

付 属 資 料

1. ミニッツ
2. 評価調査結果要約表（中間評価）
3. オリジナルPDM
4. PDM改訂版
5. 当初PDMとPDM改訂版との比較表
6. プロジェクトの実績
7. 評価結果

**MINUTES OF MEETINGS
BETWEEN
THE JAPANESE MID-TERM EVALUATION TEAM
AND
THE INDONESIAN NATIONAL POLICE
THE GOVERNMENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF INDONESIA
ON
THE PROJECT ON ENHANCEMENT OF CIVILIAN POLICE ACTIVITIES**

The Japanese Mid-term Evaluation Team (hereinafter referred to as "the Team") organized by the Japan International Cooperation Agency (hereinafter referred to as "JICA"), headed by Mr. Michio KANDA visited Indonesia from 13th June to 21st June 2005, for the purpose of the mid-term evaluation of the Project on Enhancement of Civilian Police Activities (hereinafter referred to as "the Project").

During its stay in Indonesia, the Team evaluated the progress of the Project and had a series of discussions with Indonesian National Police (hereinafter referred to as "INP") and the authorities concerned with the Project.

As a result of the study and discussions, both sides agreed to report to their respective Governments the matters referred to in the document attached hereto.

Jakarta, 21st June 2005



Mr. Michio KANDA
Leader
Japanese Mid-term Evaluation Team
Japan International Cooperation Agency



Drs. ALANTIN S.M. SIMANJUNTAK
Police Brigadier General
Head of Policy and Strategic Bureau,
Deputy of Planning and Development,
Indonesian National Police

ATTACHMENT

I INTRODUCTION

The Indonesian side and the Team had a series of discussions for the evaluation of the Project. The Team interviewed and exchanged views with the Indonesian counterpart personnel, parties concerned with the Project and the Japanese experts to review the progress of the Project since its commencement on August 1, 2002. The members of the Team and their schedule are shown ANNEX I. Major Interviewees by the Team are shown in ANNEX II. Based on the result of review, evaluation of the Project at present was carried out in terms of five evaluation criteria, i.e. "relevance", "effectiveness", "efficiency", "impacts" and "sustainability".

II REVIEW OF THE PROGRESS

1. Inputs to the Project

Inputs made by both Japanese and Indonesian sides during the past about three (3) years since the inception in August 2002 are summarized as follows. Further information on the inputs is shown in ANNEX III-(1).

(1) Japanese side

a) Dispatch of experts

In accordance with the R/D signed on 15th July 2002, the Japanese side dispatched eight (8) long-term experts and fourteen (14) short-term experts to the Project.

b) Training of counterpart personnel in Japan

The Japanese side received eighteen (18) counterpart personnel for training and observation in Japan.

Also, country focused training courses have been implemented every year in association with the Project.

c) Equipment

The Japanese side provided communication equipment, criminal identification equipment etc., for the implementation of the Project activities.

d) Model Facilities

The Japanese side provided model facilities for criminal identification laboratory and three (3) model facilities for BKPM (KOBAN-set) consist of building, vehicles and communication equipment.

e) In-country Training Program

The Japanese side provided necessary support for planning, implementation and necessary expenses for a in-country training program on radio communication techniques.

(2) Indonesian Side

a) Assignment of counterpart personnel

18 counterpart personnel are assigned for conducting project activities as of June 2005.

b) Provision of office space

The Indonesian side provided project office at the Metro Bekasi Police Resort.

c) Provision of site for model facilities

The Indonesian side provided three (3) sites for model facilities at Bekasi Area

2. Project Activities

The Team recognized that the project activities are going on steadily at Bekasi Police Resort, although some of the activities of police education and training institutions are not well performed. Achievement of the Project activities is described in the Annex III -(2)

III. Mid-term Evaluation of the Project

The summary of 5-criteria evaluation is shown below. The details are shown in ANNEX IV.

1. Relevance

The Project has good relevance with following points:

- Stability of Indonesia enhances foreign investment
- INP can take a leading role in securing public safety
- Good governance is one of priority areas of the Japanese cooperation.
- Planning was made through the participatory method.

2. Effectiveness

The project outputs contributed to the project purpose effectively. However the effectiveness are different between activities in Bekasi, and in educational institutions. In Bekasi Police Resort, criminal identification laboratory and model facilities (BKPM) has been established while in educational facilities activities still remained at basic stages.

Project purpose should be reviewed and revised so that activities are concentrated for effective priority area for remaining project period.

3. Efficiency

At the initial stage, the Project could not attain the expected outputs, because of lack of know-how and experience of similar cooperation

However, the project has gradually improved the efficiency in terms of planning and inputs. Good coordination with Japanese Grant Aid is expected to increase the efficiency.

4. Impact

Activities in Bekasi Police Resort gave positive impacts to some other police activities, such as adoption of concept of BKPM to Pos Polisi and the implementation of criminal investigation seminar by counterpart personnel in Jakarta Metropolitan Police.

So far, negative impacts are not anticipated.

5. Sustainability

Indonesian side strongly support the enhancement of civilian police activities. Financial and human resources management of Indonesian side is an important factor in terms of the sustainability.

IV. Matters discussed

1. Revision of the PDM

The Japanese side and the Indonesian side agreed to revise the PDM formulated in July 2002. The revision was made considering the latest progress of the project activities and prospect of the achievement of the project outputs. The project shall be implemented along the revised PDM in the remaining period of the Project.

The original PDM is shown in ANNEX V and the revised PDM is shown in ANNEX VI.

The revised points of PDM are described as follows.

(1) Project Purpose

Original text: "Police officers have acquired knowledge, skills, and experience through training courses developed in the process of upgrading the organization and function of the Bekasi Police Resort, a model police station, to the level appropriate for civilian police".

Revised text: "Civilian police activities are implemented at Bekasi Police Resorts (BPRs) as a model police station. (*2)"

(*2) Bekasi Police Resort is now reorganized into two police resorts, namely POLRES METRO BEKASI and POLRES BEKASI. In this PDM two police resorts in Bekasi area, including Polseks and BKPMs under the two Police Resorts, are described as "BPRs".

(2) Outputs

Original text: 1. Management skill of Bekasi Police Resort, a model police station, is improved to ensure the effective implementation of the project.

2. Practice on criminal identification in Bekasi Police Resort is improved.

3. Communication control and command system of Bekasi Police Resort is improved.

4. Training programs of the police education & training institutions on "communication control and command", "criminal identification", and "police station management" are improved.

5. Instructors/field trainers for "communication control and command", "criminal identification", and "police station management" are trained.

Revised text: 1. Management of BPRs as model police stations is improved to ensure the civilian police activities.

2. Practice on criminal identification in BPRs is improved.

3. Communication control and command system of BPRs is improved.

4. Training programs of "police station management", "criminal identification" and "communication control and command" are improved.

V Revision of Master Plan

Both side agreed that the Master Plan of the project should be amended to correspond to the revision of PDM of the Project. Amended Master Plan is shown in ANNEX VII.



List of ANNEX

- ANNEX I . Team member and schedule of the Team
- ANNEX II . Major Interviewees by the Team
- ANNEX III . Performance Grid
- ANNEX IV . 5-criteria Evaluation Grid
- ANNEX V . Project Design Matrix (PDM₁)
- ANNEX VI . Revised Project Design Matrix (PDM₂)
- ANNEX VII . Amended Master Plan of the Project

ANNEX I . TEAM MEMBER AND SCHEDULE OF THE TEAM

1. Evaluation Team

(1) Mr. Michio Kanda (Team Leader)

Councilor to the President, Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)

(2) Mr. Hiroshi Ikeda (Police Policy)

Deputy Chief of International Department, National Police Agency

(3) Mr. Takayuki Yahata (Technical Cooperation Policy)

Economic Cooperation Bureau, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

(4) Dr. Takeshi Kohno (Indonesian Security Policy)

Assistant Professor, National Graduate Institute for Policy Studies

(5) Mr. Toshiya Wakabayashi (Evaluation Planning)

Social Development Department, Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)

(6) Mr. Michiyuki Kemmotsu (Evaluation Analysis)

Chou Kaihatsu Corporation

2. Schedule of the Team

Schedule		
June 12	Sun	Arrival Jakarta
June 13	Mon	Meeting with Japanese authorities concerned to the project Courtesy Call to Embassy of Japan
June 14	Tue	Presentation on Polres Metro Bekasi and Facility Observation Site Visit to BKPM (KOBAN) 2 sites (Facility Observation & Interview to resident council)
June 15	Wed	Interview to Japanese Experts at Polres Metro Bekasi Interview to C/P at Polres Metro Bekasi
June 16	Thu	Interview to Polres Bekasi Interview to Education & Training Institution of INP
June 17	Fri	Meeting with Working Group, INP
June 18	Sat	Internal Meeting, Analysis & Discussion
June 19	Sun	Internal Meeting, Analysis & Discussion
June 20	Mon	Discussion with Working Group, INP
June 21	Tue	Signing of M/M Leave Jakarta

ANNEX II Major Interviewees by the Team**(1) Indonesia National Police HDQ**

Mr. Gregorius Mere, Director for Narcotics, CID

Mr. Ramli Darwis, Chief of Criminal Identification

(2) Planning Section of Polda Metro Jaya

Mr. Tonny Aribawanto, Chief of Planning Division

(3) Education and Training Institution

Mr. H. Yuzwar Arsyad, Deputy for Education and Training

(4) Poles Metro Bekasi

Mr. Purwadi Arinto, Deputy Chief of Poles Metro Bekasi

Mr. Sunarto, Chief of Division of Criminal Identification

Mr. Purbaya Arja Seta, Chief of Division of Telecommunication and Electronics

(5) Poles Bekasi

Mr. Joko Hartanto, Chief of Poles Bekasi

Mr. Yayat Popon, Chief of Division of Criminal Investigation

Mr. Sudarto Sukiman, Chief of Division of Telecommunication and Electronics

(6) Resident Council

Mr. H. Muhammad Djafar, Chief of Resident Council in Pondok Ung BKPM

Mr. Abdul Chalim, Chief of Resident Council in Mall BKPM

(7) Embassy of Japan

Mr. Yutaka Iimura, Ambassador of Embassy of Japan

Mr. Masato Watanabe, Minister of Embassy of Japan

Mr. Teruhisa Goto, First Secretary of Embassy of Japan

(8) JICA Indonesia

Mr. Keiichi Kato, Resident Representative of JICA Indonesia

Mr. Nobuhiko Hanazato, Deputy Representative of JICA Indonesia

Mr. Daisuke Ueda, Assistant Representative of JICA Indonesia

(9) JICA Expert

Mr. Hiroto Yamazaki, Chief Advisor of Program for supporting Reform of INP

Mr. Yoji Mano, Project Leader (Police Station Management) of the Project

Mr. Kazuyuki Fujituka, Expert on Criminal Identification

Mr. Tasahiro Yokoyama, Expert on Criminal Identification

Mr. Akira Takeba, Expert on Communication Control and Command

Mr. Tsuneo Sengoku, Expert on Education and Training

Mr. Toshiya Anzai, Coordinator of the Project

Annex III. Performance Grid

(1) Performance of Inputs (as of March 31, 2005)

Description of Inputs	Planned inputs (according to R/D and PDM)	Actual inputs	Remarks
Indonesian inputs			
1. Assignment of personnel		18 counterpart personnel are assigned for conducting project activities as of June 2003	
1a. Assignment of counterpart personnel	Police Station Management	Joko 02.08-02.09 1M/M Bachtiar 02.09-04.05 20M/M Edward 04.05-	
	Criminal Identification	Kiswan 02.08-03.03 7M/M Sunarto 03.03- Wiliam 04.10-	
	Communication Control and Command	Suntana 02.08-03.03 7M/M Rachmat 03.03- Sucipto 04.10- Iwayan 03.03-04.06 15M/M Purbaya 04.06- Budi 04.10-05.04 6M/M Sahirman 05.05- Surdarto 05.05-	
	Others		
1b. Assignment of administrative and supporting personnel	Administration Staff	Yes	
	Secretaries	Yes	
	Other necessary supporting staff	N.A	

Annex III. Performance Grid

(1) Performance of Inputs (as of March 31, 2005)

Description of Inputs	Planned inputs (according to R/D and PDM)	Actual inputs	Remarks
2. Land, buildings and facilities			
2a. Land	Project Offices and related facilities	a) The Indonesian side provided project office at the Bekasi Police Resort.	
	Education & Training Institutions	b) The Indonesian side provided three (3) sites for model facilities at Bekasi District.	
2b. Buildings and Facilities	Project Offices	Yes	
	Offices for Japanese experts	Yes	
	Indonesian counterparts' offices	Yes	
	Administrative offices	Yes	
	Education & Training Institutions	Yes	
	Other necessary facilities and rooms mutually agreed upon	N.A	
3. Operating expenses			
Overall Indonesian Inputs			Indonesian side made necessary inputs generally in accordance with the plan. In addition necessary inputs were made for BKPM operation.

