

successor to this project, for which almost all the counterparts for the project continue to work with similar responsibilities. The successor project also carries out the follow-up activities on the effects not fully accomplished under the precursor Sub-Project B, by developing a system to ensure legal human resource development and the sustainability of project effects.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Vietnam

At the time of planning the project, in January 2001, the Government of Vietnam, in recognition of the urgency to establish legal infrastructure for Vietnam's transition to market economy, conducted the "Legal Needs Assessment" whose results and proposed actions were compiled in March 2002. This project was formulated along with the Vietnam's long-term strategy for the establishment of legal infrastructure and judicial reform, whose policies were suggested in the Assessment above. The proposed actions from the same Assessment also served as a base for Vietnam's issuance of the Resolution No.48/NQ-TW of May 2005 on the "Strategy for the Development and Improvement of Vietnam's Legal System to the Year 2010 and Direction for the Period up to 2020" and of the Resolution No.48/NQ-TW of June 2005 on the "Judicial Reform Strategy to 2020," to which the project was as fully aligned. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have been relevant with the development plan of Vietnam.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Vietnam

At the time of planning the project, all the laws which the project planned to assist were listed in the legislation plan of the Vietnam's National Assembly, as part of its implementation of the aforementioned policies. The list of laws in the legislation plan remained unrevised till the end of the project, indicating that the demand for JICA's cooperation existed throughout the project implementation. From the situations above, the project can be evaluated to have met the development needs of Vietnam.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

At the time of planning the project, Japan's "Country Assistance Program for Vietnam" recognized 'human resource and institutional development (and the support to the transition to market economy, among others)' as one of the priority areas of its assistance. In particular, the strategy placed at its core the 'assistance relating to the administrative system that immediately responds to the transition to market economy, and to the development of legal and financial system.' JICA's project execution policy for Vietnam likewise identified the development of legal system as a priority issue. The program and policy remained unchanged and were supported throughout the project period. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have been relevant with Japan's ODA policy.

This project has been highly relevant with Vietnam's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective

Several issues were pointed out by stakeholders on PDM, which stated that the activities covered under Output 6 of Sub-Project B – the formulation of a manual on one hand and dissemination of it on the other – were different that they should have been separate, and that the indicators set under Output 6 were too vague. Regardless of these comments, the revision of PDM was never undertaken.

The achievement level of each Project Output is as follows.

As for Output 1, the final draft of revised Civil Code was formulated, which was approved by the National Assembly on 19th May, 2005.

As for Output 2, the Intellectual Property Law was drafted, which was approved by the National Assembly in November 2005.

As for Output 3, the Civil Procedure Code and Law on Enterprise Bankruptcy were drafted, which were approved by the National Assembly in May 2004.

As for Output 4, the preparation of four laws related to the Civil Code (Law on Registration of Immovable Properties, Ordinance on Registration of Secured Transactions, State Compensation Law and Judgment Execution Code) was promoted. This preparation work opened up the prospect for these draft laws to be approved by the end of 2007 (which indeed was materialized soon after the project completion).

As for Output 5, the common training curricula were completed in October 2005, and four textbooks were made on the Civil Code, Civil Procedure Code, practical skills for resolving civil cases and criminal cases. In addition, a practical manual on the professional skills for procurators in the criminal procedure was finalized.

As for Output 6, although a draft manual on judgment documents was finalized, it did not result in obtaining the approval from the top management of the Supreme People's Court. Without approval from the Court no seminars on the dissemination of the manual was able to take place, except for ones held in Hanoi and Da-nang to provide explanation on the manual.

As for Output 7, the understanding on the Japanese laws among the students of Law Faculty of Vietnam National University, Hanoi was deepened and their examination scores proved decent. Yet the number of deployed expert lecturers remained no more than one.

The project can be evaluated to have almost achieved Project Outputs since the indicator set under each Output was basically achieved.

In terms of the achievement level of Project Objective under Sub-Project A, the revised Civil Code and other related laws and regulations were established, to lay a legal foundation to adapt to the transition to market economy. The project can be therefore evaluated to have almost achieved the Objective under Sub-Project A since most indicators set under the Objective were basically achieved.

In terms of the achievement level of Project Objective under Sub-Project B, noted should be, on one hand, that a training institution for legal and judicial persons were established owing to the project, where the development of legal and judicial human resources were initiated with an improved curriculum. On the other hand, when viewed in terms of its impact at national level, the project failed to achieve the development of rural human resources to improve the quality of their judgment documents, because seminars could not be carried out to disseminate such documents as the manual on drafting judgment documents or sample judgment document. As a

consequence, the achievement level of Project Objective under Sub-Project B is rated as being somewhat limited.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

In terms of the achievement level of Overall Goal under Sub-Project A, different civil and commercial laws were developed based on 5 year-legislation plan. On Sub-Project B, several cases confirm that the capacity of legal and judicial persons has been strengthened. It has been observed that counterparts ensure sufficient analysis and understanding on the training content, before they put the training into practice. They are also open to learn from pioneer overseas experiences and to rearrange them to have them as their own. The quality of judgment documents also observed improvement.

In terms of the indirect impacts, it is reported as a good example that the central legal authorities have got to understand and correspond to the issues the local authorities have. Meanwhile, no negative impact on environment and other social consideration through the project has been reported so far.

This project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As mentioned in (1) of "Effectiveness / Impact," the project achieved the expected Project Outputs.

(2) Elements of Inputs

The inputs of the project are shown in "Project Outline." Some disruptions were observed in the project implementation as a result of the followings: the lack of inputs of long-term experts at the initiation of the project, as well as the deployment of a coordinator only at the second project year, caused a project leader to address by himself such administrative activities as communication and coordination with the Vietnamese counterparts, and the cost management for activities implemented locally; and the number of short-term experts were insufficient to implement local seminars. As mentioned in Effectiveness / Impact (1) as well, PDM was never revised regardless of the stated concerns, hindering some planned impacts from materializing.

(3) Period of Cooperation, Project Cost

The actual period of cooperation was 45 months against planned 36 months, slightly longer than planned (125% of planned period). The actual project cost was 371 million yen against planned 350 million yen, slightly higher than planned (106% of planned budget).

