

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Keisuke Nishikawa Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Restoration of International Airport in the Solomon Islands	February 2010 – November 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Solomon Islands	
Project Period	July 2004-December 2005	
Executing Agency	Ministry of Infrastructure Development Department of Communications, Aviation & Meteorology	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 702 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 702 million yen
Main Contractors	(Construction) KITANO Construction Corp.	
Main Consultants	PACIFIC CONSULTANTS INTERNATIONAL	
Basic Design	July 1999-June 2000 (Implementation Review Study: November 2002-July 2003)	
Related Projects (if any)	<Japan's Grant Aid> 1995-1997 Project for Henderson International Airport Development <Other International Organizations and Donors> Provision of Equipment for Communication and Meteorological Observation (EU) Renewal of VHF Transmitter (New Zealand)	
Project Background	Honiara International Airport (HIA), which is the only international airport in the Solomon Islands, is also the hub airport for the domestic air route network. It is the entry point for passengers/cargoes and is essential for the economic reconstruction of the country damaged by ethnic conflicts. However, its runway had not been fully repaired for about twenty years. The pavement surface had become severely damaged, and it has continued to deteriorate. The International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO) had made a recommendation not to use the runway. Furthermore, 28% of the runway lights and 48% of the approach lights were damaged or did not meet the current standards. As these are necessary facilities for aircraft takeoffs/landings during the night, airline companies have been demanding immediate improvements. The airport is a vital base for traffic/transportation, tourism and other sectors in the Solomon Islands, which forms an archipelago. The Government of the Solomon Islands formulated an International Airport Restoration Plan, which is aimed at runway surface improvements and the replacement of airfield lights. To this end, the government requested the Government of Japan for grant aid.	
Project Objective	To ensure safe takeoffs/landings of the aircrafts at the Honiara International Airport (HIA) by placing an overlay pavement on the runway and replacing airfield lighting, including runway lights, runway threshold lights and runway approach lights.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	Facilities: Overlay pavement for the runway using asphalt concrete (Length: 2,200 m, Width: 45 m, Overlay thickness: 10 cm) Repair of the damaged runway pavement Repair of cracks Equipment: 72 Runway lights, 12 Runway threshold lights, 6 Turning pad lights, etc.	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>This project is relevant with the development policy to modernize aviation facilities in order to ensure safe and stable air transportation at the time of project planning and with the current development policy that emphasizes the need for improving the aviation services of mainly the Honiara International Airport (HIA). Countermeasures against the obsolescence of HIA facilities were an urgent task, especially since the number of takeoffs/landings had been increasing. The project was also relevant with Japan's ODA policy to support the improvement of the transportation infrastructure; therefore its relevance is high.</p> <p>Regarding the project implementation, both the project period and project cost were as planned. The outputs were also produced as planned. Accordingly, the project's efficiency was significantly high. Regarding the effectiveness, confidence in the airport itself seems to have improved. The rate of defects in the runway lights has greatly decreased. The problem of a series of unlit lights was mostly solved. Aviation safety for the aircrafts has been improving.</p> <p>Regarding sustainability, although there is no problem with the organizational structure and technologies, the budget is generally limited. At the moment, no large scale repairs are required for the facilities improved under this project and inspections are still frequently conducted.</p> <p>In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p> <p><Constraints of this evaluation study> As the information obtained from the executing agency concerning the impacts and sustainability was not sufficient, the evaluation is based on a limited amount of information.</p>

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Policy of the Solomon Islands

At the time of project planning, the "Solomon Islands Government Action Program 2002-2005" stipulated the modernization of aviation facilities as well as the improvement of air transportation services in order to refurbish obsolete facilities/equipment and to ensure safe and stable air transportation. The current "National Transport Plan 2007-2026" also states that it is necessary to improve aviation services considering the country's dependence on international trade and the potential for tourism development. In particular, it insists on the necessity of the improvement/maintenance of Honiara International Airport. This project is relevant with these policies.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Country the Solomon Islands

Honiara International Airport, the only international airport in the Solomon Islands, is also the only airport where large aircraft can take off and land. However, its runway and aviation security facilities had degraded at the time of project planning, and aviation safety would be further undermined unless they were fully repaired right away. The number of takeoffs and landings at the airport at the time of the commencement of this project in 2004 amounted to 8,337 times, and this increased to 11,040 times by 2007, to 10,046 times in 2008, and to 10,890 times in 2009. As the airport plays a central role in the economic and social development of the country, the continuous improvement/maintenance of the airport is still an important development task.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

Japan was indicating grant aid for the fisheries sector and the improvement of the transportation infrastructure as its ODA policy toward the Solomon Islands at the time of project planning. This project was relevant with Japan's ODA policy.

This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

The outputs on the Japanese side were generally produced as planned.

(2) Project Period

As a result of the efficient construction work, the project period was shorter than planned (84% of the plan). It took 13 months, while the planned project period was 15.5 months.

(3) Project Cost

The planned project cost was 702 million yen, while the actual cost was 702 million yen as planned (100% of the plan)

Both project period and project cost were mostly as planned, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

The improvement of the runway and the repair of the airfield lights under this project have reduced the rate of defects in the runway lights from 28% before the commencement of the project implementation in 2003 to 5% at the time of the ex-post evaluation. The occurrence of a series of unlit runway lights has become rare. Quantitative values for indicators of the runway pavement conditions were neither recorded nor stored. However, the runway is maintained well, and no need for repairs has been detected.

Data on the number of passengers/cargo volume was not obtained. According to the executing agency, the number of passengers is increasing partly because a new low cost carrier called Pacific Blue entered into service in 2008, which has made it easier for more people to travel.

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)

As a result of the implementation of this project, it has become easy for larger aircrafts to take off and land, and the night operations have become safer due to the improvements in the airfield lighting. No aircraft accidents have occurred since the project completion. The executing agency recognizes the following impacts as a result of the improvement of aviation security at the airport. Effects that cannot be indicated by numerical figures are as follows:

- Confidence of airline companies in Honiara International Airport has risen.
- Improvement of the airfield lighting has increased the ability of the pilots to visually check the runway.
- Maintaining the runway in good condition has enabled continuous flight services.

