The FS and Implementation Support on the CALA East-West National Road Project

# FOURTH STAKEHOLDERS' MEETING

El Cielito Inn, Sta. Rosa, Laguna

09 December 2005

# ATTENDANCE

							K	T									
Signature	A	I Turner Chile	17 90 Collo	inon'	1 minut	Inveriel		4 allin /	Ly Man	/2 Calla	i i	2	x quile is	Ace a.	D D	2	
Telephone #	SIZSAL				V	481015P		4 8101 54	Ch& 17. 15	6365197	1)		726-0484	920-04-84	928-50-15		
Agency	druh pusitas	JICA Study Tealer	TICA	JICA Stur Ten-	that to-	DRWH/ IPUCITS		Amo-ts, DPWH	PMU-FG	VICA Secury Team	<i>L</i> ( <i>i</i>		Stander B	-1 -1]	HIMDO'SJ-OWD	1	
Designation	hur coodineter	(	H: Kurry E. 4		Halver	Elud. / Kehr.		Engr II	TI OT	Kew the met gree	~1 275/197		pututary	1	Economist IT		
Name	idnuchus 1 ic. haw	Tomos Aski	E. YOKOTA	Nanette I. Abilan .	There of any	Min Madrid	PETTE SANTAC	COENEROPS S. AL COMUS	BORDA RALLADAN	Bur 2 Prilane	in Sister	Windre Ullane	Rosenia Nicherd	LOSEPH L. CALMI	ROMJ LESCAND	El-1'Y Rowl	

The FS and Implementation Support on the CALA East-West National Road Project

# FOURTH STAKEHOLDERS' MEETING

El Cielito Inn, Sta. Rosa, Laguna

09 December 2005

# ATTENDANCE

∅ Signature		De B	A AND	S. S.		auni						
Telephone #	511-6367	641-5433	6720 923 - 5417	0218922366	3635-365 PITO	JU- X-V						
Agency		MYALA CANP, INC	Saugg un and Bayan	0 00	Bree Japan	HPR Puri- aun						
Designation	Millen. Asset asor	URBAN FUMMER	Mun. Councilor	S·B.	HPDE Ansagendendent	NDOC STAFF						
Name	Davile S. Arzola	SALVADIA C. TAU	tou. Gat Alatint	LOUN. Hel LAD	meets 4. CASUPLIAN	alexander M. Threed						

1



# **On-going Works on the ESC Study**

- Environmental Baseline Study
  - Field measurement surveys: air, noise/vibration, water
  - Secondary data collection





# **On-going Works on the ESC Study**

- · Environmental Baseline Study
  - Field measurement surveys: air, noise/vibration, water
  - Secondary data collection
- · Social Survey
  - Focus group discussion (Barangay consultation)
  - Perception survey
  - Household inventory survey for resettlement (100% survey for potential households to be resettled for ROW acquisition)

### **Consensus Building Process** for Implementation of the Proposed Projects

Focus Group Discussion (Barangay Consultation)
 Agenda: Outline of the proposed projects, Proposed alternative road alignments, Coordination on social surveys, Q&A (discussion)
 Derivinginants: Barangay

•

11

(discussion) Participants: Barangay captains and councilors, Project-affected persons, Residents, Peoples organizations (PO), Non-governmental organization (NGO) Accentence





### Consensus Building Process for Implementation of the Proposed Projects

Focus Group Discussion (Barangay Consultation)

Issues & Concern
Is the alignment final?

- Will there be compensation for affected assets? When?
- Is there a ready relocation site?How will existing business
- establishment be compensated?Will there be alternative income source in the relocation site?
- What documents are needed as proof of ownership?



### Consensus Building Process for Implementation of the Proposed Projects

• Perception Survey



### Consensus Building Process for Implementation of the Proposed Projects

- Household Interview Survey for Resettlement
  - All potential households to be resettled
  - Incl. questions on perception of the project

