Some of the inputs are appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective, therefore efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

No change is observed in the area of legal development in Vietnam, and the establishment of legal system and the training of legal and judicial persons continue to be supported at the policy level. The Vietnam's current national development plan of "8th 5-Year Socio-Economic Development Plan (2006~2010)" likewise make a reference to transparent policy management (or strengthening of governance), legal development and judicial reform.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executing Agency

"The Project on the Legal and Judicial System Reform" has been implemented from April 2007 to March 2011 as a successor to this project, where most of the project counterparts continue to assume responsibilities. On the other hand, there is a report on the National Judicial Academy under the Ministry of Justice, that its current activities as a training institution for legal and judicial persons are not as active, due both to political reasons (the change in the academy's President) that weakened the existence of the academy, as well as to opinions from some Vietnam's legal circles that the training for three legal and judicial functions (judges, prosecutors and attorneys) is better undertaken separately.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executing Agency

No difficulty is foreseen in terms of the sustainability of counterparts' skills, since the successor project introduced above continues to provide skills transfers and capacity training for the counterparts.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executing Agency

No financial difficulty has so far been recognized, on the ground that the Government has provided sufficient budget for the court's operation, and that continuous supports are provided to the area of legal development, both by donors and the successor project above.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

Follow-up activities have been undertaken on the outputs which were not fully achieved in the project, as well as the dissemination of the outputs achieved. Concrete examples of these activities include the continuous utilization, as well as revision if necessary, of the textbooks and manuals made by the project. Among others, the manual for procurators particularly enjoys high reputation. A manual on drafting judgment documents and sample judgment documents were both approved by the Council of Judges in the Supreme People's Court, and the seminars for the dissemination of the manual are implemented by the successor project. Taking the "Japan-Vietnam Joint Study on the Development of Judicial Precedents in Vietnam" as a reference document, measures have also been carried out to introduce a system of judicial precedent. In addition, at the Law Faculty of Vietnam National University, Hanoi, the lectures on 'Japanese Legal Terms' and 'Basic Japanese Laws' continue to be implemented by JETRO and the Federation of Economic Organizations after the project completion, under the name of the "Course on Japanese and Vietnamese Legal Studies."

No major problems have been observed in the policy background, the structural, technical, financial aspects of the executing agency, therefore sustainability of the project effects is high.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Masaaki Shiraishi Waseda Research Institute Corporation	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	Community Forestry Training and Extension Project in Dry Zone in the Union of Myanmar	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	The Union of Myanmar
Project Period	December 2001-December 2006
Executing Agency	Forest Department, Ministry of Forestry Dry Zone Greening Department, Ministry of Forestry
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Forestry Agency, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries
Total Cost	420.32 million Japanese yen (at the time of June, 2006)
Related Projects (if any)	The Central Forestry Development Training Center Project in Myanmar (1999-2001) Aftercare The Central Forestry Development Training Center Project in Myanmar (1990-1997) The Central Forestry Development Training Center Construction Project in Myanmar (1987-1990)
Overall Goal	FD promotes participatory forest management based on the management in Dry Zone based on the CFI so that people with spontaneous participation are able to enjoy benefits from the Community Forests.
Project Objective(s)	All FD's Township Offices in Dry Zone acquire practical capacity to promote participatory forest management based on the CFI.
Output[s]	1. An extension plan for promotion of participatory forest management in Dry Zone based on the CFI is prepared. 2. Extension staff understand the importance of participatory forest management and acquire necessary skill and knowledge for extension through training. 3. Extension of participatory forest management is practiced in villages in Dry Zone as a part of extension staff training. 4. Dissemination state of participatory forest management is monitored periodically. (Note) 5. Collaboration relationship with Dry Zone Greening Department is strengthened. (Note) (Note): Supplementary outputs added at the time of evaluation in June, 2006.

Inputs (Japanese Side)

Inputs (Myanmar's Side)

Experts	9 for Long term, 2 for Short term	Staff allocated	42 Counterparts
Equipments	50.347 million yen	Equipments	n.a.
Local Cost	80.954 million yen	Local Cost	44.088 million yen equivalent / local currency)
Trainees Received	10 person	Land etc provided	
Others		Others	Office space and facilities

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

Relevance of the project is high enough. It is significant outcomes that developed effect and impact by the project have been spreaded beyond the target area, and transferred technologies induced by continuous training have been widely applied over the country. Due to financial constraints of the government, however, though it will not significantly impede sustainability of the project, it is seen a slow down trend in dissemination activities.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

<Constraints of this evaluation study>

Quantitative data of developed effect required for evaluation of effectiveness and financial data for evaluation of sustainability of the project have not been responded.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of the Union of Myanmar

The Community Forestry Instructions (CFI), 1995, which is the principal policy instrument of the Union of Myanmar at the time of commencement of this Project, as well as the Forest Sector Master Plan (2001-2031), will be in force until the Project is completed. After the completion of the Project, the Thirty-Year Development Plan for Border Areas (Forest Sector) and the Integrated Mangrove Management Plan (IMMP) (2007-2046) will be in force as the policy instruments related to community forestry. Therefore, this Technical Cooperation Project is relevant in that it is in line with the development policy of the Union of Myanmar over a long period.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of the Union of Myanmar

Even from the planning stage of the Project, the government of the Union of Myanmar was making efforts to promote tree plantations with participation of rural people for restoration of forests and climate stabilization so as to ensure energy sources and benefits for those living in the central dry zone of the country not only under adverse conditions of climate but also under poor economical conditions, in response to their needs for promotion of industry and ensuring energy sources. The government's efforts are still ongoing. This technical cooperation project that is intended to train rural people and dissemination of the concept and practice of community forestry is therefore highly relevant to the development needs of the Union of Myanmar.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

At the stage of planning, Japan's ODA policy in Southeast Asia was focusing on measures against poverty, measures for improvement of socioeconomic infrastructure, environmental protection issues, and agricultural/rural area development fields, providing appropriate assistance according to actual situation and conditions of each country (FY2001 ODA White Paper of Japan). As this Project aims to reduce poverty in the central dry zone of Myanmar where most of the population is poor and provide disaster control and environmental protection measures, it is relevant in that it is in line with Japan's ODA policy at the time of planning.

This project has been highly relevant to the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

With respect to Output 1: "*framing of community forestry (CF) dissemination plan*," the plan was framed in March 2004, and thus this output has been achieved.

With respect to Output 2: "*training of CF dissemination staff (actual outcome at the stage of 2009 against target year 2011)*," the actual number of participants was as follows:

PES training (Dissemination system in which forestry office heads participate): 35 participants against target number of 36 (Achievement level: 97.2%)

PEM training (Dissemination system in which dissemination personnel of the Forestry Department participate): 52 participants against target number of 54 (Achievement level: 96.3%)

Follow-up training for dissemination personnel: 18 participants against target number of 17 (Achievement level: 105.9%)

Training of residents (CF user group members): 13 participants against target number of 14 (Achievement level: 92.9%)

As above, therefore, Output 2 has nearly been achieved.

As to Output 3: "*actual dissemination rate of CF*," no actual numerical data were available, but the terminal evaluation report comments that "for two years from 2003 to 2005, 7 CF user groups were established with the total number of members of 469 and total established CF area was 1,142 acres. In view of this outcome and considering the implementation speed, it is likely that the target (indicator) is achieved by the end of the Project."