There are no adverse impacts of this project on the natural environment. It can be said that being capable of safe takeoff and landing has considerably reduced the risk of aircraft accidents and therefore there are substantial positive effects.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation and Maintenance

The operation and maintenance of the airport is under the supervision of the airport manager. As the Ministry of Infrastructure Development is responsible for the maintenance work of the runway and the apron, this work is implemented in cooperation with the ministry. However, the number of engineers in the Ministry of Infrastructure Development is insufficient. When urgent responses are required, there are cases in which the work is commissioned to private sector entities.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation and Maintenance

There have been no technical problems for the operation and maintenance of the runway pavement as expected at the time of the basic design study. The technical level of the engineers is sufficient. Regarding the airfield lighting, the items proposed at the time of the project commencement were all executed, including the preparation of an inspection manual and other manuals, preparation of an inventory of the equipment, etc. Although the training courses concerning operation and maintenance of the runway and airfield lighting are regularly provided overseas by foreign organizations, there is not sufficient budget for participation in these training sessions, and only a limited number of staff can participate. Also, while only the 2009 data are available, it is stated that no operation and maintenance training is provided for airport staff within the Solomon Islands.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation and Maintenance

As the budget data on operation and maintenance were not obtained from the executing agency, financial conditions could not be captured. It was stated that the amount of budget allocated is usually limited against the amount of budget required. An Aviation Special Fund was established by the Solomon Island Government in 2005 and this supports the minimum operation and maintenance work from the financial aspect. Also, the establishment of National Transport Fund, financed by New Zealand, EU and ADB, has made it possible to have some funds allocated to the necessary operation and maintenance activities.

(4) Current Status of Operation and Maintenance

The runway and airfield lightings improved under this project are maintained well, and there is no need for large scale repairs, although simple repairs and parts replacement were conducted. However, runway lights have been stolen by the neighboring residents many times, and the executing agencies had to replace them with new lights. As a countermeasure for this, airport staff check the runway twice a day to ensure safety. At the same time, they are carrying out public awareness activities to ensure that the residents understand the importance of the airport facilities. The Ministry of Aviation stipulates in the revised Civil Aviation Act of 2008 that such conduct is subject to fines or imprisonment.

The executing agency recognizes that they cannot systematically procure necessary parts mainly due to the shortage of budget, and they are concerned about the resulting delays in the repair work. However, it has an operation and maintenance structure that can attend to urgent matters as seen in the case where there came a groove in the apron area due to the pressure from parked aircrafts / increased flight movements and a repairing work by the external company was completed in 2010 with the funding from the Aviation Special Fund.

Some problems have been observed in terms of financial aspects; therefore sustainability of the project effects is fair.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Keisuke Nishikawa Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Rehabilitation of the Domestic Tuna Fishery in the Solomon Islands	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Solomon Islands	
Project Period	March 2005-March 2006	
Executing Agency	Soltai Fishing and Processing Ltd. (SFPL)	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 973 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 967 million yen
Main Contractors	(Construction) Miho Shipyard, (Procurement) Yamaha Motor Co., Ltd.	
Main Consultants	Fisheries Engineering Co., Ltd.	
Basic Design	September 2004-March 2005	
Related Projects (if any)	Technical guidance on the management of fishing boat engines and land refrigeration equipment for SFPL (Overseas Fishery Cooperation Foundation of Japan; October 2002-October 2007)	
Project Background	<p>Soltai Fishing and Processing Ltd. (SFPL), established in 2001 with the capital contributed by the Government of the Solomon Islands, owned 12 tuna pole and line fishing vessels. They had become decrepit after 22 to 25 years of use. Among the 12 fishing boats, two had been out of service since 2004. The remaining 10 ships underwent major repairs carried out by SFPL itself. It had taken measures to extend their service life, but their average monthly utilization rate continued to fall from 10.5 boats in 2002 to 9.5 boats in 2003 and 7.1 boats in 2004, and SFPL found it difficult to prevent a downward trend in the future.</p> <p>What was needed for SFPL to raise the utilization rate of its vessels and establish long-term stability in its operation was not only to make careful repairs of their existing vessels, just as they had been doing to extend their service life, but also to introduce newly built vessels with a view to reducing repair expenses they had to bear and investing the surplus in purchasing secondhand vessels to continue the fishing operations.</p> <p>In this context the Government of the Solomon Islands requested the Government of Japan to provide grant aid to acquire two tuna pole and line fishing vessels for SFPL.</p>	
Project Objective	The objective of this project is to catch a larger amount of fish by Soltai Fishing and Processing Ltd. (SFPL), increase the production of value added products, and make its operation sustainable and stable by providing SFPL with two additional tuna pole and line fishing vessels.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	Procurement of the equipment below: (1) Tuna pole and line fishing vessels (two); and (2) Auxiliary equipment (fishing equipment (one set), bait boats (four) bait-boat engine kits (two) and fish bins (86))	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

This project was carried out to support the fishing industry, an important industry for the Solomon Islands. The project was relevant with the development policy and development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy. However, SFPL totally withdrew from the fishing business under the changing environment where purse seine fishing became increasingly common, prices for marine products were falling and fuel oil prices also soared during the second half of 2007. It was later decided by the Government of the Solomon Islands that the vessels would be leased to the private sector companies to realize the efficient use. The establishment of procedures for leasing is currently underway. In August 2010, it was also decided that SFPL would be privatized with the private-sector company becoming the largest shareholder.

The project was completed within the planned project period and project costs. It also delivered the outputs as planned. These facts demonstrate that the effectiveness of the project was significantly high.

In the first year of their service, the two pole and line fishing vessels granted in this project achieved a much larger catch amount than the target, making up for the declining catches of the existing vessels. But with the change in the policy of the project, the two vessels are now moored at SFPL's base port, and have not been used for almost two years other than for resource surveys. Most of the crew members have been transferred to the processing section of SFPL.

In terms of sustainability, as SFPL provided only limited information about their current operation and maintenance systems and financial conditions, an evaluation concerning these issues cannot be made. However, it claims that mainly due to the assistance from Japan, their operation and maintenance abilities were enhanced, and its operation and maintenance personnel have no problems in applying the techniques.

In light of the evaluation result on its effectiveness and impact, this project can be evaluated to produce the limited outcomes.

