

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Maki Hamaoka Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Strengthening Extension System for Bivoltine Sericulture in India	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	India		
Project Period	August 11, 2002-August 10, 2007		
Executing Agency	Central Silk Board (CSB), Ministry of Textiles Departments of Sericulture (DOS) of the Karnataka (KA) State, the Andra Pradesh (AP) State and the Tamil Nadu (TN) State		
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries		
Total Cost	62.379 million yen		
Related Projects (if any)	The Bivoltine Sericulture Technology Development Project (BSTDP) (1991-1997) The Project for Promotion of Popularizing Practical Bivoltine Sericulture Technology (PPPBST) (1997-2002)		
Overall Goal	Enhancing production and quality of bivoltine raw silk and thereby raising the income levels of farmers and reelers.		
Project Objective(s)	Extension system for bivoltine sericulture will be functional		
Output[s]	(1) Action Plan for promotion of bivoltine sericulture will be formulated. (2) Coordination/Collaboration mechanism among CSB and DOSs for extension of bivoltine sericulture will be formulated. (3) System for mass production of quality seed will be established. (4) DOS staff will be equipped with necessary skills and knowledge for extension of bivoltine sericulture, and training facilities will be improved for bivoltine sericulture. (5) Extension model for bivoltine sericulture will be established.		
	Inputs (Japanese Side)	Inputs (Indian Side)	
Experts	8 for Long term, 15 for Short term	Staff allocated	172
Equipments	93 million yen	Equipments	N/A
Local Cost	N/A	Local Cost	213 million RS
Trainees Received	30 for Counterpart Training in Japan	Land etc provided	Office space for Japanese experts
Others	N/A	Others	N/A

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

In India, bivoltine raw silk of high quality suitable for warp depended on imports from China. Since 1991, JICA supported India in developing basic bivoltine sericulture technology as Phase-1 of this project and to verify developed bivoltine sericulture technology to farmers as Phase-2.

This project continued as Phase-3 to further expand and promote the bivoltine sericulture technology developed by the previous two projects. Through the Project implementation, the function of linkage and coordination between the relevant executing agencies including the Central Silk Board (CSB) and the Department of Sericulture (DOS) of the target states, and support to farmers by these agencies was strengthened. Mass production of quality bivoltine seed was achieved through strengthening production and expansion systems and included staff capacity building of relevant organizations in the areas of seed production and rearing, as well as improvement of necessary facilities. It can be evaluated that the bivoltine sericulture extension system is functional judging from achievements such as the remarkable increase in the number of bivoltine sericulture farmers and the total supply of quality bivoltine cocoons.

At the time of ex-post evaluation, the initially expected impacts as the overall goal of the Project, namely, increases in income of bivoltine sericulture farmers and reelers from sericulture and increases in the production of quality raw silk (above 2A level), were achieved: In addition, positive impacts beyond the country were observed. From 2008, a training course on bivoltine sericulture technology under the third country training program was organized by CSB in collaboration with JICA to expand bivoltine sericulture knowledge and technology to participants from raw silk producing countries. There is no problem in the organizational and institutional aspects of CSB and DOS as well as in technical and financial aspects. The bivoltine sericulture extension system has been maintained as established by the Project.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of India

"The 10th Development Plan (2002-2007)" stipulated strengthening bivoltine sericulture as a new initiative in the sericulture sector to increase production of bivoltine raw silk in the country.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of India

Sericulture has supported the local economy in South India as a means of employment creation and income generation. The target 3 states are chief areas for raw silk production with 90% of the total national production. Bivoltine sericulture extension of these major raw silk production areas meets the development needs of India as well as those of the target areas under the government objective to increase domestic production of bivoltine raw silk.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

Improvement of poverty and environmental issues is specified as one of three major areas in the Country Assistance Programme for India. Extension of agricultural technology to increase productivity, which brings employment opportunities and income generation in rural areas, is set out as assistance to local development. In the JICA Country Programme (2004), income increases through agriculture is specified as development issue of "poverty reduction", one of the priority areas.

This project has been highly relevant to the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

Following outputs were achieved during the Project period.

- Basic information and issues regarding bivoltine sericulture were analyzed by the Bivoltine Cell, a unit established in CSB and DOS. The Bivoltine Cell organized monthly, section and quarterly meetings. Linkage and coordination between CSB and DOS were thus strengthened.
- Hatching, defective cocoon, absent sex, and pupation rates were improved as expected. It can be concluded that a mass production system of quality seed was established as planned.
- Through training at the Technical Service Centers (TSC), Sericulture Training Schools (STS), and Reeling TSC knowledge and techniques of the stakeholders (staff of relevant agencies, institutes, and farmers) were improved.
- The number of chawki rearing houses managed by Quality Clubs increased from 40 to 102 a compared to the initial target of 100. Sericulture related tools (rotary moutage, cocoon deflossing machines were introduced to the Basic Seed Farms (BSF), grainages and farmers.

Through the achievement of these outputs, the number of bivoltine sericulture farmers increased from 786 in 2003 to 3698 in 2006 as compared to the initial target of 3600. The quantity of bivoltine cocoon transactions increased steadily from the beginning of the Project, although the achievement in 2005 was only 60% of the initial target of 2000t. The supply of quality bivoltine seed reached 6,534 t, which more than exceeded the initial target of 3,360t. The initial targets of the Project were thus achieved.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

As a result of Project implementation, bivoltine sericulture farmer and reeler income increased from sericulture. At the Project commencement, the average annual income from sericulture of JICA selected farmers was 94,000 Rs. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, it increased approximately to 170,000 Rs. Average annual reeler incomes from sericulture in the target states increased from 200,000Rs to 300,000Rs. Before the Project commencement, the income of JICA farmers was almost the same as other sericulture farmers in India. It is now 1.4 times that of non targeted farmers. The average annual income of reelers in India is 100,000 Rs. Judging from these differences in income between Project beneficiaries (JICA farmers, reelers in target area) and non-beneficiaries, the increases in income seem to be attributable to the Project. Regarding another overall goal, "the increase in the production of quality raw silk (above 2A level)", the production increased from 507t in 2002 to nearly 900t in 2007, in 2008. It decreased slightly in 2009, but on the whole, it has steadily increased. Increases in income brought a range of improved living conditions of JICA farmers: the renovation of dwellings with concrete buildings; the education of children at better schools and colleges, and the purchase of more assets. Regarding technical impact, it should be noted that training on bivoltine sericulture technology under the third country JICA training programs co-sponsored by CSB and JICA provided participants from Asian and African raw silk producing countries with useful knowledge and technologies.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As mentioned above, the outputs were produced as planned.