With respect to Output 4: "*monitoring is to be performed*," monitoring is being conducted constantly, according to the information received, and thus it is believed this output has been achieved.

With respect to Output 5: "*Closer cooperation with the Dry Zone Greening Department is required* (activities of Committee for Community Forestry Organization -CCF-)," no information was available. Actually, Output 5 was added quite late, so lack of information within the implementation period of the Project is of some concern.

As above, although information could not be obtained for Output 3 (actual dissemination rate) and Output 5 (Closer cooperation with the relevant department), it could be stated that the CF activities in the target area are going well. In addition, CF activities are now spreading throughout the country, and therefore, it can be judged that the outputs of the Project have nearly been achieved.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

According to the reply received from the Implementing Agency, one of indirect and effects of the Project was the fact that Project could generate Community Forestry practitioners and/or extensionists in and outside of the Forest Department. As a result, the concept of CF development was spread to local governments and other interested parties, and even to areas outside the target area. In addition, the participants and trainees trained as above are taking active part in various CF-related projects nationwide, playing an important role of diffusing the concept of CF activities; consequently, this concept has now been introduced into small-scale CF and tree planting projects as CDM projects. On the other hand, CF activities involve felling or deforestation and forest deterioration, resulting in increased greenhouse gas emissions. Because of this situation, review is being made whether or not the activities are to be incorporated into the PES scope (payment for ecological service). CF activities are now moving into the spotlight as the leading activity area in the development programs in the border zones and remote regions. Furthermore, CF activities are now sources of profits for those living in the dry zone of the country (community forests provide firewood and also supply feed for their animals). This means that the indicator for the Overall Goal has been achieved. Another indirect effect is the solidarity spontaneously promoted among the participants of the target area through cooperative operations of organization, motivation, dissemination, etc. for the Project. It is reported that the trainees and local inhabitants who were trained under the Project are actively participating in CF activities of other areas that are sponsored by the United Nations in collaboration with NGOs.

As above, CF activities under the Project brought about ripple effects far more than expected and have already come to stay as the standard techniques of CF activities in the Union of Myanmar. Thus, the impact of the Project can be assessed as high. On the other hand, no negative impacts on the environment, etc. have been reported.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, and therefore its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

The intended outputs have been achieved as mentioned in (1) of 2, "Effectiveness and Impacts" section.

(2) Elements of Inputs

At the stage of planning, 5 Japanese experts were planned for periods of long stay (5 years each), totaling 300 man-months. In actual implementation of the Project, 9 experts were dispatched totaling 300 man-month plus 7 days (9,007 days). In the final analysis, the actual result was the same as had been planned. Regarding short-term experts who were planned to be dispatched "as necessary," the actual result was 2.4 man-months. 10 to 15 trainees were expected by the plan, and 10 were trained in Japan, plus 5 in a third country, and thus, the inputs were almost as planned.

Equipment and materials were furnished as planned. As additional information, the reply from the Myanmar side to our questionnaire commented as follows: "apart from experts on community forests, those specialized in climate change and water resources should have participated in the Project, considering that the brittleness of the land in the target zone is attributable to dryness and climate change." The suggested experts were not included from the beginning of planning and it is believed that there were no impact on the outputs. Regarding the training program of personnel of the Forestry Department, another comment on the outputs of the Project from the Myanmar side says that a more extensive capacity building program is required as it is necessary to train management personnel for CFDTC (Central Forestry Development Training Center). There is an opinion that says Japan should receive more trainees from the Forestry Department so that more doctors and masters are produced.

Anyway, the achievement of the inputs and their effects were satisfactory in relation to the Project Objective.

(3) Project Cost, Period of Cooperation

Because the projected budget is unknown, no comparative analysis is possible. The elements of inputs, however, were appropriate, as mentioned in (2) above. The actual period of cooperation was 5 years as planned (achievement level: 100%).

As explained above, the elements of inputs have been appropriate in relation to the Outputs and Project Objective.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

The forestry policy of the Union of Myanmar is solid and backed by related policies and plans such as the Community Forestry Instructions (CFI), the Forest Sector Master Plan (2001-2031), Thirty-Year Development Plan for Border Areas (Forest Sector) and the Integrated Mangrove Management Plan (IMMP) (2007-2046).

Policies and systems required for the sustainability of the cooperation effects have been firmly established.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

The forestry policy of the Union of Myanmar is solid and backed by related policies and plans such as the Community Forestry Instructions (CFI), the Forest Sector Master Plan (2001-2031), Thirty-Year Development Plan for Border Areas (Forest Sector) and the Integrated Mangrove Management Plan (IMMP) (2007-2046).

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

The majority of the Myanmarese trainees under this project have already been given senior posts in the Forestry Department. The level of understanding of CF and forest management techniques that required participation was improved and implementation procedures are smoother than before. The Forestry Department takes part in various seminars, workshops, training courses, etc. both home and abroad in cooperation with the United Nations, NGOs, INGOs, etc. with the aim of training participants in CF activities of higher quality level. Techniques and personnel required for continuation of effects of the Project as well as required for operation and management of the technique dissemination system are ensured.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

No data to verify the financial sustainability were available. According to the reply received from the implementing agency, budgets are allotted by the Forestry Department to all CF groups nationwide though there are limitations in funds. Considering the nature of policy priority of the Project, it is expected that the financial resources required for operation and management of the Project will be ensured in the future.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

It is believed that the community forests under the Project are sustainable at present, while poverty and vulnerability of inhabitants that are easily affected by weather conditions, constitutes a risk factor.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Keiko Asato Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Improvement of TV Broadcasting Facilities in Kabul	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Islamic Republic of Afghanistan	
Project Period	June 2003-May 2005	
Implementing Agency	Radio Television Afghanistan (hereinafter RTA)	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 794 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 794 million yen
Main Contractors	(Construction) Tobishima Corporation (Procurement) Mitsubishi Corporation	
Main Consultants	NHK Integrated Technology Inc. (NHK ITEC)	
Basic Design	"Basic Design Study Report on the Project for Rehabilitation of TV Broadcasting Facilities in Kabul in Afghanistan," Japan International Cooperation Agency and NHK Integrated Technology Inc., February 2003	
Related Projects (if any)	The Project for Improvement of Equipment of the Broadcasting at RTA (2002) Urgent Rehabilitation Support Programme in Afghanistan: Education, Health and Broadcasting sector (2004) Training Program "Television Technology" (2002), Training Program "Production of TV Program" (2002) The Construction Project of TV Broadcasting Station (1977)	
Project Background	TV broadcasting in Kabul plays an important role providing the Afghan people with basic information necessary for their life including information related to education, society, and politics. However, during the long civil war, the transmitting station at Mt. Asmayi was destroyed and the Kabul TV Studio Center has aged. Stable TV broadcasting was interrupted and the broadcasting area and duration has been limited. Residents of Kabul experienced difficulty obtaining information necessary for their life through TV.	
Project Objective	To reconstruct the transmitting station and procure transmitting equipment for Mt. Asmayi in Kabul, and to renovate the TV Studio Center in order to expand the broadcast area and extend the hours of broadcasting in Kabul.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	1. The facilities at Kabul Transmitting Station (Mt. Asmayi Transmitting Station) will be reconstructed and the transmitting equipment, including the steel tower, will be procured and installed. 2. The facilities at Kabul TV Studio Center will be renovated.	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

