

Evaluation Report

On

Ethics Training Programme

In Tanzania

(Final Report)

Dar Es Salaam
28th April, 2004

JICA LIBRARY



1175870(3)

JICA Tanzania Office

TISCO Consultants and Associates Limited

TZO

JR

03-01

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER	TITLE	PAGES
0.	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	iv-xii
1.	INTRODUCTION	1
2.	OUTLINE OF EVALUATION STUDY	2-3
2.1	OBJECTIVE OF EVALUATION	
2.2	EVALUATION TEAM	
2.3	METHOD OF EVALUATION STUDY	
2.4	PERIOD	
3.	OUTLINE OF PROJECT	4-5
3.1	PROJECT BACKGROUND	
3.2	PROJECT SUMMARY	
4.	PROJECT ACHIEVEMENT	6-7
4.1	INPUTS	
4.2	OUTPUT	
4.3	PROJECT PURPOSE	
5.	PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION	8-9
5.1	ACTIVITIES OF THE PROJECT	
5.2	PROJECT MONITORINGS	
5.3	PROJECT MANAGEMENT	
5.4	PROJECT OWNERSHIP	
6.	EVALUATION RESULTS	10-20
6.1	EVALUATION CRITERIA	
6.1.1	Relevance	
6.1.2	Effectiveness	
6.1.3	Efficiency	
6.1.4	Impact	
6.1.5	Sustainability	
6.2	CONCLUSION	
6.2.1	Factors Promoting Sustainability and Impact	
6.2.2	Factors inhibiting Sustainability and Impact	
6.2.3	Conclusion	
7.	RECOMMENDATIONS AND LESSONS LEARNED	21-22
7.1	RECOMMENDATIONS	
7.2	LESSONS LEARNED	



1175870[3]

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix No.	Title	No. of Pages
2:A	Project Design Matrix for Evaluation (PDME)	5
2:B	Evaluation Grid	6
2:C	List of Questionnaires	37
2:D	No. of Completed Questionnaires	1
2:E	Responses Analysis Results	6
4:A	Project Inputs	4
4:B	Project Outputs	2
5:A	Project Activities	8

ABBREVIATIONS

PSM	Public Service Management
MDA	Ministries, Departments and Agencies
JICA	Japan International Co-operation Agency
JFY	Japanese Fiscal Year
GoT	Government of Tanzania
TPSC	Tanzania Public Service College
PCB	Prevention of Corruption Bureau
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
SIDA	Swedish International Development Agency
TISCO	TISCO Consultants and Associates Ltd.

INTERPRETATIONS

Trainers	-	Participants invited from MDAs
Trainees	-	Employees trained at their places of work
Resource Persons	-	Course Facilitators

0. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

0.1 INTRODUCTION

Implementation of the In-country Training Course on Public Service Ethics started in the years 2000 to 2004 Japanese Fiscal Year.

The programme is being carried jointly between the Governments of Japan and Tanzania through a technical and financial support from the Japanese Government. The programme was envisaged to train 500 participants at a rate of 100 intake from Ministries, Departments and Agencies who will in turn train their fellow employees in their office environment after the course.

JICA Tanzania office commissioned TISCO Consultants and Associates Limited in January 2004 to conduct the evaluation study.

0.2 OUTLINE OF EVALUATION STUDY

0.2.1 Objective of Evaluation

The objective of the study is to evaluate the Public Service Ethics Training Programme with a view to improve its planning and management and also to enhance effectiveness of similar projects later.

0.2.2 Evaluation Team

The evaluation study team from TISCO Consultant and Associates Limited were:

Veronica Msinjili	-	Team Leader and
Juma Ngwembanoy	-	Data Analyst

0.2.3 Method of Evaluation Study

The evaluation team obtained primary and secondary data through prepared questionnaires and documents on the project obtained from project stakeholders.

A Project Design Matrix (PDM_e) and an Evaluation Grid were prepared prior to field work to guide the preparation of questionnaires.

0.2.4 Period

The project implementation period was planned from 2000 to 2004, but actual training started in January 2001. The project was still in progress at the commencement of the evaluation study in January 2004.

0.3 OUTLINE OF PROJECT

0.3.1 *Project Background*

The implementation of the Ethics Training Programme springs out from the Public Service Reform Programme (PSRP) which started in the year 2000 and planned to end in the year 2011. The overall purpose of the PSRP is to support the attainment of high rate of economic growth and ensure that delivery of quality services within the priority sectors conforms to public expectation for value, satisfaction and relevance.

Thus the Government of Japan and the Government of Tanzania (GoT) agreed to cooperate in organizing a training course in Public service Ethics under Japanese International Cooperation Agency (JICA)-In-country Training. The course is being conducted with the support of the technical cooperation scheme of the Japanese Government.

The programme will run from the year 2000 to 2004 Japanese Fiscal (JFY).

0.3.2 *Project Summary*

The frame-work is as shown below:

Project Title:	In-country Training Course on Public Service Ethics
Executing Agency:	The Civil Service Department now Public Service Management
Funding Agency:	Japan International Co-operation Agency (JICA)
Target Groups:	Capable employees from Ministries, Departments and Agencies
Target Area:	United Republic of Tanzania
Duration:	5 years (2000-2004)

Project Purpose:

1. To have a pool of trainers in ethics in the Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) who will in turn continuously train other fellow employees at work places, facilitated by MDAs strengthened capacities.

Expected Output

1. Trained employees perception on ethics (corruption) is understood.
2. Trained employees have acquired skills to train fellow employees on Public Service Ethics in their respective offices.
3. Enhance trained employees capabilities in making ethical decisions.
4. Strengthened ethics training capacities of Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs).

Activities

1. Provision of budgeted funds to cover programme costs by both Governments of Tanzania and Japan.

2. Implementing In-country training in ethics to Public Service selected employees.
3. Trained employees train other employees at their work places.
4. Monitoring the training of other employees at work places.

0.4 PROJECT ACHIEVEMENT

0.4.1 Inputs

The project's inputs involved one Japanese expert, nine resource persons and trainers from Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs). The financial input from the Governments of Japan and Tanzania which were released as required are shown in the table below, the project is still in progress at the time of evaluation.

Government	Y E A R S				Total
	2000/2001	2001/2002	2002/2003	2003/2004	
Japan	62,255,750	62,240,250	72,293,600	74,743,600	271,533,200
Tanzania	5,900,000	5,680,000	5,070,000	5,070,000	21,720,000
Total	68,155,750	67,920,250	77,363,600	79,813,600	293,253,200
Expenses	11,159,540	59,039,280	77,363,600	73,532,600	221,095,020

0.4.2 Output

There were about nine course topics allocated into 50 sessions with each session lasting 1 to 2.5 hours. The evaluation reports indicated participants gained considerably from the programme in terms of additional knowledge achieved. On average over 70% of participants rated the programme as good and above.

Participants had acquired knowledge and were in the position to train others as required. They were also provided with guiding training manuals at the end of the course. They were also more equipped to make ethical decisions at their places of work. Seventy five percent (75%) of heads of institution interviewed believe the capabilities of their employees in making ethical decisions have somehow improved after attending ethics training course.

At the time of evaluating the project 350 participants from Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) had been trained up to November 2003. These trainers had in-turn trained 3,344 employees as per the feedback reports from MDAs to Public Service Management (PSM) Office. Reports from the sampled MDAs during the survey showed that trainers had trained 3,637 fellow employees. The Table below shows how many trainers were trained each year.

PROJECT OUTPUT

Title	Y E A R S				Total
	2000/2001	2001/2002	2002/2003	2003/2004	
Trained Trainers	99	95	88	68*	350
Employees trained by trainers in their offices					3,344** 3,637***

* Up to November 2003

** Feedback from MDAs to PSM

*** Consultants survey Dar es Salaam, Tanga and Mbeya

0.4.3 Purpose

0.4.3.1 Training Sessions

The project purpose was to create a pool of ethics trainers in MDA. List of registered participants for the course indicated that they came from 18 Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, 20 Regional and Districts Offices, 8 Agencies, 3 Independent Zanzibar. Some MDAs did provide the necessary requirement for training other employees in the office environment. These MDAs include 12 Ministries, President's Office, 16 Regions and 3 Agencies.

0.4.4 The Overall Goal

The overall goal envisaged providing effective and efficient public services delivery to the public.

Sampled clients of public services feel there is a decline in unethical practices and productivity at work places is on the increase. Seventy five percent (75%) of sampled heads of organizations believed the overall goal has somehow been achieved, but more employees need to be trained for a better achievement.

0.5 PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

0.5.1 Activities of the Project

0.5.1.1 Training Sessions

At the time of the evaluation 15 courses had been organized compared to the target of 20. It is believed that all 20 courses will be completed at the end of the project.

Target participants trained at the Tanzania Public Service College and National Central Library, the venues of training programme, were 350 in number.

The courses include promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, Understanding Public Service Reforms, responsibilities and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to others, Legal Frame work and Gender Issues and HIV/AIDS.

0.5.1.2 Trainers Train Others

Trained employees had trained 3,344 employees at work places as reported by Public Service Management (PSM) office. The consultant's survey on selected MDAs mainly in Dar es Salaam, Tanga and Mbeya regions showed that 3,637 employees were trained in offices.

0.5.1.3 Japanese Expert

The medium/short term training adviser from Japan was available to give technical and management advice. He assisted in the project planning, prepared syllabus for the course, reviewed it during implementation and made valuable recommendations. He also assisted in both management and project coordination in PSM office and Tanzania Public Service College where training sessions were held.

0.5.1.4 Monitoring and Management

Public Service Management (PSM) Office communicated with MDAs for selection of the required participants and requested feedbacks from MDAs as to the continuous training of employees at places of work. PSM conducted a survey in 2002 to assess training activities in MDAs by trained trainers who were expected to train others. Problems and some achievements were identified. PSM, TPSC and JICA were involved in managing the project activities.

TPSC monitored the training through daily and end of course evaluations which are documented in the final evaluation report on each course.

0.5.2 Project Ownership

The projects' human resource requirements were to a great extent provided by the Tanzania Government.

The Tanzania Government financial contribution to the project is about 7%. This financial participation by the Government is indicative of the country's desire and capability in the ownership of the project.

0.6 EVALUATION RESULTS

0.6.1 Relevance

The overall goal of the project falls within the on-going Public Service Reform Programme which stresses the need for providing quality services to the Tanzanian Public. Secondly the implementation of the Ethics Training Course is within the priority areas as set out in Japanese Assistance for Tanzania. Hence, the overall goal of the project is relevant both in the context of Tanzania needs and Japan's Development Assistance policy.

0.6.2 Effectiveness

A pool of 350 employees in MDAs is trained in ethics. More than half of the sampled heads of MDAs who responded to the question name feel trained trainers have transferred their knowledge and skills to fellow employees at work places. Consultants' survey on sampled MDAs shows 3,637 trained employees and PSM data on all MDAs indicates 3,344 trained employees.

Trained trainers also confessed the ethics training was constructive and educative. Given that there is a pool of employees in MDAs capable of training others and that they are doing so indicate the project implementation is effective.

0.6.3 Efficiency

Nearly 70% of the trained trainers rated the overall management of the project activities to be quite sufficient and efficient but 54% felt the period provided (2 weeks) was short. The evaluation study has shown that the project activities link with other activities supported by other donor agencies and the Government of Tanzania.

On the strength of the above study results, it can be concluding that the overall project implementation was efficient.

0.6.4 Impact

There is a common thing among many, including representative of Public Service clients that signs of good Public services delivery can be seen in some MDAs whose employees have received training in ethics.

Majority of sampled stakeholders (75%) of those who responded to questionnaires think the impact of the project to the achievement of the overall goal is yet to be fully felt-given that only a small number of employees have so far received training in ethics.

However, the conclusion is that for those MDAs whose employees have been trained in ethics, the project has brought a positive impact.

0.6.5 Sustainability

It has been established through the survey findings that, the overall government policy, policies and future plans of sampled MDAs are supportive to the project activities.

A workable and lasting project management system has been established. Regular formal retraining of trained trainers will remain to be a prerequisite for them to be able to disseminate the knowledge and skills gained. In the absence of a specific budget to cater for the ethics training there has been no organized system of procuring equipment/facilities for conducting continuous ethics training in the MDAS.

0.6.6 Conclusion

It can be concluded from the above that in terms of the management systems established and the support in plans and policies, the project is sustainable base on the other evaluation results given. The society at large is in support of the Government effort to stamp out unethical practices in all public institutions.

0.6.6.1 Factors Promoting Sustainability and Impact

(1) Factors Concerning to Planning

Project stake holders be involved in the design and planning stages to enable them be fully aware of the importance of the project from the start.

(2) Factors concerning Implementation Process

Historical inbuilt cooperation between the Government of Japan and PSMO, deployment of Japanese expert who assisted in 'the management and coordination of the project activities, involvement of JICA staff in Tanzania and monitoring/follow-up measures by the PSMO and TPSC made the project implementation possible.