(2) Elements of Inputs

The dispatching of Japanese experts and procurement of equipment was appropriate. Though there was a slight delay in equipping of buildings in the early stages of the Project and the replacement of some of the Indian C/P, inputs from Indian side were appropriate.

(3) Project Cost, Period of Cooperation

The actual Project period was 60 months as planned. The actual Project cost was 624 million yen a compared to the planned cost of 730 million yen, lower than planned (equal to 85.4 % of the planned cost).

The inputs are appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the Project objective, therefore efficiency of the Project is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

The 11th Development Plan (2007~2012) specified further strengthening of the bivoltine sericulture extension. It is suggested in particular to replicate the experience of the Project. This involves large-scale bivoltine seed production supporting farmers with required infrastructure under the existing Catalytic Development Programme (CDP),

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

The number of CSB and DOS staff has decreased slightly since Project completion. Except for the AP State which drew attention to a lack of adequate staff at 3 TSC out of 6 and at 1 BSF out of 2. The number of other agency staff is considered to be sufficient for tasks on bivoltine sericulture. CSB and DOS hold meetings regularly on bivoltine sericulture to share information and decision-making. The structure of the executive agencies (CSB and DOS) as well as the coordination and linkage among them has been well maintained.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executing Agency

From 2007 until the ex-post evaluation, a total of 773 TSC/STS staff personal have been trained in 7 training courses on bivoltine sericulture at the Central Sericulture Research and Training Institute (CSR & TI). CSB and DOS trained a total of 9,000 sericulture farmers on bivoltine sericulture in 3 target states. They conducted a variety of extension activities including group discussions, and film shows for which a total of 2,565 individuals participated. In addition, more than 10,000 sets of texts/manuals developed by the Project have been distributed to farmers and relevant organizations after the completion of the Project. In light of the above, technologies on bivoltine sericulture have been maintained by respective agencies and utilized by farmers.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency.

There has been no particular problem in the financial aspects in bivoltine sericulture. The Ministry of Textile has allocated 15-16% of the total budget for sericulture development. The budget for CSB was 11,500 Rs in Lakh for the fiscal year 2007-2008 and it has increased by 10-70 % compared with the previous year. Regarding the DOS budget, KA state has maintained almost the same standard though it has sometimes fluctuated. TN state has increased its budget for bivoltine sericulture by 50-60 % from the previous years of 2007 and 2008. All the executing agencies acknowledged that the budget for bivoltine sericulture extension should be adequately funded.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

It can be evaluated that bivoltine sericulture extension system has been functional judging from succession of knowledge and techniques on bivoltine sericulture within the relevant organization and continued mass production of quality seed. The continuity of effectiveness and impact are documented in the increase in the number of bivoltine sericulture farmers after the completion, increasing from 3,704 in 2007 to 6,456 in 2009. It is also documented in the increase in the production of quality raw silk (above 2A level which increased from 6,534 dfls in 2006 to 7,073 dfls to 2009). In addition, the bivoltine cocoon transactions have largely increased through its expansion and decentralization in the target states. The transaction of bivoltine cocoon was executed in 4 markets by 2005, and has expanded to other markets since 2006, especially in the AP and TN states. The total transactions increased from 1,858t in 2005 in 4 markets to 5,056t in approximately 60 markets in 2009.

No major problems have been observed in the policy background, the structural, technical and financial aspects of the executing agency; therefore, sustainability of the Project effects is high.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Keisuke Nishikawa Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for the Establishment and Capacity Building of Regional Export Training and Promotion Centers	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of Indonesia			
Project Period	July 2002-June 2006			
Executing Agency	National Agency for Export Development, Ministry of Trade (NAFED), Indonesia Export Training Center (IETC), Regional Export Training Promotion Center (RETPC)			
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Japan External Trade Organization (JETRO), The Association for Overseas Technical Scholarship (AOTS)			
Total Cost	479 million yen			
Related Projects (if any)	Project-Type Technical Cooperation for the Indonesia Export Training Center (1988-1993), The Project on Human Resources Development in the Trade Sector (1997-2001), JICA-Net training for promoting project implementation, Country-focused training program on agribusiness SME development, Teacher training project for electronic engineering polytechnic institutes in Indonesia (1999-2004), NAFED functions improvement project (2010-2015 [scheduled])			
Overall Goal	To promote exports of Small and Medium-sized Enterprises (SMEs) in the regions where RETPCs have been established			
Project Objective(s)	Model RETPCs (in Surabaya, Medan, Makassar, and Banjarmasin) provide export training, trade information and promotion services for SMEs in their respective regions.			
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A management and operation system for the Project has been established at the respective RETPCs to provide export training and information/promotion services through collaboration with the Project Team¹ 2. The counterparts (C/P) at the RETPCs are skilled in managing export training services. 3. The C/P at the RETPCs and the Project Team are skilled in utilizing IT, including distance learning techniques, for export training services. 4. The C/P at the RETPCs and the Project Team are skilled in managing trade information and promotion services (permanent exhibitions, operation of library and the distribution of off-line information). 5. The C/P at the RETPCs and the Project Team are skilled in utilizing IT for trade information and promotion services (such as virtual exhibitions and business matching through the website). 6. The C/P of the Project Team acquires the know-how for replicating the capacity building programs of the RETPCs in other regions. 			
	Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Indonesian Side)	
Experts	5 Long-term Experts, 17 Short-term Experts		Staff allocated	87 people
Equipment	73 million yen		Equipment	-
Local Cost	31 million yen		Local Cost	20,263 million Indonesian rupiah
Trainees Received	65 for training in Japan; 8 for training in a third country		Land etc provided	-
Others	-		Others	-

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

In the development policies of the Republic of Indonesia, SME promotion and export promotion were positioned as priority tasks both at the time of planning and of the ex-post evaluation. This project is highly relevant with the country's policies. In addition, there are significant development needs for the provision of export training and other services by the RETPCs that reflect the requirements of SMEs. Japan's ODA policy at that time emphasized assistance for the reconfiguration of the industrial structure, so it was recognized that this project was highly relevant with Japan's ODA policy.