The Project aims were to facilitate the restart of TV broadcasting, which had been prohibited since 1996 when the Taliban came to power, by expanding Kabul's TV broadcasting area and extending its broadcasting duration. The Project included reconstructing the facilities at the Kabul Transmitting Station (Mt. Asmayi Transmitting Station had been destroyed during the civil war in 1979), procuring and installing the transmitting equipment and renovating the Kabul TV Studio Center. This project complemented another grant aid project, "The Project for the Improvement of Equipment of the Broadcasting at RTA". These two Projects combined were expected to contribute to the reconciliation of Afghanistan people through the development of human resources: using mass media to enlighten and educate.

Regarding the implementation process, the Project period took more time than originally scheduled due in part by security issues (causing a mandatory evacuation of staff) as well as other force majeure factors (such as the heaviest snowfall in 20 years). Allotting for these special circumstances, the Project would have been completed within the planned schedule and the planned budget. Owing to this project, TV broadcasting is currently available 24 hours per day (the original target was 7 hours per day), and the broadcasting area was expanded to provinces outside Kabul. Expanding the broadcast area was made possible by satellite transmission owing to contributions from another donor that has enabled TV broadcasting to reach Afghan people living in neighboring countries who are also concerned with the political and economic situation in Afghanistan. Considering such effects, we conclude that this project does contribute to the reconciliation of the Afghan people.

Daily inspection and cleaning are being carried out in a good manner, the facilities and equipment are generally well operated and maintained by RTA staff. Despite reports of insufficient budget for the operation and maintenance of equipment, carefully maintaining facilities and equipment to prevent them from deteriorating and breaking-down under strict budget constraints, actually facilitates the effective utilization of the equipment. The Japanese consultant, who is now conducting the in-country training on this issue (hereinafter "Japanese consultant"), also acknowledges that the facilities and equipment at RTA are in good condition and being well maintained.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

< Recommendation to RTA >
Further elaboration is expected in order to secure the necessary budget for the operation and maintenance of the facilities and equipment.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Afghanistan

National Development Framework (2002) at the time of Project's preliminary evaluation indicated that the capacity reinforcement of TV station was important to deliver people necessary information. The succeeding national strategy, "Afghanistan National Development Strategy 2008-2013" also prioritized increasing the diffusion rate for TV and radio, extending broadcasting duration and improving the quality of TV programs.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Afghanistan

Although TV broadcasting only got started in 1978, facilities and equipment soon began to deteriorate as the Soviet Union invaded in 1979 and the Afghan civil war brought chaos to the country. TV broadcasting was then utterly prohibited when the Taliban took power in 1996 and it remained so until the Taliban's demise in 2001. During the Taliban's 18-year regime, the Afghan people did not have access to political, economic, and cultural news. Currently, information diffused by the RTA regarding politics, economics and culture is believed to be contributing to the Afghan government's and the Afghan nation's attempt to form their identity. RTA run TV programs are an effective source of information for the peace-building efforts of the Afghan nation.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

JICA's Country Assistance Programme for Afghanistan was not yet finalized at the time of the preliminary evaluation. However, at the Afghanistan Reconstruction Conference in 2002, in which Japan served as a co-chair, the government of Japan raised 6 important areas, including "media infrastructure" and disbursed 500 million dollars. Aligned with this policy, the development study of "Urgent Rehabilitation Support Programme in Afghanistan" (2004), which includes the field of broadcasting, resulted in the formulation and implementation of this project, with the complementary project of "The Project for Improvement of Equipment of the Broadcasting at RTA", sharing the same overall goal.

In light of the above, this project has been highly relevant with Afghanistan's development plan and development needs and is also highly relevant with Japan's ODA policy. Therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

The outputs by Japan were achieved as planned, except in regards to the following five modifications; 1) reinforcement of capacity of fan and related facilities at the emergency power supply room, 2) air-conditioning at the transmitting room, 3) layout of bed at night duty room, 4) increase water supply tank capacity and 5) lead-in point of transmission line of power. A consultant carefully examined the technical and financial aspects of these modifications and concluded that they had no negative impact to achieve the project purpose.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

The actual project period took 23 month as opposed to the planned 17 months (135% of planned period). The major reasons for the extended planned period were the mandatory evacuation from Afghanistan of the consultants and construction personnel due to security issues related to the Presidential election (for 3 months) and suspension of construction due to the heaviest snowfall in the 20 years (for 2 months), as well as related issues such as difficulties re-hiring construction workers. These impediments can be regarded as force majeure and the delay, therefore, cannot be attributed to either the consultants or the construction company.

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

The actual project cost was 794 million yen, compared to planned costs of 794 million yen (100 %).

In light of the above, the project cost was as planned, and the project period was longer than planned. However, the reasons for the delay were unavoidable (the mandatory evacuation of workers and unexpectedly bad weather). Judging the situation comprehensively, efficiency is rated as high.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

Data for the broadcasting area and duration for the target year (2006) could not be obtained. However, according to JICA's internal 2008 reports, the broadcasting area reached 283 km² (the same as planned), and the broadcasting duration had also reached 24 hours, (more than the planned 7 hours).

(2) Impacts

The number of families able to enjoy RTA programs in Kabul city increased to 5 million in 2009: up from 50 thousand in 2003. The coverage rate for TV sets in Kabul city also increased from 20% in 2003 to 80% in 2009. The broadcasting area of RTA is not limited to Kabul city, but has expanded to the capitals of other provinces as well as to neighboring countries (broadcasting to neighboring countries was made possible through satellite transmission apparatus provided by a different donor)*. The number of TV programs available has expanded to more than 100 (at the time of the preliminary evaluation there were only 20). Additional RTA programs were produced with the support by a complementary grant aid project, "The Project for Improvement of Equipment of the Broadcasting at RTA (2002)". The contents of the TV program, which cover politics, economics, culture and daily life, help stimulate the consciousness of the people and contribute to Afghan's nation building.

