Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Keiko Asato Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	Project for Improvement of Medical Equipment for Sir. J.J. Hospital and Cama & Albless Hospital in India	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	India	
Project Period	August 2003-February 2005	
Implementing Agency	Maharashtra State Government	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 759 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 736 million yen
Main Contractors	(Package 1) Ogawa Seiki Co., Ltd. (Package 2) Mitsubishi Corporation	
Main Consultants	Binko Ltd.	
Basic Design	"Basic Design Study Report of the Project for Improvement of Medical Equipment for Sir J.J. Hospital and Cama & Albless Hospital in India", Japan International Cooperation Agency and Binko Ltd., March 2003	
Related Projects (if any)	None	
Project Background	The government of India and the Maharashtra State Government put made strengthening medical service delivery and improving maternal and child health/medical service a high priority. Sir J.J. Hospital (hereinafter referred to as SJJ) and Cama & Albless Hospital (hereinafter referred to as CA) provide patients in Mumbai city and its neighboring rural and poor areas with primary, secondary and tertiary level medical services. In addition to providing these services, they also offer professional education to medical students. However, necessary medical equipment to deliver medical services and for education are lacking. Moreover, improving the deteriorating quality of medical services is considered necessary.	
Project Objective	To renovate and replenish the basic and indispensable medical equipment to SJJ and CA related to the maternal and child care and hospital management in order to improve the quality of heal/medical service delivered at these hospitals.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	1. To provide SJJ with the medical equipment related to faculty of obstetrics and gynecology, pediatrics, cerebral surgery and others. 2. To provide CA with the medical equipment related to faculty of obstetrics and gynecology, pediatrics, radiology and others.	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

SJJ and CA provide patients in Mumbai city and the surrounding rural and poor neighborhoods with primary, secondary and tertiary medical services. This project's aims were to improve the quality of health/medical services by providing them with necessary health/medical equipment related to the hospital management and maternal and child health/medical care. The equipment was delivered as planned, but the expected direct impacts, including the number of patients, laboratory examinations, and baby deliveries have not been achieved. However, some indicators, such as bed occupancy rates and hospitalized patients at SJJ, have increased since procurement of equipment.

At the same time, this project intended to establish an information management system in conjunction with agents contracted for the outsourcing of the periodical maintenance and repair of the hospital's operational and managerial equipment. For example, medical staff was responsible for daily inspections and the task of administering the information collected through these daily activities was assigned to special professional sections, the Hospital Equipment Repair Unit (hereinafter referred to as HERU) and the Medical Equipment Management Representative (hereinafter referred to as MEMR). Specialized HERU and MEMR staff was seconded by private companies, stationed in the hospital. HERU and MEMR were responsible for the equipment's maintenance and repair contract with an outsourcing agent, and in case that some equipment was difficult to be repaired in hospital, it was contracted-out to be repaired to the agent. However, maintenance and repair contracts with these agents were not extended after 2006 and malfunctioning equipment has been left without repair. Moreover, the contracts with HERU and MEMR expired in January 2009 and they were not renewed. Tasks previously handled by HERU and MEMR were transferred to the procurement sections at SJJ and CA.

However the procurement sections do not have specialists for medical equipment maintenance such as HERU and MEMR and the tasks that they can cover are technically quite limited. The Project's aim to establish an overall equipment maintenance and repair system cannot be fulfilled. Meanwhile, some contracts, suspended since 2006, have been restarted for some advanced equipment. Also. although general budgets at both hospitals have been increasing every year, they are still insufficient to properly operate and maintain the equipment.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be fairly satisfactory.

<Recommendations to the hospitals >

1) It is desirable that the information grasped by the directors of each faculty and head nurses are shared with the procurement section, or technically competent staff assigned to the procurement section, so that the said section can manage the medical equipment's operation status and repair contract for technical issues.

2) The maintenance and repair of advanced medical equipment requires special techniques. In case a hospital does not have staff with the required capabilities, maintaining a contract with a special agent who can properly handle such equipment is desirable. Budgetary allocation for such contracts is also indispensable in this case.
3) Some simple equipment can be repaired with spare parts which are obtained locally and the parts do not necessarily have to be genuine parts. It is recommended that appropriate judgment for repairs should be made, and whenever possible equipment should be repaired using lower cost solutions.

<Recommendations to JICA>
1) According to SJJ medical staff, SJJ and CA are requested to provide poor people with primary and secondary medical care, as well as qualified tertiary medical service. Especially in India, which developed economically in a short period, the difference in the roles of public and private hospitals should be clarified and proper targets/indicators should be set based on these roles. (In the case of this project, indicators, such as the increase/decrease in the number of poor patients, the ratio of poor patients among the total number of patients, the expansion of available treatment enabled by the new equipment, might be more appropriate than the general number of patients as an indicators, to see the comprehensive impact of this project.)
2) In case of providing hospitals with advanced equipment which might require a certain amount of maintenance cost, we should carefully examine the sustainability (structural, budgetary and technical) of the counterpart, and scrutinize the appropriateness of the project and also the selection of necessary and appropriate equipment.

<Constraints for the evaluation>
This ex-post evaluation was conducted based on limited information obtained from JICA's internal report, and from the results of JICA surveys because we could not collect the answers to the questionnaires from the implementing agencies.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of India
According to "Tenth Five Year Plan 2002-2007", improving the health condition of the people through better access to health/medical service is a priority issue. The "Eleventh Five Year Plan 2007-2012" also highlights the importance of strengthening the health and medical sector. The latter plan, in particular, places importance on improving access to medical service for women and children. In order to achieve these objectives, this plan raises the need to enhance capacity to delivery public health services, improve hospitals and clinics, and also improve maternal mortality rates (hereinafter referred to as MMR), neonatal mortality rates and total fertility rates.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Afghanistan
Mumbai, the State capital of Maharashutra, is as big as Deli: the nation's capital. Mumbai; however, lags behind Deli in health/medical indicators, such as MMR and neonatal mortality rates (MMR: 180 (Deli: 160), neonatal mortality rates: 49 (Deli: 36)). In this state, they are currently pushing through "Reproductive Health and Child Health Project II" (including Family Welfare Program), trying to decrease MMR to 100 (180 in 2003), and neonatal mortality rates to 27 (49 in 2003). As a part of this effort, the Hospital Service Project aims to improve the quality of secondary health/medical services by improving the referral system from primary care through to tertiary care.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy
JICA's Country Assistant Programme for India 2004 reported that the political dialogue mission in March 2002 listed four areas, including health and medical sector, as Japanese target cooperation areas.

