

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Keiko Watanabe Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project on Balancing and Modernization of Workshop Facilities at the Pakistan Industrial Technical Assistance Centre (PITAC)	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Islamic Republic of Pakistan
Project Period	15 September 2002-14 September 2006 (4 years)
Executing Agency	Pakistan Industrial Technical Assistance Centre (PITAC), Ministry of Industries & Production
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Sokeizai Center (The Material Process Technology Center)
Total Cost	903.54 million yen
Related Projects (if any)	-Technical Cooperation: "Project for the modernization of the manufacturing process of molds and dies in PITAC" (Sep.1982-Oct.1985) -After-Care Cooperation: "Project for the modernization of the manufacturing process of molds and dies in PITAC" (1994-1995)
Overall Goal	Domestic plastic mold making industries are able to supply better quality molds for plastic production in Pakistan
Project Objective(s)	Technical capability of PITAC is upgraded to extend technical services in the field of plastic mold technology
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The project operation unit is established for making advanced plastic molds 2. The necessary machineries and equipment are provided, installed, operated and maintained properly 3. Technical capability of the C/Ps is upgraded 4. Technical training courses and seminars are implemented systematically 5. Technical backup support services are implemented systematically 6. Advisory services are implemented systematically 7. Interactions of the Project with private companies are strengthened

Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Pakistan Side)	
Experts	6 Long term, 20 Short term experts	Staff allocated	30 C/Ps
Equipments	340 million yen	Equipments	N/A
Local Cost	10.43 million yen	Local Cost	PKR 27 million
Trainees Received	26 C/Ps	Land etc provided	Building, Equipment
Others	N/A	Others	N/A

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

The project was implemented with aims of upgrading technical capabilities of PITAC in producing plastic molds as well as contributing the improvement of the plastic mold industry in Pakistan by PITAC's providing training, technical backup support, and advisory services. Therefore, upgrading technical skills in plastic mold production alone would not be enough to fulfill the project objective, but the project goal was that PITAC would itself acquire the capacity to build a firm relationship with industry and become a technical and advisory services provider to customer companies. When the project started, the skills necessary to produce sophisticated plastic mold parts essentially did not exist in Pakistan; therefore, these parts were imported. The Government of Pakistan adopted a policy to increase local procurement rates, so that the internal plastic mold demand was very high. By producing four model molds, the Project unquestionably increased the plastic mold production skill capacity at PITAC. Other outputs included training, company visits, technical backup support, and advisory services. PITAC itself, to a certain degree, has been able to conduct these activities without full Japanese expert support. However, during the project period, only limited numbers of these activities were feasible; therefore, the impact on the industry was not sizable. The major reason for this was that the project pre-conditions including construction and refurbishment of building and facilities, and deployment of qualified C/Ps were only met after more than two years of implementation. The Project, therefore, had to make a great deal of effort to meet the pre-conditions during these first two years; thus, the planned activities were delayed. Also, the frequent turn over of the General Manager of PITAC influenced efficient and coherent project operation.

At the time of ex-post evaluation, it was observed that the training courses introduced by the Project were continuously conducted and an additional 25 molds were produced. From these facts, it is confirmed that the PITAC capacity increased even after the Project ended. However, some concerns about sustainability of the project effect were observed. PITAC does not have firm financial base and some of the necessary activities like seminars, PC software/anti-virus updates, workshop renovation and maintenance, and spare part procurement of some equipment has not been implemented due to the budget shortfalls. In addition, the electricity supply problem, which was pointed out during the project period, has not been solved and is still causing the frequent interruption or postponement of the training sessions.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be fairly satisfactory.

<Recommendations for JICA>

If a project starts without having fulfilled the pre-conditions, it may need extra time and effort to complete the pre-conditions, which may to a great extent affect the planned project goals. Therefore, before the project starts, thorough consultations between JICA and the counterpart should be conducted as to whether pre-conditions have been met or not, and what countermeasures should be taken if the pre-conditions were not met.

<Recommendation for PITAC>

The frequent interruption or postponement of the training sessions due to the electricity problem may undermine the PITAC reliability even though the training contents are excellent. Considering the financial situation, problems need to be prioritized and urgent countermeasures taken.

<Constraints of this evaluation study>

Since the measurable targets for the project objectives and some output indicators were not set, a degree of project achievement was not explicitly identified. In addition, as seen from their indicators, Output 1 and Output 2 are rather Input or Activity level, not Output level. Therefore, these two outputs were examined in Efficiency, not in Effectiveness-Impact.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Pakistan

"Ten-Year Perspective Development Plan (2001-2011)" stipulates the importance of economic growth by developing the private sector including small and medium enterprises (SMEs) through improving competitiveness by promoting productivity, efficiency, and quality. The 1999 Economic Revival Plan specified SME development as a priority area. To develop local supporting industries, the government adopted a localization policy which set target levels for procuring locally produced parts by foreign companies operating in the country.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Pakistan

A variety of industrial sectors require plastic mold production, therefore, upgrading technical skills and quality in this area are essential for economic growth. In accordance with the above government localization policy, the sophisticated parts that had been imported were now required to be produced locally.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

One of the priority areas of Japan's assistance was to build Pakistan's economic base in accordance with the results of the 1996 economic cooperation survey and policy dialogue with the Government of Pakistan. The country assistance policy that was developed in February 2005 stated the importance of "sound market economy development" including the issues of production management quality, SME control, and export-oriented enterprises.

From the above, this project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore, its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

The Project produced the following outputs;

- ① Technical skills of counterparts have definitely improved by producing the target four model molds, although continuous training would be required. (Output 3)
- ② The training courses were conducted in accordance with the annual plan. According to the available data, up to June 2006, the Project conducted 34 training courses with 273 participants almost reaching the targeted number of 36 courses with 265 participants. Most of the training courses were assessed by the participants as satisfactory. It can be said that the expected training outputs were produced. The Project also held 21 seminars in five areas: Occupational Safety and Health Management (12), Latest Technology (3), Total Quality Control (4), Project Introduction (1), and 3D modeling (1). 1,454 customers in total from private companies participated. (Output 4)
- ③ The technical backup support to the private companies began in October 2005, 3 years after the Project started. Out of 14 inquiries, 6 services were completed by project termination. The advisory services also began in June 2005, which was later than planned. The Project received 26 requests from 7 companies and completed more than half of them by the end of the project period. During the initial period of the advisory services, Japanese experts mainly provided the technical advice, however, gradually C/Ps were able to deal with the services without assistance from the Japanese experts. Both services were originally planned to be initiated by 2004 after completing technical transfer to C/Ps. The main reason for the delay was that it took a great deal of time to fulfill the project pre-conditions, which were building construction and C/P deployment. Therefore, the achievement number of these services was limited. (Output 5 and Output 6)
- ④ According to the questionnaire survey at the terminal evaluation, the PITAC's training activities, technical backup support and advisory services were generally highly evaluated by the related industries. The questionnaire results also reflected the improvement and enforcement of the PITAC's services in support of the private sector. This kind of interaction between PITAC and the private sector enhanced their mutual relationship. During the project period, the number of private companies (customers) registered increased year-by-year, totaling 284 as of April 2005. (Output 7)