In light with above, this project has largely achieved its objectives; therefore, its effectiveness is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

The turnover rate of technical staff at RTA is low. Even though the number of technical staff at the Transmitter Section of the Technical Department has decreased from 132 to 100, more experienced veteran staff with good command of necessary tasks are working in the section. The number of staff with 10 to 20 years working experience has increased from 18 in 2003 to 52 in 2009. Although the broadcasting duration has expanded to 24 hours, the number of staff working at Asmayi Transmission Station remains almost the same: 9 persons in 2009, compared to 8 persons in 2003. Although RTA has reported that the current number of staff is not enough, the Japanese consultant has concluded that the current number of staff can manage 24 hour broadcasting.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

At RTA, specific technical criteria for recruiting staff has been established, and opportunities to participate in training programs are offered to the staff. They are attending the training program offered by AIBD (Asia Pacific Institute of Broadcasting Development) and UNESCO. In addition, in 2010 JICA started in-country training, "RTA TV and Radio broadcasting training (including the technical training for transmission)". The staff, who participated in these programs, have shared what they learned with other staff. With these programs, they are maintaining their technical skills. RTA has reported some problems they currently face including; the lack of knowledge for new technology (such as digital broadcasting technology) and many RTA staff cannot understand the technical documents written in English. JICA's in-country technical training program mentioned above is being conducted to respond to these problems as well. The Japanese consultant, who is involved in this training, reported that the transmission equipment is, in general, properly operated by RTA staff.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

The commercial income in 2009 was 120 million Afs. But this income has to be merged with the budget of Ministry of Information and Culture (hereinafter referred to as MOIC), and RTA is allocated the budget from MOIC accordingly, which does not allocate RTA sufficient budget. Without the exact budget figures, RTA and Japanese consultant reported that either the budget of Afghan government or that of RTA is constrained, and the minimum budget for the daily operation and maintenance of the equipment is secured. But RTA cannot afford to repair the equipment and to purchase spare parts and other necessary things.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

The current status of major equipments' operation and maintenance is in a good condition. The TV transmitter, TV changeover switch equipment, program input and monitoring equipment, field strength meter with tripod and antenna element, and automatic voltage regulator are regularly inspected, and have been in use without malfunction. The operation guideline in English and in Dari is used well and the procedure for repair has been established, setting the specific format to report the result of daily inspections. Regarding the facility maintenance at Asmayi Transmitting Station, the temperature is adjusted appropriately and the equipment is well taken care of so that the equipment condition meets the technical requirement, and also well cleaned-up. The Kabul TV Studio Center is also regularly cleaned up and well maintained as well as Asmayi Transmitting Station.

In light with the above, some financial problems have been observed; therefore, the sustainability of the project effect is fair.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Keiko Asato Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Improvement of Equipment of the Universities in Kabul	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Islamic Republic of Afghanistan	
Project Period	March 2004-May 2005	
Implementing Agency	Kabul University, University of Education	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 416 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 413 million yen
Main Contractors	ITOCHU Corporation / Kitano Construction Corp. (Joint Venture)	
Main Consultants	System Science Consultants Inc.	
Basic Design	“Basic Design Study Report on the Project for Improvement of Equipment of the Universities in Kabul in the Islamic Transitional State of Afghanistan,” Japan International Cooperation Agency and System Science Consultants Inc., March 2004	
Related Projects (if any)	Individual Long Term Expert (Education Policy Advisor) (November 2002-2003)	
Project Background	After a civil war that lasted over 20 years, Afghanistan is promoting peace-building and reconstruction processes. In its National Development Framework, education has been identified as one of the defining issues for nation's reconstruction, and in the Rehabilitation and Development of Education in Afghanistan, the strategies to reconstruct higher education have been formulated. In this country, many higher education buildings and facilities were destroyed during the long-lasting civil wars. In addition, equipment was plundered from classrooms and laboratories resulting in a devastatingly poor educational environment. Moreover, the limited funds prevents the recruitment of qualified educators as well as the procurement of educational equipment needed for the practical and laboratory training necessary for functional curricula.	
Project Objective	To develop human resources in Afghanistan through procurement of equipment for practical and laboratory training at the Faculty of Science, the Faculty of Engineering, the Faculty of Agriculture, the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine and the Faculty of Pharmacy at Kabul University and at University of Education.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Equipment for practical and laboratory training (related to biology, chemistry, electricity and electronic engineering, mechanical engineering, civil engineering and architectural, machining and tooling, animal husbandry and agriculture) are procured to the Faculty of Agriculture, the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, the Faculty of Engineering, the Faculty of Science and the Faculty of Pharmacy at Kabul University. 2. Equipments for practical and laboratory training, and language laboratories are procured to the Faculty of Science, the Faculty of Sociology and the Faculty of Linguistics at University of Education. 	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>While this project was targeted at eight faculties of two universities (Faculty of Agriculture, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Faculty of Engineering, Faculty of Science and Faculty of Pharmacy at Kabul University, and Faculty of Science, Faculty of Sociology and Faculty of Linguistics at University of Education), the questionnaire responses were collected only from the following four faculties: the Faculty of Agriculture, the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, the Faculty of Pharmacy, and the Faculty of Science at Kabul University. Due to the limited amount of information, this evaluation was conducted only at these four responding faculties, instead of over the Project as a whole. Even at these four faculties, not all questions were answered. With the specific circumstances of Afghanistan taken into consideration, the evaluation was conducted only with the given information, without further confirmation and/or inquiries.</p> <p>The Project, for this evaluation, was conducted to support the human development in higher education at the Faculties of Agriculture, Veterinary Medicine, Science and Pharmacy at Kabul University by procuring equipment for practical and laboratory training, through which practical instruction was added to the existing theory-oriented curricula, with the goal of developing highly capable professionals. This was in accordance with Afghan government policies to improve the quality of the existing educational organizations at higher education and develop qualified experts. At the same time, this was in line with Japanese government policies which recognized the significance of the education sector at the Afghanistan Reconstruction Conference. The achievement level of the laboratory hours and number of students participating in practical and laboratory training were 76 percent, as an average, in the Faculties of Veterinary Medicine and Pharmacy and 51 percent, as an average, of the Faculties of Agriculture, Veterinary Medicine, and Pharmacy, respectively. Additionally, the Faculties of Agriculture, the Veterinary Medicine, and the Pharmacy reported such indirect positive impacts as revision of practical curricula, improvements in teaching methodologies, and increased comprehension and interest toward taught subjects among the students.</p> <p>Concerning equipment operation, so far most of the important equipment (*) has been used regularly by the responding faculties (Faculties of Veterinary Medicine and Pharmacy), and no malfunctioning has been reported. Three faculties (Faculties of Agriculture, Veterinary Medicine and Pharmacy), altogether having 255 sets of equipment, reported that each faculty has equipment that is not in</p>