In light of the above, this project has been highly relevant with India's development plan and development needs, and also with Japan's ODA policy. Therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs
The outputs by Japan were achieved as planned. The technical training for the operation and maintenance was also conducted as planned.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)
The project period lasted 19 months, slightly longer (112 %) than the planned 17 months. Custom clearance for some equipment took 3 months longer than expected, but by adjusting the technical training schedule, the loss in time was shortened to 2 months.

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)
The actual project cost was 736 million yen, 97 % lower than the planned 759 million yen. Appropriate competitive bidding helped keep procurement within the planned budget.

Although the project period was slightly longer than planned, the project cost was lower than planned. Therefore efficiency of the Project is fair.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

Even the expected quantitative indicators at SJJ and CA, such as the number of patients, laboratory examinations, baby deliveries, bed occupancy rates and hospitalized patients (the last two indicators are applied only to CA) at the time of post-ex evaluation in 2009, were less than those at the time of planning (2003), some indicators such as bed occupancy rates and hospitalized patients at SJJ have increased after installment of the equipment by this project. Although we could not obtain the reason for this unexpected situation, the information offered by JICA suggested that one possible reason for the declines may have been that patients chose to go to private hospitals.

(2) Impacts

The achievement level of the expected indicators of the impacts (MMR and infant mortality rate (hereinafter referred to as IMR) in Mumbai city and other neighboring areas, and the opportunity for training offered to medical student at Grant Medical University) is not clear. According to comments provided by hospital medical staff, some unexpected effects caused by the introduction of new medical equipment included; shortening the time it takes both hospitals for operations as well as the time patients needed to be hospitalized (reducing the physical burden on patients); and the ability to respond to some diseases which were beyond their capacity before (due to better sterilization).

In light with above, this project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

This project planned to develop a system for the entire operation and maintenance of equipment. The system would combine, "establishing the mechanism of daily inspection and measures for repair in the hospital" with "outsourcing contracts for maintenance and repair with an agent". For the first target, the Project's technical training tried to establish a process for 1) daily inspection of medical equipment by medical staff, 2) reporting malfunctioning equipment through inspection, 3) judging whether or not equipment reported as needing repair does indeed need repair, 4) requesting outside agent for repairs, and 5) monthly reporting of the status of the operation and maintenance of the equipment from MEMR to the director of hospital. For the process to work properly, the said training made clear task assignments for each position and standardized formats to record and to convey information such as the result of inspections. These processes were introduced for 5 months as a trial at the faculty of pediatrics and cerebral surgery. After this trial clarified some challenges, manuals were prepared showing the operation and maintenance system, and work was assigned to the maintenance section of the medical section and the general/financial section.

Elaborate technical training enables the staff at the hospitals to prioritize the equipment to be repaired, and (according to information offered by JICA) the life span of the equipment has also been extended by activities such as the daily inspection by medical staff and sharing the result of inspection. Meanwhile, since 2006, the director of the hospital decided not to renew the maintenance and repair contract with agent. Even though the hospital established an information sharing system, this change in direction has made it difficult to repair malfunctioning equipment and as a result, equipment has been left out of order. In January 2009, the contract with private company assigned by HERU and MEMR, to technically assess the necessity of repair ended and was not renewed. Their task was transferred to SJJ and CA procurement sections. However, the procurement sections have limited technical capacity to grasp the condition of medical equipment. Therefore, only the directors of the faculty and head nurses understand the maintenance and repair status of the equipment, such as the placement of the equipment, and the history of repair. However, after the completion of the contracts with HERU and MEMR, a maintenance contract for a limited number of equipment was partially restarted, which includes a twice a year inspection service and a 24 hour technical support service for malfunctioning equipment.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

SJJ and CA do have some technical staff for operation and maintenance (handling tasks such as furniture repair), but they are not capable of repairing medical equipment with complicated electronic systems. And since the outsourcing contract with agent ended in 2006, some equipment has been left without technical support because some agents have already retreated from Mumbai, and in some cases agents assigned the work to other agents without informing SJJ or CA.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

The budget secured for fiscal year 2009/10 is 18.81 million Rupees, which is much greater than the 1.64 million Rupees estimated for necessary costs at the time of planning. However, according to the information offered by JICA, expenditure is also drastically increasing, therefore the budget for the operation and maintenance of the equipment are insufficient. In 2009, the Government provided 1,200 million Rupees, but budgeted amounts were prohibited for being used for operation and maintenance. This additional income; therefore, could not be applied to cover their budget shortage and as a result equipment was left malfunctioning.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

We could obtain only limited information about the current status of operation maintenance of the equipment. According the information offered by JICA, in February 2010, the operation condition of major equipment at the 7 faculties out of all 13 faculties with FOB values of more than 1 million were checked, and among them, it was found that at SJJ, 13 out of 103 pieces of equipment, and 9 out of 18 pieces of equipment at CA were out of order or not in use. Moreover, among the major pieces of equipment whose operation status could be observed at the time of this ex-post evaluation, among the 8 out of 18 species of equipment at SJJ, and 3 out of 12 species of equipment at CA, we found equipments not functioning. The equipment inventory recorded notes such as, "asking for repair" or "inquiring agent for repair", and the malfunctioning equipment has not yet been repaired. This situation was brought about after the contract with agent for their technical maintenance and repair ended. Although SJJ and CA kept the section of HERU, MEMR

and other technical staff for operation and maintenance until January 2009, none of them are technical professionals who can repair equipment, such as highly advanced medical equipment. Without outside technical support, the equipment was left unrepaired. Meanwhile, no action was taken to repair some simple equipment, which was "out of order" or not in use and which could have been repaired by obtaining alternative (non-genuine) local spare parts but were instead left unused (including anesthesia apparatus, infant warmer, and operation lights).

