

Ex-Post Project Evaluation 2019 :
Package III-4 (Mozambique, Honduras)

November 2019

JAPAN INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION AGENCY

GLOBAL GROUP 21 JAPAN, INC.

EV
JR
20-34

Disclaimer

This report compiles the result of the ex-post evaluations. These are conducted by external evaluators to ensure objectivity, and the views and recommendations herein do not necessarily reflect the official views and opinions of JICA. JICA is not responsible for the accuracy of the English translation, and the Japanese version shall prevail in the event of any inconsistency with the English version.

Minor amendments may be made when the contents of this report is posted on JICA's website.

Comments by JICA and/or the Counterpart Agencies may be added at the end of the evaluation report when the views held by them differ from those of the external evaluator.

No part of this report may be copied or reprinted without the consent of JICA.

The Republic of Mozambique

FY2019 Ex-Post Evaluation of Japanese Grant Aid Project

“The Project for Construction of Health Science Institute in Maputo”

External Evaluator: Katsunori Sawai, Global Group 21 Japan, Inc.

0. Summary

The project was implemented to newly construct the Health Science Institute in the Infulene district of Maputo City (*Instituto de Ciências de Saúde de Maputo*, hereinafter referred as “ICSI”) and to supply the necessary equipment, in addition to the existing institute in Maputo (hereinafter referred as “ICSM”), with the objective of improving the training circumstances for mid-level health care professionals, thereby contributing to improving the quality of health medical services through the expansion of health care professionals who have mastered the appropriate skills. In Mozambique which had serious problems regarding the shortage of health care professionals, the training of health care professionals was an important issue at the times of ex-ante as well as ex-post evaluation, so the project was highly consistent with the development policy and needs. It also corresponded to the Government of Japan’s aid policy at the time of planning, which emphasized support in the health sector. Therefore, the relevance of the project is high. The project scope was almost realized as planned and the cost and period were within the plan. Therefore, the project efficiency is high. As for the operation and effect indicators set in the plan, the number of graduates in 2019 from the odontology and the equipment maintenance courses achieved the target, and the number of classes per classroom in ICSI and ICSM was also improved very much. However, since the Ministry of Health (hereinafter referred as “MOH”) aims to decrease the number of operated classes and to organize 20 students per class based on a policy of “improving the quality of education”, the facilities designed on the assumption of 30 students per class are not fully utilized, and the overall number of graduates in ICSI and ICSM does not reach the target. Therefore, the project effectiveness and impacts are fair. As for the operation and maintenance, some problems can be partly recognized in each aspect of institution/organization, technique, finance and status. It is necessary to provide continuous training for the teachers, resolve the perennial budget shortages, secure teaching materials and consumables, install a well water sterilizer, connect to the internet and so on. Therefore, the project sustainability is fair. Considering the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

1. Project Description



Project Location



Auditorium & Water Tower

1.1 Background

The health and medical system in Mozambique was extremely weak and one of the reasons was a serious shortage of health care professionals. Since the early 1990s, after the end of civil war in Mozambique, the government had continuously promoted training of health care professionals. As a result, the number of health care professionals more than doubled during the 10 years from 2000 to 2010 and the number of doctors, nurses and midwives per 100,000 population became 46 in 2010 and was expected to be 65 in 2015.¹ However, it did not reach the level of 230 recommended by the World Health Organization (WHO). Therefore, the further expansion of health services and increase in the number of necessary health care professionals remained big issues in Mozambique.

The Health Science Institutes (*Instituto Ciências de Saúde*, hereinafter referred as “ICS”), which mainly train mid-level health care professionals, were located in four main cities, namely Maputo, Beira, Nampula and Quelimane, and ICSM was the largest one in the country. However, after the Higher Institute of Health Sciences (*Instituto Superior de Ciências de Saúde*, hereinafter referred as “ISCISA”) started to share the ICSM facility in 2004, ICSM could use only six classrooms, humanistic and multidisciplinary laboratories and one PC² room for more than 1,000 students. It meant that the facilities and equipment in ICSM were remarkably insufficient, so ICSM could not offer better education with emphasis on practical training and this affected the quality of education.³

Against the background mentioned above, the Government of Mozambique requested Japanese grant aid to newly construct ICSI and to supply the necessary equipment in order to improve and strengthen the training for mid-level health care professionals. Then, the project was implemented.

¹ See “Health Sector Review 2012”, MOH.

² The desktop computer.

³ See “Preparatory Study Report on The Project for Construction of Health Science Institute in Maputo” by JICA, January, 2014.