Annex III. Performance Grid

(1) Performance of Inputs (as of March 31, 2005)

Description of Inputs	Planned inputs (according to R/D and PDM)	Actual inputs	Remarks
Japanese inputs			
1.Long-term experts	Chief Advisor/Police Station Management	S. Iguchi 02.12.15-05.02.20 26.3M/M Y. Mano 05.01.30-07.01.29 2M/M	The initially dispatched Long-term experts in charge of Criminal Identification and in charge of Communication Control and Command could not fulfill their expected task. Thus they are recalled and substituted by other experts. This reduces the efficiency. Such cases could happen as this is the first Japan-Indonesian technical cooperation in the field of police technology. In many cases once an expert is dispatched he will stay for the planned period no matter he is found to be un appropriate as personal change is rather difficult. In this project, experts were replaced overcoming such difficulty and new experts are recovering remarkably the efficiency lost by their predecessors.
	Criminal Identification	M. Iwano 02.08.01-03.08.15 12.5M/M K. Fujizuka 04.03.14-06.03.13 12.5M/M	
	Communication Control and Command	M. Kiyono 02.08.01-03.03.10 7.3M/M A. Takeba 04.02.21-06.02.20 1.3M/M	
	Coordinator	T. Anzai 02.08.01-05.07.31 32M/M	
	Others (Education & Training)	T. Sengoku 05.04.10-07.04.09	
	Total(As of 31/03/05)	8 experts 93.9M/M	
2.Short-term experts	Equipment development, Education & Training 2-3 experts per year	JFY 2003: 6experts,566M/D	Directional service of communication(Oba 255days),Police system (Miyakoshi 5days), Administration of organization (Tanaka5days), Community policing (Miyazaki5days), Police radio (Hirose 83days), Criminal identification (Aoki 213 days).
		JFY 2004: 3experts,331M/D	Education and training (Ando 275 days), Criminal identification (Sekine, finger print)(28days), Criminal identification (Matsuhashi,foto) (28days).
		Total 9experts 897M/C (29.9M/M)	
3.Training	Counterpart training in Japan	JFY2002 3trainees	Criminal identification, police station management, communication and command control
		JFY2003 5trainees	Criminal identification x2, communication and command control x2,community policing
		JFY2004 6trainees	Criminal identificationx2,police station management x2,communication and command control x2
		Total 14trainees	
	Local in-country training	Radio Communication (2004) Neighborhood Police Center(02,03,04)	Politeknik Surabaya 16trainees Singapore (02, 03, 04 each 1) 3trainees
4.Provision of equipment	Equipment necessary for the effective implementation of	JFY2002 Y19,447,731	Vehicle, equipment for audio-visual training and communication and command control, criminal identification set, criminal identification laboratory
		JFY2003 Y26,564.649	2 BKPM and its radio, computer, vehicle, auto bicycle, furniture, etc.
		JFY2004 Y6.792.475	1 BKPM, upgerading radio for BKPM

Annex III. Performance Grid

(1) Performance of Inputs (as of March 31, 2005)

	the Project	Total	Y98,817,235	
5. Operating expenses		JFY2002	Y10,264,785	
		JFY2003	Y17,712,524	
		JFY2004	Y13,573,528	
		Total	Y41,550,837	
Overall Japanese Inputs	Although Japanese Inputs are somewhat different from what was planned at the beginning, they are effectively utilized to realize the outputs and to achieve the project purpose.			

Annex III. Performance Grid

(2) Performance of Activities

Activities Planned	Activities Carried Out	Remarks
Activities for "Output 1" Management skill of Bekasi Police Resort, a model police station, is improved to ensure the effective implementation of the project (BPR and Polsek under its command)	Indonesian National Police has long history and is a well established organization as one of four components of National Military Forces, Now that it is reorganized as a civilian police, police officers, especially the uniformed police personnel, should understand their own slogan "to protect and to serve" and obtain understanding, cooperation and trust of citizens. The project is aiming to achieve it through "respond quickly and sincerely" to citizens. The changing mind from military police to civilian police cannot be obtained only through the mere transfer of certain technologies as seen in many other projects. Thus the project put more effort on the training on the daily job rather than implementing planned activities written in PDM one by one.	Through the activities executed in the first half of the project, the changing mind of police officers towards the civilian police has been progressed remarkably. In order to make it stronger and sustainable, It is planned to proceed intensive OJT at BKMP as a means to practice activities of civilian police.
1-1.Study and analyze the current situation of police stations and personnel management to identify the issues to attend for revitalizing the police	2004 03 Interim report on "problems in proceeding technical collaboration at the field of front police office" 06 Recommendation on the "3-shift service" to counterparts	
1-2.Suggest plans of improvement on powers and functions of the individual/organization		
1-3.Suggest plans of improvement on personnel policy	Indonesian side made increase of staff and re allotment of personnel spontaneously to meet the project	
1-4.Implement feasible plans for progress on a trial basis, and undertake monitoring	Started trial execution of BKMP activities	
1-5.Improve information management/information gathering systems and campaign for the public	Started short mail activities	
1-6. Disseminate information on the reform model of Bekasi Police Resort to the public	2003 07 Public relation activities to various Japanese missions.	

Annex III. Performance Grid

(2) Performance of Activities

Activities Planned	Activities Carried Out	Remarks
(BKPM trial) (Trial implementation of BKPM activities) PDM does not mention about BKPM activities but in order to proceed intensive OJT training, BKPM activities are introduced as a trial	2003 05 Selection of BKPM sites 08 Study of organization change necessary for introducing BKPM and necessary training plan. 09 Study on design of BKPM 10 Study on design of patrol car	
	2004 01 Proceeding BKPM establishment plan and training plan. 02 Started construction of BKPM at the housing area. Site for commercial area is changed. 04 Study on sites of 9 BKPM to be introduced through the grant aid. 05 Started construction of commercial area BKPM. Chief of BPR changed. 06 Counterpart selected 24 candidates for BKPM and started training by themselves. 09 Working Group No.34 officially approved official Balai Kemitraan Polisi dan Masyarakat (BKPM). BKPM Task Force started. 24 radio communication equipment for BKPM was delivered. 10 Training on "take over, facility and documents management", "radio communication Train operation of BKPM "BKPM service (simulation)" (1 st and 2 nd)	
Activities for "Output 2" Practice on criminal identification in Bekasi Police Resort is improved (BPR and Polsek under its command)	Partly due to the unsatisfactory level of skill and technology, criminal identification was not effectively utilized in criminal investigation. It was accepted during the police belonged to military forces when confession only was enough to judge the guilty. Now the police become civilian police and evidence become more and more important. In order to make the importance of criminal identification to be understood, it is necessary to show that criminal identification is effective to investigation and proof. The project put enfaces on level up of identification skill through OJT rather than one-by-one activities according to the PDM and PO.	Finger print technology of BPR is draw up attention of headquarters of INP and Jakarta Metropolitan Police With further upgrading of technology, not only of fingerprint but including other technologies, it is expected INP will understand the significance of criminal identification and will take necessary procedures for further strengthening.
	2002 OJT and regular training was conducted 04 LT expert (Iwano) 11 Laboratory construction contract	
	2003 OJT and regular training was conducted 01 Laboratory completed 07 Equipment arrived	

Annex III. Performance Grid

(2) Performance of Activities

Activities Planned	Activities Carried Out	Remarks
	08 LT expert (Iwano left)	
	2004 OJT and regular training was conducted 01 Seminar at Police Detective School 03 LT expert (Fujizuka) arrived. 04 Seminar at BPR 05 Development of Finger print detector started 06 Training of BKPM staff on Site preservation 08 Seminar at Police Detective School 09 Request "through site reservation" to heads of Polsek within Bekasi 10 Training of BKPM staff on " site preservation " and "finger print and footprint"	
	2003 OJT and regular training was conducted 02 Seminar at Criminal identification section of INP 04 Seminar for Drug section of BPR	
2-1.Study and analyze the current situation and problems of skills and system in criminal identification	OJT and regular training was conducted.	
2-2.Carry out OJT to improve skills on criminal identification		
2-3.Develop a manual and training materials of criminal identification skills		
2-4.Undertake monitoring on practice of criminal identification		
Activities for" Output 3" Communication control and command system of Bekasi Police Resort is improved (BPR and Polsek under its command)	During the time of military police, order transfer from top to bottom was only concern in the field of communication, thus the effectiveness of police radio was not understood. Now that the INP become civilian police, it become important to improve information net, not only order from top to down, but vertical (both way) and horizontal information transfer net, and common understanding of situation among police. BPR did not have suitable equipment and the activities so far is limited to understanding.	When equipment becomes available, OJT using equipment will be executed.
3-1.Understand the current situation and	2002 08 Survey on effective reception. Survey on SABARA working system. Instruction "on site	

Annex III. Performance Grid

(2) Performance of Activities

Activities Planned	Activities Carried Out	Remarks
problems in communication control system	for all cases" 09 Made data sheet for collecting data on response time. SABARA distribution map 11 presentation at community policing seminar. Telephone reception recording system	
	2003 01 Survey at communication and command control section of Jakarta Metropolitan Police 02 Survey of actual status of radio communication at BPR 07 Start Operation of Citizen Reception Center (SPK). SABARA distribution map. Survey on present status and improvement plan of communication net. 08 Survey on communication and command control of Jakarta Metropolitan Police 12 Japanese expert moved from the project office to the room of communication and command control	
	2004 01 Survey on communication and command control for theft case. 02 Start operation of communication and command control room. 03 Survey on various inquiries at BPR. 04 Survey on distribution radio communication equipment for election. Survey on application of Motorola equipment Survey on communication and command control room of Jakarta Metropolitan Police. 05 Survey on working rule of communication and command control room of Jakarta Metropolitan Police, on Motorola equipment at BPR, working staff of communication and command control room of BPR and general staff of Telematika, POLDA 06 Survey on information status of damage to building, on night duty at BPR 07 Survey on information status of theft case. 09 Survey on Erickson equipment at Jakarta Metropolitan police. Presentation of communication group to WG no. 35. 10 Seminar to BKPM staff on "take over, facility administration, documents management" and "radio communication" 12 Survey on strengthening function of POSPOL in Metro Bekasi area. Presentation to WG on "progress of communication and command control"	
	2005 01 Survey on communication between communication and command control room and BKPM on traffic accident 02 Survey on Telematika SKP of new Bekasi Police Resort, utilization of radio communication at Mall BKPM, instructor for BKPM. 03 Survey on Telematika SKP of Poles Bekasi, utilization of radio communication at BKPM at commercial and residence area, on SPK Bekasi Udara, on SPK Metro Bekasi. Explain radio network to Telematika New Bekasi.	

Annex III. Performance Grid

(2) Performance of Activities

Activities Planned	Activities Carried Out	Remarks
	04 Survey on utilization and storing of FAX and digital camera. Survey on POSPOL.	
3-2. Work out remedial measures, and carry out OJT-based on the findings above	2004 06 Training to BKPM staff 2005 03 Lecture on radio communication net to Telematika, Poles Bekasi. Explain communication and command control to senior officers of Poles Bekasi.	
3-3. Develop a manual and training materials on communication control and command skills	2004 03 Working manual "communication and command control room" 05 Translation of "Working rule for Radio communication room, Jakarta Metropolitan police" 06 Working manual "Police Radio"	
3-4. Make a good model for communication control and command system and undertake monitoring	New system using police radio was proposed.	
Activities for "Output 4" Training programs of the police education & training institutions on "communication control and command", "criminal identification", and "police station management" are improved (Education and training institutions)		
4-1. Study and analyze the current situation and problems of training courses under Education & Training Department	Outline of training courses were studied.	
4-2. Revise and improve syllabus, curriculum, and training materials based on the achievements of Bekasi Police Resort		The review of syllabus was done by Indonesian Side.