As for impacts, an increase in the volume of exports was seen in Northern Sumatra (Medan). In terms of effectiveness, effects were identified in the following points at the time of the terminal evaluation of the project and the effectiveness of the project is therefore considered to be high:

- At the respective RETPCs, a system of providing export training and information/promotion services was improved and provision of training courses was started.
- The C/P of the NAFED/IETC and RETPC acquired IT utilization skills through the implementation of distance education for SMEs and Internet training at the RETPCs.
- Through the operation of the mini-resource centers at the RETPCs, management techniques for trade information services were acquired.

¹ This is a team consisting of the IETC, which has accumulated know-how in providing export training through Japan's cooperation over the past ten years, and NAFED, which is the ruling body of the IETC and has jurisdiction over trade promotion/information services. The team's purpose was to transfer technology to the RETPCs with the cooperation of JICA experts.

- The C/P of NAFED/IETC acquired the necessary know-how by which they could develop a manual for replicating the capacity building programs of the RETPCs in other regions.
- In addition to the provision of training, the RETPCs came to provide space for virtual exhibitions and permanent exhibitions, so that their services have come to be used by many SMEs
- SMEs are applying the knowledge and technologies they acquired in the training provided by the RETPCs to their business operations. Some of them actually succeeded in exporting their products.

With regard to efficiency, outputs were produced as planned, and the terminal evaluation of the project found that the inputs were appropriate both in terms of the project period and project costs. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is considered to be high. As to the sustainability of the project, each RETPC has been continuing their activities after the project, such as the provision of training services and exhibitions, and the promotion of SMEs' participation in other exhibitions, with the budget generally secured and allocated for this purpose.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of the Republic of Indonesia

The country's National Development Plan (2000-2004) regarded export promotion and SME promotion as the priority programs. The priority tasks of the Five-Year Development Strategy (2004-2009) also included "improvement of the environment for the efficient development of SMEs" and "emphasizing trade promotion cost reductions and an increase in the number of promotional activities in improving the export environment."

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of the Republic of Indonesia

This project is relevant with the needs of the country's SMEs that are planning to start/expand export businesses in the regions where the RETPCs have been established. NAFED's operations include the execution/coordination of export promotion activities. IETC is playing the role of providing various training courses as an executing agency for export training. Accordingly, this project reflects the needs that NAFED/IETC should meet.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

One of Japan's priority assistance activities for the country is "assistance for the reconfiguration of the industrial structure." In particular, assistance to SMEs is emphasized.

This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

As a result of establishing a system to provide export training and information/promotion services at the RETPCs through this project, training courses were started and the training services were properly operated and managed. The C/P of NAFED/IETC and the RETPCs acquired IT utilization skills through the provision of distance education and the Internet training to the SMEs at RETPCs. Furthermore, through the provision of trade information services by utilizing the mini-resource centers at the RETPCs and on websites, they acquired management skills for the mini-resource centers and IT equipment. The C/P of NAFED/IETC generally acquired the necessary know-how with which they developed sufficient manuals for replicating the capacity building programs of RETPCs in other regions. While the executing agency has felt that the effects could be enhanced if they had more counterparts and training courses during the project, it can be said that effectiveness of this project has been achieved as a whole.

The RETPCs provided training courses to approximately 3,000 participants from SMEs, so that the virtual exhibitions (a half a year average of approximately 300 enterprises participated) and the permanent exhibitions of the RETPCs (a half a year average of approximately 60 enterprises participated) came to be utilized.

Accordingly objectives of the project have been largely achieved.

The changes in the targets for the number of trainees, the number of enterprises that utilized the RETPCs, and percentage of self-income in the mid-term evaluation are the result of consideration of the project situation at the time by the persons concerned, and it aimed at more flexible and practical achievement of the objective.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

Many SMEs are applying the knowledge and technologies they obtained in the training provided by the RETPCs to their business operations. An increase in the volume of exports was seen in Northern Sumatra (Medan), and there were also some cases in which the SME had actually succeeded in exporting its products by the time of the terminal evaluation, although these were not verified due to the limited information provided to the questionnaire in the ex-post evaluation. Ex-RETPC trainees formed a network so that they could share market information and disseminate knowledge obtained from the RETPCs.

Although information is limited, there is an increase of the volume of exports and this project had largely achieved its objectives at the time of the terminal evaluation; therefore, its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As stated in (1) of "Effectiveness / Impact", this project has produced the intended outputs.

Inputs to the project were executed in line with the project outline. The inputs on the sides of both Japan and Indonesia were appropriate for producing the outputs without any problems, according to the terminal evaluation.

(2) Period of Cooperation

The project period was planned to be 36 months and it was completed in 36 months as planned (100 % of the plan).

(3) Project Cost

The actual project cost was 479 million yen (the planned cost was unknown).

Although the project cost could not be compared with the planned cost, the inputs were found to be appropriate at the time of the terminal evaluation. The inputs are appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective, therefore, efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

In "comprehensive and equitable development," one of the development priorities stipulated by the country's National Medium-Term Development Plan (2010-2014), the continuation of SME promotion program is emphasized. Thus, the promotion of SMEs will continue to be important.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

According to the experts involved in the project, the RETPCs continue to provide training services and promote the participation of SMEs in exhibitions. NAFED holds annual meetings with the RETPCs every year to regularly discuss operation reports, the operation schedule for the subsequent fiscal year, requests for assistance from the central government, and so on.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

According to the experts involved in the project, the respective RETPCs continue to provide services. As new RETPCs are planned to be established, the RETPCs in East Java and South Sulawesi are accepting OJTs. In this way, the C/Ps are maintaining their technologies.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

While the financial information obtained from the executing agency was not fully sufficient in the ex-post evaluation, it was observed that central and local governments have been endeavoring to promote trade activities by securing and increasing the budget allocation including the subsidies, in light of the importance of fostering small and medium-sized enterprises.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

According to the experts involved in the project as well as the executing agency, the respective RETPCs continue their activities, such as providing training services and exhibitions, and promoting the participation of SMEs in other exhibitions.