Actually, the project purpose was understood as synonymous with the above outputs since some of the output indicators were the same as those of the project purpose. Therefore, based on the above outputs, as shown in ③, the Project was only able to produce limited services and effects on the related industry in Pakistan within the project time frame. It can be concluded that the Project was not able to achieve its expected objective.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

The Project contributed to the SME development and the overall goal of qualitative mold production. For example, with the PITAC produced plastic mold, one of the natural gas pipeline companies became the sole supplier producing sophisticated parts cheaply in Pakistan, parts that used to be imported from western suppliers at high cost. The number of registered customers increased to 528 companies at the time of ex-post evaluation. Technical backup support also increased 49 cases (from 25 companies) and advisory services were provided to 7 companies in 2009.

From the above, this project has somewhat achieved its objectives; therefore, its effectiveness is fair.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As stated in the above "Effectiveness / Impact", some of the outputs of the Project were not fulfilled as expected.

(2) Elements of Inputs

The selection and recruitment of a Japanese long-term expert on mold processing was unsuccessful and the post was not filled. This led to the delay of the planned activities in that field. The Project made up for this gap by sending short-term experts and providing additional training in Japan. As a result, the expected output in this field was produced. Concerning the provision of machinery and equipment from Japan, procured items were appropriate in numbers and types. Also they were procured and transported to PITAC on time. However, the pre-conditions including construction and refurbishing of the building and C/Ps deployment were not completed before the Project start, as the Pakistani side failed to secure the local budget for these purposes in time. Therefore, the Japanese experts devoted their efforts to compensate for the preconditions for more than two years within the four-year project; and this obstructed the implementation of the planned activities. It is also reported that the frequent PITAC General Manager turn over affected coherent management and efficient communication with the Japanese experts.

(3) Project Cost, Period of Cooperation

The Project implementation period was as planned; the planned period was 48 months and actual period was 48 months (equal to 100% of planned period). The planned cost was not confirmed but the actual cost was 903.54 million yen.

From the above, some of the elements of inputs are not appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective; therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

The demand of plastic mold producing is still high among industries. The plastic industry is now the second fastest growing industry in Pakistan. In these circumstances, the PITAC modernization and technical upgrading direction is in line with Pakistan's long-term development strategy of "Vision 2030", "SME Policy 2007", and "Industrial Policy 2009-2010 (2009)".

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

The functions of the four sections (Design, Mold Making, Trial Shot, and Administration), which were newly established for the Project, are now incorporated into the existing sections in PITAC, which has enhanced the institutional sustainability. An internal PITAC management committee has been established and has developed a short-term and long-term strategy for PITAC. Out of 28 C/Ps, 23 C/Ps still remain at PITAC. More than half C/Ps staff was contract staff at that time, but 12 of them became permanent staff. It was self-evaluated that the number of staff is sufficient to operate PITAC activities.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

Judging from the fact that PITAC itself produced 25 plastic molds after the project termination (currently 4 more molds are in production) and revised four kinds of training materials, PITAC unquestionably has built up the needed technical skills as well as gaining a responsive ability to the changing needs and situations. The PITAC has instituted a system for the staff to increase broad-based technical skills by sending 4-6 personnel annually to domestic or overseas training programs, and transferring some internally every 2-3 years. It was reported that the training manuals that were produced by the Project are still frequently used and the persons in charge and supervisors for the machinery and equipment strictly practice the operational guidelines. Therefore, it is assumed that there are not any technical problems.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

The government funding the is increasing year by year and the PITAC income also has more that doubled since project termination (PKR 4.11 million (2005/06) → PKR 10.3 million (2008/09)). Training income is half of total revenue. However, it was reported that the budget is insufficient for PITAC to be a fully functioning operation, so that the necessary activities such as upgrading of PITAC workshops, holding seminars and symposiums, updating anti-virus software, and procuring licensed software, remain intact as of now. The machinery and equipment maintenance funds are only to some extent is secured. Some machinery spare parts and consumables have to be imported. Because of the budget shortfalls and the complexity of the import procurement process, some technical training and mold making using this machinery are from time to time interrupted.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

The technical training has been continuous. During the period of 2007 and 2009, 34 courses with 200-290 participants were conducted each year. Most of the training was evaluated as more than satisfactory according to participant post-training assessments. As seen in the increased number of technical backup support and advisory services as well as in the rising trend in the customer registration, it can be assumed that the relationship between PITAC and industry has been strengthened. In accordance with 5S's practices (Seiri (Sort), Seiton (Set in order), Seiketsu (Standardize), Seiso (Shine), Shituke (Sustain)) which were introduced during the Project, wearing uniforms and safety shoes, 5S routine patrol and tool box meetings in the morning have been continued. As for publicity, PITAC is updating its website monthly, distributing PITAC pamphlets, and advertising training courses in local newspapers. One area of concern is the electricity supply issue at the PITAC workshop was not completely solved despite it being pointed out at the mid-term evaluation and during the Project. After the indication, PITAC agreed to procure an Auto Voltage Regulator (AVR) and a generator. The AVR and 35 KVA generator having been procured and installed in the PITAC workshop. However, the 35 KVA generator was insufficient to operate the large machinery including the injection molds. Therefore, the training courses and mold making which require large machinery was frequently interrupted and postponed in some cases even after 2007. Among procured machinery and equipment, four pieces of equipment including a video camera and copy machine were damaged and remain unusable because of lack of funds and the difficulty in procuring spare parts locally. The production standardization of the molds by the Project has not been realized yet, which was one of the recommendations of the terminal evaluation.