Annex III. Performance Grid

(2) Performance of Activities

Activities Planned	Activities Carried Out	Remarks
Activities for "Output 5" Instructors/field trainers for "communication control and command", "criminal identification", and "police station management" are trained (BPR and Polsek under its command)		
5-1. Carry out trainings for instructors based on the achievements of Bekasi Police Resort	Training for Bekasi Police Resort was implemented.	
5-2. Establish training courses for executive officers of regional police departments		This activity is scheduled in 2006 and 2007.
5-3. Carry out seminars/ training at local police stations		This activity is scheduled in 2006 and 2007.

Annex III. Performance Grid

(3) Achievement of Targets

Target	Indicators	Means of Verification	Achievement Status as of Evaluation Time	Remarks
<p><u>Achievement of Project Purpose(Forecast)</u> Is the Project Purpose "Police officers have acquired knowledge, skills, and experience through training courses developed in the process of upgrading the organization and function of the Bekasi Police Resort, a model police station, to the level appropriate for civilian police." likely to be achieved by the end of the project period (July 31, 2007)?</p>	1. People in Bekasi District recognize that Bekasi Police Resort shows significant progress in the ability of civilian police activities	Public opinion survey by the third party	According to the survey by A.C.Nielssen, ratio of people in Bekasi who recognize that performance of Police is improved, has been increased from 49% as of 2002 to 55% in Nov/Dec 2004	It takes time for citizens recognize the improvement of police performance. Furthermore it is difficult for citizens to judge the "progress in the ability of civilian police activities" It is recommended to review the indicator.
	2 More than 75% of the supervisors of the police officers who have completed the trainings appreciate significant contribution by the trained officers	Follow up survey on trainings	Survey to supervisors was not done and difficult to collect information.	It is difficult to collect comments from supervisors. It is recommended to review the indicator.
	Appropriateness of indicators for Project Purpose	It is difficult to collect information on current indicators. Review of indicators is necessary.		
	Overall forecast for achievement of the Project Purpose	<p>Knowledge and skill in the fields of police station management, communication and command control, criminal identification, etc. directly transferred by the project combined with knowledge obtained through the training under the scheme within the program , as well as the effort made by Indonesian side by themselves push together the Indonesian INP, especially BPR to the direction civilian police should be.</p> <p>For example, level of criminal identification at BPR shows remarkable improvement. Citizen contact at BKPM obtained high remark by the Jakarta Post. On the other hand equipment for communication and command control was not delivered yet and technology transfer in this field will be executed in the later half of the Project.</p> <p>However, the target to be reached within the project period of 5 years and bench mark for each year is not clearly understood by stakeholders. Consensus on target point to be reached by the end of 5-year project period must be clearly set and understood by all stakeholders.</p>		
<u>Are outputs produced as planned?</u>				

Annex III. Performance Grid

(3) Achievement of Targets

Target	Indicators	Means of Verification	Achievement Status as of Evaluation Time	Remarks
Output 1. Management skill of Bekasi Police Resort, a model police station, is improved to ensure the effective implementation of the project	1-1. More than 75% of the police officers of Bekasi Police Resort and police sub-stations under its control assess that they show more civilized and cultivated attitude and discipline as professionals in 2007 than in 2002, because more attractive mental and physical incentives are given	1-1. Interview / Questionnaire	Because of periodical personal changes and other reasons, questionnaire for police officers is difficult to make. Japanese experts comments: Current figure : 30%, will be 90% by the end of the project	At interview made by Evaluation team, 100% of police officers answered that they show more civilized and cultivated attitude and discipline as professionals in 2007 than in 2002. However, this does not necessary mean "Management skill of Bekasi Police Resort, a model police station, is improved to ensure the effective implementation of the project". Indicator must be reviewed.
	1-2 Campaigns for the public are held 120 times in Bekasi Police Resort	1-2. Record of Bekasi Police Resort	No record is available and achievement status cannot be judged	Indicator must be reviewed.
	Overall achievement of Output 1.	Management skill of Bekasi Police Resort is observed to be improved from various points, for example, distribution of BKPM staff and their training. However the degree of improvement cannot be judged from the current indicators. Review of indicators is necessary so that it can be clearly judged at the time of the terminal evaluation.		
Output 2. Practice on criminal identification in Bekasi Police Resort is improved	2-1. The ratio of the number of cases in which criminal identification skills are utilized to the number of cases in which criminal identification is necessary in Bekasi Police Resort in 2007 increases by more than 55% points compared to the ratio in 2002	2-1. Record of Criminal Identification Division of Bekasi Police Resort	2002 No. of cases accepted: 528 No. of cases utilized: 98 Utilization ratio: 19% 2004 No. of cases accepted: 846 No. of cases utilized: 150 Utilization ratio: 18%	Utilization of criminal identification is about 50% increased from 98 to 150. This is remarkable progress in this field. On the contrary, indicator figure dropped from 19% to 18%. The current indicator appears not appropriate.

Annex III. Performance Grid

(3) Achievement of Targets

Target	Indicators	Means of Verification	Achievement Status as of Evaluation Time	Remarks
	2-2.The ratio of the cases where criminal identification skills contributed to the settlement of cases in Bekasi Police Resort in 2007 increases by more than 5% points compared to the ratio in 2002	2-2.Record of Criminal Identification Division of Bekasi Police Resort	No. of contribution 2002: 0 2004: 1	Partly because the technical level of criminal identification was not enough, the contribution to the settlement has been practically nil. The output and indicator must be reviewed.
	2-3.All of the uniformed police officers of Bekasi Police Resort acquire and practice certain level of skills of criminal identification	2-3.Record of Bekasi Police Resort on Certification of Skill	The project has been transferring the technology to 10 (out of total 1,000) police officers of criminal identification section of BPR	The technical level that is to be obtained by uniformed police staff and by the staff of criminal identification professionals are not same as a matter of course. The indicator is not realistic and needed to be reviewed.
	Overall achievement of Output 2.	Finger print technology at Metro Bekasi Police Resort is remarkably improved. But current indicators are not appropriate to judge the level of achievement. Outputs and indicator must be reviewed, including the following aspects: 1.Level of finger print technology to be obtained 2.level of other technology to be obtained 3. Level of New Bekasi Police Resort to be reached.		
Output 3. Communication control and command system of Bekasi Police Resort is improved	3-1.The ratio of cases where actions are taken for reports from the people in Bekasi Police Resort reaches 100% in 2007	3-1.Record of Bekasi Police Resort on Processing of Reports from People	Survey at BPR including its POLSEK shows that all (100%) of reports to them are appropriately taken action for. The record is well kept.	As a result of improvement of organization (establishment of SPK, etc.) This indicator already reached the target. However, from the practical view point, the change after introducing police radio by grant must be watched.

Annex III. Performance Grid

(3) Achievement of Targets

Target	Indicators	Means of Verification	Achievement Status as of Evaluation Time	Remarks
	3-2. Response time for cases where actions are taken for emergency calls and reports in Bekasi Police Resort in 2007 is improved by more than 85% compared to the number in 2002	3-2. Record of Bekasi Police Resort on Processing of Reports from People	Record is not well kept, also baseline is not clear.	This indicator cannot be verified. The first target should be set at "keep appropriate record of response time"
	Overall achievement of Output 3.	The delivery of equipment is delayed. So far only classroom training was done in the communication and command control field. Progress level is about 5%.		
Output 4. Training programs of the police education & training institutions on "communication control and command", "criminal identification", and "police station management" are improved	4-1. Curriculum and syllabus development/revision are completed	4-1. Curriculum and syllabus	So far: 1	
	4-2. Textbooks and other training materials are completed	4-2. Textbooks and other training material	So far: 0	
	Overall achievement of Output 4.	This output is not appeared yet.		
Output 5. Instructors/field trainers for "communication control and command", "criminal identification", and "police station management" are trained	5. Instructors and field trainers complete trainings by the following numbers	5. Reports of trainings	Not achieved	
	• Instructors in training institutions 160	• Activity Reports of Training Centers	Not achieved	

Annex III. Performance Grid

(3) Achievement of Targets

(c) Achievement of Targets				
Target	Indicators	Means of Verification	Achievement Status as of Evaluation Time	Remarks
	• Executive police officers of local police 1000	• Report of Trainings for executive officers of local police	Not achieved	
	• Participants in traveling seminars/trainings 2000	• Report of traveling seminars/trainings	Not achieved	
	Overall achievement of Output 5.	Instructor for the field of criminal identification is ongoing, and expected to be proceeded for the communication and command control after introducing equipment. Current progress is about 5%. The target for Output 4 and Output 5 is not clearly understood by stakeholders and needed to be reviewed.		
Appropriateness of indicators for outputs	Contents of all outputs together with their Indicators must be reviewed			
Overall achievement of Outputs	Achievement of outputs shows progress and some of indicators are already achieved, while many indicators are not clear and needed to be reviewed.			

Annex III. Performance Grid

(4) Process of Implementation

Evaluation Question	Findings
1. Have Activities been conducted as planned? (Conclusion of activity grid)	Although, there have been some problems/delays, the project as a whole is progressing toward the target.
2. Are there any problems in the methods of technical transfer? (technical level of counterpart, social/religious problems, etc.)	No problem in the method of technical transfer, although some description of PDM was not clearly understood by stake holders.
3. Were there any problems in the management system of the project?	Not particularly, except that some description of PDM is not clear or not realistic.
3-1 Monitoring system (review the actual progress compared to the plan and make necessary revision of the plan).	
3-1-1. How the progress was monitored? How often, by Whom, etc	Monitoring including is mainly done by Japanese experts and explained to counterpart from time to time.
3-1-2. Were the plan for the activities revised in accordance with the results of the monitoring, when there were the problems in the progress, change of the outside situations, etc.?	Some long-term experts dispatched by Japanese side could not proceed his task appropriately and replaced. When BPR is divided into two Police resorts, working group(named POKJA) was formed to promote common understandings among two police resorts. Contents of activities are flexibly revised from time to time.
(2) decision making process	
3-2 Please explain briefly the decision making process of the project, including the revision of the plan	Issues within the project are discussed at meeting held every morning, then discussed at the program meeting held every Friday.
3-3 Did the support / the cooperation of JICA office function well?	Fair
3-3-1. Did they correspond well to the results of monitoring?	Fair
3-3-2. Did they provided appropriate advices/supports when needed?	Fair
3-3-3 Was the communication with the Project Team good?	Fair
3-3-4 Was the linkage with Japan's domestic supporting agencies good?	Fair
3-3-5 General situation of supporting/cooperating	Fair
3-4 The system of communication within the	

Annex III. Performance Grid

(4) Process of Implementation

Evaluation Question	Findings
Project, between Japanese experts and your organization, etc.?	
3-4-1. Regular meeting (how often, on what, etc.)	① Project meeting: every morning ② Programm meeting: every Friday ③ BKMP task force: weekly meeting ④ POKJA (two Bekasi PR meeting): monthly ⑤ Working Group meeting: monthly
3-4-2. Daily communication	No problem, very good.
3-4-3. Are there common understanding of the Project purpose? Was the joint effort made in trouble shooting, plan making, etc.?	Yes, very good In the criminal identification field, Japanese expert and Indonesian counterpart jointly developed finger print finder.
3-4-4. Were the mutual trust established?	Yes, very good.
3-4-5. Is the ownership of counterpart high? Do they think this is their own project?	Yes, very good. Leading officers who participated in training in Japan as a core, Indonesian side is positively and actively predicating in the project.
3-4-6. Any other comments	
3-5 How are the communications between the Project and the related Indonesian organizations?	
3-5-1 With cadre of INP Headquarters	Yes, very good.
3-5-2 With cadre of Bekasi Police Resort	Yes, very good, especially those who participated in training courses in Japan.
3-5-3 With Education and Training Dept. of INP Headquarters and Education/Training Institutions.	Good and expected to be better now that long-term expert responsible for education and training was dispatched.
3-5-4 With Jakarta Metropolitan Police	Yes, very good.
3-5-5 With the "Working Group"	Yes, very good.
3-5-6 With other related organizations	
4. Ownership	
4-1. Is it clear with whom the matters are to be discussed on the issues of implementing the project? Are the responsibilities of the related organizations clear and appropriate?	Yes, it is clear and appropriate.
4-2. Participation of the management of implementing organizations to the Project.	It is good and appropriate.

