

CHAPTER 4
PROJECT EVALUATION

CHAPTER 4 PROJECT EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION

4.1 Project Effect

(1) Direct Effect

The following direct effects will be anticipated by the implementation of the Project.

- Some facilities of the former Market were forced to move out since the Dar es Salaam Port Channel Expansion Project had been executed. Therefore, the Market has not been functioning well. By implementing the Project, the Market will recover its function fully, resulting in improving fishery circulation.
- Water and sewage facilities have not been established in the Market, yet. Thus, the sanitary conditions in the Market have been bad. Such bad sanitary conditions will improve by the implementation of the Project.
- A time-consuming fish landing with fish retail activities in the sun is one of the reasons why the quantity of some of the fish catch becomes bad. Establishing a fish landing wharf and sufficient fishery facilities will contribute to improving the quality of fish catch.

(2) Indirect Effect

Banda Beach Market has been functioning as a market, serving fish and grocery foods to the public. In addition to the direct effects, the following indirect effects will be anticipated by the implementation of the Project.

- With the implementation of the Project, fresh fish and vegetables will be served to the 1.36 million Dar es Salaam public people, contributing to the improvement of their health.
- More people will gather in the Market and more sales will be expected, creating job opportunities and increasing revenues.

4.2 Need for Technical Cooperation

In order to operate and manage the Market effectively, DCC, the executing agency after the completion of the Project, and a private company, which will be sub-contracted, will establish regulations in advance, specifying selection of shops, tariffs, and usage of the facilities.

DCC has experienced subcontracting management work to a private company so that DCC can utilize its know-how to this Project. Since such private company has mastered such work, no problems for the management are expected. In Tanzania,

auction taxes are collected as revenues to the Government. Thus, no financial problems will be expected. However, since neither the Government nor a private company has dealt with fresh fish so far, some assistance will be necessary before commencing the operation. No other projects cover the same scope of this Project.

4.3 Recommendations

This Project will bring a variety of direct and indirect effects, contributing to the improving fishery productions, increasing fishermen's income and upgrading environment as mentioned in the preceding section. Moreover, the Project will enhance the development of the fishery sector in Tanzania and contribute to activating the local economy. Hence, implementation of the Project is recommended as a Japan's grant aid project.

After the completion of the Project, to operate the Market smoothly and effectively, the following recommendations need to be fully considered.

- The facilities will be controlled by a steering committee, which consists of DCC, market users, and representative of an administrative company. DCC have experienced subcontracting their works to private companies in a variety of enterprises. No serious problems are expected on that. However, DCC have no experience administrating fresh fish. Therefore, technical assistance in dealing with fresh fish will be necessary.
- Not all tariffs have been collected from market users except for those on ship registrations and wholesales. In the beginning of the operation at the new Market, it is anticipated that a subsidy from DCC be necessary to supplement a deficit in revenues. In order to operate the Market efficiently, it is mandatory to set up a new system to collect new tariffs and levy from the market users surely as early as possible.
- The number of existing shops is about 500. Most of the owners of retail shops and restaurants wish to place their shops at the new Market. Therefore, in selecting lease shops, it is necessary to set up some selection process and criteria.
- With the construction of a stair-type fish landing wharf, medium size fishing ships will use it to unload their fish catch, while small ships are expected to use the original unloading method by mooring in the beach. Considering the existing custom, it is difficult for all the fishermen to use the new wharf. It is recommended that using the new fish landing wharf be gradually introduced to all the fishermen.

- Once water supply and sewage facilities are developed, sanitary conditions will improve accordingly. However, that will not be achieved without cooperation with the market users. Thus, it is necessary to set up some rules and market users should obey the rules.
- Since it is impossible to accommodate all the necessary facilities on the reclamation area, the area beyond Ocean Road should be used for constructing some facilities. Although the area had been a property of a hotel, the land right was revoked. In the future, such issue should be swiftly cleared among the related organizations.

