4-2 Effectiveness

Effectiveness examines the extent to which the project objective has been achieved in relation to the outputs. In this criterion, it is also examined whether or not there have been any promoting or impeding factors for or against the achievement of the project purpose.

(1) Developing Capacity of Human Resources

The counterpart training courses in Japan were the prime input of the Project, which enabled Chilean (mainly public officers and staff in private sector related to the public entities) to acquire the Japanese knowledge and practical experiences. As a result, the trainees could diffuse their learned knowledge and experiences to their belonging organizations and communities in the pilot areas, formulating "Knowledge Communities" which gather useful and practical knowledge and experiences in Japan and share them among the members (mainly trainees who participated in the Training from 2009 to 2010).

In fact, the administration capacity in the pilot provinces and region has been strengthened. Through the community activities, both public officers and staff in private sectors have shared their knowledge and experience each other and have aimed to promote regional economic development. Table 10 shows the actual activities realized in the pilot areas, with participation of public organizations like the municipal governments and the OPDPs. Thus, it can be considered that activating and developing more Knowledge Communities may increase the project effects and help to diffuse the Japanese knowledge to other regions in Chile.

Table 10 Knowledge Communities and Participation from Public Organizations

No.	Pilot Areas	Activities by Knowledge Communities and Participation from Public Organizations
ī	San Antonio Province	5s Campaign and OVOP Movement by OPDP's Strong Initiative in the Province
2	Chiloé Province	Magic Incubator Plan with Participation of a few Municipalities (Ancud and Quemchi City)
3	Araucanía Region	Training Courses in 2011 for Regional and Municipal Officers (SERCOTEC supported by the Regional government)

Source: JICA documents

With regard to one of the pilot areas, Arauco province, the Knowledge Community was not formulated due to inevitable work response to earthquake occurred in February 2010 as well as a significant number of coordination activities regarding the public investment by special plan in the province. According to SUBDERE, activities by the trainees who participated in the Training from Arauco province have been consequently limited, although they have individually

7.1c

promoted their own activities. This is because the project team in SUBDERE headquarter did not achieve convincing the OPDP in the province about diffusing the work necessity, which coordinate the various initiatives of ex-trainees for the provincial project plan. However, regarding the concept OVOP, the OPDP is now considering to promote the coordination. Further measures should be taken for the province in order to enable the project effects rise.

(2) Local Trainings in the Pilot Areas

Approximately 400 Chilean participated in the local training courses of the pilot provinces and region. Although 100 professional staff at public organizations were target to be trained, other 300 personnel could join in the total of 12 local trainings (three times in four pilot areas). Mainly, the participants consisted of staff at OPDP, provincial and municipal officers, staff at SERCOTEC, etc, but actually included the staff in private sectors, too. Therefore, the total number of the participants became higher than what was originally assumed, and it can be judged that the project effects with more participants may have been developed in the pilot areas, influencing on the regional economy and the public entities.

(3) Manual to be used for Public Officers

SUBDERE supported by the expert has elaborated a manual "Territorial Economic Development". Though the manual was originally designed for public officers' use in regional, provincial and municipal governments, it is also useful for private enterprises. The concept of 5S campaign and Kaizen stated in the manual have given a significant impact on their mind. According to interview with the trainees participated in the Training as well as SUBDERE, they have been satisfied with the manual. Also, SUBDERE commented that the manual will be used even after the project completion for the purpose of diffusing the Japanese knowledge and experiences both to internal divisions and to other public entities like regional and municipal governments.

(4) Impeding Factors

In relation to impeding factors of the Project, although their operational difficulties such as earthquake and change of the national government have often been taken place due to the changes of the team's structure, the project team has played an important role in promoting various activities such as coordination between SUBDERE and the pilot areas as well as public relation works. SUBDERE had not had sufficient experiences for implementing projects directly related to local and community development like this project, since its principal role is providing regional and local governments with financial resources and technical assistances. However with the support of advices from the expert, the SUBDERE project team could



25

introduce the local vision in the project implementation.

Therefore, the Project has largely achieved its objectives; therefore its effectiveness is high.