Annex III. Performance Grid

(4) Process of Implementation

4-3. Was the allocation of budget necessary for the Project activities appropriate?	There are some problems but not so fatal.
4-4 Do you think the assignment of personnel (number, quality, specialties, etc.) of your organization is appropriate?	Japanese experts comment that number of staff for criminal identification is not enough and that Poles Bekasi has not person responsible for communication and command control. At the same time they also admit the effort by Indonesian side to assign personnel under difficult condition.
4-5 Smoothness of equipment delivery and facilities preparation	Not, bad. Delivery of communication and command control must be watched.
4-6 Is the recognition to the project by related agency and personnel.	
4-6-1. by cadre of INP Headquarters and Bekasi Police Resort high	Not only. by cadre of INP Headquarters and Bekasi Police Resort, the project is recognized highly by INP nationwide.
4-6-2. by counterpart and citizens	Recognition by counterpart is high but by citizens is not so high yet.
5. The PDM states that the Project cannot be started until the preconditions "Support from the Indonesian government for the police reform continues" is satisfied. Is the said precondition satisfied?	Yes, this precondition was satisfied.
6. Any other comments on the implementation process	Although it was not included in the original plan, BKPM activities are included as the OJT site of citizen contact. Provision of radio communication equipment is causing delay of activity
Overall observation on implementing process	As this is the first technical cooperation project for the Police station in the field, there are many unknown factors for both side at the beginning. As the result some parts of PDM are not clear or not realistic. This caused some delay in progress at the initial stage but expected to be recovered in the remaining period.

Annex IV 5-Criteria Evaluation Grid

(1) Relevance

Evaluation Questions	Necessary information and data	Findings
The Project Document, attached to the Minutes of Meetings dated July 15, 2002, of this project states that the Project is relevant from the following five view points. Have there been any political, economical or social changes, so significant as to give the positive or negative effect on the Project Purpose or on the Overall Goal, or on the implementation of the Project since July 15, 2002?	Relevance with the needs of Indonesia	No, there have not been such big changes and the importance remains at the similar level. The project purpose and overall goal are consistent with the needs of Indonesia. This project contributes to two of the five priorities stated in PROPENAS, that is, ①ensuring democratic political system/national cohesion/social stability, and ②achieving good governance/rule of law. PROPENAS advocates an emphasis on political reform. It says human resource development is one of the major issues to tackle.
	Consistency with the aid policy of Japan	No, there have not been such big changes and the importance remains at the similar level. The project is in line with Japan's policy on the region. Democratization and modernization of INP will contribute to the stability of the country as well as Southeast Asian region as a whole. It also ensures a safe environment for Japanese aid programs and foreign investment.
	Eligibility as ODA project	No, there have not been such big changes and the importance remains at the similar level. The project is appropriate for ODA because it ultimately benefits the whole Indonesian population through supply of public goods. Public safety and justice is a basis for the lives and activities of the people and a platform for prosperity.
	Participatory approach	No, there have not been such big changes and the importance remains at the similar level. The plan of the project is being formulated through PCM method of planning which involves stakeholders in the participatory process including workshops for problem analysis. Opinions of the stakeholders are best taken into consideration.
	Advantage of Japan's skill	No, there have not been such big changes and the importance remains at the similar level. Japanese police have a reputation of being well disciplined and efficient. Japanese police have excellent knowledge and skills to provide Indonesian police with guidance.
	Are there any other factors which have given or might give positive or negative effect on the relevance of the Project?	After holding in-depth discussion in Tokyo, H.E. Mr. Junichiro Koizumi, Prime Minister of Japan, and H.E. Dr. Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono, President of the Republic of Indonesia issued Joint Statement titled "Partners for New Challenges". In the said Joint Statement, the two leaders "reaffirmed their commitment to promoting closer and stronger bilateral relations, elevating them to a new height so that the two countries sharing common vision may work closely together as Partners for New Challenges in a rapidly changing international environment." Then Prime Minister Koizumi expressed his strong support for political, economic and social reforms being instituted in Indonesia under the leadership of President Yudhoyono. Prime Minister Koizumi also stated that Japan would continue to support Indonesia's development efforts by extending assistance for "infrastructure improvement, poverty reduction and good governance", including support for and that Japan would also support Indonesia's efforts to improve its investment climate. The two leaders recognized the need to strengthen cooperation on combating transnational crimes as terrorism, such as terrorism, arms smuggling, illicit drug trafficking, etc. They emphasized the importance of strengthening cooperation between relevant authorities. Prime Minister Koizumi highly valued the leadership of President Yudhoyono in the fight against terrorism and expressed continued support for capacity building to this effect.

Annex IV 5-Criteria Evaluation Grid

(1) Relevance

Evaluation Questions	Necessary information and data	Findings
Are there any significant changes since July 15, 2002, of role, activity, purpose, organization, personnel, etc., of the related organizations which might have effect, either positive or negative, on the Project?		Yes, positive change. Senior Officers trained in Japan are assigned to posts important for promoting the project activities. Those trained in Japan are assigned to key positions in BPR.
Appropriateness of the	Is the Project appropriate as the strategy of the development issues in the field of the internal security of Indonesia?	Very appropriate
	Is the project design appropriate in its approaches and methodology?	Very appropriate Approach by 3 directions i.e. police station management, criminal identification and communication control and command, is appropriate. Methodology of technical transfer, utilizing more OJT rather than classroom lecture is appropriate.
	Was it appropriate to choose Bekasi Police Resort as the model site?	Very appropriate The selection made through the joint study resulted the very appropriate choice.
Consistency with other projects	Is the Project consistent with other cooperation under the "National Police Improvement Program"?	Yes, Consistent. Synergy or complementary effects were observed and effective.

Annex IV 5-Criteria Evaluation Grid

(1) Relevance

Evaluation Questions	Necessary information and data	Findings
	Is the Project consistent with other Projects done by Indonesia with or without cooperation from other cooperating agency?	Approach of this project, i.e. building up a model station, is an unique approach and does not conflict with any other projects. This project and other efforts can help each other.
Overall Relevance	<p>The five reasons justifying the relevance of the project mentioned in the Project Document is still effective.</p> <p>After holding in-depth discussion in Tokyo, H.E. Mr. Junichiro Koizumi, Prime Minister of Japan, and H.E. Dr. Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono, President of the Republic of Indonesia issued Joint Statement titled "Partners for New Challenges". In the said Joint Statement, the two leaders "reaffirmed their commitment to promoting closer and stronger bilateral relations, elevating them to a new height so that the two countries sharing common vision may work closely together as Partners for New Challenges in a rapidly changing international environment." Then Prime Minister Koizumi expressed his strong support for political, economic and social reforms being instituted in Indonesia under the leadership of President Yudhoyono. Prime Minister Koizumi also stated that Japan would continue to support Indonesia's development efforts by extending assistance for "infrastructure improvement, poverty reduction and good governance", including support for and that Japan would also support Indonesia's efforts to improve its investment climate.</p> <p>The project is in line with the above Joint Statement.</p> <p>The Project is relevant.</p>	

Annex IV 5-Criteria Evaluation Grid

(2) Effectiveness

Evaluation Questions	Necessary information and data	Findings
Achievement of the Project Purpose "Police officers have acquired knowledge, skills, and experience through training courses developed in the process of upgrading the organization and function of the Bekasi Police Resort, a model police station, to the level appropriate for civilian police."	Achievability of Indicator 1. " People in Bekasi District recognize that Bekasi Police Resort shows significant progress in the ability of civilian police activities"	It takes time for citizens to recognize the improvement of police performance. Furthermore it is difficult for citizens to judge the "progress in the ability of civilian police activities" It is recommended to review the indicator.
	Achievability of Indicator 2. ". More than 75% of the supervisors of the police officers who have completed the trainings appreciate significant contribution by the trained officers"	It is difficult to collect comments from supervisors. It is recommended to review the indicator.
	Are the above two indicators appropriate to measure the achievement degree of the project purpose?	It is difficult to collect information on current indicators. Review of indicators is necessary.
	Notwithstanding the forecast for the indicators, Is the project purpose likely to be achieved by the end of the project period (July 31, 2007)?	Knowledge and skill in the fields of police station management, communication and command control, criminal identification, etc. directly transferred by the project combined with knowledge obtained through the training under othe scheme within the program , as well as the effort made by Indonesian side by themselves push together the Indonesian INP, especially BPR to the direction civilian police should be. For example, level of criminal identification at BPR shows remarkable improvement. Citizen contact at BKPM obtained high remark by the Jakarta Post. On the other hand equipment for communication and command control was not delivered yet and technology transfer in this field will be executed in the later half of the Project. However, the target to be reached within the project period of 5 years and bench mark for each year is not clearly understood by stakeholders. Consensus on target point to be reached by the end of 5-year project period must be clearly set and understood by all stakeholders.
Cause and effect relation		
Is the Project designed in such way that if all the Outputs are attained then the Project Purpose will be	Are all the Outputs designed to contribute to the achievement of the Project Purpose?	As It is not clear whether the target to be achieved within the project period is to "establish model police station at Bekasi" or to make training courses based on Bekasi model at education and training institutions, some confusions are observed in what activities and outputs are needed for the achievement of the project purpose. It is necessary that common understanding on what must be achieved during the project period and then the contents of activities and outputs shall be reviewed.

Annex IV 5-Criteria Evaluation Grid

(2) Effectiveness

Evaluation Questions	Necessary information and data	Findings
achieved? Do the outputs satisfy necessary and enough condition for the achievement of the Project purpose?	Are the Outputs enough for the achievement of the Project Purpose?	This depends on the above (what should be achieved?) Consensus must be formulated on the target to be achieved, then the outputs and activities must be reviewed. During the review, how to express the BKPM activities must also be studied.
Is the important assumption met?	INP continuously takes good care of skill transmission to fellow police officers after the project	Activity for this purpose is not started yet.
. Are there any effective means or necessary conditions to ensure the achievement of the Project Purpose?	There are means to make the achievement of the project purpose more assured. Such means can be conducted by the Project without changing the PDM	
	It is recommended to amend some part of the Project Design (PDM) to ensure the achievement of the Project purpose.	Consensus must be formulated on the target to be achieved, then the outputs and activities must be reviewed.
	There are important outside conditions beyond control of the Project, which are needed to be fulfilled to ensure the achievement of the Project Purpose	Facilities, equipment, budget, human resources, etc. of INP might become important factor.
What would facilitate the achievement of the Project purpose?	Among the contents of PDM (Inputs, activities, outputs, etc.) what are remarkably effective for the achievement of the Project Purpose?	All inputs are effective, especially equipment for criminal identification was remarkably useful.
	What are activities or other implementing process which are not written in PDM but conducted by the Project which were/likely to be effective for the achievement of the Project Purpose?	Establishment of BKPM highly contributed to the activities close to the citizens in their districts.
	What are the situations outside the Project, which facilitate or are likely to facilitate the achievement of the Project Purpose?	Local community contributed by providing land for BKPM. Establishment of command center would contribute to quick response.
What would hamper the achievement of the Project purpose?	Among the contents of PDM (Inputs, activities, outputs, etc.) what hampered the achievement of the Project Purpose?	

Annex IV 5-Criteria Evaluation Grid

(2) Effectiveness

Evaluation Questions	Necessary information and data	Findings
	What are hampering factors for the achievement of the Project Purpose, which occurred during the implementing process?	At the early stage trial-and-error was inevitable as both sides did not understand how the technical cooperation project would proceed.
	What are the situations outside the Project, which hampered or are likely to hamper the achievement of the Project Purpose?	BPR is divided into 2 Police Resorts. The distance between 2 police resorts may become a hampering factor.
Overall Effectiveness	It is observed that the outputs of the project are effectively contributing towards the achievement of the project purpose. In that sense it can be said that the project is effective. However, the goal of the 5-year project is not clear and the degree of effectiveness is not clear. The target to be achieved must be clearly decided and understood by stakeholders, and then the outputs and activities must be reviewed.	