From the above, some problems have been observed in the financial aspects of the executing agency; therefore, sustainability of the project effects is fair.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Hideyuki Takagi Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Modernization of Industrial Property Administration Project and the Follow-up Project	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of the Philippines		
Project Period	Original project: May 1999-May 2003 Follow-up project: November 2004-May 2006 (extended to March 2007)		
Executing Agency	The Intellectual Property Office of the Republic of the Philippines (IP Phil)		
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry, Japan Patent Office		
Total Cost	525 million yen		
Related Projects (if any)	None		
Overall Goal	The IP Phil will be able to grant intellectual property rights more promptly with increased accuracy.		
Project Objective(s)	The patent administration process is facilitated and improved in IP Phil.		
Output[s]	<p>Original Project:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Project operation unit will be enhanced. 2. Staff will be able to analyze the patent administration process and suggest ways of improvement. 3. Appropriate equipment will be provided, installed and maintained properly. 4. A bibliographic database will be created and utilized. 5. A document database will be created and utilized. 6. Staff will be able to manage the patent administration computerized system (PACSYS). <p>Follow-up Project:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. PACSYS is enhanced to be fully operational. 2. Staff's capacity of PACSYS management is improved. 		
	Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Philippine Side)
Experts	Original project: 7 for Long term, 11 for Short term Follow-up project: 1 for Long term, 4 for Short term	Staff allocated	Original project: 22 Follow-up project: 34
Equipments	Original project: 188 million yen Follow-up project: —	Equipments	Original project: 8 million peso Follow-up project:—
Local Cost	Original project: 14 million yen Follow-up project: 57 million yen	Local Cost	Original project: 26 million peso Follow-up project: 5 million peso
Trainees Received	Original project: 11 trainees Follow-up project:—	Land etc provided	Office for Japanese experts
Others	—	Others	—

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

The project is relevant with the Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan and development needs of the country as well as Japan's aid policy. The Patent Administration Computerized System (PACSYS), an input delivered in this project, failed to fully operate, and as a result a follow-up project was needed to put it right. The project had problems in efficiency as seen in the fact, among others, that the actual expenses for the inputs were higher than planned. In terms of effectiveness, the follow-up project finished with its effects confirmed for achieving the objective, a reduction in the manual procedures needed to deal with patent administration process, and the effects are still being maintained. However, the obsolete server takes a rather long time for processing. For administration process to be dealt with more quickly, further improvement is needed. IP Phil, on its part, successfully maintains its systems and abilities to operate PACSYS, and it manages to operate on a self-paying basis, doing without subsidies from the government, which demonstrates good sustainability of effects the project has delivered.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be fairly satisfactory.

< Recommendations >

Use of PACSYS has not yet reached the level assumed. In order to grant industrial property rights more quickly, there is still room for improvement. The current status is due to the slow processing of the system and a lack of data, a result of the unfinished entry of the backlog of data. The system's slowness in processing comes from the fact it was an old model, for which the maker has already terminated offering support services. The evaluation at completion of the follow-up project also recommended that the server

and other system components be renewed, taking into consideration the future integration of IP Phil's systems. On the other hand, the backlog of data entry has not yet been finished because it is complicated work and takes time. It is desirable that further inputs be delivered as far as they are required to complete the data entry work and quickly raise the utilization level of PACSYS.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of the Philippines

The Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan (2001-2004), a plan prepared at the beginning of the project, pointed out the necessity of intellectual property rights protection for the strengthening of the information communication sector. The Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan (2004-2010), another program produced at the end of the project, also refers to an increase in intellectual property registration as a tool for economic development and job creation that should be promoted.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of the Philippines

IP Phil received an annual average of 4,200 patent applications during the ten years from before the beginning to the end of the project, and 4,700 at the end of the project, which was quite a large number. There is still a high level of need for quick and accurate implementation of the patent administration process.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

In its ODA Charter, Japan mentions the appropriate protection of intellectual property rights as a key issue, declaring that with its individual aid programs, it will support developing countries in enhancing the development and implementation of their intellectual property systems according to their needs and priorities.

This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

The original project achieved improvements in the patent administration process at IP Phil and trained its staff to operate the PACSYS that was introduced. Despite the completion of the bibliographic and document databases, due to the failure of PACSYS to be fully operational, no major outputs were realized in terms of the quicker patent administration process. At the end of the follow-up project, its effects showed up in a reduction in the manual procedures needed to deal with patent administration process, which was an objective of the project. At that point in time, at least 50% of the IP Phil staff came to recognize the importance of PACSYS.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

IP Phil receives less patent applications than in 2000, a reflection of the increase in international applications after the Philippines' participation in the Patent Cooperation Treaty (PCT) and the global economic crisis. Such external factors have hindered the number of administration processes dealt with for industrial property from rapidly increasing from the level before the project was carried out. On the other hand, IP Phil recognizes that with improvements in the efficiency of patent administration process delivered by the introduction of PACSYS they are prepared to respond to any future increase in patent applications. Positive indirect effects delivered by the introduction of PACSYS include systems that allow mutual support between patent and trademark administration processes, which will contribute to future patent administration in the Philippines.

This project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As described above in (1) of "Effectiveness / Impact," this project, with the follow-up project having been carried out, has produced outputs generally as planned.

(2) Elements of Inputs

In terms of inputs in this project, comparison cannot be made between planned and actual expenses for the whole process of the original project combined with the follow-up project, as the latter was added to enable PACSYS to become fully operational. In the original project alone, the cost of the equipment supplied and local costs borne by the recipient country both were significantly higher than planned.

(3) Project Period of Cooperation

The original project, designed to be completed in 49 months, actually finished in this number of months (a ratio of 100% to the plan). The follow-up project, designed to be completed in 19 months, actually finished in 29 months (a ratio of 153% to the plan). As this project succeeded in achieving the objective originally set for it only after the follow-up project had been carried out, the judgment is that the cooperation period was significantly longer than planned.

(4) Project Cost of Cooperation

The extent to which the project costs of cooperation were projected in the plan has not yet been confirmed as no information is available concerning this. This project actually cost ¥525 million, with no problem found when it is compared with other projects with similar contents. Just as the cooperation period was too long, the judgment is that the cooperation costs to carry out the follow-up project in order to achieve the project objective were significantly higher than planned.

The inputs are not appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective, therefore efficiency of the project is low.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

As the current Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan (2004-2010) refers to an increase in intellectual property as a tool for economic development and job creation that should be promoted, it still ranks high among policy priorities.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

Operation of PACSYS continues with 22 staff members assigned to the Information Systems and Operation Units. With the rules that the two Units have established for the operation of PACSYS, the system of IP Phil has been maintained.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

IP Phil ensures that its staff both at the Information Systems and Operation Units are technically qualified for the operation and maintenance of PACSYS.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

After its shift to a self-supporting accounting system in FY2007, IP Phil's service is financed not with subsidies from the government, but mainly from revenue collection from patent annuities.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

The effects of the project are still being maintained. However, to deal with the administrative process more quickly, problems - slow processing speed of the system operated with an obsolete server and a lack of data due to the unfinished entry of the backlog of data - should be solved.