In light with above, major problems have been observed in terms of structural, technical, and financial aspects, meanwhile the mechanism to identify the condition of equipment and to share the result for further action in the hospital has been established; therefore, sustainability of the Project effect is fair.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Hideyuki Takagi Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Enhancement of the Civilian Police	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of Indonesia	
Project Period	September 2004-January 2006	
Executing Agency	The Indonesian National Police : INP	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 518 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 512 million yen
Main Contractors	(Procurement) Sumitomo Corporation	
Main Consultants	Yachiyo Engineering Co., Ltd.	
Basic Design	July 2004	
Related Projects (if any)	Program for Supporting Reform of the Indonesian National Police (2001) Civil Police Activities Promotion Project (Phase I: 2002-2007, Phase 2: 2007-2012)	
Project Background	The Indonesian armed forces had taken responsibility for public order in Indonesia over the past 30 years. But amidst the country's trend toward democratization, the Indonesian National Police (INP) were officially detached and made independent from the Indonesian armed forces by a resolution of the People's Consultative Assembly in August 2000, and was entrusted with the responsibility for public order. Since then police reforms have been promoted, but there are still demands for constitutional reform of the INP for promoting democratization and the transition to the civilian police in consideration of the actual police activities and the awareness of the police officers. For meeting such needs, Japan was requested to provide targeted police stations with the equipment and materials required for police activities.	
Project Objective	The objective of this project is to contribute to the promotion of civilian police activities by providing related police stations in Indonesia with radio communication equipment, criminal identification equipment, and simple drug identification equipment.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	(1) Provision of equipment for a radio communication system (construction of a radio communication system within the Bekasi Resort Police station, equipment needed to install a radio relay station in order to build a communications command system between the Jakarta Metropolitan Police and the Bekasi Resort Police Station) (2) Provision of onsite criminal identification equipment (photo developing and printing machines to the Jakarta Metropolitan Police and onsite criminal identification sets to the three copying pilot stations (Chimahi, Kendal, and Sidoarjo) (3) Provision of simple drug identification equipment (simple drug identification kits, sample drug testing sets, and small radio systems for searches for INP Headquarters, the Jakarta Metropolitan Police, and provincial police headquarters in eight provinces with jurisdiction over nine priority drug enforcement sites)	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

This project has been consistent with the Indonesian National Development Plan (PROPENAS), which advocated for the promotion of democratic police administration services and the continuation of police reforms, as well as with Indonesia's development needs and Japan's ODA policy; therefore the relevance of the project is high. Since the provision of equipment and materials was carried out as planned, the expected outputs of installing a radio communication network and deploying identification equipment were largely achieved. Although after the completion of the project there were reports of problems with dead zones with radio communication, this was properly handled through a survey conducted by consultants dispatched from Japan and a technical cooperation project implemented afterward by JICA. On the other hand, according to the results of surveys of the citizens in the target area, improvements such as elevating police performance and improving public order in the area since the project completion were not recognized. Therefore, the effectiveness of the project can be thought to be fair. In terms of sustainability, it was impossible to evaluate in the ex-post evaluation study since information related to the current operation and maintenance status of the furnished equipment could not be acquired.

In light of the evaluation result on its effectiveness and impact, this project can be evaluated to produce fairly sufficient outcomes.

<Constraints of this evaluation study>
Since no response was received from the questionnaire to the executing agency, analysis was based on information from JICA and the results of interviews with the contractors as the primary sources of information.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Policy of the Republic of Indonesia

In order to establish a country governed by the rule of law, policies related to police reform were implemented. A new police law was

promulgated in PROPENAS (2000-2004) at the time of project commencement. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, PROPENAS (2004-2009) was aiming to realize just and democratic Indonesia, while in PROPENAS (2000-2004) it was deemed that reinforcement of the democratic police administration was necessary.
(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of the Republic of Indonesia
As police reforms were promoted, there were demands that democratic police administration services be provided by the national police. Moreover, they have been required to assure domestic stability and security as the public order situation was still marked by a high incidence of crime. Therefore, this project is relevant with Indonesia's development needs.
(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy
Japan's Country Assistance Program for Indonesia (2004) upheld "the creation of a democratic and fair society" as one of its three priority areas. The Program also specified providing more proactive support for "police reform," which was indicated therein under governance reforms.

This project has been highly relevant with Indonesia's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs
The outputs on the Japanese side are listed in "Project Outline." The equipment was provided as planned.
(2) Project Period
The actual project period came to 17 months, while 14 months were planned period. It was slightly longer than planned (121% of the plan).
(3) Project Cost
The actual project cost came to 512 million yen, while 518 million yen was planned cost. It was lower than planned (99% of the plan).

Although the project cost was lower than planned, the project period was slightly longer than planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects
Goals and their target value were: for the creation of the radio communication network, the umber of police officers who are able to be contacted at any time is increased from 161 to 664; and the umber of patrol cars of which their locations are identifiable is increased from 23 to 109. For the deployment of identification sets, the following were set as goals: the Jakarta Metropolitan Police becomes able to develop and print color photographs; the the number of police stations where onsite criminal identification equipment is distributed is increased from 2 to 5; and the number of provincial/regional police headquarters and police stations where simple drug identification sets are used is increased from 27 to 207. Since the provision of equipment and materials was carried out as planned, it was surmised that these goals have been largely achieved though indicators such as the number of police officers were unverified in the ex-post evaluation study. What is more, after the completion of the project there were reports of problems with dead zones with the radio communication, but this was properly handled through a survey conducted by Japanese consultants, as well as the installation of antennas in police boxes through the implementation of the Civil Police Activities Promotion Project, a JICA's technical cooperation project.
(2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)
At the time of the ex-ante evaluation it was expected that the project would enable the police to rapidly response to reports from citizens by utilizing the radio communication system in the Bekasi Resort Police Station. But according to the results of interview surveys regarding police reform with the citizen in targeted area where the Bekasi Resort Police Station covered, they did not recognize any significant improvements with regard to elevating the performance of this police station or any accompanying improvements in public order in the region around the time of the installation of the radio communication system in said police station.
Due to the limitations in the evaluation study methodology, there was insufficient information for evaluating effectiveness and impact of this project. Since the provision of equipment and materials was carried out as planned, it was surmised that to a certain degree effects have been generated.

