

Annex 5 Evaluation Grid
Evaluation Grid for Terminal Evaluation of Capacity Building for Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Al Baath University

Evaluation Items	Evaluation Question		Criteria and Method for Judgement	Required Data and Information	Information Source and Collection Methods (Interviews are conducted with JICA Expert and Counterparts in regards to all items)
	Question	Sub-question			
<u>Verification of performance</u>	Were Inputs in line with initial plan?		Discrepancy between Input plan and actual results	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Annual activities and the achievements Actual results of activities Status of counterparts' work Evaluation by JICA Experts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Periodical report by JICA Experts Performance and rating based on the Plan of Operation by both sides Self evaluation by CP
	Were Outputs generated in line with PO?		Ditto	ditto	ditto
	Will the Project Purpose be achieved?		Extent to which Project Purpose indicators have been achieved	ditto	ditto
	Will the Overall Goal be achieved?		Extent to which Overall Goal indicators have been achieved	ditto	ditto
<u>Implementation Process</u>	Was the activity carried out as planned?		Discrepancy between activity plans and actual results	ditto	ditto
	Was there any problem in the method of the technology transfer?		Do implemented activities match below mentioned aspects? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Characteristics of the C/Ps Capacity of resources of the counterpart organization Culture of the counterpart organization 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Methods of the technical transfer Suitability of the methods 	ditto
	Was there any problem in the management system of the project?		Does the monitoring system put in place to achieve the Project Purpose?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Existence of system to monitor project's progress Monitoring methodology Feedback methodology 	ditto
	Do the executing organization and the counterparts have a high recognition of the project?		Do they recognize about the contents of the PDM?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Degree of understanding about the contents of the PDM 	ditto
	Were the appropriate counterparts assigned?		Suitability of the basic technical capacity of CPs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Basic technical capacity of CPs 	ditto
	Was there any constraint in the process of the project implementation and what is the factor which generated the positive effects?		Obstacles on the activities and production of the Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Key person's opinion 	ditto

Handwritten signature

Mohrah

Evaluation Items	Evaluation Question		Criteria and Method for Judgement	Required Data and Information	Information Source and Collection Methods (Interviews are conducted with JICA Expert and Counterparts in regards to all items)	
	Question	Sub-question				
1. Relevance	1.1 Is the project consistent with Syria's development policy?	1.1.1 Is the effect that the project is aiming for in line with the national policy of Syria?	Consistency of priority, needs, feasibility of the national development policy	10 th Five-Year National Development Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interview to JICA Syria, MOAAR, MOHE, SPC Questionnaire survey 	
		1.1.2 Is the project consistent with the needs of targeted group and organization?	Conformity to the FVM, MOAAR, MOHE conditions and measures required	Policy and strategy of FVM Development Plan of MOEH Educational policy by MOEH Policy of animal health by MOAAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interview to MOAAR, MOHE, FVM of Al Baath University Questionnaire survey 	
	1.2 Is the project consistent with Japan's ODA policy?	1.2.1 Is the project conformity to the Japan ODA policy?	Conformity to the Japan's policy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Policy of economic cooperation - Syria ODA Taskforce 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interview to EoJ Review of relevant reports 	
		1.2.2 Relevance of the Japan's ODA in technical cooperation	Conformity to JICA's cooperation policy	JICA Country Assistance Implementation Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interview to JICA HQ and JICA Syria 	
	1.3 Appropriateness as a means?	1.3.1 Were the project's approach, target group and its size appropriate?	Justification of target group and its size	Key person's opinion	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Report of Mid-term Evaluation Interview to Dean of FVM, JICA HQ, JICA Syria Review of relevant reports 	
			Appropriateness of the target group size in regards to inputs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conditions of supporting Key person's opinion 	ditto	
		1.3.2 Do project Purpose and Outputs coincide to the scale of Inputs and institutional capacity of Japanese side?	Capacity of project Outputs and purpose was support enough or not by JICA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Opinions from MOAAR, MOHE, FMV Project's role within development issues in Syria Demarcation and share among other projects 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interview to MOHE, MOAAR Review of relevant reports 	
	1.4 Does Japanese technology (knowledge) in the field have any advantage?	1.3.3 Is commitment of Syrian side actors high?	Magnitude of project commitment at FMV	Project experiences in veterinary medicines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> TA Achievements in VM Technical advantages of Outputs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review of relevant reports
			2.1.1 Are the Project Purpose and Objectively Verifiable Indicators appropriate?	assessment from a technical perspective by the team	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project Purpose and verifiable indices of PDM Key person's opinion 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Periodical report by expert Interview to MOHE, MOAAR
	2. Effectiveness	2.2 Was the Project Purpose expected to be	2.2.1 Was the project purpose archived in line	assessment from a technical perspective by the team	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Achievement of PO Key person's opinion 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ditto

XX

Mahr.

