoc/virtual team established from planning purpose in the wereda?	No	No	No,	No	yes
38	If yes, who are its members?			No		WAO, WOFED, capacity, WHO,

						WPDO
39	Are community projects and programmes included in annual and medium-term plans?	No	No	no	Yes	Yes
40	If not, why not?	Believed sector plans are adequate and financing modalities not in place for kebeles	because the sector plans can include kebele plans	Skill and experience, in some no manpower at all, poor in detail and commitment		
41	Is there major problem in preparation of annual plans in sector offices?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
42	If yes, indicate some problems?	budget, skills, manpower, capacities, delayance, weak planning and budgeting team, poor communication,	Experience, turn over, limited in scope (of plan)	The sector plans expected to include that of kebeles also	Lack of reliable data	Delayance
43	Is kebele plan included in your annual and medium-term plans?	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
44	If yes, are all kebeles able to prepare their annual plans?	Yes	Yes	yes	Yes	Yes
45	If yes, how many kebeles prepare and submit their plans to WFEDO since 2000?	all 26	all 38 kebeles	All 43 kebeles	All 43	All 18
46	Who sets sector priority in each planning period?	WoFED	BoFED with ceiling	BOFED	Oromia council	WOFED
47	What is the basis for priority setting?	Fund, infrastructure gap, % of expenditure	fund, infrastructure gap, number of workers	Infrastructure	Infrastructure gap, potential to change livelihood	Fund, revenue, livelihood, infrastructure gap, political decision
48	What determines the efficiency of planning?	Fund, participation, manpower	Fund, potentials, constraints	Fund, problems	Development needs, available potential,	Fund, needs, potentials, problems
49	Who identify projects and programmes in the wereda?	Sector offices, zonal sectors, the WOFED	Sectors, communities, wereda council	Sectors, kebeles and communities	Sectors, kebeles, WOFED	WOFED
50	Is there capacity for identification and study of new programmes and projects in the wereda?	No	No	No	No	NO
51	If yes, who appraise new projects and programmes?	WOFED	WOFED	WOFED	WOFED	WOFED
52	Have you developed standard appraisal criteria for new projects?	No	No	No	Yes	No
53	Are there adequate opportunities to incorporate these projects in annual and medium term planning?	No	No	No	No	Yes

54	Is there unnecessary structure or organization in planning?	No	No,	Yes,	No	No
55	If yes, what is it?			PME in WAO		
56	Have you adequate manpower in number and necessary skills? (fill also the next table)	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
57	Is the required manpower for planning fulfilled in accordance with the recommendations of the BPR? If no, how many staff are lacking?	No, 2	No, 5 (For PME)	No 3	No 5	Yes 2
58	Have you adequate staff training program?	No	No	No	No	No
59	Have you staff development and retention plans or strategies?	No	No	No	No	No
60	If yes, what are they?					
61	What are the most important training subjects to develop the skill of the staff in planning?	PME, audit, PCM, strategic planning, IT, others	Planning, PCM, M&E, information management	Planning, PCM, M&E, information management, budgeting	ME, IM, IBEX, computer technology	PCM, M&E, IT, budgeting
62	Is the staff turnover common in the planning team?	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes
63	If yes, what are the reasons?	Unattractive salary, inadequate training, better opportunities, workloads	Unattractive salary, transfer and promotion	Salary, opportunity, promotion and transfer		Salary, training, allowance, work environment, opportunities, remoteness, volatile structure, services, transfer and promotion
64	If turnover is common, how many planning staff members left between 1995-2001?	no information as the head is new	2	4		Data inadequate
65	Comment on efficiency of human resources?	Medium	Medium	High	Weak	Medium
66	What are the major constraints to improve the efficiency of existing staff?	Shortage of logistics, communication facilities, poor working environment, inadequate salary and allowances, inadequate incentives, workloads	Logistics, communication, salary and allowances, workloads	Logistics, communication, salary, incentives	Logistics, incentive	Logistics, communication, work environment, salary, incentives, workloads

PART I SECTION I
(CONTINUED)