Therefore, the effectiveness of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance
Since no response was received to the questionnaire from the implementing agency, the structural aspects of operation maintenance could not be verified.
(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance
Since no response was received to the questionnaire from the implementing agency, the technical aspects of operation maintenance could not be verified.
(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance
Since no response was received to the questionnaire from the implementing agency, the financial aspects of operation maintenance could not be verified.
(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance
Since no response was received to the questionnaire from the implementing agency, the current status of operation maintenance could not be verified.

Due to the limitations of information, sustainability of this project cannot be evaluated.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Masaaki Shiraishi Waseda Research Institute Corporation (WRI)	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Supply of Road Construction and Maintenance Equipment (Phase II)	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	The Republic of Uzbekistan	
Project Period	January 2005-February 2006	
Executing agency	State Joint Stock Company UZAVTOYUL	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 976 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 893 million yen
Main Contractors	ITOCHU Corporation	
Main Consultants	Construction Project Consultants, Inc.	
Basic Design	October 2004	
Related Projects (if any)	None	
Project Background	After achieving independence from the USSR in 1991, the Republic of Uzbekistan emerged as a landlocked country where at least two national borders must be crossed to reach the sea. Therefore, it was determined that land routes should be improved and expanded for the economic development of Uzbekistan. However, the transition to a market economy caused an increase of traffic volume, bringing about damage to roads. Effective and efficient maintenance of roads is crucial for smooth distribution of goods in the market. UZAVTOYUL, an authorized government agency which is in charge of the road transport sector, considers it urgent to improve performance, and gives priority to renewal of construction machinery. At the request of the government of Uzbekistan, the Japanese government agreed with Uzbekistan government to grant assistance for purchase of such requirement.	
Project Objective	To provide road construction equipment in order to improve conditions for transportation and physical distribution on 378km of national trunk road from Samarkand to Termez.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	- Motor Grader 150 HP - Dump Truck 10 ton - Asphalt Hand Sprayer 400L - Roller >6.5 ton - Pneumatic Roller >8.5 ton - Pick-up Truck >5 person - Water Tank Truck 8,000L - Multi Purpose Truck - Road Line Marker	- Asphalt Finisher width 2.5-4.5m - Asphalt Distributor 4.5m(w), 6,000L - Trailer Truck 30 ton - Road Planer 0.5-1.0m(w) 160mm(d) - Mobile Testing Lab (soil, asphalt) - Mobile Workshop (crane, DG, welder) - Excavator 0.8 m3 bucket - Wheel Loader 2.5 m3 bucket - Truck Crane 25 ton - Air Compressor >7 m3 - Tamper 70 – 75kg - Hand Guide Roller 700kg min.

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

This project conforms to the social development policy and needs of the Armenia and Japan's ODA policy as well. The project has been implemented nearly as planned. In its effectiveness aspect, however, a deficiency in achievement of expected outcome has been identified due to an unknown cause of difference in understanding on the "planned schedule". For the rest of relevant points, operation and maintenance of the project has been consistently performed, and though there are some unclear points of financial sustainability, in matters of budget allocation, in relation with the above "difference in understanding", they are considered to be irrelevant as a financial issue.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of the Uzbekistan

At the time of project planning, the targeted trunk road from Samarkand to Termez had been designated as one of the thirteen major projects under the National Road Improvement and Rehabilitation Plan, and therefore it had conformed to the national policy of the Uzbekistan. In the time of post-evaluation, it conforms to Presidential Decree PP-1103 (April, 2009), On Measures to Reconstruct and Develop Uzbekistan National Highways for 2009~2014, and therefore this project conforms to Uzbekistan's policies since 2004 throughout the project period and present.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of the Uzbekistan

At the time of project planning, there had been number of needs for rehabilitation of the trunk roads such as deterioration of road surface and aging of maintenance equipment due to increase of heavy cargo transportation and volume of cargoes which are accelerated by development of market economy, and needs for renewal of road maintenance equipment. At the time of post-evaluation, there are growing needs for trade promotion, rural development, improvement of regional public services, political needs for formation of regional common market, and needs for cross boarder logistics through Afghanistan. Therefore, relevance of this project with needs of Uzbekistan is very high.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

At the time of project planning, Japan's ODA policy for the countries in the Central Asia and Caucasus region emphasized the fields of economic management, communication, healthcare and transport infrastructure that contribute to socio-economic stabilization of the Central Asia (ODA White Paper 2004). Further, considering the geographical importance of Uzbekistan in the Central Asia, the Japanese government has intended to assist indigenous needs of Uzbekistan that, from the viewpoint of the contribution to promote mutual cooperation among the countries of Central Asia. Renewal and Improvement of Economic Infrastructures (Transportation and Energy)" was one of three priority areas (Country-wise Data Book – 2005, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs). This project thus precisely conforms to one of the above priority areas.

This project has been highly relevant to Uzbekistan's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, and therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

Despite slight changes, outputs by the Japanese side have been attained essentially as planned.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

The project implementation period of 13 months has been attained as planned. (100.0%)

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

The actual project cost of 893 million Japanese yen was lower than planned budget of 976 million Japanese yen. (90.1%)

Both project period and project cost were within the plan, and therefore efficiency of the project is high.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

The target outcome of the project had been defined as 328km of the total distance of 378km of the highway from Samarkand to Termez. The total construction period had been estimated as five years after delivery of construction equipment under the project. According to answers to our questionnaire, however, actual construction accomplished has been only 246km as of the time of post-evaluation (i.e., 2010). Details of said actual performance have been; 20km in 2006, 100km in 2007, 30km in 2008, 5km in 2009, and 90km in 2010, respectively. Despite the discrepancy, the implementation agency in Uzbekistan has reported that performance has been as planned. However, it has not examined the reason for the different understanding on the target outcome. Based on the target distance given in the Basic Design Study, achievement rate of actual performance by the implementation agency is 75%. Unfortunately, however, as no annual figures for the target outcome or breakdown of total distance of 328km were given in the Basic Design Study, achievement of outcome cannot be evaluated.