DH R	oad Description: Common Alignment
Road Segment	Alignment Description
DH 1: SLEX to Old National Road	The alignment lies within the heavily built up area in Poblacion Muntinlupa traversing a generally flat to gently rolling terrain adjacent to residential area beginning from the Old National Road and intersecting Muntinlupa. The segment spans approximately 1.68 km.
DH 2: Muntinlupa to Bacoor Boundary	The alignment runs along the open area near the Muntinlupa Bilibid Prison, crossing over the South Luzon Tollway until it joins the existing Daang Hari Road at the boundary of Baccor and Muntinlupa. This alignment has a length of 3.17 km and traverses a gentle rolling terrain.
DH 3: Bacoor Boundary to Imus	The alignment uses the existing Daang Hari Road, with a length of 10.40 km. The line runs along residential areas in Baccor and Imus, Cavite. The existing pavement of Daang Hari Road ends at the intersection of Aguinaldo Highway while the line runs continuously towards the western side of Imus using the existing Subdivision Road near Salitran.
5	

Road Segment	Alignment Description
DH 4: Imus to Gen. Trias/Rosar	The alternative lines traverse the open raw land between Imus (starting from Aguinaldo Highway) and Gen. Trias. DH – 4 spans 9.00 km and initially runs in a westerly direction then veers northwest toward the Export Processing Zone Area in Rosario as it intersects the Rosario – Noveleta Diversion Road.
DH 5: Imus to Tanza 1	This alignment shares the same starting point as DH4. It has a length of 8.75 kms and traverses westerly along open raw land of the same Imus and Gen. Trias municipalities. In Tanza, it slightly veers in a northwesterly direction for a shor distance and then interfaces with the existing Tanza – Gen. Trias Road.
DH 6: Imus to Tanza 2	DH 6, is a variation of DH – 5 but extends farther to the west toward the Tanza area and connects with the Tanza – Naic – Caylabne Road. This proposed road alignmen alternative measures approximately 10.40 km in length and likewise passes through an open area with relatively flat to gently rolling terrain.

		1.2 Alternative Alignments
Daang	Hari Road Exte	nsion
	Advantage	Disadvantage
DH-4 : Imus to Rosario (EPZA)	<ul> <li>Provides direct access to the Export Processing Zone in Rosaria and alternative route to the beavity congested section of Aquitable Highway from Rosario and Baccor to Imus.</li> <li>Comparative Jonder oute length than that of DH- 6 but a little longer than that of DH-5.</li> </ul>	• Will distub more roadside structures during construction.     • Requires longer pipe network as the locations of outfail for surface runnof discharge are far from each other.     • Though desirable geometric design conditions could be satisfied as the segment traverses open area, the alignment has more bench than the definit devices than the ordinary condition when the alignment is almost straight.     • Total project capital requirement is higher than DH- 5.
DH-5 : Imus to Tanza (Tanza – Gen. Trias Road)	• Offers more efficient linkage to the other road networks such as the Tazaz – Gan. Tras Road and Tazaz – Naie – Caylaten Road, which lead to various cayoing readential devolution to the midowy tetween Bacoor and Nais, the alternative line serves more traffic generators even hose coming from the Export Processing Zone in Rosario. The alternative line has the schortes route length among other alternatives. Requires the least project capital requirements due to the states and project and la requirements due to the states and project capital requirements due consing, road intersections and fever disturbances to existing radiatide devolopment.	<ul> <li>Requires improvement and videning of the short section of the existing Tanza – Gen. Trias Road to maintain traffic convenience and smooth traffic flow along the intersection.</li> </ul>

		1.2 Alternative Alignments
Daang	Hari Road Exte	ension
	Advantage	Disadvantage
DH-6 : Imus to Tanza (Tanza – Naic – Caylabne Road)	<ul> <li>Likevise with DH-5, this segment offers more officient linkage to the other crade networks such as the Tanza – Gen. Trias Road and Tanza – Naic – Cayahone Road, which lead to various ongoing residential developments, tourist destinations, lessiner parks and resorts. Located mix/way between Baccor and Naic, the alternative line serves more traffic generators even those coming from the Export Processing Zone in Rosario.</li> </ul>	Has the longest route length among the other alternatives and consequently has the highest total project capital requirement.     The alignment entails sharp bench as it approaches the intersection of Tanza – Naic – Caylabne Road.
8		



