

CHAPTER 8

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

CHAPTER 8 : CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

8.1 Conclusions

- (1) Contrary to Government's intentions to turnover of the target number of irrigation schemes for better O&M of infrastructure facilities, which has already passed little more than 20 years, applying "Full Cost Recovery Concept", is in very sorry plight. It is quite hard to find out or to identify target-oriented plans, which would show how much investments have been made for establishing required infrastructures to support the peoples' staple foods, how many irrigation schemes have been provided, how much costs are needed for maintaining them and how many WUAs shall be established, by when. On the other hand, the farmer engaged in irrigated agriculture who is the object of this Study is carrying forward the income diversification activities in order to make self-endurance of their own lives. Consequently, their mental and economical dependence on irrigated agriculture declines rapidly. The most pitiful point is that nobody, either government staff or farmers acknowledge or take responsibilities for current failures and low achievement rates.
- (2) Ongoing administrative reform process aims at a society that is blessed state's rich resources distributed more justly based on consciousness, a break from the old government attitudes that has conquered Indonesia until recently. Even though, the reform process attempts to develop a new paradigm of power distribution, state of confusion at the central and local governments level as a result, which infused peoples' indifference and distrust to the governments. It is expected to establish stable social structure that is available to owe obligations for public services as soon as possible and "Kabupaten governments" are planned under the decentralization policy. But it is recognized that some inclusive and integrated viewpoints based on middle and long term planning, are necessary to meet with the new paradigm. This exists mainly due to lack of capability and experiences for regional planning and budget disbursements.
- (3) The administrative system established after the Independence was a quite efficient for conveying instruction and orders from administrator of the day to the far ends of the societies while providing job opportunities into the system. Functions set into the system were to pass down any orders quickly and to eliminate obstacles to hinder the orders only, not others. But what being demanded to the governments now are creativities and self-reliance, which were most hated ones under the state power administration, and capability to ensure sufficient budgets to maintain the local society, which was granted from the central to the locals from the administrator of the day. Under such debtor administrative system depending on foreign loans and grants for most portion of the necessary national budget, who could grow senses of cash-oriented logics? who could expect efficiencies without such cash-orient logics?, and who could recognize his own responsibilities without seeking efficiencies? Senses and viewpoints as mentioned above are important for examining issues of human resources development at kabupaten government level. Also as reference points public awareness for farmers and young generations, who have observed and leant from the governments how to survive.
- (4) Besides of the above, most of farmers engaged in the irrigated agriculture never have occasions to involve in planning provisions of irrigation schemes, but only for issues of tertiary and

quarterly blocks. So they have “sense of ownership” only for those vicinity farm plots and their irrigation systems, but not so strongly for trunk facilities like intakes and primary / secondary canals. For farmers’ understandings actually, irrigation system developed before the Independence are objects just renounced by colonial dictators, and the facilities of “Untouchable Taboo” which developed by state power after the Independence. In rural communities tertiary and quarterly irrigation systems have been maintained well by local farmers as one of their rural community activities. For expanding and enhancing transfer of irrigation O&M by WUAs while setting targets to let farmers owe O&M of trunk facilities, it is indispensable to accelerate establishments of unit WUAs at first basing on such nucleus of traditional rural communities while making efforts to reform their awareness to accept “Full Cost Recovery concept”, and guide them to understand the necessity of O&M of trunk irrigation systems in upstream.