APPENDICES

Appendix 1 Member List of Survey Team

The field survey was conducted from July 8 to August 12, 1999. The members of the Survey Team are listed as follows.

<u>Position</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Organization</u>
Leader	Toru Shimoda	Japan International Cooperation Agency
Technical Advisor	Shoichi Ogasawara	Fishery Agency
Chief Consultant/ Marine Civil Engineer	Ryoichi Nishimura	Nippon Koei Co., Ltd.
Fishery Market Planning	Sachio Yamamoto	System Science Consultants Inc.
Civil Facilities Planning	Kowa Kajima	Nippon Koei Co., Ltd.
Fishery Facilities Planning	Kozo Kondo	System Science Consultants Inc.
Natural Condition Survey	Hiroyuki Takakaze	Nippon Koei Co., Ltd.
Construction Planning /Cost Estimate	Katsumi Naito	Nippon Koei Co., Ltd.

The Draft Report was explained to the Government of Tanzania from October 14 to October 24, 1999, by the Survey Team whose members are as follows.

<u>Position</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Organization</u>
Leader	Satoshi Torika	Fishery Agency
Chief Consultant/ Marine Civil Engineer	Ryoichi Nishimura	Nippon Koei Co., Ltd.
Fishery Market Planning	Sachio Yamamoto	System Science Consultants Inc.
Civil Facilities Planning	Kowa Kajima	Nippon Koei Co., Ltd.

Appendix 2 Survey Schedule

Field Survey

No.	Date	Day	Itinerary	Accommodation	Activities
1	8 July	Thu	Mr. Shimoda, Mr. Ogasawara, Mr. Nishimura, Mr. Yamamoto, Mr. Kondo and Mr. Kajima (From Narita to London, From London to Dar Es Salaam)	In Transit	
2	9 July	Fri		Dar Es Salaam	Courtesy Call on MNRT, MOF, DCC and JICA
3	10 July	Sat		Dar Es Salaam	Site Reconnaissance
4	11 July	Sun		Dar Es Salaam	Site Reconnaissance
5	12 July	Mon		Dar Es Salaam	Courtesy Call on THA, MLHS, Japanese Embassy, Discussion about IC/R
6	13 July	Tue		Dar Es Salaam	Meeting at President's Office, Field Survey
7	14 July	Wed		Dar Es Salaam	Meeting at MNRT, Site Meeting with Chief Secretary of the President, Hearing Survey, Field Survey
8	15 July	Thu		Dar Es Salaam	Meeting at MLHS, THA and MNRT, Field Survey
9	16 July	Fri	Mr. Shimoda, Mr. Ogasawara (Leave Dar Es Salaam)	Dar Es Salaam	Signing for the Minutes of Discussion, Report on Progress of Field Survey to Japan Embassy and JICA
10	17 July	Sat		Dar Es Salaam	Marketing Survey, Field Survey
11	18 July	Sun	Mr. Naito (Arrive at Dar Es Salaam)	Dar Es Salaam	Meeting which is concerned with Cost Estimate, Field Survey
12	19 July	Mon		Dar Es Salaam	Data Collection, Meeting at THA, Meeting with the related of the Ferry Construction, Field Survey
13	20 July	Tue		Dar Es Salaam	Meeting with Environmental Conference, Field Survey
14	21 July	Wed		Dar Es Salaam	Marketing Survey, Field Survey
15	22 July	Thu		Dar Es Salaam	Data Collection and Field Survey
16	23 July	Fri	Mr. Kajima (Leave Dar Es Salaam)	Dar Es Salaam	Data Collection and Field Survey
17	24 July	Sat		Dar Es Salaam	Mechanical Investigation, questionnaire survey and Field Survey
18	25 July	Sun		Dar Es Salaam	Field Survey
19	26 July	Mon	Mr. Kondo (Leave Dar Es Salaam)	Dar Es Salaam	Meeting with Director of MNRT, Field Survey
20	27 July	Tue	Mr. Takakaze (Arrive at Dar Es Salaam)	Dar Es Salaam	Soil Data Collection, Field Survey
21	28 July	Wed		Dar Es Salaam	Meeting with the Director who Ferry of the MOW, Field Survey
22	29 July	Thu		Dar Es Salaam	Burrow Pit Survey, Data Collection, Field Survey
23	30 July	Fri		Dar Es Salaam	Burrow Pit Survey and Building Material Survey, Report on Progress of Field Survey to Japan Embassy and JICA
24	31 July	Sat		Dar Es Salaam	Field Survey
25	1 August	Sun	Mr. Naito (Leave Dar Es Salaam)	Dar Es Salaam	Field Survey
26	2 August	Mon	Mr. Nishimura and Mr. Yamamoto (Leave Dar Es Salaam)	Dar Es Salaam	Meeting and Discussion, Field Survey
27	3 August	Tue		Dar Es Salaam	Field Survey
28	4 August	Wed		Dar Es Salaam	Field Survey
29	5 August	Thu		Dar Es Salaam	Field Survey