1.2 Project Outline

The objective of this project is to improve the training circumstances for mid-level health care professionals by newly constructing ICSI and supplying the necessary training equipment, thereby contributing to improving the quality of health medical services in Mozambique through the expansion of health care professionals who have mastered the appropriate skills.

Grant Limit / Actual Grant Amount	(Detailed Design) 84 million yen / 83 million yen (Project) 2,071 million yen / 2,069 million yen
Exchange of Notes (E/N) Date /Grant Agreement (G/A) Date	(Detailed Design) January 2014 / January 2014 (Project) June 2014 / June 2014 (Additional Grant) July 2015 / July 2015
Executing Agency	Ministry of Health
Project Completion	July, 2016
Target Area	Infulene district in Maputo
Main Contractor(s)	(Construction) Dai Nippon Construction (Equipment) Nissei Trading Co. Ltd.
Main Consultant(s)	Matsuda Consultants International Co. Ltd./ INTEM Consulting Inc. (JV)
Preparatory Survey	February 2013 – January 2014
Related Projects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The Project for Strengthening Pedagogical and Technical Skills of Teachers of Health Training Institute (2012–2016) ➤ The Project for Strengthening Pedagogical and Technical Skills of Health Personnel in Mozambique (ProFORSA II) (2016–2019) ➤ The Project for Improvement of Infrastructure and Equipment of Training Schools for Health Personnel (Grant Agreement in 2008) ➤ Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteers (JOCV) (2013–)

2. Outline of the Evaluation Study

2.1 External Evaluator

Katsunori Sawai, Global Group 21 Japan, Inc.

2.2 Duration of Evaluation Study

This ex-post evaluation study was conducted with the following schedule.

Duration of the Study: September 2019 – November 2020

Duration of the Field Study: January 15, 2020 – February 6, 2020

2.3 Constraints during the Evaluation Study

As for “improving the quality of health and medical services” as the project impact, it might be integrated into “patients’ feeling of satisfaction”, so the evaluator tried to conduct interview survey of patients for the qualitative analysis. However, since it seemed that patients were more interested in clinical matters, significant interviews about the health and medical services in a broad sense were limited.⁴

3. Results of the Evaluation (Overall Rating: B⁵)

3.1 Relevance (Rating: ③⁶)

3.1.1 Consistency with the Development Plan of Mozambique

In *the National Development Plan* (2010-2014) of Mozambique, human and social development including the health sector was recognized as one of the main issues for comprehensive economic growth and poverty reduction. In addition, human development in the health sector was a priority policy in *the Strategic Plan in Health Sector (Plano Estrategico do Sector Saúde*, hereinafter referred as “PESS”) (2013-2017), while *the Human Resource Development Plan in Health Sector* (2008-2015) raised four pillars, namely 1) organization of services and regulatory framework, 2) management skills at different levels, 3) distribution, motivation and retention of health care professionals, and 4) capacity of the initial education network and continuous training. The construction plan of ICSI was included into activities related to initial education.

At the time of ex-post evaluation, priority No.2 in *the Five Year Program* (2015-2019) says “developing human and social capital”, while the strategic objectives include “expand access and improve the quality of health services” and “reduce various diseases”. For that, the national health services would be expanded by increasing health care professionals. This policy can be recognized in *the National Development Strategy* (2015-2035) as well. PESS (2014-2019) renewed under this superior policy raised “better health services” and “reform agenda (decentralization)” as important pillars to tackle the big issue of fragile health sector and set seven objectives such as “increase access and utilization”, “improve the quality and humanization”, “reduce inequalities”, etc. Furthermore, the revised *Human Resource Development Plan in Health Sector (Plano Nacional de Desenvolvimento dos Recursos Humanos Para a Saude*, hereinafter referred as “PNDRHS”) (2016-2025) stated the strategic objectives of: 1) increase the availability and equity of competent and committed health professionals, 2) retain the health professional field at the medium level and in the primary network, 3) raise the level of satisfaction, competence and commitment of health professionals and 4) support the

⁴ “Quality of Health and Medical Services” may be expected in a different way by each staff in charge of clinical matter and administration and by each patient. According to Tomita, it can be divided into “clinical quality” and “service quality”, and it can be considered that when the clinical quality is better the satisfaction of patients is higher. However, it should be noted that the needs of patients are various. (Kenji Tomita, “Medical Quality and Service Quality”, *The Doshisha Business Review* Vol. 63, No. 1&2, July 2011)

⁵ A: Highly satisfactory, B: Satisfactory, C: Partially satisfactory, D: Unsatisfactory

⁶ ③: High, ②: Fair, ①: Low

implementation of a renewed legal and institutional framework.