Nort	h-South Road: Common Alignment
NS 1: Rt to Baccor	This road segment starts as it interfaces with the existing R-1 Expressway (previously Manila Cavite Coastal Road) at a bend as the latter connects with McDonald Jct Aguinaldo Highway. From this junction, the alignment runs through the shoreline and across salt ponds for about 1.0 km while it bends and connects with McDonald Jct. – Aguinaldo Highway. Then, the proposed road alignment uses the same existing road (McDonald Jct. – Aguinaldo Highway) for about 440 meters and terminates as it intersects the main Aguinaldo Highway. The road segment has a length of 1.39 km.
NS 2: Baccorto Molino Boulevard	The segment commences at the terminus of Segment. From the junction of Aguinato Highway, the segment runs along the Molino Boulevard alignment for about 4.61 km. This line traverses subdivision areas and the construction of the remaining section of Molino Boulevard along this area has yet to be completed. The terrain is generally flat and the surrounding area has been well developed
NS 3 Molino Blvd. to Daang Hari	The alignment veers away from the existing Molino Boulevard alignment along the south west direction cutting across the existing subdivision areas for about 2 km after which, it runs through an open raw land area until it bends near Aguinaldo Highway and continuously runs alongside until it reaches and connects with existing Daang Hari Road. The road segment measures about 5.1 km in length.
NS & Daang Hari to Gov Drive	From Daang Hari Intersection, the road alignment creeps through the open area alongside Aguinaldo Highway until it cuts across roadside residential and commercial development along Salitan Road. The alignment continues to move southerly almost parallel to the Aguinaldo Highway and along the still vacant areas east of the existing highway towards Palapala in Dasmarinas. The road alignment intersects again with Aguinaldo Highway as this segment terminates and changes direction west of the same highway. From the intersection with Daang Hari, the segment runs approximately 7.52 km along gently rolling terrain in Dasmarinas.
10	

NS 5: Aguinaldo Highway (expansion)	NS – 5 uses the existing Aguinaldo Highway alignment starting from about 2 km before Governor's Drive and terminates at the junction of Silang Municipal Road and the said highway. It spans about 9.24 km and has wide 4 to 5 lanes up to the Robinsori's Mall area and tapers to two (2) lanes within about 500 meters until it reaches Silang. The existing horizontal and vertical alignments are generally good along relatively flat to gently rolling terrain.
NS 6: New road west of Aguinaldo	NS – 6 is an alternative alignment, which starts from the intersection of Aguinaldo Highway and traverses slightly in a southwesterly direction almost parallel to and west of Aguinaldo Highway. Since the alternative alignment would supposedly connect with the proposed CALA Expressway, it should terminate as it intersects the expressway alignment located about 7.85 km from the segment's northern terminal at the intersection of Aguinaldo Highway. The segment cuts across the commercial strip near the junction of Governor's Drive and through the open raw land adjacent to the existing riverbank located west of Aguinaldo Highway. The segment alignment traverses a rolling terrain at the initial stretch and changes gradually to gently rolling and relatively flat as it approaches the Silang Area.

	Advantage	Disadvantage
NS-5 : Governor's Drive to Silang (via Aguinaldo Highway)	Minimum tequirements for project implementation such as compliance with environmental requirements, etc. since the existing algument vill be utilized.     Still, the alignment has the shortest route length.     Utilization of the existing pavement structure could be optimized requiring in less project capital requirements.	The proposed widening or improvement of the existing road section will affect significantly large number of roadside developments aside from the meessary for rolicate existing utilities installed within Requires provision for project affected persons and properties. Difficulty in right of way acquisition since many lot owners would be involved. Requires efficient traffic management and control dwing construction.
NS-6 : Governor's Drive to Silang (via Aguinaldo Highway)	Provides alternative route to the existing Aguinaldo Highway, which is now experiencing congestion due to heavy routadise developments.     Provides opportunity for unbouched areas and raw land along its route to be developed.     Ferver disturbances to existing developments as well as fewer project affected persons.     Easy to construct as the alignment rests on open area.	<ul> <li>Expensive right of way acquisition along the commercial areas in Palapala. However, previous coordination with the landowner indicates that mutual beneficial arrangement could be secured.</li> <li>The alignment requires gour connection with Aguinatol Highway for alignment continuity.</li> <li>Requires mitigation of adverse impacts to existing adjacent waterway during construction.</li> <li>Requires higher total project requirement due to new construction and acquisition of right of ways.</li> </ul>





