

ATTACHMENT

TERMINAL EVALUATION REPORT ON INTEGRATED SEDIMENT-RELATED DISASTER MANAGEMENT PROJECT FOR VOLCANIC AREAS

Jakarta

December 8, 2005

JOINT EVALUATION TEAM



Mr. Masafumi NAGAISHI
Leader
Japanese Evaluation Team
Japan International Cooperation Agency
Japan



Mr. Is Prasetya Basuki
Leader
Indonesian Evaluation Team
Ministry of Public Works
The Republic of Indonesia

CONTENTS

1. Introduction and Outline of the Project

1.1 Objectives of the Evaluation

1.2 Members of the Joint Evaluation Team

(1) Japanese Member

(2) Indonesian Member

1.3 Schedule of the Evaluation

1.4 Background of the Project

1.5 Summary of the Project

2. Methodology of Evaluation

2.1 Methodology of Evaluation

2.2 Criteria of Evaluation

3. Performance of the Project

3.1 Inputs of the Project

3.2 Outputs of the Project

3.3 Achievement of the Project Purpose

3.4 Achievability of the Overall Goal

4. Results of the Evaluation

4.1 Relevance

4.2 Effectiveness

4.3 Efficiency

4.4 Impact

4.5 Sustainability

5. Conclusion

6. Recommendations and Lessons Learned

6.1 Recommendations

6.2 Lessons Learned

List of Annexes

Annex 1: Schedule of the Evaluation

Annex 2: PDM3 (Project Design Matrix Version 3, now in use)

Annex 3: Dispatch of Japanese Experts

Annex 4: Training of Counterpart Personnel in Japan

Annex 5: Provision of Equipment

Annex 6: Local Operation Expenses borne by the Japanese Side

Annex 7: Assignment of Counterpart Personnel

Annex 8: Curriculum of the MPBA course

- Annex 9: Organization chart of the Ministry of Public Works
Annex 10: Evaluation Grid
Annex 11: List of the Participants for the WIDE Course
Annex 12: List of the OJT Trainee
Annex 13: List of the Students of the MPBA Course
Annex 14: Contents of the guideline Overall Implementation Plan of ISDM for Mt. Merapi Model Area
Annex 15: Contents of Manual for Making Hazardous Map of Sediment Related Disaster – Debris flow/ Mudflow
Annex 16: Contents o the Manual for the Investigation Methods of the Slope Disaster
Annex 17: Contents of the Survey and Zoning Manual for Streams Susceptible to Debris Flows
Annex 18: Contents of Manual to Investigate Sediment-related Disaster
Annex 19: Plan of Operations for 5 years

1. Introduction and Outline of the Project

1.1 Objectives of the Evaluation

The evaluation study was conducted with the purpose of

- (1) To verify the level of the achievement and performance of the Project based on the Record of Discussions (R/D), the Plan of Operations (P/O), and the Project Design Matrix (PDM),
- (2) To evaluate the Project in terms of the five criteria, and
- (3) To draw useful recommendations to the Project and lessons learned from the Project.

1.2 Members of the Joint Evaluation Team

(1) Japanese members

	Field in Charge	Name	Position/ Organization
1)	Leader	Mr. Masafumi NAGAISHI	Team Director, Disaster Management Team, Group III (Water Resources and Disaster Management), Global Environmental Department, JICA
2)	Disaster Management Policy	Mr. Haruo NISHIMOTO	Director for Volcanic Sabo and Debris Flow Control, Sabo Planning Division, Sabo Department, Ministry of Land, Infrastructure and Transport
3)	Cooperation Planning	Mr Atsushi NAKAYAMA	Disaster Management Team, Group III (Water Resources and Disaster Management), Global Environmental Department, JICA
4)	Project Evaluation	Mr Isao DOJUN	International Project Department, Chuo Kaihatsu Corporation