Evaluation Items	Evaluation Question		Criteria and Method for Judgement	Required Data and Information	Information Source and Collection Methods (Interviews are conducted with JICA Expert and Counterparts in regards to all items)
	Question	Sub-question			
	achieved? And, was it achieved by the project?	with the plan?	Prediction as to whether Purpose will be achieved based on the extent to which Outputs has currently been achieved	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reason of updating curriculum Effects of diagnosis research training and internalization into VM education 	
		2.2.2 Was the achievement of Purpose generated by the achievement of Outputs?	Current relation of activities and Outputs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PDM Current achievement of PO Standard Diagnosis Operation Procedure, O/M Manual Change of practical exercise class, number of report regarding diagnosis research 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Performance and rating based on the Plan of Operation by Expert and FMV
	2.3 Has CLDR provided efficient knowledge to students and veterinarians in Syria? (Was the achievement of Purpose generated by the achievement of Outputs?)	2.3.1 Are indicators of the Project Purpose expected to be achieved?	Current achievement of the project purpose based on current achievement of Outputs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PDM Current achievement of PO Number of practical exercise class and attendants Current conditions of the sharing information of animal disease Current on going training programme Number of research paper submitted 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Periodical report by expert Performance and rating based on the Plan of Operation by Expert and FMV Interview to Dean of FMV, CLDR staff, alumni, clients, students
		2.3.2 Was the achievement of Purpose generated by the achievement of Outputs?	Current conditions of the Outputs (maintenance of equipment, diagnostic research, knowledge of diagnostic skills, training programme) which leads to project purpose.	ditto	ditto
		2.3.3 Can the project purpose achieve by current Outputs and important assumptions set?	Appropriateness of casual relationship among important assumptions, Outputs and project purpose	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PDM Technical advices from Expert 	ditto
	2.4 Are there any factors impeding or encouraging the achievement of the Project Purpose?		factors that inhibit the achievement of project purpose	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> factors that inhibit the achievement of project purpose Role of Local Committee 	ditto
	3.1 Is the Outputs achievement level adequate in regard to	3.1.1 Were number of dispatching experts, their field, dispatching timing	Comparing Inputs to initial plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of dispatching experts Experts' activities Key person's opinion 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Periodical report by expert Performance and rating based on the Plan of Operation by Expert and
3. Efficiency					

AK

mohrab

Evaluation Items	Evaluation Question		Criteria and Method for Judgement	Required Data and Information	Information Source and Collection Methods (Interviews are conducted with JICA Expert and Counterparts in regards to all items)
	Question	Sub-question			
	amount, quality and timing of inputs?	appropriate?			FMV
		3.1.2 Was equipment supply appropriate in terms of amount, type, timing?	Qualitative evaluation based on information and results of interviews	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of equipment supply Record of equipment operation Key person's opinion 	ditto
		3.1.3 Was training in Japan proper measure to achieve the Outputs?	Number of trainee, field of training, duration of training	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of training in Japan Key person's opinion 	ditto
		3.1.4 Are number of counterpart, their ability, their duration appropriate?	assessment from a technical perspective by the team	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Current assignment of CP Key person's opinion 	ditto
		3.1.5 Are project space and building, size of space, utilities sufficient enough to implement the project?	ditto	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Current condition of the project space, utilities, Key person's opinion 	ditto • Site observation
		3.1.6 Is cost of the project reasonable size?	ditto	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project cost sharing of both Syrian and Japanese side Annual budget of CLDR Key person's opinion 	ditto • Interview to Dean • Questionnaire survey
		3.1.7 Is capacity of counterpart improved for diagnostic skills?	Teaching and research assistances	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Progress of technical transfer to research and technical staff regarding diagnostic skills Key person's opinion 	ditto
		3.2.1 Was the total amount appropriate?	In comparison of similar project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evaluation report of similar projects 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interview to JICA HQ Review of relevant report
		3.2.2 Was training cost appropriate?	In comparison of unit cost		ditto
		3.3 Were there any factors that impeded or promoted the achievement of the various Outputs?		Differences between PO and actual results, factors that impeded or promoted the achievements, changes, etc.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> change of important Assumptions Impeded or promoted factors CP's employment conditions Key person's opinion
4.1 Can the Overall Goal be achieved as an effect of the accomplishment of the Project Purpose?	In comparison between before the project and after the project		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evaluation by JICA Expert Contribution magnitude of diagnostic skills to student and veterinarian at CLDR Prospects of achieving 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Periodical report by expert Performance and rating based on the Plan of Operation by Expert and FMV Questionnaire survey 	
4. Impact					