<Constraints of this evaluation study>

As the executing agency (SFPL) provided only limited information, part of the evaluation was carried out using JICA's internal documents and the findings of interviews with the consultants who worked for the project.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Policy of the Solomon Islands

At the time of project planning, this project was positioned as the project in line with one of the eight key objectives of the development policy "National Economic Recovery, Reform and Development Plan 2003-2006", which was "(to) reasonably manage and protect coastal fishing and marine living resources through sustainable use." In the ex-post evaluation, this project is also considered to be relevant with the country's policy of shifting the focus to tourism, fishing industry and marine resources development, which is mentioned in the "Medium-term Development Strategy 2008-2010" as a key issue in the "productive sectors of the economy," one of its six key areas.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of the Solomon Islands

The agriculture, forestry and fishery industries have very important roles in the Solomon Islands economy. At the time of project planning, in 2004, these industries accounted for 55% of its GDP, and were responsible for 56% in 2008, the year for which the latest data is available, demonstrating the continued importance. The fishing industry also serves as an essential means of livelihood to support the daily life of the people. Marine products constitute important export goods, and the development of the fisheries industry has a high priority among the development agendas for the country.

Around September 2008, however, SFPL withdrew from fishing after it had drastically changed its operation policy to specialize in the canning operations. The change was made mainly because the pole and line fishing method had lost its advantage amid the changing environment. The prices for marine products were falling as purse seine fishing had become common among other private-sector fishing companies and fish catches were increasing, and the fuel oil prices since the second half of 2007 had been soaring worldwide. With the country's change in policy, these vessels are no longer utilized by SFPL. However, it is expected that the vessels will contribute to the development of the fisheries industry once the leasing to the private sector has been realized.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

At the time of project planning, Japan's ODA policy to the Pacific region included the protection and sustainable use of natural resources. Therefore, this project was relevant with Japan's ODA policy.

This project has been relevant with the development policy of the Solomon Islands and Japan's ODA policy, but was partly irrelevant with the country's development needs at the time of ex-post evaluation; therefore its relevance is fair.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

Outputs by Japan were mostly delivered as planned.

(2) Project Period

The project, designed to be completed in 13 months in the plan, was actually completed in 13 months as planned (100% of the plan).

(3) Project Cost

The project, designed to cost 973 million yen, actually cost 967 million yen. It was lower than the planned amount (99% of the plan).

Both project period and project cost were mostly within the plan, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

The fishing vessels granted in this project started to work at their full capacity as freezing and cooling vessels just after being put into service, and have been operated without any major troubles, and achieved a catch amount of 2,712 tons, well over the target of 1,870 tons (2006-2007). In terms of the repair and maintenance costs during the year, while the existing fishing vessels annually cost 550,000 Solomon Island dollars (SBD) per vessel, the expenses spent for the new vessels in the same year for daily inspections were 48,000 SBD per vessel, which was a great contribution to the reduction of cost. However, as the executing agency withdrew from fishing in 2008, it now has no fish catch to be recorded. For the two fishing vessels granted in this project, the leasing procedures are being established. One of the vessels was used by the Secretariat of the Pacific Community for a tuna tagging survey that it conducted.

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)

When SFPL withdrew from fishing activities two years after this project had been completed, the concern was that the crew of the fishing vessels, bait suppliers and other people involved might be adversely affected. The crew members have been transferred to its processing section, but processing operation is not performing well, either. SFPL operates under severe management conditions. When the company fell into a cash-flow crisis, it suspended the operation of its canning factory for months and ceased supplying canned food to the domestic market, which escalated into a social problem. But with the capital injected by government-related institutions and a private-sector fishing company, SFPL has resumed operation. Now the focus is on whether its operations can keep going smoothly.

With SFPL's withdrawal from fishing, it would have to be said that the effectiveness and impact of this project was low at the time of the ex-post evaluation. However, the strengthening of the fishery sector remains a national policy. If the fishing vessels are used in an efficient manner by, for instance, private businesses and a stable supply of materials is secured for SFPL's canning factory, the local economy can expect positive effects from it. Now that SFPL has definitely withdrawn from fishing, the leasing of the fishing vessels granted in this project, for which procedures are being established by the government, should be regarded as a pragmatic measure for their efficient use.

This project has achieved its objectives at a limited level at the time of the ex-post evaluation compared with the plan, therefore its effectiveness and impact is low. However, attention should be paid to any specific developments in the future.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation and Maintenance

As no information was obtained from SFPL on this aspect, the operation and maintenance systems for the fishing vessels granted in this project are unknown. However, SFPL was privatized in 2010 and a private-sector company became the largest shareholder. It is decided that the vessels will be leased out to this private-sector company and the leasing procedures are currently underway. SFPL is to continue operation and maintenance activities of these vessels based on the Memorandum of Agreement with the Ministry of Finance and Planning.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation and Maintenance

As technical guidance on the operation and maintenance of fishing vessel engines and freezing facilities on land had been provided by the Overseas Fishery Cooperation Foundation of Japan from 2002 to 2007, which included the project period, SFPL and the consultants who worked on this project comment that the engineers in charge, with expertise accumulated over the years, have no problems in applying their operation and maintenance techniques to fishing vessels.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation and Maintenance

As no information was obtained from SFPL, an evaluation cannot be made.

(4) Current Status of Operation and Maintenance

The two vessels granted in this project are now moored at SFPL's Noro Base. Operation and maintenance manuals have been prepared, and inspection records have been preserved. According to SFPL, part of the cooling equipment needs repairing.