In order to attain a more sustainable project implementation process the following measures need to be taken:

- Involvement of all stakeholders in regular review of the project.
- Treasury to introduce a budget line to cater for ethics training
- Introducing ethics training in higher and lower institutions of learning.
- Creating awareness on ethics amongst high ranking officials by giving them training.
- Emphasizing maximum use of in-house resources in ethics training by MDAS.
- Improving the welfare of Public Civil Servants in terms of better working conditions, facilities and remuneration.
- Government issuing a directive making it compulsory for the MDAs to institute ethics training in their annual operations.

0.6.6.2 Factors inhibiting Sustainability and Impact

(1) Factors Concerning to Planning stage

- Guidelines on selection of employees to be trained as trainers were either not adequately covered to MDAs or intentionally not adhered to. As it turned out later some trainers did not have the time to train others. Or fill in the questionnaires forms for the survey.
- Ensured availability of necessary funds and equipment facilities to conduct training at work places continuously was overlooked from the launching of the project.

(2) *Factors concerning to the implementation process*

- Main factors which impede the project implementation process include:
- Lack of commitment and cooperation by the top management/leadership
- Wrong selection of trainers who do not find time to train others.

0.6.7 Conclusion

The project is relevant and valuable for the Government of Tanzania in its quest to have a workforce that can provide effective and efficient public services delivery to the people of Tanzania.

Both trainers and trainees have confessed an improvement in their understanding of public services ethics. Most of the employees who have received training have become more accountable, productive and customer oriented. A core pool of ethics trainers has been established and given adequate time, funds, facilities, regular retraining and commitment from top leadership; it should be possible for the trained trainers to implement continuous ethics training at work places.

0.7 RECOMMENDATIONS AND LESSONS LEARNED

1. For Tanzania Government

- To continue with the effort being made in financial contribution to the project up to its final completion in 2004.
- Top management in MDAs to show enough commitment and cooperation.
- To select right employees to be trained as trainers who will ultimately be available to carry out training in ethics at work places continuously.
- To ensure that management in MDAs provide regular feedback reports to PSM office and regard ethics training as an obligation.

2. For JICA

- To continue project funding and management till the end of the project period.

0.7.1 Lessons Learned

1. For Tanzania Government

- (i) In planning and implementation of such project all stakeholders to be fully involved so that the overall goal will be fully achieved.
- (ii) Funds should be budgeted to cater for the project's full implementation and sustainability.
- (iii) A broad management and monitoring systems of the project be installed and known at the planning stage.
- (iv) All institutions involved in project implementation to keep relevant records of project's vital information.

- (v) Involvement and cooperation of top decision makers in the project areas both at the planning and implementation stages are crucial for the projects to be successful.
- (vi) Giving the budgetary constraints faced by the Government of Tanzania, technical and financial support from donors will greatly enhance implementation of programmes requiring substantial amounts of funding. Thus the following projects being contemplated may require these supports.
 - Training of top management in ethics in the MDAs including Members of Parliament to be to achieve fully the overall goal of the Ethics Training Programme.
 - To roll out the Ethics Training Programme to the up-coming generations in primary schools, secondary schools and other higher institutions of learning.
 - Design special Ethics Training Manual for specific MDAs.

2. *For JICA*

- (i) Timely dispatch of experts at the planning and project implementation stages will continue to be an important factor in future project.
- (ii) Awareness in the differences in fiscal years of both countries to ensure inflow of financial support is smooth and timely.

1. INTRODUCTION

Implementation of the In-country Training Course on Public service Ethics, the project being evaluated started in the Japanese Fiscal Year (JFY) 2000 to 2004.

The programme is being carried out jointly between the Government of Japan through the Japan International Co-operation Agency (JICA) Tanzania office which is providing the technical and financial support and the Government of Tanzania (GoT) conducting the course and co-ordinating it through the Tanzania Public Service College (TPSC) and Public Service Management Office (PSMO) both in the President's office in Dar es Salaam.

The course was envisaged to train a total of 500 participants at a rate of 100 participants per year from Government Ministries, Departments and Agencies who will after the course return to their employment and train others.

JICA commissioned TISCO Consultants and Associates Limited in January 2004 to conduct the programme evaluation study.

2. OUTLINE OF EVALUATION STUDY

2.1 OBJECTIVE OF EVALUATION

The objective of the study is to evaluate the Public Service Ethics Training Programme with a view to improving its planning and management and also to enhancing effectiveness of similar projects to be carried out in the future.

2.2 EVALUATION TEAM

Members of the evaluation team are from TISCO Consultants and Associates Limited and comprise Mr. Juma Ngwembanoy an experienced consultant and Ms. Veronica Msinjili, the Team Leader as shown below:

Name	Assignment	Organisation/Title
Veronica Msinjili	Team Leader	TISCO – Principal Consultant
Juma Ngwembanoy	Data Analyst	TISCO – Senior Consultant

2.3 METHOD OF EVALUATION STUDY

The evaluation study looked into recorded documents of discussion between representatives of JICA and the GoT, as well as the evaluation reports of each course on the ethics training programme. Discussions with the Tanzania Public Service College authorities and with the Co-ordinator at the Public Service Management also formed part of the evaluation study.

A Project Design Matrix (PDM_E) and an Evaluation Grid were prepared prior to the field work to guide the consultants in the preparation of field work questionnaires and later analyse findings and compile evaluation results.

2.3.1 *Project Design Matrix for Evaluation (PDM_E)*

The PDM_E that was prepared for the purpose of the evaluation of the ethics training programme is shown in *Appendix 2:A*.

2.3.2 *Evaluation Grid*

The evaluation grid was developed based on the PDM_E and outlined in the format of evaluation grid. The evaluation grid accommodates the evaluation criteria of relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability of the project.

The evaluation study was conducted in accordance with the information that is available in the evaluation grid.

The evaluation grid is presented in *Appendix 2:B*.

2.3.3 *Designing and Administering Questionnaires*

As per the agreed Technical Proposal TISCO was required to cover a representative sample of 100 trained trainers as well as those who were trained by trainers: Dar es Salaam (80), Mbeya (10) and Tanga (10).

TISCO deemed it imperative to get the views of other stakeholders and include them in the evaluation study. In view of the above, TISCO prepared and administered nine (9) types of questionnaires to retrieve the necessary information/data from a broad spectrum of respondents. The questionnaires were prepared on the basis of the PDM_E and Evaluation Grid approved by JICA earlier.

A total of 176 questionnaires were distributed as follows: Trained trainers (100), trainees (23), Heads of Departments/Agencies (40), Resource Persons (3), Donor Agencies (2), representatives of clients of Public Services (2), PSMO (1), TPSC (1) JICA (1) and others (3).

Appendix 2:C is a set of questionnaires administered.

A total of 121 questionnaires were completed and returned to TISCO giving a success rate of nearly 70%; *Appendix 2:C*. Seventy (70) Trainers and twenty three (23) trainees completed and returned the questionnaires.

Despite extension of time, it was not possible to have all the questionnaires completed for a number of reasons; some respondents could not find time to complete the same because of the tight daily work schedules, lack of commitment (by few), and others were either on official working trips or had been transferred to other places outside the stations. *Appendix 2:E* highlights main responses analysis results.

2.4. PERIOD

The final agreement for the project's implementation between the two Governments' representatives took place in Dar es Salaam in September 2000. The remaining part of the year 2000 was used for project planning and preparation. The actual training of Trainers started in January 2001. At the time of evaluating the project the training however was still in progress and the consultants have training data up to November, 2003. Hence, the project period being evaluated is 2000 to 2003.

3. OUTLINE OF PROJECT

3.1 PROJECT BACKGROUND

The implementation of the Ethics Training Programme in Tanzania emanates from the Public Service Reform Programme(PSRP) which commenced in the country in the year 2000 and planned to end in the year 2011.

The overall purpose of PSRP is to support the attainment of high economic growth rate and ensure that delivery of quality services within the priority sectors conforms to Public expectation for value satisfaction and relevance.

Hence the Government of the United Republic of Tanzania envisages to conduct the course with the support of the technical co-operation scheme of the Government of Japan under JICA's In-country Training.

The course will be held four times a year from Japanese fiscal year (JFY) 2000 to JFY 2004 with provision for annual consultation between the two Governments. The course was still in progress even at the time of evaluating the project and the Government of Japan has released all the required support for the JFY 2003.

3.2 PROJECT SUMMARY

The frame-work is as shown below:

Project Title:	In-country Training Course on Public Service Ethics
Executing Agency:	The Civil Service Department now Public Service Management (President's Office)
Funding Agency:	Japan International Co-operation Agency (JICA)
Target Groups:	Capable employees from Ministries, Departments and Agencies
Target Area:	United Republic of Tanzania
Duration:	5 years (2000-2004)

Project Purpose:

1. To have a pool of trainers in ethics in the Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) who will in turn continuously train other fellow employees at work places, facilitated by MDAs strengthened capacities.

Expected Output

1. Trained employees perception on ethics (corruption) is understood.
2. Trained employees have acquired skills to train fellow employees on Public Service Ethics in their respective offices.
3. Enhance trained employees capabilities in making ethical decisions.
4. Strengthened ethics training capacities of Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs).

Activities

1. Provision of budgeted funds to cover programme costs by both Governments of Tanzania and Japan.
2. Implementing In-country training in ethics to Public Service selected employees.
3. Trained employees train other employees at their work places.
4. Monitoring the training of other employees at work places.

4. PROJECT ACHIEVEMENT

4.1 INPUTS

The projects inputs are given in *Appendix 4:A*.

4.2 OUTPUT

The outputs of the project are detailed in *Appendix 4:B*.

4.3 PROJECT PURPOSE

The project's purpose as achieved during the project implementation is shown in the table form below together with the indicators tested for achievement. (**Table 4.1**).

Table 4.1: **Project Purpose**

Narrative Summary	Indicator	Summary of Achievements
To create a pool of ethics trainers in MDAs who will continuously conduct ethics training at work places.	1. List of MDAs covered.	List of registered participants from the Tanzania Public Service College who attended the programme indicated that participants came from 18 Ministries, Presidents Office, Vice President's Office, Prime minister's Office, 20 Regional and District Offices, 8 Agencies, 3 Departments and Zanzibar.
	2. Ethics training capacities of MDAs	As part of strengthening their training capacities some of the MDAs have provided the necessary equipment/facilities like computers, stationeries, related booklets on ethics, training manuals, venues etc.
	3. The number of trainers and trainees in MDAS.	The list of participants from the Public Service College showed that 350 employees were trained in ethics from January 2001 to November 2003 compared to the target of 500. In some MDAs trainers have not been able to train others either for lack of time or facilities or commitment by the top leaders.
		A list from the Public Service Management showing responses on number of trainees from 12 Ministries, President's Office, 16 Regions and 3 Agencies gave a total of 3,344 trainees from April 2001 to October 2003. The consultants survey of selected Ministries Departments and Agencies in the three regions: i.e. Dar es Salaam, Mbeya and Tanga gave a total trainees of 3,637.

THE PROJECT'S OVERALL GOAL ACHIEVEMENT

This is indicated in table form as follows (Table 4.2).

Table 4.2: Summary of Achievement

Narrative Summary	Indicator	Summary of Achievements
<p>Overall Goal:</p> <p>To enable the Government of Tanzania provide effective and efficient public services delivery to the people of Tanzania.</p>	<p>1. Rate of Corruption 2. Productivity</p>	<p>Sampled clients of public services feel there is a decline in corrupt practices and productivity at work places is on the increase as employees remunerations are based on performance results. It was confirmed during the survey that delays in the dispensation of justice in some law enforcing organs has been reduced after its employees had attended training in ethics; they have now become more productive and accountable. Seventy five percent (75%) of the sampled heads of organizations (<i>Appendix 2:E</i>) believe the overall goal has somehow been achieved but continued training to cover more employees and more effort to change the attitude and behaviour of most civil servants are needed to have the overall goal fully achieved.</p>

5. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

5.1 ACTIVITIES OF THE PROJECT

Activities that took place under the project are shown in *Appendix 5:A*.

5.2 PROJECT MONITORING

On the strength of the following steps taken by the course organizers, the consultants are satisfied with the overall monitoring of the project implementation.

To be able to monitor achievements of output, the course was evaluated on daily basis and finally there was an overall evaluation at the end of the programme.

The daily evaluation reflected the views of the participants on everyday basis. The evaluation was based on Mood Barometer evaluation method which attempts to measure individual appreciation of topics covered each day, through depicting different moods, smiling, indifference or frowning in relation to what the individual has gained, what participants have learnt from each other and whether the course materials were appropriate.

When there was a need to make changes, actions were taken timely. Counseling is done to some of the facilitators and others replaced by more competent and experienced trainers as it happened for a resource person on corruption who was replaced immediately following complaints from the course participants.