Annex IV 5-Criteria Evaluation Grid

(3) Efficiency

Evaluation Questions	Necessary information and data	Findings
Achievement of Outputs	Are the outputs attained appropriately?	(Result of Performance Grid) Progress towards the achievement of the outputs was observed. But some outputs and indicators are not appropriate. The review of PDM is necessary.
Appropriateness of plan (cause and effect)		
(Activity Plan)	Are the Activities of the project well designed to achieve the outputs?	Mostly appropriate, but some activities are not appropriate. Review is needed.
(Input plan)	Were the Inputs planned appropriately to obtain outputs?	
Were the Inputs necessary for activities carried out appropriately without any serious problem in quality / quantity / timing, etc.? a. Indonesian inputs	Assignment of Counterpart Personnel	Almost appropriate
	Assignment of Administrative and Supporting Staff (secretary, interpreter, etc.)	Almost appropriate. If the interpreter was assigned from the beginning, the activities would have been executed more effectively and efficiently.
	Operating expenses	Appropriate
	Facilities and equipment	
	Project office necessary for the implementation of the Project	Appropriate
	Overall Indonesian inputs	
Appropriateness of inputs	Dispatch of long-term expert	Appropriate in general. Some of experts could not fulfill their job properly and replaced by others. As many counterpart staff do not understand English, some difficulty in communication is observed.
	Dispatch of short-term expert	Appropriate in general. Some problem in communications.
	Provision of equipment	Appropriate in general. Few items are not appropriate for Japanese cooperation with Indonesia. The delay of delivery, especially those provided under grant aid hampered smooth implementation of the project.
	Counterpart training in Japan	Appropriate in general. Trainee in communication control and command was not engaged in the project after the training. This reduces efficiency.
	Operating expenses	Appropriate in general.
	Overall Japanese inputs	Japanese inputs in general were effectively utilized in the project activities and contributing efficiently to the achievement of outputs. However the delay of provision under grant aid reduced the efficiency of the project.

Annex IV 5-Criteria Evaluation Grid

(3) Efficiency

Evaluation Questions	Necessary information and data	Findings
Timing	Were the appropriate inputs carried out timely?	Part of equipment was delayed.
	Were the appropriate Activities carried out timely?	Delay of equipment caused delay of activities.
Was the Important assumption satisfied?	"Trained police officers continue working."	No problem so far. Unknown in future.
What factors facilitated the achievement of the Outputs?	Among the contents of the project design (PDM), what are remarkably effective for the achievement of the Outputs?	Selection of BPR as the pilot station was effective. In the criminal identification field, provision of equipment in time contributed effectively.
	Please describe if there are any particular matters, which are not shown in the Project Design, but conducted during the project implementation and were very effective for the achievement of the Outputs.	Establishment of BKPM is promoting lot for the OJT of activities of civilian police. Joint effort for developing finger print detector resulted the raise of morale of criminal identification staff of BPR.
	Please describe if there are any outside situation, which are not done by the Project, but happened, for example change of laws or regulations, natural and social happenings, etc. and were very effective for the achievement of the Outputs.	Nothing particularly
What factors hampered the achievement of the Outputs?	Are there anything in the Project Design, that are not appropriate and hampered smooth achievement of the Outputs?	Nothing particularly
	Are there anything in the implementation process, that are not appropriate and hampered smooth achievement of the Outputs?	Nothing particularly
	Are there any outside situations, that are not appropriate and hampered smooth achievement of the Outputs? Comments:	Nothing particularly

Annex IV 5-Criteria Evaluation Grid

(3) Efficiency

Evaluation Questions	Necessary information and data	Findings
Cost efficiency	<p>Are the achievement of the Project Purpose and the Outputs reasonable compared to the amount of inputs?</p> <p>Is there any alternative method to obtain higher results with same cost?</p> <p>Is there any alternative method to obtain outputs with less cost?</p>	In the criminal identification field, effort is made to utilize low-cost locally-available materials.
Overall Efficiency	<p>Some factors reduced efficiency of the project, e.g.</p> <p>① Some experts could not attain the expected outputs and additional short term experts were dispatched</p> <p>② Equipment originally planned was changed.</p> <p>Trial and error was inevitable for the project like this, as such was the first experience for both Indonesian and Japanese side. But the flexible change of the plan made in this project reduced the damage caused by such error and the efficiency is kept as the result.</p>	

Annex IV 5-Criteria Evaluation Grid

(4) Impacts

Evaluation Questions	Necessary information and data	Findings
Achievement of the Overall Goal (System of civilian police established by police stations and police officers is deployed throughout the country)	Goal "System of civilian police established by police stations and police officers is deployed throughout the country."	Number of senior officers dispatched for Japan by the program reached 70 and their interest on the project is very high. If the project shows good result at Bekasi, then the Overall Goal will likely be achieved. The point is whether the project can show the good result or not.
	Is the above indicator appropriate?	
	Will the Overall Goal be achieved?	If the project makes good success at Bekasi, then the Overall will be achieved.
(Impact of Overall Goal)	Is there any impact or indirect effect, positive or negative, intended or unintended, which can be regarded as the result of this project?	Social security is an important element for the National Development plan of Indonesia. Strengthening of civilian police will have significant impact to the national development of Indonesia.
(Cause and Effect Relation)	Is the project designed so that the Overall Goal will be achieved if the project purpose is achieved and the important assumption is satisfied?	Yes
Will the important assumption be satisfied?	"Actions are taken to develop and imitate the achievements of Bekasi Police Resort in other police stations"	Yes, INP already started to introduce the outcome of the project to other police stations.
(Facilitating and hampering factors)	What will facilitate the achievement of the Overall Goal?	
	What will hamper the achievement of the Overall Goal?	
Are there any impact or indirect effect, positive or negative, intended or unintended, which can be regarded as the result of this project?	On the government policy, laws and regulations, norms and standards, etc.	To some extent
	Impact on cultural/social aspect, such as gender, poverty, human right, etc.,	To some extent Impact on human rights may be great.
	Impact on the related institutes, budget, organization, personnel, etc.,	There is a possibility that reorganization of INP will be studied to suit the civilian police.
	Impact on Environmental protection	Unknown
	Impact on Technical aspect	Yes, a big impact. Grade up of technical level will have impact on criminal investigation based on the evidence.

Annex IV 5-Criteria Evaluation Grid

(4) Impacts

Evaluation Questions	Necessary information and data	Findings
	Impact on counterpart personnel, motivation, work load, income, etc.	Yes, a big impact. As the trust by citizens increases, the morale of police officers would also increase.
	Any impact which acted negatively to specific people by race, religion, gender social status, etc.	May be to some extent.
	Any negative impact such as contamination of water and air, noise, increase of work load of female population, etc.	No negative impact is likely.
Overall Impact	<p>Number of senior officers dispatched for Japan by the program reached 70 and their interest on the project is very high. If the project shows good result at Bekasi, then the Overall Goal will likely be achieved. The point is whether the project can show the good result or not.</p> <p>Some other big impacts are expected such as impact on national development, impact on morale of police officers, impact on criminal investigation, etc. However, it is too early to judge how soon and how big those impacts will be.</p> <p>No negative impact is likely.</p>	

Annex IV 5-Criteria Evaluation Grid

(5) Sustainability

Evaluation Questions	Necessary information and data	Result of survey
Political and legal aspect	Will the political support be continued after the end of the Project?	Will continue at current level. Financial support might be required.
	Are the related laws and regulations well established or likely to be established?	Will be established according to the necessity.
Financial and institutional aspect	Institutional strength of counterpart organizations to continue the activities (personnel assignment, decision making process, etc.)	Civilian police activities mean that police is changing to the police civilians' request. It is started and cannot be stopped. INP is well established strong organization but not yet well established as "civilian police", "Continued effort is necessary.
	Systems to extend the outcomes of the model site (Bekasi) to all over Indonesia	INP has capability to extend, but some cooperation from Japan will facilitate it.
	Is the ownership of implementing agency well established?	Indonesian parties have strong self consciousness that the project is their own.
	Can Indonesian government allocate enough budget?	
Technical aspect	Are the methods of technical transfer used in the Project accepted? (technical level, social/traditional customs, etc.)	Yes, well accepted.
	Is operation and maintenance of equipment done appropriately?	Has been done properly so far. More training, especially for communication equipment will be necessary.
Social, cultural and environmental aspect	Is there any possibility that the lack of consideration to women, the poor, and the socially vulnerable hamper the sustainability?	No. Principle of the civilian police is the consideration to the socially vulnerable.

Annex IV 5-Criteria Evaluation Grid

(5) Sustainability

Evaluation Questions	Necessary information and data	Result of survey
	Are there any possibilities that the lack of consideration to the environment will hamper the sustainability?	Not likely
Others	What are the major problems Indonesian side currently faces, or is likely to face in the future to keep continuing the activities after the project period?	Financial aspect. Indonesian police rely considerable portion on donation by patron. In case request from patron does not consistent with the policy of civilian police, difficult question may arise.
Overall Sustainability	There are problems, such as financial, to be overcome. But Indonesian side is very keen to continue. It is not easy but Indonesian side will likely to overcome the problem and obtain sustainability	

ANNEX V PROJECT DESIGN MATRIX (PDM₁)

Project Title: The Project on Enhancement of Civilian Police Activities

Duration: August, 2002 ~ July, 2007

Project Area: Bekasi District

Target Group: Police officers in Bekasi District and trainees

Date: July 3, 2002

Narrative Summary	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Means of Verification	Important Assumptions
Overall Goal System of civilian police established by police stations and police officers is deployed throughout the country (*1)	35% of all the police stations achieve in 2012 the same level of improvement of police activities as Bekasi Police Resort achieved in 2007.	Records of police stations similar to the one used for verification of the outputs of Bekasi Police Resort	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Structural reforms make a progress in line with the enhancement of civilian police
Project Purpose Police officers have acquired knowledge, skills, and experience through training courses developed in the process of upgrading the organization and function of the Bekasi Police Resort, a model police station, to the level appropriate for civilian police	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> People in Bekasi District recognize that Bekasi Police Resort shows significant progress in the ability of civilian police activities More than 75% of the supervisors of the police officers who have completed the trainings appreciate significant contribution by the trained officers 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Public opinion survey by the third party Follow up survey on trainings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Actions are taken to develop and imitate the achievements of Bekasi Police Resort in other police stations
Outputs 1. Management skill of Bekasi Police Resort, a model police station, is improved to ensure the effective implementation of the project 2. Practice on criminal identification in Bekasi Police Resort is improved 3. Communication control and command system of Bekasi Police Resort is improved 4. Training programs of the police education & training institutions on "communication control and command", "criminal identification", and "police station management" are improved 5. Instructors/field trainers for "communication control	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1-1. More than 75% of the police officers of Bekasi Police Resort and police sub-stations under its control assess that they show more civilized and cultivated attitude and discipline as professionals in 2007 than in 2002, because more attractive mental and physical incentives are given 1-2. Campaigns for the public are held 120 times in Bekasi Police Resort 2-1. The ratio of the number of cases in which criminal identification skills are utilized to the number of cases in which criminal identification is necessary in Bekasi Police Resort in 2007 increases by more than 55% points compared to the ratio in 2002 2-2. The ratio of the cases where criminal identification skills contributed to the settlement of cases in Bekasi Police Resort in 2007 increases by more than 5% points compared to the ratio in 2002 2-3. All of the uniformed police officers of Bekasi Police Resort acquire and practice certain level of skills of criminal identification 3-1. The ratio of cases where actions are taken for reports from the people in Bekasi Police Resort reaches 100% in 2007 3-2. Response time for cases where actions are taken for emergency calls and reports in Bekasi Police Resort in 2007 is improved by more than 85% compared to the number in 2002 4-1. Curriculum and syllabus development/revision are completed 4-2. Textbooks and other training materials are completed 5. Instructors and field trainers complete trainings by the following numbers <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Instructors in training institutions 160 Executive police officers of local police 1000 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1-1. Interview/Questionnaire 1-2. Record of Bekasi Police Resort 2-1. Record of Criminal Identification Division of Bekasi Police Resort 2-2. Record of Criminal Identification Division of Bekasi Police Resort 2-3. Record of Bekasi Police Resort on Certification of Skill 3-1. Record of Bekasi Police Resort on Processing of Reports from People 3-2. Record of Bekasi Police Resort on Processing of Reports from People 4-1. Curriculum and syllabus 4-2. Textbooks and other training materials 5. Reports of trainings <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Activity Reports of Training Centers Report of Trainings for executive officers of local police Report of traveling seminars/ trainings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> INP continuously takes good care of skill transmission to fellow police officers after the project

and command", "criminal identification", and "police station management" are trained	Participants in traveling seminars/trainings 2000		
--	---	--	--