In light of the above, with no information about the structural and financial aspects available, a judgment cannot be made on the sustainability of the project.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Akemi Shimura Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The project for Improvement of the Majuro Hospital	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of the Marshall Islands																		
Project Period	October 2002-July 2003																		
Executing Agency	Ministry of Health, the Republic of the Marshall Island																		
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 988 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 977 million yen																	
Main Contractors	Tokai Kogyo Co., Ltd.																		
Main Consultants	Azusa Sekkei Co., Ltd.																		
Basic Design	"Basic Design Study on the Project for Improvement of the Majuro Hospital in the Republic of RMI", JICA, Azusa Sekkei Co., Ltd., and System Science Consultants, June, 2003																		
Related Projects (if any)	JICA, "Trainee Acceptance (Majuro Hospital Assistant Head Nurse, 2003)"																		
Project Background	<p>The national Majuro Hospital located in the capital city of Majuro of RMI provides primary medical care to residents in the region, while simultaneously being regarded as one of the country's core hospitals. Yet the facilities at Majuro Hospital had undergone considerable deterioration, and most of the medical equipment was still used despite having exceeded its service life. This posed a hindrance to the provision of healthcare services in response to needs. What is more, there were numerous cases where patients were transported out of country for examinations and medical treatment. For this reason, both qualitative and quantitative improvements were sought for the healthcare services provided by Majuro Hospital. Full-scale improvements to the facilities and the procurement of the necessary medical equipment were difficult due to a shortage of funds. For this reason, this project improved the facilities and equipment, focusing mainly on the Outpatient Department at Majuro Hospital.</p>																		
Project Objective	<p>The project aimed to improve healthcare services for the approximately 30,000 residents of Majuro Atoll and its surrounding regions by improving the facilities and equipment, focusing mainly on the Outpatient Department, at Majuro Hospital, which is the core hospital for Majuro Atoll and the surrounding regions.</p>																		
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	<table border="1"> <tr> <th colspan="2">Buildings</th> </tr> <tr> <td>Building -1</td> <td>RC, two-story</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Building -2, Building -3, Utility Building</td> <td>RC, one-story</td> </tr> </table>	Buildings		Building -1	RC, two-story	Building -2, Building -3, Utility Building	RC, one-story	<table border="1"> <tr> <th colspan="2">Equipment</th> </tr> <tr> <td>X-ray Dept.</td> <td>X-ray Apparatus</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Outpatient Dept.</td> <td>Ultrasound diagnostic apparatus</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Emergency Dept.</td> <td>Ventilator, operating table, Patient monitor, and Electrosurgical kit</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Dental Dept.</td> <td>Dental Unit and Dental Panoramic X-ray Unit</td> </tr> </table>		Equipment		X-ray Dept.	X-ray Apparatus	Outpatient Dept.	Ultrasound diagnostic apparatus	Emergency Dept.	Ventilator, operating table, Patient monitor, and Electrosurgical kit	Dental Dept.	Dental Unit and Dental Panoramic X-ray Unit
Buildings																			
Building -1	RC, two-story																		
Building -2, Building -3, Utility Building	RC, one-story																		
Equipment																			
X-ray Dept.	X-ray Apparatus																		
Outpatient Dept.	Ultrasound diagnostic apparatus																		
Emergency Dept.	Ventilator, operating table, Patient monitor, and Electrosurgical kit																		
Dental Dept.	Dental Unit and Dental Panoramic X-ray Unit																		

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>This project provided support for the medical sector, which has been prioritized in the development policies of RMI. As such, it is consistent with both the development policies and development needs of RMI and with Japan's ODA policy, and therefore the relevance of the project is high. Moreover, through the introduction of new medical equipment in the Outpatient Department the hospital gained the ability to perform examinations and respiratory management that it was unable to perform at the time of the planning, and improved efficiency in service and improvements in the effects were achieved by expanding the building's area. Because of this, effects were obtained largely as planned, and the efficiency, effectiveness, and impacts of the project are deemed to be high. However, sufficient information for making a determination on the sustainability of the project could not be acquired from the implementing agency, with this including information related to the maintenance structure for the medical equipment that was introduced and on securing the financial resources for the operating budget.</p> <p>In light of the evaluation result on its effectiveness and impact, this project can be evaluated to produce the sufficient outcomes.</p> <p>Since sufficient information to determine the current status of the project could not be obtained, the decision was made not to submit the recommendations to the implementing agency and JICA.</p>

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of RMI

Vision 2018, the development plan for RMI, states that the Ministry of Health will effectively use facilities, staff, and resources in order to provide high quality, effective, and efficient healthcare services to all Marshall Islanders. Additionally, the 15-Year Strategy 2001-2015 that was prepared by the Ministry of Health made aiming for the functional improvement of Majuro Hospital a goal by building facilities, installing medical equipment, and allocating the appropriate medical staff by FY2005. These development policies have remained unchanged since the time of the plan through the time of the ex-post evaluation, and the relevance with this project was high at the time of the plan and the ex-post evaluation.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of RMI

In RMI the need for medical services for the people had increased due to the deterioration in living environments and the changing lifestyles brought about by a rise in the population and urbanization. Majuro Hospital is one of two national hospitals that handle primary and secondary-level medical care, and as such it has been considered a core hospital for healthcare services in RMI. But due to a shortage of funds its facilities and medical equipment had not been upgraded, which had hindered it from providing proper medical treatment. Therefore, the improvements to the equipment at Majuro Hospital from this project were highly relevant with the development needs of RMI.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

Japan governed RMI from 1914 to 1945 as part of the South Sea Islands, and continues to have friendly relations with the country still today. Moreover, the country is closely related to the Japanese fisheries industry, and there are high expectations for Japanese ODA in terms of achieving economic independence. Moreover, "improving health and sanitation" was included as one of the five priority policy objectives set forth at the Japan-Pacific Islands Forum Summit Meeting that was held in May 2003. Since this project was held up as a specific support project in the fact sheet for this, the project is highly relevant with Japan's ODA policy.

This project has been highly relevant with the RMI's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

The outputs on the Japanese side went as planned.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

Compared to the 32 months planned, the actual total aggregate project period for the first and second stages came to 35 months, which was slightly longer than planned (109.4% of the plan). This was impacted by the delay in bringing in the necessary materials, which was caused by the withdrawal of the shipping company that had been running regular freighters.

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

Compared to the planned project cost of 995 million yen the actual project cost came to 977 million yen, which was lower than planned (98.2%).

In light of the above, the project period was longer than planned. But for the reasons mentioned above it is considered valid, and judged comprehensively its efficiency is high.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

The hospital gained the ability to perform diagnostic ultrasounds on abdominal urinary organs, respiration management via artificial respirators, and tooth alignment diagnoses via dental X-ray equipment through the introduction of equipment via this project. While the diagnostic ultrasounds on abdominal urinary organs and the tooth alignment diagnoses via dental X-ray equipment have not achieved the target values from the time of the ex-ante evaluation, it is believed that the number of patients requiring diagnosis was low.

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)

According to the implementing agency, the new construction of facilities through the project expanded space in the Laboratory Department and the Emergency Department, which made it possible to raise the efficiency and improve the effects of their services. Moreover, congestion inside the hospital was alleviated by means of newly installing a waiting corner exclusively for outpatients.

Furthermore, since medical waste, drainage, and so on are properly disposed of there is no impact on the natural environment.

The resettlement of residents and land acquisition were not deemed necessary for the implementation of this project.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

A reorganization was carried out at the implementing agency, but the majority of the management staff from the time of the project implementation remained at Majuro Hospital. What is more, according to the implementing agency there is adequate personnel in most of the sections, and so there are no problems with the operating structure.