In the final evaluation participants responded to structured questions followed by general comments.

Both evaluations helped to determine what participants have achieved from the training.

In monitoring the project's purpose a survey was conducted in 2002 by the Public Service Management to get the extent of training activities taking place in the different institutions (MDAs) and problems being encountered. MDAs also gave feedbacks to PSM on the number of employees trained at work places.

5.3 PROJECT MANAGEMENT

The Civil Service Department now known as Public Service Management (PSM) in the President's Office is responsible for overall management of the project.

Information on qualifications of required participants from MDAs's is provided by the PSM. The training sessions are handled by the Tanzania Public Service College (TPSC) who plan the time table, provide resource persons and coordinate the entire training sessions including report preparations and general administration of the course.

JICA Tanzania office is also involved in the management of the project through feedbacks and other backstopping activities. The medium and short term Japanese expert assisted in facilitating project activities both at the management level in PSM office and coordinating the training courses at the TPS College.

5.4 PROJECT OWNERSHIP

The Project human resource requirements were to a great part provided by the Tanzania Government, i.e. local Tanzania experts were mostly involved in the implementation of the project. The Japanese expert was mainly involved in the initial year of project planning and implementation, thereafter he visited the project for short periods to give required technical advice in management and training courses.

Secondly the Tanzania Government contributed financially to the project. On average financial contribution was about 7% and the budget allocation for 2003 is still available for use as the project is still in progress. This financial participation by the Tanzania Government is indicative of the country's seriousness, desire and capability in the ownership of the project.

6. EVALUATION RESULTS

6.1 EVALUATION CRITERIA

Evaluation criteria of the project include:

- Relevance
- Effectiveness
- Efficiency
- Impact
- Sustainability

6.1.1 *Relevance*

- **In the Context of Tanzania's Needs**

The overall goal of the project is consistent with Tanzania Public Services Policy (TPSP). The TPSP among others, stresses on the need for providing quality public civil services to the Tanzania public and this is greatly dependent on the deployment of ethical public servants at work places. Reform Programmes are being implemented in the Central Government and local Government Authorities with a view to enhancing public services delivery to the public.

- **Relevance to Occupation**

Out of seventy (70) trainers who commented on the relevance of the training to their occupation, 47% believed the relevance was very good, 40%, excellent, 9% good and 4% fair (*Appendix 2:E*). Eighty percent (80%) of the trainees who responded to the specific question on the relevance thought the overall goals of the project is consistent with the TPSP. (*Appendix 2:D*).

- **In the context of Japan's Development Assistance Policy**

The overall goal and project purposes are consistent with Japan's Development Assistance Policy for Tanzania. The policy spells out priority areas which comprise Health, Education, Infrastructure (water and roads) and support in Public Sector Reform Programme (PSRP). The implementation of Ethics Training Programme among others, disseminates knowledge and techniques which the Government of Japan has transferred to the Government of Tanzania.

Therefore the overall goal is considered relevant both in the context of Tanzania needs and Japan Development Assistant Policy.

6.1.2 Effectiveness

6.1.2.1 Project Purpose:

To create a pool of ethics trainers in the Ministries, Departments and Agencies who will continuously conduct ethics training at work places.

6.1.2.2 Results

The number of trained trainers as reported by the PSMO during the period from January 2001 to November 2003 reads 350 compared to the set out target of 500 which gives a success rate of 70%. See also Section 4.2 and *Appendix 4:B*. The number of employees who have been trained at work places as provided by the same office is 3,344; this is based on the reports from some MDAs submitted to the PSMO covering 30 MDAs including 15 regions. A higher number is envisaged when the rest of MDAs submit their reports.

The number of trainees as reported by the trainers and some MDAs during the field work as shown in Table 4.1 on Project Purpose is 3,637 and distributed as follows:

Place/MDA	No of Trainees
Ministry of Defence/JKT (all over the country)	2,000
Tanga Region	237
President's Office, Planning & Privatisation	151
Ministry of Science, Technology and Higher Education	120
Ministry of Communication and Transport	45
Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Co-operation	39
Public Service Commission	32
Law Reform Commission	28
Ethics Secretariat	15
Ministry of Labour, Youth & Sports Development	970
Total for MDAs which responded	3,637

Other MDAs stated they had conducted training to their staff but failed to indicate the number of employees trained.

The Consultants interview with some trainers and trainees revealed the following main problems.

- Lack of funds, facilities and training materials to facilitate continuous training by the trained trainers; a trainer based in Dar es Salaam complained that he has never been facilitated to conduct training.
- Some of the trained trainers holding high positions are pre-occupied with routine office work against tight schedules and have no time to spare for training. The implication from the above is that availability of the trained trainers to train others

seems to have been overlooked right from the time of their selection when the project was being launched.

- Lack of commitment by the Management/Leadership. In some instances a noticeable lack of commitment by the management could be seen; some of the heads of Departments/Agencies who provided employees to be trained as trainers have never seen the Ethics Training Manual; a trainer complained that ever since he submitted his report of the training he had received from the TPSC to his head, he has received no response on how the training of fellow employees can start.

Despite the extreme cases cited above, most of the trainers interviewed admitted the Ethics Training Programme was constructive and educative and some of the MDAs did provide the necessary facilities as well as co-operation in training fellow employees. Over 60% of the sampled Heads of Departments interviewed (16) feel trained trainers have transferred knowledge and skills to fellow employees at work places. (*Appendix 2:E*).

The Consultants believe that a pool of ethics trainers in some MDAs has been established and given adequate time, funds, facilities/equipment, further training of some trainers and commitment from the top leadership, it should be possible for the trained trainers to execute continuous ethics training at work places.

Based on the above evaluation results and comments, it is believed the project's implementation was effective.

6.1.3 *Efficiency*

Areas examined include:

- Adequacy of quantity and quality of inputs
- Timing of inputs
- Appropriateness of the Training Programme
- Efficiency of the Management System
- Factors that have facilitated/and or obstructed the efficiency of the project implementation.

Details on the type and quantity of inputs provided under the project have already been covered in *Section 4.1* and *Appendix 4:A*.

- Ninety seven percent (97%) of the sampled trainers (68) think the local experts were of the right caliber and adequate in number and that most experts mastered the topics they were presenting. Training methodology and facilitation was rated to be 53% very good, 12% excellent, 30% good, 4% fair and 1% poor as per *Appendix 2:E*.
- The expert from Japan was dispatched as scheduled. He worked full time in the year 2000 and from thereon stayed for one month per annum in the following two years i.e. 2001-2002.

- Funds from JICA office were provided and received timely. The facilities and equipment provided under the project are being used adequately.
- Based on the views of the course organizers, local inputs i.e. resource persons, trainees for the course, personnel from the PSMO, funds and facilities were provided as planned.

Sixty eight percent (68%) of the trainers rated the overall management of the project activities to be quite sufficient and efficient but more than half (54%) believed the period provided for the course (2 weeks) was short and wanted it to be raised to 3-4 weeks arguing that some of the topics were presented very hurriedly providing no room for discussion. Resource persons interviewed affirmed their full satisfaction with the project management and were given adequate information about the course well in advance to prepare themselves.

Participants (trainers) were generally satisfied with the course contents but wanted additional topics to be included namely: Good Governance, Civil Service Act and Regulation, Public Finance and Procurement Acts of 2001 as tools of fighting against corruption, Scheme of Service for Public Servants and communication skills. Guidelines for selection of participants (employees) to be trained as trainers were given by the PSMO and generally adhered to by some of the MDAs. We have pointed out earlier that some trainers seem to have been wrongly selected as they later on could not find time to train others due to pressure of work contrary to the project's purpose which requires them to train continuously.

The Consultants survey has revealed that some donor agencies in collaboration with the Government of Tanzania are implementing programmes which support Public Service Reform Programme, accountability, transparency, human rights and democracy and how to combat corruption. Donor agencies from Sweden, Canada, Denmark, Finland, Norway and Netherlands jointly support the on-going Legal Reform Programme. In the light of the above findings the project activities are appropriate and adequately link with other activities initiated/supported by other donor Agencies and the Government of Tanzania.

The efficiency of the project is attributed to the following reported factors:

- Historical long time co-operation between PSMO and the Government of Japan.
- Issuance of budgeted funds, equipment and facilities to facilitate the project implementation.
- Counseling given to some of the facilitators and immediate replacement of those who were found to be incompetent.
- Deployment of advisors/experts from Japan.
- Some MDAs providing in-house training facilities adequately.
- Follow-up measures taken by the course organizers during the project implementation.

The main factors that were reported by participants to have obstructed more efficient implementation of the project are as follows:

- Handouts including Training Manual written in English language instead of Kiswahili rendering it difficult for some participants to comprehend the course contents.
- Some incompetent resource persons who failed to deliver as expected.
- Lack of commitment/co-operation by the top management.
- Training manual is too bulky and needs to be summarized.
- Training manuals delivered late to the MDAs.
- Tight schedule/short course period leading to hurried presentation of course topics by the facilitators with no time provided for discussion.

Apart from the above reported incidences obstructing the smooth implementation of the project it can be concluded that on the whole the project implementation was efficient.

6.1.4 Impact

Areas examined in this section include: achievement of the overall goal of the project, factors that influenced negatively/and or positively and positive/negative impact resulting from the project implementation.

Majority of the sampled stakeholders interviewed and those who responded to the questionnaires think that the impact of the project to the achievement of the overall goal has yet to be fully felt. Seventy five percent (75%) of the heads of organizations and trainers as shown in *Appendix 2:E* feels the overall goal has just somehow been achieved on account of the following factors:

- The number of public civil servants who have received training in ethics reported to be 3,344 from all MDAs is far below the total number of employees working in the central and local Governments given by the PSMO; i.e. 266,732 (as of November 2003 excluding those who have been terminated) i.e. around 1% of the total work force. A number of MDAs have yet to conduct ethics training due to either limited funds allocated for the training component or mere lack of commitment by the management. In some MDAs ethics training seems to be marginalized when it is just mentioned in the introduction during the weekly meetings where development issues are discussed and given more attention. There was a complaint from some of the trainers that management is just interested in the output and not in the delivery of inputs (funds and facilities) to facilitate continuous training in ethics by the trainers.
- Most of the employees who have participated in ethics training are not decision makers and can thus hardly exert enough influence in the delivery of ethical public services at work places.

Despite the above, there is a consensus among many that in the MDAs where training in ethics has been conducted, employees have become more customer oriented and signs of good public services delivery can be seen.

Follow-up, monitoring and remedial measures being taken by the course organizers through evaluation of the course contents by the participants, discussion, mini-survey on workplace Ethics Training in the MDAs and on the spot observation of the training activities have greatly enhanced the quality and coverage of the training provided.

Representative clients of public service contacted like the Confederation of Tanzania Industries (CTI), and the Tanzania Chamber of Commerce, Industry and Agriculture (TCCIA) commented that services delivery in the MDAs is improving though there is still a long way to go to realize the overall goal.

It was reported by the Industrial Court that delays in the dispensation of justice has somehow been minimized because employees who attended training in ethics have become more accountable.

A growth rate of 5% in the number of complaints against corruption presented to the PCB by individuals and MDAs between 2000 and 2002 signifies increased public awareness on corruption and unethical practices. People are discussing corruption openly and raising alarms when they sense problems.

Further positive impact is expected as some MDAs have introduced orientation courses for new recruits wherein training in ethics is included. Another fact is that training in ethics is now a hot issue and falls within the Government Public Service Reform Programme which has attracted assistance from donor agencies.

One of the signs of secondary or indirect impact resulting from the project implementation is that participants of ethics training have developed courage to raise/explain their grievances at work places during the training sessions.

On the whole it can be concluded that in the MDAs whose employees have been trained in ethics the project has brought a positive impact.

6.1.5 Sustainability

The project sustainability has been evaluated on the basis of the following main factors:

- Sustainability from Technical Aspects;
 - Sustainability from Institutional Aspects;
 - Sustainability from Financial Aspects;
 - Sustainability from Policy Aspects,
 - Social and Cultural Sustainability;
 - Factors that influence the Sustainability
-
- **Sustainability From Technical Aspects**

Sustainability from the technical aspects, among others requires that those who have been imparted with the knowledge and skills to train others at work places maintain their capacity and continue with the training role effectively and efficiently.

As mentioned elsewhere in this report, sixty three percent (63%) of the sampled heads of organizations are convinced that trained trainers have really transferred their knowledge and skills to fellow workers but due to the constraints described under *Section 6.1.2* and given the number of total public civil servants mentioned in *Section 6.1.4*, it will be difficult for them (trainers) to disseminate their knowledge and skills more effectively. Formal retraining of the trainers is essential to ensure sustainability of skills and knowledge obtained.