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the Natural Environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)

According to the reply from the implementation agency, by implementation of the project, strengthening of transportation capacity, improvement in safety and reliability of road transportation, and improvement of road conditions have been realized. As specific impact by the project there have been increases in traffic speed and cargo transported, and a sharp increase in passenger transportation, a decrease in traffic accidents, and a decrease in vehicle body damage. Further, as environmental impact, the socio-economic environment of the area along the highway has been improved, though no numerical evidence of this has been obtained. No negative impacts due to destruction of nature, land expropriation, relocation of inhabitants, etc. have been occurred.

This project has somewhat achieved its objectives, and therefore its effectiveness is fair.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

The State Joint Stock Company UZAVTOYUL is a state organization. The number of staff members assigned to the project area covered the three states was 5,626 (as of November, 2003) including 1,333 engineers and technicians. This organization was reformed in 2006 under Presidential Resolution No. PP-551, On Measure to Improve the Organizational Structure of the State Joint Stock Company "UZAVTOYUL", however, reportedly the overall structure and management system is not changed significantly.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

According to the implementation agency, they are very confident in technical operation and maintenance of the project, and there are no overt technical issues at all. No information for preparation of operation and maintenance manuals and/or training performance was provided. The implementation agency procures spare parts for equipment in August every year. Further, the implementation agency says that they share their experience in road construction and repairs and maintenance under the project. In the context of the above, nonattainment of the targeted outcome is considered to be not attributable to technical reasons.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

All of construction, maintenance and restoration of the roads performed by the JSC UZAVTOYUL is implemented under the plan and budget of the Republican Road Fund, and therefore, the budget for maintenance and renewal of construction equipment is also considered to be included in the governmental budget. However, no answer to the question about financial statements was provided, and details of the operation and maintenance budget for the equipment under this project is unknown, though they stated that reserves for future renewal of the equipment are being maintained. Nevertheless, since the JSC UZAVTOYUL is a government owned corporation, no particular financial constraints are considered to exist.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

Despite the planned rehabilitation of 328km trunk road between Samarkand and Termez using construction equipment supplied under the project, 25% (82km) of road is incomplete. Nevertheless, the implementation agency has responded that the project is completed as planned. The cause of this discrepancy is not known.

No major problems have been observed in terms of operation and maintenance system, therefore sustainability of the project effects is high.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Miho Kawahatsu Waseda Research Institute Corporation (WRI)	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Construction of Primary Schools in Phnom Penh in the Kingdom of Cambodia	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	The Kingdom of Cambodia	
Project Period	June 2004-October 2005	
Executing Agency	The Education Youth and Sport and Sport Service of Phnom Penh Municipality	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 509 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 493 million yen
Main Contractors	Taisei Corporation	
Main Consultants	System Science Consultants Inc.	
Basic Design	July 2004	
Related Projects (if any)	N.A	
Project Background	The Government of Cambodia adopted the Education Strategic Plan (ESP) and the Education Sector Support Program (ESSP) to assure equitable access to education services by reducing classroom shortages. However, due to rapid population growth as well as a shortage of budgetary funds allocated to the education sector, the construction of school facilities was lagging, especially in Phnom Penh. Most primary schools with excessive number of students have had to conduct either double-shift or triple-shift classes. Also, many of those schools have been obliged to use either temporary or badly damaged classrooms, hampering efforts to provide equitable access. In light of the above, the Government of Cambodia requested grant-aid assistance from the Government of Japan for the construction of primary school buildings in Phnom Penh.	
Project Objective	To reconstruct and expand school buildings of existing schools, in order to improve the educational environment of primary education in Phnom Penh.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	1. Reconstruction and/or expansion of school facilities at 5 elementary schools located in Phnom Penh: Bak Touk, San Thor Mok, Tour Kok, Anu Wat Reach Theany, Boeung Salang 2. Provision of school furniture (tables, chairs, benches, whiteboards, etc.) for classrooms, libraries, meeting rooms, workshops for the above mentioned schools.	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

To the extent that can be judged from data values for indicators related to the effectiveness of this project, in addition to there being strong project effects in the improvement of the education environment, wide-ranging spillover effects can be seen such as cluster activities by teachers and social activities featuring participation by community residents. From the viewpoint of sustainability, however, because each school has had a financial structure which made it necessary for the school itself to undertake operation and maintenance management, there is a degree of concern over ensuring a source of funds for stable covering of costs of operation over time.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

<Recommendations>

As recommendations to the executing agency, mention was made of matters related to the financial sustainability of the project. Because it is indispensable for each school to acquire its own source of funds so as to improve the financial foundation of the school, what is needed is a strengthening of school management capacity through training in the subject by specialists and for schoolmasters and managers, and through each school's acquiring effective methods of both activity planning and fundraising.

<Constraints of this evaluation study>

Some uncertainty regarding details for this evaluation review exist, because the target schools are five in number and there are some deficiencies in the financial balance information obtained by use of the questionnaire for the executing agency, meaning that evaluation results are susceptible to the level of information available. Note that because of this the evaluation has had to be by means of identifying the overall situation at the schools as a whole.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Cambodia

At the time of the project planning this project, the high level national planning for the education sector was embodied in the Education Strategic Plan (ESP) and the Education Sector Support Program (ESSP) that had the objective of providing "Education for All." In particular, regarding the fair expansion of access to education, the goal had been adopted to completely eliminate by 2005 the severe overcrowding of the present and future primary schools by building additional classrooms. Since then, and after completion of this project, an action program titled Education for All (EFA) was adopted to accelerate efforts toward the above-mentioned goal. In addition, the ESP for 2006-2010 was prepared with the medium-term targets of improvement of education quality and internal efficiency, assuring fair access to educational opportunities, and capacity building for the sake of promoting regional autonomy.