4-3 Efficiency

Efficiency examines how efficiently the various inputs are converted into outputs of the project during the implementation process. In this criterion, it is examined whether the inputs are appropriately used or not.

(1) Human Resources from the Japanese Side

In the Project, the expert has been dispatched since August 2008. The expert has not been changed and worked almost all of the project period with SUBDERE as well as with the pilot provinces and region, which both the expert and the counterpart have established good relationships each other throughout the period. Additionally, as stated at 3-5-4, the weekly report written by the expert has played an important role in conducting smooth communication with Chilean side. Furthermore, it is notable that the expert's performance has contributed greatly to SUBDERE and the pilot areas, since he introduced systematic methods regarding Japanese knowledge and examples to the Chilean side. The expert also participated partially in some training courses in Japan with Chilean trainees and he could know what the trainees learned and what action plans were presented. The procedure helped well to start up the local trainings in Chile, knowing the participants' needs as well as their knowledge level.

Based on the above, it is judged that the expert could contribute to the whole management of the Project as well as to the project's efficiency.

(2) Human Resources from the Chilean Side

In SUBDERE, 11 staff have been engaged in the Project with the expert. In fact, the staff were from different divisions inside SUBDERE, which has established a task force unit for the Project. According to SUBDERE, the number of staff was appropriate to conduct the Project. Cooperating with the expert, it is considered that the task force unit worked well during the project implementation.

(3) Japanese Training Courses

As described earlier, Table 3 showed the actual training courses held in Japan. According to interview with the trainees, it was confirmed that they were mostly satisfied with the provided courses and commented that they were very practical to know the Japanese methods like Kaizen, 5S, etc. Taking ex-trainee's opinion into account, the project team sometimes presented a



request to the training institutions, such as increasing the components related to public administration in APU's training course. Before the training courses, the expert has often reported the trainee's needs and the background information. Since the communication between the expert and training institution is enough, training has been conducted efficiently considering project needs and participants' background.

It can be judged that the courses were very useful to promote the economic development in the pilot provinces and region and improve public organization's work activities.

Thus, both the Japanese and Chilean sides have contributed to promote the project effects; therefore efficiency of the project is high.

4-4 Impact

Impact identifies the extent to which overall goal of the project has been achieved, and verify intended and unintended, direct and indirect, positive and negative changes in social-economic and institutional aspects, etc as a result of the project.

(1) Activities and Innovation Support in Poor Regions for Micro-enterprises and Ripple Effect

As a result of the expanded activities such as implementation of the local trainings and commencement of the Knowledge Communities in the pilot provinces and region, supports from the public entities have also been increasing. The supports are also on rise for micro-enterprises. For example, one ex-trainee in the Training (APU 2009) who is in charge of the Agricultural Development Program (PRODESAL) in Lautaro City formulated an action plan during the training course and started implementing it after he came back home. The plan mainly aims to stabilize the agricultural product's price of which indigenous produce, in the program of PRODESAL. Securing the selling destination of agricultural products, the trainee's activity has achieved to strengthen the chain of productivity. In July 2010, the agricultural association "Amley" was formed, which consisted of 35 indigenous families engaged in agriculture. The family member has begun cultivating raspberry. Then, 15 out of the 35 families have succeeded in receiving subsidies from Social Investment Fund (FOSIS) and installed irrigation facilities on their farm. Two families also have received subsides from SERCOTEC. Furthermore, under the coordination of PRODESAL, excavators which Lautaro City owns have been lent, and use of underground water has also been urged. Therefore, supports from public services as well as subsides like FOSIS actually exist and agricultural farmers could receive the opportunities.

(2) Knowledge Applied to other Provinces and/or Regions except the Pilot Areas of the Project



According to SUBDERE, based on the experience of the Project, SUBDERE will implement local training programs in other provinces or municipalities in the near future. Since demand of training programs from municipal governments is relatively high, SUBDERE is planning to respond it. Demand of training programs regarding the economic development is especially high. According to SUBDERE, manuals formulated in the Project will be used when the new training courses will be held in the other areas. Then, it is assumed that experiences and knowledge like 5S and Kaizen stated in the manuals will be applied widely.