No major problems have been observed in the policy background, the structural, technical, financial aspects of the executing agency, therefore, sustainability of the project effects is high.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Hideyuki Takagi Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for the Quality Tuberculosis Control Programme	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of the Philippines			
Project Period	September 2002-August 2007			
Executing Agency	The Infectious Diseases Office of the Department of Health (DOH-IDO); Research Institute on Tropical Medicine, National Tuberculosis Reference Laboratory (NTRL); and Center for Health Development			
Cooperation Agency in Japan	The Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare and the Research Institute Tuberculosis, Japan Anti-Tuberculosis Association			
Total Cost	563 million yen			
Related Projects (if any)	Public Health Project (September 1992-August 1997), Tuberculosis Control Project (September 1997-August 2002), and construction of the National Tuberculosis Reference Laboratory (NTRL) (March 2002)			
Overall Goal	Tuberculosis (TB) in the Republic of the Philippines is controlled.			
Project Objective(s)	Quality NTP (National Tuberculosis Control Program) is sustainably managed.			
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Quality DOTS (Directly Observed Treatment, Short-course) implementation is ensured through capacity building activities and a strengthened monitoring and supervision system. 2. Quality laboratory services become available nationwide due to the formation of networks for sputum examinations. 3. Capability to plan and conduct Operations Research (OR) is strengthened to monitor the TB control program. 			
	Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Philippine Side)	
Experts	5 for Long term, 50 for Short term		Staff allocated	18
Equipments	87 million yen		Equipments	-
Local Cost	74 million yen		Local Cost	29 million pesos
Trainees Received	13		Land etc provided	Offices, facilities and equipment for experts
Others	-		Others	-

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

The project was carried out in an efficient manner. With regard to outputs produced, the objectives were achieved generally as planned for each of the objectives: the enhanced ability to implement quality DOTS; strengthened networks for sputum examinations; and improved ability to conduct operations research for monitoring the TB control program. As a result, indicators of the project objectives - improvements in the national recovery rate of tuberculosis and discovery rate of TB patients - were generally satisfied. On the other hand, data concerning the overall goal, a reduction by half in the indicators for TB problems, at the time of the ex-post evaluation were unavailable in the survey. However, statistical data from the World Health Organization (WHO) shows that the mortality rate for tuberculosis marked a significant decline, even though it fell short of a 50% reduction, which confirms the partial contribution that this project has made. Despite the tendency for insufficient budgets to be appropriated for TB control programs, the counterparts maintained their role and activities even after the program finished.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of the Philippines

The Philippines is one of the major TB-infected countries in the world. In the National Objectives for Health (1999-2004), announced in 1999, a 50% reduction in the morbidity rate, the mortality rate and occurrence of complications from TB was set as the target. The Medium-term Philippines Development Plan (2004-2010) points out that tuberculosis as one of the critical diseases to be tackled, with a discovery rate of 70% and a recovery rate of 85% among the sputum smear-positive patients designated as targets.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of the Philippines

From the beginning of the project to its end, the Philippines saw tuberculosis ranked sixth in the morbidity rate among the diseases affecting humans. (The country had 114,000 patients, or a morbidity rate of 143 patients per 100,000 people in 2002, and as many as 114,000 patients, or a morbidity rate of 136 patients per 100,000 people in 2007.)

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

This project is relevant to the basic policy of the aid plan for the Philippines. Aid for the health sector is regarded as an important field, and TB is pointed out as one of the particularly important issues in the health sector.

This project has been highly relevant with the Philippines' development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

In this project, each of the objectives - enhanced ability to implement quality DOTS, strengthened networks for sputum examinations, and improved ability to conduct operations research for monitoring the TB control program- were achieved generally as planned. The national recovery rate for tuberculosis rose from 75% in 2002 to 82% in 2006 (against a target of 85% or more), and so did the discovery rate of patients from 57% in 2002 to 75% in 2006 (against a target of 70% or more), part of which can be attributed to the contribution this project made.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

As data concerning the overall goal, a 50% reduction in the TB morbidity and mortality rates, was unavailable at the time of the ex-post evaluation, the level of achievement in these indicators could not be judged. However, statistical data from the World Health Organization (WHO) shows that the TB mortality rate fell from a ratio of 58 deaths per 100,000 people in 2000 to a ratio of 41 deaths per 100,000 people in 2007, and the TB mortality rate in 2010 is forecasted to decline further to a ratio of 34 deaths per 100,000 people, which is a remarkable decline despite the failure to reach the target of a 50% reduction.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As described above in (1) of "Effectiveness / Impact", this project produced the outputs generally as planned.

(2) Elements of Inputs

The inputs into this project were provided as stated in the "Project Outline."

(3) Project Period of Cooperation

The project period, 60 months in the plan, actually ended in 60 months, just as planned (100% of the plan).

(4) Project Cost of Cooperation

The project cost, ¥540 million in the plan, actually totaled to ¥513 million, lower than planned (95% of the plan).

The inputs were appropriate for producing the outputs and achieving the project objectives, therefore the efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

As the Medium-term Philippine Development Plan (2004-2010) again points out that TB control measures are an important policy for the health sector, the policy has high sustainability. The central government of the Philippines maintains a strong commitment to NTP. Now that the methods of implementing TB control measures transferred to the country in this project are reflected in the NTP, the central government will continue carrying out anti-TB measures according to a revised version of the "Manual of Procedures 2005, 4th edition."

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

Since many of the counterparts are still engaged in the NTP, the same roles and activities are maintained as at the implementation stage of the project. Presently, in the Philippines Programmatic Management for Drug Resistant Tuberculosis (PMDT) an issue is that DOH-IDO and NTRL also deal with an increasing number of PMDT-related tasks.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

The counterparts have maintained the skills to offer touring guidance on DOTS to public health centers and to conduct sputum smear examinations, and these activities are regularly conducted. Training for touring guidance on DOTS and sputum smear examinations is also provided.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

Budgets appropriated to the NTP and local government TB control measures tend to be insufficient at present, and they will remain so in the near future. According to responses from the counterparts to the questionnaires, in order to support the implementation of the NTP at the local level, it is necessary to increase the Provincial Investment Plan for Health (PIPH).

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

Data for 2007 has not been obtained. Data at the end of the project suggests that most of the project objectives have been achieved. As stated above in terms of the overall goal, the indicators for TB problems are on a downward trend, a fact that indicates that the effects of the project have presumably been maintained.

In light of the above, in the decentralized health sector, the steady appropriation of the budget required for TB control measures at the local government level is still an issue to be addressed, and therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is fair.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Sawa Hasegawa Japan Development Service Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Improvement of Cattle Artificial Insemination Technology	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	The Socialist Republic of Vietnam		
Project Period	October 2000-October 2005		
Executing Agency	National Institute of Animal Husbandry (NIAH), Moncada Artificial Insemination Center (MAIC)		
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries		
Total Cost	632 million yen		
Related Projects (if any)	N.A		
Overall Goal	The productivity of milk and beef will be increased by improving cattle artificial insemination techniques.		
Project Objective(s)	Artificial insemination techniques for cattle will be improved through the use of straw semen.		
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. AI technicians are trained and their skills are improved. 2. Distribution method for frozen semen and AI recording management are improved. 3. Production technique of straw typed frozen semen is improved. 4. Feeding and management of sires are improved. 		
	Inputs (Japanese Side)	Inputs (Vietnamese Side)	
Experts	6 for Long term, 22 for Short term (at the time of terminal evaluation)	Staff allocated	44
Equipments	157.5 million yen (at the time of terminal evaluation)	Equipments	Provided (the amount is unknown)
Local Cost	65.6 million yen (at the time of terminal evaluation)	Local Cost	3,220 million dong (at the time of terminal evaluation)
Trainees Received	30	Land etc provided	Project office, etc.
Others		Others	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>The relevance of the project is high, and Project Outputs, Objective and Overall Goal set by the project have been largely achieved. The project operation was also implemented largely on schedule. Thus the project got the good results in terms of the relevance, effectiveness/impact and efficiency during its implementation, and so is the sustainability of the project after its completion, judging from the fact that its activities and impacts are generally well-sustained.</p> <p>In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p>