No major problems have been observed in the policy background, the structural, technical, financial aspects of the executing agency, therefore, sustainability of the project effects is high.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Shiro Otomo Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	Community Empowerment Program with Civil Society in the Republic of Indonesia	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of Indonesia			
Project Period	January 2004-December 2006			
Executing Agency	National Development Planning Agency (BAPPENAS), Secretary of State (SETNEG), Local Governments and NGOs in 10 provinces in the eastern part of Indonesia			
Cooperation Agency in Japan	<NPO/NGO> SOMNEED, I-I-Net, Shaplaneer, and others.			
Total Cost	321 million yen			
Related Projects (if any)	<Community Empowerment Program> Strengthening Sulawesi Rural Community Development to Support Poverty Alleviation Project, <Technical Cooperation Project> Project on Strengthening Sulawesi Rural Community Development to Support Poverty Alleviation Programmes Policy Advisor on Regional Development in South Sulawesi Province Human Resources Development for Local Governments in the Republic of Indonesia Sulawesi Capacity Development Project			
Overall Goal	The policy and program for the community development are formulated and implemented with a participatory approach.			
Project Objective(s)	Collaboration among the governments (national and regional), NGOs and communities is improved through the activities for the community empowerment.			
Output[s]	1. A participatory approach for the community development taken by the governments (national and regional), NGOs and communities is improved. 2. Good practice cases of the community development activities in the target areas are accumulated and disseminated. 3. Pilot activities for the locally initiated community empowerment are launched.			
	Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Indonesian Side)	
Experts	2 for Long term, 23 for Short term		Staff allocated	6
Equipments	4 million yen		Equipments	-
Local Cost	47 million yen		Local Cost	4 million yen
Trainees Received	19		Land etc provided	Project office
Others	-		Others	-

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

This project has been highly relevant with both Indonesian Development Plan and Japanese ODA's Policy. Furthermore, in Indonesia, the participation of communities in the development processes has been promoted; thus, this project is highly relevant. In this project, workshops and seminars on, among other topics, methods of the participatory approach to community development were held in the provinces involved, and studies on good practice cases of community development were conducted. Pilot activities designed to empower communities were also carried out. As an outcome of the training to help participants acquire better facilitation skills, a training record book which aimed to give guidance on community empowerment was completed.

Facilitators who received training in this project are working for a range of initiatives carried out through cooperation among governments, NGOs and communities. "Master facilitators", who are skilled to transfer the facilitation techniques to others, were also trained.

With no response from any of the executing agencies, the current status of this project remains unknown; therefore, an evaluation cannot be made in terms of the sustainability of the project.

In light of the evaluation result on its effectiveness and impact, this project can be evaluated to produce the sufficient outcomes.

<Constraints of this evaluation study>

With no response from any of the executing agencies, the Ex-Post evaluation is implemented based mainly on interviews with the expert who involved in this project and now involves in the project of "Sulawesi Capacity Development Project" in which the trained personnel through the training method established with this project are used.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Indonesia

With Article 22 of the Local Autonomy Law of 1999 and Article 32 of the amended Law of 2004, the country shifted from a centralized political regime to a more decentralized one. Article 25 of the Law on National Development Planning System, enacted in 2004, also required local governments to prepare long, medium, and short-term development plans in order to guarantee participation by communities in the process of development.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Indonesia

Local governments were required to have people in each stratum express their needs in a bottom-up manner, so that they would be reflected in development plans. To encourage communities to participate, therefore, the emphasis of the project was placed on the need to build the capacity of NGOs that should work as facilitators to bring together local policymakers and communities and on the roles the facilitators should play. It came to be recognized how important it was to restore relations between the people concerned and build a collaborative relationship among them. The 10 provinces in the eastern region covered by this project constitute one of the less developed areas in Indonesia. It was expected that local governments there would be enhanced and communities would be empowered to encourage them to promote development by themselves.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

Japan's Development Assistance Plan for Indonesia (2004) designated "sustainable development led by the private sector," "construction of a democratic and fair society," and "peace and stability" as key areas, with governance, including aid for devolution, mentioned as a key issue for the "construction of a democratic and fair society." In its Assistance Implementation Program for Indonesia (2002), JICA also pointed out support for devolution as a key issue.

This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

In this project, workshops and seminars were held on the methods of the participatory approach to community development. In the regions covered by this project, research was conducted to study and analyze good practice cases of community development and the findings were summarized in a report.

Pilot activities designed to empower communities were carried out. As an outcome of the training to help participants acquire better facilitation skills, a training record book of "Building Local Initiative" was completed and publicized as a tool to provide guidance for community empowerment. Although information on each indicator to verify the outputs was not available, it can be said that the project has achieved its objectives since the outputs were produced as described above.

The information on cases of collaboration models for community empowerment was not obtained by the executing agencies. Nevertheless, ex-experts say that the facilitators who received the training in this project are working to help governments, NGOs and communities work in cooperation. They also point out that "master facilitators," those who are equipped to transfer the skills, were also trained. Therefore, while targeted value of the objective, it can be said that the project has largely achieved its objectives since there has been an improvement in the collaboration among communities, governments and NGOs as described above.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

Information was not obtained from the executing agencies. However, the ex-expert says that the people involved in this project are working for development programs carried out in Indonesia and projects conducted with JICA's assistance, such as the "Project for Building a Symbiotic and Collaborative Relationship with Local Communities in the Management of the West Bali National Park" and the "Sulawesi Capacity Development Project," helping to make such initiatives more effective. In addition, in the above-mentioned projects participatory approach is applied by those who have been trained in the project, which was the overall goal of the project.

Although the current status could not be confirmed with the information from the executing agencies, this project has largely achieved its objectives; therefore its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As stated in (1) of "Effectiveness / Impact," this project has produced the expected outputs.

At the time of the terminal evaluation, an analysis reached the conclusion that "effective use has been realized," with no specific problem found in the process of producing the outputs.

(2) Project Period of Cooperation

The project, which was designed to be completed in 36 months, actually finished in 36 months. It is as planned. (100% as planned period).

(3) Project Cost of Cooperation

The project cost, which was estimated to be 300 million yen, actually reached 321 million yen. It is slightly higher than planned (107% as planned cost).

Although the input of experts and facilities for the project was appropriately implemented within the planned period, the project costs are higher than planned for producing the outputs and achieving the project objective, therefore efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

The National Medium-Term Development Plan (2010-2014) includes the issue of "Economic Development and Increased Welfare of the People" in the Agenda of Development for achieving the visions and missions of national development. To address these issues, community empowerment is maintained as a basic policy for increasing the welfare of the people. In the Agenda, the issue of "Development that is Inclusive and Just" is also included. In this, the bottom-up process of development designed to allow

communities to participate is also regarded as an essential element.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

With no response from any of the executing agencies, the current institutional and operational aspects of the counterparts were unknown; thus, an evaluation cannot be made.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

With no response from any of the executing agencies, the current technical aspects of the counterparts were unknown; thus, an evaluation cannot be made.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

With no response from any of the executing agencies, their current financial aspects were unknown; thus, an evaluation cannot be made.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

With no response from any of the executing agencies, the current status was unknown; thus, an evaluation cannot be made.