As for the maintenance structure, according to the response to the questionnaire from the implementing agency, inspection and repair ledgers, manuals, and so on are useful for maintenance, and a structure for getting in touch with the sales agent for the introduced equipment has been set in place for when this is necessary. Yet on the other hand, it also responded to the effect that there are problems, like a shortage of repair technicians for medical equipment at Majuro Hospital, and maintenance contracts cannot be concluded with the manufacturers owing to the limited budget. It is impossible to determine whether an adequate maintenance structure has been adopted.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

According to the implementing agency, the medical equipment that was introduced does not require any special skills to be used, and so training is not provided. As for maintenance, since the repair technicians have the necessary skills, it is determined that there are no technical problems.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Inquiries were made to the implementing agency over the state of revenue and expenditures at Majuro Hospital following the implementation of the project, but adequate information could not be obtained regarding issues like the extent to which there are independent financial resources, like payments for medical services. Moreover, no response was obtained with regard to the future prospects for securing other financial resources, such as budgetary allocations from the government and financial assistance from other countries. Therefore, sustainability can not be determined for its financial aspects.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

According to the response to the questionnaire from the implementing agency, Majuro Hospital is operating according to the initial plan, and all of the equipment that was introduced is being used in an ongoing manner. Also, it was learned from the response to the questionnaire by the implementing agency that the items detected with regard to the building and equipment that were pointed out during the inspection for defects have been improved, and that routine maintenance is being carried out.

In light of the above, since the information needed for evaluations of its structural and financial aspects could not be obtained, the sustainability of the project can not be evaluated.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Keisuke Nishikawa Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for the Improvement of the Circumferential Road around Pohnpei Island in the Federated States of Micronesia	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Federated States of Micronesia	
Project Period	Phase I: January 2004-February 2005 Phase II: November 2004-December 2005	
Executing Agency	Pohnpei State Government / Pohnpei Transportation Authority (PTA)	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 940 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 904 million yen
Main Contractors	(Construction) Maeda Corporation	
Main Consultants	Katahira Engineers International	
Basic Design	March, 2003	
Related Projects (if any)	[Grant Aid Project] Local Road and Agricultural Road Network Improvement Project (1980, 1982) Road Pavement Project in Pohnpei State (1987) The Project for the Road Improvement for the State of Yap (2000-2002)	
Project Background	The circumferential road around Pohnpei Island is the only arterial road on the island, to which all other roads are connected. People and goods moving between villages all go through the circumferential road. It is an important part of the island's basic infrastructure that supports social and economic activities on the island. However, some parts of the road have not been completed. Vehicles have difficulties in running on these sections as the sections are less reliable. The unfinished parts of the road are a hindrance to safe and smooth passenger traffic and goods flow between the communities along the sections and Palikir, the capital of Micronesia, or Kolonia, the capital of the Pohnpei State, and this is one of the factors causing disparities between the regions of the island. This project broadly serves to raise living standards in the project areas for reducing disparities between communities and to promote social and economic activities on the island.	
Project Objective	Unpaved sections of 11.8 kilometers on the circumferential road around Pohnpei Island are improved to deliver safe and smooth traffic along these sections.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	Road improvements to 11.8 km of unpaved sections on the circumferential road around Pohnpei Island (Phase I: 5.1 km; Phase II: 6.7 km) • Carriageway: 6.0 m (2 lanes); Shoulder: 1.2 m (both sides) • Design speed ranges from 30 km/h to 50 km/h, depending on sections	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>In conducting this ex-post evaluation, data were gathered by sending questionnaires to the Pohnpei Transportation Authority (PTA) and receiving its responses. But adequate answers were not given to some questions and the documents or reference materials to some of its answers were not attached, which imposed some restrictions on the evaluation results. It should be noted, therefore, that this ex-post evaluation is based on limited information. Such restrictions were taken into account in carrying out the ex-post evaluation.</p> <p>This project improved the circumferential road around Pohnpei Island, which has a very important position as part of the social and economic infrastructure, and achieved smooth flows of passengers and goods. In this regard, the project was highly effective and succeeded in promoting economic activities. The construction work was completed on time and within the budget. The project, therefore, can be said to have been conducted efficiently. However, in terms of the operation and maintenance of the road, some concerns have arisen; although PTA is provided with the arrangements and skills for road operation and maintenance, the problem of insufficient budget prevents the road from being operated and maintained in an appropriate manner, causing rapid deterioration of its condition.</p> <p>In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.</p> <p><Recommendations> In terms of operation and maintenance, the Executing Agency must work with the residents in mowing the grass along the road and cleaning side ditches and drainage ways along the route. They must also consider, from the long-term perspective, how to allocate the largest possible portion of the budget to operation and maintenance purposes.</p>
1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Policy of FSM

When the plan for this project was formulated, the construction, operation and maintenance of roads was included in the public sector investment plan, which explicitly included completion of the circumferential road (improvement of its unpaved sections). The Strategic Development Plan (SDP), formulated afterwards in 2005, pointed out the development of the social infrastructure as one of its ten priority fields. In 2008, the president also mentioned that, in his state-of-the-nation address, infrastructure development was a key issue. As described above, road construction and improvement has always been positioned as a priority issue in the development policy of FSM.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of FSM

Pohnpei Island's road network had been constructed with the circumferential road as the main artery. Some parts of the road, however, had not been paved or completed, with the road surface left damaged and the shoulders eroded at an increasing number of sections along the road. At these points, vehicles were forced to slow down and had difficulties in driving safely. Both at the time the plan was formulated and at the time the ex-post evaluation was conducted, the circumferential road was important for the people on the island as a social and economic foundation. It can be said that there was a great need for this project to be carried out in order to realize safe and smooth transportation of people and goods and reduce disparities on the island.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

When the project was planned, Japan declared that for island countries in the entire Pacific area, not only for FSM, "(Japan should work to) develop the economic and social infrastructure that should serve as a foundation for their economic and social activities and help them overcome their dispersed locations and geographical isolation as island countries." Implementation of this project conforms to this policy.

This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

Outputs by Japan were generated generally as planned while there were some minor alternations.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

The project, designed to be completed in 28 months (Phase I: 14 months; Phase II: 14 months) in the original plan, and it actually finished in 28 months (14 months in each phase) as planned (100% to the plan). The Executing Agency says that the contractors in Pohnpei Island were sufficiently experienced to carry out the road construction work quite efficiently, a major factor that enabled the project to be completed on time.

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

The project, designed to cost ¥940 million in the original plan, actually cost ¥904 million, lower than the planned cost (96% of the plan).

Both project period and project cost were mostly within the plan, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

On the sections covered by the project, the average vehicle speed has risen from 20 km/h in 2002 to 40 km/h, reaching the target speed in 2008. In terms of the travel time required, the Executing Agency has no data, but a calculation based on the average speed suggests that presumably the project sections can be covered within the target time of 18 minutes.

