

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Yukiko Sueyoshi Global Link Management, Inc	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Improvement of Educational Achievement in Science, Technology and Mathematics in Basic Education	March 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of Ghana		
Project Period	March 1, 2000-February 28, 2004		
Executing Agency	Ghana Education Service, Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports		
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Hiroshima University		
Total Cost	884 million yen		
Related Projects (if any)	<p>JICA, Project to Support the Operationalisation of the INSET Policy (2005-2008, project purpose is to strengthen operation system at district level for implementation of INSET)</p> <p>JICA, Project for Strengthening the Capacity of INSET Management (2009-2013, project purpose is to establish and reinforce the nationwide management system for implementation of INSET)</p>		
Overall Goal	<p><u>Long-Term:</u> Student's educational achievement in Science, Technology and Mathematics (STM) at upper primary/Junior Secondary School (JSS) is improved in project area.</p> <p><u>Short-Term:</u> The educational achievement in STM of upper primary/JSS students who have been taught by STM/INSET-trained teachers is improved in project areas.</p>		
Project Objective(s)	The capacity of STM/INSET-trained teachers for delivering STM (skills, contents) is improved for upper primary/ JSS in the project areas		
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The existing STM education at upper primary/JSS is reviewed and recommendations are reflected in the Project design. 2. Structured INSET is established in Akuapem North District linked with School-based INSET. 3. INSET Programme is replicated in other Project Areas (Tamale and Sdansi West) 4. Institutionalization of INSET is supported and policy advocacy is implemented 5. Awareness-creation and information-sharing on STM are promoted. 6. Monitoring and Evaluation of INSET are regularized 		
Inputs (Japanese Side) Note: At the time of the Final Evaluation		Inputs (Ghana Side) Note: At the time of the Final Evaluation	
Experts	12 for Long term, 21 for Short term	Staff allocated	5 staff
Equipments	54 million yen	Equipments	no data available
Local Cost	143 million yen	Local Cost	7,167 million cedis (i.e. seminar cost, maintenance cost of facilities, etc)
Trainees Received	27 trainees	Land etc provided	Provision of seminar rooms, meeting rooms, operation rooms and teachers' dormitory, etc
Others	N.A.	Others	N.A.

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

From the time the project was planned through its completion, this project was highly consistent with Ghana's education policies, development needs and Japan's aid policy; therefore, its relevance is high. Although the achievement of the indicators for the Overall Goal has not been confirmed, the project purpose has generally been achieved, and the positive impact on the educational policies of Ghana has been confirmed; therefore, its effectiveness is high. Although the planned project cost was unknown, the other inputs from Japan were provided according to plan, and the expected outputs were achieved during the project period; therefore, efficiency is high. Sustainability is also high because Ghana's Ministry of Education established a unit to expand In-Service Training (INSET) nationwide and is carrying out nationwide expansion programs. In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

<Recommendations>

• Since the achievement of the indicators for the Overall Goal could not be confirmed at the ex-post evaluation, it is recommended that GES verify and publicly release information on the visible effects of the INSET currently underway, with evidence such as the results of the Basic Education Certification Examination (BECE). In addition, it is recommended that District Education Office (DEO) secure a budget to continue implementing INSET and carrying out monitoring and evaluation activities. On this point, GES should discuss budget planning with DEO as necessary and provide advice on forming an INSET budget.

<Constraints of this evaluation study>

This evaluation is a simplified version without a field survey, therefore the evaluation was performed under some constraints as

follows.

- 1) The fact that it does not include data that could be confirmed by direct observation, since the evaluation was based solely on data obtained through document review and questionnaires given to the implementing agency;
- 2) when using data on indicators in the questionnaire responses, we requested the raw data as evidence, but were not able to obtain any;
- 3) the report written at the project's completion did not include enough information on the achievement of the indicators of PDM at the time of the project's completion;
- 4) it was difficult to obtain some of the information because the contact information for the Japanese experts employed in this project could not be ascertained; and
- 5) due to the lack of a field survey, there was no opportunity to hold discussions with the executing agency regarding the recommendations.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Ghana

At the time of planning, Ghana Vision 2020, the national development plan, emphasized human resource development as an important issue for national development, and the government has been pursuing the Free Compulsory Basic Education program (FCUBE¹). At the end of the project, the Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy (2003-2005) mentions the need for INSET to strengthen science education, in addition to the aforementioned measures. Accordingly, this project was consistent with Ghana's development policies from the time it was planned to completion.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Ghana

The government gave priority to the quantitative expansion of basic education, and the attendance rate improved for elementary education, but there were still many issues to be addressed to improve the quality of education. In particular, the low quality of the teachers (insufficient basic academic skills and teaching skills) was a serious issue, and was the primary factor standing in the way of improving children's learning and understanding. This low quality of teachers was attributed to the lack of a systematic INSET system. This project aimed to develop demand-driven teacher training programs at three teacher training schools in the target district, and thus was consistent with Ghana's development needs from the time the project was planned to its completion.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

According to Japan's ODA policy at the time of planning, 'Japanese Country Assistance Program for Ghana in 2000', support for the education sector was positioned as one of the priority areas in the basic human needs sector (support to raise the quality of teachers, augment curriculum, and raise attendance rates), so this project is consistent with Japan's ODA policy from the time it was planned to its completion.

This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan and development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore, it is highly relevant.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

【Achievement of Outputs】 Output 1 (identify the current conditions of science and mathematics education and establish a plan) had been achieved as of the terminal evaluation. As regards Outputs 2 and 3 (development and implementation of INSET model), the INSET package (principal training, training for newly transferred teachers, training for instructors, and training for circuit inspectors, etc.), which was intended to promote training within the school, was developed and verified in all elementary schools in the program region (Akuapem North District, Adansi West District, Tamale Municipal), and the results were reflected in the Manual for Upper Primary and Junior Secondary School Math and Science Teachers. The achievement of the indicators for Output 2 ('All head teachers, circuit supervisors and district teachers support team received INSET orientation' and 'at most 70% of curriculum leaders in the district received INSET training') was not known as of the terminal evaluation, but an expert's final report noted that the specified training had been given to the relevant persons at all of the target schools, so it can be confirmed that the indicators had been achieved by the time of the project's completion. According to the monitoring results when the project was completed, 98% of the teachers who facilitated in-school training sessions were teachers who received instructor training in this project, so we can confirm that the training participants contributed to the promotion of in-school training. Under the activities of Output 4 (support for institutionalization of INSET), INSET manuals were distributed to all schools in the target districts; in addition, the preparation of INSET policy implementation guidelines were supported by the Japanese experts. According to GES, this activity played a major role in bringing about INSET's institutionalization. The achievement status of Output 5 (fostering awareness and sharing information about math and science) is unknown because verified data at the time of project completion could not be obtained. However, according to the results of the terminal evaluation, the project prepared newsletters, pamphlets and calendars to promote the sharing of information on math and science education, and this confirmed that students were more interested in math and science. The indicators for Output 6 (monitoring and evaluation of INSET) were achieved at the time of the terminal evaluation. According to GES, the baseline survey and news assessment survey implemented in this project were beneficial, and these methods are being utilized in current operations.