(2) Indonesian members

	Field in Charge	Name	Position/ Organization
1)	Leader	Mr. Is Prasetya Basuki	Sub-directorate of Performance and Evaluation, Directorate of Planning Programming, Directorate General of Water Resources, the Ministry of Public Works
2)	Member	Mr. Uleys Wailandauw	Section of Western Region, Sub-directorate of Performance and Evaluation, Directorate of Planning Programming, Directorate General of Water Resources, the Ministry of Public Works
3)	Member	Mr. Ceritera Sembiring	Section of Eastern Region, Sub-directorate of Water Resources Conservation, Directorate of River, Lake and Reservoir, Directorate General of Water Resources, the Ministry of Public Works
4)	Member	Mr. Harmadi	Section of Western Region, Sub-directorate of Natural Disaster, Directorate of River, Lake and Reservoir, Directorate General of Water Resources, the Ministry of Public Works

1.3 Schedule of the Evaluation

From November 20 till December 9. Details are shown in Annex 1.

1.4 Background of the Project

In Indonesia, as local development takes place, risks of loss of life and assets by flow of debris and other sediment are increasing in various regions.

In such situation, JICA implemented two project-type technical cooperation projects, namely the Volcanic Sabo Technical Center Project from 1982 to 1990 and the Sabo Technical Center Project from 1992 to 1997. Both projects introduced Sabo technologies of Japan to Indonesia and trained a total of some 220 engineers of designing and implementing Sabo facilities.

As one of the major issues of the country is development of social infrastructure in hilly and mountainous areas, it is urgently needed to foster staff who are not only competent in civil engineering but also capable of preparing integrated regional plans for disaster management based on socio-economic characteristics of the regions, formulating project implementation schemes, and establishing and implementing disaster prevention projects with community participation.

The Government of the Republic of Indonesia, therefore, requested project-type technical cooperation of Japan in order to establish methodologies to plan and implement integrated disaster management measures and to foster experts for such tasks.

After several preparatory studies, the Record of Discussions (R/D) was jointly signed by the leader of Japanese Implementation Study Team and the Director General of Water Resources of the Ministry of Settlement and Regional Infrastructure of Indonesia on March 2001 to commence the Integrated Sediment-related Disaster Management Project for Volcanic Areas (herein after referred to as "the Project"). The Project period is five years from April 1, 2001 to March 31, 2006.

As remaining period of the Project is less than a half year, terminal evaluation is required to assess the progress, achievement and performance of the Project, and recommend actions to be taken in the rest of the Project period and after the termination of the Project.

1.5 Summary of the Project

1.5.1 Objectives of the Project

(1) Super Goal

Damage by volcanic sediment-related disasters to human lives, assets and environment in volcanic areas in Indonesia is reduced.

(2) Overall Goal

Integrated sediment-related disaster mitigation measures are implemented in hazardous areas.

(3) Project Purpose

Engineers involved in disaster mitigation and local residents become able to plan and implement

disaster mitigation measures to reduce the impacts of sediment-related disasters on villages in volcanic areas.

1.5.2 Outputs of the Project

- (1) Planning and implementation methodologies of sediment-related disaster mitigation measures are established through the cooperation between engineers on disaster mitigation and local residents. (Establish integrated sediment-related disaster management model)
- (2) Methodology to establish local organizations and systems for promoting disaster mitigation measures are established. (Establish local organizations and systems for disaster mitigation)
- (3) Engineers to implement appropriate countermeasures on disaster mitigation measures are trained. (Train engineers in disaster mitigation)
- (4) Training programs for engineers involved in sediment-related disaster mitigation are established. (Establish training programs for engineers)
- (5) Disaster investigation, planning and implementation methods for disaster rehabilitation measures of devastated areas are established. (Establish methods of disaster rehabilitation measures of devastated areas)
- (6) Popular rainfall gauges etc. are developed and distribution plan is made. (Develop popular rainfall gauges etc.)
- (7) Database system for Sabo information is established. (Establish database system for Sabo information)

(Details: PDM version 3 in Annex 2)