(3) Appearing Impact by the Trainees who Finished Their Trainings in Japan

Trainee's own activities in Knowledge Communities have also been developed. In other words, relationship among the pilot areas has gradually progressed. For example, the Knowledge Community in San Antonio is planning to visit Chiloé province for the purpose of studying the approach of Chiloé's tourism which has introduced 5S campaign and concept of Kaizen, etc. Several members of the Community in San Antonio will discuss the member in Chiloé and intend to obtain and share their ideas and experiences. As a result, it is considered that synergy impact will be produced through their exchange of knowledge and experiences.

(4) Negative Impact

No negative impact has been observed with the activities of the Project. Based on the interview with Chilean sides, it was confirmed that no negative impact has occurred.

4-5 Sustainability

Sustainability examines whether project benefits are likely to continue after the project completion.

(1) Sustainability for the Enforcement of Administrative Framework

The administrative framework has been strengthened throughout the pilot activities of the Project. In addition, according to SUBDERE, future plans and programs regarding the enforcement of the framework have been prepared. For example, a program called "Program for certificating Regional Governments (Introduction of Continuing Improvement "Kaizen")" will be implemented soon and promoted to all the regions in Chile. As for strengthening the framework of municipal governments, a training program called "National Capacity Building Program for Municipalities" will be implemented for all the 345 Municipal governments. According to SUBDERE, the concept and contents of these programs will adopt the experiences and knowledge of the Project, such as Kaizen and 5S Campaign. Therefore, there is possibility

7.10

of securing sustainability of the administrative framework regarding the public organizations in Chile.

(2) Operational Aspects of SUBDERE and OPDP

SUBDERE has also considered important that sufficient budgets for continuing the Project must be secured. To implement above plan and program, SUBDERE intended to disburse necessary budgets for OPDP until all knowledge and experiences are transferred to the regional governments. In addition, it is considered that allocating personnel and keeping the project task force unit can also be regarded as important element, in order to maintain the project effects after the project completion.

(3) How Lessons Learned Obtained in the Pilot Areas and Job Manuals Will Be Used in Other Regions after the Project Completion

With regard to SUBDERE's future programs, the manuals and lessons learned obtained in the training courses held in the pilot areas will be used in various patterns. For example, a SUBDERE's future program, Management System of "Continuing Improvement (Kaizen)" in the Regional Governments (GOREs) will be introduced to the regional governments to improve the quality of formulating plans in the governments. The manuals will also be used particularly for public officers in the regions. Meanwhile, the OPDP in Araucanía region has launched a plan of new training courses starting in 2011, collaborating with the regional government. In the training courses, the job manuals prepared by the project team and knowledge and experiences what the trainees obtained in Japan will be used as course materials and practical examples. Therefore, it is confirmed that use of job manuals and lessons learned created throughout the Project will be realized in the near future.

In relation to the above, it is considered that sustainability of the Project is high.

5. Conclusion

This project is in compliance with development policy and needs. Furthermore, expected effects of the project such as capacity development of human resources have been achieved. In addition, the future training courses have already been planned applying the project's knowledge and experiences for other public officers in the pilot area. The Executing Agency, SUBDERE has also committed to continue its activities and diffuse the effects to other regions.

7:14

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

6. Recommendations

- 1) It is desirable that SUBDERE headquarter starts implementing activities related to the Project in other regions or provinces as soon as possible. By expanding the project effects to other areas while appearing, the synergy effects will also be occurred easily. As a result, contribution to the whole local administration system will be expected greatly.
- 2) It is desirable that measures (e.g., conducting monitoring for the activities) have to be prepared and taken sufficiently, in order not to let activities in the SUBDERE headquarter and four pilot areas split even after the project completion.
- 3) Although individual activities have been implemented by ex-trainees who participated in the Japanese trainings in Arauco province, it is desirable that SUBDERE headquarter should systematically link the activities in the province and should establish a Knowledge Community. SUBDERE should also support sustainability of the activities, so that the project effects will last long.
- 4) It is desirable that SUBDERE continuously secure personnel to monitor the activities in the pilot areas and revise the manuals when necessary in order to use them continuously.