CALA	Expressway	1.2 Alternative Alignments
	Advantage	Disadvantage
CE-1~2+CE-3: Aguinaldo Highway to South Luzon Tollway via Sta. Rosa Interchange	<ul> <li>The alternative line has the shortest roote length generated and provides direct connection with Stu. Rosa Interchange. May serve as diversion road or alternative read to Sta. Rosa – Tagaytay Road, which is presently experiencing traffic congestion especially during peak hours.</li> </ul>	The alternative line will affect significantly large magnitude of oxiging developments, properties and persons.     Interfacing with Sta. Rosa hierchange may on the contrary aggravate the present traffic condition at the sam likelih to South Lizons Centernative and the south Centernative line is shorter route length due to high cost of road development consisting of longer way splatourand the high Centernative and Centernative Index and Centernative and Centernative Index

		1.2 Alternative Alignments
CALA	Expressway	
	Advantage	Disadvantage
CE-1~2+CE-4: Aguinaldo Highway to South Luzon Tollway via Mamplasan Interchange.	- Forevir disturbances to existing developments. Will affect less number of structures. - Uilization of the right of vway and roadway structure of the existing link road to Mampiasan Interchange could be optimized resulting in reduced project capital requirement. - Minimum adverse environmental impacts as the segment will use the existing link road alignment. - Offers more efficient road network interfacing since the Mampiasan Interchange has not reached its capecity even during peak hours and at the same time serve as a diversion road to SLR. Roaa – Tagardya Road, which is presently experiencing traffic compasition.	Has longer route length and requires several bends as it uses the link road and approaches the proposed terminal at Mamplasan Interchange.     Will require higher capilar qeuiptment in spile of potential savings to be generated from the utilization of the existing link road right of way and road structure due to its longer route as compared to the other attemative line.     Ayala Land owns some properties on this area and it might be a conflict.
16		

	Advantage	Disadvantage
CE-5~7: Aguinaldo Highway (Silang) to ABB- Greenfield Interchange.	<ul> <li>Magnitude of distubiance to existing developments is very small as compared to the other alternative lines.</li> <li>The cost of development for the alternative line is the lowest among the other expressway line options since it has the hortest route length and less number of roadway structures to be installed.</li> <li>This line offers optimity to develop undouched and open rave land along its route and increases the lowed and open rave land along its route and increases the lowed and open rave land along its route and increases the lowed and open rave land along its route and increases the lowed and open rave land along its route and increases the lowed and open rave land along its route and increases the lowed and the lowed and the lower social and environmental impacts as it traverses generally open land.</li> <li>The line provides more efficient transportation network linkage with the South Luzon Tolkway since the newly construed ABB-Greentelk Interchange has sufficient space for future expansion and improvement.</li> </ul>	Farther location when other nearer sites with large tracts of land still left untouched and undeweloped due to lack of adequate transportation network. For efficient utilization of right of way along the last stretch of the alignment near the SLT, several turning curves should be provided. The location lacks adequate local road network system such that Taffi from the alphoing service road will have to blend with expressively traffic at th Interchange.

				2. Cri	teria fo	or Eva	luatior	of Al	ternati	ve Ali	gnmen	ts
	E	valuatio	n o	f Al	ter	nat	tive	AI	ign	me	nts	
-				effect Techni		0	and Develop		-			-
2			11	affic / Techni	cai	кед	ional Develop	nent		Environment		
Alternative		Alternative Alignment	Easiness of Construction	Adequacy of the Alignment	Low Capital Requirement	Network Efficiency	Growth Corridors / Industrial Areas	Tourism Devmt.	Magnitude of Disturbance	Easiness in ROWA	Low Impact on Agricultural Sector	Total Score
				25%		40%			35%			
JAANG	HARI		5	6	15	15	15	10	10	20	5	
AL-1	DH-4	Imus to Rosario (EPZA)										
Alt-2	DH-5	Imus to Tanza (Gen. Trias Road)										
AL-3	DH-6	Imus to Tanza (Tanza-Naic Road)										
NORTH	OPTH-SOUTH POAD			45%		20%		35%				
	-000 111	ROAD	10	15	20	10	5	5	15	15	5	
Alt-1	NS-5	Governors' Drive to Silang (on Aguinaldo Highway)										
Alt-2	NS-6	Governors' Drive to Silang (new alignment)										
	YDDES	WAY	30%		40%			30%				
			5	10	15	15	15	10	10	15	5	
	CE-1	Governors' Drive to NS-6										1
AH -1	CE-2	North South Road to NS-6										
	CE-3	Aguinaldo Highwayto SLEX via Sta. Rosa Interchange										
	CE-1	Governors' Drive to NS-6										
48.2	CE-2	North South Road to NS-6										1
PRIVE	CE-4	Aguinaldo Highwayto SLEX via Mamplasan Interchange										
	CE-5	Governors' Drive to North-South Road										
Alt3	CE-6	North South Road to Aguinaldo										1
	CE-7	Aguinaldo Highway (Silang) to ABB Greenfield Interchance										
	18											
_												

