

Annex 10 Evaluation Grid : Integrated Sediment-related Disaster Management Project for Volcanic Areas in the Republic of Indonesia

Evaluation criterion	Evaluation Question		Required information/ data	Information source	Findings
	Main Question	Sub Question			
Relevance	Conformity of the project goal to the National Development Plan of Indonesia	Importance of the disaster management for volcanic areas within National Development Plan etc.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Political status or importance 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Medium-term Development Plan 2004-2009, Strategic Plan of Public Work Department 2005-2009 	<p>According to the Indonesia's Medium-term Development Plan 2004-2009, there are 3 main agendas, such as 1) establishing democracy and justice for all, 2) crafting an Indonesia that is safe and peaceful, and 3) improving prosperity economically and socially.</p> <p>According to the Strategic Plan of Public Work Department 2005-2009 of the Ministry of Public Works, there are 3 items mentioned as policy and one of the items is "Infrastructure development with basis in space arrangement in border area, isolated area, conflict area, and disaster area and disaster potential area to form Indonesia peace and safe."</p> <p>Infrastructure development in disaster areas is one of priority issues of Indonesian Government. Therefore, disaster management for volcanic areas is an important issue within the National Development Plan.</p>
	Conformity to the Official Development Assistance (ODA) policy of Japan.	Conformity of priority assistance subjects of Japanese Government.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Priority assistance subjects of Japanese Government to Indonesia 	Assistance policy of Japan (Ministry of Foreign Affairs)	One of the priority areas of Japan's ODA for Indonesia (version of November 2004) is support on establishing society with justice and democracy. Environmental conservation and disaster prevention is an important issue within establishment with justice and democracy.
	Conformity with needs of target group and appropriateness of selection of model areas.	Conformity of priority assistance subjects of JICA.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Priority issues for assistance 	Country-wise cooperation implementation plan of JICA	Country-wise cooperation implementation plan of JICA is under revision.
	Conformity with needs of targeted area, i.e. needs of disaster prevention for selected model areas	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Needs of disaster prevention for volcanic areas and priority Opinions of persons concerned 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Related information C/Ps and Japanese experts 	<p>The model areas were selected through discussions between the Indonesian and Japanese sides. Criteria for selecting areas were following 5 items.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Area that includes hazardous sites on sediment-related disaster, and requires urgent introduction of some countermeasures. Area that has accessibility from Yogyakarta for convenience of implementing model projects. Area that is suffered from poverty and is expected to make model plans for improving daily conveniences and for increasing local income through multi-purpose measures mainly for disaster mitigation. Area where local governments, residents and NGO concerned is expected to accept the model project and the involvement. At least one area should be outside of Java from a viewpoint of dissemination into whole country. <p>Base on the above-mentioned criteria, 4 model areas were selected.</p>	

<p>It is pointed out in the mid-term evaluation report regarding activity in the Mt. Agung model area in Bali province as follows.</p> <p>"However, there was misunderstanding between the Project team and a small group of local people. Therefore, this project has been discontinued except for only the follow-up monitoring of its limited achievements. The structural measures of this model project could not meet one of the important needs of the residents, that is the water supply.</p> <p>Also in the case of Merapi model area, model site was reviewed in order to implement the project activities focusing needs of local residents.</p> <p>Generally, priority needs of local residents may be infrastructure development like water supply, bridge and road, or improvement of standard of living through income increase. Therefore, appropriate measures for diffusing disaster mitigation activities into local residents should be designed complying above-mentioned needs of them.</p> <p>We can't say that it was not conformity with needs of target areas. But there were other urgent needs for local residents. It is necessary to consider these cases for selecting model areas when similar project will be implemented in future. It will be necessary to investigate social, economical situations and degree of people's awareness on disaster mitigation.</p> <p>STC is a training and technology development center that has roles of technology development of and human resources development related to Sabo technology, and dissemination of technologies in Indonesia. STC was formerly under the Directorate of Technical Guidance of the Directorate General of Water Resources, and now STC is under the Directorate of River, Lake and Reservoir of the Directorate General of Water Resources.</p> <p>It is necessary to add roles for STC in order to be able to have functions such as support activities to local governments in regard to Sabo technology (prevention of sediment-related disaster) and implement countermeasures after occurrence of disaster.</p> <p>At present, discussion about status of STC for becoming more permanent organization is underway in the Ministry of Public Works.</p>			<p>Conformity with roles and responsibilities of STC (Sabo Technical Center)</p>	<p>Was project approach adequately selected?</p>
<p>Role and responsibility of STC</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Executive staff of General Directorate of Water Resources of the Ministry of Public Works and STC 	<p>Role and responsibility of STC</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Executive staff of General Directorate of Water Resources of the Ministry of Public Works and STC 	<p>Role and responsibility of STC</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Opinions of persons concerned 		
<p>There are 2 main approaches for the implementation of the Project, those are 1) implementation of the model projects to establish integrated sediment-related disaster management (ISDM) technology taking into consideration of socio-economic conditions of the target areas, and 2) develop qualified Sabo engineers who can implement and diffuse the model of ISDM.</p> <p>But there are several sub-approaches (activities) with many items in the Plan of Operations, and several activities were implemented in parallel. It seems that there was not enough consideration about relations among planned activities and appropriate orders or sequences of implementation of the planned activities.</p> <p>In addition, it seems that more approaches or more focus should be included in the plan of the Project in order to correspond to the changed social and economic situations and systems under the recent democratization and decentralization movement in Indonesia.</p>	<p>Executive staff of General Directorate of Water Resources of the Ministry of Public Works and STC, C/Ps and Japanese experts</p>	<p>Opinions of persons concerned</p>		