【Achievement of Project Purpose】 According to the results of the terminal evaluation, as indicated by the results of the survey on teachers' instruction skills and their improvements, a comparison of the instruction skills before and after the training shows a significant improvement in the skills of upper primary and junior secondary school teachers. As of the terminal evaluation, the objective for Indicator (1) "junior secondary school teachers who have received in-service training have the ability to teach mathematics and science in accordance with the project's implementation standards (60% of science teachers and 70% of math teachers exceed the baseline for measuring teaching skills)" had been achieved. However, Indicator (2) "upper primary school teachers who have received in-service training have the ability to teach mathematics and science in accordance with the project's implementation standards (60% of science teachers and 70% of math teachers exceed the baseline for measuring teaching skills)" fell

¹ The main policy goal of the FCUBE program is to provide opportunity for every school-age child in Ghana to receive quality basic education

slightly short of the target, but 55% of science teachers and 67.9% of math teachers exceeded 90% of their respective targets. It is unknown whether a similar survey of teaching skills was carried out when the project was completed. According to GES, the teachers in the target district who participated in INSET were able to actively incorporate child-centered approaches and group activities and excite students' interests. In light of the above, it can be determined that the project purpose was generally achieved.

【Contribution of the Outputs to the Project Purpose】 In this project, INSET packages in the math and science fields were developed based in the teacher training schools in the southern region, northern region and central west region through the achievement of Outputs 1-3. Moreover, Outputs 4 and 5 raised students' and teachers' interest in math and science education and at the same time spread awareness about the institutionalization of INSET among Ministry of Education staff, which helped to establish this policy. Output 6 contributed to the development of a system to ascertain the effect of INSET. Accordingly, it can be said that each of these outputs contributes to the achievement of the project purpose. Contributing factors to the Project Purpose were (1) the dispatch of Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteers (JOCV) to work in the math and science education sector and (2) non-project grant aid to build a resource center, access roads and worker housing in the target district. However, the insufficient budget of DEO, which had taken on a major role as a result of decentralization, was an impeding factor.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

It is not possible to confirm that the Overall Goal, "improve the math and science skills of children and students in the program region", has been achieved based on the indicators because the results of the Basic Education Certification Examination (BECE), the data for the indicators, could not be obtained. According to the responses to the questionnaire given to GES when the ex-post evaluation was conducted, improvements in teacher quality and the higher performance of students were noted even in regions other than the target district while INSET was being expanded nationwide. In addition, JOCV in the field of math and science teachers were dispatched to upper primary and junior secondary schools in the country, which contributed to the improvement in the quality of teaching skills at the school level.

The institutionalization of INSET by GES was another positive indirect effect. The primary promotional factor was the continuous support for INSET's institutionalization and nationwide expansion even after JICA completed this project.

This project has largely achieved its objectives; therefore, its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

Input from the Japan side and the Ghana side were generally provided as planned. The final evaluation report indicated the need for effective use of the resource center in Akuapem North, to which the Japan side provided equipment and materials. When the ex-post evaluation was conducted, it was confirmed by the GES that the Center was being administered and utilized by the teacher training schools and education offices under INSET, which was being expanded nationwide.

(2) Elements of Inputs

Both the planned and actual project period was 60 months. Thus, the period of cooperation is as planned (100% of the planned target).

(3) Project Cost, Period of Cooperation

The planned cost was not confirmed at the time of ex-post evaluation, whereas the actual cost was about 884 million JPY.

Although it can't be judged the appropriateness of the project cost because the planned cost is unknown, the Outputs and Project Purpose have been achieved within the planned project period. Therefore, efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

The development plan as of the ex-post evaluation, the Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy II (2006-2009), aimed to improve the quality of classes and learning in basic education under the issue of human resource development. The plan advocated efforts to improve teacher education and reinforce teacher management, for example, by using indicators such as the percentage of teachers who had received teacher training and INSET, and also emphasized improvements to class content in math and science and science and technology. At the sector level, Ghana's Ministry of Education prepared a nationwide expansion program in 2009 and expanded INSET nationwide, targeting the first group of 57 counties in fiscal 2009 and the second group of 71 counties in fiscal 2010. Accordingly, as of the ex-post evaluation, the policies that guarantee the effects of this project are sustainable.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

At the time of the ex-post evaluation, GES was in charge of implementation from the time that the INSET policy was drafted, and there have been no changes in the implementation system and mandates. Since the project was completed, this implementation system has been reinforced to promote the nationwide expansion of INSET with the establishment of a new national INSET Unit (NIU). Moreover, the importance of strengthening the capacity of DEO (in particular, plan formulation, reports, and monitoring) was pointed out during the project implementation period, and after the project completion, JICA supported efforts to strengthen the implementation system needed to expand INSET nationwide. Under the new project, Japanese Experts worked with DEO, which play an important role in implementing INSET, to clarify roles and develop a monitoring system. Accordingly, it is judged that the counterpart system was sustainable.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

Since this project was completed, JICA has provided new support to GES with the aim of expanding INSET more widely. The teachers in the pilot schools were selected as national trainers and are utilized as curriculum leaders and resource persons for teacher training in the new project's target area. As such, JICA provides GES with ongoing technical cooperation to support INSET, and GES

is also engaged in independent initiatives to spread INSET nationwide. Accordingly, it is judged that the technical sustainability is also high.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

According to GES, INSET is identified as a high priority in education policies, so there is access to financial support from donors such as the World Bank and the UK Department for International Development (DfID); therefore, the sustainability of the financial aspects is high. Moreover, the World Bank gave Capitation Grants at the school level. At the district level, DEO prepared budgets for the INSET program, but it was pointed out that there are shortfalls and delays in the funding needed for INSET monitoring and evaluation activities because it depends on the districts' priorities. Despite some financial constraints, the commitment from Ghana's government and financial support from donors is ongoing; thus, its financial sustainability is high.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

This project aimed to improve the teaching skills and instructional content of math and science teachers in upper primary and junior secondary school, and an INSET package was developed, manuals prepared and institutionalization support provided in the three target district. After the project completion, JICA provided further support in 10 pilot districts (including this project's three target districts) to make the training packages more versatile with the aim of expanding INSET nationwide. Ghana's government has highly appreciated these series of cooperation, and JICA was supporting efforts to reinforce the implementation system and expand INSET nationwide as of the ex-post evaluation. As such, programs to improve the quality of Ghana's in-service school teachers are ongoing, and the effects of this project will have high continuity.

No major problems have been observed in the policy background, the structural, technical, and financial aspects of the executing agency; therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is high.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Yoko Ogawa Global Link Management Inc.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Lusaka District Primary Healthcare Project (Phase II)	March 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of Zambia
Project Period	From July 2002~July 2007
Executing Agency	Ministry of Health (MoH), Lusaka District Health Management Team (LDHMT)
Cooperation Agency in Japan	The Associations of Medical Doctors in Asia (AMDA), International University of Health and Welfare, Niigata University
Total Cost	761 million Japanese Yen
Related Projects (if any)	Grant Aid "Water Supply Project in Satellite Area of Lusaka (1993)," constructed water-supply facilities for six (6) unplanned settlements in Lusaka, including the George compound. Community Empowerment Program "Community Empowerment for Water Development (2002)," provided technical assistance in 1) training managers, or "tap leaders," of public taps installed by the above-mentioned Grant Aid, 2) promoting community ownership over the water facility, and 3) providing hygiene education to residents. Development Study, "Lusaka Unplanned Urban Settlements Living Environment Improvement Plan (1999~2001)," formulated an area action plan for strengthening social services in eight (8) unplanned settlements in Lusaka including Ng'ombe and Kanyama. Technical Assistance, "The Lusaka District Primary Healthcare Project (1997~2002)," was a predecessor of this Project; and, Grant Aid, "The Project for Improvement of Living Environment for Unplanned Urban Settlements in Lusaka (2004)," constructed water-supply facilities accompanied by a technical assistance (TA) component on environmental hygiene and health education for three (3) unplanned settlements in Lusaka, including Ng'ombe compound. The Lusaka District PHC Project (Phase II) technically supported the TA component of this project.
Overall Goal	<u>Long-Term:</u> Health status improvement of under-5 children in Lusaka District is sustained through development of urban health and community value. <u>Short-Term:</u> Health status of under-5 children is improved through establishment of effective and sustainable community-based health activities in Lusaka District
Project Objective(s)	Health status of under-5 children is improved through establishment of effective and sustainable community-based health activities in selected Health Centre catchments
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Community-based child growth promotion is enhanced. 2. Community-based environmental health activities are improved. 3. Community referral services for under-5 children are enhanced. 4. Planning and financing capacity of LDHMT and health centres in support for community-based health activities is strengthened. 5. Management capacity of community-based organizations (CBOs) to ensure sustainability of community-based health activities is strengthened.

Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Zambian Side)	
Experts	9 for Long-term (245MM), 21 for Short term (55MM)	Staff allocated	80
Equipments	27 million yen	Equipments	NA
Local Cost	156 million yen	Local Cost	Counterparts salaries and Project Drivers salary (1 person: 2004~2005, 3 persons 2006~2007)
Trainees Received	25	Land etc provided	Office space for Experts (July ~ November 2002)
Others	NA	Others	NA

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

- The project has been highly relevant to Zambia's health policy/strategy, the development needs of the target area, as well as Japan's ODA policy/strategy, both at the planning stage and during the implementation period. Thus its relevance is rated high. The Project's effectiveness is rated high, considering the fact that the Project Purpose has been mostly achieved and that it made an impact on health policy. As for an efficiency level, it is also rated as high based on the following accounts: 1) inputs and outputs are appropriate in achieving the Project Purpose, as most Output indicators reached the target level; 2) these targets are obtained even with limited financial inputs from Zambian government; and, 3) inputs from Japanese side are evaluated as appropriate by Project's Counterparts. Sustainability is rated high when the following factors are considered: 1) some essential activities at community level have continued despite the lack of health personnel and financial resources from LDHMT/MoH and 2) child health indicators have been continuously improving in the target compounds.
- In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

<Recommendations to MoH and LDHMT>

1. To secure human and financial resources to support due implementation of PHAST and GMP + activities.
2. To inquire into the extent of improvement on child health in other unplanned settlements where PHAST and GMP + approaches have been adopted.

<Constraints of this evaluation study>

- 1) The data obtained by direct observation are not included in this study because this study was conducted based only on document review and questionnaires to the counterparts.
- 2) When indicator data in response to the questionnaire, JICA internal documents and related published reports are used, raw data and types of formula have not been confirmed.
- 3) The degree of users' satisfaction, which was the indicator of the Project Purpose, was not measured because the questionnaire survey to the research institutes, line ministries and donors could not be conducted.
- 4) There was no avenue to discuss the appropriateness and feasibility of the recommendations with the counterparts.
- 5) It was difficult to identify the level of the Outputs achieved and impacts attained due to the lack of indicator data and inadequacy of a certain indicator:
 - Most data for the indicators of Outputs were sourced from sample surveys conducted by the Project at baseline (2002), mid-term (2004) and six months before the termination of the Project (2006). No data for the indicators were collected at the completion of the Project (2007).
 - Some of the Output indicators were marked as inadequate to assess the achievement level at the time of the Terminal Evaluation. However, the ex-post evaluator did not set alternative indicators at this time due to inaccessibility of raw data and insufficient knowledge of the circumstances to do so. They include "percentage of community-based activities funded by LDHMT," and "transfer ratio of community volunteers."
- 6) The ex-post evaluator did not exercise strict control over who should respond to the questionnaire, nor the anonymity of the responses.
- 7) There were numerous similar interventions to improve living conditions and health status of residents in urban unplanned settlements both prior to and during the Project, and either by JICA or by other development assistance organisations, which inferably contributed to the effective Project design and success in developing capacity of the executing agency and the community. However, this evaluation did not conduct a causality assessment between such interventions and Project's achievement.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance to the Development Plan of Zambia

At the time of planning, integrated child health and nutrition as well as environmental health are considered as priority in the National Health Strategic Plan (NHSP: 2001~05). The renewed NHSP (2006~2010), which was in place at the end of the project, also enlisted these areas within the seven "Public Health Priority Interventions," along with HIV/AIDS, malaria, tuberculosis, etc.

(2) Relevance to the Development Needs of Zambia

At the time of planning, congested living environment and deteriorating hygiene were resulting in communicable diseases such as diarrhoea as well as malnutrition of residents, depriving lives of children in the unplanned settlements in Lusaka. Thus, Project's intervention package consisting of promotion of improved child health and environmental hygiene was consistent with the needs of beneficiaries. At the end of the Project (2007), Lusaka District still had far-above-average incidences of respiratory infections and diarrhoeal diseases (non-bloody) per 1000 under-five children, indicating the assistance in the above area was still relevant to the needs of the target areas at the end of the project.

(3) Relevance to Japan's ODA Policy

From the time of planning (2002) through the end of the Project (2007), the Japan's ODA policy towards Zambia had included "" as main areas of support, which consistently stressed communicable diseases control, environmental health, and primary healthcare among its five Priority Areas. Therefore, the assistance to LDHMT in establishing effective and sustainable community-based health activities for improved child health status was relevant to the Japan's ODA policy from the planning to the end of the project.

Based on the above accounts, this project has been highly relevant to the Zambia's development policy/strategy, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy. Therefore, its relevance of the project is rated high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

【Achievement of the Outputs】

At the time of Terminal Evaluation, much improvement was confirmed in strengthening Growth Monitoring Programme Plus (GMP+) (Output 1), environmental health (Output 2), community referral (Output 3), while some of the indicators for these Outputs had already achieved target value. As for Output 4 regarding planning and financial capacity of LDHMT, activity execution ratio was 50% at the end of the Project, short of the target value of 80%, due to the limitation in budget. Thus, the financial capacity of LDHMT to support community-based activities had yet to have strengthened. Output 5 regarding management capacity of CBOs can be considered moderately achieved, despite persistently high transfer rate of trained community health workers (CHWs) of 40% in 2006 as opposed to 38% in 2002. This is due to the observation that there are significant advances in securing sustainability of community-based activities: LDHMT now has a functional mechanism to select, train and provide technical backstopping for CHWs, and the number of CBOs, which consist of CHWs, having profitable income generating scheme almost reached 10 out of the target value of 12 at the time of ex-post evaluation.

【Achievement of the Project Purpose】

Project Purpose indicators have shown much improvements during the Project, and till the time of ex-post evaluation: 1) incidence of diarrhoea (non-bloody and bloody) in the Project areas were 212 and 5.3 per 1000 under-five children, respectively, clearing the target value of 218 and 9.5 (2007); 2) prevalence of the malnourished was 14.4 per 1000 under-five children, also clearing the target value of 24; and, incidence of measles has shown significant improvement since the beginning of the Project, from 18.2 per 1000 under-five children in 2002, 1.2 in 2004, to 0.9 in 2007. However, it was only in 2009 when they reached the target value of 0.6. Given the above achievement level, one can conclude that the Project Purpose has been mostly achieved.