Activities	Inputs	
<p><u>Bekasi Police Resort and Polsek under its command</u></p> <p>1-1. Study and analyze the current situation of police stations and personnel management to identify the issues to attend for revitalizing the police</p> <p>1-2. Suggest plans of improvement on powers and functions of the individual/organization</p> <p>1-3. Suggest plans of improvement on personnel policy</p> <p>1-4. Implement feasible plans for progress on a trial basis, and undertake monitoring</p> <p>1-5. Improve information management/information gathering systems and campaign for the public</p> <p>1-6. Disseminate information on the reform model of Bekasi Police Resort to the public</p> <p>2-1. Study and analyze the current situation and problems of skills and system in criminal identification</p> <p>2-2. Carry out OJT to improve skills on criminal identification</p> <p>2-3. Develop a manual and training materials of criminal identification skills</p> <p>2-4. Undertake monitoring on practice of criminal identification</p> <p>3-1. Understand the current situation and problems in communication control system</p> <p>3-2. Work out remedial measures, and carry out OJT based on the findings above</p> <p>3-3. Develop a manual and training materials on communication control and command skills</p> <p>3-4. Make a good model for communication control and command system and undertake monitoring</p>	<p>Indonesia</p> <p>1. Counterparts, Secretaries</p> <p>2. Operating expense</p> <p>3. Equipment necessary for smooth implementation of the Project</p> <p>Project offices</p> <p>Japan</p> <p>1. Long-term experts</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project Leader, police station management for the project implementation • Communication control and command • Criminal identification • Coordinator • Others <p>2. Short-term experts</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education & training • Equipment development • Others <p>3. Equipment</p> <p>Within the limit of necessity for skill transfer activities by experts</p> <p>4. Training</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Local in-country training • C/P training in Japan 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trained police officers continue working
<p><u>Education and Training Institutions</u></p> <p>4-1. Study and analyze the current situation and problems of training courses under Education & Training Department</p> <p>4-2. Revise and improve syllabus, curriculum, and training materials based on the achievements of Bekasi Police Resort</p> <p>5-1. Carry out trainings for instructors based on the achievements of Bekasi Police Resort</p> <p>5-2. Establish training courses for executive officers of regional police departments</p> <p>5-3. Carry out seminars/ training at local police stations</p>		<p>Preconditions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support from the Indonesian government for the police reform continues

(*1) Activities as civilian police: Police are responsible for protecting "life, person, and property of the people," and "maintain public safety and order." In performing their duties, individual police activity should be carried out sincerely and promptly with fairness under the law. A good example of the civilian police is that due process of law is observed including respect of human rights of the accused identified based on the physical evidence obtained through criminal identification technique. In the practice of civilian police, they work on prevention and suppression of crimes sincerely, kind to the people, and close to local communities. Prompt responses to the demand of the people and sincere actions are also the essence of the civilian police activities.

ANNEX VI. Revised Project Design Matrix(PDM₂)

Project Title : The Project on Enhancement of Civilian Police Activities

Duration : August, 2002 ~ July, 2007

Project Area: Bekasi District

Target Group: Police officers in Bekasi District

Date: June 21, 2005

Narrative Summary	Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Means of Verification	Important Assumptions
Overall Goal System of civilian police established by police stations and police officers is deployed throughout the country. (*1)	35% of all the police stations achieve in 2012 the same level of improvement of police activities as BPRs achieved in 2007.	Records of police stations similar to the one used for verification of the outputs of BPRs	Structural reforms make a progress in line with the enhancement of civilian police
Project Purpose Civilian police activities are implemented at Bekasi Police Resorts (BPRs) as a model police station. (*2),	1. People in Bekasi District recognize that the activities of BPRs, as civilian police, shows significant improvement. 2. Format for record of various reports from citizens (information, claim, consultation, etc.) at BPRs will be made and reports will be appropriately recorded.	1. Public opinion survey by the third party 2. Record of BPRs	Actions are taken to develop and imitate the achievements of BPRs in other police stations
Outputs 1. Management of BPRs, model police station, is improved to ensure the civilian police activities. 2. Practice on criminal identification in BPRs is improved. 3. Communication control and command system of BPRs is improved. 4. Training programs of "police station management", "criminal identification" and "communication control and command" are improved.	1-1. More than 75% of the police officers of BPRs assess that they show more civilized and cultivated attitude and discipline as professionals in 2007 than in 2002, because more attractive mental and physical incentives are given. 1-2. Function of Polsek including BPKM is improved through the revision of organization. 1-3. Activities related daily life of citizens, such as crime prevention and traffic safety, are executed at each BPRs. 2-1. Number of investigation by criminal identification team at the site will be increased. 2-2. Number of finger print collected on the site will be increased. 2-3. Uniformed police officers will execute the site preservation activities at a appropriate level. 2-4. Officers of crime identification section at BPRs obtain high-level of skills for criminal identification and utilize it at the site. 3-1. The ratio of cases where actions are taken for reports from the people in BPRs reaches 100% in 2007. 3-2. Communication control and command system of BPRs for emergency calls will be established. 3-3. Response time for cases where actions are taken for emergency calls and reports in BPRs is properly recorded. 4-1. Manuals are developed. 4-2. Not less than two instructors each for "police station management", "communication control and command" and "criminal identification" respectively are cultivated at BPRs.	1-1. Interview/Questionnaire 1-2. Organization chart of BPRs including allocation of personnel 1-3. Activities Record of BPRs 2-1. Record of Criminal Identification Section of BPRs 2-2. Record of BPRs on site investigation 2-3. Record of BPRs on site investigation 2-4. Record of BPRs 3-1. Record of BPRs 3-2. Chart of Communication control and command system, Record of BPRs 3-3. Record of BPRs 4-1. Manuals of each field 4-2. Record of trainings at BPRs.	INP continuously takes good care of skill transmission to fellow police officers after the project

Activities	Inputs	
<p>1-1. Study and analyze the current situation of police stations and personnel management to identify the issues to attend for revitalizing the police</p> <p>1-2. Promote activities of Polsek, implement possible measures for improvement, including BKPM activities and carry out monitoring</p> <p>1-3. Suggest plans of improvement on powers and functions of the individual/organization</p> <p>1-4. Implement training for prevention against wound</p> <p>1-5. Improve information management/information gathering systems and campaign for the public</p> <p>1-6. Disseminate information on the reform model of BPRs to the public</p> <p>2-1. Study and analyze the current situation and problems of skills and system in criminal identification</p> <p>2-2. Develop a manual and training materials of criminal identification skills</p> <p>2-3. Carry out necessary training to improve skills on criminal identification</p> <p>2-4. Introduce certification system of criminal identification skills.</p> <p>2-5. Carry out monitoring on practice of criminal identification</p> <p>3-1. Understand the current situation and problems in communication control system</p> <p>3-2. Work out improved model of communication control and command system</p> <p>3-3. Develop a manual and training materials of communication control and command system</p> <p>3-4. Introduce communication control and command system on trial base and carry out necessary training.</p> <p>3-5. Carry out monitoring for communication control and command system and undertake monitoring</p> <p>3-6. Establish operation and maintenance system for police radio equipment.</p> <p>4-1. Study and analyze the current situation and problems of training courses in the field of "police station management", "criminal identification", and, "communication control and command"</p> <p>4-2. Develop training materials such as manuals, etc., in the fields of "police station management", "criminal identification", and "communication control and command" based on the achievements of BPRs</p> <p>4-3. Train instructors for teaching fresh police officers in the fields of "police station management", "criminal identification", and "communication control and command" at BPRs.</p>	<p>Indonesia</p> <p>1. Counterparts, Secretaries</p> <p>2. Operating expense</p> <p>3. Equipment necessary for smooth implementation of the Project</p> <p>4. Project offices</p> <p>Japan</p> <p>1. Long-term experts</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project Leader, police station management for the project implementation • Communication control and command • Criminal identification • Coordinator • Others <p>2. Short-term experts</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education & training • Equipment development • Others <p>3. Equipment</p> <p>Within the limit of necessity for skill transfer activities by experts</p> <p>4. Training</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Local in-country training • C/P training in Japan 	<p>Trained police officers continue working</p> <p>Preconditions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support from the Indonesian government for the police reform continues

(*1) Activities as civilian police: Police are responsible for protecting "life, person, and property of the people," and "maintain public safety and order." In performing their duties, individual police activity should be carried out sincerely and promptly with fairness under the law. A good example of the civilian police is that due process of law is observed including respect of human rights of the accused identified based on the physical evidence obtained through criminal identification technique. In the practice of civilian police, they work on prevention and suppression of crimes sincerely, kind to the people, and close to local communities. Prompt responses to the demand of the people and sincere actions are also the essence of the civilian police activities.

(*2) Bekasi Police Resort is now reorganized into two police resorts, namely POLRES METROBEKASI and POLRES BEKASI. In this PDM two police resorts in Bekasi area, including Polsek and BKPMs under the two Police Resorts, are described as "BPRs".

ANNEXVII REVISED MASTER PLAN**1. Overall Goal**

System of civilian police established by police stations and police officers is deployed throughout the country. (*1)

(*1) Activities as civilian police: Police are responsible for protecting “life, person, and property of the people,” and “maintain public safety and order.” In performing their duties, individual police activity should be carried out sincerely and promptly with fairness under the law. A good example of the civilian police is that due process of law is observed including respect of human rights of the accused identified based on the physical evidence obtained through criminal identification technique. In the practice of civilian police, they work on prevention and suppression of crimes sincerely, kind to the people, and close to local communities. Prompt responses to the demand of the people and sincere actions are also the essence of the civilian police activities.

2. Project Purpose

Civilian police activities are implemented at Bekasi Police Resorts (BPRs) as a model police station. (*2)”

(*2) Bekasi Police Resort is now reorganized into two police resorts, namely POLRES METROBEKASI and POLRES BEKASI. In this PDM two police resorts in Bekasi area, including Polsek and BKPMs under the two Police Resorts, are described as “BPRs”.

3. Outputs

- (1) Management of BPRs, model police stations, is improved to ensure the civilian police activities.
- (2) Practice on criminal identification in BPRs is improved.
- (3) Communication control and command system of BPRs is improved.
- (4) Training programs of “communication control and command”, “criminal identification”, and “police station management” are improved.