As stated above, with no response from any of the executing agencies, the current status of institutional, operational, technical and financial aspects of the counterparts were unknown; sustainability of the project cannot be evaluated.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Akemi Shimura Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	Human Resource Development for Local Governance Phase II	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of Indonesia			
Project Period	April 2005-March 2007			
Executing Agency	Education and Training Agency of Ministry of Home Affairs (B.Diklat of MoHA), Directorate General of Regional Autonomy of Ministry of Home Affairs (OTDA), Education and Training Board of North Sumatra Province (B.Diklat of Sumut)			
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications, Local Autonomy College, Hyogo Prefecture			
Total Cost	236 million yen			
Related Projects (if any)	<Technical Cooperation> Human Resource Development for Local Governance (Phase I)			
Overall Goal	Human resources for local governance in administrative management and regional development are developed through the training.			
Project Objective(s) ¹	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Capacity of training management for human resources development of local governmental officials is improved in B.Diklat of MoHA and B.Diklat of Sumut. 2. Public administration methods and techniques based on new policies and guidelines related to decentralization and regional autonomy in Indonesia are widely disseminated and understood by local governments. 			
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Training curriculum and modules are improved to be more practical based on the needs of local governments (in B.Diklat of MoHA and B.Diklat of Sumut). 2. Collaboration between B.Diklat of MoHA and B.Diklat of Sumut to conduct training courses is enforced. 3. Training curriculum aiming at improvement of public service is improved and its training is implemented (in North Sumatra). 4. Partnership among the training institutions (between province and provinces or between province and district / municipality) is established (in North Sumatra). 5. Guidelines for the inter-regional partnership and its implementation methods are understood by the local governmental officials. 6. Guidelines for the new role of sub-district heads (Camat) responding to the new Decentralization and Regional Autonomy Law and its implementation methods are understood by the sub-district heads. 			
	Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Indonesian Side)	
Experts	3 for Long term, 8 for Short term		Staff allocated	124
Equipments	-		Equipments	-
Local Cost	137 million yen		Local Cost	30 million yen + Project activity cost
Trainees Received	30		Land etc provided	Office buildings
Others	Provision of equipment		Others	-

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

The project has been highly relevant with Indonesian Development Plan and Japanese ODA's policy. Furthermore, there was a need to improve public administrative services of local governments due to the rapid progress in decentralization and regional autonomy since 1999; thus, the relevance of the project is high. Through the project, many seminars were held for relevant personnel including Camats (sub-district heads) and the Manual for Planning, Implementation and Evaluation of Effective Training and the Standard of Training Management were developed using the know-how obtained. Therefore, it was determined that the capacity of training institutions which conduct human resource development for local public administration has been improved. Through training, public administration methods and techniques based on the policies and guidelines of the Ministry of Home Affairs were widely disseminated and understood by local governments. Therefore, the effectiveness and impact of the project was high. Regarding efficiency, the project was efficient in terms of its outputs and the project period, but efficiency from the aspect of the project cost could not be evaluated because the necessary information could not be obtained. Regarding sustainability, the sustainability concerning the policies and systems as well as the project effects have been ensured. However, technical and financial sustainability could not be analyzed because answers to the questionnaire could not be obtained from counterparts; therefore the project efficiency and sustainability could not be evaluated.

In light of the evaluation result on its effectiveness and impact, this project can be evaluated to produce the sufficient outcomes.

¹ Prior to the present project, the Human Resource Development for Local Governance Phase I was conducted with the objective that "training courses which meet local needs are conducted mainly in the fields of regional development and public administrative management," for three years from April 2002. According to the documents at completion for the present project, the two objectives that could not be achieved in Phase I were set as the objectives for Phase II, in order to improve the capacity of training institutions which conduct human resource development for local governments, which was an issue for local governance in Indonesia, and to disseminate policies on decentralization and regional autonomy.

<Constraints of this evaluation study>

- The evaluation was conducted based on the terminal evaluation report and the results of interviews with long-term experts at the time of the project implementation (hereinafter called ex-JICA experts) because the project completion report and answers to the questionnaire from the executing agencies could not be obtained.
- In the project design matrix (PDM) for the project, target values which provide benchmarks for evaluating the achievement of the outputs were not set for many indicators.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Indonesia

In Indonesia, Law 22 Year 1999 and Law 32 Year 2004 on Local Autonomy were issued and it was stipulated that local governments would promote their regional autonomy and provide public services that meet their residents' needs. The 2005-2009 National Medium-Term Development Plan also included the "improvement of social services through the implementation of regional autonomy" as one of the goals that aimed to build a fair and democratic nation. For this purpose, the plan also mentioned the need for the quality improvement of local governments.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Indonesia

Decentralization in Indonesia was fully launched in 1999. When the project was implemented, the decentralization policies were still at an early stage of implementation and were evolving through trial and error as can be seen in the revision of the Law on Local Government in 2004. Therefore, there was a significant need for the dissemination of regional autonomy policies and guidance for their implementation methods.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

The Japanese ODA's country assistance policy for Indonesia stipulated assistance for governance including decentralization as one of the priority issues under the priority area "Assistance to Create a Democratic and Fair Society." The JICA Country Program (FY 2002) also set forth support for regional development and decentralization as priority issues.

The project has been highly relevant with Indonesia's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objectives

Many of the indicators for determining the outputs were unclear. Nonetheless, all the different types of training courses that had been planned were held multiple times. According to JICA's internal documents and reports from ex-JICA experts, all the training courses enjoyed a good reputation among the training participants. Therefore, it was determined that the project outputs were achieved.

Regarding Project Objective (1), one of the indicators the "implementation of training based on the Manual for Planning, Implementation and Evaluation of Effective Training" could not be achieved because approval by the Minister of Home Affairs was delayed although the manual had been completed. Other indicators were achieved. Regarding Project Objective (2), the number of participants on training courses exceeded the planned number and the results of the survey for participants showed that their levels of satisfaction about the training content were high, according to JICA's internal documents. This suggests that the indicators were achieved. Therefore, it was determined that the project objectives were largely achieved.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

Based on the available information about the achievement level of the project outputs and the objectives, the overall goal was fulfilled in North Sumatra Province where the project was conducted.

