

## 主要面談者リスト

<ベトナム側>

トゥア・ティエン・フエ水道公社 (Thua Thien Hue Construction and Water Supply State-One Member Company Limited)

- Mr. Truong Cong Nam 局長
- Mr. Tran Van Tho 副局長／設計部 部長
- Mr. Nguyen Khoa Hien 水質管理部 部長
- Mr. Cao Huy Tuong Minh 配水管理部 部長
- Mr. Duong Quy Duong 賃金部 副部長
- Mr. Mai Duy Tuong 顧客サービス部 部長
- Mr. Ho Dang Xuan Lam 顧客サービス部 副部長

フエ省人民委員会

- Ms. Nguyen Thi Thuy Hoa 副議長
- Mr. Chau Dinh Nguyen 外交局 局長
- Mr. Hoang Viet Thang 外交局国際協力部 副部長
- Mr. Le Dinh Khanh 計画・投資局 副局長
- Mr. Phung Huu Thien 建設局インフラ部 部長

<日本側>

プロジェクト専門家

- 井出 益二 チーフアドバイザー／配水管理
- 笹山 弘 水質管理
- 浜村 正義 浄水処理
- 市川 孝幸 人材育成計画
- 村上 徹也 顧客サービス
- 板谷 秀史 配水管網計画
- 木下 雄介 業務調整

JICA ベトナム事務所

- 築野 元則 所長
- 東城 康裕 次長
- 安藤 勝洋 企画調査員

**I. Current Status of the Project: Inputs, Activities, Outputs and Prospects to Achieve Project Purpose and Overall Goal**

**Question 1: Have the inputs for the Project been done as planned?**

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
1-1 Vietnamese side	(1) Counterparts allocated (2) Office space and facilities for experts (3) Equipment (4) Necessary Information (5) Local cost	Compare "plan" with "actual"	Request of data	Project expert team
1-2 Japanese side	(1) Experts allocated (2) Equipment and materials (3) Trainings (4) Local cost	Compare "plan" with "actual"	Request of data	Project expert team

**Question 2: Have the activities for Outputs been implemented as planned?**

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
2-1 Have the activities for Output 1 been implemented as planned?	Status of progress of activities	Evaluate achievements and process	Reports of experts	Project experts
2-2 Have the activities for Output 2 been implemented as planned?	Process of implementation		Questionnaires or interviews if necessary	COWASU
2-3 Have the activities for Output 3 been implemented as planned?				
2-4 Have the activities for Output 4 been implemented as planned?				

**Question 3: Has the Project achieved Outputs?**

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
3-1-1 Has ISO/IEC 17025 been acquired?	(1) Acquisition of ISO/IEC 17025	Compare "target" with "actual status"	Reports of experts Questionnaires or interviews if necessary	Project experts COWASU
3-1-2 Has water been analyzed in line with MOH's standards?	(2) Water analysis in line with MOH's standards			
3-1-3 Have procedure guidance for water treatment and operation of the water facilities been improved?	(3) Procedure guidance for water treatment and operation of the water facilities			
3-1-4 Has water quality management plan been improved?	(4) Water quality management plan			
3-1-5 How many seminars and workshops have been held? How many participants? Have these numbers achieved the target?	(5) Number of seminars, workshops and participants			
3-2-1 Has water distribution network management been	(1) Water distribution network map (water pressure, residual chlorine and turbidity)			
3-2-2 How many seminars and workshops have been held? How many participants? Have these numbers achieved the target?	(2) Number of seminars, workshops and participants			
3-3-1 Has qualification test been implemented as planned? How was the result?	(1) Implementation to the trial qualification test (promotion and specialty)			
3-3-2 Has personnel management regulation been implemented?	(2) Implementation of personnel management regulation			
3-3-3 How many training materials and manuals have been developed? Have the numbers achieved the target?	(3) Number of training materials and manuals			
3-4-1 How many materials have been developed for public	(1) Number of materials for public relations			
3-4-2 Has regulation been developed?	(2) Regulation of reaction to customer's request			
3-4-3 How many replies have been done to customers' suggestions and complaints based on	(3) Number of reaction to customer's request based on the customer's request			
3-4-4 How many visitors have come to purification plant?	(4) Number of visitors to purification plant (more than 1,000)			
3-4-5 How many events have been held for public relations?	(5) Number of events to improve public relations			

## II. Relevance of the Project

### Question 1: Is the Project compatible with national policy and programme in Vietnam?

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
	Information on policy documents in Vietnam	Analyze alignment of the Project in national policy and programme regarding water supply	Preliminary study report of the Project	Already available

### Question 2: Is the Project compatible with needs of water sector covered by COWASU?

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
	Opinions of stakeholders Information on PCM workshop	Evaluate opinions of stakeholders	Preliminary study report of the Project Questionnaires or interviews if necessary	COWASU JICA Project experts