<p>Overall Evaluation of the Relevance</p>	<p>(1) Consistency with the National Development Plan of Indonesia According to the Indonesia's Medium-term Development Plan 2004-2009, there are 3 main agendas, such as 1) establishing democracy and justice for all, 2) crating an Indonesia that is safe and peaceful, and 3) improving prosperity economically and socially. Corresponding to the Development Plan, the Ministry of Public Works prepared a Strategic Plan of Public Work Department 2005-2009 and one of the 3 main issues is "infrastructure development with basis in space arrangement in border area, isolated area, conflict area, and disaster area and disaster potential area to form Indonesia peace and safe". The Project, that aims the human resources development who can plan and implement disaster mitigation measures to reduce the impacts of sediment-related disasters on villages in volcanic areas, is consistent with the Development Plan of Indonesia.</p> <p>(2) Consistency with the ODA policy of Japan One of the priority areas of Japan's ODA for Indonesia (version of November 2004) is support on establishing society with justice and democracy. Environmental conservation and disaster prevention is an important issue within establishment with justice and democracy.</p> <p>(3) Conformity with needs of targeted area, i.e. needs of disaster prevention for selected model areas 4 model areas were selected through discussions between the Indonesian and Japanese sides before the start of the Project using selection criteria. As mentioned in the mid-term evaluation report, in case of the Agung model area in Bali, there was misunderstanding between the Project team and a small group of local people. Therefore, most of the activities have been discontinued except for only the follow-up monitoring of its limited achievements. The structural measures for this model area could not meet a important need of the residents, that is the water supply. Generally, priority needs of local residents may be infrastructure development like water supply, bridge and road, or improvement of standard of living though income increases. Therefore, appropriate measures for diffusing disaster mitigation activities into local residents should be designed complying above-mentioned needs of them. We can't say that it was not conformity with needs of target areas. But there were other urgent needs for local residents. It is necessary to consider these cases for selecting model areas when similar project will be implemented in future. It will be necessary to investigate social, economical situations and degree of people's awareness on disaster mitigation.</p> <p>(4) Conformity with roles and responsibilities of STC STC is a training and technology development center that has roles of technology development and human resources development related to Sabo technology, and dissemination of technologies in Indonesia. STC was formerly under the Directorate of Technical Guidance of the Directorate General of Water Resources, and now STC is under the Directorate of River, Lake and Reservoir of the Directorate General of Water Resources. It is necessary to add roles for STC in order to be able to have functions such as support activities to local governments in regard to Sabo technology (prevention of sediment-related disaster) and implement countermeasures after occurrence of disaster. At present, discussion about status of STC for becoming more permanent organization is underway in the Ministry of Public Works.</p> <p>(5) The approach and methodology of the Project There are 2 main approaches for implementation of the Project, those are 1) implementation of the model projects to establish the ISDM technology taking into consideration of socio-economic conditions of the target areas, and 2) develop qualified Sabo engineers who can implement and diffuse the model of ISDM. But there are several sub-approaches (activities) with many items in the Plan of Operations, and several activities were implemented in parallel. It seems that there was not enough consideration about relations among planned activities and appropriate orders or sequences of implementation of the planned activities. In addition, it seems that more approaches or more focus should be included in the plan of the Project in order to correspond to the changed social and economic situations and systems under the recent democratization and decentralization movement in Indonesia.</p>
--	--