Our review of reports compiled by the PSMO and interviews with some trained trainers reveal some problems similar to those covered under *Section 6.1.3* and which constitute major contributing factors for the failure (by some of the trainers) to effect ethics training at work places namely:

- Lack of leadership commitment/interest characterized by failure to provide adequate training materials and indecision in approving ethics training programme/budget submitted by the trainers.
- Absence of training budget/funds.
- Misuse of funds allocated for training.

Weekly, quarterly and annual meetings involving senior officers who have received training in ethics, supplementing financial resources required for training by funds from other donors and use of in-house training facilities have to some extent enhanced the project sustainability related to the transfer of knowledge and skills.

Only between 37% and 38% of the trained trainers and heads of MDAs reported full utilization of the training manual. The rest i.e. 62% to 63% represent respondents who think the training manual is just somehow being utilized or not utilized at all due to more or less similar reasons given under section 6.1.2: time and money not allocated, training manual not delivered in time, limited funds to conduct training and training manual written in foreign English language rendering it difficult for some to understand the contents. Some MDAs, for good intention, have translated the documents into Kiswahili but mis-interpretation of some course contents can not be overruled. We suggest that the PSMO/TPSC should involve the National Kiswahili Council (BAKITA) to translate relevant course documents with a view to maintaining consistency and avoid perversion of the contents. Authentic translated course documents are very vital especially for low cadre employees with low formal educational qualification.

• **Sustainability from Institutional Aspects**

As described in *Section 5.3* on Project Management, the Public Service Management in the President's Office manages/coordinates the project activities in collaboration with MDAs and Tanzania Public Services College.

It was confirmed during the field survey that in the absence of a specific budget for ethics training, there has been no organized system of procuring the equipment and working tools for conducting ethics training at work places; instead, MDAs have to finance the same from own sources. Despite this weakness, it is believed that a workable and lasting project management system involving PSM, TPSC and MDAs has been established.

- **Sustainability From Financial Aspects**

The Central Government as well the local Government authorities face budgetary constraints and do not maintain specific budgets for ethics training. The PSMO and some MDAs are implementing remedial measures which include, among others:

- Conducting training using in-house office facilities;
- Implementing residential workshops and seminars, incorporating topics on ethics during the presentation of other themes;
- Retraining of the trainers outside the country;
- Soliciting funds from other donors to supplement meager financial resources for ethics training.

Without underestimating the aforementioned measures, a more feasible strategy to attain institutional sustainability is for the Treasury to create a separate budget for ethics training.

- **Sustainability From Policy Aspects**

In the light of the following findings, the overall government policy, policies and future plans of PSM and sampled MDAs are supportive to the Project.

- PCB is charged with among other things, enforcing ethics and anti-corrupt practices at work places.
- Implementation of the Local Government Reform Programme and Public Service Reform Programme which ultimately aims at improving public services delivery.
- Issues of Public Service Ethics now included in some of the MDAs Training Programmes.

The Central Tender Board has recently advertised for Consultancy Services for Public Awareness on Public Service Delivery Improvement in MDAs being carried out as part of the Public Service Reform Programme Implementation.

- Ministries planning to incorporate ethics training component in their future budgets.

TPSC has introduced regular programmes in ethics training and persuades MDAs to sponsor their employees to attend such programmes.

- The PSMO planning to implement/implementing the following programmes.
 - Service improvement through installation of Reform Management System;
 - Further retraining of trainers in ethics and equipping them with the necessary facilities;

Seminars/workshops planned to be conducted within and outside Dar es Salaam by incorporating training institutions like Nyegezi and Mbegani Folk Development Colleges (FDCs).

- Carrying out baseline study.

- **Sustainability From Social and Cultural Aspects**

Ethics are culturally constructed in a given society like Tanzania. For example culturally, people would show appreciation for a service offered by a token gift even if the service being provided is one's duty to do so. These token gifts genuinely given could be perceived as bribe or corrupt action in our cosmopolitan society. In the public service code of Ethics and Conduct only gifts of minimal value are allowed. However, token gifts of up to TShs 50,000 are provided in the Public Leaders Code of Ethics Act. No. 13 of 1995 as amended. Gifts above this ceiling have to be declared by leaders and handed over to the employer. On the other hand, cases where some public civil servants initiate gifts in return for services they provide continue to surface. It has been established through our meeting with the Director of Culture Development and field observation that it is increasingly becoming more acceptable, socially and culturally for the public to discuss corruption and unethical practices freely.

Despite the acceptability, there seems to be lack of immediate remedial measures and safe avenues for the people to raise their grievances. The Government is in the process of developing a mechanism for protecting people who provide information on corruption.

6.2 CONCLUSIONS

In view of the above the society at large is in support of the Government's effort to stamp out vices partly through the implementation of Ethics Training Programme and with this determination by both society and Government the project's overall positive results will continue to be felt.

6.2.1 Factors Promoting Sustainability and Impact

(1) *Factors Concerning to Planning*

Project stake holders be involved in the design and planning stages to enable them be fully aware of the importance of the project from the start.

(2) *Factors Concerning to Implementation Process*

Historical inbuilt cooperation between the Government of Japan and PSMO, deployment of two (2) Japanese experts who assisted in the preparation management and coordination of the project activities, involvement of JICA staff in Tanzania and monitoring/follow-up measures by the PSMO and TPSC made the project implementation possible.

In order to attain a more sustainable project implementation process the following measures need to be taken:

- Involvement of stake holders in regular review of the project.
- Treasury to introduce a budget line to cater for ethics training
- Introducing ethics training in higher and lower institutions of learning.
- Creating awareness on ethics amongst high ranking officials by giving them training.
- Emphasizing maximum use of in-house resources in ethics training by MDAS.
- Improving the welfare of Public Civil Servants in terms of better working conditions, facilities and remuneration.
- Government issuing a directive making it compulsory for the MDAs to institute ethics training in their annual operational plans.

6.2.2 Factors inhibiting Sustainability and Impact

(1) Factors Concerning to planning stage

- Guidelines on selection of employees to be trained as trainers were either not adequately conveyed to the MDAs or intentionally not adhered to. As it turned out later some trainers did not have the time to train others.
- Ensured availability of the necessary funds and equipments facilities to conduct ethics training at work places continuously was overlooked just from the launching of the project.

(2) Factors concerning to the implementation process.

- Main factors which impede the project implementation process include:
- Lack of commitment and cooperation by the top management/leadership
- Wrong selection of trainers who do not find time to train others.

6.2.3 Conclusion

The project is relevant and valuable for the Government of Tanzania in its quest to have a work force which can provide effective and efficient public services delivery to the people of Tanzania.

Both trainers and trainees have affirmed that their understanding of public service ethics has greatly been enhanced and working capabilities 'somehow' improved. A pool of core trained trainers has been established in the MDAs but given the small number of employees who have so far received ethics training at work places the trainers have yet to be utilized effectively.

Financial support from the Government of Japan which also provided an expert/advisor, management and monitoring of the project activities by the PSMO and TPSC, co-operation extended by the MDAs in selecting employees to be trained and supervision of training at work places (for some MDAs) have to a greater extent led to an appreciable level of success.

Given the actual number of employees who have received training in ethics compared to the total number of Public Civil Servants, there is a long way to go in order to have the overall goal of the project fully achieved. Main identified problems which impede project implementation include:

- Lack of commitment by some of the MDAs Chief Executives,
- Absence of a special budget line to cater for ethics training activities;
- Wrong selection of some employees right from the inception of the project, who were trained as trainers but are now unable to train fellow employees due to pressure of work, i.e. they do not have the time to spare for ethics training.
- Under-utilization of existing facilities in some of the MDAs for ethics training and over-emphasis on external resources.

Retraining of existing trained trainers who are, and still will be available to train others is essential to ensure sustainability of the skills and knowledge they have obtained through the Ethics Training Programme.

7. RECOMMENDATIONS AND LESSONS LEARNED

7.1 RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1.1 *Recommendations for Tanzania Government*

As the project results are showing some encouraging signs of achievement it is important that the project continues up to its completion and the role of the Government should be:

- To continue with the effort being made in financial contribution up to its final completion in 2004.
- TOP management in MDAs to show enough commitment and cooperation in the implementation of the project in the remaining years and thereafter.
- MDAs management to select the right employees to be trained as trainers who will ultimately be available to carry out the ethics training at work places continuously.
- To ensure that the management in MDAs provides regular feedback reports on ethics training to PSM office as an obligation.
- Communication between Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) and PSM office somehow led to less than expected number of participants for the course. Improved communication would lead to selected participants not able to attend the course to be replaced prior to the commencement of course.

7.1.2 *Recommendations for JICA*

- To continue project funding and management till the end of the project period.

7.2 LESSONS LEARNED

7.2.1 For Tanzania Government

- (i) In planning and implementing such project a broad spectrum of stakeholders should be involved with a view to attaining to full achievement of the project overall/goal and objectives.
Recipients of the projects being implemented need to be sensitized on the importance of such projects.
- (ii) Separate budgets should be established for projects which require financial resources to supplement stakeholders' contribution; availability of funds ensures successful implementation of the projects as well as sustainability.
- (iii) A good management and monitoring system of the project implementation should be installed right from the project planning stage.

- (iv) All institutions involved in the project implementation need to keep relevant records of the projects and be able to provide vital information required by the management.
- (v) From the evaluation of the ethics Training Programme the Consultants have also learned that involvement and cooperation of the top decision makers both at planning and implementation stages are crucial for the projects to succeed.
- (vi) Given the budgetary constraints faced by the Government of Tanzania, technical and financial support from donors will greatly enhance implementation of programmes requiring substantial amounts of money thus the following projects being contemplated by the PSM may require technical and financial support from donors .
 - To roll out the Ethics Training Programme to up-coming generations in primary schools, secondary schools and higher institutions of learning.
 - Designing special Ethics Training Manual for specific MDAs like the Police Force, Ministries of Education and health etc.

7.2.2 For JICA

- (i) Timely dispatch of experts to be involved in the planning and management of the projects implementation will continue to be decisive in the implementation of future projects.
- (ii) In future differences in the fiscal years between the Government of Japan and the Government of Tanzania should be sorted out/harmonized very early to ensure a steady inflow of financial assistance during the project planning and implementation stages.

APPENDIX 2:A

PROJECT DESIGN MATRIX FOR EVALUATION

PROJECT DESIGN MATRIX FOR EVALUATION

Project Title: In-country Ethics Training Course
Target Area: Tanzania
Executive Agency: Civil Service Department/JICA
Prepared by: TISCO Team
Implementation Period: January 2001 – November 2003

Project Item Summary	Indicators	Method of Verification	Important Assumptions
Overall goal: To enable the Government of Tanzania provide effective and efficient public services delivery to the people of Tanzania	1. Rate of Corruption 2. Productivity	1. Statistics/information from Prevention of Corruption Bureau (PCB).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Government Policy on good governance and ethical values does not change.
		2. Heads/Supervisors: Clients of public services i.e. businessmen and general public.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Clients will be available and co-operative
Project Purpose: To create a pool of ethics trainers in the Ministries, Departments and Agencies who will continuously conduct ethics training at work places.	1. List of Ministries, Departments and Agencies covered; 2. Ethics training capacities of Ministries, Departments and Agencies; 3. The number of trainers and trainees in the Ministries, Departments and Agencies.	1. Documents/Reports; 1.1 Request for Japanese Government Support for Ethics Training; 2. The Record of Discussion between JICA and the Tanzania Government; 2.1 Interview at the Civil Service Department (Ethics Inspection Unit);	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Co-operation between the Governments of Japan and Tanzania continues. Co-operation between the Public Service College and Ministries/Departments and Agencies continues.

Project Item Summary	Indicators	Method of Verification	Important Assumptions
		2.2 Interview at Public Service College; 2.3 Interviews to Trainers & trainees in DSM, Mbeya and Tanga; 2.4 Ministries, departments and Agencies.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trainers and trainees will be found at their work places. • Ministries, Departments and Agencies maintain reports and will co-operate.
Outputs: 1. Trained employees's perception on corruption is understood and implemented.	1. Number of sessions and topics covered.	1. Review of Evaluation Reports on the course; 1.1 Public Service College reports; 1.2 Civil Service Department reports; 1.3 Interview Resource Persons, trainers and final trainees.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Resource Persons, Trained Trainers and Trainees will be available for contacts.
2. Trained employees have acquired skills to train fellow employees on Public Service ethics.	1. Change in knowledge and skills between pre and post training sessions.	1. Programme Evaluation Reports as above. 2. Interview Resource Persons, Trainers and final trainees.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Resource Persons Trainers and Trainees do not leave current work places/country

Project Item Summary	Indicators	Method of Verification	Important Assumptions
3. Enhance trained employees capabilities in making ethical decisions.	1. Increased discussion on ethics at work places.	1. Project Evaluation Reports 2. Interview of trained employees and departmental heads.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Employees and departmental heads do not leave current working places.
4. Strengthened ethics training capacities of the Ministries, Departments and Agencies.	1. Number of trainers and trainees in the respective Ministries, Departments and Agencies. 2. Equipment/facilities provided.	1. Project evaluation reports 2. Interviews of Ministerial Officials and Heads of Departments and Agencies.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Respective officials maintain reports, do not leave current working places and co-operate.