With regard to indirect impacts, there were some reports of cases where the action plans produced by the training participants during training were used to improve public administrative services after the project ended (in Medan City 1st Junior High School, the Joint Office for Vehicle Registration at the Revenue Bureau of the provincial government, etc.), according to JICA's internal documents. It was also reported that efforts to improve the function of the sub-district office has been made based on a proposal made by the sub-district head who attended a training course conducted in Aceh Province.

There were no particular reports of negative impacts caused by the project.

This project has largely achieved its objectives; therefore its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As mentioned in (1) of "Effectiveness / Impact," the project brought about the expected outputs. Inputs to the project are as described in the "Project Outline." According to the long-term experts, no problems which would hinder the achievement of the outputs were identified with regard to the inputs. The terminal evaluation concluded that the "inputs were efficiently converted (into outputs) in terms of their quality, quantity and timing." Therefore, it can be concluded that there was no problem which affected the final outputs.

(2) Project Period of Cooperation

The planned project period was 24 months and the actual project period was 24 months. Therefore, the project was conducted as planned (100% of the planned period).

(3) Project Cost of Cooperation

The actual project cost was 236 million yen. The actual project cost could not be compared with the planned cost because the ex-ante estimation could not be obtained.

Since the planned value for the project cost was not available, financial efficiency was unclear. Therefore, efficiency of the project could not be evaluated.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

The Law on Local Government was revised (Law Number 12 Year 2008) after the project completion, but its policy to promote decentralization was not changed. According to the information obtained by ex-JICA experts, it is thought that the Decree of the Minister of Home Affairs established as a result of the project is still valid.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

According to information given by ex-JICA experts, the North Sumatra provincial training center has renewed the ISO 9001:2000 certification obtained during the project implementation. Therefore, it is thought that the organizational structure of the training center is still in place. However, the organizational structures of the other counterparts at the time of ex-post evaluation are unknown because answers to the questionnaire could not be obtained. Therefore, it is not possible to evaluate institutional sustainability.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

According to information obtained by ex-JICA experts, the North Sumatra provincial training center has renewed the ISO 9001:2000 certification which stipulates the use of Standard of Training Management. However, the technical levels of the counterparts at the time of ex-post evaluation are unknown because answers to the questionnaire could not be obtained from the training center or the other counterparts. Therefore, it is not possible to evaluate technical sustainability.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

The financial situation at the time of the ex-post evaluation is unknown because answers to the questionnaire could not be obtained from the counterparts. Therefore, it is not possible to evaluate financial sustainability.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

The methodology and the manual for the training developed through the project were handed over to the Sulawesi Capacity Development Project (implemented from September 2007 to September 2010) and are being used mainly in Sulawesi 6 provinces (North Sulawesi, Gorontalo, Central Sulawesi, West Sulawesi, Southeast Sulawesi and South Sulawesi).

As has been explained above, the counterparts' current institutional, technical and financial situations are unknown since the counterparts' answers to the questionnaire are not available. Therefore, it is not possible to evaluate sustainability.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Hideyuki Takagi Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Training of Agricultural Extension Officers on Improvement of Farm Management	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of Indonesia			
Project Period	January 2004-January 2007			
Executing Agency	BDA-Kayuambon of the Agency for Agricultural Human Resources Development, Ministry of Agriculture			
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries			
Total Cost	240 million yen			
Related Projects (if any)	<Technical Cooperation> Project for Improvement of Agricultural Extension and Training System (September 1999-March 2002); and <Training Course> Training of Trainers for Participatory Training Program on Agricultural Extension Methodology (three years from FY2008)			
Overall Goal	Farm management in selected districts is improved through the Participatory Agricultural Extension Method (MP3) training. "Selected districts: Seven provinces where national agriculture education and training centers (BBDAs/BDAs) are located."			
Project Objective(s)	Agricultural extension officers in the selected districts acquire skills in the extension methodology through the improved MP3 training program.			
Output[s]	1. MP3 training program is improved in BDA-Kayuambon. 2. Training of trainers (TOT) program for MP3 training is established in BDA-Kayuambon. 3. MP3 training program is applied to selected districts.			
	Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Indonesian Side)	
Experts	3 for Long term, 2 for Short term		Staff allocated	10
Equipments	12 million yen		Equipments	-
Local Cost	25 million yen		Local Cost	2,470 million rupiahs
Trainees Received	7		Land etc provided	Project offices (Jakarta and Kayuambon), and official cars
Others	-		Others	-

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

The project conforms to Indonesia's national development plan and development needs, as well as Japan's aid policy. Therefore, the relevance of the project is high. Although the information about planned cost was not obtained, actual cost can be adequate amount compared to other similar projects. Moreover, the actual project period was within the plan; therefore, efficiency of the project is high. The activities of the project were implemented as planned. As for outputs, the MP3 training program was improved in BDA-Kayuambo and the improved programs were carried out at BBDAs/BDAs in 7 districts. As a result, by the end of project, agricultural extension officers in the selected districts had learned to apply good practices to their activities more effectively. Therefore, the project had probably a certain effect on the agricultural extension among farmers. According to the counterpart, the overall goal was achieved as the majority of farmers who had taken the MP3 training course has improved farming management. However, the actual status has not been clearly verified because it needs much more time to take and verify effects, and no survey on the farmers has been carried out. The MP3 training program is still being conducted as part of Indonesia's development policy and sector policy, and the central government has secured the budget for the project. At the training centers to which the skills were transferred in this project, the counterparts continue to carry out the training programs, and they also work to improve the training methods on their own. The sustainability of the project, therefore, is judged to be high.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Indonesia

The Indonesian Five-Year National Development Plan (2000-2004), a plan that was in force when the project got started, aimed at a shift from an "increase of food production" to an "improvement of farm income." The 2005-2009 Five-Year Plan, in force when the program was completed, also pointed out the further development of the agricultural sector. It was encouraged that agricultural extension officers would expand good practices among advanced farmers and they would make effective use of such practices.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Indonesia

In the agriculture sector in Indonesia, along with changes in its agriculture policy, a further need arose to introduce new types of agricultural extension methodology designed to discover and spread the skills and techniques suited to the characteristics of the district in order to respond appropriately to the challenges farmers face and the need they have for improving the competitiveness in productivity and profitability of agriculture. According to responses from the executing agency to questionnaires, 60% of the farmers had had a need for an agricultural extension officer system before the implementation of the project, and 90% of them had this need at the time of project completion, representing a high percentage at both points in time.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

Japan's aid plan for Indonesia refers to the "construction of a democratic and fair society" as one of its priority areas. It states clearly that in order to "reduce poverty" through the development of agriculture and fishery communities, aid should be provided mainly for strengthening the management of farmers' and fishers' organizations, developing and managing the related infrastructure, improving their productivity, and establishing systems for processing and distribution.

