

MERCOSUR Tourism Promotion Project
Evaluation Grid for Final Evaluation

1. Achievement

Evaluation Questions		Data Source							Data Collection Methods		
		Ad hoc	PMO	JICA Expert	JPMO	JICE	JICA	Private Sector		Others	
Survey Items	Sub-survey Items										
Inputs	What kinds of inputs have been provided by the Japanese side?						○				Project reports and documents
	What kinds of inputs have been provided by PMO?		○								Project reports and documents
	What kinds of inputs have been provided by the MERCOSUR side?	○									Project reports and documents
Activity 1	Strengthen framework of regional collaboration in the tourism sector		○	○	○	○	○				Project reports and documents
	Enhanced capacity of MERCOSUR in tourism planning		○	○	○	○	○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
Activity 2	Formulation of a master-plan of tourism promotion for the Japanese market										Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Implementation of marketing activities on a pilot basis		○	○	○	○	○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
Activity 3	Development of media and materials for tourism marketing on a pilot bases		○	○	○	○	○				Project reports and documents, and interviews

Evaluation Questions		Data Source								Data Collection Methods
		Ad hoc	PMO	JICA Expert	JPMO	JICE	JICA	Private Sector	Others	
Activity 4	Enhanced capacity of MERCOSUR in tourism product development	Development of MERCOSUR tourism products on a pilot basis		○	○	○	○	○		Project reports and documents, and interviews
Activity 5	Enhanced capacity of MERCOSUR in tourism human resource development	Capacity development of focal persons of MERCOSUR tourism sector		○	○	○	○	○		Project reports and documents, and interviews
Output 1	Strengthened framework of regional collaboration in the tourism sector	Plan of MERCOSUR Tourism Promotion Office both in MERCOSUR and in Japan		○	○	○	○	○		Project reports and documents
Output 2	Enhanced capacity of MERCOSUR in tourism planning	The number of meetings of the Support Committee		○	○	○	○	○		Project reports and documents
Output 3	Enhanced capacity of MERCOSUR in tourism marketing	Master plan of tourism promotion		○	○	○	○	○		Project reports and documents
Output 4	Enhanced capacity of MERCOSUR in tourism product development	Increase in the number of persons reached		○	○	○	○	○		Project reports and documents
Output 5	Enhanced capacity of MERCOSUR in tourism human resource development	A guideline/manuals for marketing		○	○	○	○	○		Project reports and documents
		Increase in the number of products developed		○	○	○	○	○		Project reports and documents, and interviews
		Maintained network of focal persons		○	○	○	○	○		Project reports and documents, and interviews
		The number of persons attended workshops		○	○	○	○	○		Project reports and documents, and interviews

Evaluation Questions		Data Source							Data Collection Methods	
		Ad hoc	PMO	JICA Expert	JPMO	JICE	JICA	Private Sector		Others
Project Purpose	Survey Items	Approval of MERCOSUR Tourism Promotion Office as an official institution and necessary budgetary arrangements for operation of the office	○	○	○	○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Sub-survey Items	Approval of Master-Plan of tourism promotion	○	○	○					Project reports and documents, and interviews
Overall Goal	Survey Items	Enhanced regional collaboration among MERCOSUR in the Japanese tourism market and develop a model of tourism promotion in new market	○	○	○	○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Sub-survey Items	Implementation of joint tourism promotion activities for other countries	○	○	○		○			Project reports and documents, and interviews
Overall Goal	Survey Items	Enhanced bilateral collaboration between MERCOSUR and Japan in the tourism sector	○	○	○	○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Sub-survey Items	Increase of the number of Japanese tourists to MERCOSUR	○	○	○		○			Project reports and documents, and interviews

* English expressions used above are verbatim with the ones in PDM.

2. Implementation Process

Evaluation Questions		Data Source							Data Collection Methods	
Survey Items	Sub-survey Items	Ad hoc	PMO	JICA Expert	JPMO	JICE	JICA	Private Sector	Others	
Implementation of Activities	Have the Activities been conducted based on the PDM and PO?		<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>				Interviews
	Are there any factors that have impeded the implementation of the Activities?	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>		<input type="radio"/>		Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Are there any factors that have promoted the implementation of the Activities?	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>		<input type="radio"/>		Interviews
General	Have the communications between the MERCOSUR side and JPMO been all right, sharing information with each other?		<input type="radio"/>		<input type="radio"/>					Interviews
	Have important decisions been made by both the MERCOSUR and Japanese sides?	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>					Interviews
Implementation Framework	Have the staff of PMO and the members of Ad hoc been posted appropriately in terms of number, timing, etc.?	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>						Interviews
	Have the staff of JPMO been posted appropriately in terms of number, timing, etc.?			<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>					Interviews
	How has the attitude of the staff of PMO and the members of Ad hoc been throughout the project duration?	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>						
MERCOSUR	How have public-private partnerships been established in the MERCOSUR side?	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>				<input type="radio"/>		Interviews
	Has the budgetary allocation been appropriate?	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>						Interviews

