

Terminal Evaluation of FSIP Project

Annex 2. Documentation

Department of Forestry (2010). Annual Review of REDD+ in Lao PDR 2009. Report prepared for the National REDD Task Force of Lao PDR.

Department of Forestry (2009). Village Rights and Responsibilities to Manage and Use Forest, Forest Land and Aquatic [and] Wild Animals. February.

Department of Forestry (2009). Implementation Status of the Forestry Strategy 2020 and MAF 5 year Plan for 8th Meeting of GOL-Donor Sub-working Group on Forestry. Vientiane, Lao PDR.

Department of Forestry (2006). Project Document: Forestry Strategy 2020 Implementation Promotion Project, Vientiane, Lao PDR.

Department of Forestry (2007). Forestry Sector Development Report for 2006/07 for 1st Stakeholder Consultation on FS 2020 Implementation on Nov. 14th and 15th, 2007. Vientiane, Lao PDR.

Department of Forestry (2006). Technical Report for the National Agriculture and Forestry Conference, MAF, 18-22 September 2006. Vientiane, Lao PDR.

Government of Lao PDR and United Nations Development Program (2008). Millennium Development Goals: Lao PDR, Progress Report, 2008. Vientiane.

KPMG (2009). Audit of FSIP Project for period ending 30 September 2008. Auditor's Report and Management Letter. Vientiane.

Mekong Maps Co. Ltd. in cooperation with the Faculty of Forestry and Social Sciences, national University of Lao PDR and the NCCR North-South, University of Bern, Switzerland (2010). Analysis of Land Use and Forest Changes and related Driving Forces in the Lao PDR. Part 1, Main Document, and Part II, Annex. Vientiane, 28 February.

Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (2010). Agriculture, Natural Resources, and Rural Development Sector Strategy to 2020. Power point presentation, March.

Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (2010). MAF Strategy for Developing Farmer Associations and Cooperatives. Working Draft. January.

Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (2009). Manual: Participatory Agriculture and Forest Land use Planning at Village and Village Cluster Level. Vientiane, June.

Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (2006). 6th 5 Year Plan for Agriculture and Forestry Development (2006-2010), Vientiane, Lao PDR.

Terminal Evaluation of FSIP Project

Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (2007). Indicators for monitoring of forestry sector performance (Draft), Vientiane, Lao PDR.

Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (2007), Organization Structure of Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry, Vientiane City, Lao PDR.

Ministry of Planning and Investment (2010). The Seventh National Socio-Economic Development Plan (2011-2015): Executive Summary. English Translation of Draft. Vientiane.

National Assembly (2003), Land Law, Vientiane, Lao PDR.

National Assembly (1999), Industry Law, Vientiane, Lao PDR.

Prime Minister's Office (2010). Strategy on Climate Change of the Lao PDR. 12 March.

Prime Minister's Office (2006). Order of Prime Minister No 31/PM, dated 23.08.2006 about Increasing the Strictness in Forest Management, Conservation, Wood Business and Wood Processing Industry Promotion as Finished Products, Vientiane, Lao PDR.

Prime Minister's Office (2005). Decree on Endorsement and Declaration of the Forestry Strategy to the year 2020 of Lao PDR, No 229/PM dated 9 August 2005. Vientiane, Lao PDR.

Prime Minister's Office (2005), Decree on the Environment Protection Fund, Vientiane, Lao PDR.

Prime Minister's Office (2006), Decree on the Forestry and Forest Resource Development Fund, No 38/PM dated 21 February 2005. Vientiane, Lao PDR.

Prime Minister's Office (2006). Notification: Arrangement for Investor for Land Concession and Lease for Commercial Tree Plantation, Agricultural Activities, Tourism, and Mining Survey. Vientiane, Lao PDR.

Science Technology and Environment Agency (2006). National Policy: Environment and Social Sustainability of the Hydropower Sector in Lao PDR, Vientiane, Lao PDR.

Stephen Midgley (2006). Position Paper on Tree Plantation Sector Development in Lao PDR, Department of Forestry, Vientiane, Lao PDR.

STT Audit and Advisory Partnership (2008). Audit of FSIP Project for period from 1 April 2006 to 30 September 2007. Report of Independent Auditors and Management Letter. Hanoi.