No	Indicators/Questionnaires	TULLO	HABRO	LUME
1	What is the type of planning you are currently exercising	PDP	PDP	MS, RDP, PDP
2	If participatory planning, when did you adopt it?	1995	1995	1995
	Why it is so important to adopt participatory planning?	Priority setting, ownership, relevance, sustainability	Sustainability, ownership	Ownership, consensus, sustainability
3	Who are stakeholders in planning?	Sectors (27), community, cabinet, council, ZOFED, BOFED	Sectors (27), community	Sectors, NGOS, ZOFED, wereda council, community
4	Who participate in actual planning exercises?	WOFED, sector plan and program sections	Community, sectors, WOFED	Sectors, WoFED, wereda council
5	Is the participation of stakeholders in planning adequate?	No	NO	NO
6	If no, what are the reasons?	Weak linkages, participation, inadequate flow of plan data, communication and transport, budget, experience, technical support	Capacities, budget	Manpower, linkage
7	What are the responsibilities of each stakeholder in planning?	Refer to BPR	Refer to BPR	Refer to BPR
8	How do the WoFED coordinate different stakeholders during planning?	Calls, information gathering, consultation and discussion, information exchange, plan appraisal	letter, information, consultations, discussion, information exchange, plan appraisal	letter, information gathering, consultation, discussion, information exchange, plan appraisal
9	Is the WoFED efficient in coordinating the stakeholders?	No	No	No
10	If not what does it lack?	Decision making power, technical expertise, support from WC,	Manpower, capacities of sectors	Manpower, decision, technical expertise, support from cabinet, support from ZoFED and BoFED, capacities
11	Are all processes and procedures indicated in BPR for panning fully adopted? (multi sectoral or single sector planning?)	No	No	NO
12	If not indicate some of the reasons?	Communication, no plan worker at kebele level assigned by BOFED	Financial and human resources	Attention, financial and human resources, communication b/n WoFED, BoFED, ZoFED
13	What type of planning are you preparing, and for which years?	Annual and medium term plan	Annual and medium term	Annual, medium term plans
14	What type of inputs/instruments are you using for planning purposes?	Plan documents,	BPR guideline, other	Technical and operational

		formats, priority sector identification, short directives	documents	guidelines, BPR documents
15	If positive for no. 14, who prepared them and which year?	BoFED	BOFED	BOFED
16	Are these inputs adequate for technical planning purposes?	No	No	No
17	If no, what do they lack	Not comprehensive, content and scope, outdated and irregular	Not user friendly, inconsistent with the real world	Not user friendly
18	Have you planning indicators for annual or midterm planning?	Yes	Yes	Yes
19	Are these indicators detailed, aggregated and adequate?	Yes	No	No
20	What is the maximum aggregation level of the indicators?	Sectors	Sectors	Kebeles, sectors
21	Who prepare these indicators?	Sectors	Sectors	WoFED
22	Have you adequate capacity (skill, experience, etc) to prepare detail and SMART indicators?	No	No	No
23	From where do you draw these indicators?	Annual plans, baseline studies, ME	Annual plans, medium and long term strategic plans, ME documents	Annual planning, M&E
24	When do you start planning?	May-June	March	May
25	How many times does it take to complete a planning document?	60	90	60
26	Does this time consistent with that indicated in the planning BPR/manual?	Yes	Yes	Yes
27	If not why?			
28	What is the schedule for planning?	May-June	May-June	May-June
29	Is your planning consistent with available resources?	No	No	No
30	Are plans consistent with the fundamental problems of the wereda?	Yes	No	Yes
31	Is there a practice of linking the plans with the fundamental indicators such as food insecurity, poverty, environmental degradation, and other MDG indicators etc?	No	yes	Yes
32	What are the basics of planning?	Infrastructure gap, resource potential, contraints,	Gaps, resources, constraints	Gap, ressources, contraints, motives, Financial resource
33	How many times do you revise the plan before approval?	1x	1x	3X
34	Have you standard plan appraisal criteria?	No	No	NO
35	What are these criteria			
36	Who approves plan in the wereda?	WC	WC	WC
37	Is there an adhoc/virtual team established from planning purpose in the wereda?	No	No	No
38	If yes, who are its members?			
39	Are community projects and programmes included in annual and medium-term plans?	Yes	Yes	Yes
40	If not, why not?			
41	Is there major problem in preparation of annual plans in sector offices?	Yes	Yes	Yes
42	If yes, indicate some problems?	Delayance, lack of attention and	Manpower	Manpower