【Contribution of the Outputs to the Project Purpose】

At the time of Terminal or Ex-post Evaluation, levels of achievement in Output 4 and 5 were partial. Nevertheless, notable improvement in child health indicators and its continuous improvement till the time of Ex-post Evaluation inferably suggests significant and larger contribution of Output 1, 2 and 3. Furthermore, a multiple regression analysis based on data from Project's sample survey reported significant co-relations between factors such as 1) proportion of households that adopt appropriate hand-washing behaviour; 2) proportion of households with access to safe water, and incidence of diarrhoea and prevalence of malnourished children in a report prepared by one of the Japanese experts. Given that partial achievement of Output 4 and 5 had not hinder attainment of the Project Purpose, it can be inferred that indicators of Output 4 and 5 were either overestimated or inadequate, and/or there were significant non-Project factors that influenced Project's achievement.

As other factors that contributed to the achievement, MoH points out 1) increase in knowledge of child caretakers and residents through participation in GMP+ and PHAST activities promoted by the Project; and, 2) availability of incentives for health education and volunteer activities through CHW-organised income generation scheme. Non-project factors may include 1) effects brought by several NGOs (Care International, Valid International, etc.) active in the area, 2) increased rate of immunisation rate brought by the 2003 Nation-wide Measles Campaigns, and, 3) lessons and knowledge brought to the Project from several predecessor JICA-funded Projects in the same areas.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

Overall Goals are partially achieved. GMP+ and PHAST Manuals are in use in four (4) and eleven (11) catchment areas other than six (6) Project areas, respectively, exceeding the target value of three (3). Improvement of child health indicators in those areas, however, could not be confirmed due to the null response in questionnaire. Other impact observed is the planned national scale-up of PHAST methods (NHSP 2006~2010). Not only the PHAST Manual developed through the Project has been approved by MoH for use in other compounds, but also been adopted by other aid agencies including UNICEF. At the time of ex-post evaluation, MoH had already completed the training of PHAST in twenty-two (22) out of seventy-two health districts. Furthermore, MoH reported that a certain protocol in the PHAST Manual had been put to good use when the eruption of cholera caused by heavy flooding in 2010 affected the unplanned settlement. No negative impacts have been reported.

Therefore, given that the targeted effects have been largely obtained through implementation of the Project and that a policy-level impact of PHAST methods is confirmed through its nation-wide expansion, the effectiveness of the project is rated high. As for the impact, although the GMP+ and PHAST methods have successfully been promoted to and adopted in non-project areas, its impact on child health status could not be verified due to lack of information. Hence, it is difficult to access the level of impact at this level.

3 Efficiency

(1) Inputs

As for the inputs made by the Japanese side, the actual number and timing of the experts, trainees received, equipment provided, financial inputs made were reported mostly as planned in the Terminal Evaluation. The Executing Agency also pointed out that inputs from the Japanese side were appropriate for intended Outputs. For the inputs made by the Zambian side, external factors such as devaluation of foreign aid revenue due to appreciation of local currency and insufficient and unreliable budget allocation from the central government resulted in non-fulfilment of part of the planned inputs.

(2) Period of Cooperation

Both the planned and actual project period was 60 months. Thus, the period of cooperation is as planned (100%).

(3) Project Cost

The planned cost is unknown.

Given that Project's intended Outputs have largely been achieved within the planned period with adequate inputs, efficiency of the project is rated high. The fact that a certain portion of Inputs was insufficient did not overly suppress the Project's gain, and that it was caused by external an factor that was difficult to neither predict nor prevent. Note that this analysis does not include comparison

between the planned and actual project cost.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

Zambia MoH considers integrated child health and environmental health as public health priority interventions: PHAST is stipulated as the method adopted by NHSP and thus an agenda for national scale-up, while child health adopts Community IMCI (Integrated Management of Childhood Illnesses), a method similar to GMP+. By the same token, the Ministry of Local Government and Housing (MLGH) stresses the importance of complementarities of water supply and environmental hygiene promotion through community participation as means to prevent water-borne diseases in its "National Urban Water Supply and Environmental Health Programme (2009)." MoH is reaching out to MLGH in establishing collaborative mechanisms as well. Furthermore, Manuals on GMP+ and PHAST, formulated under the Project, are utilised in LDHMT to date. Considering these factors, it is concluded that participatory approaches to child health and environmental health addressed by the Project are continuously held as priorities by MoH, and that these approaches have policy-level sustainability.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executing Agency

All the health centres in Project areas now have one or two community focal points. Numbers of primary-level health workers did increase over the past four years, but the fill rate dropped from 86% for nurses and 77% midwives in 2006 to 79% and 71% in 2010, respectively. Number of CHWs in 2010 was not confirmed through the questionnaire (was 120 in 2006). Number of Nutrition Promoters retained the same level of 100.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executing Agency

LDHMT has seven (7) GMP + and five (5) PHAST trainers, who have conducted fifteen (15) and twenty-one (21) training courses, respectively, between Project termination and this evaluation. LDHMT also continued regular annual orientations for community organisations on child health and environmental hygiene, and Manuals are in use and referred to by practitioners in twenty-six (26) and seventeen (17) health centres in Lusaka Districts out of twenty-seven (27). In light of the above, LDHMT has sufficient technical capacity in sustaining activities initiated by the Project.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executing Agency

Detailed financial status, such as proportion of personnel-related expenditures and amounts of total annual expenditure, of the LDHM is unknown. According to the above-mentioned NHSP, deficit to annual MoH budgets are estimated between 12% (2007) and 22% (2009). However, both child health and environmental health have been itemised as independent budget components. Some amount, though lesser, is likely to be expended under these line items. During the same period, not much fluctuations are observed in LDHMT's annual expenditures for child health and environmental health activities, ranging between 570 ~1,083 million kwacha, or 400~877 million kwacha, respectively.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

As described above, under such circumstances with limited human and financial resources, community-based income generation activities organised by CHWs, GMP+ including health education activities, and PHAST activities have been sustained in the six target compounds, and there is a inclining trend in child health-related indicators in the area. At the planning stage of the Project, incidence of diarrhoea (non-bloody) was 682 per 1,000 children (2002), while it improved at the Terminal Evaluation to 212 (2007) and again at the time of this evaluation to 49 (2009). Likewise, incidence of diarrhoea (bloody) also improved from 26 per 1,000 children (2002), to 5.3 (2007) and 2.2 (2009); incidence of measles 18 (2002) to 0.9 (2007) and 0.6 (2009); and percentage of malnourished under 5 children has significant decrease from 72 per 1,000 (2002) to 14 (2007) and 11 (2009).