Activities	Inputs	Important Assumptions
1. Japanese Government Contribution/disbursement to the implementation of the Training Programme	Japanese aid budgeted for the Programme Period was US\$ 295,030 equal to 35,369,746 Japanese Yen or TShs 271,533,200. Actual amount utilized amounted to US\$ 295,030 Japanese Yen 35,369,746 and Tshs	Stability and no policy changes in co-operation between both countries.
2. Tanzania government Contribution to the Implementation of the programme	Tanzania Government budget was US\$ 23,864 (TShs 21,720,000 and actual amount contributed was US\$ 20,148, Japanese Yen 2,432,195 (TShs 18,255,786) up to Nov.2003	Stability and no policy changes in co-operation between both countries.
3. Implementing In-country Training	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Foreign experts in various Programme topics; • Local expenses (accommodation, teaching materials, and other allowances); • Local experts (resource persons) in various programme activities • Local experts allowances • Training materials • Trainees for the course • Per-diem and accommodation cost • Equipment (e.g. computer, whiteboard, TV etc.) and maintenance. • Administrative Personnel i.e. those paid by the project. • Other Training facilities e.g. classrooms, accommodation etc.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Local and foreign experts availability and willingness; • Adequate funds for local expenses provided; • Local experts and trainees are selected and their involvement in the course is effected as anticipated. • Equipment and other facilities are provided as planned.

Activities	Inputs	Important Assumptions
4. Trainers train other employees	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Acquired knowledge from course (skills)• Fellow employees• Necessary facilities (manuals)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Fellow employees are selected and willing to participate.
5. Monitoring and management of the training of employees in the participating institutions.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Personnel from Ethics Inspection Unit.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The unit is still in existence.

APPENDIX 2:B

EVALUATION GRID

EVALUATION GRID

Evaluation Criteria	Items to be Examined	Evaluation Questions	Data/Information Source(s)
Relevance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevance of the Ethics Training Programme in the context of Tanzania's needs. • Relevance of the Project Coverage in line with the Japan Development Assistance Policy. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Is the overall goal consistent with the country's Public Service Policy? • Is the overall Goal consistent, with the Japan's development assistance policy? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presidents office (Civil Service Department); • Japan International Co-operation Agency (JICA); • Resource Persons, trainers and trainees; • Consultants survey.
Effectiveness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Achievement of the Programme/Project purposes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What has been the extent of achievement in the training of trainers and trainees? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evaluation reports from Civil Service Department. • Consultants' field survey
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Factors that facilitated/impeded achievement of the project purposes. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How have important assumptions influenced the achievement process of the Project Purposes? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consultants' field work/survey. • Evaluation reports.
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are there other factors that affected the achievement of the Project Purposes? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consultants' field work/survey. • Evaluation reports.

Evaluation Criteria	Items to be Examined	Evaluation Questions	Data/Information Source(s)
Efficiency	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adequacy of quantity and quality of inputs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Were the local experts/resource persons of the ethics Training Programme of the right caliber and enough in number? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evaluation reports • Consultants field work/survey • Comments/views from Trainees
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Were Japan's inputs for the implementation of the training programme enough and relevant? (fund & expertise). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consultants field work/survey • Comments/views from officials of Civil Service Department.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Timing of Inputs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Were the inputs from both the Governments of Japan and Tanzania provided at the right time? 	As above
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Appropriateness of the Training Programme 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Were the training course contents in line with the expected outputs to be attained? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consultants field work/survey

Evaluation Criteria	Items to be Examined	Evaluation Questions	Data/Information Source(s)
Cont. Efficiency	Cont. Appropriateness of the Training Programme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Were the Training Programme Activities adequately linked with other activities initiated by SIDA, CIDA, other donors and the Government of Tanzania? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ethics Department • SIDA • CIDA • JICA
	Efficiency of the Management System of the Training Course.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Was overall management of the ethics training courses sufficient and efficient enough to attain expected outputs? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trainees views; • Resource Persons • Ethics Department • JICA
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Were the criteria set out in selection of resource persons and employees to be trained as trainers adequately followed? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ethics Department • Trainers' employers • Trainers
	Factors that facilities/impeded the efficiency of the Project implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Did any of the assumptions/preconditions made earlier affect the implementation process of the ethics Training Programme? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • JICA • Ethics Department • Resource Persons

Evaluation Criteria	Items to be Examined	Evaluation Questions	Data/Information Source(s)
Cont. Efficiency	Cont. Factors that facilities/imposed the efficiency of the Project Implementation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have there been any other factors that have influenced efficiency of the Project Implementation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As above and other sources.
Impact	Achievement of the overall goal of the ethics Training Programme and the achievement process.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What are the degrees of achievement of the overall goal? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trainers and Trainees heads • Trainers and trainees • Clients of public services • Ethics Department (monitoring unit)
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have early follow-up monitoring and remedial measures been realized in areas where the project was being implemented? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ethic Departments • PCB • Trainees employers • Clients of public services
	Factors that influenced negatively/positively the achievement of overall goal.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have there been any factors that influenced achievement process of the overall goal? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ethics Department • PCB • Clients of Public Services.

Appendix 2:B
5(6)

Evaluation Criteria	Items to be Examined	Evaluation Questions	Data/Information Source(s)
Cont. Impact	Positive/negative and/or expected/unexpected impact resulting from the Ethics Training Programme Implementation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Has the implementation of the Ethics Training Programme brought any secondary/indirect impact to areas other than those originally envisaged as per the project goal and purposes? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trainers • Trainees • Comments of the Ethics Department
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Has there been any impact of the ethics training Programme to the local people? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consultants field observation on involving local people/general public.
Sustainability	Sustainability from technical aspects.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have trainers trained in the Ethics Training Programme transferred their knowledge and skills to fellow employees at their respective work places? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trainers • Fellow employees • Trainers Heads • Ethics Department
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Has the training manual developed in connection with the Programme been utilized by the Trainers at work places? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trainers • Trainees • Ethics Department • Trainers Heads

Evaluation Criteria	Items to be Examined	Evaluation Questions	Data/Information Source(s)
Cont. Sustainability	Sustainability from Institutional Aspects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Is the future allocation of the Government budget enough to ensure continuity of the training program when the donor fund (JICA) ceases? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Civil Service Department (Permanent Secretary)
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Has there been an organized system of procuring the necessary equipment and working tools? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Civil Service Department (Permanent Secretary)
	Sustainability from Policy Aspects.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are policies and future plans of the Civil Service Department, Ministries, other departments and Agencies supportive to the ethics training programme? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Civil Service Department • Ministries • Departments • Agencies • Resource Persons
	Social and Cultural Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Is it socially and culturally acceptable for the general public to freely talk about corruption and others on ethical values? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Department of Culture and General Public
	Factors that influence the sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are there any factors that influence the sustainability of the ethics Training Programme? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interviewees

APPENDIX 2:C

EVALUATION ANALYSIS QUESTIONNAIRES

LIST OF QUESTIONNAIRES

- Q:A (1) PUBLIC SERVICE MANAGEMENT OFFICE (PSMO)
(2) PSML - ETHICS MONITORING UNIT
(3) TANZANIA PUBLIC SERVICES COLLEGE (TPSC)
- Q:B (1) TRAINED TRAINERS
(2) TRAINEES
- Q:C (1) LOCAL EXPERTS/RESOURCE PERSONS
- Q:D (1) JAPAN INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION AGENCY (JICA)
- Q:E (1) GOVERNMENT MINISTRIES
(2) GOVERNMENT DEPARTMENTS/AGENCIES
(3) LOCAL GOVERNMENT AUTHORITIES
- Q:F (1) PREVENTION OF CORRUPTION BUREAU (PCB)
- Q:G (1) MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND CULTURE
(DEPARTMENT OF CULTURE)
- Q:H (1) OTHER DONOR ORGANIZATIONS
- Q:I (1) CLIENTS OF PUBLIC SERVICES AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS

LIST OF QUESTIONNAIRES

Type of Questionnaire	Target Respondents	No. of Pages
A	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Public Service Management Office/Ethics Monitoring Unit• Tanzania Public Service College	9
B	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Trained Trainers• Trainees at Work Places	8
C	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Resource Persons/Local Experts	3
D	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)	3
E	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Ministries• Departments/Agencies• Local Government Authorities	4
F	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Prevention of Corruption Bureau	3
G	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Ministry of Education and Culture	2
H	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Other Donor Organisations	2
I	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Clients of Public Services and Other Stakeholders	3

**JAPAN INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION AGENCY
(J I C A)**

EVALUATION

ON

PUBLIC SERVICES ETHICS TRAINING PROGRAMME

QUESTIONNAIRE A

**PUBLIC SERVICE MANAGEMENT OFFICE /ETHICS MONITORING UNIT
TANZANIA PUBLIC SERVICES COLLEGE**

GENERAL INFORMATION

I. Name Title and Contact Address of Responding Officer

Name: _____
Title: _____
Department/Office: _____
Address/Tel No: _____
Signature: _____

II Location

Region: _____
District: _____

III Name of Consultant

Name: _____ Telephone No. _____

IV. Date of completing Questionnaire

This questionnaire has 9 pages

QA.1 Is the overall goal of Ethics Training Programme consistent with Tanzania's Public Services Policy? Please explain

QA.2 Please explain briefly the extent of achievement in the training of trainers and trainees under the Ethics Training Programme

QA.3 Which factors do you think specifically influenced the achievement of the Ethics Training Programme?

QA.4 Please provide at least three (3) most important problems/constraints encountered while implementing the Ethics Training Programme?

QA.5(i) Were JICA's inputs in terms of financial assistance and technical advice on management of the Ethics Training Programme enough and relevant? Please tick appropriately.

QUITE ENOUGH AND RELEVANT

JUST ENOUGH AND RELEVANT

NOT ENOUGH AND RELEVANT AT ALL

DON'T KNOW

In either answer provided above please explain briefly

QA.5(ii) Were the funds provided by the Government of Tanzania to run/manage the Programme enough and relevant? Please tick appropriately:

QUITE ENOUGH AND RELEVANT	<input type="checkbox"/>
JUST ENOUGH AND RELEVANT	<input type="checkbox"/>
NOT ENOUGH AND RELEVANT AT ALL	<input type="checkbox"/>
DON'T KNOW	<input type="checkbox"/>

In either answer provided above please explain briefly

QA.6 Were the course inputs in terms of equipment, facilities and funds from both Government of Tanzania and Japan provided TIMELY?

	YES	NO
Inputs from Japan/JICA	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Inputs from Tanzania	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

If the answer in QA.6 above is 'No' please explain.

QA.7 Please explain how the Ethics Training Programme activities financed by JICA link with/are in harmony with other Programme activities initiated by other donors and the Government of Tanzania

QA.8 Was the overall management of the Ethics Training Programme course Contents sufficient and efficient enough to attain expected outputs?

QUOTE SUFFICIENT AND EFFICIENT

JUST SUFFICIENT AND EFFICIENT

NOT SUFFICIENT AND EFFICIENT AT ALL

If the answer in QA.8 above is 2 or 3 please explain.

QA.9 Which were the criteria set out in selecting:
(1) RESOURCE PERSONS? (2) EMPLOYEES TO BE TRAINED?

Criteria in selecting Resource Persons

Criteria in selecting Employees to be trained

QA.10 In your opinion were the criteria set out in both cases above adequately/strictly followed?

Please tick appropriately.

	YES	NO
Selection of Resource Persons	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Selection of Employees to be trained	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

If the answer in QA.10 above is 'No' please explain.

QA.11 Are you satisfied with the efficiency of the project implementation?
Yes No

If the answer in QA.11 above is 'Yes' please explain factors that facilitated the efficiency in implementing the Ethics Training Programmes

If the answer in QA.11 above is 'No', please explain factors that affected the implementation process.

QA.12 The overall goal of the Ethics Training Programme is to enable the Government of Tanzania provide effective and efficient public services delivery to the people of Tanzania.

In your opinion how far has the overall goal been achieved?

Please tick appropriates.

1. HIGHLY ACHIEVED

2. SOME HOW ACHIEVED

3. NOT ACHIEVED AT ALL

4. DON'T KNOW

In either case please explain briefly.

QA.13 Please explain how your institution carried out management/monitoring/ follow up of the training of employees in the participating institutions and remedial measures taken to address problems/comments raised by the course participant and other stake holders:

(i) Just from the beginning of the project implementation

(ii) When trained trainers returned to their work places to train other employees

QA.14 Below are some of the general views/comments of the course participants cited in the evaluation reports.