		commitment, skill and experience		
43	Is kebele plan included in your annual and medium-term plans?	No	Yes	Yes
44	If yes, are all kebeles able to prepare their annual plans?	Don't know	Yes	Yes
45	If yes, how many kebeles prepare and submit their plans to WFEDO since 1995?	32	32	38
46	Who sets sector priority in each planning period?	BOFED	BOFED	OC, BOFED, WC
47	What is the basis for priority setting?	Contribution in poverty reduction	Potentials	Fund, livelihoods, gap, political decision
48	What determines the efficiency of planning?	Fund, certain problems	Fund, needs, potentials, problems	Fund, needs, potentials, problems
49	Who identify projects and programmes in the wereda?	Sector offices	Sectors, BOFED	Sectors, ZOFED, communities, WC, BOFED, WOFED
50	Is there capacity for identification and study of new programmes and projects in the wereda?	No	No	Yes
51	If yes, who appraise new projects and programmes?	WOFED	WOFED	WOFED, sectors, WC
52	Have you developed standard appraisal criteria for new projects?	No	No	No
53	Are there adequate opportunities to incorporate these projects in annual and medium term planning?	No	Yes	No
54	Is there unnecessary structure or organization in planning?	No	No	No
55	If yes, what is it?	No		
56	Have you adequate manpower in number and necessary skills? (fill also the next table)	No	Yes	No .
57	Is the required manpower for planning fulfilled in accordance with the recommendations of the BPR? If no, how many staff are lacking?	No,	Yes	No, 2
58	Have you adequate staff training program?	No	No	No
59	Have you staff development and retention plans or strategies?	No	No	No
60	If yes, what are they?			
61	What are the most important training subjects to develop the skill of the staff in planning?	Planning, budgeting, M&E, IM, IT, PCM	Planning, IT	Planning techniques, PCM
62	Is the staff turnover common in the planning team?	Yes	No	Yes
63	If yes, what are the reasons?	Transfer		Salary, training, allowances, environment, opportunities, volatility, services, transfer
64	If turnover is common, how many planning staff members left between 1995-2001?	1		11
65	Comment on efficiency of human resources?	Medium	Medium	Medium
66	What are the major constraints to improve the efficiency of existing staff?	Logistics, communication, salary, incentives, workloads	Logistics, communication, salary	Logistics, communication, salary, incentives

PART I SECTION II (CONTINUED)

No	Indicators/Questionnaires	SIBU SIRE	GUTO GIDA	JIMA ARJO	KERSA	GOMA
1	What is the type of planning you are currently exercising	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS
2	If participatory planning, when did you adopt it?					
	Why it is so important to adopt participatory planning?					
3	Who are stakeholders in planning?			Sectors		wereda sectors
4	Who participate in actual planning exercises?		sectors	sectors,		wereda sectors
5	Is the participation of stakeholders in planning adequate?	yes	no	no		no
6	If no, what are the reasons?					skill and experience
7	What are the responsibilities of each stakeholder in planning?					
8	How do the WoFED coordinate different stakeholders during planning?	Calls, information gathering, consultation and discussion, information exchange, plan appraisal	letter, information, consultations, discussion, information exchange, plan appraisal	letter, information gathering, consultation, discussion, information exchange	letter, data gathering, consultation, discussion	letter, data gathering, consultation, discussion
9	Is the WoFED efficient in coordinating the stakeholders?	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No
10	If not what does it lack?		Manpower, technical expertise			Manpower, technical expertise
11	Are all processes and procedures indicated in BPR for panning fully adopted? (multi sectoral or single sector planning?)	No	No	Yes	No	No
12	If not indicate some of the reasons?	Attention	Financial and human resources, attention		Attention	Manpower
13	What type of planning are you preparing, and for which years?	Annual plan	Annual term	Annual, medium term plans	Annual plan	ANNUAL
14	What type of inputs/instruments are you using for planning purposes?	Plan documents,	BPR guideline, other documents	Technical guidelines, BPR documents	Planning technical; guideline	Technical guidelines
15	If positive for no. 14, who prepared them and which year?	BOFED	BOFED	BOFED	BOFED	BOFED
16	Are these inputs adequate for	No	No	No	Yes	No