Based on the above, given that the effects obtained through the Project have been sustained in Project areas despite certain limitations in human and financial resources, the sustainability of the project effects is rated (a) high, unless the said limitations seriously hamper community-based activities in the future.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Junko Miura Global Link Management Inc.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for the Development of Human Resources in Health (Projet d' Appui au Développement des Ressources Humaines dans le domaine de la Santé, "PADRHS")	March 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of Senegal		
Project Period	November 2001-October 2006		
Executing Agency	Human Resources Department (Direction des Ressources Humaines, "DRH"), Ministry of Health and Prevention, National School of Health and Social Development (Ecole Nationale de Développement Sanitaire et Social, "ENDSS"), Primary Health Care Division of Health Department (Division de Soins de Santé Primaires, Direction de la Santé, "DSSP"), Ministry of Health and Prevention		
Cooperation Agency in Japan	International Medical Center of Japan (IMCJ) and others		
Total Cost	Approximately 623 million Japanese yen		
Related Projects (if any)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Grant Aid Project for the Improvement of ENDSS in 2002 and follow-up cooperation in 2010. In-school technique practice was performed in this Project by using the facilities and equipment provided by the above grant aid project. 2) Dispatch of two Technical Advisors to the Cabinet of the Ministry of Health and Prevention, from 2003 to 2005 and from 2005 to 2007. They assisted the project formulation, follow-up for on-going and completed projects including this Project. 3) Technical Cooperation by Spain, "Assistance for Decentralization in Training System for Nursing Staff" was implemented by DRH in Kaolach, Saint Louis, Tambacounda (same target regions of this Project) from November 2006 to May 2008. The national guide for the Chief of Health Posts (Infirmier Chef de Poste, "ICP") were updated and re-printed. 		
Overall Goal	To contribute to the growth of human resources capable of working in the primary healthcare system in Senegal		
Project Objective(s)	Training system of health workers who work in primary healthcare is strengthened.		
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) The capacity of healthcare personnel training schools to foster human resources, particularly the capacity to foster human resources working in the primary healthcare system is reinforced. 2) The process for establishing the in-service education system targeted for nursing staff in the primary healthcare system is improved. 3) An appropriate training system for Community Health Workers (Agent de Santé Communautaire, ASC¹) is established in the test health zone (District Sanitaire, "DS"), Gossas. 		
Inputs (Japanese Side) Note: At the time of the Final Evaluation		Inputs (Senegal Side)	
Experts	10 for Long term (234M/M), 17 for Short term (252M/M)	Staff allocated	39
Equipments	41 million yen	Equipments	None
Local Cost	85 million yen	Local Cost	Expenses for Project Office and per diem for seminars at ENDSS
Trainees Received	34 persons	Land etc provided	Project Offices in ENDSS and Ministry of Health and Prevention
Others	Equipment carried by experts: 8 million yen	Others	None

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>· This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high. Although the achievement of the indicators for the Overall Goal has not been confirmed, this project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high. In spite of the delay in dispatching the experts and the limited inputs by the counterparts, the Outputs and the Project Purpose have been largely achieved within the planned project period and cost, therefore efficiency of the project is high. The number of registered nurses and midwives are increasing every year, and the contents of the national guide for ICP were updated through the assistance by Spain. Operation and maintenance system of the equipment and financial situation of the counterparts are also improving, therefore, sustainability the project effects is high. In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p>
<Recommendations to Ministry of Health and Prevention>
· To ensure issuing the in-service training annual report every year.
<Constraints of this evaluation study>
· This evaluation is a simplified version without a field visit, and the evaluation was performed based solely on a review of

¹ Local volunteer without certificates.

materials and data obtained from questionnaires given to the implementing agencies. Accordingly, when using the data for indicators provided in the responses to the questions and in JICA's documents, the raw data on which these indicators were based was not confirmed.

- Due to the lack of a field survey, there was no opportunity to hold discussions with the executing agency regarding the recommendations.
- Specifically, there were three constraints on the data collection:
 - 1) It was not possible to obtain numerical data and case studies for indicator (1) for Output 1 (reduction in time spent on financial management) when the final evaluation and the ex-post evaluation were carried out, so this indicator was deemed to have been achieved on the basis of the results of interviews in the final evaluation.
 - 2) There was no baseline for the indicator for the Overall Goal (increase rate of the number of personnel working in the primary healthcare system in Senegal), and data could be obtained neither at project completion nor in the ex-post evaluation, so it was not possible to determine the extent to which the Overall Goal had been achieved.
 - 3) The final evaluation pointed to the use of the nursing education materials and matron training manuals developed in the project by other organizations (private schools, NGOs) as the impact the project had had. However, since the names of these organizations were not given, it was not possible to confirm this with the organizations when the ex-post evaluation was carried out. The questionnaires given to C/P also failed to acknowledge their utilization.
- The shortcomings of the PDM² structure are 1) Important Assumptions, 2) Indicators for Outputs and 3) Activities.
 - 1) Important Assumptions: "The required number of healthcare workers is hired" and "The hired healthcare workers are appointed in accordance with the national development plan" were indicated as Important Assumptions that were essential for the achievement of the Super Goal. However, they were Important Assumptions that must be satisfied to achieve the Overall Goal. Moreover, "the attrition rate of healthcare workers in the primary healthcare system would not increase" should be added to the Important Assumptions that must be satisfied to achieve the Overall Goal. For the achievement of the Project Purpose, "The working conditions of healthcare workers will improve" should be replaced by "the working conditions of healthcare workers will not worsen". Moreover, "all private schools preparing to open will meet the standards for establishment set by the Ministry of Education" must be added to the Important Assumptions needed to achieve the Outputs.
 - 2) Indicators for Outputs: A more appropriate indicator for indicator (5) for Output 1 ("All private schools will be run in accordance with the DRH standards for the establishment of private schools") would have been "The project will draft the standards for the establishment of private schools and all private schools will be established based on the standards approved by the Ministry of Education (MoE). It is because a) only the MoE can set standards for the establishment of private schools and b) this project cannot control the administration of all private schools.
 - 3) Activities: 1-C-3 "Set standards for the establishment of private nurse and midwife training schools" will should be replaced by "Draft the standards" and "Conduct audit based on these standards" for the reason given in a) above. Moreover, the training manual for Community Health Workers (Agent de Santé Communautaire, "ASC") includes material on matron³ training, and matron training is also provided, so the activities for matrons should be added to the PDM as Activities.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Senegal

At the time of project planning, the National Plan for Healthcare Development (Plan National de Développement Sanitaire, "PNDS," 1998-2007) raised the following issues as priorities related to human resources: 1) implementing the National Human Resources Training Plan (Plan National de Formation, "PNF"); 2) increasing the number of students and improving the quality of its teachers at ENDSS; and 3) increasing the quality of health and medical personnel. At the time of project completion, PNDS Phase II (2004-2008) continued to make securing healthcare workers and improving their quality its main priority, and also included the reinforcement of ENDSS's capacity to accept students. Accordingly, training healthcare workers was consistent with Senegal's healthcare policy from the plan's inception to its completion.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Senegal

At the time of project planning, Senegal had seven doctors and 35 nurses per 100,000 people, which was lower than the average for developing countries overall (78 doctors and 98 nurses). At the time of project completion, the number of doctors and nurses per 100,000 people had declined compared to the numbers before the plan at 1.14 and 10, respectively. This indicates that the need for healthcare worker training has heightened. Moreover, DRH's Human Resource Management Strategy (2006) to Achieve the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) states that in order to achieve the MDGs related to the health sector by 2015, Senegal needs 987 more nurses at hospitals and health centers, 1,824 more at health posts and midwife clinics and needs 206 more midwives at hospitals and health centers and 462 more at health posts and midwife clinics. The need to assign human resources remains high in order to improve residents' access to healthcare services.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

Support for healthcare worker training was consistent with the Japanese government's priority assistance areas for Senegal as agreed in the 1998 policy consultation as well as the basic human need areas (including water supply, education, and healthcare and medical services; the development of human resources was added in 2005) listed in JICA's Project Implementation Plan for Senegal in 2005. Accordingly, support for healthcare worker training can be deemed consistent with Japan's aid policies from the project planning to its completion.

²This evaluation study was performed based on PDM3 which was used at the final evaluation.

³Different from traditional midwives, matrons have received training from registered medical personnel with certificates for a certain period. They perform not only in communities but also in health facilities. Although they do not hold certificates, when they work in health facilities, they receive salaries.