In this project, the road surface has been raised to a higher level and the crossing drainage facilities have been improved. As a result, the road can now avoid any submersions, thus ensuring smooth traffic flows.

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)

According to the Executing Agency, the road improvement has delivered easier access to places around the island, allowing an increasing number of tourists to visit various tourist spots. They also say that agricultural and marine products can be transported more easily, which has brought about positive effects to the economic activities.

After the project, in addition, substantial dredging of coral materials is no longer needed in operation and maintenance of the road, which has reduced the environmental burden on the sea. The pavement of the road has solved the problem of surface soil being washed away, preventing muddy water from polluting the seawater in the lagoons. Debris from the road construction was appropriately disposed of at a government plant, with no environmental pollution found to have been caused by the waste.

Acquisition of the land for the project, which had been estimated to be 1,710 m², was carried out without delay and without any resettlements of the residents.

This project has largely achieved its objectives; therefore its effectiveness is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Since the project was completed, the road has been operated and maintained by the Construction Division of PTA.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

PTA's operation and maintenance staff have sufficient skills and techniques for the daily operation and maintenance work. However, training for road operation and maintenance is not offered.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Road maintenance cost 150,000 dollars in 2002. In 2008, however, without any further need to replenish roadbed materials (coral materials), except those for road shoulders, the maintenance cost fell to as low as 50,000 dollars. The target of 20,000 dollars has yet to be observed, but a significant cost reduction to one third of the expenses before the project was achieved.

However, in their answers to the questionnaires, the Executing Agency has commented that no operation and maintenance expenditure was recorded for the circumferential road in 2009 due to the lack of budget.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

The road surface was originally in good condition. But with no operation and maintenance work carried out for the road other than mowing and ditch cleaning that the local government routinely carries out, the condition is deteriorating rapidly. As the Executing Agency does not have sufficient mowing machines for servicing the road, some road edges have appeared covered with weeds.

Major problems have been observed in terms of financial aspects; therefore the sustainability of the project effects is low.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Hideyuki Takagi Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	Project on Energy Management Promotion in the Islamic Republic of Iran	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Islamic Republic of Iran			
Project Period	March 2003-March 2007			
Executing Agency	Energy Efficiency Office (EEO)/Ministry of Energy, Azerbaijan Higher Education and Research Complex (AHERC), National Training Center for Energy Management (NTCEM), Iran Energy Efficiency Agency (SABA)			
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Energy Conservation Center, Japan			
Total Cost	684 million yen			
Related Projects (if any)	Institutional Capacity Building on Energy Management in Building Sector and its Regulations (2010-2011), Project on Energy Management Promotion in the Islamic Republic of Iran F/U (Provision of Equipment) (2008-2010)			
Overall Goal	Enhancement of energy management in the industrial sector is achieved through the promotion of rational use of energy.			
Project Objective(s)	The National Training Center for Energy Management (NTCEM) contributes to the energy management of the industrial sector.			
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Policies and the related administration structures are coordinated so that the contribution of the project becomes effective. 2. The project counterparts—namely the instructors at the training center—are able to operate and maintain the training facilities and equipment. 3. Both theoretical and practical training for energy related engineers are carried out in a continuous manner. 			
	Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Iran Side)	
Experts	4 for Long term, 19 for Short term		Staff allocated	11
Equipments	144 million yen		Equipments	-
Local Cost	25 million yen		Local Cost	9.9 billion rials
Trainees Received	11		Land etc provided	Training buildings, offices for experts
Others	-		Others	-

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

This project is consistent with the Socio-Economic and Cultural Development Plan of the Islamic Republic of Iran, the country's development needs, and Japan's ODA policy; therefore, the relevance of the project is high. As for the project's inputs, since defects occurred in the mini-plant that was supplied, this had influenced the progress in the first half of the project. In addition, the number of counterpart personnel assigned on the Iranian side was slightly lower than planned, and was not sufficient for the sake of carrying out concentrated and continuous training courses. For this reason, the efficiency of the project is deemed fair. The project outputs were largely achieved. But for the one portion of the outputs of conducting training for energy related engineers, the number of times the training course was held fell short of the goal, and the goal was not reached for the number of graduates either. The target for the number of trainees from factories, which was a project objective, was largely achieved. But the number of proposals for energy efficiency measures by ex-trainees accepted at factories and the number of factories passing the financing screenings of financial institutions for energy efficiency activities were beneath the mark at the time the project completion; therefore, the effectiveness of the project is fair. Currently an adequate number of instructors have been assigned to NTCEM, and a collaborative structure has been maintained with the related organizations of EEO and SABA. However, due to institutional changes in 2009, there have come to be calls for the sustainable continuation of training activities at some of the training agencies. As a result, compensation for budget shortfalls from the government have gradually been reduced and the cost of attending the training has been raised in order to continue running the training activities. After the project completion, since the number of trainees has been steadily increasing, no immediate impact is observed. However, there can be further institutional changes. For this reason the sustainability of the project is considered to be fair.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be fairly satisfactory.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Iran

Over the project period, the Five-Year National Socio-Economic and Cultural Development Plan of the Islamic Republic of Iran (Third: 2000-2004, Fourth: 2005-2009) set forth policies for energy efficiency and for environmental conservation such as the standardization and labeling of devices, equalization of peak energy use hours, promoting the shift to non-peak energy use months for factories, saving energy at buildings, etc.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Iran

In recent years domestic energy consumption within Iran has shot up rapidly, and has reached 44% of total energy productions. In Iran, where 36% of the population is under 15 years old, the amount of oil consumed will be on an upward trend for the future. If it holds steady around the current energy consumption growth rate of 6% then preliminary calculations indicated that Iran will shift to being an energy importing country by 2018. Conversely, Iran is dependant on exports of oil products for roughly 80% of its foreign currency income. Therefore, if exports of oil cannot be guaranteed then there are fears that this will have a major impact on the domestic economy. For this reason the promotion of the efficient use of energy in the industrial sector is crucial for Iran for the sake of its ongoing economic development; therefore, this project is relevant with Iran's development needs.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

The goal of this project is to achieve ongoing development in Iran by promoting energy efficiency. It is prioritized in Japan's policies of the economic cooperation policy consultation with Iran; therefore, the project is highly relevant with Japan's ODA policy.