	technical planning purposes?					
17	If no, what do they lack	inadequate	not comprehensive	not user friendly		content and scope
18	Have you planning indicators for annual or mid term planning?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
19	Are these indicators detailed, aggregated and adequate?	No	Yes	No	Yes	No
20	What is the maximum aggregation level of the indicators?	Sectors	Sectors	Sectors	Sectors	Sectors
21	Who prepare these indicators?	Sectors	Sectors	Sectors	Sectors	Sectors
22	Have you adequate capacity (skill, experience, etc) to prepare detail and SMART indicators?	No	No	No	Yes	No
23	From where do you draw these indicators?	Past performance		Annual planning, ME	Annual and medium term plan	Sector report
24	When do you start planning?	April	April	April-May	July 1-30	June-August
25	How many times does it take to complete a planning document?	80	90	60	30	90
26	Does this time consistent with that indicated in the planning BPR/manual?	No	No	No	Yes	No
27	If not why?	Manpower, workload, delayance	Delayance, coordination	Delayance		Manpower, delayance
28	What is the schedule for planning?	April-June	April-June	April-May	July 1-30	April-June
29	Is your planning consistent with available resources?	Yes	No	No	No	No
30	Are plans consistent with the fundamental problems of the wereda?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	YES
31	Is there a practice of linking the plans with the fundamental indicators such as food insecurity, poverty, environmental degradation, and other MDG indicators etc?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
32	What are the basics of planning?	Infrastructure gap, resource potential	Gaps, constraints	Gap, resource, contraints	Gap, resource potential, contraints	Potential, problems, finance
33	How many times do you revise the plan before approval?	1x	2x	2X	2x	3x
34	Have you standard plan appraisal criteria?	No	No	Yes	No	No
35	What are these criteria					
36	Who approves plan in the wereda?	Wereda Cabinet	Wereda cabinet	Wereda council	Wereda cabinet	Wereda cabinet
37	Is there an adhoc/virtual team established from planning purpose in the wereda?	No	No	No	No	No
38	If yes, who are its members?					

39	Are community projects and programmes included in annual and medium-term plans?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
40	If not, why not?					
41	Is there major problem in preparation of annual plans in sector offices?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
42	If yes, indicate some problems?	Manpower	Manpower	Manpower	Some receive plans from zones and region after wereda plan is completed	Manpower and skills
43	Is kebele plan included in your annual and medium-term plans?	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
44	If yes, are all kebeles able to prepare their annual plans?	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
45	If yes, how many kebeles prepare and submit their plans to WFEDO since 1995?	none	None	20	31	37
46	Who sets sector priority in each planning period?	BOFED	Sectors bureau	Oromia council	Oromia council	None
47	What is the basis for priority setting?	Livelihoods, gaps, political decision	Livelihood	livelihoods	livelihoods	
48	What determines the efficiency of planning?	Fund	Fund	Fund, needs, potentials, problems	Needs	
49	Who identify projects and programmes in the wereda?	Sector offices	Sectors	Sectors	Sectors, WC	
50	Is there capacity for identification and study of new programmes and projects in the wereda?	No	No	No	No	Sectors
51	If yes, who appraise new projects and programmes?					No
52	Have you developed standard appraisal criteria for new projects?	No	No	Yes	No	
53	Are there adequate opportunities to incorporate these projects in annual and medium term planning?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
54	Is there unnecessary structure or organization in planning?	No	No	Yes	No	Yes
55	If yes, what is it?					
56	Have you adequate manpower in number and necessary skills? (fill also the next table)	No	No	No	No	
57	Is the required manpower for planning fulfilled in accordance with	No 3	No, 5	No, 1	No, 3	No, 2