Evaluation Questions		Data Source								Data Collection Methods
Survey Questions	Sub-survey Questions	Ad hoc	PMO	JICA Expert	JPMO	JICE	JICA	Private Sector	Others	Interviews
Japan	Have the staff members been appropriately posted to JPMO?				○	○				Interviews
	How has the attitude of the JPMO staff been throughout the project duration?				○	○				Interviews
	How have public-private partnerships been established in Japan?				○	○		○		Interviews
	How has JPMO coordinated with government organizations, such as Embassies of the MERCOSUR countries and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs?							○		Interviews
	Has the budgetary allocation been appropriate?				○	○				Interviews

3. Five Evaluation Criteria

Survey Items		Evaluation Questions	Data Source								Data Collection Methods
			Ad hoc	PMO	JICA Expert	JPMO	JICE	JICA	Private Sector	Others	
Consistency with the policy of the MERCOSUR countries	Are the Project Purpose and the Overall Goal consistent with the development policy of MERCOSUR?										Project reports and documents
		In the MERCOSUR countries, is it urgently needed to explore a new market for tourism promotion?	○	○	○			○			Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Is the assistance for tourism promotion of MERCOSUR consistent with the aid policy of the Japanese government?										Project reports and documents
Appropriateness of the selection of the target market for tourism promotion	Was it appropriate for MERCOSUR to select Japan as a new market for tourism promotion?	○	○	○	○					○	Interviews
		Was the joint tourism promotion approach as MERCOSUR appropriate? (What are advantages and disadvantages of a single-country target approach and a regional (MERCOSUR) target approach?)	○	○	○	○					○
	Compared with other JICA technical cooperation projects, what are the advantages of conducting technical transfer in Japan, not in MERCOSUR countries, in the form of providing training at TIC?										
Appropriateness of the project implementation approaches	Was it appropriate to conduct technical transfer in Japan (through JICA training programs at TIC)?	○	○								Interviews
											Interviews

Evaluation Questions		Data Source								Data Collection Methods
Survey Items	Sub-survey Items	Ad hoc	PMO	JICA Expert	JPMO	JICE	JICA	Private Sector	Others	
		Possibility to achieve the Project Purpose	(Refer to "1. Achievement")							
Production of the Outputs										
Implementation of the Activities										
Effectiveness	Inhibiting factors for the achievement of the Project Purpose		○	○	○	○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Inhibiting factors for the production of the Outputs		○	○	○	○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
Efficiency	Inputs									Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Activities									Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Relationship between the Inputs and the Activities		○	○	○	○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Relationship between the Activities and the Outputs		○	○	○	○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Relationship between the cost and the Outputs								○	Interviews

Evaluation Questions		Data Source								Data Collection Methods	
		Ad hoc	PMO	JICA Expert	JPMO	JICE	JICA	Private Sector	Others		
Survey Items	Sub-survey Items										Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Are there any prospects that the MERCOSUR side (Ad hoc and PMO) and JPMO are trying to promote tourism in other countries? (Do they have specific ideas to explore a new market of tourism?)	○	○	○	○		○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Possibility to achieve the Overall Goal	○	○	○	○		○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Are there any prospects that the number of Japanese tourists to the MERCOSUR countries will increase? (Explain why)	○	○	○	○		○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
Impact	Are there any impeding factors to increase the number of Japanese tourists to the MERCOSUR countries? (e.g., distance, tourism resources, etc.)	○	○	○	○		○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Besides the Overall Goal and the Project Purpose, are there any positive impacts that have been produced by the Project?	○	○	○	○		○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Positive impacts (other than the Project Purpose and the Overall Goal)	○	○	○	○		○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Negative impacts	○	○	○	○		○				Project reports and documents, and interviews
	Are there any negative impacts that have been brought about by the Project?	○	○	○	○		○				Project reports and documents, and interviews