This project has been highly relevant with the Iran's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

In terms of the outputs indicator on implementing training for energy related engineers, the number of times the training course was implemented fell short of the objective value and the target was not reached for the number of graduates either. However, the other outputs indicators were achieved. As for the project objective of the number of trainees from the factories, which was taken as an indicator, the actual number of about 700 people largely achieved the target of 800 people. But compared to the target of 400 for the number of ex-trainees' proposals accepted by factories, the actual number was about 100. While for the number of factories with ex-trainees which succeeded to obtain loans for the energy efficiency activities, there were three in actuality compared to the target of 50. Both of these targets remained unachieved as of the time of project completion. Yet training has been conducted at the center even after the completion of the project, and initiatives for energy efficiency continue to be carried out at factories with training participants. One factor for why the project targets were not achieved is the fact that progress in the first half of the project was delayed because defects occurred in the mini-plant that was provided as part of the project's inputs. Another is that the number of counterpart personnel assigned was slightly lower than planned, and was not sufficient for carrying out concentrated and continuous training courses.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

For the "10% decrease in the targeted Specific Energy Consumption (SEC) of industrial sectors", which was the overall goal of the project, differences were observed in the average reduction rate for each industrial sector. Yet from the perspective of the targeted industrial sectors as a whole, it is believed that this was achieved in nearly 80% of the industrial sectors. But it could not be said that the contributing factors for the decrease in SEC was necessarily due to the effects from this project. It is also conceivable that the enactment of laws pertaining to SEC reduction and activities by related agencies aside from SABA also contributed to reduction.

This project has somewhat achieved its objectives; therefore its effectiveness is fair.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As was indicated in (1) in "Effectiveness / Impact," out of the input elements the defects in some of the supplied equipment and the fact that the required number of counterpart personnel were not assigned had an impact; therefore, the outputs produced by this project is fair.

(2) Project Period of Cooperation

The actual project period came to 49 months and it is the same as the 49 months; so, the project went as planned (100% of the plan).

(3) Project Cost of Cooperation

The actual project cost came to 684 million yen, while the 930 million yen was the planned cost. It was lower than planned (74% of the plan).

Some of the elements of inputs are inappropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective; therefore the efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

Policies related to energy efficiency continue to be specified in the Five-Year National Socio-Economic and Cultural Development Plan of the Islamic Republic of Iran (Fourth: 2005-2009), and its priority in a policy remains high.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

According to the response from the executive agency, at present NTCEM has secured an adequate number of instructors for implementing general course, electricity course, and heat course. Moreover, EEO, the project's executive agency, and SABA, which is the agency in charge of recruiting trainees and the external evaluation, maintain a collaborative structure. The executive agency has maintained a sustainable management structure for the training system.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

According to the response from the executive agency, the NTCEM instructors continuously implement training courses 26 times a

year, and make use of the technology for managing the courses. Moreover, changing the training contents to accommodate the progress made in energy efficiency technology has been held up as a challenge at NTCEM. Looking at the content of the request for the follow-up experts scheduled to be dispatched within FY2010 reveals that they have a clear recognition of the technology they should learn about from Japan and the technology they can learn about on their own. It is believed that they are acquiring the ability to change technology on their own somewhat. What is more, according to the response from the executive agency the NTCEM instructors have sufficient knowledge and technology when it comes to operating the mini-plant, but the claim could not be made that their technical level is adequate for its operation and maintenance. The desire is that the maintenance technology will be improved for the sake of improving the sustainability of the counterpart's technology.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

As for the budget required to manage the courses, until 2009 the Ministry of Energy allocated a budget sufficient for this. But there were institutional changes and calls for AHREC to carry out independent course management, and so currently government compensation such as in the form of subsidies is gradually being reduced. Because of this, according to the responses to the questionnaire the portion by which the government compensation has been reduced is being borne by the trainees. NTCEM is not exceptional. Therefore, even if there are no problems with the sustainability of AHREC's financial affairs, in the future the further understanding of the factories, which are also beneficiaries, will be necessary in order to increase the number of trainees as has been done so far.

In addition, in cooperation with the Ministry of Petroleum the Ministry of Energy has started training via the budget of the Ministry of Petroleum aimed at organizations affiliated with the Ministry of Petroleum. The operation of this training is continuing through this sort of cooperation between government ministries and agencies.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

After the completion of the project, 346 trainees were trained through the 24 training sessions that were held from April 2007 to March 2008, 738 trainees were trained through the 27 training sessions that were held from April 2008 to March 2009, and 554 trainees were trained through the 27 training sessions that were held from April 2009 to March 2010, respectively. As such, it was confirmed that the project outputs are steadily expanding even after the completion of the project. As this shows, even after the completion of the project, the "number of trainees from the factories" is on the rise, and the project effects related to implementing training are on course to continue. But that is not to say that there are no concerns over the aforementioned problem with the counterpart's technical status and the future trends in the number of trainees. Furthermore, the target values at the time of project completion were not necessarily reached for indicators measuring effects other than the increase in the number of trainees as of the ex-post evaluation. Taking this into account, it is not being claimed that there are no problems with the sustainability of the future effects.

In light of the above, some minor problems have been observed in the technical and financial aspects of the counterpart; therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is fair.

【Comments from Ministry of Energy】

1. As for 3. *Efficiency*, the scientific board consists of fewer members compared to the agreed number. However, in the past 6 years the instructors managed to train more participants than expected even though there were laboratory problems and the anticipation of dispatch of expert of Japan to fix the problems.
2. As for 4. *Sustainability (4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency*, participation of the trainees in paying expenses related to the training courses contributed to higher motivations and the center's self-sufficiency. Despite the 25% payment of the training courses expenditure covered by the participants, the number of applications for the course increased, which indicates the personnel's high interest in participating in the courses. The Ministry of Energy's support and the improvement of the center's performance before and after the project termination indicate the stability of the training courses in the future.
3. As for 4. *Sustainability (5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact*, according to the agreement between Ministry of Energy and JICA regarding the exploitation of the NTCEM, it was decided to instruct 1600 managers before 20th of March 2009 but 1760 Industry energy managers were trained and 2675 of energy managers and Energy Services Companies agents were trained until 5th of December, 2010. It proves the success of the center in providing a time table and conducting specialized and non-specialized training courses.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Hideyuki Takagi Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project on the Improvement of Audio-Visual Aids and Instruction Methods in Vocational Training at the Instructor Training Center	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Islamic Republic of Iran			
Project Period	June 1, 2002-May 31, 2005			
Executing Agency	Technical and Vocational Training Organization (TVTO) of the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA)			
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Health, Labor and Welfare; Employment and Human Resources Development Organization of Japan			
Total Cost	471 million yen			
Related Projects (if any)	Iran "Project for Enhancement of Vocational Training Administration" (July 2007-December 2010)			
Overall Goal	High-quality training is conducted at the Technical and Vocational Training Centers (TVTCs).			
Project Objective(s)	The standards of the Instructor Training Center (ITC) are improved in terms of the production of audio-visual aids and instruction methods for vocational training.			
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The equipment necessary for the development, production and use of audio-visual aids is introduced into ITC; and the staff of ITC gains the ability to maintain and continuously use the equipment. 2. ITC gains the ability to develop and produce video aids using the adequate video equipment. 3. ITC gains the capacity to manage the instructors' training courses on production of audio-visual aids and instruction methods. 			
	Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Iran Side)	
Experts	4 for Long term, 6 for Short term		Staff allocated	14
Equipments	146 million yen		Equipments	-
Local Cost	15 million yen		Local Cost	607 thousand US dollar
Trainees Received	12		Land etc provided	Offices and commuting cars for experts, and warehouses for the equipment provided, etc.
Others	-		Others	-