Please go through relevant comments concerning your department/institution and briefly state actions taken/plan to take to address them.

(Use separate sheets of papers and provide necessary exhibits where applicable).

SN	Participants Views/Comments	Actions taken/Plan to take
1.	Public Service Management Office (PSMO) should direct Ministries, departments, independent agencies and district authorities to finance Ethics Training Programme at their places i.e. allocate funds in their budgets.	
2.	There should be a close follow-up of the whole programme carried out at the Tanzania Public Service College (TPSC) and at work places in the Ministries, Department and Agencies.	
3.	The TPSC should watch closely the negative remarks made on the Ethics Training Programme and promptly seek ways of improving the areas that need improvement.	
4.	Participants were not satisfied with the facilitator on corruption and suggested replacement from Prevention of Corruption Bureau (PCB)	
5.	The PSMO should ensure that the course covers entire public service encompassing political leaders, Ministers, Permanent Secretaries, Regional Commissioners, Regional Administrative Secretaries and officials of local Government authorities.	
6.	Ethics Training should be part of curriculum in schools.	
7.	Employers should be informed of the Ethics Training Programme to enable them allocate the necessary funds (Publicise the Programme)	
8.	Ethics Training should be provided to public servants as soon as they are recruited.	
9.	Some facilitators should be couched in training methodology to enable them deliver correctly and efficiently.	

QA.15 Has the implementation of the Ethics Training Programme brought any secondary/indirect impact to areas other than those originally envisaged as per the project goal and purposes? Please explain.

QA.16 In your opinion have trainers trained in Ethics Training Programme transferred their knowledge and skills to fellow employees at their respective work places? Please explain.

QA.17 Is the future allocation of the Government budget enough to ensure sustainability/continuity of the Ethics Training Programme when the donor fund (JICA) ceases?

Please explain.

QA.18 Has there been an organized system of procuring the necessary equipment and working tools (present and planned)?

QA.19 Please explain briefly how the policy and future plans of the PSMO are supportive to/take care of the Ethics Training Programme.

QA.20 Which other factors do you think could make the Ethics Training Programme sustainable.

THANK YOU FOR YOUR CO-OPERATION.

**JAPAN INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION AGENCY
(J I C A)**

EVALUATION

ON

PUBLIC SERVICES ETHICS TRAINING PROGRAMME

QUESTIONNAIRE B

- **TRAINED TRAINERS**
- **TRAINEES**

GENERAL INFORMATION

I Name, Title and Contact Address

Name: _____
Title/ Designation: _____
Department/Office: _____
Address/Tel. No. _____
Signature: _____

II Location

Region: _____
District: _____

III Name of Consultant

Name: _____ Telephone No _____

IV. Date of Completing Questionnaire

This questionnaire has 8 pages

QB.1 Please state your personal profile as follows:

- Age in years
- Experience in present job..... (years)
- Highest level of education completed (please tick appropriately).

Primary/Middle School	<input type="checkbox"/>
Secondary School (O-Level).....	<input type="checkbox"/>
Secondary School (A-Level).....	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational.....	<input type="checkbox"/>
University	<input type="checkbox"/>
Postgraduate	<input type="checkbox"/>
Others..... (Specify)	<input type="checkbox"/>

- Brief description of your current job

QB.2 In which of the following course contents/topics did you participate? (please tick appropriately).

1.	Introduction to Ethics.....	<input type="checkbox"/>
2.	Ethics Principles.....	<input type="checkbox"/>
3.	Ethics Styles and Management in Decision Making.....	<input type="checkbox"/>
4.	The Government Public Servants and their Roles.....	<input type="checkbox"/>
5.	Efficient and Effective Government.....	<input type="checkbox"/>
6.	Public Service Ethics.....	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.	Corruption (Definition, causes, effects.....)	<input type="checkbox"/>
8.	Legal Frame Work (Civil Service Act & Regulations.....	<input type="checkbox"/>
9.	Civil/Public Service Reform.....	<input type="checkbox"/>
10.	Gender.....	<input type="checkbox"/>

11. Training Methodology/Skills.....

12. Other e.g. HIV/AIDS.....(Specify).....

QB.3 Which of the topics listed above did you find most useful (fill in numbers of topics in the space provided).

QB.4 Please give reasons as to why you consider the above topics to be useful.

QB.5 Please state other topics (if any) which you consider to be useful/relevant but were not provided in the Ethics Training Programme.

QB.6 Please rate the ethics training you have so far received by inserting the appropriate rating number in the spaces provided as follows:

- EXCELLENT..... 1
- VERY GOOD..... 2
- GOOD..... 3
- FAIR 4
- POOR..... 5

Organization of the Programme

Objective of the Programme

Relevance of the Course to your Occupation

Effectiveness of Training Received

Provision of Training Materials

Training Methodology & Facilitation

Practical orientation of the Training Programme

Please provide other comments/remarks over the whole Ethics Training Programme.

QB.7 Were the local experts/resource persons of the Ethics Training Programme of the right caliber and enough in number? Please tick appropriately. (Trained Trainers only).

YES

NO

QB.8 What is your opinion about total period provided for the training (about 2 weeks)? Please tick. (Trained Trainers only).

More than Enough

Just Enough

Not Enough

QB.9 How do you compare your understanding of Public Service Ethics to day with your situation prior to receiving ethics training?. Please tick.

Much Better Now.....

Somewhat better now

Not different

QB.10 Please state in your opinion whether or not the overall goal of Ethics Training Programme (of providing effective and efficient public services delivery to the people of Tanzania) is consistent with Tanzania's Public Service Policy?

QB.11 In your opinion were the local experts/resource persons of the Ethics Training Programme of the right caliber and enough in number? Please explain.

QB.12 Was the overall management of the Ethics Training Programme course contents sufficient and efficient enough to attain expected outputs? Please tick appropriately.

- | | |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------------|
| 1. Quite Sufficient and Efficient | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2. Just Sufficient and Efficient | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 3. Not Sufficient and Efficient | <input type="checkbox"/> |

If the answer in QB.12 above is either no. 2 or 3 please explain.

QB.13 Which were the criteria set out in selection of resource persons/facilitators and employees to be trained as trainers? (Trained Trainers only).

Criteria in selecting Resource Persons

Criteria in selecting employees to be trained

In your opinion were the criteria set out in both cases above adequately/strictly followed:- Please tick appropriately.

	YES	NO
Selection of Resource Persons	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Selection of Employees to be trained	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

QB.14 The overall goal of the Ethics Training Programme is to enable the Government of Tanzania provide effective and efficient public services delivery to the people of Tanzania. In your opinion how far has the overall goal been achieved? Please tick appropriately.

1. Highly achieved	<input type="checkbox"/>
2. Some how achieved	<input type="checkbox"/>
3. Not achieved at all	<input type="checkbox"/>
4. Don't know	<input type="checkbox"/>

In either case please explain briefly.

QB.15 Has the implementation of the Ethics Training Programme brought any secondary/indirect impact to areas other than those originally envisaged as per the programme goal and purposes?

QB.16(i) After your participation in the Ethics Training Programme please state as a trainer how far you have transferred your knowledge and skills to fellow employees (Trained Trainers only).

QB.16(ii) Please indicate the number of employees you have so far trained in the space provided.

No. of employees trained

QB.17 Have adequate equipment/facilities and funds been provided to enable you carry out the training?

QB.18 In your opinion has the training manual developed in connection with the Ethics Training Programme been utilized fully? Please tick appropriately. (Trained Trainers only)

1. Fully Utilized

2. Somehow Utilized

3. Not utilized at all

If the answer in QB.18 is either 2 or 3 please explain.

QB.19 In your opinion are policies and future plans of the Public Service Management Office, other Ministries and your institution/department supportive to/take care of the Ethics Training Programme? Please explain.

QB.20 Which other factors do you think could make the Ethics Training Programme sustainable?

QB.21 Please provide at least three (3) most important problems encountered while participating in the Ethics Training Programme.

THANK YOU FOR YOUR CO-OPERATION

JAPAN INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION AGENCY
(J I C A)

EVALUATION

ON

PUBLIC SERVICES ETHICS TRAINING PROGRAMME

QUESTIONNAIRE C

- RESOURCES PERSONS/LOCAL EXPERTS
(Those who trained Trainers)

GENERAL INFORMATION

- I Name, Title and Address
Name: _____
Title/Designation: _____
Department/Office: _____
Address/Tel. No: _____
Signature: _____
- II Location
Region: _____
District: _____
- III Name of Consultant
Name: _____ Tel No. _____
- IV. Date of Completing Questionnaire

This questionnaire has 3 pages

QC.1 Is the overall goal of Ethics Training Programme consistent with Tanzania's Public Services Policy? Please explain.

QC.2 Was the overall management of the Ethics Training Programme course contents sufficient and efficient enough to attain expected outputs? Please tick appropriately.

1. Quite Sufficient and Efficient

2. Just Sufficient and Efficient

3. Not Sufficient and Efficient at all

If the answer in QC.2 above is 2 or 3 please explain.

QC.3 Were the equipment and facilities provided adequate? Please explain

QC.4 Are you satisfied with the efficiency of Ethics Training Programme implementation.?

YES

NO

If the answer in QC.4 above is 'Yes' please state factors that you think facilitated the efficiency in implementing the programme.

If the answer in QC.4 above is 'No' please state factors/constraints that affected the implementation.

QC.5 How are the policies and future plans of Civil Service Department, Ministries, other departments, agencies including your institution supportive to/take care of the Ethics Training Programme? Please explain.

THANK YOU FOR YOUR CO-OPERATION

**JAPAN INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION AGENCY
(J I C A)**

EVALUATION

ON

PUBLIC SERVICES ETHICS TRAINING PROGRAMME

QUESTIONNAIRE D

J I C A

GENERAL INFORMATION

- I Name, Title and Address of Responding Officer
Name: _____
Title/ Designation: _____
Address: _____
Signature: _____
- II Name of Consultant
Name: _____ Tel No. _____
- III Date of Completing Questionnaire

This questionnaire has 3 pages

QD.1 Please provide figures of actual amount of fund utilized on the Ethics Training Programme (2001-2003)

Is the overall goal of Ethics Training Programme being implemented in Tanzania and financed by JICA consistent with Japan's Development Assistance Policy? Please explain.

QD.2 Please explain how the Ethics Training Programme activities financed by JICA link with/are in harmony with other programme activities initiated by other donor agencies such as SIDA & CIDA and the Government of Tanzania.

QD.3 Were the Japanese Experts provided to the Civil Service Department/PSM as planned?

Yes

No

In either case (Yes or No) please explain.

QD.4 Was the overall management of the Ethics Training Programme course contents sufficient and efficient enough to attain expected outputs? Please tick appropriately.

1. Quite Sufficient and Efficient

2. Just Sufficient and Efficient

3. Not Sufficient and Efficient

If the answer in QD.4 above is either No. 2 or 3 please explain and suggest remedial measures.

QD.5 Given the feedback JICA has so far been receiving from PSMO, TPSC and other stakeholders on the implementation of the Ethics Training Programme which factors do you think:

(a) facilitate the efficiency of the project implementation

(b) impede the efficiency of the project implementation

THANK YOU FOR YOUR CO-OPERATION

**JAPAN INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION AGENCY
(J I C A)**

EVALUATION

ON

PUBLIC SERVICES ETHICS TRAINING PROGRAMME

QUESTIONNAIRE E

HEADS IN:

- **MINISTRIES**
- **DEPARTMENTS/AGENCIES**
- **LOCAL GOVERNMENT AUTHORITIES**

GENERAL INFORMATION

I Name, Title and Address OF Responding Officer

Name: _____

Title/ Designation: _____

Address: _____

Signature: _____

II Location

Region: _____

District: _____

III Name of Consultant

Name: _____ Tel. No. _____

IV Date of Completing Questionnaire

This questionnaire has 4 pages

QE.1 Please attach to this questionnaire annual list of names of trainers and trainees who have participated in the Ethics Training Programme from your institution (2001, 2002, 2003).

QR.2 Please state types of equipment/facilities provided to the trainers in Ethics Training to enable them train their fellow employees in your institution.

QE.3 Have the capabilities of your employees in making ethical decisions been improved after their participation in the Ethics Training Programme? (Please tick appropriately).

- | | |
|---------------------|--------------------------|
| 1. Highly Improved | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2. Somehow Improved | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 3. Not Improved | <input type="checkbox"/> |

In either case please explain briefly.

QE.4 In your opinion have trainers trained in the Ethics Training from your organization really transferred their knowledge and skills to fellow employees? Knowledge transferred Knowledge not transferred

Please explain in either answer given above.

QE.5 Which were the criteria set out in selection of employees to be trained as trainers in the Ethics Training Programme from your institutions?