1 Relevance

<p>(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Vietnam</p> <p>At the time of planning the project, Vietnam's "6th 5-Year Socio-Economic Development Plan (1996-2000)" set as its objective the growth in agricultural production with emphasis on the development of animal husbandry. The next national development plan of "10-Year Socio-Economic Development Strategy (2001-2010)" then recognized 'improvement of agricultural technology for the modernization of agriculture' as its target, and the "5-Year National Dairy Development Project," the 'increase in the number of dairy cattle' and 'increase in the quantity of milk production.' This way, the centrality of animal husbandry promotion to Vietnam's national development plans remained unchanged till the end of the project and was supported throughout the project period. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have been relevant with the development plan of Vietnam.</p> <p>(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Vietnam</p> <p>At the time of planning the project, the introduction of technology to produce high-quality frozen semen was the highest priority for the breeding of indigenous cattle and for improved productivity of dairy cattle. Regardless of this situation, the Government's investment in artificial insemination system was insufficient, and the management of equipment and facilities inadequate. Besides, under the abovementioned National Dairy Development Project, the AI technicians belonging to the target group of this project were facing an urgent need to improve artificial insemination technology using straw typed frozen semen. The dissemination of insemination technology had been hampered by the inadequate level of knowledge and skills of both information delegate extension workers and practitioners. Such development needs in principle remained unchanged till the end of the project, and the demand for artificial insemination through straw typed frozen semen existed throughout the project implementation. From the situations above, the project can be evaluated to have met the development needs of Vietnam.</p>
--

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

At the time of planning the project, Japan's "Country Assistance Program for Vietnam" recognized 'agricultural and rural development' as one of the priority areas of its assistance, referring to the need for assistance to ensure improved agricultural productivity, increased food production, and market access to agricultural products. JICA's project execution policy for Vietnam also included the focus on the improvement and dissemination of technology in agriculture, forestry and fisheries, and the strengthening of focal academic institutions. The program and policy above remained unchanged till the end of the project and were supported throughout the project period. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have been relevant with Japan's ODA policy.

This project has been highly relevant with Vietnam's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective

The original PDM lacked the clarity in its description on the content of initial project plan. The revision of PDM was thus proposed during the mid-term evaluation of the project in March 2003, and the revisions were carried out twice during the project implementation. The first revision corrected the unclear description of project activities, whose main ideas Vietnamese counterparts had difficulties understanding. The second revision changed the wording of some output indicators which did not reflect the real situation in the country. These revisions contributed to better clarifying the objectives and activities of the project, and to deepen Vietnamese counterparts' understanding on the project.

The achievement level of each Project Output is as follows.

As for Output 1, follow-up training to AI technicians was conducted 8 times, to retrain 199 technicians in selected areas (5 provinces in the North and 4 in the South) and 12 from other provinces. 28 of these training participants joined an advanced training course. 11 different manuals and 21 textbooks were created for this follow-up training. Noted should be that the method of retraining AI technicians used by the project was incorporated in the National Dairy Development Project, under which further 480 technicians out of 1700 in whole Vietnam received retraining.

As for Output 2, the semen motility examination were carried out in 7 provinces (3 in the North and 4 in the South), whose result proved the motility rate of frozen semen in 3 Northern provinces to be over 40% on average (according to a sample test). The motility rate of those in 4 Southern provinces was around 30%, with some differentials identified among various samples. It was conjectured that the poorer result in the South than in the North could be explained by the South's distance from the Tu Son Artificial Insemination Center, causing the frozen semen to reduce its motility in the process of transportation and storage. Further, the monitoring survey of distributed semen quality undertaken by the field staff, succeeded in collecting necessary information using the method of recording artificial insemination and pregnancy tests, demonstrating the usefulness of the artificial insemination recording method and other formats introduced by the project.

Another output to note is the introduction of a database program for the storage, distribution, and management of frozen semen at the Tu Son Artificial Insemination Center in September 2004. The frozen semen produced at MAIC will be all delivered to the Tu Son Artificial Insemination Center which centralizes the nation-wide distribution of the semen. The data is updated daily by the staff in charge at the Tu Son Center, with which to create monthly reports. In addition, the method of managing the artificial insemination record and related materials (including insemination record books and other relevant equipment) was adopted in the National Dairy Development Project, and were utilized by the AI technicians of 29 provinces.

As for Output 3, the production of straw typed frozen semen of dairy cattle accounted as much as 91% at MAIC. Furthermore, the quality test in 2004 in the production process of straw typed frozen semen resulted in 96.4% of the semen to pass the test, a distinct improvement from 66% in 2002. In addition, all the data on the production and distribution of frozen semen produced at MAIC is now managed by a computer system where records are updated daily. To have such a system in place contributed to the improvement of production technology and of the management method.

As for Output 4, the rate of sire bulls used for semen processing increased from 50% at the beginning of the project, to 83%. Disposal rate of collected semen decreased from 60% in 2000 to 18% in 2004. In addition, regular health checkups were carried out to compile and record the data on semen collection, weights, heights and chest sizes to monitor and manage respective bulls. The formulation and utilization of a feeding program was also promoted for bulls bred at MAIC.

The project can be evaluated to have almost achieved Project Outputs since the indicator set under each Output was basically achieved.

In terms of the achievement level of Project Objective: 1) In the areas selected for the project, pellet-type was more prevalent in 2000 and straw-type was used less for artificial insemination of dairy cattle. By 2004, the prevalence of straw typed frozen semen was 95%; 2) In order to utilize the artificial insemination system improved by the project, and to utilize the artificial insemination data collected through artificial insemination recording method introduced by the project, NIAH initiated impregnation monitoring by types of bulls and by the work of each AI technician; 3) In the areas selected for the project, the average frequency in which each trained AI technician uses frozen semen increased from 342 times in 2002 to 410 in 2003, and so did the number of impregnated bulls. The improvement of fertility of dairy cattle in the same areas could not be confirmed, due to the lack of basic data relating to artificial insemination information at the time of the project commencement. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have almost achieved Project Objective since most indicators set under the Objective were basically achieved.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

In terms of the achievement level of Overall Goal, it should be noted that the amount of milk production of 10,583 tons at the initiation of the project in 2000 increased to 22,809 tons by the time of the terminal evaluation, and to 40,587 in 2008. The number of dairy cattle saw the increase from 5,809 in 2000, 15,845 in 2004, and 19,112 in 2008. The annual milk yield per cow increased from 3,634 kilos in 2000 to 3,959 kilos in 2004 (the data for 2008 unavailable). Furthermore, the insemination with straw typed frozen semen was adopted at all provinces. For these results, it is fair to assess that the project offered certain contribution to the achievement of Overall Goal.