### Question 3: Is the Project compatible with Japanese assistance policy and programme to Vietnam?

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
	Japanese ODA policy to Vietnam Assistance programme of JICA to Vietnam	Analyze alignment of water sector in Japanese ODA policy and programme	Request of Information	JICA

## III. Effectiveness of the Project

### Question 1: How much prospect does the Project have to achieve the Purpose?

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
1-1 Have the targets of the action plan been achieved?	(1) Achievements of the action plan	Compare "target" with "current situation"	Reports of experts Request of data	Project experts COWASU
1-2 Can COWASU implement analysis of water quality necessary to declare "safe drinking water"?	(2) Implementation of necessary water quality examination for "safe drinking water"		Questionnaires or interviews if necessary	
1-3 How is water pressure?	(3) Water pressure (more than 1.0 bar in urban and 0.5 bar in rural)			
1-4 How is residual chlorine?	(4) Residual chlorine (more than 0.1 mg/l)			

### Question 2: What external factors affect achievement of the Project Purpose?

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
2-1 How is quality of raw water source?	Information on quality of raw water	Analyze information collected	Request of data Questionnaires or interviews	Project experts COWASU
2-2 Are there any factors affecting achievement of the Project Purpose?	Opinions of stakeholders			

**IV. Efficiency of the Project**

**Question 1: Have the inputs of the Project produced the Outputs efficiently?**

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
1-1 Are the inputs for the Project appropriate from the views of quantity, quality and timing?	(1) Counterparts assigned (2) Experts allocated (3) Expenses from Vietnam (4) Expenses from Japan (5) Equipment procured	Evaluate quantity, quality (years of experiences, etc) and timing of assignment of counterparts Evaluate expenses planned and actually used Evaluate components, quantity, procurement and installation and current condition	Request of data Questionnaires or interviews	Project experts COWASU

**Question 2: What external factors affect efficiency of the Project?**

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
2-1 Do employees trained by the Project continue working for COWASU?	Information of trainees	Analyze information collected	Request of data Questionnaires or interviews	Project experts COWASU
2-2 Has the Project ever experienced transfer that affected the implementation of the Project?	Information of transfer of COWASU			
2-3 Are there any factors affecting achievement of the Outputs?	Opinions of stakeholders			

**V. Impact of the Project**

**Question 1: How much prospect does the Project lead to achieving the Overall Goal?**

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
1-1 How much prospect does COWASU have to declare "safe drinking water"?	(1) Declaration of "safe drinking water"		Request of data Questionnaires or interviews	Project experts COWASU
1-2 When, or how often is the survey on customer satisfaction conducted? If it's already done, how is the result?	(2) Results of questionnaire on customer satisfaction			

**Question 2: What external factors affect achievement of the Overall Goal?**

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
2-1 Has the Project ever observed policy change of other development partners that will affect the Project implementation?	Information on assistance policy of other development partners	Analyze information collected	Request of data Questionnaires or interviews	Project experts COWASU
2-2 Are there any factors affecting achievement of the Overall Goal?	Opinions of stakeholders			

**Question 3: What other impacts (both positive and negative) has the Project given to the Vietnamese water sector?**

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
	Opinions of stakeholders	Evaluate opinions of stakeholders	Request of data Questionnaires or interviews	Project experts COWASU

**VI. Sustainability of COWASU with Declaration of Safe Drinking Water**

**Question 1: Policy aspect**

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
1-1 Do national policy and programme continue to address the issues of water supply?	Current policy documents Future prospects of policy and programme	Analyze current policy and future prospects	Questionnaires or interviews	Project experts COWASU

**Question 2: Organizational and technical aspect**

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
2-1 Can COWASU sustain its organizational and technical base by itself?	Employment plan of COWASU Training plan of COWASU	Evaluate prospects	Request of data Questionnaires or interviews	COWASU

**Question 3: Financial aspect**

Sub-questions	Indicators	Methods of Evaluation	Methods to Collect Indicators	Sources of Indicators
3-1 Can COWASU sustain sound financial condition?	Financial statement and balance sheet of COWASU	Analyze financial statement and balance sheet	Request of data	COWASU
3-2 Can COWASU manage necessary investment?	Future investment plan of COWASU	Evaluate prospects	Questionnaires or interviews	COWASU

## Questionnaire to COWASU

Dear Sirs,

Following questions are to collect information for the Final Evaluation of JICA Project on Human Resource Development for Water Sector in the Middle Region of Vietnam. The questions can be allocated to the counterparts that you think are most suitable to answer. It will be our pleasure to reply promptly. Your kind cooperation is highly appreciated in advance.