QE.6 The overall goal of the Ethics Training Programme is to enable the Government of Tanzania provide effective and efficient public services delivery to the people of Tanzania.

In your opinion how far has the overall goal been achieved?
Please tick appropriately.

- | | |
|------------------------|--------------------------|
| 1. Highly Achieved | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2. Somehow Achieved | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 3. Not Achieved at all | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 4. Don't know | <input type="checkbox"/> |

In either case please explain briefly.

QE.7 Please explain how your institution made a follow-up on the Ethics Training from the beginning of its implementation and measures taken/plan to take to address problems encountered/views raised by the course participants and other stakeholders.

- e.g. (a) Trained trainers should be provided with the necessary facilities to enable them provide such training at their work places.
- (b) Ministries/Departments/Government agencies should finance Ethics Training at work places i.e. allocate funds in their budgets.

QE.8 Has the training manual developed in connection with the Ethics Training Programme been utilized by the trainers in your organization? Please tick appropriately.

- 1. Fully Utilized
- 2. Somehow Utilized
- 3. Not Utilized at all

If the answer in QE.8 above is either 2 or 3 please explain.

QE.9 Please explain briefly how the policy and future plans of your institution are supportive to/take care of the Ethics Training Programme.

QE.10 Please state other factors that could make the Ethics Training Programme sustainable.

THANK YOU FOR YOUR CO-OPERATION.

JAPAN INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION AGENCY
(J I C A)

EVALUATION

ON

PUBLIC SERVICES ETHICS TRAINING PROGRAMME

QUESTIONNAIRE F

PREVENTION OF CORRUPTION BUREAU
(PCB)

GENERAL INFORMATION

- I Name Title and Address of Responding Officer
Name: _____
Title/ Designation: _____
Department/Office _____
Address: _____
Signature: _____
- II Location
Region: _____
District: _____
- III Name of Consultant
Name: _____ Tel No. _____
- IV Date of Completing Questionnaire

This questionnaire has 3 pages

QF.1 Please explain how your institution monitored/made a follow-up of the Ethics Training Programme in the areas (Tanzania Public Service College (TPSC), Public Service Management Office (PSMO) and at work places where the Programme was being implemented just from the beginning and remedial measures taken/plan to take to address problems/comments raised by the course participants and other stakeholders;

e.g. Participants were not satisfied with the facilitator on corruption and suggested replacement from the PCB.

QF.2 Please state what has been the RATE of corruption prior and after implementation of Ethics Training Programme?

QF.3 Please explain briefly how the policy and future plans of the PCB are supportive to/take care of the Ethics Training Programme.

QF.4 The overall/goal of the Ethics Training Programme initiated since 2001 is for the Government of Tanzania to provide effective and efficient Public Services delivery to the people of Tanzania.

In your opinion have there been any factors that influenced achievement process of the overall good? Please explain.

QF.5 Please state factors that you think could make the Ethics Training Programme Sustainable.

THANK YOU FOR YOUR CO-OPERATION

**JAPAN INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION AGENCY
(J I C A)**

EVALUATION

ON

PUBLIC SERVICES ETHICS TRAINING PROGRAMME

QUESTIONNAIRE G

**MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND CULTURE
(DEPARTMENT OF CULTURE)**

GENERAL INFORMATION

- I Name, Title and Address of Responding Officer
Name: _____
Title/ Designation: _____
Department/Office: _____
Address: _____
Signature: _____
- II Location _____
- III Name of Consultant
Name: _____ Tel No. _____
- IV Date of Completing Questionnaire

This questionnaire has 2 pages

QG.1 The Ethics Training Programme being implemented by the Government of Tanzania through the Public Service Management Office (PSMO) and Tanzania Public Service College (TPSC) since 2001 was designed with the purpose of creating ethics awareness and change of attitude towards corrupt and unethical practices among the employees at work places with an overall goal of providing effective and efficient public services delivery to the people of Tanzania.

It was further expected that the Ethics Training Programme would ultimately result into increased discussion on ethics and corruption at workplaces.

In your opinion is it now socially and culturally acceptable for the general public to talk about corruption and ethical values more freely? Please explain briefly.

In your opinion how is unethical values e.g. corruption viewed culturally? Please explain.

THANK YOU FOR YOUR CO-OPERATION

**JAPAN INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION AGENCY
(J I C A)**

EVALUATION

ON

PUBLIC SERVICES ETHICS TRAINING PROGRAMME

QUESTIONNAIRE H

OTHER DONOR ORGANIZATIONS

GENERAL INFORMATION

- I Name, Title and Address of Responding Officer
Name: _____
Title/ Designation: _____
Name of Donor Agency: _____
Address: _____
Signature: _____
- II Location
Region: _____
District: _____
- III Name of Consultant
Name: _____ Tel No. _____
- IV Date of Completing Questionnaire

This questionnaire has 2 pages

QH.1 Since 2001 the Government of Tanzania has been implementing Ethics Training Programme with the overall goal of providing effective and efficient public services delivery to the people/general public.

In your opinion does the programme link with/is in harmony with other programmes initiated by your organization under technical co-operation with Tanzania? (Please explain briefly).

THANK YOU FOR YOUR CO-OPERATION

**JAPAN INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION AGENCY
(J I C A)**

EVALUATION

ON

PUBLIC SERVICES ETHICS TRAINING PROGRAMME

QUESTIONNAIRE I

- **CLIENTS OF PUBLIC SERVICES**
- **OTHER STAKEHOLDERS**

GENERAL INFORMATION

- I Name, Title and Address of Responding Officer
Officer's Name: _____
Title/ Designation: _____
Name of Organization: _____
Address: _____
Signature: _____
- II Location
Region: _____
District: _____
- III Name of Consultant
Name: _____ Tel No. _____
- IV Date of Completing Questionnaire

This questionnaire has 3 pages

Q1.1 The Ethics Training Programme being implemented by the Government of Tanzania since 2001 was designed with the purpose of creating ethics awareness and change of attitude towards corrupt and unethical practices among the employees with an overall goal of providing effective and efficient public services delivery to the people of Tanzania.

In your opinion how far has the overall goal been achieved? Please tick appropriately.

- | | |
|------------------------|--------------------------|
| 1. Highly achieved | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2. Some how achieved | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 3. Not achieved at all | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 4. Don't know | <input type="checkbox"/> |

In either case/answer you have ticked above please explain.

Q1.2 It was further expected that Ethics Training would ultimately increase or prompt open discussions on ethics at work places and in other areas.

Please explain if it is now socially and culturally acceptable for the general public to talk about corruption and ethical values more freely?

Q1.3 Which factors do you think have had positive influence over the achievement of the overall goal of the Ethics Training Programme stated in Q1.2 above?

Q1.4 Which factors do you think have influenced the achievement of the overall goal of the Ethics Training Programme.

THANK YOU FOR YOUR CO-OPERATION!

APPENDIX 2:D

COMPLETED QUESTIONNAIRES COLLECTED

Completed Questionnaires Collected

Type of Questionnaire	Total Distributed	Completed Questionnaires Received			
		Dar es Salaam	Mbeya	Tanga	Total
A	2	2	-	-	2
B(i)	100	58	5	7	70
B(ii)	23	16	1	6	23
C	3	3	-	-	3
D	1	1	-	-	1
E	40	12	3	1	16
F	1	1	-	-	1
G	1	1	-	-	1
H	2	2	-	-	2
I	3	2	-	-	2
Total	176	98	9	14	121
Success rate	-	-	-	-	69%

Key: Q – means questionnaire

- QA - Public Service Management Office (PSMO) and Tanzania Public Services College (TPSC)
- QB(i) - Trained Trainers
- QB(ii) - Trainees at Workplaces
- QC - Local Experts/Resource Persons
- QD - Japan International Co-operation Agency (JICA)
- QE - Heads of Ministries, Departments and Agencies
- QF - Prevention of Corruption Bureau (PCB)
- QG - Ministry of Education & Culture-Directorate of Culture
- QH - Other Donor Agencies
- QI - Institutional Clients of Public Services

Notes: As per the agreed Technical Proposal, TISCO was expected to cover only 100 participants (trainers) i.e. DSM (80), Mbeya (10) and Tanga (10). TISCO deemed it imperative to get the views of other stakeholders and include them in the evaluation study.

APPENDIX 2:E

RESULTS OF ANALYSIS FOR SELECTED RESPONSES

**(i) Quality of Trained Trainers Based on Educational/
Professional Qualifications**

Level of Qualification	% of Total
Primary/Middle School	-
Secondary School – (O-level)	9
Secondary School – (A-level)	6
Vocational	4
University	46
Postgraduate	31
Others	4
Total	100%
No. of trainers who responded to the questionnaires	70

Source: TISCO Analysis of Responses

Notes: Majority (77%) are University graduates and those holding postgraduate degrees – very capable to offer ethics training to fellow employees.

(ii) Quality of Trained Trainers by Experience

Experience in Years	% of Total
Below 1 year	-
1-5	23
6-10	10
11-15	13
16-20	20
21-25	7
Over 25	23
Not stated	4
Total	100%
Number of Trainers	70

(iii) Change in Knowledge and Skills between Pre- and Post training Course in Ethics by Trained Trainers

(%)

Level of Understanding	Type of Respondents	
	Trainers	Trainees
Much better now	81	55
Some what better now	16	45
Not different	3	-
Total	100%	100%
No. of Responses	69	22

(iv) Improved Employees Capabilities in Making Ethical Decisions as stated by Sampled Employers

Level of Improvement	%
Highly improved	19
Somehow improved	75
Not improved	6
Total	100%
No. of responses	16

(v) Evaluation of Ethics Training Programme Based on Sampled Trainers Responses

No.	Area of Evaluation	Excellent	Very Good	Good	Fair	Poor	Total
1.	Organization of the Programme						
	Responses	15	34	19	2	-	70
	% of Total	21	49	27	3	-	100
2.	Objective of the Programme						
	Responses	31	30	5	1	-	67
	% of Total	46	45	7	2	-	100
3.	Relevance to Occupation						
	Responses	28	33	6	3	-	70
	% of Total	40	47	9	4	-	100
4.	Effectiveness of Training						
	Responses	4	40	22	4	-	70
	% of Total	6	57	31	6	-	100
5.	Provision of Training Materials						
	Responses	8	28	26	7	-	69
	% of Total	11	41	38	10	-	100
6.	Training Methodology and Facilitation						
	Responses	8	37	21	3	1	70
	% of Total	12	53	30	4	1	100
7.	Practical Orientation						
	Responses	1	22	29	11	5	68
	% of Total	1	32	44	16	7	100
8.	Overall Evaluation (1-7)						
	Total Responses	94	224	128	32	6	484
	% of Total	19	46	27	7	1	100

Source: TISCO Analysis of Trainers Responses

(vi) Consistency of the Overall Goal of Ethics Training Programme with Tanzania's Public Service Policy as stated by Sampled Trainees

Type of Response	Score (%)
It is consistent	80
It is not consistent	20
Total	100%
Total Responses	15

(vii) Comments by Trainers on the Calibre and number of Local Experts

Item	% of Total Responses
Experts were of the right calibre and enough	97
Experts were not enough in number and of the wrong calibre	3
Total	100%
No. of Responses	68

(viii) Assessment of the Sufficiency and Efficiency of the Overall Project Management by Trainers

Level of Assessment	% of Total
Quite sufficient and efficient	68
Just sufficient and efficient	30
Not sufficient and efficient	2
Total	100%
No. of Responses	66

(ix) Transfer of Knowledge and Skills by Trained Trainers to Fellow Employees as Evaluated by Heads of Organizations

Type of Response	% of Total
Knowledge & skills transferred	63
Knowledge & skills not transferred	37
Total	100%
No. of Responses	16

(x) **Opinion on the Period Provided for Training (2 weeks) as stated by Sampled Trainers**

Remark/Opinion	Score % of Total
More than enough	1
Just enough	45
Not enough	54
Total	100%
No. of Responses	69

(xi) **Achievement of Overall Goal of Ethics Training Programme as stated by Sampled Heads of Organisations (%)**

Level of Achievement	% of Total
Highly achieved	13
Somehow achieved	75
Not achieved at all	6
Don't know	6
Total	100
No. of Responses	16

(xii) **Assessment of Achievement of Overall Goal by Trainers**

Degree of Achievement	% of Total
Highly achieved	12
Somehow achieved	75
Not achieved at all	3
Don't Know	10
Total	100%
No. of Responses	67

(xiii) **Comments on the Utilization of Training Manual
(By Heads of Organizations)**

Extent of Utilization/Comment	% of Total
Fully utilized	38
Somehow utilized	31
Not utilized at all	25
Has never seen the Document	6
Total	100%
No. of Responses	16

(xiv) **Utilization of Training Manual at Work Places as seen by Trainers**

Extent of Utilization	% of Total
Fully utilized	37
Somehow utilized	44
Not utilized at all	19
Total	100%
No. of Responses	52

APPENDIX 4:A

PROJECT INPUT

Project Input

1. Japanese Expert

Name	Scheme	Title	Dispatched Period
Mr. Atsushi Inoue	Medium term expert	Training Advisor	2000-2001 (1 year)
Mr. Atsushi Inoue	Short term	Training Advisor	2001 (1 month)
Mr. Atsushi Inoue	Short term	Training Advisor	2002 (1 month)

2. Personnel (Tanzanians)		Y E A R S				Total
Title	Target Group	2000/2001	2001/2002	2002/2003	2003/2004	
Trainers	Employees from Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs)	99	95	88	68*	350
Resource Persons	Training employees from (MDA's)	8-9	9	9	9	8-9
Co-ordinators	Managing the project process (Public service management)	1	1	1	1	1
Employees	Fellow employees from trainers' offices					3,344** 3,637***

* Up to November 2003

** Feedback from MDAs

*** Consultants survey (Dar es Salaam, Tanga and Mbeya Regions)

Project Input Cont.