7. Lessons Learned

- 1) A strong leadership of local leaders is necessary for developing activities such as OVOP campaign, 5S, etc. Like the case of Ancud City, Chiloe province, the effects of the public administration can be improved by finding local leaders both from public and private sectors. The involvement of local leaders in the project activities can reinforce its effects, through facilitating the participation of various actors and public officers. Therefore, to consider and foster local leaders is important for IICA as well as other entities when coordinating project activities.
- 2) The selection of trainees for the Training should be carried out carefully, considering its future impact in the pilot areas. The followings are important for improving the quality of the trainees; (a) to identify well the objective of the participation which each trainee has, and (b) to design beforehand the action plan to realize after returning to Chile with the application of new knowledge. The sustainability of projects can be reinforced by improving the consistency between the selection of trainees and their activities after returning to the country.
- 3) From the interviews for several ex-trainees, it is observed that their participation itself in the Training made them reconsider their workplace and the local community. In this regard, the local viewpoint is very important for implementing training courses in Japan; therefore, it can



be recommended to involve the viewpoint as one of the training components, or to relate it with the training themes. Thus, the trainings in Japan can be more efficient and the sustainability of the effects can be more strengthened.

- 4) Taking the project's experiences into account, it is very important to systematize lessons and practices by the Knowledge Community. It is more efficient to develop activities in group through applying lessons and experiences systematized by the Community in a way which these would be adapted to the local characteristics, rather than implementing individual works of each ex-trainee. Thus, the sustainability of projects can be reinforced.
- 5) When developing group activities, such as Knowledge Community, it is important to consider the various types of incentives to stimulate participation of the activity. In addition, a slogan to motivate the people in the Community is important. Observed in Japan, the word like Kaizen ("Litoral de los Poetas" in case of Chile) contributes more to strengthen the Communities.
- 6) The following matters have been important for improving the consistency between the project's activities in Chile and the technical components of the training courses in Japan; the JICA expert's participation in the selection of trainees, his partial participation in the training courses, and the diffusion of components and effects of the training courses by weekly reports and the other means. Furthermore, it is important for the project team to consider the training theme in order to secure the consistency.
- 7) In a country where public administration system is well developed, like Chile, it is more efficient to strengthen the existing system through applying lessons generated by pilot activities respecting the ownership and initiative of the recipient country rather than establishing a new system by the initiative of Japanese expert. Through these cooperation, sustainability of the project activity is secured after the project completion.



Appendix 1: Project Design Matrix (PDM for Version 0.0, 1.0, 3.0)

Appendix 2: Plan of Operation (Version 3.0)

Appendix 3: Main Interviewees

Appendix 4: List of Trainees (Participants for training in Japan and for local training courses)



Project period:

Poject Title Siergibening of Regional Administrative Function for the Local

Industrial Promotion.

Target Area:

Three years from the date of arrival of the Japanese long-term expart.

Date: October 1st, 2007

Verstan Na. D

1) Prafessionals of SUBDERE and Regional / Pravional / Municipal Governments, and Tarpet Group:

Socially and economically disadvantaged areas or in productive

transition in the provinces of Chiba, Amuco and San Antonio.

2) Associations of Municipal offices, guild , chamber of commerce, universities and public services to charge of

economic and private secur development in the Provinces of Chiltre, Arattco and San Antonio.