This project has been highly relevant with the Indonesia's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

This project served to improve the MP3 training program at BDA-Kayuambon and provide training for trainers at BBDAs/BDAs in the 7 selected districts. After receiving the training, the trainers at each BBDA/BDA trained the agricultural extension officers in their district. During the project period, at least 200 officers attended training courses, finishing with a high level of understanding of what they had been taught there. The executing agency responded that the agricultural extension officers in the selected districts utilize the skills regarding good practices that they learned in the training courses in their activities for agricultural extension. On the other hand, in terms of the introduction of good practices at the individual-farmer level, one of the indicators for the project objectives, the ex-post evaluation refrained from making any judgment about its level of achievement as no numerical target had been set for the percentage of farmers adopting good practices. Furthermore, no survey on farmers that would be required in order to verify the achievement of the objectives had been carried out. Ex-experts say that as it takes a long time for individual farmers to introduce good practices and probably only a certain level of achievement has been made by the time of the ex-post evaluation. In light of the above, although most of the project outputs have been achieved, the level of achievement of the project objectives is presumed to be fair.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

In terms of the improvement of farm management in selected districts, which was set as an overall goal, the present status has not yet been verified enough as a survey of the farmers has not been carried out, though, according to the counterpart, the majority of the farmers who had taken MP3 training course has improved their farm management. However, it will presumably take more time for farmers to adopt the good practices introduced in this project and improve their farm management. For the improvement of farm management what is required is: to spread good practices, enhance the services of the agricultural extension officers such as the provision of market price information and guidance for improving the management of farmers' organizations. It is also necessary to resolve external factors, such as the high cost of agricultural chemicals and chemical fertilizers, which are major challenge in farm management.

This project has somewhat achieved its objectives; therefore its effectiveness is fair.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As stated above in (1) of "Effectiveness / Impact," this project has produced the outputs generally as planned. With a time lag between the beginning of Indonesian fiscal year and the commencement of the project, there was a delay in the funds for the project activities on Indonesian side in the first year. It caused delay in formulating training implementation plans and affected the progress of the project. However, after these problems had been solved, the project was carried out smoothly.

(2) Project Period of Cooperation

The project period, designed to be completed in 36 months in the plan, actually finished in 36 months. It is just as planned (100% of the plan).

(3) Project Cost of Cooperation

With no information available, the planned project cost is yet to be confirmed. The project actually cost 240 million yen. Compared with other projects that had similar contents and were conducted in similar districts, no specific problem was found in the project.

While there was a delay in providing some of the inputs, the delay was later made up for; therefore, the efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

In the current Five-Year Plan for National Development of Indonesia (2004-2009), agricultural policies such as "the one agricultural extension officer per village program" are put up. The targeted provinces in this program also have a policy of continuing to carry out MP3 training programs. "The competency system," a scheme designed to improve the abilities of agricultural extension officers, is being operated, and a research and development center manages information about the research findings of agriculture promotion activities; thus, the agricultural extension officers system is still being maintained. In light of the above, the priority of the policies related to the project is still high.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

According to the responses from the executing agency, BDA-Kayuambon and the BBDAs/BDAs in the selected districts maintain a sufficient number of trainers to continue providing MP3 training. At present, BBDAs/BDAs in the 7 provinces have 50 trainers, and the "Agricultural Academy for Extension," an academic institution established by the Ministry of Agriculture as part of a new policy for spreading good practices, has 20 trainers for MP3 method programs. These facts demonstrate that the counterparts' system is being maintained.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

The counterparts, the trainers of the MP3 training programs, maintain the knowledge and skills that were required to provide the training, and each BDA continues to offer an annual MP3 training course to agricultural extension officers. Responses from the executing agency indicate that the trainers themselves work to improve training methods, which demonstrates that the sustainability of the technical aspects is being maintained.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

The actual amount of the central government's budget for training at BDA-Kayuambon was unavailable in the ex-post evaluation survey. The executing agency responded that the budgets have been secured for FY2010, the year of the ex-post evaluation, and FY2011, the following year.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

The executing agency responded that a large percentage of the agricultural extension officers who took part in the training program still utilize the good practices in their activities for agricultural extension, and that the number of farmers who have adopted the good practices is on an upward trend.

Due to restrictions on the survey methods for the evaluation, some of the financial information necessary to evaluate the sustainability of the executing agency was unavailable. But no major problems have been observed in the policy background and the structural, technical, financial aspects of the executing agency; therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is high.

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Keiko Watanabe Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	Human Resource Development in Information Technology through Capacity Building of the University of Colombo School of Computing (UCSC)	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Democratic Socialist Republic of Sri Lanka			
Project Period	1 June 2002-31 May 2005 (3 years)			
Executing Agency	The University of Colombo School of Computing (UCSC)			
Cooperation Agency in Japan	JICA, and Information Policy Division and Information and Communication Electronics Division of Commerce and Information Policy Bureau, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry			
Total Cost	365 million yen			
Related Projects (if any)	None			
Overall Goal	Both quality and quantity of IT related human resources in Sri Lankan industries are improved.			
Project Objective(s)	UCSC increases its capacity in conducting IT trainings that match the needs of Sri Lankan industries in a more effective and efficient manner for IT related staff in universities, IT training institutes and industries.			
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Organization/functions of UCSC are strengthened. 2. C/Ps acquire necessary IT skills and technologies for implementation of WBT. 3. UCSC provides IT training courses on WBT. 4. UCSC provides WBT courses. 5. R&D capabilities relating to WBT are strengthened in the UCSC. 			
	Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Sri Lanka Side)	
Experts	2 long-term experts and 24 short-term experts		Staff allocated	21 staff
Equipments	156.15 million yen		Equipments	N.A.
Local Cost	10.43 million yen		Local Cost	72.628 million LKR
Trainees Received	15 C/Ps		Land etc provided	Existing facilities
Others	N.A.		Others	N.A.