KK

Mohrah

Evaluation Items	Evaluation Question		Criteria and Method for Judgement	Required Data and Information	Information Source and Collection Methods (Interviews are conducted with JICA Expert and Counterparts in regards to all items)
	Question	Sub-question			
				Overall Goal by fulfilment of the Important Assumptions and Project Purpose achieved <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Is the policy framework needed to achieve the Overall Goal feasible? Is there any estrangement between the Project Purpose and the Overall Goal? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interview to MOAAR Animal Health Statistics
		4.1.2 Is it decreased number of animal diseases and is it increased number of treatment?	ditto	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of animal disease and treated number 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interview to MOAAR Animal Health Statistics
		4.1.3 Is it increased number of vaccination to animal health?	ditto	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of vaccinations 	ditto
	4.2 Ripple effects	4.2.1 Is there ripple effect on education of VM?	In comparison between before the project and after the project commencement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Key person's opinion 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Periodical report by expert Performance and rating based on the Plan of Operation by Expert and FMV Questionnaire survey
		4.2.2 Is there any ripple effect on Al Baath University?	ditto	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Key person's opinion 	ditto
		4.2.3 Is there any effect on animal health in district level?	ditto (mutual cooperation between CLDR and Directorate of Animal Heal, Daily Fann Agency)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Key person's opinion 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interview to Directorate of Animal Health
		4.2.4 Is appropriate mutual complementary system with the other donors or projects?	Is there any objective mutual cooperation?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Current cooperation with ICARDA Key person's opinion 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Periodical report by expert
	4.3 Are there any factors contributing to or impeding the achievement of the Overall Goal?	4.3.1 How did trainees who attended seminar evaluate by themselves regarding to training effects?	Changes of technical level before the training and after the training	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Current employment status of attendants Self evaluation result in technical level 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Periodical report by expert Questionnaire survey
	4.4 Are there any ripple effects to beneficial or detrimental to project?		Change of animal health and socioeconomic policies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Determinable and positive aspects on archiving Overall Goal Appropriateness of preconditions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interview to FVM, MOAAR, MOHE

KK

Mohab

Evaluation Items	Evaluation Question		Criteria and Method for Judgement	Required Data and Information	Information Source and Collection Methods (Interviews are conducted with JICA Expert and Counterparts in regards to all items)
	Question	Sub-question			
5. Sustainability	5.1 Is CLDR clear position and role at FVM?		Importance of CLDR in FVM and in animal health	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Related affects on gender, social group, etc. Roles at FVM Roles in animal health in Syria 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interview to Dean, MOAAR
	5.2 Is organizational capacity sufficient to sustain the project's effect?	5.2.1 Is organizational capacity sufficient to sustain CLDR?	Capacity of operation and maintenance of CLDR at FVM	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Development Plan of FVM for Year 2007 Current conditions of transferred diagnosis research information and technology, sharing mechanism of accumulated information and technology 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interview to Dean and JICA Expert Questionnaire survey
		5.1.2 Is financial capacity sufficient to sustain CLDR?	Is appropriate budget (staff wages, consumables) approved for next fiscal year?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Budget of Year 2007 for CLDR Development Plan of FVM 	ditto
		5.1.3 Are appropriate skilled staff assigned at CLDR and will the stay at CLDR?	Human resources assignment policy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Current and further assignment of staff at CLDR Sharing transferred technology among staff 	ditto
		5.2 Is there sufficient technology to sustain the project's effects?	Prospects of technical achievements set in Outputs and their sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evaluation by JICA expert Prospects of technical transfer by the end of project 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Performance and rating based on the Plan of Operation by Expert and FMV
		5.2.2 Will the transferred technology be sustained in CLDR and FVM?	Provisional conditions of activating CLDR by FVM	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evaluation by experts Internalization conditions of diagnosis research at FVM 	ditto
		5.2.3 Will the equipments granted appropriately be maintained?	Conditions of staff assignment and provision of O/M manual, SDOP, etc.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Current conditions of operation and maintenance Key person's opinion 	ditto
		5.3 Are there any other factors that would influence the project's sustainability?	Is three any other factors?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Other factors Key person's opinion 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interview to Dean of FVM, JICA Syria

Mohra