Sugimoto, Shinichiro (2009). Indicators for Monitoring of Sector Performance (Indicators 2009). Report for FSIP Project, Vientiane, September.

Williams, Paula J. (2008). Forestry Strategy Implementation Promotion (FSIP) Project: Strategic Actions for Next Two Years. August.

Terminal Evaluation of FSIP Project

Williams, Paula J. and Boutheen Phasiboriboun (2008). Forestry Strategy Implementation Promotion (FSIP) Project: Mid-Term Review Study Report. May.

In addition, a large volume of project-related documentation was examined, including:

Department of Forestry, Forestry Strategy Implementation Promotion (FSIP) Project. (2006-2010). Various work plans, progress reports, matrices of implementation, annual and semi-annual budgets, and minutes of Tripartite Steering Committee meetings and the first 8 Forestry Sub-Working Group meetings.

Luang Prabang Teak Program (2008-2010). Wide variety of reports concerning this program.

Terminal Evaluation of FSIP Project

Annex 3. Resource Persons and Stakeholders met or interviewed during Terminal Evaluation Study Mission for FSIP Project (19 April to 21 May 2010)

Dr. Phuong Parisak, Head, Department of Planning, Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (MAF)
 Dr. Silavanh Savathvong, Director General, Department of Forestry (DOF), MAF
 Mr. Khamphay Manivong, Deputy Director General, Department of Forestry, MAF
 Mr. Oupakone Alounsavath, Head of Planning Division, Department of Forestry, MAF
 Mr. Khamsene Ounekham, REDD Coordinator, Planning Division, DOF
 Mr. Buaphanh Phanthavong, Head, Division of Forest Resource Conservation, DOF
 Mr. Vongdeuane, National Land Management Agency (NMLA)
 Mr. Syaphone Sengchandala, Director of Climate Change Office, Department of Environment, Water Resources and Environment Agency (WREA), Prime Minister's Office
 Mr. Sianouvong Savathvong, Vice Dean, Faculty of Agriculture and Forest Resources, Souphanouvong University, Luang Prabang
 Dr. Sithong Thongmanivong, Associate Professor, Director, Center for Natural Resource Management and Climate Change, Faculty of Forestry, National University of Laos
 Mr. Sounthone, Deputy Director, Forestry Research Center, National Agriculture and Forestry Research Institute
 Mr. Boualy Phamouang, Head, Shifting Cultivating Division, National Agriculture and Forest Extension Service
 Mr. Yoneyama Yoshiharu, Senior Representative, JICA Laos Office
 Mr. Moriyaki Watanabe, Project Formulation Advisor, JICA Laos Office
 Mr. Viengsavanh Sisombath, Programme Officer, JICA Laos Office
 Ms. Lisbet Bostrand, Sida, First Secretary, Vientiane
 Ms. Helena Ahola, Counsellor, Embassy of Finland, Bangkok
 Mr. Bruno Cammaert, UNDP-UNEP Head of Environment Unit, Vientiane
 Mr. Noriyoshi Kitamura, Forestry Strategy Implementation Promotion (FSIP) Project, Chief Technical Advisor
 Ms. Noriko Ishitobi, FSIP, Technical Advisor
 Mr. Kenichi Takano, Participatory Land and Forest Management Project for Reducing Deforestation (PAREDD), Chief Technical Advisor
 Dr. Esa Puustjärvi, Sustainable Forestry and Rural Development (SUFORD) Project, Chief Technical Advisor
 Mr. Tapani Ruotsalainen, SUFORD, Monitoring and Control Advisor
 Ms. Majella Clarke, SUFORD, REDD + Advisor
 Mr. Martin Hollands, SUFORD consultant on Payment for Environmental Services
 Dr. Georg Buccholz, Lao-German Program on Climate Protection through Avoided Deforestation (CliPAD), GTZ Chief Technical Advisor
 Mr. Joost Foopes, NTFP specialist and consultant
 Dr. Alastair Fraser, REDD Readiness Preparation Proposal (REDD R-PP) Team Leader
 Mr. Dietmar Bräutigam, REDD R-PP, Institutional Specialist
 Mr. Alexander Horst, REDD R-PP, Monitoring Specialist
 Mr. Peter Watt, REDD R-PP, Baseline Scenario Specialist
 Mr. Carl Mossberg, Lao-Swedish Upland Research and Capacity Development Programme (URDP), Chief Technical Adviser