Also, the Education Sector Support Program (ESSP ; 2006-2010) was revised in order to make it easier to shift to implementation of ESP and this is an ongoing activity today. In January 2009, there was a Mid-Term Review of ESSP and ESP at which time the extent of progress was assessed and some revisions were made. In addition, it was reported that there had been progress in terms of the number of six-year-olds entering school and reduction of the cost of education, there had been improvement of the laws regarding the age for starting education, as well as drafting of guidelines for elimination of informal payments to impoverished families. Strong efforts continue to be made at ensuring fair educational opportunities, so the project is deemed to be consistent with development plans.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Cambodia

Education facilities were in very short supply at the time of planning this project, in particular because of a large-scale inflow of Cambodians from rural villages to Phnom Penh. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, importance had been assigned to fair supply of opportunities to obtain education throughout the nation, including rural villages and ethnic minority communities, this from the viewpoint of improving basic education for the entire nation, in keeping with the Mid-Term Review of the education sector support program and ESP. Therefore, considering the continued high importance of meeting development requirements for education as is evident at the time of the ex-post evaluation, the project is judged to have relevance to the nation's development needs.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

In Japan's development cooperation program for Cambodia at the time of project planning, improvement of basic education and of the medical care fields were assigned high importance as being fundamental to achieving a sustained growth of the economy. From the viewpoint of medium- and long-term development of human resources, expanding access to basic education is of extreme importance.

Thus, this project has been highly relevant with Cambodia's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its overall relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

The following changes were made concerning output from the Japanese side.

The location of toilet and other facilities was changed at the AnuWat Reach Teany primary school site. This was done because of installation of water drainage lines by the city of Phnom Penh. Strengthening of joists for the foundation and footings at BakTouk and AnuWat Reach Teany was done and the dimensions of columns were changed. This was done because of in driving piles change within the allowable margin of the design had to be made in the location of the piles.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

Both the original plan and actual project period were 16 months, from June 2004 (E/N) to October 2005. The project was accomplished as planned (100%).

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

Total project cost was 493 million yen; the amount in the E/N was 509 million yen, so the accomplishment was within planned budget (97%).

Both project period and project cost was mostly as planned, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

The number of pupils per classroom for the five schools covered by this project was obtained as 58.6 pupils, and compared to the target figures for 2004. The target was 39.2 pupils/classroom in 2006. In that year, the number was 25 pupils/classroom and thus the objective was achieved. In terms of the effect of the project, the degree of overcrowding was reduced by half.

According to the response from the executing agency at the time of the ex-post evaluation, the number of pupils per classroom has now risen to about 40. Even with this setback, overcrowding is less than it was before the project. Specifically, whereas before the project, the rooms were used by three shifts of pupils daily but this has been reduced to two shifts at most, and the mobile class that at the time of the project planning, it might have affected school attendance adversely, is no longer in existence, and it was said that the improvement in the conditions for learning is continuing.

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, land acquisition and resettlement, unintended positive/negative impact)

The project sought to improve the girls' enrollment and graduation rates by the indirect means of eliminating a constraint to the increase in their enrollment, by improving the girls' toilets. We could not confirm with quantitative data a significant cause-and-effect relationship in this matter but we did receive in the response from the executing agency that having sanitary toilets for girls has

improved the attendance rate, promoted greater awareness of hygiene and health, and aided hygiene education by the teachers. Thus, at the present time although there is a limit to what can be done by way of quantifying impact of the project, it is believed that the potential spillover effects are substantial.

The indirect impact of use of the classrooms that were planned to function also as meeting rooms includes their use for various cluster activities by teachers as well as voluntary work by community members. In this connection, the executing agency reported that from 30 to about 100 persons a time engage in this sort of activity with a frequency of once or twice a month.

Also, there were no reports of problems associated with the natural environment, land acquisition, and resettlement nor were there any reports of major negative impact.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

According to the executing agency, community residents have continued to increase their participation of activities related to the target schools. Regarding operation of the schools, we were informed that operation and maintenance is done by school supporting committees. When asked about any changes in the institutional arrangements after the project was implemented we were told that the number of persons participated had been increased.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Response to the questionnaire shows that there has not been any occurrence of a major problem at the technical level in connection with operation and maintenance of the schools. The O&M requirements created by the project consist of maintaining functionality and hygiene of the toilets through cleaning work and maintenance, repair of school furniture and repainting of exteriors and interiors. This is similar to the situation at other schools and can be done by the school-support organization. The executing agency has also reported that there are no problems from a technical viewpoint in operating and maintaining the facilities.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

According to the response from the executing agency, O&M expenses for each school are paid on a school by school basis (with exception of personnel costs) and the source of funds are (1) government program budgets, (2) contributions from the community, and (3) fees for use of the land or facilities of the school. Power and water utilities are paid for by each school.

It was not expected at the time the project was planned that there would be a large increase in the cost of operating and maintaining the facilities and equipment, power and water utility charges were assumed to be borne by each school. However, the added costs of O&M caused by the project come to from 9.4% to 38.2% of annual income of the schools, and was planned that fund subsidies would be provided by Phnom Penh municipality to cover these increases.

It was not possible at the time of the ex-post evaluation to determine in detail the situation regarding school budgets and income including any subsidies from Phnom Penh municipality, or expenditures for personnel, utilities etc. The income for any given school is quite limited from tuition alone, while necessary expenses may rise with increases in enrollment over time. Thus, it is thought to be essential to secure stable funding for the schools. Nevertheless the response indicated that collections were not being made of contributions from community members for use of facilities so it is not clear how these activities are being funded. Moreover, it was not possible to confirm the situation regarding methodology and budgets for obtaining suitable funds for operation at each school.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

The response from the executing agency indicated that the facilities and equipment obtained through this project were being fully utilized.