	the recommendations of the BPR? If no, how many staff are lacking?					
58	Have you adequate staff training program?	No	No	No	Yes	No
59	Have you staff development and retention plans or strategies?	No	No	No	No	No
60	If yes, what are they?					No
61	What are the most important training subjects to develop the skill of the staff in planning?	Planning, projects and data	Planning, IT	Planning techniques	Plan and project preparation	Planning
62	Is the staff turnover common in the planning team?	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
63	If yes, what are the reasons?			Salary, training, opportunities,	Salary, training, allowances	Salary, training, opportunities
64	If turnover is common, how many planning staff members left between 1995-2001?			1	3	5
65	Comment on efficiency of human resources?	Medium	Medium	Very high	High	Medium
66	What are the major constraints to improve the efficiency of existing staff?	Logistics, salary, incentives	Logistics, work, salary, incentives, workload		Salary, workloads	Logistics, incentives, workloads

PART I SECTION II
THEMATIC FOCUS AND KEY INFORMANT DISCUSSION WITH WOFED and SECTOR OFFICES ON BUDGETING

NO	Indicators	GEDEB ASSASSA	SHASHAMANE	ARSI NEGELE	ADAMI TULU	FENTALE
1	Is there significant difference between planning and budgeting?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
2	If yes, what differentiates budgeting from planning?	Planning is for physical activities and budget is for money	Plan is activity and budget is money	Plan is activities and budget is money	Budgeting is money	
3	How do you decide on budget ceiling?	The expected own revenue	Own revenue, regional grant, community participation	Revenue, grant	Revenue, grant, participation	Own revenue, grant, external sources
4	Is this ceiling consistent with the actual availability of the budget?	Yes	No	No	No	No
5	If no, how often do they vary?		Very large (>20%)	Very large over 50%	Medium	Medium
6	Who decide on the budget ceiling?	WOFED	Wereda council, WOFED	BOFED, wereda council, WOFED, cabinet	BOFED	BOFED
7	Is this ceiling consistent with gaps to be fulfilled or expenditure needs?	No	No (the demand is more than double)	No	No	No
8	How do you decide and prioritize the budget ceiling for sectors?	Scope of the work	Scope of the work, manpower, type of projects, priority for the sector, previous year plan and achievements	Scope, manpower, type of projects, priority	Scope, manpower, type, priority	Manpower, type, priority, community need
	Who sets priorities among sectors?	WOFED	WOFED and the council for approval	BOFED, cabinet	BOFED, WOFED	WoFED
9	How do you budget for kebeles?	Depending on their proposal	No budget for kebeles	No for kebeles	None for kebeles	Proposal, participation, past performance
10	Does the ceiling for each sector, in accordance with livelihood constraints and coverage?	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
11	How do you divide between recurrent and capital budget in annual or medium term plans?	Decision of the wereda council	last performance, infrastructure gap, availability of fund, decision of BoFED	FED, 6.62% for capital budget but there are chances to adjust this figure	Gaps, performance, infrastructure	Gaps, performance, fund, decision of BOFED
12	What is the schedule for annual budgeting	July	Feb to June 30	1st ceiling May-June, 2nd ceiling July, 3rd ceiling January-march (supplementary budget)	Similar to planning but 3 times	Jan to June