use. The main reasons for this are the loss of instruction manuals, the shortage of spare parts, and the unfamiliarity with new equipments. Concerning equipment maintenance and management, three of the faculties (the Faculty of Pharmacy excepted) have assigned maintenance staff, and use registry books and instruction manuals in the local language (Dari). In contrast, spare part procurement has been challenging due to absence of agents and/or slowness processing. Not enough information was obtained for the budget, but at least at the Faculty of Agriculture there is a shortfall. Concerning faculty member capability in handling the equipment, two of the faculties (that of Veterinary Medicine and Pharmacy) out of the four reported appropriate sharing of technical knowledge on equipment use, but the opposite holds true for the other two faculties. Faculties other than the Faculty of Pharmacy claim that they are not certain of how to handle the equipment regardless of their attendance to the workshop for equipment operation. With above assessed carefully, there is an uncertainty regarding sustainability of equipment operation and maintenance.

(*) Major equipment is listed on "the Major Equipment List" in the Completion Report and is equipment with CIF values of more than 1 million yen.

In light of the above, this project, evaluating only the four limited faculties, is evaluated to be satisfactory.

<Recommendations to JICA>

More frequent use of equipment through retraining on equipment operation, and replacing lost instruction manuals is recommended.

<Recommendations to Kabul University>

Sharing of technical knowledge on equipment use, of the equipment manual, of teaching methodologies, strengthening of administering of mentioned manual among the faculty members is recommended. At the Faculty of Pharmacy, assigning staff to be in charge of equipment maintenance is desired.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Afghanistan

At the time of this project's preliminary evaluation, the National Development Framework recognized education as a significant issue in national reconstruction. The Policy for the Rehabilitation and Development of Education in Afghanistan also discusses the necessity of maintenance and expansion of public educational systems, and furthermore, mentions the importance of the rehabilitation of higher education as well as of the teacher-education system. At the time of post-project evaluation, the Afghanistan National Development Strategy 2008-2013, also placed education as a significant sector in the development of human resources that contribute to the nation's long-term economic growth. Higher education in particular is both expected to improve the existing educational institutes and to produce the technical professionals demanded by the market economy.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Afghanistan

The preliminary evaluation pointed out issues on the physical plight of higher education facilities including the destruction of building structures, electricity and water facilities, and research facilities, and plundering of equipment used for practical and laboratory training. In addition, the evaluation evidenced the extent of human resource issues including the absence of faculty from practical and laboratory training due to the civil war and their limited skill at using specialized equipment. At the present moment, the Ministry of Higher Education indicates the need to improve teaching and learning facilities and to renew of classrooms and laboratories in its National Higher Education Strategic Plan 2010-2014. The Faculty of Agriculture, the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, the Faculty of Science and the Faculty of Pharmacy at Kabul University also reported the significance of promoting student understanding on related subjects through improvements of teaching methodologies led by improvements of equipment for practical and laboratory training.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

JICA's Country Programme for Afghanistan had yet to be elaborated at the time of the preliminary evaluation. However, at the Afghanistan Reconstruction Conference in 2002, in which Japan served as a co-chair, education was recognized as a significant aid issue for Japan. In July of the same year, the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology announced "reconstruction of higher education" as one of four major themes of its educational aid policy.

In light of the above, this project has been highly relevant with Afghanistan's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

The outputs by Japan were achieved as planned.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

The Project period lasted for 15 months, slightly longer (125 %) than the planned 12 months. Blockage of the road from Pakistan to Afghanistan due to very bad weather (the heaviest snow in last 20 years) consequently delayed the transportation schedule and custom processing resulting in the three-month delay of the original plan (as machinery were transported overland from Pakistan).

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

The actual project cost was 413 million yen, lower (99 %) than the planned cost of 416 million yen, which was within the original plan. Appropriate competitive bidding assisted the procurement within the planned budget.

The project cost was within the planned amount. Although the project period was slightly longer than planned, it was unavoidable due to the very bad weather, which can be considered as force majeure. With the comprehensive judge of this situation, efficiency of the Project is high.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

Out of the eight targeted faculties, evaluation was conducted on the three responding faculties, (Faculty of Agriculture, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine and Faculty of Pharmacy at Kabul University) as follows:

(1) Quantitative Effects

Hours of laboratory room use achieved 76% (the average at the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine (65 %) and the Faculty of Pharmacy (96 %)) of targeted hours in 2006 (which was the target year), while the number of students participating in practical and laboratory training remained 51% of the target indicator in 2009 (the average at the Faculty of Agriculture (61 %), Faculty of Veterinary Medicine (55 %), and Faculty of Pharmacy (35 %)). No additional information or explanation was given on these results.

(2) Indirect Impacts and Other Positive/Negative Indirect Impacts

With installation of practical and laboratory training, the curricula have been modified to become more practical. Each faculty reported that with practical and laboratory training student understanding of subjects was improved (i.e. the number of proteins could be specified (Faculty of Agriculture), understanding of theory was improved (Faculty of Veterinary Medicine), etc.). At the Faculty of Pharmacy, it was noted that graduates face less problematic situations while on their duties.

At the three faculties (Faculty of Agriculture, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine and Faculty of Pharmacy at Kabul University), this project has somewhat achieved its objectives; therefore its effectiveness is fair.

4 Sustainability

Out of the eight targeted faculties, evaluations were conducted on four responding faculties (Faculties of Agriculture, of Veterinary Medicine, of Pharmacy and of Science at Kabul University) as follows:

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

The Faculty of Agriculture, Veterinary Medicine and Science assigns three to four persons to be in charge of this. The assigned staff either possesses bachelor's degrees or are technicians (one of them is a high school graduate). All four faculties prepare registry books for equipment, and the Faculty of Agriculture additionally has set out repair procedure. Though outside this project, at the time this project was designed, there had been 11 students from Kabul University studying to earn diplomas in Japan, and according to JICA's internal documents, they were expected to serve in practical training and equipment maintenance after they returned. Out of the 11, eight students earned their diploma and returned, but with the exception of one who teaches in the Faculty of Pharmacy, none of them participates in practical training. And none of eight students are involved in the equipment maintenance. However, there has been no report claiming that it negatively impacted the structural aspects of operation and maintenance. Therefore no significant problem is seen in the structural aspects of operation and maintenance.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

The number of faculty members who use the equipment for practical and laboratory training has increased from 10 to 14 at the Faculty of Agriculture, and from 19 to 32 at the Faculty of Pharmacy. At these two faculties, more experienced faculty members teach younger ones to use the equipment, and at the Faculty of Pharmacy instruction manuals are used to assist equipment use. In contrast, at the Faculty of Agriculture 12 members participated in equipment operation workshop and all of them have remained at the university. However, some equipment remains unused because it is too new. At the Faculties of Science and of Veterinary Medicine, experienced faculty members do not always share their technical knowledge of equipment usage with younger ones. The Faculty of Veterinary Medicine leaves some new equipment unused due to unfamiliarity for its usage. At the Faculty of Science one person participated in a workshop but that person is not in the university at moment. No other information on whether or not there are problems with equipment use remained unknown in this Faculty.