Evaluation Questions		Data Source							Data Collection Methods			
		Ad hoc	PMO	JICA Expert	JPMO	JICE	JICA	Private Sector		Others		
Survey Items	Possibility that the positive effects of the Project will continue	Are public-private partnerships likely to continue in both Japan and MERCOSUR after the Project?	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	Project reports and documents, and interviews	
		After the Project, are the C/Ps (MERCOSUR) determined to continue the same kind of tourism promotion activities that they have been doing in the Project?	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	Interviews
	Sustainability	Possibility that the operation system of the project activities will continue	After the Project, are the C/Ps (MERCOSUR) ready to continue to operate PMO and JPMO?	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
After the Project, will the RET Adhoc Committee continue to exist after the Project?			<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Possibility that the tourism promotion policy of the MERCOSUR countries will continue		After the Project, will the personnel and budgetary allocations in PMO and JPMO continue the same way as what they have done during the project duration?	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
	Is tourism promotion consistent with the policy of each country of MERCOSUR?	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	Project reports and documents

* Not all stakeholders with in the column of Data Source will be interviewed.

* Even if written documents provide a lot of detailed information, interviews will be conducted with some of the stakeholders.

* The answer(s) to some of the sub-survey questions might be overlapped with the one to another question. In case of that, an evaluation consultant will make some arrangements to put the answer(s) in the appropriate section of the evaluation report.

Inputs by the Japanese Side as of September 2007

	Inputs	Period	JFY2004	JFY2005	JFY2006	JFY2007*1	Amount (JPY)
Personnel	Long-term expert 1 Advisor to PMO	Dec. 12, 2005 to date					
Receipt of the Trainees	MERCOSUR Tourism Promotion Executive Seminar (8 trainees)	Mar. 20-27, 2005	9,285,113				9,285,113
	MERCOSUR Tourism Promotion Seminar (28 trainees)	Sep. 14 to 26, 2005 Sep. 19 to 30, 2006 Sep. 11 to 23, 2007		6,851,402	6,132,000	7,342,000	20,325,402
	JPMO Director (1 trainee)	Apr. 19 to July 17, 2005					
	JPMO Director (1 trainee)	Sep. 7 to Dec. 12, 2005 Jan. 19 2007 to Jan. 13, 2008					
	OJT Promotion (1 trainee)	Apr. 26 2005 to Apr. 25, 2006					
	OJT Promotion (1 trainee)	May 20, 2006 to Feb. 28, 2007					
	OJT Promotion (1 trainee)	Feb. 14 to Oct. 13, 2007					
	OJT Promotion (1 trainee)	Sep. 11 2007 to Jan. 13, 2008					
Operational Expenses	Operation of JPMO	JFY2004-2007	21,854,372	55,815,825	52,388,163	43,785,000	173,843,360
	Cost Sharing in MERCOSUR						
	Brazil	Apr. 2005 to date		1,800,000	2,810,000	1,910,000	6,520,000
	Argentina	Apr. 2005 to date		2,955,000	1,987,000	1,500,000	6,442,000
	Uruguay	Apr. 2005 to date		1,845,000	4,372,000	2,340,000	8,557,000
	Paraguay	Apr. 2005 to date		1,400,000	1,799,000	1,500,000	4,699,000
Others	Expenses for OJT Trainee, experts, missions, etc.		6,524,688	27,054,671	27,252,000	21,936,000	82,767,359
			37,664,173	97,721,898	96,740,163	80,313,000	312,439,234

*1) The amount for JPY 2007 is the planned budget.

Inputs by the MERCOSUR side as of September 2007

(1) Argentina

	Inputs	Period	2005	2006	2007	Amount (USD)
Personnel	RET Ad hoc Group Member	Jan. 2005 to date				
	Local Coordinator	Oct. 2005 to date				
	OJT Promotion trainee (costs borne by JICA)	Sep. 2007 to date				
Materials	Printing of the Promotional Materials of MERCOSUR	2007			8,300.00	8,300.00
	Printing of the Promotional Materials of Argentina	2006 and 2007		6,800.00	7,500.00	14,300.00
Seminars and tours	Cost sharing for FAM Tours	2006 and 2007		2,630.00	9,000.00	11,630.00
Travel	Participating in JATA (8 Officers from the Ministry)	2005	8,000.00			8,000.00
	Participating in Ad hoc Group meeting	2007			8,600.00	8,600.00
	Subsidy for the Seminar Participants' Travel	2006		55,990.00		55,990.00
Operational Expenses	Courier (Materials)	2006		29,620.00		29,620.00
	Communication and Office Materials	2007			1,390.00	1,390.00
			8,000.00	95,040.00	34,790.00	137,830.00