4. Activities

- (1) Activities for above-mentioned Output No. (1)
 - 1-1. Study and analyze the current situation of police stations and personnel management to identify the issues to attend for revitalizing the police
 - 1-2. Promote activities of Polsek, implement possible measures for improvement, including BKPM activities and carry out monitoring
 - 1-3. Suggest plans of improvement on powers and functions of the individual/organization Implement training for prevention against wound
 - 1-4. Improve information management/information gathering systems and campaign for

the public

1-5. Disseminate information on the reform model of BPRs to the public

(2) Activities for above-mentioned Output No. (2)

- 2-1. Study and analyze the current situation and problems of skills and system in criminal identification
- 2-2. Develop a manual and training materials of criminal identification skills
- 2-3. Carry out necessary training to improve skills on criminal identification
- 2-4. Introduce certification system of criminal identification skills
- 2-5. Carry out monitoring on practice of criminal identification

(3) Activities for above-mentioned Output No. (3)

- 3-1. Understand the current situation and problems in communication control system
- 3-2. Work out improved model of communication control and command system
- 3-3. Develop a manual and training materials of communication control and command system
- 3-4. Introduce communication control and command system on trial base and carry out necessary training
- 3-5. Carry out monitoring for communication control and command system and undertake monitoring
- 3-6. Establish operation and maintenance system for police radio equipment

(4) Activities for above-mentioned Output No. (4)

- 4-1. Study and analyze the current situation and problems of training courses in the field of “police station management”, “criminal identification”, and , “communication control and command”
- 4-2. Develop training materials such as manuals, etc., in the fields of “police station management”, “criminal identification”, and “communication control and command” based on the achievements of BPRs
- 4-3. Train instructors for teaching fresh police officers in the fields of “police station management”, “criminal identification”, and “communication control and command” at BPRs

a

✓

2. 評価調査結果要約表（中間評価）

1. 案件の概要	
国名：インドネシア共和国	案件名：市民警察活動促進プロジェクト
分野：ガバナンス	援助形態：技術協力プロジェクト
所轄部署：社会開発部第一グループ ガバナンス・ジェンダーチーム	協力金額（評価時点）：約6億2,000万円
協力期間	(R/D)：2002年7月15日 協力期間：5年間 (2002年8月～2007年7月)
	先方関係機関： 1) 主務官庁：インドネシア国家警察(INP) 2) 実施機関：インドネシア国家警察本部、ジャカルタ警視庁、メトロ・ブカシ警察署、ブカシ県警察署 日本側協力機関：警察庁 他の関連協力：(国家警察改革支援プログラム) 個別専門家派遣(国家警察長官アドバイザー) 技術協力プロジェクト(薬物対策、観光警察活動促進) 無償資金協力(市民警察化支援計画、国家警察組織能力強化支援計画等) 国別特設研修(警察行政比較セミナー)
1-1 協力の背景と概要	
<p>インドネシア国（以下、「イ」国）の治安維持は30年あまりにわたって国軍の一部である警察が担ってきた。しかしながら、民主化の進展に伴い2000年8月の国民協議会決定を受けて、国家警察は国軍から分離され、大統領直轄の市民警察として再スタートした。今後、国家警察が市民警察として国民の信頼を得るとともに、「イ」国の治安を維持していくことは投資の促進や経済の安定にとっても重要な課題である。「イ」国政府は国家開発計画（PROPENAS）においても国家警察の改革を重点項目に掲げている。かかる状況下、「イ」国政府は警察機能の近代化と行政能力の向上に対する支援につき我が国に要請してきた。これを受けて我が国は2001年2月の国家警察長官アドバイザー（個別専門家）派遣を始めとして複数のスキームを活用した協力「国家警察改革支援プログラム」を開始したが、本プロジェクトは当該プログラムの中核をなす技術協力プロジェクトであり、ジャカルタ郊外のブカシ警察署を市民警察としてふさわしいレベルまで組織と機能を強化し、全国のモデル警察署として構築すべく活動を行っている。なお、ブカシ警察署は2004年10月メトロ・ブカシ警察署、ブカシ県警察署に再整備された。</p>	
1-2 協力内容	
(1) 上位目標	
インドネシア国各地の警察署と警察職員により市民警察としての活動が展開される。	
(2) プロジェクト目標	
「モデル警察署」であるブカシ警察署の組織と機能が、市民警察としてふさわしいレベルにまで強化される過程で得られた知識・経験・技術を研修コースにより習得した警察官が育成される。	
(3) 成果	
1. 「モデル警察署」たるブカシ警察署の組織運営能力が向上する。 2. 同警察署の現場鑑識業務が改善される。 3. 同警察署管内の通信指令体制が改善される。 4. 警察学校及び訓練センターにおいて「組織運営」「現場鑑識」「通信指令」に関連した訓練プログラムが整備改善される。 5. 「組織運営」「現場鑑識」「通信指令」に関連した訓練プログラムにおける教育訓練指導者が養成される。	
(4) 投入（評価時点）	
日本側：	
長期専門家派遣	8名
短期専門家派遣	14名
カウンターパート来日研修	18名
カウンターパート現地国内研修	16名
機材供与	98,817千円
ローカルコスト負担	41,551千円
相手国側：	
カウンターパート配置	18名
モデル交番用地提供	3カ所
事務所施設提供	

2. 評価調査団の概要		
調査者	調査団員数 6名 (1) 団長・総括 神田道男 国際協力機構上級審議役 (2) 警察政策 池田宏 警察庁長官官房国際課課長補佐 (3) 技術協力政策 八幡隆幸 外務省経済協力局技術協力課 (4) インドネシア治安政策 河野毅 政策研究大学院大学助教授 (5) 評価企画 若林敏哉 国際協力機構社会開発部 (6) 評価分析 監物順之 中央開発株式会社海外事業部	
調査期間	2005年6月12日(日)～6月22日(水)	評価種類：中間評価
3. 評価結果の概要		
3-1 実績の確認		
(1) 活動と成果の実績 ブカシ警察署における活動は概ね順調に進捗し成果を現しつつある。他方、当初計画ではプロジェクト後半に予定されていた警察官教育訓練施設における活動は実情にそわない面があり、今次調査の結果、プロジェクト目標、活動及び成果の内容が修正された。		
(2) プロジェクト目標の達成度 プロジェクトはプロジェクト目標の前段すなわちブカシ警察署における市民警察モデルの確立に向けて着実に前進している。プロジェクト目標後段は前段が達成された後に警察官教育訓練施設において実施を予定された活動及び成果によってもたらされるものである。現時点ではその達成を予測することは時期尚早であり、当面は、別途実施を予定されている無償資金協力の結果を有効に活用するためにも目標の前段の達成にむけて資源・活動を集中すべきである。		
3-2 評価結果の要約		
(1) 妥当性 本プロジェクト開始にあたり 2002 年に作成されたプロジェクトドキュメントでは、①「イ」国のニーズに合致、②我が国の援助政策との整合、③ODA として適格、④参加型の計画作成である、⑤日本の技術の適格性の五点から本プロジェクトは妥当性が高いとしている。2004 年 10 月にメガワティ政権からユドヨノ政権への交代があったが、これらの点は現在でもそのままあてはまる。 2005 年 6 月 2 日付小泉総理とユドヨノ大統領による共同声明「新たな挑戦へのパートナー」の中で小泉総理は、「インフラ整備、貧困削減及び良い統治」のための支援の継続を表明し、また、インドネシアが進める「投資環境改善」や、「国境を越える犯罪及びテロとの闘い」に対する支援を表明している。本プロジェクトはこうした主旨にそうものであり、妥当性は高い。		
(2) 有効性 本プロジェクトはその成果を達成しプロジェクト目標を達成すべく前進しつつある。しかしながら、市民警察への大規模な支援は初めての経験であり、現行の PDM では 5 年間でどこまで到達すべきか計画段階で必ずしも明確でない。5 年間で到達目標を明確にし、関係者が共通した理解を持つことが必要である。		
(3) 効率性 本プロジェクトが警察署を相手機関とした初の技術協力プロジェクトであったことから、当初計画されたプロジェクト活動が実情に合わないケースや、投入内容が成果の発現に十分結びつかないといったケースも見られた。「必要・十分な投入がなされ、効率的に成果が発現されたか」という意味において初年度の効率は高いとはいえない。しかしながらプロジェクトでは、PDM にかかれた目標を意識し、計画された個々の活動に対し柔軟な対応をとることにより結果として 2 年目以降の効率は回復しつつある。		
(4) インパクト 本プロジェクトはインドネシア国家警察幹部のみならず、メディアによる紹介を通じ一般社会にも注目を浴びている。ブカシにおけるモデル警察署構築が成功すれば、その成果は段階的にインドネシア全土に展開しインドネシア国家開発計画に大きなプラスのインパクトをあたえるものと期待される。 上位目標以外においても実施機関の人事・組織・予算等への影響やカウンターパート他プロジェクト関係者の意識へのプラスの影響が予測されるがその度合いを予測することは時期尚早である。 なおマイナスのインパクトは予測されない。		
(5) 自立発展性 インドネシア側の意識は高く、政策的支援は期待できる。しかしながら国軍の一部としての長い伝統をもつインドネシア国家警察が上から下まで意識改革を浸透させるには時間が必要である。特に本プロジェクトで柱と据えた交番活動、鑑識活動や通信指令については予算的問題や人材の効果的活用が課題となろう。		

<p>3-3 効果発現に貢献した要因（計画内容に関すること、実施プロセスに関すること）</p> <p>(1) インドネシア側の意欲 国軍から独立したインドネシア国家警察の幹部には国軍ではなく「市民警察」であることの独自性を確立したいとの意識が高く、本プロジェクトで導入した鑑識技術や交番活動等効果が認められると判断すればブカシ以外にも試行しようとの意識が高い。</p> <p>(2) プログラム方式の協力 本プロジェクトと並行して警察改革支援プログラムの下で実施された他のスキームによる協力、例えば国別特設研修（警察幹部の意識改革）、無償資金協力（供与された機材による現場技術の習得）等は本プロジェクトの相乗効果が高く有効であった。</p>	<p>3-4 問題点及び問題を惹起した要因（計画内容に関すること、実施プロセスに関すること）</p> <p>(1) PDM の不確実性 本プロジェクトは第一線の警察署を実施機関とする初の技術協力プロジェクトであったことにもより、PDM の表現には関係者により異なった理解がされていた部分がある。本プロジェクトは警察改革支援プログラムの一環として実施され、プログラムリーダーには明確な目標意識があり、PDM の細部よりもプログラムが目指す方向との整合性を意識して PDM には柔軟に対応したことにより PDM の不十分な部分が補われた。</p> <p>(2) 言葉の問題 本プロジェクトのカウンターパートは第一線警察署であり、ほとんどが英語を解さない。また派遣専門家の多くはインドネシア語で業務を遂行することができない。抜群の技術力により言葉が十分でなくても成果をあげた専門家もいたし、プロジェクトでは通訳を雇用するなど対応策をとっているが言葉の問題から生じるコミュニケーション上の問題は効率を低下させる要因である。</p>
<p>3-5 結論</p> <p>本プロジェクトは</p> <p>①ブカシ警察署における様々な試行を通じてインドネシアに適した市民警察のモデルを構築する。 ②その結果を活用して各レベルにおける警察官訓練コースを確立する。（シラバス・カリキュラムの作成、教材の作成、教官の養成）</p> <p>といった二段構成となっている。①については着実な前進が見られるが、②は①の結果が出ないと実施困難であり、ほとんど手がついていない状況である。本プロジェクトは我が国にとって初の警察署プロジェクトであることから、初年度の活動には試行錯誤が見られ、わずか 5 年間の協力期間において②まで狙うことには無理がある。プロジェクト開始後に決定した無償資金協力で供与された機材の有効活用のために本協力期間内においては、①を重点的に実施し②についてはその基礎を固めることが合理的と判断される。</p>	<p>3-6 提言</p> <p>(1) 「PDM」と「マスタープラン」を改訂し、ブカシ警察署のモデル警察としての完成度を高めることに重点をおく。 (2) 警察改革支援プログラムとの連携を高めモデル警察署の全国への展開の道筋を明らかにしていく。 (3) 無償資金協力による資材、施設が有効に活用しよう警察改革支援プログラムとプロジェクトが役割を分担し、予め明確にしておくこと。 (4) 国別特設研修は、市民警察としてのあり方を認識する上で極めて有効であり、研修内容も吟味しつつ継続充実する。 (5) 日本警察の有する人的資源を十分に把握した上で今後はデータベースを整備するなどして日本警察の人材の発掘に意を注ぐとともに、人材の育成を図る。 (6) 我が国の鑑識技術は高度化・細分化が進んでいることから、今後はこれらを踏まえ、派遣する鑑識専門家について、インドネシア側の課題により適合した分野に絞り込んだ人材選定をする。 (7) インドネシア側のプロジェクト関係者が習得した知識、経験を生かせるよう、人事異動の方法について考慮すべきこと。</p>
<p>3-7 教訓</p> <p>(1) 入念な事前調査を行っても外部条件が変化したり、事前調査では不明であった部分が判明したりすることにより、当初計画に対し柔軟な対応が求められるケースは十分にありうる。これらのケースに適切に対応するために中間評価が重要となる。 (2) 警察分野の技術協力では、派遣専門家の力量によるところが大きい。プロジェクト開始当初、派遣専門家が活動の方向性を見いだせず、途中交代することがあった。人材の思いきった交代により効果的实施を目指すことも必要である。</p>	<p>3-8 フォローアップ状況</p> <p>中間評価のため記載すべき内容は無い。</p>