## **3. Implementation Support**

### 1. LGUs initiatives

- a. Board Resolutions endorsing/accepting the project
- b. Land Use preservation/protection of alignment
- c. Development control along alignment
- d. Cost sharing scheme
- 2. Contribution/participation by private sector

## 4. Workshop Guidelines

Groupings	Scope of Evaluation (Alternative Alignments)	Facilitator
(1) Provincial Stakeholders	Entire Alternative Alignments	Takagi / Lynn Sison
<ol><li>Bacoor Stakeholders</li></ol>	North South	Mamet Tizon
3) Dasmarinas Stakeholders	North South	Freddie Galano
<ol> <li>Gen. Trias Stakeholders</li> </ol>	East West	Rene Santiago
<ol><li>Imus Stakeholders</li></ol>	East West	Alvin Madrid
6) Silang Stakeholders	CALA Expressway	Bing Pallana
7) Tanza Stakeholders	East West	Nanette Abilay

### **Output of Workshop**

21

Output of the exercise is a weighted scoring of each road alternative based on the following parameters:

- <u>Traffic and Technical</u>: Easiness of Construction, Adequacy of Alignment, and Magnitude of Capital Requirement
- <u>Regional Development</u>: Network Efficiency, Support Growth Corridors/Industrial Areas, and Tourism Development
- <u>Environment</u>: Magnitude of Disturbance, Easiness in ROWA, and Low Impact on Agriculture.

$\overline{\}$	(1)	(2)	(3)	
	Traffic/Technical	Regional Development	Environment	Total
ast-West Road	25%	40%	35%	100%
North-South Road	45%	20%	35%	100%
CALA	30%	40%	30%	100%
xpressway				







### **General Mechanics**

- Chairperson per group will be selected.
- Facilitator will prepare the output evaluation sheet for the group
- Reference materials will be distributed for each evaluation criteria
- Output of the groups will be summarized and presented in Session 3.



Feasibility Study and Implementation Support for the Cavite-Laguna (CALA) East-West National Road Project

Preparation of the Optimum Project Plan -Laguna-

- I Background
- II Framework on the Preparation of the Optimum Project Plan
- III Progress on the Environment/Social Consideration Study

Feasibility Study and Implementation Support for the Cavite-Laguna (CALA) East-West National Road Project

### The Holistic Development Scenario



Fea Cavi	isibility Study and Implementation Suppo te-Laguna (CALA) East-West National Ro	ort for the ad Project
Task 1:	Inception Study	Jan. 2005
	Surveys and Preliminary Scenario	Jan. – Mar

Task 2:	Surveys and Preliminary Scenario Development	Jan. – Mar 2005
Task 3:	Evaluation and Selection of Scenarios	May – Aug. 2005
Task 4:	Evaluation and Selection of Priority Projects	Sept. – Dec. 2005
Task 5:	FS of Priority Projects	Jan. – Sept. 2006
		3