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>The project was carried out generally as planned. Expected outputs such as implementation of training at ITC concerning the production of audio-visual aids and instruction methods, and technical acquisition by ITC were achieved. Even after the project completion, TVTC instructors who participated in training at ITC have maintained a high pass rate of the completion-of-course examinations. As recommended in terminal evaluation, TVTC instructors have provided similar training to instructors at private training institutions so that a partnership with them could be strengthened. On the other hand, partly due to delays in adopting candidates for new instructors, the number of participants of instructor's training courses was significantly lower than planned, suggesting that the effect of the project was limited.</p> <p>In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.</p>

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Iran

During the project period, the Iran National Five-year Plan for the Development of the Economy, Society and Culture (Third: 2000-2004; Fourth: 2005-2009), placed a high priority on vocational training and human resources development and explicitly stated the roles that TVTCs and ITC should play.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Iran

During the project period, the unemployment rate in Iran was more than 10% on average: it fluctuated between 14% before the project and 11% at the end of the project. In this context, in order to respond to the problem of unemployment among young people and the sophistication of industry, TVTC was required to offer more sophisticated vocational training and job education to meet the needs for training. As a result, these issues became recognized as issues to be solved: the renewal and improvement in the training equipment, the development of audio-visual aids and other training materials, and capacity development of the instructors.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

In 1999 Japan and Iran agreed in their economic cooperation policy talks to position vocational training as a key aid area. Since then this issue has been carried in JICA's basic policy.

This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

In this project, improvement in training concerning audio-visual aids production and instruction methods was achieved. It was recognized that the participants had acquired some techniques for the production of audio-visual aids for vocational training, such as production and editing and scenario-writing for audio-visual teaching materials. The number of instructors trained in the project was significantly lower than planned and 1,149 instructors at the time of terminal evaluation had been trained. This was mainly due to delays in adopting trainees as new instructors. The TVTC instructors who received training at ITC have achieved a high pass rate of the completion-of-course examinations; therefore, the instructor training has largely accomplished the objective of the project in term of quality of training. However, such outputs were attributed in part to the leadership of experts from Japan. Thus, further efforts by the counterpart are still needed.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

TVTCs still use the audio-visual aids that they produced in this project for vocational training. However, responses from the counterpart to the questionnaire suggest that the provision of high-quality vocational training has not been achieved because the level of participants' understanding and knowledge is below expectation. In this regard, the attainment level of the overall goal of the project is fair at best. As for positive indirect effects of the project, instructor training was provided by the TVTCs instructors to instructors of private training institutions. In addition, to make use of results accomplished in this project, ITC now provides Afghanistan with support for vocational training there through JICA.

This project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As stated above in (1) of "Effectiveness / Impact", this project produced outputs generally as planned.

(2) Elements of Inputs

Inputs of this project are as stated above in the "Project Outline." During the project period, a delay of several months occurred in equipment procurement, and so did another delay in the assignment of two counterpart personnel. However, outputs had been accomplished by the time of project completion. In the terminal evaluation, it was concluded that, except for the delays mentioned above, activities were carried out in an efficient manner in line with the PDM, suggesting that the delays had no impact on production of the outputs.

(3) Project Period of Cooperation

The project, designed to be completed in 36 months in the plan, actually finished in 36 months just as planned (ratio of 100% to the plan).

(4) Project Cost of Cooperation

The project, designed to cost 440 million yen in the plan, actually cost 471 million yen, slightly higher than planned (ratio of 107% to the plan). However, compared to technical cooperation projects whose content and target area are similar to this project, the project cost is judged appropriate for producing outputs; therefore, it is thought that there is no particular problem.

The inputs are appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

The Iran National Five-year Plan for the Development of the Economy, Society and Culture (Fourth: 2005-2009) explicitly refers to vocational training policies just as the preceding five-year plan did. That is, high priority on vocational training has been given among the country's policies.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

The counterpart has played the same role as it did during the project period. However, the number of its staff members decreased from 14 to 8 (decline rate is approximately 43%) as some resigned or were transferred. Thus, the counterpart does not seem to have sufficient personnel to continue offering instructor training.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

The counterpart still continues video program production through the use of audio-visual equipment introduced in this project, and the maintenance and inspection of the equipment. The level of instruction techniques is also maintained. According to a report from

the counterpart, some improvements in the training courses were made.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

According to a report from the counterpart, the government budget has been secured to maintain instructor training at ITC and vocational training at TVTC; thus there seems to be no financial problem.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

Even after the project completion, the TVTC instructors who participated in training at ITC have maintained a high pass rate of the completion-of-course examinations. On the other hand, as stated above in (2) of "Effectiveness / Impact", the scale of instructor training at ITC is still below the level expected at the beginning of the project.

Some minor problems have been observed in the structural aspects of the executing agency; therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is fair.

[Comments from ITC]

1. As for 4. Sustainability (2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency, although six counterpart personnel of the project in Audio-visual department have moved to another positions, but at the moment, two full time official instructors as well as three contract-based instructors are doing training activities. Both AV and pedagogy departments are the most active departments of ITC both in video aids production and teaching methods.
2. As for 4. Sustainability (5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact, after terminating the project, training courses were conducted for 600 newly employed public instructors and 1500 newly employed private instructors from all over the country. These training courses continue for instructors. Thus, referring the conducted evaluation, we believe the project had sufficient effectiveness.