Some other indirect effects of this project have also been reported as follows. Yet no negative impact on natural environment through the project has been reported so far.

- The ear tag cattle identification system introduced by the project contributed to the increase in the price of earmarked cattle.
- Income of AI technicians increased after the retraining by the project as compared to before, because the additional training rendered the trainees both the knowledge and equipment (on lease), thereby enhancing the credibility of the technicians' skills.
- An International Dairy Farming Workshop was organized, to familiarize with the systems and measures adopted in Thailand and Indonesia – two countries of the Southeast Asia region with advanced dairy farming – and to utilize those for the development of Vietnam's dairy farming system. The workshop received participation of 150 people from Vietnam, Thailand and Indonesia.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As mentioned in (1) of "Effectiveness / Impact," the project achieved the expected Project Outputs.

(2) Elements of Inputs

The inputs of the project are shown in "Project Outline." The implementation of the project experienced some delay in its planned activities, as a result of the delay in the dispatch of a successor chief advisor, which created the absence of experts for 6 months. Part of the project activities was also disrupted, since the budget to be incurred by the Vietnamese government was not disbursed by the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, causing the shortage of financing for training and for counterparts' travel. Regardless of such disruptions, Project Objective was achieved in the end. Judging from the terminal evaluation which analyzes that inputs other than above had been "effectively converted to outputs in terms of quality, quantity and timing," it is unlikely that the above issues affected the results of compiled overall achievements.

(3) Period of Cooperation, Project Cost

The actual period of cooperation was 5 years against planned 5 years, exactly as planned (100% of planned period). The actual project cost was 632 million yen, which could not be compared to the planned budget, due to the lack of information on the planned amount.

The inputs are appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

No policy change was observed in the area of animal husbandry promotion in Vietnam, and the policies continued to support animal husbandry. Vietnam's current "5-Year National Dairy Development Project (2006~2010)" aims at increasing the number of dairy cattle and continues to support its implementation by each province. The "Livestock Development Strategy to 2020 (2008)" formulated by the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development mentions the increase in the number of dairy cattle to 500,000 by 2020. Likewise, the same target areas referred to in the "5-Year National Dairy Development Project (2001~2005)" are also identified as target areas in the "5-Year National Dairy Development Project (2006~2010)," underpinning the sustainability of policies to back up the project.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executing Agency

Responses to the provided questionnaire indicate that the executing agency, NIAH's departments in charge of cattle artificial insemination techniques has further strengthened its implementation system than at the time of project implementation. No major challenge was identified in terms of the number of staff and of the decision-making process, to enable nationwide dissemination of the project's techniques to utilize straw typed frozen semen.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executing Agency

Some of the NIAH staff who worked at the time of project implementation continue to assume responsibilities in the same department. Since the questionnaire respondents stated that the knowledge and skills gained from the project are being inherited to new incumbents, no difficulty is foreseen in sustaining counterparts' skills.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executing Agency

Judging from the filled questionnaires, budget allocation from Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development has been sufficient, and no major concern are so far recognized in disseminating and sustaining the cattle artificial insemination techniques in straw typed.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

The textbooks and manuals made by the project continue to be utilized even after the project. Measures have been taken to disseminate skills and techniques to the AI technicians living in the parts of target areas which are in short of equipment to maintain the quality of frozen semen and of liquid nitrogen. The network is in place to deliver the straw typed frozen semen produced at MAIC to AI technicians nationwide, while maintaining the semen safe and hygienic. As a consequence, the distribution amount of the frozen semen produced by MAIC is seeing an increase. Some reports stated that no major concerns had been found on the use and management of the provided equipment.

No major problems have been observed in the policy background, the structural, technical, financial aspects of the executing agency, therefore sustainability of the project effects is high.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Sawa Hasegawa Japan Development Service Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project of Strengthening the National Institute of Veterinary Research	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	The Socialist Republic of Vietnam			
Project Period	March 2000-February 2005			
Executing Agency	National Institute of Veterinary Research (NIVR)			
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries			
Total Cost	834 million yen			
Related Projects (if any)	N.A			
Overall Goal	The livestock production in Vietnam is increased by improved diagnostic technology of animal infectious diseases.			
Project Objective	Diagnostic techniques, especially immunological ones at NIVR are improved.			
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The project is properly managed by the Project Management Unit (PMU). 2. Basic and applied techniques for immunological diagnosis of important infectious diseases are acquired by NIVR staff. 3. Latest status of important infectious diseases in Vietnam is studied and epidemiological skills are acquired by NIVR staff. 4. Local veterinarians are trained for appropriate diagnostic techniques for infectious diseases. 			
	Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Vietnamese Side)	
Experts	6 for Long term, 30 for Short term (at the time of terminal evaluation)		Staff allocated	60
Equipments	122 million yen ¹ (at the time of terminal evaluation)		Equipments	Provided (the amount is unknown)
Local Cost	445 million yen (at the time of terminal evaluation)		Local Cost	155,860 US dollars (at the time of terminal evaluation)
Trainees Received	26		Land etc provided	Project office, etc.
Others			Others	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

The relevance of the project is high, and Project Outputs, Objective and Overall Goal set by the project have been largely achieved. Although such an unexpected incident as the serious outbreak of avian flu resulted in more activities to be added to the original project plan, the project operation was implemented largely on schedule.

In terms of the sustainability of the project, however, several activities have been disrupted due to the lack of funding for the executing agency of NIVR. Unavailable was also the data on the status of the implementation of training by the counterpart, to widely disseminate the diagnostic techniques improved by the project to the fields in the provinces. This way, while the project has some challenges in its sustainability, it got the good results in terms of the relevance, effectiveness/impact and efficiency during its implementation.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

<Recommendations>

As recommendations to NIVR include further promotion of the dissemination of diagnostic techniques improved by the project, given its importance to animal disease prevention and to the promotion of animal husbandry as well as for wider dissemination of the diagnostic techniques to provinces, NIVR is expected to increase its efforts to secure additional budget for training from Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development. Even if it is not NIVR itself to receive the budget and carry out training, ways should be sought to encourage training implementation through other relevant organizations, including through the Regional Animal Health Center. Given the fact that animal disease control is supported by policy initiatives provides a persuasive ground for NIVR in making budget request to the Ministry, parallel efforts for self-finances should also be dedicated, through revenues from the production and sales of sample medicines dealt by NIVR, as well as through commissions on diagnosis.

¹ The Japanese yen figures shown here were converted from the US dollar amounts at the rate of 108.2 yen/dollar, which is a rough estimate of the annual average rate (Bank of Japan, 2004).