(2) Brazil

	Inputs	Period	2005	2006	2007	Amount (USD)
Personnel	RET Ad hoc Group Member	Jan. 2005 to date				
	Local Coordinator	Oct. 2005 to date				
	JPMO Director (costs borne also by JICA)	Apr. 4 to July 17, 2005 Sep. 7 to Dec. 12, 2005 Jan. 19, 2007 to date				
Materials	Promotional Materials of MERCOSUR (Pamphlets with the map, folders, etc.)	2006 and 2007		6,363.64	6,363.64	12,727.28
	Promotional Materials of Brazil (Maps, magazines, pamphlets, DVD, etc.)	2006 and 2007		9,204.59	8,671.82	17,876.41
	Folders of MERCOSUR for ICCA (Pamphlets)	2005	1,400.00			1,400.00
Travel	Cost sharing for FAM Tours	2005, 2006 and 2007	2,994.55	15,000.00	11,272.73	29,267.28
	Press Tours	2005 and 2007	3,127.27		3,363.64	6,490.91
	Participation in Ad hoc Group Meetings	2006 and 2007		32,772.73	7,870.45	40,643.18
	Ministry's Officials' Visit to JATA Fair	2005 and 2007	12,960.00		15,000.00	27,960.00
Operational Expenses	Courier (Materials)	2006 and 2007		20,912.01	1,678.52	22,590.53
	Subsidy for JPMO Director's expenses in Japan	2005 and 2007	36,820.27		115,500.00	152,320.27
	Office Operation (communication, stationeries, etc.)	2006 and 2007		1,090.91	1,090.00	2,180.91
			57,302.09	85,343.88	170,810.80	313,456.77

(3) Paraguay

	Inputs	Period	2005	2006	2007	Amount (USD)
Personnel	RET Ad hoc Group Member	Jan. 2005 to date				
	Local Coordinator	Oct. 2005 to Apr. 2006 June 2006 to March 2007 April 2007 to date				
	OJT Promotion trainee (costs borne by JICA)	Apr. 26, 2005 to Apr. 25, 2006 May 20, 2006 to February 2007				
Materials	Promotion Materials of MERCOSUR	2007			8,200.00	8,200.00
	Promotional Materials of Paraguay (Magazine)	2005	2,984.21			2,984.21
	Promotional Materials of Paraguay (CD)	2005	281.75			281.75
	Promotional Materials of Paraguay (Guidebook in Japanese)	2006		8,593.60		8,593.60
	Promotional Materials of Paraguay	2006		4,000.00		4,000.00
Seminars and Tours	Cost sharing for FAM Tours	2005, 2006 and 2007	652.23	879.48	10,000.00	11,531.71
	Seminar for Operators/Hotels on Japanese Market	2005	275.75			275.75
	Technical Committee's Meeting with the Private Sector	2006		263.16		263.16
Travel	Minister's visit to Japan	2006 and 2007		6,824.91	10,000.00	16,824.91
	Participation in Ad hoc Group Meetings	2006 and 2007		3,132.94	1,000.00	4,132.94
	Journalist's Visit to JATA Fair	2005	3,316.14			3,316.14
	Administrator's Visit to JATA Fair	2005	6,112.69			6,112.69
Operational Expenses	Courier	2006 and 2007		392.72	3,000.00	3,392.72
	Office Operation	2005		553.39		553.39
			13,622.77	24,640.20	32,200.00	70,462.97

(4) Uruguay

	Inputs	Period	2005	2006	2007	Amount (USD)
Personnel	RET Ad hoc Group Member	Jan. 2005 to date				
	OJT Promotion trainee (costs borne by JICA)	Feb. 2006 to Oct. 2007				
Materials	Promotion Materials of MERCOSUR	2007			6,700.00	6,700.00
	Promotional Materials of Uruguay (Pamphlets)	2006		3,458.00		3,458.00
	Promotional Materials of Tannat Wine (Label printing, boxes, pamphlets and cards)	2006		4,900.00		4,900.00
Equipment	PMO Office Equipment	Feb. 2005 to date		3,736.00		3,736.00
	PMO Office Utilities	Feb. 2005 to date		9,669.00		9,669.00
Seminars and tours	Seminar of PMO opening	2005	500.00			500.00
	Cost sharing for FAM Tours	2005, 2006 and 2007	4,600.00	2,880.00	9,000.00	16,480.00
Travel	Participation in Ad hoc Group Meetings	2006 and 2007		9,003.00	8,600.00	17,603.00
Operational Expenses	Communication and Office Materials	2006 and 2007		1,650.00	1,650.00	3,300.00
	PMO operation expenses				3,890.00	3,890.00
	Food and Transportation for Hosting Ad hoc Group Meetings	2006		500.00		500.00
			5,100.00	35,796.00	29,840.00	70,736.00