Terminal Evaluation of FSIP Project

Dr. Horst Weyerhauser, URDP, Research Management Advisor
Mr. Peter Jones, URDP, Land Management Advisor
Mr. Andrew Bartlett, Laos Extension for Agriculture Project (LEAP), Chief Technical Advisor
Mr. Rick Reece, Village Focus International, Executive Director
Dr. Michael Hedemark, Wildlife Conservation Society, Lao Country Program Co-director
Dr. Arlyne Johnson, Wildlife Conservation Society, Lao Country Program Co-director
Mr. Boris Saraber, The Forest Trust (TFT), Senior Manager Asia North
Mr. Thibault Ledecq, Rattan Programme Manager, WWF Greater Mekong Programme
Mr. Somphone Bouasavanh, National Policy Coordinator, WWF Greater Mekong Programme

Group Meeting with DOF Staff Studying Intensive English and their Instructors, at the 21st Century School of English, Vientiane, on 24 April 2010:

Mr. Bounpheng Xaynasinh, DOF staff member/English student
Mr. Keokolakoth Chantavixay, DOF staff member/English student
Mr. Somranouk Pathammavongsa, DOF staff member/English student
Mr. Khamkoun Philsavanh, DOF staff member/English student
Mr. Khamphan Boupha, DOF staff member/English student
Mr. Xahamsenk Khadmontry, DOF staff member/English student
Mr. Bounheuang Sengvizay, DOF staff member/English student
Mr. Veophet Sibounma, DOF staff member/English student
Ms. Oumaly Zayyovong, DOF staff member/English student
Mr. Alastair Maitland, 21st Century School of English, Director
Ms. Kelly Kidson, 21st Century School of English, Manager
Mr. Mark George, 21st Century School of English, English Teacher
Mr. Mickey Russell, 21st Century School of English, English Teacher

Meeting with Forestry Strategy Secretariat Members or Their Representatives, 6 May 2010:

Dr. Silavanh Siwathvong, Director General, DOF
Mr. Khamphay Manivong, Deputy Director General, DOF
Mr. Oupakone Alounsavath, Head, Planning Division, DOF
Mr. Oudom Sypaseuth, Deputy Head, Management of Protection Forest and Regeneration Forest Division, DOF
Mr. Sangvanh Bouavong, Deputy Head, Forest Resource Conservation Division, DOF
Mr. Somchay Sanonty, Forest Inventory and Planning Division, DOF
Mr. Boualy Phamouang, Head, Shifting Cultivating Division, National Agriculture and Forest Extension Service
Mr. Saykham Boutthavong, Faculty of Forestry, National University of Lao PDR
Mr. Soumphachanh, Forestry Research Centre, National Agriculture and Forestry Research Institute
Mr. Phayboun Boutsaba, National Land Management Agency

Meeting with Teak Farmers Group (TFG), Ban Kok Gniew, 10 May 2010:

Mr. Nipon, TFG Treasurer
Mr. Somephet, TFG Assistant Treasurer
Ms. Bounchan, TFG Member (former Treasurer)
Mr. Houmpeing, TFG Production Manager

Terminal Evaluation of FSIP Project

Mr. Sithong, TFG Production Assistant

Mr. Ounthong, TFG Production Assistant

Mr. Thongkhoun, TFG Member

Mr. Kamla, TFG member

Mr. Some, TFG member

Mr. Bounthan, TFG Member

Mr. Xieng Kao, TFG member

Ms. Changpeing, Wife of Village Chief (TFG Member)

Mr. Bounchan Lattavongkot, PAFO, LPTP Coordinator

Mr. Richard Laity, TFT Consultant to LPTP

Meeting with TFG members and staff undertaking field survey, 10 May 2010:

Mr Kao, TFG Leader

Mr. Kampeing, TFG Forest Manager

Mr. Laad, TFG Assistant Forest Manager

Mr. Somphon, TFG Member

Ms. Kunthavone, TFG Secretary

Mr. Xieng Bounthan, TFG Member

Mr. Bounlath, PAFO Staff Member

Mr. Bounthan, Luang Prabang Teak Platform Assistant

Mr. Bounchan Lattavongkot, PAFO, LPTP Coordinator

Mr. Richard Laity, TFT Consultant to LPTP

Video (TV) Conference with JICA and other colleagues in Japan, 19 May 2010

Colleagues in Japan:

Mr. Masaki Yamashita, Forestry Agency in Japan

Mr. Kazuyuki Morita, Forestry Agency in Japan

Mr. Hiroto Mitsugi, JICA Headquarters

Ms. Emiko Mutsuyoshi, JICA Headquarters

Mr. Kazunobu Suzuki, JICA Headquarters

Mr. Hitofumi Abe, JICA Headquarters

Colleagues in JICA Laos Office, Vientiane:

Mr. Yoshikaru Yoneyama, Senior Representative, JICA

Mr. Moriaki Watanabe, Project Formulation Officer

Mr. Oupakone Alounsavath, Head, Planning Division, Department of Forestry,

Ms. Lisbet Bostrand, First Secretary, Sida

Mr. Noriyoshi Kitamura, FSIP Chief Technical Advisor

Ms. Noriko Ishitobi, FSIP Technical Advisor

Other Meetings Attended:

Launching Meeting for Evaluation, 22 April 2010

Launching Ceremony for Participatory Land Use Planning Manual, 23 April 2010

REDD Task Force Meeting, 26 April 2010

Forestry Sub-Working Group Meeting, 14 May 2010

Debriefing Meeting for Evaluation, 17 May 2010

Terminal Evaluation of FSIP Project

Terminal Evaluation of FSIP Project

Annex 4. FSIP Original Budget and Accumulated Expenditures through 30 Sep 2008

Project Component	Action	Original Budget			Expenditures (1 Apr 06 – 30 Sep 08)			Disbursement rate (% planned)		
		Sida	JICA	Total	Sida	JICA	Total	Sida	JICA	Total
1		\$29,500	\$0	\$29,500	\$0	\$0	\$0	0.0%		0.0%
2		\$107,600	\$0	\$107,600	\$13,800	\$13,000	\$26,800	12.8%	unplanned	24.9%
3		\$32,000	\$0	\$32,000	\$8,663	\$0	\$8,663	27.1%		27.1%
4		\$34,500	\$0	\$34,500	\$0	\$0	\$0	0.0%		0.0%
5	Action 1				\$49,925	\$37,602	\$87,526			
	Action 2				\$0	\$0	\$0			
	Action 3				\$0	\$0	\$0			
	Action 4				\$7,500	\$20,300	\$27,800			
	Action 5				\$92,223	\$9,955	\$102,178			
	Action 6				\$0	\$0	\$0			
	Action 7				\$36,116	\$0	\$36,116			
	Action 8				\$30,510	\$0	\$30,510			
	Action 9				\$22,400	\$152,491	\$174,891			
	Action 10				\$7,699	\$0	\$7,699			
	Action 11				\$2,739	\$0	\$2,739			
	Sub-total	\$744,000	\$318,000	\$1,062,000	\$249,111	\$220,348	\$469,459	33.5%	69.3%	44.2%
6		\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$23,200	\$23,200		unplanned	
7		\$0	\$0	\$0	\$58,830	\$1,910	\$60,740	unplanned	unplanned	
8		\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,200	\$0	\$1,200			
9		\$27,000	\$160,800	\$187,800	\$81,041	\$146,937	\$227,978	300.2%	91.4%	121.4%
Contingency		\$94,760	\$31,800	\$126,560						
Total		\$1,069,360	\$510,600	\$1,579,960	\$412,645	\$405,395	\$818,040	38.6%	79.4%	51.8%

Terminal Evaluation of FSIP Project

Annex 5. FSIP Revised Budget and Accumulated Expenditures from 1 Oct 2008 to 31 Mar 2010