No.	Study Phase	Main Subjects	Period
lst	Preparation of Scenarios	<ul> <li>Study Outline</li> <li>Past, Ongoing &amp; Future Transport Projects</li> <li>Scope of Stakeholdens,</li> <li>Schedule &amp; Objectives of Future Stakeholder Meetings</li> </ul>	March 17, 2005
2nd	Evaluation of Scenarios	<ul> <li>Alternative Development Scenarios</li> <li>Environmental Pramework: Social and Natural Environment</li> <li>Alternative Scenarios for Regional Transport Network</li> </ul>	June 16, 2005
3rd		- Outline of alternatives     - Alternative measure in zero option     - None and evaluation methodologies for Environmental and social considerations study     (ELI level)     - Obtain opnion on concerned environmental impacts     (This STM is the Olicial Scoping Session under EES Process)	Sept. 23, 2005
4th	Preparation of Optimum Project Plan	-Results of evaluation on alternatives - Progress and interim results of Environmental and social considerations study (EIA level) - Study framework on preparation of optimum project plan	Early Dec., 2005
5th		Results of Environmental and social considerations study (EIA level)     Overall evaluation on project validity     Mutual consent on optimum project	Mid-March 2006
6th		<ul> <li>Outline of P/S</li> <li>Pollow-up of Environmental and social considerations study (EIA level)</li> <li>Explanation of resettlement policy</li> </ul>	Mid-May, 2006
7th	F/S	Progress of the F/S     Explanation of framework of RAP	Early July, 2006
8th		Outline of results of F/S     Mutual consent on framework of RAP     Further armnement and reouizmement for the implementation	Early Sept., 2006







# On-going Works on the ESC Study

- Environmental Baseline Study
  - Field measurement surveys: air, noise/vibration, water
  - Secondary data collection





# **On-going Works on the ESC Study**

- Environmental Baseline Study
  - Field measurement surveys: air, noise/vibration, water
  - Secondary data collection
- Social Survey
  - Focus group discussion (Barangay consultation)
  - Perception survey
  - Household inventory survey for resettlement (100% survey for potential households to be resettled for ROW acquisition)

### Consensus Building Process for Implementation of the Proposed Projects

### Focus Group Discussion (Barangay Consultation)

- Agenda: Outline of the proposed projects, Proposed alternative road alignments, Coordination on social surveys, Q&A (discussion)
- Participants: Barangay captains and councilors, Project-affected persons, Residents, Peoples organizations (PO), Non-governmental organizations (NGO)
- Acceptance of the project by Barangay =>Endorsement of the Acceptance of the Project by Municipalities and Provinces

11



### **Consensus Building Process** for Implementation of the Proposed Projects

- Focus Group Discussion (Barangay Consultation)
- Issues & Concern
- Is the alignment final? • Will there be compensation for affected assets? When?
- Is there a ready relocation site?
- How will existing business establishment be compensated?
- Will there be alternative income source in the relocation site?
- What documents are needed as proof of ownership?



# **Consensus Building Process** for Implementation of the Proposed Projects

- · Perception Survey
  - Sampled households from project-affected barangays



### **Consensus Building Process** for Implementation of the Proposed Projects

- Household Interview Survey for Resettlement
  - All potential households to be resettled
  - Incl. questions on perception of the project









Feasibility Study and Implementation Support for the Cavite-Laguna (CALA) East-West National Road Project

THANK YOU

19









C/	ALA Expressway
CE 1,2,3	CE1 runs from Governors' Drive to NS6. CE2 is the segment that continues on from NS6 to Aguinaldo Highway (at Silang). CE3 aligrment vers away toward the northwest direction as it enters the Sta. Rosa industrial complex and uses the existing link road to Mamplasan Interchange of the South Luzon Tollway in Binan, Laguna. The alternative line traverses rolling terrain between Silang and Sta. Rosa industrial Complex and relatively flat area within the industrial park area for a total length of 15.65 km.
CE1,2 and 4	This uses the same alignment of CE1 and CE2 but continues on an easterly direction toward subdivision areas at the back of the S1a. Ross industrial complex and runs paralle to an existing waterway until it reaches and eventually connects with the existing S1a. Ross Interchange of the South Luzon Tollway. Likewise, the alternative line passes through the same terrain and spans approximately 14.53 km. As it enters the S1a. Ross Industria Complex, the line cuts through some developed residential and industrial subdivision areas and crosses over the existing maior waterwave twice.
CE5 - CE7	This line runs parallel to the alternative CE 1 – CE4 at a distance of about 2.5 km and begins its alignment 4.5 km west of Governors Drive – Aguinaldo Highway Junction and ends at the existing ABE – Greenfield Interchange of the South Lucon Tollway. The alternative alignment has three (3) segments with aggregate length of 22.82 km. The expressway alignment traverses a rolling lerrain from Governor's Drive and gently rolling to relatively flat along residential and industrial subdivisions along Sta. Rosa and Cabuyao.