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Vietnam

At the time of planning the project, Vietnam's "6th 5-Year Socio-Economic Development Plan (1996-2000)" set as its objective growth in agricultural production, with emphasis on the development of animal husbandry. The next national development plan of "10-Year Socio-Economic Development Strategy (2001-2010)" then recognized 'improvement of agricultural technology for the modernization of agriculture' as its target. One of the 9 emphasis of the "5-Year Agricultural and Rural Development Plan (2001-2005)" was on 'development and dissemination of agricultural technology (with focus on the restructuring of agricultural research institutes, strengthening of partnership for research and its dissemination, increased investment for agricultural modernization, fostering of researchers, and the breeding of agricultural and forest products).' Besides, the "Master Plan for Agriculture Research in Vietnam (2001)" aimed at achieving the increase and steady supply of livestock by 2010, through promoting the programs for breeding agricultural products and livestock, based on the study results on major infectious diseases such as foot-and-mouth disease, pasturellosis, and classical swine fever. This way, the centrality of improving agricultural and animal husbandry technology to Vietnam's national development plans remained unchanged till the end of the project and was supported throughout the project period. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have been relevant with the development plan of Vietnam.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Vietnam

At the time of planning the project, NIVR had been undertaking research and study on animal diseases in Vietnam. Yet the level of its research technology was not adequate, and the facilities and equipment necessary for a research organization was particularly lacking. NIVR had been tasked to effectively promote research and study on animal diseases and improve the techniques to diagnose those diseases. While the increase and steady supply of livestock products was considered as Vietnam's national priority, small-scale farming communities were suffering from damages caused by diseases from livestock infections and parasites, given a hot and humid climate condition in Vietnam. These backgrounds urged the need for animal health control and for improved diagnostic techniques. Such development needs in principle remained unchanged till the end of the project, and the demand for diagnostic techniques for animal diseases existed throughout the project implementation. From the situations above, the project can be evaluated to have met the development needs of Vietnam.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

At the time of planning the project, Japan's "Country Assistance Program for Vietnam" recognized 'agricultural and rural development' as one of the priority areas of its assistance, referring to the need for assistance to ensure improved agricultural productivity, increased food production, and market access to agricultural products. JICA's project execution policy for Vietnam also included the focus on the improvement and dissemination of technology in agriculture, forestry and fisheries, as well as on the strengthening of focal academic institutions. The program and policy above remained unchanged till the end of the project and were supported throughout the project period. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have been relevant with Japan's ODA policy.

This project has been highly relevant with Vietnam's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective

The Overall Goal shown in PDM is that "the livestock production in Vietnam is increased by improved diagnostic technology of animal infectious diseases." The logic of this Overall Goal, however, is considered as a significant leap from Project Objective. This ex-post evaluation therefore assessed the achievement of this project against an alternate goal, rather than simply quoting the aforementioned Overall Goal. The alternative goal states that "practical diagnostic techniques will be disseminated to veterinarians and animal health workers."

The mid-term evaluation of the project in November 2002 proposed that the indicators in PDM be clarified, and the comments made at the mid-term evaluation and terminal evaluation also pointed out that the relationship was unclear between the experts' academic expertise and the areas of activities which the delegated experts were to supervise. Regardless of such advice, the revision of PDM was never undertaken during the project period.

The achievement level of each Project Output is as follows.

As for Output 1, a Project Management Unit (PMU) was established composed of the director, acting director, and chiefs of research offices of NIVR, as well as of representatives of relevant committees and Japanese experts. The PMU undertook the tasks of monitoring the project and calling for regular meetings. Other 4 committees (including a committee for selecting equipment to be provided, for the administration of joint experiments, among others) were also established in parallel to the commencement of the project, which were managed and supervised by the PMU. A joint coordination committee for all four committees was also organized annually.

As for Output 2, NIVR staff succeeded in acquiring skills in immunological diagnostic techniques including the technique to create monoclonal antibody, polyclonal antibody, and conjugation technique for immunological diagnosis. The diagnostic techniques manuals were formulated by the project, such as a diagnostic protocol "CSF Protocol for 4 methods" by the Virology department. The Parasitological laboratory created some procedure record and logs.

As for Output 3, studies were carried out in pilot sites of Ba Vi district of Hà Tây province, on dairy cattle prevalence of tuberculosis, brucella, leptospirosis and theileriosis. These studies, however, were implemented under the initiative of Japanese experts, leaving little room for NIVR staff to familiarize themselves with the research methodologies. For immunological test on livestock infections, diagnostic kits for immunological diagnosis were developed.

As for Output 4, NIVR staff carried out 6 training courses on diagnostic techniques in Ba Vi district of Hà Tây province, for 268 veterinarians and animal health workers. This training course was highly appreciated by the Provincial People's Committee. Besides, a workshop was organized for veterinarians and animal health workers working with the Regional Animal Health Center under the Division of Animal Health, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, on the diagnosis and prevention of parasitic infections, pasteurization, dairy cattle diseases and milk hygiene, and classical swine fever.

The project can be evaluated to have almost achieved Project Outputs since the indicator set under each Output was basically achieved.

In terms of the achievement level of Project Objective, following results were identified: 1) the diagnostic techniques for 5 major livestock infectious diseases were improved at each laboratory office of NIVR. These diseases are classical swine fever at the Virology laboratory, swine respiratory diseases at the Bacteriology laboratory, protozoology and hepatic fascioliasis at the Parasitological laboratory, mastitis at the Veterinary Hygiene laboratory, monoclonal antibody at the Immunity Pathology laboratory. 2) 41 NIVR staff implemented the training courses on diagnostic techniques animal diseases for veterinarians and animal health workers working with the Regional Animal Health Center. Almost half of the NIVR staff gained capacity to carry out both the lectures and practical exercises by themselves. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have almost achieved Project Objective since most indicators set under the Objective were basically achieved.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

In terms of the achievement level of Overall Goal, it should be noted that continuous efforts are made to widely disseminate the diagnostic techniques to the fields, by the NIVR staff who provide training courses on diagnostic techniques in response to the requests from rural veterinarians and animal health workers. The actual extent of the prevalence of the techniques, however, could not be confirmed due to the lack of relevant data. Hence, the dissemination activities are undertaken, yet the level of their achievement cannot be verified.

Some other indirect effects of this project have also been reported as follows. Yet no negative impact on natural environment through the project has been reported so far.