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

This Project was in line with the Sri Lankan government policies to enhance the capacity for various industries and government administration to use Information Technology (IT). Its purpose was to build the capacity of the University of Colombo School of Computing (UCSC) to improve IT human resources in the country's industries. This Project improved organizational and human resources capacity of UCSC, including upgrading the capacities of IT trainers, curriculum and educational materials development, and R&D related to Web Based Training (WBT). The Project also established an alliance mechanism to match industry needs and UCSC training through development of a "University-Industry Forum". The participants of IT training courses of UCSC were highly appreciated by industries and universities. UCSC has become the national core to raise IT human resources and is making a substantial contribution to expanding IT human resources, such as by training WBT lecturers at other universities and IT training institutes. Furthermore, this evaluation confirmed that "continuation of IT training that meets the needs, and development and induction of a WBT module" are currently implemented as suggested by the final evaluation of the Project. R&D capacity was enhanced, and the alliance with industries is being maintained and promoted. Thus, it is concluded that the Project has achieved the intended objectives, and the Project effects are expanding.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Policy of the Democratic Socialist Republic of Sri Lanka

The Government of Sri Lanka designated 1998 as "Year of Information Technology," and emphasized promoting IT development in its national development plan. In particular, the lack of human resources in IT is serious, and "e-Sri Lanka", the government's basic policy on IT, emphasizes human resource development as one of the main strategic pillars.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of the Democratic Socialist Republic of Sri Lanka

The result of "the National Human Resource Survey for IT" administered by Sri Lanka ICT association indicated that although the demand for IT engineers in the industries remained high, the supply of IT engineers with Bachelor's degrees or higher only met half of the industry demand in 2005. IT training courses on WBT implemented by UCSC are highly appreciated and much requested by IT training institutes and private corporations.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

Japan's Country Assistance Program for Sri Lanka in 2004 listed "assistance to promote IT" as one of the important areas to promote IT for expanding its economy and improving competitiveness. JICA's program in 2004 also recognized that one of the most important areas to assist was IT promotion, by extending multi-dimension programs in light of the Sri Lankan national development plan of IT.

From the above, this project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore, its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

The Project produced the following outputs and this evaluation concluded that the training capacity of UCSC in the field of IT was strengthened.

① UCSC established the "University-Industry Forum" with industries and organized meetings twice on average during the Project period. These meetings and other Project activities built a cooperative system to implement effective training that matched industry needs.

② Trainers in IT technologies and techniques for implementing WBT were developed as indicated by the substantial improvement of the ex-post test from the pre test of the participants in the pertinent training programs.

③ WBT contents/IT training materials (6 types) were developed and revised to meet the needs of industries. 13 training programs in total were implemented with 240 trainees (target 200) from universities, IT training institutes, and industries.

④ 8 WBT modules were developed as planned and were actually used in classes.

⑤ With the cooperation from Toyohashi University of Technology, R&D on WBT module development was implemented, and 10 research papers were presented in international academic conferences during the Project period.

The production of outputs ①—⑤ made training courses more relevant to industry needs and upgraded the capability of trainers and contents development.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

Based on the training courses (6 types) implemented by the Project, UCSC has started an additional 15 courses to meet industry needs. For three years in 2006 to 2009 after the termination of the Project, UCSC implemented these new courses 81 times with 1,021 participants in total. WBT modules newly designed by UCSC are in high demanded by industries and other universities, and this indicates the high quality of the training contents of UCSC. Therefore, it is concluded that UCSC has been making a substantial contribution to improving IT human resources in industry in terms of quality and quantity. Furthermore, UCSC is training WBT trainers at 12 universities and making efforts to expand IT human resources. Since 2006, UCSC has also implemented the third country training programs in cooperation with JICA and contributed to IT human resources development in Asia and Africa. UCSC won the first prize for "national e-contents" and is highly appreciated in its efforts in R&D of IT. In July 2009, UCSC broadcasted the very first Web TV program in Sri Lanka for educational purposes, using the advanced digital media technology center (ADMTC) established by the Project. These are the impacts on technological and organizational enhancement of the Project.

From the above, this project has largely achieved its objectives; therefore, its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As stated in (1) of "effectiveness and impact", the Project produced the outputs as planned.

(2) Elements of Inputs

The Project implementation had some delays because of delayed arrival of some of the equipment for R&D and voice recognition, and resignation of 2 out of 6 core C/Ps. However, all the training of all 21 C/Ps were sufficiently done so that knowledge of resigned C/Ps was sufficiently shared by other C/Ps, and planned outputs were produced during the Project period as stated above. Quality, quantity and timing of other inputs were evaluated as appropriate, and it can be concluded that the delays did not have any effect on producing the outputs.

(3) Project Cost, Period of Cooperation

The Project implementation period was as planned: the planned period was 36 months and actual period was 36 months (equal to 100% of planned period). Project cost was lower than planned: The budget was 375 million yen and the actual expenditure was 356 million yen (equal to 95% of the planned cost).

From the above, the inputs are appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective; therefore, efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

IT human resources development is the priority area in "e-Sri Lanka" and "Mahinda Chinthana" (2006-2016) (the vision of President Mahinda), the country's long term development strategy. The government also announced its policies to introduce IT in health, education and judiciary areas.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

UCSC has no change in organization or personnel in IT training, WBT module development, R&D, or management, and all project C/Ps remain assigned as they were at the time of the project period. Although the alliance with industries is not by "Forum" established by the Project, UCSC promotes the alliance with them by sending students to industries as interns and inviting lecturers from industries.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

Software and manuals introduced by the Project are revised as necessary and are currently used. UCSC by themselves designed 26 modules and technical problems are not observed.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

UCSC is financially sound as it increases its budget year by year, and has sufficient budget to implement its activities. As ADMTC is an associated organization independent of UCSC, it has steadily increased income by implementing training programs that use the ADMTC laboratory and rental revenue of the ADMTC studio, and has come to adopt an independent accounting system. The budget is allocated for maintaining the equipment provided by the Project. In sum, there is no financial problem.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

UCSC has become the national core for enhancing IT human resources. It is contributing to expanding IT human resources development as it currently implements 15 training courses that meet industry needs, and provides technical assistance to other universities. UCSC continues to expand the effects of project achievements as project C/Ps continue to work for UCSC, using techniques and know-how they have acquired during the project, developing new WBT modules, and implementing training courses that meet new needs. From the above, no major problems have been observed in the policy background, or the structural, technical, and financial aspects of the executing agency; therefore, sustainability of the project effects is high.