		1.2 Alternative Alignments
CAL/	A Expressway	
	Advantage	Disadvantage
CE-1-2+ CE-3: South Luzon Tollway via Mamplasan Interchange.	Fewer disturbances to existing developments. Will affect less number of structures.     Utilization of the right of way and roadway structure of the existing link road to Mamplasan Interchange could be optimized resulting in reduced project capital requirement.     Minimum adverse environmental impacts as the segment will use the existing link road alignment.     Offers more efficient road network interchange has not reached its capacity even during peak hours and at the same time serves as a diversion route to Sta. Rosa – Tagaytay Road, which is presently experiencing traffic congestion.	<ul> <li>Has longer route length and requires several bends as it uses the link road and approaches the proposed terminal at Mamplasan Interchange.</li> <li>Will require higher capital requirement in spite of potential savings to be generated from the utilization of the existing link road right of way and road structure due to its longer route as compared to the other alternative line.</li> <li>Ayala Land owns some properties on this area and it might be a conflict.</li> </ul>

T

Advantage         Disadvantage           Advantage         Disadvantage           - The alternative line is the shortest route and provides direct context or agarvate the present traffic conflor at the sad facility union Expension trade of existing developments, properties and persons.         - The alternative line is the shortest route and provides direct connection with Sta. Rosa Interchange May serve as interchange. May serve as interchange. May serve as interasive line though and bin cost or alternative line is the satisfication of the satisficatin the satis and the satisfication of the satisfication of the s			1.2 Alternative Alignments
Advantage         Disadvantage           CE-1-2+ CE-4:         • The alternative line is the shortest route and provides direct connection with Sta. Ross Interchange. May serve as diversion road or alternative road to Sta. Rosa Interchange         • The alternative line with the south Lucon Expressive would be developed to accompate additional traffic multi be greating by the connection.           South Luzon Tollway via Sta. Rosa Interchange         • The alternative line of Sta. • The alternative line is the shortest route and provides direct         • The alternative line though will avoid hitting completely diversion road or alternative road to Sta. Rosa Interchange         • The alternative line though will be greating it is inevitable that the utilities alterady installed would be affected.           Note the subscription of the provide science of the state and the state constitute occupied, yet disturbance to the existing completely developed land will be great time it is nervitable that the utilities alterady installed would be affected.           • The alternative line the state constituted of organization and which is presently experiencing traffic congensation.         • The alternative line that due to high cost of road developed land wingenet consisting of ongene wateway structures and the high cost of right of way acquilition and consensation.           • The alternative mode the hours.         • The alternative application to the existing major wateway.	CALA	Expressway	
<ul> <li>CE-1-2+</li> <li>CE-4:</li> <li>The alternative line is the shortest route and provides direct.</li> <li>The alternative line is the shortest route and provides direct.</li> <li>CE-4:</li> <li>CE-4:</li> <li>South Luzon Tolkara, a Tagaytay Road, which is presently experiencing traffic consisting of ongestion areas are of hilly occupied, yet distribute on the sind the is whether the the subtlinearity is the second to sta.</li> <li>Rosa Interchange and Tagaytay Road, which is presently experiencing traffic conseption and or alternative road to sta.</li> <li>Note a Tagaytay Road, which is presently experiencing traffic conseption are are not fully during peak hours.</li> <li>The alternative line to shorter oute length due to high cont of right or way acquilition and consisting of ongestion are safe whether to pain are are many structures and the whether the section of the south consisting of ongestion are consisting of ongestion are consisting of ongestion are and the site of the alternative line's thorter route length due to high cost of right of way acquilition and consisting of ongestion are conserved to the existing advergement on the specific and the line to the direct of right of way acquilition and conserve and the line to the direct of the advergement on the part of the advergement on the part of the direct of the to the specific and the high cost of right of way acquilition and conserve and the line to the direct of the specific and the line to the direct of the to the specific and the line to the direct of the to the specific and the line to the direct of the to the specific and the line to the specific and the line to the direct of the specific and the line to the specific and the line to the specific and the line to the direct of the to the specific and the line to the specific and the line to the specific and the li</li></ul>		Advantage	Disadvantage
be a conflict.	CE-1~2+ CE-4: South Luzon Tollway via Sta. Rosa Interchange	• The alternative line is the shortest route and provides direct connection with Sta. Rosa Interchange. May serve as diversion road or alternative road to Sta. Rosa – Tagaytay Road, which is presently experiencing traffic congestion especially during peak hours.	The alternative line will affect significantly large magnitude of existing developments, propretises and persons.     Instraicing with Sta. Rora InterChange may on the contrary agravus the present traffic contilion at the said facility users is independent interfacing acheme with the South Lucros Expressives would be developed to accommodate additional traffic that will be generated by the connection.     The alternative line though will avoid hitting some readential structures as the subdivision artess are not fully occupied, yet disturbance to the existing completely developed lands will be gent and the line with the the utilities already installed would be affected.     Will require higher capital requirement in spite of the alternative line's shorter route length due to high cost of road developement consisting of longer waterway structures and the high cost of right of way acquisition and compensation.     The alignment will create adverse environmental impacts as it cross over and runs parallel and adjacent to the existing major waterway.     Ayaia Land owns some properties on this area and it might be a conflict.