This project has been highly relevant with the Senegal's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

【Achievement of the Outputs】

Indicator (1) (the annual report on in-service education issued by Ministry of Health and Prevention will be available for use every year) of Output 2 (Improvements to in-service education system) was not achieved in fiscal 2005 (the final fiscal year of the project). All the indicators for Outputs except the above were almost achieved.

【Achievement of the Project Purpose】

Indicator (1) for the Project Purpose was partially achieved. Although the number of registered midwives increased by 274%, compared to a target of 50% increase from 2004 to 2006, the number of registered nurses only increased by 34%, compared to a target of 50% increase. Indicator 2 (usage rates of ICP guide by those in charge of health education in the three model regions: target of 80%) and Indicator (3) (percentage of health cabins in the test area functioning under ASC working in accordance with the standard module: Target of 80%) have been achieved. Therefore, the Project Purpose has generally been achieved.

【Contribution of the Outputs to the Project Purpose】

It is judged that Outputs 1-3 (reinforcement of the initial education system, improvements to the in-service education system, and establishment of an ASC system) all contributed to the strengthening of the healthcare worker training system. It is also considered that all the Outputs were adequate for the achievement of Project Purpose. All the Important Assumptions seem to have been fulfilled.

Another contributing factor for the project's achievement which relates to the plan content was the ability to provide a higher quality of in-school technique practice and practical training in the field with the use of facilities and equipment provided in the grant-aid project for ENDSS. Other contributing factor for the project's achievement related to the implementation process was that the following factors all strengthened the healthcare worker education system: 1) an increase in the number of regular entrants to the nurse and midwife programs at ENDSS; 2) the start of assistant nurse training and in-service education at three regions at the Regional Health Training Center (Centre Regional de Formation en Sante, "CRFS") through cooperation from the World Bank; and 3) an increase in the number of nurse and midwife training private schools (from three in 2000 to 16 in 2006). Contributing factors related to the process also include that project activities were facilitated by the newly-built DRH and the dispatch of technical advisors to the Cabinet of the Ministry of Health and Prevention.

At the same time, there were several problems and factors causing problems: 1) because the PDM, including indicators, had not been adequately reviewed in the planning stage, once the project started time had to be spent resolving problems over interpretations of the PDM with a broad range of those involved, breaking down issues in detail, and revising the PDM and 2) the reorganization of the Ministry of Health's Department of Education, Research and Study (Direction des Etudes de la Recherche et de la Formation, "DERF") as DRH resulted in the loss of a project manager, which affected activities.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

Data on the indicators for the Overall Goal (increase rate of the number of personnel working in the primary healthcare system in Senegal) could not be obtained, thus the extent to which it has been achieved is not clear. Other positive indirect effects that we were able to confirm were that the project encouraged the establishment of DRH, which had been recommended by the World Bank and others, at the time of the final evaluation, and that the development of relationships with private nursing and midwife training schools was encouraged through the invitation of private schools to ENDSS seminars.

Although the achievement the Overall Goal has not been confirmed, this project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Inputs

For the Japanese side, although there were minor changes in the timing and number of Japanese experts dispatched, the inputs were generally in line with plans. Inputs that failed to contribute to the Output have not been reported. There were two changes in the initial plan regarding the dispatch of experts: 1) since Senegal is a French-speaking country, it was difficult to find long-term experts and the dispatch was delayed and 2) there were few visitors to the maternal and child health clinic so the clinic was not able to provide enough practical training for students, and as a result the planned dispatch of a short-term expert to instruct midwives was cancelled. The former issue is a problem shared by other projects in French-speaking Africa and was unavoidable, and the latter change was considered appropriate. Meanwhile, it was pointed out by Counterparts (C/P) that the specialty of some short-term experts did not completely fit the required terms of reference and that a one-month dispatch was too short considering their inadequate skills in French language.

For the Senegalese side, the following three problems can be noted, and thus the inputs by the Senegalese side were generally limited. 1) Since the transition for DRH's reorganization took time, there was a period when there was no project manager; 2) there was only one actual C/P at DSSP; and 3) the ENDSS teachers were so busy that they had little time to participate in activities together. However, the Outputs were generally achieved, as shown by the effectiveness criteria, and the trainees who participated in the training in Japan helped to advance the project activities after their return home, so we cannot conclude that the input on the C/P side was inadequate. Meanwhile, since the test health zone for Output 3 was outside of the three targeted regions in Output 2, it could have been more effective if the test health zone for Output 3 had been in one of the target regions for Output 2.

It is concluded that the Activities implemented were sufficient to generate all of the Outputs. Output 1 was intended 1) to improve

ENDSS's school administration and management capacity by improving the financial management and equipment management systems, 2) to enhance the initial educational material at ENDSS by providing support for practice in the field, holding seminars to improve teacher capacity in the nursing and midwifery subjects, and adopting guidance for the ICP guide and the ASC training manuals into an initial education curriculum for nurses and midwives, and 3) to improve the functions of initial education through support for the formulation of standards for the establishment of private nurse and midwife training schools.

In Output 2, the procedures for establishing an in-service education system has been improved with the formulation of the national ICP guide, TOT implementation for those in charge of healthcare education in the three target regions by using this guide, and the preparation and distribution of annual reports on in-service education.

In Output 3, an ASC training system was established in the test health zone with the formulation of a training module for ASC and the education of trainers and ASC.

(2) Period of Cooperation

Both the planned and actual project period was 60 months. Thus, the period of cooperation is as planned.

(3) Project Cost

The planned cost was approximately 750 million JPY whereas the actual cost was 623 million JPY. Therefore, the project cost was almost as planned.

In spite of the delay in dispatching the experts and the limited inputs by the counterparts, the Outputs and the Project Purpose have been largely achieved within the planned project period and cost, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

Even after the completion of this project, the training of healthcare workers is viewed as a priority in the Senegalese government's policy. The sustainable reinforcement of the healthcare system is one of the four key areas in PNDSIII (2009-2018), which clearly states the importance of securing and raising the quality of human resources. At the same time, the training of ACS (Output 3) was being carried out by local governments, not the Ministry of Health and Prevention, as of the ex-post evaluation.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executing Agency

Enough personnel have been appointed to DRH and ENDSS, but DSSP did not provide a response so its situation is not known. DRH increased the teachers at CRFS after this project was completed in order to decentralize initial education, and teachers were increased in all of this project's three target regions. Moreover, DRH is setting up regional human resource departments in the regional medical departments to strengthen human resource management at the regional level, and these departments have already been set up in one of the three target regions, as well as other regions.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

As stated below in (5), the evaluation of the practical field training achievements showed impressive results, even after the project was complete. Thus, it is considered that ENDSS's technical level (teachers' capacity, practical training content) is high and that the transferred technology is maintained. Regarding the operation and maintenance (O&M) of the equipment, an equipment manager was appointed for each department, and the resident manager is contacted by those equipment managers in the event of a malfunction. The resident manager makes rounds, and also manages contracts with six management companies. Therefore, it can be said that the O&M situation has been improved compared to the time of the project completion.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

ENDSS had a deficit in 2006 and 2007, but posted a profit in 2008 and 2009. At the time of final evaluation, there had been concerns about maintenance costs, including equipment in the multi-purpose practical training wing, but ENDSS made stable expenditures for the maintenance from 2008 to 2010. This is because ENDSS applies about 15% of its own revenue (tuition fees, medical treatment fees) to equipment maintenance fees. Revenue from tuition fees has increased as a result of the increase in students since 2008. In addition, the revenue from treatment fees has also increased now that practical training in dentistry is being offered within the facility.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

The status of the ACS passed on by the Ministry of Health and Prevention to local governments (Output 3) is not known, but the Outputs 1 and 2 are considered to be sustainable. As regards Output 1, even after this project's completion, all the students taking the practical field training achieve at least 80% of the training goals every year. As described in (3) above, the equipment is regularly maintained. As regards Output 2, the results of the annual report on in-service education are posted in the Health Management Information System, but it is not being published every year. In addition, the in-service education plan has been updated every year in two of three target areas even after the project's completion.