Employees to be Trained Selected by MDAs and Trained as Trainers

Years	Target Group*	Courses
2000/2001	100	4
2001/2002	100	4
2002/2003	100	4
2003/2004	100	4
2004/2005	100	4
Total	500	20

* Public Service Employees from Ministries, Departments, and Agencies capable of passing on their skilled knowledge to other employees after training.

3. Financial Inputs Tanzania and Japanese Governments (TShs)

Budget/ Actual	Government	Y E A R				Total
		2000/2001	2001/2002	2002/2003	2003/2004	
Budget	Japanese Government	62,255,750	62,240,250	72,293,600	74,743,600	271,533,200
Actual	Japanese Government	62,255,750	62,240,250	72,293,600	*74,743,600	271,533,200
Budget	Tanzania Government	5,900,000	5,680,000	5,070,000	5,070,000	21,720,000
Actual	Tanzania Government	5,146,047	5,243,077	4,301,818	**3,564,844	18,255,786
Balance not spent		753,953	436,923	768,182		
Total Spent and available for spending	Both Governments	67,401,797	67,483,327	76,595,418	***79,813,600	
Cost Sharing	Japan Government	92.4%	92.2%	94.45		
	Tanzania Government	7.6%	7.8%	5.6%		

* This amount has been released and is continuing to be used on the project.

** This amount is what has been spent up to November 2003 and the budgeted amount is available for the project which is in progress.

*** Amount available for spending

Project Input Cont.

3. Financial Inputs Japan & Tanzania (Expenses) (TShs)

Expenses	2000/2001	2001/2002	2002/2003	2003/2004	
1. Resource Persons		11,232,000	17,080,000	13,424,600	
2. Invitation Expenses		3,151,480	5,100,000	5,605,900	
3. Participants Allowances/ Accommodation		37,468,800	41,500,000	39,390,000	
4. *Facilities/Equipment	7,859,540	-	-	-	
5. Stationery/hired venues		7,177,000	13,683,600	15,112,100	
6. Others	3,300,000	10,000	-	-	
Total	11,159,540	59,039,280	77,363,600	73,532,600	
Japanese Expert	30,000	**15,000,000	**15,000,000	-	Supported from Japan

* This include 1 personal computer, 1 printer, 1 photocopy machine, 1 white board, 1 television and VTR, 1 screen overhead projector and uninterrupted power supply (UPS).

** Including Transport to and from Japan

APPENDIX 4:B

OUTPUT

Outputs

Narrative Summary	Indicator	Summary of Achievements																												
<p>Output 1: Trained Employees perception on ethics/corruption is understood and implemented.</p>	<p>Number of sessions and topics covered</p>	<p>Each course lasted two weeks that is ten study days. The sessions lasted between one hour to two and half hours. The topics and sessions were as shown below:</p> <p>Course Topics and Sessions:</p> <table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th style="text-align: left;"><u>Topics</u></th> <th style="text-align: right;"><u>Sessions</u></th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>- Ethics</td> <td style="text-align: right;">11</td> </tr> <tr> <td>- Accountability/Role/Responsibility</td> <td style="text-align: right;">2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>- Motivation/Conducive Environment</td> <td style="text-align: right;">4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>- Government structure</td> <td style="text-align: right;">2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>- Management/management System/Reports</td> <td style="text-align: right;">6</td> </tr> <tr> <td>- Communication and information control</td> <td style="text-align: right;">2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>- Methodology and Action Plan</td> <td style="text-align: right;">7</td> </tr> <tr> <td>- Corruption</td> <td style="text-align: right;">6</td> </tr> <tr> <td>- Legal Framework</td> <td style="text-align: right;">4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>- Gender</td> <td style="text-align: right;">2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>- Aids</td> <td style="text-align: right;">2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>- Others/Registration & Evaluation</td> <td style="text-align: right;"><u>2</u></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: center;">Total</td> <td style="text-align: right;"><u>50</u></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>The evaluation reports indicated generally that participants gained from the programme in terms of knowledge achieved through the course structure and group discussions. On average over 70% of participants rated the programme as good and above</p>	<u>Topics</u>	<u>Sessions</u>	- Ethics	11	- Accountability/Role/Responsibility	2	- Motivation/Conducive Environment	4	- Government structure	2	- Management/management System/Reports	6	- Communication and information control	2	- Methodology and Action Plan	7	- Corruption	6	- Legal Framework	4	- Gender	2	- Aids	2	- Others/Registration & Evaluation	<u>2</u>	Total	<u>50</u>
<u>Topics</u>	<u>Sessions</u>																													
- Ethics	11																													
- Accountability/Role/Responsibility	2																													
- Motivation/Conducive Environment	4																													
- Government structure	2																													
- Management/management System/Reports	6																													
- Communication and information control	2																													
- Methodology and Action Plan	7																													
- Corruption	6																													
- Legal Framework	4																													
- Gender	2																													
- Aids	2																													
- Others/Registration & Evaluation	<u>2</u>																													
Total	<u>50</u>																													

Narrative Summary	Indicator	Summary of Achievements
<p>Output 2: Trained employees have acquired skills to train fellow employees on public service ethics</p>	<p>Change in knowledge and skills between pre-and past training course</p>	<p>The daily and final evaluation forms filled by the participants and administered by the facilitators (resource persons) indicated in general that they (participants) have acquired sufficient knowledge and skills to teach others. Asked to rate their understanding of public service ethics, 81% of the total trainers who responded to the questionnaire (69) believe that their understanding is now much better as shown in <i>Appendix 2:D</i>. Sampled heads of ministries/agencies (16) generally believe that trained trainers have transferred their knowledge to fellow employees.</p>
<p>Out put 3: Enhance trained employees capabilities in making ethical decisions</p>	<p>Increased discussion on ethics at work places</p>	<p>Reports by PSMO and TPSO and TPSC coupled with the consultants observation indicate that there is an increase in discussion on ethics at work places. Seventy five percent (75%) of the heads of departments/agencies think employees capabilities in making ethical decisions have somehow improved. More training covering all the employees is needed to have their capabilities highly improved.</p>
<p>Output 4: Strengthened ethics training capacities of Ministries, Departments and Agencies.</p>	<p>4.1 Number of trainers and trainees trained in the respective ministries, departments and agencies.</p>	<p>The evaluation study period covers up to November, 2003. Reports compiled by PSMO show that a total of 350 participants from MDAs in Tanzania mainland and Zanzibar were trained from January 2001 to November 2003. More are expected to be trained as the project is in progress. Funds approved and disbursed from Japan squeezed the training time and sessions in the implementing country. Sessions had to be carried out within a shorter period than planned – six or seven months instead of 9 months. That is July/August to January instead of May to January resulting into the extension of training courses up to the month of March. A follow-up report compiled by PSMO indicates that a total of 3344 employees had been trained by trainers at work places in different MDAs from May, 2001 through October, 2003.</p>

APPENDIX 5:A
PROJECT ACTIVITIES

Project Activities

List of Training Sessions Conducted from January 2001 to November 2003

Year	Participants	Timing	No. of Participants	Target Group	Course Content	Venue
2001	Senior and middle level officers	2001/01/08-2001/01/19	26	Participants from Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies.	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work and Gender issues.	Dar es Salaam, (Tanzania Public Service College)
2001	Senior and middle level officers	2001/01/29-2001/02/09	25	Different participants from Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies.	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work and Gender issues.	Dar es Salaam, (Tanzania Public Service College)

Appendix 5:A
2(8)

Year	Participants	Timing	No. of Participants	Target Group	Course Content	Venue
2001	Senior and middle level officers	2001/02/19-2001/03/02	24	Different participants from Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies.	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work and Gender issues.	Dar es Salaam, (Tanzania Public Service College)
2001	Senior and middle level officers	2001/03/12-2001/03/23	24	Different participants from Ministries, President Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work and Gender issues.	Dar es Salaam, (Tanzania Public Service College)

Appendix 5:A
3(8)

Year	Participants	Timing	No. of Participants	Target Group	Course Content	Venue
2001	Senor and middle level officers	2001/11/12-2001/11/23	21	Different participants from Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies.	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work and Gender issues.	Dar es Salaam, (Tanzania Public Service College)
2001	Senor and middle level officers	2001/12/03-2001/12/14	25	Different participants from Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies.	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work and Gender issues.	Dar es Salaam, (Tanzania Public Service College)
2002	Senior and middle level officers	2002/01/14-2002/01/25	24	Different participants from Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies.	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work and Gender issues.	Dar es Salaam, (Tanzania Public Service College)

Appendix 5:A
4(8)

Year	Participants	Timing	No. of Participants	Target Group	Course Content	Venue
2002	Senior and middle level officers	2002/02/25-2002/03/08	25	Different participants from Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies.	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work and Gender issues.	Dar es Salaam, (Tanzania Public Service College)
2002	Senior and middle level officers	2002/07/01-2002/07/12	22	Different participants from Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies.	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work and Gender issues.	Dar es Salaam, (Tanzania Public Service College)
2002	Senior and middle level officers	2002/08/12-2002/08/23	24	Different participants from Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies.	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work and Gender issues.	Dar es Salaam, (Tanzania Public Service College)

Appendix 5:A
5(8)

Year	Participants	Timing	No. of Participants	Target Group	Course Content	Venue
2002	Senior and middle level officers	2002/10/14-2002/10/25	19	Different participants from Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies and Zanzibar.	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work and Gender issues.	Dar es Salaam, (Tanzania Public Service College)
2003	Senior and middle level officers	2003/01/13-2003/01/24	23	Different participants from Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies and Zanzibar.	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work and Gender issues.	Dar es Salaam, (Tanzania Public Service College)
2003	Senior and middle level officers	2003/07/14-2003/07/25	26	Different participants from Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies and Zanzibar.	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work, Gender issues and HIV/AIDS.	Dar es Salaam (National Central Library)

Appendix 5:A
6(8)

Year	Participants	Timing	No. of Participants	Target Group	Course Content	Venue
2003	Senior and middle level officers	2003/08/11-2003/08/22	21	Different participants from Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies and Zanzibar.	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work, Gender issues and HIV/AIDS.	Dar es Salaam (National Central Library)
2003	Senior and middle level officers	2001/11/03-2003/11/14	21	Different participants from Ministries, President's Office, Vice President's Office, Prime Minister's Office, Departments and Agencies and Zanzibar.	Promoting ethics in Public Service, Corruption, understanding Public Service Reforms, Public servants responsibility and accountability, learning to pass on acquired skills to other employees, Legal frame work, Gender issues and HIV/AIDS.	Dar es Salaam (National Central Library)
Total			350			

Project Activities Cont.

2. Japanese Expert's Activities

Name	Scheme	Title	Activities
Mr. Inove	Medium/Short term	Training Advisor	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ He was available throughout the year 2000 at the project planning stage to give technical and management advice on the project's commencement and implementation. ▪ Prepared the syllabus for the Ethics Training course. ▪ Reviewed syllabus during initial project implementation and made recommendations (1 month each in years 2001 and 2002). ▪ Assisted in both management and co-ordination of the project in Public Service Management (PSM) where the project is being managed and the Tanzania Public Service College (TPSC) where the training sessions are being run and coordinated.

3 Trainers Train other Employees

Target Group	Timing	Number Trained
MDA's Employees	May 2001 – Oct. 2003	3,344
Consultants Survey	January – February 2004	3,637

Source: Consultant's Survey and PSMO Records.

Project Activities Cont.

4. Monitoring and Management of the Training of Employees in the participating institutions.

Target Group	Timing	Number Trained
MDAS employees	Throughout the Project Implementation Period	The PSM conducted a survey in 2002 to assess training activities in the MDAS being carried out by trained trainers who were expected to train fellow employees. Problems and some achievements were identified. MDAs submitted reports on the number of employees trained. PSM, TPSC and JICA through their expert were all involved in the management of project activities.