13	Who are the major stakeholders in budgeting?	Budget team of WOFED, all sectors, wereda cabinet	WOFED, sectors, wereda cabinet, wereda council	WOFED, sectors	WOFED, sectors, the council	Wereda council, WAO, health, PDO, wereda planning committee and all sector offices
14	What are the responsibilities of each stakeholder?	In accordance with the BPR	In accordance with BPR	In accordance with BPR	In accordance with BPR	In accordance with BPR
15	How strong are the relationships between stakeholders during budgeting?	Very strong	Very strong	Very strong	Strong	Strong
16	What is the role of WFEDO in budgeting?	Monitoring and evaluation of budget	Aggregating budget, allocation of budget, M&E, estimation and planning of sector budget, priority setting	Aggregate budget, allocation, M&E, estimate and planning for sectors	Aggregating, allocating, monitoring and evaluating, estimating and planning	Aggregate, allocate, ME, planning of sector budget, information exchange
16	How many steps should you follow in budgeting?	5	8	10	6	4
17	Are these procedures consistent with that of the recommendations of BPR?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
18	If, not give the reasons					
19	Is what you plan and actually obtained t consistent to accomplish the plans?	No	No	No	No	No
20	If not consistent please indicate your planned budget and actual budget for the last 5 years, '000 birr		41.2 Vs 24 million	30 vs 27		
21	What is the share of capital and recurrent budget allocations between 1995-2002 EFY? ('000 birr)	6.62% capital	Refer to attached figure	1.4 vs 27.4		
22	Indicate the source of budget for the period 1995-2002 EFY in '000 Birr	16,7 vs 6.1 million	18 vs 6 million	27.6 vs 1.4 million		
23	What is the share of your internal revenue in the budget for years 1995-2002 EFY in '000 Birr? For detail refer to the appropriate table.	6.1 million	6 million	1.4 million		
24	Do you know the grant formula used to allocate budget among weredas currently?	No	No	No	No	No
25	If yes, what is it?			It seems from their figure that the criteria is based on manipulating our revenue		
26	Is this formula appropriate for efficient	no	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown

	planning, resource utilization, management and development?					
27	If no, what are its problems?	Technically inefficient, based on previous year performance, does not consider scope of activities and available manpower and the amount of salary				Don't know
28	What formula/ consideration is important than the current ones?	It needs detail study	We don't know. We believe however that the formula was not in accordance with our data	No	Don't know	
29	Have you attempted to produce your own wereda formula?	Yes	No	No	No	No
30	If yes, what are the basic indicators?	Previous year performance, last year initial budget, scope of the work, capacity of the wereda, priority of the sector				
31	If you have any information about the current grant formula, do you think it is based on accurate and reliable information?	Yes	No	yes we know that the data is in consistent)	Don't know	Don't know
32	If not what are the reasons?	Irrelevant for the wereda and sectors	Might not based on our data	Don't know		
33	Are there irrelevant indicators in the current formula to your local circumstances?	Yes	Not known	No	Don't know	Don't know
34	If yes, what are they?					
35	Are there times when the allocated budget (from government) does not comply with the community contribution?	no	No		No	No
36	If yes, are there times when community proposals and contribution were rejected due to lack of fund from the government?	Yes				
37	Have you budgeting manuals for planning?	Yes	Yes, training on preparation and financial administration, BoFED March 2000		Yes	Yes
38	If yes, what are they?	technical manuals, operational manuals			Training manual	Operational manuals, laws and

						regulation, budget planning guidelines
39	Are they adequate, user friendly and up to date?	Yes	Yes	Yes	yes	No
40	Who prepared these guidelines and manuals and when?	BoFED	BOFED	BOFED	BOFED	BOFED
41	What is your basis of budget planning?	Expected regional grants	Previous year achievement, revenue, expected grant, constraints, infrastructure gap	Previous year achievement, revenue, expected grant, constraints, infrastructure gap	Performance, revenue, grant, contraints, gaps, demand	Last achievement, your revenue, grant, constraints, infrastructure gap, community needs
42	Is the current level, amount and modalities of financing adequate to run the sectors under the mandate of the wereda mandates?	no	No	No	No	No
43	If not, why not?	Expanding institutions and structures, Increasing demands for basic needs, Too many socio-economic problems	Expanding institutions and structure, demands for basic needs, low revenue generation, too many socio-economic problems, inadequate attention from the government, inconsistent allocation criteria inadequate priority setting	Expanding structure, demands for basic needs, low internal revenue generation, socio-economic problems	Institutions and structures, demands for basic services, low internal revenue, socio-economic problems, priority setting	Institutions and structures, demand for basic services, internal revenue generation capacity, problems, logistics
44	What should be done to solve the problems?	Economic growth, priority setting, internal revenue expansion			Adequate budget,	Improve internal revenue, manpower, expand grants, prioritize tasks
45	How do you coordinate the budget owners during budget planning?	Collect needs at the beginning of the year	Common discussion forum, regular follow up, face to face support	Through calls and direct communication, meetings and hearings on the cabinet meetings	Call for budget, setting priorities and ceilings, submission by sectors, appraisal, cabinet, standing committee, council	Calls, communications, online support and coordination, orientation
46	Is there any problem in coordinating these stakeholders?	no	No	No	Yes	Yes
47	If yes, what are the problems?			PSNP activities are planned, the budget is monitored but not planned	Delayance	Delayance, unreliable and inconsistent data, manpower,, inadequate orientation, low