Among the Indicators (1) for the Project Purpose, although the number of registered nurses did not achieve the target by 2006, the number of registered nurses had reached 1,272, exceeding the target in 2008.

As for indicator (2) (usage rates of the national ICP guide), the guidance was updated after this project with the technical cooperation from Spain. Over 90% of the health education managers in the three target regions are using them. In conjunction, a guide for education managers and a guide for trainees were also formulated and used at private schools and seven CRFS. As recommended in the final evaluation, the nursing technique video, nursing technique sheets and nursing technology texts developed in this project are used in initial education and in-service education in ENDSS and CRFS.

No major problems have been observed in the policy background, technical, financial aspects of the executing agency, and the effects by the project is continuously maintained, therefore sustainability the project effects is high.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Junko Miura Global Link Management Inc.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Strengthening of National Bureau of Statistics in Data Providing Service	March 2010—December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	United Republic of Tanzania		
Project Period	From February 2004 to February 2007		
Executing Agency	National Statistics Bureau (NBS)		
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Statistics Bureau, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications Japan Statistical Association		
Total Cost	213 million Japanese Yen		
Related Projects (if any)	9 officials of the NBS participated in the various trainings by JICA between 2000 and 2006. Some of the officials were the counterparts of this project. From 2007 to 2009, the Poverty Monitoring Data Management Advisor was dispatched for following up this project as one of his tasks. From February to March 2009, an expert for Geographical Information System (GIS) was dispatched for assisting in storing the GIS data into the Integrated Statistical Database (ISD).		
Overall Goal	Statistical information is fully utilized in the process of policy and implementation with regard to poverty reduction in Tanzania.		
Project Objective(s)	NBS is able to provide policymakers, administrators, academics, NGOs, development partners and other general public with more reliable statistical data in a timely manner.		
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. NBS Integrated Statistical Database (ISD) is established and operated appropriately. 2. Statistical Library acquires the capacity to compile and disseminate the statistical data such as statistical abstracts and other publications through its own web site and library. 3. Users of statistical information (officers at NBS Regional Offices, line ministries, etc.) will be able to use the Database appropriately. 		
Inputs (Japanese Side) Note: At the time of the Final Evaluation		Inputs (Tanzania Side)	
Experts	2 for Long term, 18 for Short term	Staff allocated	9
Equipments	2 million yen	Equipments	NA
Local Cost	17 million yen	Local Cost	NA
Trainees Received	6	Land etc provided	Statistical Library, Office for Experts
Others	None	Others	None

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>· This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high. Although the achievement of the indicators for the Overall Goal has not been confirmed, this project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair. In spite of the delay in dispatching the experts and the limited inputs by the counterparts, the Outputs and the Project Purpose have been achieved except some indicators within the planned project period and cost, therefore efficiency of the project is high. In spite of the limited human resources of the counterparts, no major problems have been observed in the policy background, technical, financial aspects of the counterparts, therefore, sustainability the project effects is high. In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p>
<Recommendations to NBS>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The search system of the statistical data in the website should be improved. 2. The tariff system for the data dissemination should be established.
<Lessons Learned>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. In this project, delay in installing Local Area Network (LAN) by NBS along with the renovation of the NBS building prevented its staff from accessing to the database and from enhancing their job quality. In the future similar projects, establishment of LAN should be stated as Pre-condition in the Project Design Matrix (PDM), and the project should start only after the pre-condition is met. 2. In this project, although the project period was decreased from five years to three years at the time of ex-ante evaluation, the contents of the Outputs and Activities were not modified appropriately. As a result, there is a high possibility that some indicators for Output 3 were not achieved and the capacity of the counterparts responsible for the applied training courses could not be strengthened to a satisfactory level. Therefore, in the future similar projects, if the project period is changed, it is recommended to modify the contents of Outputs and Activities accordingly.
<Constraints of this evaluation study>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) The data obtained by direct observation are not included in this study because this study was conducted based on only the

document review and the questionnaire to the counterparts.

- 2) When the data in the questionnaire answer, information from JICA and the report by the Poverty Monitoring Data Management Advisor is used, the raw data for those data were not confirmed.
- 3) The degree of users' satisfaction, which was the indicator of the Project Purpose, was not measured because the questionnaire survey to the research institutes, line ministries and donors could not be conducted.
- 4) Due to the lack of a field survey, there was no opportunity to hold discussions with the executing agency regarding the recommendations.
- 5) It was difficult to measure the achievement of the Project Purpose due to the problems with the definition and indicators in the PDM.
 - The Project Purpose in the PDM cannot be achieved only by NBS because the cooperation by other statistical units is required for the improvement of the statistical reliability and the timeliness in dissemination.
 - Most indicators for the Project Purpose were Output level indicators.
 - Criteria and a benchmark were not established for the indicator "Satisfaction of users (about the data quality)".

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Tanzania

At the time of planning, in the Master Plan for Poverty Monitoring System, which was formulated as a part of Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) in December 2001, it was emphasized that there is a need to provide users with statistical information properly and to monitor the progress of the indicators along with the PRSP. At the end of the project, the Master Plan II in March 2006 stressed the same point. Therefore, the support in strengthening the capacity of NBS in statistical data management and dissemination for poverty monitoring was relevant with the development plans of Tanzania from the planning to the end of the project.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Tanzania

At the time of planning, the capacity of NBS in statistical data collection, management and dissemination was not sufficient. Statistical surveys conducted by the NBS and statistical units of other ministries were saved separately by themselves due to the lack of integrated system. In this project, the above statistical surveys were saved in the statistical integrated database. However, enhancing the capacity of NBS in statistical data collection, management and dissemination was still a development priority for Tanzania at the end of the project. Therefore, the assistance in the above area was relevant with the development needs of Tanzania from the planning to the end of the project.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

At the time of planning, the Japan's ODA policy towards Tanzania in the year 2000 and the policy consultations between the two governments in 2001 stressed the following five priority areas: 1) development of agriculture and small-scale enterprises, 2) basic education, 3) population, HIV/AIDS and children's health, 4) improvement of basic infrastructure particularly in cities, 5) preservation of forest. The poverty reduction was included in the first four priorities. In the Japan's ODA policy towards Tanzania in August 2006, the improvement of the administrative capacity for poverty reduction was added to the above priorities. Therefore, the assistance to NBS in strengthening the capacity in statistical data management and dissemination for poverty monitoring was relevant with the Japan's ODA policy from the planning to the end of the project.

This project has been highly relevant with the Tanzania's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

【Achievement of the Outputs】

All the indicators for Output 1 (NBS Integrated Statistical Database is established and operated appropriately) and Output 2 (Statistical Library acquires the capacity to compile and disseminate the statistical data such as statistical abstracts and other publications through its own web site and library.) were achieved. However, two out of three indicators for Output 3 (Users of statistical information will be able to use the Database appropriately) were not achieved. For Indicator 1 for Output 3, the actual number of sessions of applied training courses conducted was limited to twice whereas it was planned to conduct more than nine times¹. For Indicator 2 for Output 3, the actual number of participants in the applied training courses was also limited to thirty whereas more than 135 persons were planned to participate. The reasons for non-achievement were as follows. 1) The twelve-time-applied training courses were planned based on the conditions that the project period is five years and that ISD is established before the applied training courses. However, the actual project period was three years², thus it was not possible to secure sufficient time for conducting the courses for twelve times. 2) The trainers for the applied training courses appointed by NBS had limited capacity as trainers. Meanwhile, it can be said that Indicator 3 for Output 3 (participants acquire skills and knowledge) was achieved because the pre-post test result in the applied training course showed the increase of the score by 35.4 point after the training.