- (5) The manner of "the see-not, hear-not, and speak-not" was the surest art of defending their own interests under the state power policies. It avoided increasing and facing with the problems and conflicts by that manner on occasions of trade-off issues among community levels, too. It is not a common situation that farmers of downstream sides against compulsory water taking-outs in express discontents upstream that occurs frequently. It is due to their resignations. The administration, too, didn't take aggressive involvements to maintain irrigation O&M issues, as farmers’ personal problems. The JICA Study Team examined the contents of the Action Plans based on understandings the importance to utilize “Participatory Decision Making Procedure (RRA, PRA and Problem Analysis Procedure of PCM) applied in this JICA Study for letting farmers recognize the benefits of irrigation facilities as national assets.
- (6) "The unification in the diversity" was adopted as the motto for managing the country from the Independence to today and it gets to the point actually. Whilst being suggested to care "the diversity of the culture according to the area" at the time to commenced this Study, it was recognized the diversity was not affecting so deeply to define the diversity of irrigation O&M by culture actually. Originally, “Irrigation system” is possible to be understood as an implement to unify the diversities of the water resources, the landform situations and the previous water managements by locations region. Whilst examining ways to introduce and let accept the “Full Cost Recovery” concept is the main subject of the Study, objects of the concept is for the part of upper stream trunk facilities from secondary canal level actually, which requires measures mainly by WUA federation level, not by unit WUAs. As for the issue of establishing unit WUAs too, it was recognized that “Cultural diversity” does not share large part of factors than the issue of defining whether members would like to establish WUA or not or the issue whether potential persons for leader(s) are there or not who can command community people into one direction.
- (7) It became clearer that serious “distrust” relations are there between farmers and the governments, as background of low achievement of irrigation O&M transfer activities though spending about 20 years, while tracing the history of the policy basing on understandings procedures taken and characters of the governments as policy implementer and of farmer as policy recipients. Whilst could get closer the gaps between the government and farmers by the Independent, depth of the gap became more deeper than before. Farmers have no sense of ownership for the irrigation facilities constructed by the governments of the days. Also could find “internal distrust” among strata and sectors on the government side. Laws and regulations are to be effective due to “trust”. Provision of Action Plan of this Study has been preceded from viewpoints of “awaking sense of ownership” and “creation of partnership creation”, based on attempts of arousing “trust in the

society”.

- (8) Only the governments has maintained most of existing irrigation development schemes and their O&M activities actually, not inquiring farmers’ involvements, which can be said like “governments’ one-man show”. As parts of reasons and background of farmers’ weak sense of ownership and rarefied partnership, such history and procedures are there. Before transferring the authority of irrigation O&M to the farmer, so many problems are there for the governments, as the duty of former party concerned and "the public servant" of the new society. The Action Plans described in this report makes dealing with the problem of the local governments and the immediateness of the farmer a starting point and is developing a plan to the conception bridging to the future which was pictured in WATSAL. It is obvious that number of necessary preparation issues and time to be consumed is to be increased before reaching to the activity implementation, while moving the subject from vicinity to future issues. The Study Team understands that the government should not to wait for the time of completing all of necessary setting-ups and has to commence any actions available to handle, mobilizing available resources, mainly existing local government staffs, from the subjects laying in front of farmers and local government staffs. Especially, the setting of the targets of establishing unit WUAs and commencing the implementation are available to start immediately and the issues to do so. Also, "Coordination WUA support groups" attempted to form it by kabupaten level can be established now within present laws and regulations, too.
- (9) After establishing unit WUA(s), the government must wrestle with the subject of ISF charging. Creation of willingness to formulate WUA federation will be available through efforts of strengthening capability of problem finding and capability of their own management. But what the government can show how many “success stories” might be one of important keys, which is going to overturn “distrust” of farmers to the government. It will be quite important for the government to pile up efforts to co-share the experiences of to solve problems together with farmers and out sources like NGOs, like the IDTO schemes for realizing "the success stories".
- (10) It is already mentioned that “distrust” of farmers shared most of background of low achievement of the policy while passing about 20 years or so. Government have to commence necessary measures as soon as possible to clarify and summarize issues which parts are required to rehabilitate, how many rehabilitations are required and how much costs are necessary, as his own responsibility, if he would like to proceed the transfer the irrigation O&M for the upstream trunk facilities from the secondary canals. And also Government shall examine and set necessary rules of the cost allocation among related Kabupatens. For this purpose, implementing a case study even though only in selected provinces, is necessary available to spread results of those subject examinations to over the country in earlier stage.

8.2 Recommendations

8.2.1 Action Plans and WATSAL

Action Plans of this Study, owing transfer issue of irrigation O&M as the main subject, are examined to be in same line of WATSAL that Government has been trying to provide as the policy frame for water resources development and utilization, and provided from viewpoints of farmers and local government staffs who are dealing with irrigated agriculture. Even though never been complete yet to define details of the decentralization policy, the Action Plan are arranged the contents to be steadily

realized in the existence administration system. Government shall concentrate to set-up ways for implementation of the Action Plans in the early stage, encouraging the local governments that will become the centers of the local administration in near future, basing on re-recognitions of the importance of the subjects of the Study.