Some problems have been observed in terms of financial aspects, therefore sustainability of the project effects is fair.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Miho Kawahatsu Waseda Research Institute Corporation (WRI)	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Construction of the Cambodia-Japan Cooperation Center in the Kingdom of Cambodia	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	The Kingdom of Cambodia	
Project Period	June 2004-November 2005	
Executing Agency	The Royal Phnom Penh University, The Cambodia-Japan Cooperation Center (CJCC)	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 490 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 489 million yen
Main Contractors	Konoike Construction Co., Ltd.	
Main Consultants	Pacific Consultants International	
Basic Design	May 2004	
Related Projects (if any)	JICA, "The project for Cambodia-Japan Cooperation Center" (phase I: 2004-2009, phase II: 2009-) (Technical Cooperation Project)	
Project Background	The 1991 Paris Conference notably added emphasis to the importance of democratization and globalization as challenges to the development of Cambodia. Cambodia has needed to leave behind its negative legacy and re-establish itself as a democratic country with objectives including, in particular, economic growth and poverty reduction, thorough the processes of a free market-oriented policy. The Government of Cambodia requested assistance in the form of Japanese Grant Aid for to establish a facility as the Cambodia-Japan Cooperation Center (CJCC), to promote human resource development for adjusting to the ever-changing global market economy as well as cultivation of mutual understanding between Cambodia and Japan and other nations.	
Project Objective	To construct facilities and install equipment, in order to implement "Human Resource Development Courses," "Japanese Language Courses" and "Exchange Programs" at the CJCC.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	1. Facilities (1) Seminar Rooms Computer Room, Japanese Style Room, Reception Room, Instruction Room, etc. (2) Multi-Purpose Hall, Pantry, Corridor, Toilets, Machinery Space, Storage Space, etc 2. Provision of equipment Lobby Display, Library Control Desk, CCTV system, AV Equipment, Room Furniture, Telecommunication systems, etc.	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

This project is judged highly relevant in terms of policies and needs, and promising with respect to human resources development (HRD). Further, to the extent enabled by evaluating the number of graduates of the HRD course and the Japanese language course, as two indicators determined at the time of project planning as measures of effectiveness, the degree of attainment of targets is high, and the facilities are being used for the purposes of contributing to exchange between Cambodia and Japan. However, lowering of the efficiency has resulted from a delay of the project period and start of courses.

Moreover, from the viewpoint of sustainability, although some progress has been made toward independent management, it has been unavoidable for a while to depend on Japanese financial support. It was reported that in terms of both technical and financial matters it has been difficult to operate and maintain the facilities. There also is concern that physical sustenance of the facilities may be difficult, as in three years following the completion, measures have become necessary for formaldehyde and termites. Therefore, it is desirable to make a follow-up study of ways to minimize the financial burden on Cambodia so as to ensure sustained functioning of the facilities.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be fairly satisfactory.

<Recommendations>

As recommendations to the executing agency, mention must be made of issues related to financial aspects, to ensure sustainability of operation and maintenance. From the viewpoint of strengthening the financial base, it is deemed to be indispensable to secure an independent source of funding and to make good, proactive use of Cambodians as instructors and lecturers. In order to increase the number of students and seminar participants of the CJCC for years to come, what is required is strategic investment as well as a management plan for utilization of existing knowledge and human resources of the Royal University of Phnom Penh. Further, considering the future prospects for regional integration, it would be beneficial to make the most of the TV conference system in order to actively share valuable lessons and experiences of the CJCC with the other Japan Centers in Mekong countries.

<Constraints of this evaluation study>

Because this was a project involving construction of entirely new facilities in conjunction with technical assistance in the form of the dispatch of instructors from Japan, at the present time the project cannot be continued without technical cooperation by Japan. Independent management of the project including operation and maintenance at this time cannot be done by Cambodians alone, and it is thought that some time will be needed before the sustainability of the project can be ensured.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Cambodia

At the time of project planning, the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport announced its Strategic Program for Education and on the basis of the program, the Education Sector Support Program (ESSP) including priority planning for 2001~2005 was formulated, with the objective of improving the quality of education and including the specific targets of "promoting participation by the private sector," and supplying secondary education of immediate value in the job market." The plan for this project was prepared to conform to this policy.

At the time of the ex-post evaluation, the importance of HRD and secondary education within the National Strategic Development Plan: 2006~2010 is being given special attention. In the second ESSP (2006~2010) mention is made of improvement of access to vocational education and secondary education, "augmentation of educational materials, school facilities and school equipment," "strengthening education administration work by means of training of officials and monitoring. The ESSP also included a Priority Action Program (PAP) that is concerned with broad issues in the education sector. Thus, this project is consistent with development programs of Cambodia.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Cambodia

At the time of project planning, it was recognized that it was important in view of the country's target of functioning as a market economy, as well as economic globalization, participation in ASEAN, to improve the training and education of internationally oriented persons having specialized knowledge and technical abilities. In particular, although even at that time, it was possible to study general business subjects at the management courses at the 13 colleges under the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport, the management programs do not meet the needs of the expanding, diversifying business and industry. Also, at the Royal University of Phnom Penh, prior to this project, volunteers were assisting in Japanese language courses, complying with the student desires for learning Japanese.

At the time of the ex-post evaluation, needs to learn business management are still high. After 2006, however, there has been rapid improvement of the legal basis for the general business environment,* and at some universities, specialization at advanced levels became possible. Concerning Japanese language requirements, regular courses have continued and demand for Japanese language education remains high. Therefore, at both the time of planning and of the ex-post evaluation, the project matched development needs of the nation.

* Cambodia Development Council, "Cambodia Investment Guidebook," Jan. 2010.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

At the time of project planning, the policy of Japan's development assistance program for Cambodia was to utilize special qualities associated with Japan to develop human resources capable of dealing with the shift to a market economy as was deemed essential for sustained stabilization of the nation in the course of advancement of peace in the Asia-Pacific region. According to JICA policy for project implementation in Cambodia, in addition, within "development of the economy and industry," development of the private sector was assigned importance and in accordance with that it was sought to development human resources so as to provide through projects the special capabilities and skills needed for the promotion of the economy and industry. Moreover it was desired to maintain a close relationship of the two countries and to promote economic exchanges between them. By means of its HRD courses and Japanese language courses, as well as the promotion of exchanges, this project was consistent with Japanese policy.