No.	Date	Day	Itinerary	Accommodation	Activities
30	6 August	Fri		Dar Es Salaam	Field Survey
31	7 August	Sat		Dar Es Salaam	Field Survey
32	8 August	Sun		Dar Es Salaam	Field Survey
33	9 August	Mon		Dar Es Salaam	Report on Progress of Field Survey to JICA, Field Survey
34	10 August	Tue	Mr. Takakaze (Leave Dar Es Salaam)	In Transit	Meeting with DCC
35	11 August	Wed	Arrive at London, Leave London	In Transit	
36	12 August	Thu	Arrive at Narita		

Explanation of Draft Report

No.	Date	Day	Itinerary	Accommodation	Activities
1	14 October	Thu	Mr. Katori, Mr. Nishimura, Mr. Yamamoto, Mr. Kajima (From Narita to London, From London to Dar Es Salaam)	In Airplane	
2	15 October	Fri		Dar Es Salaam	Courtesy Call on MNRT, MOF, DCC and JICA
3	16 October	Sat		Dar Es Salaam	Site Reconnaissance
4	17 October	Sun		Dar Es Salaam	Site Reconnaissance
5	18 October	Mon		Dar Es Salaam	Courtesy Call on THA, MLHS, Japanese Embassy, Discussion about D/F Report
6	19 October	Tue		Dar Es Salaam	Meeting at President's Office, Field Survey
7	20 October	Wed		Dar Es Salaam	Meeting at MNRT, Site Meeting with Chief Secretary of the President, Hearing Survey, Field Survey
8	21 October	Thu		Dar Es Salaam	Meeting at MLHS, THA and MNRT, Field Survey
9	22 October	Fri	Mr. Katori, Mr. Nishimura, Mr. Yamamoto, Mr. Kajima (Leave Dar Es Salaam)	In Airplane	Signing for the Minutes of Discussion, Report on Progress of Field Survey Report to Japan Embassy and JICA
10	23 October	Sat	Arrive at London, Leave London	In Airplane	
11	24 October	Sun	Arrive at Narita		

Appendix 3 Member List of Concerned Parties in the Recipient Country

President's Office

Mr. Matern Y. C. Lumbanga	Chief Secretary
Mr. Joseph N. Isaka	Coordinator, Office of the Chief Secretary

Ministry of Finance

Mr. Prosper J. Mbena	Commissioner for External Finance
Mr. Bitungwa	Japan Desk Officer

Ministry of Natural Resource and Tourism

Mr. Philemon L. Luhanjo	Permanent Secretary
Mr. Thomas Maembe	Director, Fisheries Department
Mr. Geofry F. Nanyaro	Deputy Director, Fisheries Department
Mr. S.P.N. Kimaro	Deputy Director, Fisheries Department
Mr. Mapunda	Deputy Director, Fisheries Department
Mr. Moreni	Fisheries Officer/Counterpart
Mr. Jihulya	Fisheries Officer/Counterpart