Faithfully yours,

18 November 2008

Consultant in charge of Final Evaluation

---

### A. Outputs/Activities of the Project

#### 1. Output 1

[Indicator 1-1]

- (1) When did you begin to prepare the acquisition of ISO/IEC 17025?
- (2) How did the Japanese expert contribute to the acquisition of ISO/IEC 17025?

[Indicator 1-2]

- (1) How do you regard as an achievement of the target of the Indicator 1-2 “Water analysis in line with MOH’s standards”?
- (2) Do you think you can properly analyze the items necessary to declare “safe drinking water”? If yes, kindly show us why.
- (3) Do you think you can take actions to sort out problems through the proper analysis? If yes, kindly show us examples.

[Indicator 1-3]

- (1) How do you regard as an achievement of the target of the Indicator 1-3 “Procedure guidance for water treatment and operation of water facilities”?
- (2) Have you developed manuals and handbooks necessary for water treatment and operation of facilities including maintenance? If yes, kindly show them.
- (3) How were you involved with development of the manuals and handbooks?

[Indicator 1-4]

- (1) How were you involved with development of Water Safety Plan?

[Indicator 1-5 and 2-2]

- (1) How do you evaluate the seminars and workshops to reflect the results for improvement of the next ones?
- (2) Do you think the participants can properly understand the contents of seminars and workshops? Kindly show us the results of questionnaires.



## 2. Output 2

[Indicator 2-1]

- (1) How do you regard as an achievement of the target of the Indicator 2-1 “Water distribution network map (water pressure, residual chlorine and turbidity)”?
- (2) Have you developed the map properly? If yes, kindly show it.

## 3. Output 3

[Indicator 3-1]

- (1) Have you implemented the trial qualification test? If yes, how was the result?

[Indicator 3-2]

- (1) Have you developed personnel management regulation? If yes, kindly show it.
- (2) Have you formulated long-term and/or annual training plan?

[Indicator 3-3]

- (1) Kindly show the training materials and manuals.

## 4. Output 4

[Indicator 4-1]

- (1) How many materials for public relations have been developed during the period of the Project?
- (2) How did the Japanese expert contribute to the improvement of materials?

[Indicator 4-2]

- (1) Have you developed the regulation of reply to requests/complaints of customers? If yes, kindly show it.
- (2) How did the Japanese expert contribute to the improvement of materials?

[Indicator 4-3]

- (1) Kindly show the trend of requests/complaints of customers and reply to them.

[Indicator 4-4]

- (1) How many visitors have come to purification plant? Have you been able to achieve the target (> 1,000)?

[Indicator 4-5]

- (1) How many events do you hold to improve public relations?

## 5. Implementation Process

- (1) How have you been involved with planning the Project: activities and inputs?
- (2) How often do you communicate with the Japanese experts?

## **B. Five Criteria for Evaluation of the Project**

### **1. Relevance of the Project**

- (1) Are there any changes of policies/programs on water supply in Vietnam, compared with those at the time of commencement of the Project?
- (2) Do you think the approach of the Project is appropriate to meet the needs of COWASU? And why do you think so?

### **2. Effectiveness of the Project**

[Achievement of the Action Plan (Water Safety Plan)]

- (1) What is the target?
- (2) What has been achieved in the Water Safety Plan?
- (3) How is the progress of the Water Safety Plan monitored?
- (4) What are the difficulties for implementation of the Water Safety Plan?

[Water pressure and residual chlorine]

- (1) How many inspection points does the target of water pressure (>1.0 bar in urban and >0.5 in rural) have to be achieved by the end of the Project?
- (2) How many inspection points does the target of residual chlorine (> 0.1mg/l) have to be achieved by the end of the Project?
- (3) Kindly show us the data in 2007 and 2008.

### **3. Efficiency of the Project**

- (1) Have the inputs from Vietnamese side been done as planned? If no, what inhibited and how have those adversely affected smooth implementation of the Project?
- (2) Are you satisfied with competence of the experts and equipment procured from Japanese side?
- (3) Are you satisfied with the training in Japan? How has it contributed to upgrading your work?
- (4) Do employees trained by the Project continue working for COWASU?

### **4. Impact of the Project**

- (1) How are the results of the latest questionnaire survey on customer satisfaction? How do you reflect them for better services of yours?
- (2) Besides the indicators of the Overall Goal defined in PDM, have you ever observed any positive or negative impacts through implementation of the Project?

### **5. Sustainability of Strengthened COWASU**

- (1) In order to scrutinize sustainability of strengthened capacity of COWASU, kindly let us know the following information.
  - Future employment plan
  - Future in-service training plan for employees
  - Financial statement of COWASU: P/L, B/S, cash flow, etc.
  - Future investment plan to upgrade infrastructure, including sources of funds