This project has been highly relevant with Cambodia's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

There were changes regarding project outputs as follows;

At the time of basic design of the project, there was a change in the location of earthquake-resistant walls, change in the flooring materials to be used (from vitreous tile to tile carpet), change in the number of GRC louvers, addition of one ceiling-mounted cassette type air conditioner, modification of lighting in the multi-purpose hall, addition to two places for infiltration tank protection from rain water, change in the size of septic tank. These resulted in a change in administration overhead.

At the time of the detailed design the height of part of the fence on the west side of the interior court was changed, the finishing materials for the multi-purpose hall were changed, and there was a change in the finishing work for the ceiling of storage at the second floor.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

The project required 18 months, through November 2005, whereas the plan period was 17 months, from June 2004 (E/N) to October 2005. The actual period was slightly longer than planned (106%).

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

Initial project cost was planned at 490 million yen but actual cost was 489 million yen. So the project was completed as planned (99.8%).

Although the project period was longer than planned, the project cost was mostly as planned, therefore efficiency of the project is fair.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

At the time of project planning, the anticipated target number was expected to reflect the respective number of students who had completed an HRD course and had attended seminars at the CJCC, and that by the end of the target year of 2009 a total of 5,000 would have participated. Data from the executing agency, however, indicates only the number of persons who have completed the HRD course, and it was not possible to obtain data on seminar participants, for which reason recourse was made to referring to the number of participants finishing courses in 2008. As a result, in 2009 1,819 persons completed the HRD course. In addition, when evaluation of related technical cooperation was carried out in 2008, it was reported that the participants in seminars came to 5,578, for a total of 7,397. Consequently, we can conclude that the 2009 target of above 5,000 has been reached.

Also, the cumulative number of Japanese language students projected at the time of project planning was 700 or more, but in 2009 there were 1,150, meaning that the target was achieved.

On the basis of data provided to use tabulating the rates of usage of different facilities we calculated the annual usage rate of seminar rooms (5 of them), meeting rooms (two) and the multi-purpose hall. Taken together, the seminar rooms were heavily used; the rate of usage was stable at about 80%. Regarding the multi-purpose hall, usage was low in the early years (2005, 27%; 2006, 48%) but rose over time and is now at a satisfactory level (2008, 66%; 2009, 81%).

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the Natural Environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)

The response obtained from the executing agency indicates that the project facilities are contributing to educational activities and cultural exchange, by being used for a study-in-Japan fair, a fashion show featuring traditional ethnic clothing of the two countries, concerts, displays of robots, a Japanese drum concert, Japanese seasonal 'bon odori' dance festival, scientific exhibitions, so it was confirmed that the facilities are serving their intended purpose. Further, as to whether the facilities were playing a role in support of Japanese language education and HRD for business persons, among those who have studied Japanese several have gone to Japan as exchange students or found employment in Japanese companies, and among the HRD graduates in 2008 we are informed that of 2008 graduates 22% of opened their own business.

In addition to this, the facilities are used by the government and international agencies, business organizations, colleges, NGOs and others as a venue for exchange of information.

Further, as for the role of facilitating communication and exchange of information with other countries in the Asian region, and interaction with other Japan Centers for the purpose of HRD, there is one case in point, namely that students in the HRD course visited Japan Center in Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam. Further, the Tokyo Declaration of the First Meeting between the Heads of the Governments of Japan and the Mekong region countries in 2009, endorsed common training courses for CLV countries by utilizing the existing TV conference system. On the whole indirect effects of the project are being developed.

It has been informed to us that there have been no other issues reported concerning the environment, relocation of inhabitants, or land acquisition.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Arrangements for this project have undergone no change since the plan was made; the agency with oversight for the project facilities is the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport. The CJCC is management is the responsibility of the Royal University of Phnom Penh. Continued support is being provided by the government, the president of the university, and executives of the university. It was also reported that there was awareness that the project facilities and equipment were contributing the earnings of the university.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

There are issues related to the management, and operation and maintenance, of the facilities and supplied equipment, and according to the CJCC, it is difficult to find appropriate technicians and when spare parts are needed they cannot be obtained domestically.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Regarding the budget for O&M, the Royal University of Phnom Penh provides part of its budget allocation from the government to defray some of the CJCC personnel costs and expenses of O&M (electricity, water, etc.). The CJCC obtains income from tuition paid for HRD and Japanese language courses; rental of facilities & equipment; and membership fee, etc. And the CJCC pays for expenses such as honorariums, trash removal, disinfection, gardening, entertainment etc. Regarding the lecture fee income, the income is to be obtained in the form of fees paid by persons attending lectures in courses offered by Japanese consultants assigned by a JICA technical cooperation project.

Expenses for activities (staff costs, overtime, telecommunications, travel, etc.) necessary for operations are paid out of JICA funds and are not covered by budget money from Cambodian side. Thus, as the bulk of expenses for O&M is being covered by funds from JICA, the Cambodian side provides only 19% of a total cost in 2007. According to JICA, the latest ratio of CJCC's own income to total operational expenses has risen (to 22% in 2008, 34% in 2009). It is still hardly said to be sufficient but it suggests a trend toward improvement in financial strength. It is advisable to accelerate the transfer of knowledge and expertise as much as possible to potential Cambodians who may serve as instructors by using a bigger part of lecture fee income for compensation. By such a substitution, it will be possible to ensure financial sustainability. According to JICA, the actual number of local instructors is 4 out of 46 in 2008, and 9 out of 40 in 2009.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

Further, in 2008, after the defects liability period, there was an odor suggestive of formaldehyde and there were complaints by users of the facilities that they did not feel well after being inside for a long period of time and expressions of worry over becoming ill. Also, at the end of 2009, termites were discovered and the need for treatment by an exterminator was confirmed. According to JICA, formaldehyde treatment and termite extermination was properly done and termite treatment is ongoing. After the proofing, an expansion work of seminar rooms is planned as a follow-up project.

Major problems have been observed in terms of financial aspects, therefore sustainability of the project effects is low.