Oct 2008-Mar 2010	Budget			Expenditure (1 Oct 2008 – 31 Mar 2010)			Disbursement rate			
	Sida	JICA	total	Sida	JICA	Total	Sida	JICA	total	
	Comp1	1-1	\$23,500	\$0	\$23,500	\$4,115	\$0	\$4,115	17.5%	-
	1-2	\$55,000	\$7,500	\$62,500	\$27,861	\$8,000	\$35,861	50.7%	106.7%	57.4%
	1-3	\$19,400	\$0	\$19,400	\$423	\$0	\$423	2.2%	-	2.2%
	1-4	\$35,700	\$35,900	\$71,600	\$17,057	\$3,933	\$20,990	47.8%	11.0%	29.3%
	1-5	\$117,880	\$700	\$118,580	\$49,657	\$3,296	\$52,953	42.1%	470.9%	44.7%
	subtotal	\$251,480	\$44,100	\$295,580	\$99,113	\$15,229	\$114,342	39.4%	34.5%	38.7%
Comp2	2-1	\$83,980	\$16,100	\$100,080	\$56,001	\$25,036	\$81,037	66.7%	155.5%	81.0%
	2-2	\$84,730	\$47,500	\$132,230	\$82,359	\$53,949	\$136,308	97.2%	113.6%	103.1%
	2-3	\$14,100	\$33,030	\$47,130	\$8,688	\$17,312	\$26,000	61.6%	52.4%	55.2%
	2-4	\$185,900	\$18,000	\$203,900	\$68,689	\$12,745	\$81,434	36.9%	70.8%	39.9%
	subtotal	\$368,710	\$114,630	\$483,340	\$215,737	\$109,042	\$324,779	58.5%	95.1%	67.2%
Comp3	3-1	\$1,810	\$0	\$1,810	\$1,605	\$0	\$1,605	88.7%	-	88.7%
	3-2	\$300	\$0	\$300	\$226	\$0	\$226	75.3%	-	75.3%
	3-3	\$33,900	\$1,200	\$35,100	\$3,439	\$1,157	\$4,596	10.1%	96.4%	13.1%
	3-4	\$0	\$73,900	\$73,900	\$0	\$81,668	\$81,668	-	110.5%	110.5%
	3-5	\$13,400	\$1,600	\$15,000	\$8,693	\$0	\$8,693	64.9%	0.0%	58.0%
	subtotal	\$49,410	\$76,700	\$126,110	\$13,963	\$82,825	\$96,788	28.3%	108.0%	76.7%
Total		\$669,600	\$235,430	\$905,030	\$328,813	\$207,096	\$535,909	49.1%	88.0%	59.2%

Terminal Evaluation of FSIP Project

Annex 6. Commentary on Possible Elements in Follow-on Project Design.

Elements proposed in follow-on project (post FSIP)	Findings and Analysis in Evaluation of FSIP	Remarks regarding Possible Follow-on Project Support
1-1 Support to formulation of new MAF/DOF 5 year plans	Government activities are carried out on the basis of the 5-year and annual work plans and budgets	5-year plans need to be finalized in 2010, just after new project would start
1-1-1 Support to studies and data collection	In 2009/10, FSIP and SUFORD are co-funding quick assessment of forest cover/resources, which DOF needs to assess progress with 5-year plan (2006-2010) and to prepare next one (2011-2015)	Unclear what types of studies and data collection will be needed in the future
1-1-2 Support to meetings and consultations	In 2009/10, FSIP providing some funding for DOF for provincial visits to consult on 5-year plan	Unclear why project support needed for routine govt. work
1-2-3 Provision of advice on draft plans	Preparation of MAF and DOF 5-year plans is an internal government process	Unclear – which plans, MAF and DOF level, or others? Who would provide advice?
1-2 Support to basic capacity development including language, data collection / analysis and so on	FSIP has provided support for training in English, IT, accounting for DOF staff, and in report writing and proposal preparation for provincial staff. Six staff have attended short courses in Japan. One staff member will go to Japan for M.Sc. course. Support is also being provided by other projects.	More thorough analysis is needed of the existing human resources and skills levels, gaps, and human resource development plan.
1-3 Support to capacity development for preparation and establishment of REDD+ mechanism with focus on REDD Task Force	FSIP has acted as secretariat for REDD Task Force, with 20 meetings since July 2008, and numerous informal meetings prior to Task Force establishment	Continued support to REDD Task Force is needed, whether from this proposed project or another source
1-3-1 Support to preparation and implementation of R-PP through supplementary activities and so on	FSIP advisors have provided important technical and logistical assistance for R-PP preparation	What type of support is envisaged from this project, as compared with other REDD support initiatives?
1-3-2 Support to REDD+ policy formulation and institutional development		Such support would be in addition to forthcoming support from the World Bank REDD funding and other sources
1-3-3 Support to coordination and smooth implementation of REDD+ activities	FSIP has provided guidance, coordination and logistical support to REDD activities and Task Force	Continued support to REDD Task Force is needed, whether from this proposed project or another source
1-3-4 Support to dialogue and cooperation with neighboring countries	FSIP has provided some support for travel and participation in regional (Mekong) meetings	Lao PDR, Viet Nam and Cambodia need to collaborate on REDD efforts, especially considering timber flows in the region.
1-3-5 Support to dissemination and understanding of REDD+ mechanism at local levels	Broad consultation on REDD issues is just getting underway, with support from several projects	REDD+ mechanisms need to be developed and agreed for Lao PDR before local level and provincial action
1-3-5 Others		Vague – should be specified
1-4 Support to identification, consultation and proposal of additional funding sources with focus on payment for environmental services (PES)	This issue was identified as a priority in FS 2020. [SUFORD supporting a study tour on these issues to Latin America]	A more comprehensive review of overall funding sources for the forest sector, including the Forest Development Fund, Environmental Fund, future REDD, etc. is needed.