Marratine Santatales	Other South of the State of the	Means of Verification	Immortant Assumptions
Overall Goal To contribute in overcoming of provincial inequity in zones which - Increase in average chared income per capita in regional and the conomically put build in Chile. Increase in average chared income per capita in regional and the conomically put build in Chile. Increase in the number of employment in the province. - Rate of interpolyment	- Increase in average extract income per capita in regional and provincial fourstholds. (Earsed income: excludes income by subsidies) - increase in the number of employment in the province Rate of unemployment	National Surveying Surveying Surveying Survey (Surfact, 1 Study (Survey) CASEN / IN	The Government of Chile mulmulus priority of public policy toward descatatization, equity and development of the country.
Project Purpose To strangthen the insultational and management capacity of Integrated strategic plan for focal industrial development and SUBDERE and Region, in the field of economic development in its implementation in the farme of the project straining and Region, in the field of economic development in its implementation in the farme of the project of the project of the substantial provinces, training and employment to provinces. Integrated the substantial provinces, monaged by Provincial integrated in implementations of the project of the project of the public capability for implementable the project of the public interventions in the project.	Integrated strategic pian for focal industrial development and its implementation in the frame of the project - Editence of professional strains of the project - Editence of professional strains to support the competitiveness, training, and employment in provinces, land employment in provinces, unuaged by Provincial Industrial Development Offices and Regional Government in the limps of the project. - Existence is the SUBDERE of a professional ican with capability for implementing integral emplysis of the public interventions in the provinces defined in the project.	Publication / Project Document Survey on they information source: / Registry of provided services. / Aunual report of budget execution (SUBDERE) / Meanuls and published execution (SUBDERE) / Meanuls and published Registry of attended users and services provided at the office, / Aunual seport of Industrial Development lastitutions. Published Reports	SUBDERE maintains political priority with respect to innester of competencies and support to local government manuscular. The conditions of political institutional and social gabilities in the project start maintain.
Datouts 1. A team in SUBDERE, in allimos with Regional Governments, is stroughowed to make it equality of transferring knowledge, adapting and applying of the experiences and good practices acquired under this project.	- There is a "Local Economic Development and Imposition Thun", which supports the strengthening of Regional Governments in the field of local economic development Cathen professionals trained in Japan There is equalitied quality standard for technical assistance and training in SUBDERE.	- Formal formation of the Team Official authorization by the External Service - Commission of the Missiry of Interior - Project Decement elaborated by the counterpart team and the long turn expert.	
2. A know-how transfer process addressed to the public sector professionals who are in charge of the territorial economic development is being established.	Cirilean professionals trained in Japan (at least 2/3 of them) Project Document elaborated by the counterpart provide technical assistance service sactor participate in manicipalities, and other public services in the field of local ecocomic development. Indication of the Manual of Training and Technical Assistance, in the application of the methodology. Indication of the expect counter the beauted by Chilean counter. Indication of the methodology. Indication of the methodology.	- Project Document elaborated by the counterpart team and the long term expert. - Project document elaborated by Chilean counter part and Japanese forge term expert.	

ANNEX I PDM version 1

Project Titie: Enforcement of Regional Admitistrative Panolina for the Local Industrial Promoton in the Republic of Chita. Thinges fores:

Statisty and -declarationaly distributions are in productive transition in the provinces of 22 Chibas, America and San Antonio.

Project period: From Jacoury 2008 to December 2019

Parget Grupo:
1): Pottestionals of SURBIERS and Reptrost Octoerments of Six-Bis, Weborate and Los Lagos, and
2): Associations of Mandeled offices, publichamines of inconsters, universitial and public denders in charge of accordance and public services in charge of accordance and process sector development in the Provinces of Chiba, Anaco and Son America.