		1.2 Alternative Alignments
CALA	Expressway	
	Advantage	Disadvantage
	<ul> <li>Magnitude of disturbance to existing developments is very small as compared to the other alternative lines.</li> </ul>	
CE-5~7: ABB- Greenfield Interchange.	The cost of development for the alternative line is the lowest among the other expressway line options since it has the shortest route length and less number of roadway structures to be installed.     This line offers opportunity to develop untouched and open raw land along its route and increase the land development potentials with the new alignment opening.     The line will not create adverse social and environmental impacts as it traverses generally open land.     The line will wy since the newy constructed ABB-Greenfield Interchange has sufficient tapace for future expansion and improvement.	<ul> <li>Farther location when other nearer sites with large tracts of land still left untouched and undeveloped due to lack of adequate transportation network.</li> <li>For efficient ultization of right of way along the last stretch of the alignment near the SLT, several turning curves should be provided.</li> <li>The location lacks adequate local road network system such that traffic from the adjoining service road with ave to blend with expressway traffic at the Interchange.</li> </ul>

2. Criter	ria for Evaluation of Alternative Alignments
Evaluation of Alt	emative Angiments
Traffic and Technical :	Easiness of Construction, Adequacy of Alignment, and Magnitude of Capital Requirement.
Regional Development	Network Efficiency, Support Growth Corridors/ Industrial Areas, and Tourism Development
Environment	Magnitude of Disturbance, Easiness in ROWA, and Impact on Agriculture.
0	

# **3. Implementation Support**

### 1. LGUs initiatives

- a. Board Resolutions endorsing/accepting the project
- b. Land Use preservation/protection of alignment
- c. Development control along alignment
- d. Cost sharing scheme
- 2. Contribution/participation by private sector

4. Workshop Guidelines				
Scope of Evaluation	Facilitator			
Il alternatives	Takagi / Mamet Tizon			
Il alternatives	Rene Santiago / Alvin Madrid			
Il alternatives	Freddie Galano / Bing Pallana			
	Scope of Evaluation Il alternatives Il alternatives Il alternatives			

	(1)	(2)	(3)	
	Traffic/	Regional	Environment	Total
	Technical	Development	Environment	
CALA	30%	40%	30%	100%
Expressway				





	(3) Environment				
$\backslash$	(3-1)	(3-2)	(3-3)		
	Magnitude of disturbance	Easiness of ROWA	Impact on agricultural sector	Tota	
CALA Expressway	10%	15%	5%	30%	

Gonora	IW	orks	hon	Mec	hanics
Schera		JINJ	ΠOP	mee	names

- Chairperson per group will be selected.
- Facilitator will prepare the output evaluation sheet for the group
- Reference materials will be distributed for each evaluation criteria

16

• Output of the groups will be summarized and presented in Session 3.



DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS AND HIGHWAYS (DPWH) JAPAN INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION AGENCY (JICA)
THE FEASIBILITY STUDY AND
IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT ON THE
CALA EAST-WEST NATIONAL ROAD
PROJECT (CALA East-West)
4th Stakeholder Meeting
Session 3: Results of the Evaluation of Road
Alternative Alignments
9 December 2005

<b>Results of the Evaluation by Group</b>					
2					

# **Next Steps**

Г

- Consultation with Affected Barangays
- Consultation with Large Property Owners
- Environmental and Social Study
- 5<sup>th</sup> Stakeholders' Meeting for Environmental and Social Study Results (March 2006)

