In all the four faculties, most of the instruction manuals in use are in the local language (the Dari) even though some manuals have been lost (at Faculty of Agriculture and Faculty of Veterinary Medicine). None of four faculties has local agents for repairing and procuring spare parts. Procuring spare parts is challenging due to limited budgets and complicated procedures.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

No practical figures have been collected on the financial aspects, except from the Faculty of Agriculture, which mentioned its budget shortfall.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

As for major equipment (equipment listed on "the Major Equipment List" in the Completion Report and equipment with CIF values more than 1 million yen), their operational and maintenance conditions are as follows: at the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, four sets of equipment out of five, and at the Faculty of Pharmacy all the seven sets are operational and are functioning. The Faculty of Pharmacy conducts regular inspections of them. The Faculty of Science is not in possession of this major equipment, while no response was received from the Faculty of Agriculture.

As for the operational status of all equipment, 255 sets were provided altogether: 101 sets to the Faculty of Agriculture, 80 to the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine and 74 to the Faculty of Pharmacy (the Faculty of Science did not answer). At every faculty, there are some equipments unused. Examples of such unused equipments include spectrophotometers, blood analyzers and fluorescence microscopes, as mentioned by the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, whereas the Faculty of Agriculture and the Faculty of Pharmacy answered only that "some equipment" are unused. Major reasons of not using are loss of instruction manuals, lack of spare parts, and unfamiliarity with new equipment.

Some problems have been observed in terms of technical and financial aspects, and therefore, sustainability of the project effect is fair.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Masaaki Shiraishi Waseda Research Institute Corporation (WRI)	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for the Implementation of Obstetrical Service in the Republic of Armenia	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	The Republic of Armenia	
Project Period	March 2005-February 2006	
Executing agency	Center of Perinatology, Obstetrics and Gynecology (CPOG) Gavar Maternal Hospital Hrazdan Maternal Hospital	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 209 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 203 million yen
Main Contractors	Sarina Corporation	
Main Consultants	ICONS International Cooperation Inc.	
Basic Design	December 2004	
Related Projects (if any)	JICA, "The Project for Health-Maternal and Child Health / Reproductive Health" (2004-2006) (Technical Cooperation Project)	
Project Background	<p>The combination of the collapse of the USSR and subsequent conflict with neighboring Azerbaijan forced Armenia to cope with worsened economic conditions while undergoing drastic changes of its national system. This seriously affected the previous high level of medical health services. In light of the situation, the National Health Policy for the Republic of Armenia 2004-2015 addresses the issue of a number of reforms to the health sector. In particular, it states that a vulnerable group in the sector, women and children, should be assigned priority as per the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper in 2003. However, holdings of equipment in three major target medical institutions become obsolete and unusable for achieving the desirable level of obstetrical service. Therefore, improvement of the service through upgrading equipment was considered urgent and given priority. Considering this situation, the Armenian government requested Japanese government grant assistance for purchase of relevant equipment for obstetrical service in the hospital.</p>	
Project Objective	To refurbish the medical equipment of CPOG, Gavar Maternal Hospital and Hrazdan Maternal Hospital, in order to improve obstetrical care in Armenia.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - US (Color Doppler) with Necessary Probes - US (B/M Mode) with Necessary Probes - Biochemical Analyzer - Operation Table - Anesthetic Unit - Laparoscope Set - Obstetrical Bed (LDR type) - Infant Warmer - Gynecological Examination Chair - Patient Monitor for ICU - Infusion Pump (syringe type) - Infant Incubator - Infant Ventilator - Steam Sterilizer - Washing Machine 	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>This project conforms to social development policy and needs of Armenia and Japan's ODA policy as well. The project has been implemented almost as planned, and the project performance procedure has been highly appreciated. Although the project outcomes are evident, due to economic difficulties that impede production of the expected effect of the equipment supplied under the project, it is hard to assign high score. In regard to sustainability, downsizing of staff and beds have been effectively covered by rationalization of management. In terms of financial aspects, though budgetary support by the government fairly covers almost all the required expenditures, some destabilizing factors are identified, namely a shortage in the supply of consumables and spare parts due to budgetary deficit; these shortages have caused some of equipment supplied under the project to be left unused (as "out-of order"). This issue may cause opportunity loss and reduce the physical sustainability of the equipment, and therefore the value of the project will decline.</p> <p>In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be fairly satisfactory.</p> <p><Recommendations></p> <p>As a recommendation to JICA, the statement by the executing agency that the majority of equipment that has consumables and spare parts, which quickly go unserviceable, should be investigated in detail as it may be lack of fund to purchase expensive spare parts that has made the equipment stand idle.</p>

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan and Policies of the Armenia

At the time of project planning, the National Development Plan of Armenia (2003), that was drawn up with collaboration of the World Bank and IMF, positioned maternal and child health sector as a strategic field in the development process, and in the National Health Policy (2003) issued by the Ministry of Health, strengthening maternal and child health and primary health care were made specific targets. At the time of post-evaluation, The National Program, Strategy and Action Plan on Reproductive Health for 2007 – 2015 had been issued (in 2007), and programs on maternal health protection, contraception, safe abortion, genital infection prevention, etc. are currently underway. This project, in the above context, is consistent with the policy of Armenia.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of the Armenia

At the time of project planning, whereas countermeasures against fertility decline in the Armenia that have continued since 1992, decrease of infant mortality, maternal mortality, and perinatal mortality have continued to be serious issues in the field of medical care, And modernization of the hospital facilities has been an important countermeasure. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, it was reported that improvement of fertility rate, modernization of hospital facilities, and strengthening of the referral system are all still insufficient. Therefore, there is evident and high need for such improvements, and the project's contribution to modernization of medical facilities at three obstetrical hospitals is now helping to achieve those improvements.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

Japan's ODA White Paper for 2004, under the essential philosophy of "human security" concept, stated that maternal and child health, public health and healthcare are of crucial importance for realization of MDGs. The same white paper advocates Japan's aid policy for the countries in Central Asia and the Caucasus region to be focused on healthcare together with other fields such as economic management, communication, and transport infrastructure. In the Country-wise Data Book of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs for 2005, as basic policy of ODA for Armenia, in order to address the problems of aging economic infrastructure and deterioration of the environment, healthcare is emphasized as one of five important fields in the social sector to be supported. This project, therefore, is consistent with the Japanese government's ODA policy.