プロジェクト名： 市民警察活動促進プロジェクト
対象地域： プカシ市

期間： 2002 年 8 月～2007 年 7 月
ターゲットグループ： プカシ警察署管内の警察官及び研修コース受講者

作成日： 2002 年 7 月 3 日

プロジェクトの要約	指標	入手手段	外部条件
上位目標 インドネシア国各地の警察署と警察職員により市民警察としての活動が展開される。 (※1)	1. 2007 年時のプカシ警察署を手本とした業務改善を達成した警察署の数が、2012 年において全警察署の 35%以上となる。	1. プカシ警察署における成果 1. ～3. の指標に準じた各警察署での記録	・ インドネシア警察における市民警察化に即した制度改善が進む
プロジェクト目標 「モデル警察署」であるプカシ警察署の組織と機能が、市民警察としてふさわしいレベルにまで強化される課程で得られた知識・経験・技術を研修コースにより習得した警察官が育成される。	1. プカシ住民がプカシ警察署の警察活動能力の向上を認める 2. 訓練を修了した警察職員の上司の 75%以上が修了者の職場への貢献を認めている	1. 第三者機関による世論調査結果 2. 修了者追跡調査	・ プカシ警察署において得られた成果を他署で展開、実施する活動が行われる
成果 1. 「モデル警察署」たるプカシ警察署の組織運営能力が向上する。 2. 同警察署の現場鑑識業務が改善される。 3. 同警察署管内の通信指令体制が改善される。 4. 警察学校及び訓練センターにおいて「組織運営」「現場鑑識」「通信指令」に関連した訓練プログラムが整備改善される。 5. 「組織運営」「現場鑑識」「通信指令」に関連した訓練プログラムにおける教育訓練指導者が養成される。	1-1. 2007 年におけるプカシ警察署警官の 75%以上が、2002 年時に比べ、警官としての意識が高まる等、インセンティブが高まったことを認める 1-2. プカシ警察署において広報活動が 120 件実施される 2-1. 2007 年にプカシ警察署において現場鑑識活動の必要性が認められた案件に対する鑑識活動実施率が 2002 年時に比べ 55%ポイント以上増える 2-2. 2007 年にプカシ警察署において現場鑑識活動を実施した案件のうち、証拠採用により捜査活動に貢献した案件の割合が 2002 年時に比べ 5%ポイント以上増える 2-3. プカシ警察署において制服警察官全員が一定レベルの現場鑑識技術を習得、警察活動現場で実施する 3-1. 2007 年にプカシ警察署において通報に対応し処理された件数の割合が 100%となる 3-2. 2007 年にプカシ警察署において通報に対応し処理された件数のレスポンスタイムが 2002 年時に比べ 85%以上改善される 4-1. 開発・改訂されたカリキュラムとシラバスの完成 4-2. 開発された教科書と教材の完成 5. 訓練指導者が、以下のとおり訓練を修了する 教育訓練施設のインストラクター 160 名 地方警察幹部 1. 000 名 巡回セミナー・巡回指導参加者 2. 000 名	1-1. インタビュー・アンケート調査等の記録 1-2. プカシ署活動記録 2-1. プカシ警察署案件処理記録 2-2. プカシ警察署案件処理記録 2-3. プカシ警察署技術認定記録 3-1. プカシ警察署案件処理記録 3-2. プカシ警察署案件処理記録 4. 各コースのカリキュラムと教科書 5. 訓練実施記録 ・ 教育訓練施設研修実施記録 ・ 地方警察幹部研修実施記録 ・ 巡回セミナー・巡回指導実施記録	・ 研修で得た能力の継承に関し、INP によるフォローアップが継続的に行われる

(※1) 市民警察としての活動：警察は「国民の生命、身体、財産を保護し、公共の安全と秩序の維持にあたる。」責務を負っているが、任務遂行にあたり個々の警察活動が法の下での公正さを持つて誠実・迅速に実施されなければならない。現場鑑識活動による物的証拠により特定された被疑者の人権保護を含む刑事司法手続きが公正に進められる等が一例としてあげられる。具体的には「犯罪の防止・検挙に取り組み市民に優しく、地域社会に密着した警察」の活動とし、市民の要望に対する迅速な対応かつ誠実な対応をすること。

<div>活動</div> <div><div>ブカシ警察署及び同管内分署</div><div>1-1. 業務管理、人事管理の実態を把握し、組織の活性化に必要な課題を特定する</div><div>1-2. 業務範囲、職務執行権限等の改善策を検討する</div><div>1-3. 人事制度、人事政策上の改善策を検討する</div><div>1-4. 実施可能な改善策を試行し、モニタリングを行う</div><div>1-5. 市民に対する広報活動、情報収集・情報管理システムを改善する</div><div>1-6. ブカシ警察署改革モデルに関する情報の提供、発信を行う</div><div>2-1. 現場鑑識業務の実態を把握し、技術、システム上の問題点を抽出する</div><div>2-2. 鑑識技術の向上に向けた OJT を実施する</div><div>2-3. 鑑識技術にかかるマニュアル、研修用教材を作成する</div><div>2-4. 現場鑑識業務にかかるモニタリングを行う</div><div>3-1. 通信指令体制の現状を把握し、問題点を抽出する</div><div>3-2. 通信指令体制の改善策を検討し、上記に基づく OJT を行う</div><div>3-3. 通信指令技術にかかるマニュアル及び研修用教材を作成する</div><div>3-4. 通信指令体制の改善モデルを確立し、モニタリングを行う</div><div>警察官教育訓練施設</div><div>4-1. 教育訓練総局管轄下の教育訓練施設における研修コースの現状を把握し、改善点を抽出する</div><div>4-2. ブカシ警察署で得られた成果をもとにシラバス、カリキュラム、教材の改訂を行う</div><div>5-1. ブカシ警察署で得られた成果をもとにインストラクターに対する研修を実施する</div><div>5-2. 地方警察幹部を対象とする研修コースを開設する</div><div>5-3. 地方警察署での巡回セミナー及び巡回指導を行う</div></div>	<div>投入</div> <div><div>インドネシア</div><div>1. カウンターパート、秘書</div><div>2. 運営管理費</div><div>3. 円滑なプロジェクト運営に必要な資機材</div><div>4. プロジェクト事務所</div></div> <div><div>日本</div><div>1. 長期専門家 プロジェクト実施リーダー (兼警察組織運営) 現場鑑識 通信指令 業務調整 他</div><div>2. 短期専門家 教育訓練開発 資機材開発 他</div><div>3. 機材 各分野の専門家の技術移転 に必要な資機材</div><div>4. 研修 現地国内研修 カウンターパート本邦研修</div></div>	<div><div>● 指導を受けた署員が勤務を続ける</div></div> <div><div>前提条件</div><div><div>● 「イ」国政府の警察改革に対する支持が継続する</div></div></div>
---	--	--

プロジェクト名：市民警察活動の促進プロジェクト

期間：2002年8月～2007年7月

対象地域：ブカシ市

ターゲットグループ：ブカシ警察署の警察官

作成日：2005年6月16日

プロジェクトの要約	指標	入手手段	外部条件
上位目標 インドネシア国各地の警察署と警察職員により市民警察としての活動が展開される。 (※1)	1. 2007年時のブカシ警察署を手本とした業務改善を達成した警察署の数が、2012年において全警察署の35%以上となる	1. ブカシ警察署における成果1.～3.の指標に準じた各警察署での記録	・インドネシア警察における市民警察5化に即した制度改善が進む
プロジェクト目標 「モデル警察署」であるブカシ警察署(※2)において、市民警察としての活動が実施される。	1. ブカシ住民がブカシ警察署の警察活動の向上を認める 2. ブカシ警察署において、市民からの各種届出の情報が整備される	1. 第三者機関による世論調査結果 2. ブカシ警察署の記録	・ブカシ警察署において得られた成果を他署で展開、実施する活動が行われる
成果 1. 「モデル警察署」たるブカシ警察署の市民警察としての組織運営能力が向上する。 2. 同警察署の現場鑑識業務が改善される。 3. 同警察署の通信指令体制が改善される。 4. 「組織運営」「現場鑑識」「通信指令」に関連した訓練プログラムが整備改善される。	1-1. 2007年におけるブカシ警察署警察官の75%以上が、2002年時に比べ、警官としての意識が高まる等、インセンティブが高まったことを認める 1-2. ブカシ警察署の組織体制について、交番活動を含む分署の機能が向上する 1-3. 防犯指導、交通安全指導等の市民生活に関連した活動がブカシ警察署で実施される 2-1. 2007年にブカシ警察署において現場鑑識臨場数が増加する 2-2. 2007年に鑑識課員が現場臨場して指紋を採取した事件について、指紋採取個数が増加する 2-3. 制服警察官が一定レベルの現場保存を実施する 2-4. 鑑識係員が高度な現場鑑識の技術を習得、警察活動現場で実施する 3-1. 2007年にブカシ警察署において通報に対応し処理された件数の割合が100%となる 3-2. 緊急通報等に対する通信指令体制が整備される 3-3. レスポンスタイムが適正に記録される 4-1. 開発されたマニュアル等の完成 4-2. ブカシ警察署において「組織運営」「現場鑑識」「通信指令」の分野で、2名以上の指導員が養成される	1-1. インタビュー・アンケート調査等の記録 1-2. ブカシ警察署組織図、人員配置 1-3. ブカシ警察署活動記録 2-1. ブカシ警察署案件処理記録 2-2. ブカシ警察署臨場記録 2-3. ブカシ警察署臨場記録 2-4. ブカシ警察署鑑識技術認定記録 3-1. ブカシ警察署案件処理記録 3-2. 通信指揮系統図、無線管理簿 緊急通報受理簿、通話記録 3-3. ブカシ警察署案件処理記録 4-1. 各分野のマニュアル 4.2. 訓練実施記録	・研修で得た能力の継承に関し、INPによるフォローアップが継続的に行われる

(※1) 市民警察としての活動：警察は「国民の生命、身体、財産を保護し、公共の安全と秩序の維持にあたる。」責務を負っているが、任務遂行にあたり個々の警察活動が法の下での公正さを持って誠実・迅速に実施されなければならない。現場鑑識活動による物的証拠により特定された被疑者の人権保護を含む刑事司法手続きが公正に進められる等が一例としてあげられる。具体的には「犯罪の防止・検挙に取り組み市民に優しく、地域社会に密着した警察」の活動とし、市民の要望に対する迅速な対応かつ誠実な対応をすること。

(※2) 2004年10月にブカシ警察署がメトロ・ブカシ警察署、ブカシ県警察署に分割されたが、両警察署を対象に本プロジェクトを実施していく。本PDMにおいて「ブカシ警察署」はメトロ・ブカシ警察署、ブカシ県警察署の両警察署を指す。

活動	投入	
1-1 業務管理、人事管理の実態を把握し、組織の活性化に必要な課題を特定する 1-2 分署の活動促進、交番活動等実施可能な改善策を試行し、モニタリングを行う 1-3 業務範囲、職務執行権限等の改善策を検討する 1-4 受傷事故防止のための訓練を実施する 1-5 市民に対する広報活動、情報収集・情報管理システムを改善する 1-6 ブカシ警察署改革モデルに関する情報の提供、発信を行う 2-1 現場鑑識業務の実態を把握し、技術、システム上の問題点を抽出する 2-2 鑑識技術にかかるマニュアル、研修用教材を作成する 2-3 鑑識技術の向上に向けた必要な訓練を実施する 2-4 鑑識技術認定制度を導入する 2-5 現場鑑識業務にかかるモニタリングを行う 3-1 通信指令体制の現状を把握し、問題点を抽出する 3-2 通信指令体制の改善モデルを確立する 3-3 通信指令技術にかかるマニュアル及び研修用教材を作成する 3-4 通信指令体制を試行し、必要な訓練を実施する 3-5 通信指令体制のモニタリングを行う 3-6 警察無線機器の維持・管理体制が整備される 4-1 「組織運営」「現場鑑識」「通信指令」における研修コースの現状を把握し、改善点を抽出する 4-2 ブカシ警察署で得られた成果をもとに「組織運営」「現場鑑識」「通信指令」の分野についてマニュアル等を作成する 4-3 「組織運営」「現場鑑識」「通信指令」の3分野において、ブカシ警察署で初任科レベルの警察官を指導できる指導者が養成される	インドネシア 1. カウンターパート、秘書 2. 運営管理費 3. 円滑なプロジェクト運営に必要な資機材 4. プロジェクト事務所 	