

Annex 11. Evaluation Grid

Criteria	Evaluation Items	Confirmation Items	Results
Relevance	Consistency between Project goals and Indonesia's national development policy	<p>1. Consistency with the national development policy</p> <p>2. Does this Project meet the policies of MSRI & STC?</p>	<p>The Five Year National Development Program called "PROPENAS 2001 - 2005" stipulates five urgent challenges. One of them is the acceleration of sustainable economic recovery. Under this title, the program states that management of disaster prone areas is a major issue for the national development. It also states the importance of controlling environmental and natural disaster impact.</p> <p>According to a series of five year national development programs, the Directorate General of Water Resources has been addressing volcanic disasters and other sediment related disasters, and also planning and implementing recovery programs of disaster hit areas.</p>
	Consistency with Japan's ODA policy	<p>1. Consistency with the ODA policy for Indonesia</p> <p>2. Japan's technological advantages</p>	<p>The Project coincides with two priority issues of the Japan's ODA to Indonesia, namely the human resource development in relation to the devolution and the natural disaster mitigation.</p> <p>The Project can fully utilize the accumulated achievements of the Japanese cooperation in the field of Sabo.</p>
	Relevance in terms of equity	Selection procedures of model areas, etc.	<p>The Project has selected four poverty-affected model areas so that both the processes and the results of the pilot projects can be applied to the rest of the country. The Project therefore intends to promote the local participation such as local communities, governments, and NGOs. It also intends to work out low cost technologies as well as non-structural measures. Such approach is regarded to be highly relevant to the local needs.</p>
	Consistency between Project purpose and Indonesia's needs		<p>The rapid institutional changes for the devolution require human resource development at local levels who address increasing issues of decentralization. In particular, fostering skilled engineers in disaster management is an urgent requirement of many local areas.</p> <p>It is therefore important to disseminate the disaster management measures to local regions by training local engineers by fully utilizing the accumulated experiences of the STC. However, participatory and bottom-up approaches were started only in recent years. Therefore, in spite of the relevance, a lot of efforts are required for such approach to be accepted by local societies.</p>

Criteria	Evaluation Items	Confirmation Items	Results
Effectiveness	Achievement of outputs		Local governments frequently damaged by natural disasters are actively seeking for disaster management through disaster education, evacuation drills, etc. at their own budgets. An increasing number of local governments are consulting with the STC and inviting lectures from the center. Moreover a number of local governments send their staff to the courses initiated by the STC, including some Kabupaten governments who have sent their staff at their own expenses.
	Achievement of Project purpose		The training courses are fostering engineers in disaster management, while the disaster information system is steadily developed.
	Specific factors constraining Project outputs to achieve Project purpose		The project at Mt. Agung Model Area, the first implementation area among the four model areas so far achieved limited success due to lack of communication between relevant government organizations and the local communities.
	Specific factors promoting Project outputs to achieve Project purpose		Some disaster hit local governments request the STC to survey and study the disasters and recovery measures, while some NGOs have inquired the center to support for their activities against disasters.
	Cooperation with local government staff	To what extent do local government staff cooperate with Project?	The Project is gaining close working relationship with local governments as an important step toward its purpose.

Criteria	Evaluation Items	Confirmation Items	Results
Efficiency	<p>Quantity, quality and timing of the inputs (Indonesian and Japanese)</p> <p>Utilization of the inputs</p>	<p>Was the timing to dispatch the long & short-term experts appropriate?</p> <p>Were the selection of counterpart training, the timing of training and the contents of training appropriate? How do they utilize the knowledge and technology learned in the training?</p> <p>Were the selection of the equipment and materials and the timing to supply them appropriate? How are they utilized?</p> <p>Was the operation budget used efficiently?</p>	<p>The long-term and short-term experts have been dispatched according to the schedule.</p> <p>The training in Japan was received by a total of 12 counterparts. They are now lecturing in the OJT course and the WIDE course by utilizing the knowledge and observation in Japan. The training in Japan is therefore efficient with its multiplier effect.</p> <p>The provided equipment has been properly maintained and utilized, while some observation equipment is standing by to be installed in the model areas. The computer system with the accessories has been installed in the specially arranged computer room, which is equipped with double floors allowing easy wiring, air-conditioned and fully secured against possible loss.</p> <p>The total budget of the STC from the MSRI has been increasing as the budget for training courses and disaster surveys was added in the second year and that for the sediment related disaster prevention campaign was added in the third year. However, the budget limitation is still a restriction on the Project activities.</p>
Factors promoting or constraining Project activities to produce Project outputs	Linkage, cooperation or competition with other projects	For example, the Project support system	<p>The Directorate General of Water Resources is supporting the Project activities by promoting the establishment of the Sabo units, campaigning for sediment related disaster prevention, and so forth. The Project is also supported by some NGOs through their participation in the project activities in the model areas.</p> <p>On the other hand, in the disaster site surveys, coordination among different offices in the Directorate General is yet to be strengthened. For example, temporary institutional arrangement such as organizing a special taskforce may secure the coordination.</p> <p>Some tasks closely related to the Project are being implemented by NGOs' initiatives. So far four projects have received the Japan's Grant Assistance for Grassroots Projects.</p>

Criteria	Evaluation Items	Confirmation Items	Results
Impact	Prospects of achievement of Project goals in future		<p>It is premature to identify the overall Project impact. However, through the sediment related disaster prevention campaigns and the awareness raising activities to communities in some areas including the model areas, the need for protection of communities from natural disasters is being widely recognized. The new understanding that natural disasters can be mitigated by proper measures is steadily replacing the traditional belief that natural disasters are totally out of people's control.</p> <p>Although such a trend may be of limited magnitude, it is the impact partly made by the Project. Vice versa, the popularization of the understanding will support the Project activities and other disaster management programs through increased social acceptability.</p>
	Impact in the model areas	Institutional, socio-economic, cultural, environmental, etc	<p>One example of the specific impact of the Project is a case of West Sumatera Province. The provincial government constructed an open-type Sabo dam with silt to allow ordinary debris flow at its own budget, according to the activities and advice of the Project team. The government of West Sumatera is also positive to establish its Sabo unit.</p>
	Impact outside the model areas	Institutional, socio-economic, cultural, environmental, etc	<p>An increasing number of disaster-hit or disaster-prone local governments are requesting the STC to conduct disaster site surveys and disaster management lectures.</p> <p>As part of the sediment related disaster management campaign at Kebumen in Central Java Province in November 2002, a campaign slogan contest was held and over 3,000 people sent their works from all over the nation. Then some local governments showed their interest to host the next year's campaign events.</p>