This project has been highly relevant with Armenia's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

Despite slight changes, outputs by the Japanese side have been attained essentially as planned.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

The project implementation period of 11 months was slightly longer than the planned period of 10 months (109.7%). The reason for the delay has not been confirmed.

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

The actual project cost of 203 million yen was lower than the planned budget of 209 million yen (97.1%).

Although the project period was slightly longer than planned, the project cost was lower than planned, and therefore efficiency of the project is fair.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

In the time of planning, evaluation of quantitative effects of the project were expected to be felt three years after completion of delivery of equipment, and no numerical targeted outcomes were indicated; objectives were expressed only in terms of "increase" or "decrease". The performance record in the three hospitals (CPOG, Gavar and Hrazdan) in terms of the number of parturient outpatients, parturients registered and neonatal deaths in 2004 and 2009 are as shown in the attached Table-1. According to the data, both parturient outpatients and parturients registered increased and neonatal deaths decreased. However, these outcomes are attributable not only to equipment supplied under the project, but to combined effects of other contributions such as educational campaigns aimed at parturient, improvement in the hygienic environment, nation-wide improvement in healthcare technology, etc. As per responses by the executing agency, the contribution to these outcomes by the project is evaluated as at the moderate level. However, modernization of the facilities of targeted hospitals under the project might have contributed to the achieved outcomes and to improvement of reproductive health in the country. However, to our request of a 4-grade evaluation of the contribution level for three outcome items, results were referral system strengthening = 3/4, infant mortality = 2/4 and perinatal mortality = 3/4, and they were not always highly marked.

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the Natural Environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)

According to responses from the executing agency, an indirect impact by the project has been identified as an abundant benefit to CPOG's educational program and synergy effect to its Evidence Based Medicine Project. Reportedly, however, some of equipment supplied under the project has become broken, and left unused. Due to existence of such idle equipment, the expected outcomes are deemed likely to be impeded, and unexpected opportunity losses emerge. Nevertheless, it is difficult to clarify the actual fact only by desk research. No negative impacts due to destruction of nature, land expropriation, relocation of inhabitants, etc. have been reported.

This project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Comparison of organizational structure by kind of staff in the three hospitals in 2004 and 2009 is shown in the attached Table-2. Changes in the number of staff show 4% increase for doctors, 7% decrease for nurse and 73% decrease for technicians in average, and the overall staff reduction is 6%. The reason of the decrease has been explained as a result of "renovation in inpatients medical service". No relevant policies or supporting data have been provided, but according to the executing agency, they address downsizing policy of number of inpatients, beds and staff of the hospital. Number and status of indirect staff have not responded. Further, present status of operations supposedly affected by decrease of medical engineers is unknown, but since no particular response is reported it is considered to be no particular problems in organizational concern as a whole.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Since most of the equipment newly employed has been for replacement of old models, technical training on operation and maintenance has been accomplished satisfactorily. According to the report from the executing agency, however, mechanical troubles have occurred at most once a month due to breakdown of consumable parts. No information has been provided about preparation of manuals and technical training.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Reportedly, the financial status of the institutions has been consistently sound, and no specific problems have been identified. However, despite of staff reduction, increases in the average salary exceed the growth rate of government disbursement to each hospital (see attached Table-3). It may become a financial burden hampering operation and management in the long run. Further, the proportion of personnel expenses in each hospital accounts for 10.5% (CPOG), 4.1% (Gavar) and 3.0% (Hrazdan) of the total expenses of the hospital respectively, and it is evident that operation policy of the hospitals in the country relies on the financial support by the government.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

It is reported that some equipment has been out of order, and some equipment has been not repaired, and these pieces of equipment have been left unused. According to responses by the implementation organization, these pieces of equipment are easily breakable, and their replacement parts are expensive, and that is the likely reason for them not to use the equipment. According to response by the executing agency, the result of their 5-grade evaluation on the supplied equipment by ten suppliers consisting 8 from Japan and 2 from Germany shows 5/5 for the two suppliers from Germany, 2/5 for seven suppliers and 1/5 for one supplier from Japan, where Japanese suppliers have been rated as very low. In the free comment column in the questionnaire sheet, they have stated as "Unfortunately, the majority of equipment has consumables and spare parts, which quickly go unserviceable (out of order), such as lamps, filters, sensors, electrodes, etc., this hospital does not have enough funds to procure spare parts, therefore the equipment stands idle."

However, on the claim of "fragile", there may be possibly another reason due to technical insufficiency in repair and maintenance technology, and on the claim of "expensive", this may be possibly explained by financial constraints. This issue, therefore, is difficult to clarify on a desk research basis only.

Some problems have been observed in terms of technical or financial aspects, therefore sustainability of the project effects is fair.

Table-1 Performance of Targeted Outcomes

Name of Hospital	Year	Parturient Outpatient		Parturient Registered		Neonatal Death	
		Performance	Index	Performance	Index	Performance	Index
OPCG	2004	3,940	107	2,400	149	60	38
	2009	4,200		3,576		23	
Gavar Maternal Hospital	2004	403	183	740	103	11	9
	2009	737		760		1	
Harazdan Maternal Hospital	2004	400	300	892	131	16	75
	2009	1,200		1,170		12	
Total	2004	4,743	129	4,032	137	87	41
	2009	6,137		5,506		36	

Note: Index is based on 2004=100

Table-2 Change in Number of Enrollment in Each Hospital

Name of Hospital	Year	Medical Doctor		Nurse		Medical Engineer		Total	
		Enrollment	Incr./Decr. Rate	Enrollment	Incr./Decr. Rate	Enrollment	Incr./Decr. Rate	Enrollment	Incr./Decr. Rate
OPCG	2004	66	108%	125	98%	5	20%	196	99%
	2009	71		123		1		195	
Gavar Maternal Hospital	2004	14	86%	42	71%	3	33%	59	73%
	2009	12		30		1		43	
Harazdan Maternal Hospital	2004	16	106%	49	98%	3	33%	68	97%
	2009	17		48		1		66	
Total	2004	96	104%	216	93%	11	27%	323	94%
	2009	100		201		3		304	

Note: Index is based on 2004=100

Table-3 Substance of Financial Status

	2004	2005	2007	2009	Average Annual Incr./Decr. Rate
Government Disbursement	346,789	416,730	599,774	1,046,598	24.72%
Personnel Expenses	163,771	249,594	317,576	731,051	34.88%
Number of Enrollment	326	-	-	307	-1.19%