						commitment
48	How do you decide financing of bilateral and multi lateral projects?	Priority of the sector	No program in the wereda	BoFED and regional sectors are responsible	PSNP, the budget is not part of the wereda plan	Check whether it is priority and budgeted in government plan
49	Sketch the organizational structure for budgeting					
50	Are there any redundant or overlapping functions in budgeting?	no	No	No	No	No
51	If yes, what are they?					
52	Is the existing staff of budgeting adequate in terms of number, quality and skills?	no	Yes	yes	No	No
53	What is the required and currently existing number of staff of budgeting functions in your office?	Required: 6 Existing: 3	Required 4 Existing 3	3 required and 3 available	10 required 8 available	7 out of 9
54	Is staff turnover common in your office (for budgeting only)	no	Yes	Yes	No	Yes
55	If yes, how many of them left between 1995-2001?		1	1		3
56	What are the main reasons for staff turnover?	Unattractive salary, Unattractive working environment	Unattractive salary	Salary		Salary, work environment, growth, promotion, opportunities, pull factors
57	Is there any staff development and incentive packages to retain and motivate?	no	No	No	No	No
58	If yes, what are they?					
59	Are there any short and long term training for your staff?	no	No	No	No	Yes
60	If yes, indicate the type of training and number trained from 1995-2001?					3 in budgeting
61	What are your plans in staff training?	Short term training	None		No	Training of managers and kebele and wereda sector offices
62	What are the most important training subjects for budgeting staff?	budgeting	Planning, budget administration, PCM	Budgeting, auditing, project cycle management	IBEX	Budget planning
63	Attach the duties and responsibilities	Refer BPR	Refer to BPR	Refer to BPR	Refer to BPR	Refer to BPR

	of the budgeting staff					
64	Are there enabling environments for budgeting staff to execute their responsibilities as stated in their job descriptions?	no	Yes	No	No	No
65	If not, list the reasons	Shortage of budget, transport, incentives		Logistic, training, transport, experience sharing and technical support	Lack of necessary LOGISTICS	Poor weather conditions, lack of training, incentives and turn over
66	Have you ever provided supports to stakeholders?	Yes	Yes for sectors no for kebeles	Yes	Yes	Yes
67	If yes, indicate the type of support you provided to stakeholders in budgeting?	Information exchange on budgeting, Support in budget planning, Joint team work on budgeting	Information exchange, technical support, manuals and guidelines	Information exchange, technical support, manuals and guidelines	Information exchange, technical support, training, manuals and guidelines	Information exchange, support, team work, orientation
68	Have you adequate capacity to provide support to stakeholders?	no	No	No	Yes	No
69	If not, what do you lack?	Manpower, Budget, Facilities and services, Motivation and attention	Manpower, budget, skill and experience, facilities and services	Manpower, budget, skill and experience	Skill and experience, data and information	Manpower, budget, experience, facilities
70	Have you ever obtained support from other stakeholders?	no	No	Yes	No	Yes
71	If yes, what type of support you get from other stakeholders?					Financial
72	Is this support adequate and timely?	no		No	No	No
73	Have you ever obtained support from the BoFED and ZFEDO?	Yes	No	Yes once on budgeting	Yes	Yes
74	If yes, what type of support?	Joint budget planning, Information and budget data, Technical support on implementation and methods of budgeting		Training on budgeting, technical support	Training, information, technical support	Information, orientation
75	Is the support timely and adequate?	no		No	No	No
76	How frequent is this support?	Occasional		Occasional	Occasional	Occasional
77	How important is their support to the weredas?	Very important	Very important	Fairly important	Very important	Very important
78	Are current linkages and working relationships between ZFEDO adequate?	no	No	No	No	No
79	Are current linkages and working relationships between weredas and BoFED adequate and efficient?	no	No	No	No	No