【Achievement of the Project Purpose】

Regarding the Indicator 1 for Project Purpose (satisfaction of users), the improvement of the data quality and of website contents were acknowledged by line ministries, research institutes and donors at the time of the final evaluation. However, it was pointed out that it is difficult to search data on the website. The satisfaction of users at the end of the project is unknown because questionnaire survey for the concerned could not be conducted.

¹At the time of final evaluation, a benchmark (more than nine times) was newly established for the number of the applied training courses based on the actual number of basic training courses conducted (nine times). However, it is unknown whether a full discussion was held or not by the evaluation mission regarding the appropriateness of the benchmark (conducting the applied training courses for seven times in six months).

²As the project period in the ex-ante evaluation summary was 3 years, there is a possibility that the project period was shortened from 5 years to 3 years without the modification of the activities which were planned before the ex-ante evaluation.

Meanwhile, Indicator 2 for Project Purpose (data stored in ISD and uploaded in the website within two to three months after receiving statistical surveys from ministries and other statistical units) was established at the time of ex-post evaluation because the PDM did not contain an indicator which demonstrates the improvement in the timeliness. For the above indicator, all the authorized data had been immediately stored in ISD and uploaded in the website by the end of the project. In light of the above, it is judged that the Project Purpose has been largely achieved.

【Contribution of the Outputs to the Project Purpose】

In spite of the fact that the reliability and timeliness had been largely improved by the three Outputs, the final evaluation report pointed out that it was difficult to measure the contribution of the Outputs to the Project Purpose because there is a logical gap between the Output and the Project Purpose.

No particular contributing and preventing factors have been observed.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

According to the NBS, the Overall Goal has been achieved. However, regarding Indicator 1 (statistical data is more quoted in the Poverty and Human Development Report) and Indicator 2 (Discussion is enlarged and deepened based on the statistical data in the Poverty Monitoring Working Groups), any specific case for evidence has been reported. No other particular impacts have been observed. Although this is not a negative impact, space for storing data is immediately to be enlarged because the data quantity was increased after the project.

This project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair.

3 Efficiency

(1) Inputs

For the Japanese side, the actual number of the trainees received was the same as the planned. The equipment was also provided as planned. Whether there is a gap or not between the number of the planned experts and the actual could not be confirmed due to the followings: 1) planned number of experts and Man-Month (M/M) were not indicated in the ex-ante evaluation summary; 2) the planned and actual assignment sheet could not be obtained; and 3) the difference between the plan and the actual for the number of experts was not pointed out in the final evaluation report.

Regarding the appropriateness of timing in dispatching the experts, two issues were pointed out by the final evaluation report. 1) At the planning, the Statistics Bureau of the Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications in Japan was supposed to offer some experts, but it did not realize. It was extremely difficult to secure appropriate experts in timely manner given that the tasks are related to governmental statistics. As a result, the implementation of the database applied training courses was delayed. 2) Experts who were involved in the similar project in other country had to adjust their schedules. Consequently, experts were not dispatched in the perfect timing for the counterparts.

For the Tanzanian side, statistical library and the office for experts were provided as planned. However, there were two problems. 1) The number of staff for the data processing was not sufficient. 2) LAN was planned to be installed in the first or second year, but it was seriously delayed (not completed by the final evaluation). Consequently, it prevented NBS staff from accessing to the database and from enhancing the job quality.

In light of the above, the final evaluation stated that there was a room for improvement in terms of efficiency. But, inputs for not contributing to the Outputs were reported. According to the final evaluation report, it is noteworthy that this project cost is approximately 210 million Japanese Yen (JPY) for three years (70 million JPY per year) whereas the cost of the similar project in Cambodia is about 240 million JPY for two years (120 million JPY per year). Thus, the annual cost of this project is lower than the equivalent of Cambodia. However, the project in Cambodia covers the wider range of activities such as planning of statistics, data collection and dissemination, thus it is not possible to simply compare those cost.

(2) Period of Cooperation

Both the planned and actual project period was 36 months. Thus, the period of cooperation is as planned.

(3) Project Cost

The planned cost was approximately 210 million JPY whereas the actual cost was 213 million JPY. Therefore, the project cost was almost as planned.

In spite of the delay in dispatching the experts and the limited inputs by the counterparts, the Outputs and the Project Purpose have been achieved except some indicators within the planned project period and cost, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

Even after the end of the project, the enhancement of the capacity of NBS in statistical data management and dissemination for poverty monitoring is an urgent issue for Tanzanian Government. Tanzania Statistical Master Plan (TSMP) in 2009 stated that the data storing space and National Statistical System (NSS) should be established.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executing Agency

According to the NBS, the number of staff for data processing is limited and only IT Manager is in charge of website update. On the other hand, two staff is assigned for the library. In spite of this limited number of human resources, statistical surveys have been continuously stored in the ISD and uploaded in the website, as described later. Thus, if the current number of staff with current level of capacity is continuously retained in the future, there is a high possibility that NBS can sustain its capacity in data management and dissemination.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

It can be said that the IT staff has acquired required skills for database and network management because statistical surveys have been continuously stored in the ISD and uploaded in the website even after the end of the project. Local Area Network was introduced after the completion of the renovation of the second floor of the NBS. Out of the technical issues to be improved, the following two issues were improved: 1) file formats of raw data of various statistical surveys have been standardized; 2) attribution data of statistical surveys have been improved and the raw data transmission between NBS and other statistical units became smooth by introducing the Microdata Management Toolkit (MMT) through the Accelerated Data Program by the World Bank. The new system introduced by the project for the smooth data transmission between the NBS and other statistical units is still functioning at the ex-post evaluation. Such system includes the participation of NBS IT Department staff in the statistical surveys and censuses, and the appointment of responsible persons in the statistical units in each ministry for data transmission to NBS. In light of the above, there is no major problem with the technical aspects.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

Detail financial status of the NBS is unknown. Although the tariff policy for data dissemination was formulated by the NBS, the system has not been established. However, there is an access for NBS to the basket fund for TSMP, therefore it cannot be said that there is a problem with financial status.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

At the Project Purpose level, statistical surveys have been continuously stored in the ISD and uploaded in the website soon after receiving statistical surveys from other statistical units. However, according to the NBS, statistical data search system in the website has to be further improved as pointed out at the final evaluation. Degree of users' satisfaction is unknown because a questionnaire survey could not be conducted.

At the Output level, regarding Output 1, the number of statistical surveys stored in the ISD is increasing. The data transmission between NBS and statistical units became smooth although no quantitative data is available. For Output 2, the number of statistical books sold in the library between March 2007 (end of the project) and May 2010 reached 3,757. This means that the statistical publications have been sold at the same pace with the project implementation period (1,200 books per year). Although the statistical library was closed due to the renovation until June 2010, it is expected to be used by more people in the future.

Although the number of human resources is limited, no major problems have been observed in the policy background, technical, financial aspects of the executing agency, and the effects by the project is continuously maintained, therefore sustainability the project effects is high.