- As a result of clinical epidemiology survey targeting small-scale dairy farmers in some parts of Ba Vi district of Hà Tây province where dairy farming is promoted, the seriousness of the problems in breeding dairy cattle was recognized. In addition, the level of infections of dairy cattle bred outside was clarified by a parasite test and through the tests by ELISA on the antibody for brucellosis, tuberculosis, leptospirosis, and theileria parasites, whose results had an impact on Vietnam's dairy farming promotion policy.
- An international workshop on "Diagnosis and Prevention of Swine Fever in Indochina Region" was organized in Hanoi in October 2003 by this project, jointly with a regional project on the prevention of livestock diseases implemented in Thailand and its neighboring countries. The workshop confirmed the importance of the control measure supported by this project.
- This project and the disease prevention system established in NIVR made a significant contribution when avian flu broke out in Vietnam in January 2004. Owing partly to this contribution, NIVR later was designated by the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development as a reference laboratory for avian flu.
- NIVR staff acquired skills to carry out the isolation of avian flu virus, as well as its monitoring and vaccination tests.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As mentioned in (1) of "Effectiveness / Impact," the project achieved the expected Project Outputs.

(2) Elements of Inputs

The inputs of the project are shown in "Project Outline." Although such an unexpected incident as the serious outbreak of avian flu resulted in more activities to be added to the original project plan, the administration of the project mostly followed a set schedule. As shown in the "Effectiveness/Impact (1)," some concerns were raised on PDM of this project. However, judging from the terminal evaluation which analyzes that inputs other than above had been "effectively converted to outputs in terms of quality, quantity and timing," it is unlikely that the above issue affected the process of assessing overall achievements.

(3) Period of Cooperation, Project Cost

The actual period of cooperation was 5 years against planned 5 years, exactly as planned (100% of planned period). The actual project cost was 834 million yen, which could not be compared to the planned budget, due to the lack of information on the planned amount.

The inputs are appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

No policy change was observed in the area of agricultural development and animal husbandry promotion in Vietnam, and Vietnam's policies continued to support agricultural development and related measures for animal health. The extension of Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development's "Master Plan for Agriculture Research in Vietnam (2001)" for the next 5 years also confirms the policy sustainability.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executing Agency

Responses to the questionnaire state that the PMU established within NIVR still maintain the same function as it did during the project, confirming that sufficient human resources are secured for the current implementation structure. The same project counterparts continue to work with NIVR now, and so are the instructors who acquired the diagnostic techniques improved by the project, indicating that the institutional sustainability is existent. On the other hand, the closer collaboration between the laboratory offices recommended in the terminal evaluation seemingly has not been realized, even if the offices maintain the same level of collaboration.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executing Agency

According to the responses to the questionnaire, the diagnostic techniques that NIVR staff acquired through the project have been maintained, and the training on the techniques is being provided to the local veterinarians and animal health workers. Hence, no difficulty is foreseen in sustaining counterparts' skills.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executing Agency

Judging from the filled questionnaires, the budget allocation from the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development is insufficient. The responses to the same questionnaire also indicate that NIVR's animal operation facility reconstructed and expanded by the project has not been maintained in the same manner as during the project.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

The laboratory manuals and training textbooks made by the project continue to be utilized up to now. The terminal evaluation of the project recommended that "the results of the epidemiological studies on selected important infectious diseases be compiled," and that "the cooperation with the Division of Animal Health, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, and with the National Veterinary Diagnostic Center be promoted." Accordingly, the results were compiled, and the cooperation and partnership with the two organizations have been established. Noted also is that continuous efforts are made to widely disseminate the diagnostic techniques to the field, by the NIVR staff who provide training courses on diagnostic techniques in response to the requests from the local veterinarians and animal health workers. The actual extent of the prevalence of the techniques, however, is yet to be verified. While no major concern has been observed on the use and management of the provided equipment, comments have been raised that the supply ability of NIVR's transformer substation and electricity network is inadequate.

Some problems have been observed in the financial aspect of the executing agency, therefore sustainability of the project effects is fair.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Sawa Hasegawa Japan Development Service Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Cooperation in the Legal and Judicial Field (Phase 3)	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	The Socialist Republic of Vietnam		
Project Period	July 2003-June 2006		
Executing Agency	Ministry of Justice (MOJ), Supreme People's Procuracy, Supreme People's Court, Vietnam National University, Hanoi		
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Justice (Research and Training Institute), Supreme Court, Japan Federation of Bar Associations		
Total Cost	371 million yen		
Related Projects (if any)	JICA "The Project on the Legal and Judicial System Reform (2007~2011)" in Vietnam (Technical Cooperation Project)		
Overall Goal	Sub-Project A: The foundation of the legal infrastructure consistent with market economy is established. Sub-Project B: The implementation capacity of the judicial sector is strengthened.		
Project Objective(s)	Sub-Project A: Basic civil laws consistent with market economy are enacted through the increased law drafting capacity of legislative staff. Sub-Project B: The institutional framework to develop high-caliber human resources in the judicial sector is established.		
Output[s]	<p>Sub-Project A:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) The final draft of a revised Civil Code consistent with a market economy is prepared. 2) Basic knowledge about the legislation of intellectual property is obtained by national legislative staff and drafts of intellectual property regulations consistent with the revised Civil Code are prepared. 3) The final drafts of the Civil Procedure Code and the Law on Enterprise Bankruptcy consistent with market economy are prepared. 4) Drafts of other laws related to the Civil Code are prepared. <p>Sub-Project B:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Training programs and materials of existing judicial training institutions are improved (keeping in mind that the "National Judicial Academy," a unified professional training institution, will be established and will start activities in the near future). 2) Judgment documents are standardized, and court precedents that are accessible to the legal profession are compiled. 3) Students of the Law Faculty of Vietnam National University Hanoi obtain knowledge on Japanese laws, and lecturers specializing in Japanese laws are trained. 		
Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Vietnamese Side)	
Experts	7 for Long term, 29 for Short term (at the time of terminal evaluation)	Staff allocated	11
Equipments	7.6 million yen (at the time of terminal evaluation)	Equipments	Provided (the amount is unknown)
Local Cost	48 million yen (at the time of terminal evaluation)	Local Cost	Provided (the amount is unknown)
Trainees Received	68	Land etc provided	Project office, etc.
Others	Joint study groups of front-line academics and practitioners on 1) revising the Civil Code, 2) the Civil Procedure Code, 3) Judicial training and 4) standardizing judgment documents and compiling court precedents	Others	Expenses for manuals and textbooks: 26,920 US dollars in total

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>The project proved itself as highly relevant. Regarding the respective Project Outputs and Objective set by the project, Sub-Project A achieved most of the desired effects while some activities under Sub-Project B had only limited effects.</p> <p>On the project operation, the duration of cooperation slightly exceeded the initial plan. In explaining the delay in implementation, considerations need to be made to the following aspects: assistance such as this project to support the development of legal infrastructure can be considered as relatively a "high-level" project in term of the technicality it requires; the project involved the review and drafting of national laws, requiring more issues to be examined than other projects and thus more time to implement; there are also factors on the Vietnamese side – such as the delay in drafting of laws – which affected the project schedule but over which the project efforts could not exert effects.</p> <p>Currently, "the Project on the Legal and Judicial System Reform" is being implemented from April 2007 to March 2011 as a</p>