Terminal Evaluation of FSIP Project

Elements proposed in follow-on project (post FSIP)	Findings and Analysis in Evaluation of FSIP	Remarks regarding Possible Follow-on Project Support
1-5 Support to stakeholder consultations	FSIP supported one large annual stakeholder consultation in Nov. 07, and other types of dialogue	Type of support and type of stakeholder consultations needs to be clarified.
1-5-1 Organization of High level stakeholder consultation	Support to high-level consultations in May and August 2010 being supported by World Bank grant, FSIP, CliPAD, SUFORD	MAF already supports annual agriculture and forestry conferences. What other stakeholder consultations are envisaged?
1-5-2 Organization of Forestry Sector sub-working group	FSIP has supported 9 meetings and 2 online consultations over 4.5 years	Continued support is needed, whether from this proposed project or another source
1-6 Support to participation in international and regional meetings on forestry	FSIP has provided considerable support to such participation, especially to REDD-related events during 2008/09	To stay up to date with emerging new issues such participation is useful. Continued support is needed, whether from this proposed project or another source
2-1 Support to formulation, dissemination, implementation and monitoring of key policy/legislation identified in the new MAF/DOF 5 year plans	FSIP – and other projects – have provided important support for formulation and dissemination of key policies and legislation. Not clear how such support, however, has (or has not) been translated, into implementation or monitoring.	Continued support is needed, whether from this proposed project or another source
2-2 Support to capacity development for appraisal of forestry investment proposals	FSIP supported study of plantation investments, guidelines for feasibility studies from investors, and criteria for government approval.	Unclear – who appraises such proposals, and thus needs support?
2-3 Support to capacity development for proposal preparation and reporting for the Forest Development Fund by local authorities	FSIP has tried to provide support to sector to complement FDF support. FDF is not working well, government provides much less money than anticipated	Rather than supporting training on proposal preparation and reporting, perhaps it would be better to undertake an analysis of the Forest Development Fund's funding and operations.
2-4 Piloting and extension of approaches in increasing rural incomes from forestry activities		
2-4-1 Teak group certification	FSIP, TFT, WWF, DOF, and PAFO have been working together to support pilot activities, with a MOU that runs through 30.9.10. After a slow start, work seems to be going well. Farmers already report significant increase in income from teak sales.	Continued support is needed, whether from this proposed project or another source. TFT confident of ability to raise other funding if needed. Considerable potential to scale up, given that Luang Prabang Province has an estimated 30 000 ha of smallholder teak plantations.
2-4-2 Village level NTFP management and marketing	FSIP support to Forestry Research Center in 3 pilot villages: slow progress, work to be done in 2007/08 has not yet been completed. Unclear whether such efforts have resulted in any increases in rural incomes. [WWF also supports work on rattan through a regional project.]	Given the importance of NTFPs in Lao's rural economy, more efforts are needed to support their sustainable management and marketing. [WWF will continue support on rattan. SUFORD is currently assessing NTFP issues for production forests.]
2-4-3 Others		Vague – should be specified