Dar es Salaam City Commission

Mr. Chales N. Keenja	Chairman
Mr. Alfred Fuko	Commissioner Secretary
Mr. John M. Lubuva	Deputy Commissioner Secretary
Mr. Salim Chima	Deputy Commissioner Secretary
Mr. Raphael S. Ndunguru	Commissioner for Urban Planning
Mr. Chacha S. Mwita	Commissioner for Works
Ms. Suwai	Commissioner for Trade and Economic
Mr. Mkama	Commissioner for Administration
Mr. Muya	Health Department
Mr. Bonifae Mellys	Economist, Trade and Economic Department
Mr. Ntima	Fish Market Officer/ Project Counterpart
Mr. Juma Msangi	Banda Beach Fish Market (officer-in-charge)
Mr. J.S. Kiwale	Former Officer, City Natural Resource

Ministry of Lands and Human Settlement

Mr. Mughweno	Director, Planning Division
Ms. Mary H. C. Stella Longway	Commissioner of Land

Ministry of Works

Mr. J. S. Ndunguru	Director, Electrical & Mechanical Division
--------------------	--

Tanzania Harbors Authority

Mr. Ramadhan N. Mwamandongo	Chief Design Engineer
Mr. Meteru	Senior Design Engineer

Begani Fishery Center

Mr. K. Matwanje Principal

Tanzania Fishery Institute

Prof. Philip O. J. Bwathondi Director General

National Environment Management Council

Mr. Magnus Ngoile Director General
Ms. Lydia A. Mbwele Principal Pollution Control Officer

Japanese Embassy

Mr. Keitaro Sato An Envoy Extraordinary and Ambassador
Mr. Yuzo Ota Minister Plenipotentiary
Mr. Masayuki Kawano First Secretary
Mr. Kenzi Yoshioka First Secretary

JICA Tanzania Office

Mr. Shinya Nakai Resident Representative
Mr. Shinichiro Nimi Assistant Resident Representative

National Income Generation Program

Mr. K.W. Salewi Civil Engineer

Representative of Fish Market

Mr. Abdulkadiri Mshamu Hemedi VUSHA
Mr. Dismus Mauye Fish processor (dried fish)
Mr. Hafai Mohamedi Fire wood dealer
Mr. Ismail Omari Liwanga DSM Dealers of Sea shells
Mr. Juma Japan Ngonye Vegetable dealer
Ms. M. Mohamedi (Mama Didi) Ass/chairman, MUUNGANO (Mama Ntihe)
Mr. Mustafa Salumu Fruit and Vegetable dealer
Mr. Nassoro Ismail Nassoro WASWI
Mr. Nassoro Omari Mbagu WASWI
Mr. Rajhidi Mohamedi Cumbe Chairman, VUSHA
Mr. Salmu Bakari VUSHA
Mr. Selemani Saidi Kissande WASWI

Others

Mr. James Yonazi National Programme Officer, FAO
Mr. B. V. Luhui General Manager, Kariakoo Market Corporation

Appendix 4 List of Collected Materials

1. Economic Bulletin for the Quarter Ended 30th September 1997 Vol. XXVII No.3
2. National Environmental Policy
3. Proposed Environmental Standards: Municipal and Industrial Wastewaters
4. Dar es Salaam Port Development Study 1994-2000 Volume 6 Environmental Assessment
5. Geotechnical Investigation for the Proposed PPF Tower
6. The Rolling Plan and Forward Budget for Tanzania for the Period 1994/5-1996/7
7. The Rolling Plan and Forward Budget for Tanzania for the Period 1996/7-1998/9
8. National Fisheries Sector Policy and Strategy Statement, December 1997
9. Fisheries Division Annual Statistics Report 1995
10. Fisheries Legislation
11. Monthly Economic Review