WATSAL is the structure adjustment loan, which affects water resource management and is a necessary policy frame surely to Indonesia attempting to realize decentralization reformation now. It is a kind of policy frame paid lots of wisdom and efforts, but it is said that further examinations and efforts are to be poured to make more concrete details to realize linkages with the actual laws and regulations to be utilized at field levels. Especially, in the operation of the decentralization just started now, the adjustments among the provincial and district governments for issues of cost allocation of developments and operations of rivers and water resources and the water right interpretation and so on but the establishment of the concrete system hasn't been completed. Government shall, relating with the Action Plans assembled to this report, make complete the concrete examination of the subjects left under WATSAL formation as soon as possible, with his all energy.

8.2.2 Irrigated Agriculture

Indonesian agriculture seems to be left under complicated administrative organizations over many ministries and agencies, even though passing through the Government's reformation this time. As many farmer and local government staffs are pointing out, such administrative conditions are leaving possibility to make complicate task and responsibility allocation for any irrigated agricultural issues. Present situation of farmers and local government staffs seem being left under non-political direction because Government has never issued definite state policy on agriculture, especially on irrigated agriculture by now. Hence Government shall try to create the situation which can describe a plan in the sure future which is available for farmers to predict and make concrete future plans, who are engaged in the national food production, through issuing the national agriculture policy that have to be background of irrigation O&M transfer which the Study has dealt with. Especially, the reform and the improvement of the manufacturing of the agricultural chemicals and manure, their distribution systems and so on, also non-functioning farmers' credit system and KUD system which is distrusted by farmers, are the issues to be dealt urgently.

8.2.3 WUA Database Operation

To enhance the transfer of O&M of irrigation, the concrete goal setting is very important which WUA(s) shall be established for the next term, while trying to understand farmers' constraints. The established WUA database in this Study consists general items of WUA organization, WUA activities, and conditions of crop cultivation, O&M management, name of respective irrigation scheme and its canal system at tertiary level. The result can be a prototype of "WUA Inventory" proposed as one of the Action Plan, and it is available to be adapted to provinces and districts as it is. Including setting-up necessary Information Technology (IT) infrastructure, Government shall make efforts to provide WUA Inventory as the basic preparation for O&M transfer, spreading the results over the country as soon as possible. The structure, the contents and the operations of the database are already completed and compiled into CD-ROM and been delivered to related province and district governments during the Phase II of this Study.

8.2.4 Other Issues

Many constraints exist in the background of the subjects of this Study. Among them the condition of everlasting poverty of farmer especially, that is caused by the traditional landholding system is affecting deeply. For instance in Java, the absentee landowner possesses about 50% of the irrigated paddy fields and the mechanism to pay about 50% of the crop yields as the rental fee is maintained, under the condition of the average acreage under cultivation of 0.30 ha / family. It shall be obvious that farmers can not improve the land productivity, the possibility of the incentive creation to farmers is to be limited and farmers' economical availability to owe the water charge will not be expanded, if not be improved such small tillage scale and the tenancy charge as present. Also the outer society surrounding the irrigated agriculture will affect in direction to accept the traditional labor concentration-type small-scale agriculture which restrains farmers. Government shall start the sincere effort to review the traditional landholding system in parallel of conducting this Project.

It was found out people, not only farmers but also government staffs, were restricted with spells, which they could not recognize & share social obligations while concentrating their own individual intensions due to surviving at risk of their lives, enduring philosophically. Some possibilities will be remained, which will misapply the Action Plans as giving carrots only, not asking obligations. Hence Government shall keep convictions to recover "Social trust" among the people, to stir their self-help efforts and competitive spirits for re-creating social duties of them, when Government is going to apply the Action Plans.

The Government adopted any loans and grants offered from the international donors to large part of necessary funds of national development projects, which were implemented after the independence. If Government will continue the same manner for national management activities, not only for development projects, that is to say "running on a hand-to-mouth basis" depending on loans and grants from foreign donors like previous, not with his own revenue, it will mean that Government could fail to wipe away the possibilities of wearing thin of cash-oriented recognitions similar to '90s, disruption of sense of responsibilities as civil servants and hovering in inefficient public services. The government shall aim to avoid from such a debt constitution and should immediately realize the mechanism, which can manage administration based on the financial sense.

Breakaway from the previous Government attitude has just began today for the people of Indonesia. A lot of problems are there to realize the society available to share the national wealth with fair rule. But unless the people could share the burden of countermeasures, the mountain of the problems will be increased than present. The Government should continue to pour the efforts to re-create "the trusteeship" climate, which shall be a foundation of the activities of the society, while attempting to develop capability to grasp the present situation for contributing to "the public service" as the presupposition of solving problems accumulated.