Version Mc. 1 Date: December 180,, 2009

_	•		1		T.	,		_	1	ı		1	т		}	V
tricontact Assumetico	-The Government of Calls matteins priority of public pointes terrent decembration on onely and development of the county.	-SLEDISSE, maintains political palochy repending transfer of sympositions and support to best government transporters. -The conditions will political backballoned and social stability in the conditions will be social.		÷												V
Aftern of Vertication	Projects publications! Reports Register of the excholal services about the optication of the safety (to preceding and incorporation) Adulty (to preceding and incorporation) Cuestionnuite for this persons! register of the services contract	Projects Publications / Reperts - Survey on law internative sources. I Replate of provided sources. I - Survey on law internative sources. I Replate of provided sources. I publicate reports. - Replate of condition were state sources provided at the ordines. I - Armal report of traditions in the field of provided at the ordines. I - Published Reports.		- Official Decumentation by SUBTERE - Project Report - Within publications - Author Plant sugments by the Project	- Official Decumentation by SUGOERE - Project Report - Outbefaces for Tracing cond Technical Assistance - Subdivines for Tracing cond Technical Assistance - Methodor			•					2		9	
Weditatin Indicators	*	stilly for verification of the verification of		-Existence of its pinn for the Counterput Traking Program is aloneExistence of a preferring action plan.	- Excitations of guidalities for Training and Technical Assistance by SUGDERGE SUGGERGE SUGGERGE Successful of the Outside see for Thisking end Technical Assistance by SUGDERGE Successful of the Outside see for Thisking and Yecknow Assistance by SUGGERGE Excitation of the Guidalities was an assistance of the Control of Assistance by SUGGERGE.	Ligarita Appara Poessacrasi	Long-term expert (i necessary) Start-term teperts (if necessary) Thisking courses to Japan		<u>. s.</u>	E	Lexas Sequente Correspondi (Gara Mandrickhy Chickas (1) Deliver and Order (1)	Figures Development Drifting (4), Special Plans Library Li				
Negative Summay	Bunyesi echekte and imorate auper ter KSME com generaled in underpirkleged rones	· · · · ·	6	Hansa Resources of GLISCERS and local Constanting are developed	Special thanking Plan for the local economic. Assumption in Supplicity, with local generations and Policity for the local generations and Policy of Previous Decard Freductive Devisionment in San Antonia, Assum- and Chilad, in implementatio,	ś	To execute the Operandezed Unit for the Interfeciel coordinated, and martindary of the JUCA-Stilleneries which his beauti	This work pan and budged of the Tests	To design a mentaring mechanism and its implement	The confined five monthly for the propess of the pr	To enables a residuality needle total give them becomes	To design and plan Consistent Theriting Program for Japan Lide of the ecount the experience of the benefitches of the project	To excellent critera and regulitorients for	To economic transers greatenery action plan		
L	4-2							_			_	-	-	ш		

Project Design Matrix (PDM)

ANNEX!

Project Title: Enforcement of Regional Administrative Function for the Local Industrial Promotion in the Republic of Chile Project Period: From January 1, 2008 to December 31, 2010 Target Group:

Professional staff of SUBDERE

Professional staff of the Regional and Municipal Government in the three pilot provinces (Arauco, Chiloé and San Antonio) and a pilot region (Araucanía), and their direct counterpart of the private sector

	-	<u>""</u>
Important Assumption -The Government of Chile mainteins priority of public policies toward decentralization, equity and development of the country.	-SUBDERE maintains political priority regarding transfer of competences and support to local government management. The conditions of political institutional and social stability in the project sites remain the same.	
Version No. 3 Weans of Verification Projects publications / Reports Register of the services about the application of the subsidy for promotion and innovation Questionnaire for key persons / register of the services realized	Projects Publications / Reports Survey on key information sources. / Registry of provided services. / Annual report of budget execution (SUBDERE) / Manuals and published reports. Registry of assisted users and services provided at the offices: / Annual report of Institutions in the field of productive development	- Official Documentation by SUBDERE - Project Report - Material for training - Raports of local courses - Action Plan approved by the Project counterparts
Verifiable Indicators Increase of instruments for innovation, which will be operating in the regional, provincial and / or local territory. Increase in the support service for microenterprises and entrepreneurs in the regional, provincial and / or local territory. Increase in the public and private investment managed by agencies relevant to the regional, provincial and / or local territory.	 Existence of the training program for territorial economic development. Successful examples of territorial economic development and runovation in the three pliot provinces and the pilot region. Existence of the Job Manual diffused to SUBDERE's various divisions and the public institutions located in the three pilot provinces and the pilot region. 	Existence of the plan for the local course program and counterpart training course in Japan. Existence of the material for human resource development. 12 local courses realized (4 territories x 3 times). 100 professional staff whose technical capacity related to the territorial economic development will have been reinforced. Existence of trainees' action plan, which would mention the plan for application and the diffusion of knowledge tearned.
Narrative Summary Business activities and innovative support for MSME are promoted in underprivileged zones.	The framework for temtorial (regional, provincial and tocal) according development is strangtfiened in the three plot provinces and the pilot region.	The technical capacity of human resource is developed, with regard to the professional staff of SUBDERE and regional and local governments and private sector's representatives who work as public sector's counterpart, in the three pilot provinces and the pilot region.
Iso2 listavQ	evitoeidO toeior9	1 JuctinO