As mentioned above, the Government of Mozambique emphasized securing human resources in the health sector both qualitatively and quantitatively at the time of the project planning as well as the ex-post evaluation. Therefore, the project is consistent with the development policy in Mozambique.

3.1.2 Consistency with the Development Needs of Mozambique

As for the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) No.4 (Reduce Child Mortality) and No.5 (Improve Maternal Health), the under-5 mortality rate was 87.2 per 1,000 live births in 2013 and 72.0 in 2017, and the maternal mortality ratio was 480 per 100,000 live births in 2013 and 489 in 2015 respectively in Mozambique. Those were at the lower level among neighbouring countries.⁷ The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), for which 2030 is the target year, establish the target No.3 “Good Health and Well-Being” and the issues of “Reduce Child Mortality” and “Improve Maternal Health” are continuously addressed. It also advocates increasing the recruitment, development, training and retention of the health workforce. It means that the project objective also corresponds to the SDGs.

The absolute shortage of health care professionals in Mozambique is, however, very serious. PNDRHS (2016-2025) set the indicators shown in Table 1 regarding human resource development in main areas of the health sector. According to those, although the demand for health care professionals is very big it is difficult to train the necessary number of professionals in each area due to the shortage of facilities, budget, teachers and the necessity to ensure quality of human resource. The same situation will continue in the future.

Table 1: Human Resource Development Plan in Health Sector

	Number of Necessary Staffs			Actual in 2015	Number Planned	
	2015	2020	2025		2020	2025
Mid-level Health Care Professional (Rate of Sufficiency)	47,725	57,654	68,638	15,714 (33%)	27,415 (48%)	38,986 (57%)
Nurse (per 100,000 People) (Rate of Sufficiency)	10,988	14,487	18,302	6,943 (27.0) (63%)	8,998 (30.7) (62%)	11,153 (33.6) (61%)
Midwife (per 100,000 People) (Rate of Sufficiency)	7,993	9,852	11,934	5,159 (48.3) (65%)	6,488 (54.1) (66%)	7,543 (56.3) (63%)
Pharmacist (Rate of Sufficiency)	3,639	4,398	5,284	1,831 (50%)	2,511 (57%)	3,325 (63%)
Dental Technician (Rate of Sufficiency)	2,536	2,913	3,260	467 (18%)	689 (24%)	926 (28%)

Source: PNDRHS (2016-2025)

⁷ See WHO Global Health Observatory 2015, 2019.

Currently, nine ICSs and nine training centers are operated as public institutes in Mozambique, and there are also 25 private training institutes. Owing to the fact that the facility of ICSI is the largest among them and has sufficient laboratory equipment, ICSI can take a core role in training mid-level health care professionals.

On the other hand, ICSM shares the building with ISCISA as it was. ICSM can use six classrooms now and another three classrooms are available out of building. When there were more classes, space was allotted from the Central Hospital, which is adjacent to ICSM. The laboratory is also shared with ISCISA.

Therefore, the training of health care professionals is urgently needed both qualitatively and quantitatively and it can be said that the project is consistent with the development needs in Mozambique.

3.1.3 Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy

In the Country Assistance Program for Mozambique in 2013, human development was one of key issues and assistance to the health sector was located in the basic health improvement program. Also, the Japanese government declared in TICAD V⁸ in June 2013 to offer 50 billion yen of support to health sector and to train 120,000 health workers. The project realized this commitment.⁹ Accordingly, the project corresponded to Japan's ODA policy for Mozambique in the planning stage.

As described above, this project has been highly relevant to the country's development plan and development needs as well as Japan's ODA policy. Therefore, its relevance is high.

3.2 Efficiency (Rating: ③)

3.2.1 Project Outputs

The first tender for construction under Japanese aid was cancelled because the tender price was above the ceiling. In the process of preparation of re-tender, it was deemed appropriate to exclude the component of male dormitory to adjust the budget. However, due to the sudden change of exchange rate¹⁰ during rearrangement of the tender conditions, it was decided to exclude the components of teachers' house and the corridor not directly linked to the educational activities. At this point, since it was difficult procedurally to increase the amount of Japanese aid, these changes were inevitable. After that, since MOH was confronted with budgetary pressure due to heavy floods in early 2015 and could not find another financial source for construction of the male dormitory, MOH requested it to the Government of Japan again and the revised E/N and G/A were concluded to increase the amount of grant aid. Although minor

⁸ The 5th Tokyo International Conference on African Development

⁹ Press release "Exchange of Notes concerning Grant Aid to Mozambique", Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Japan, Jan.12, 2014.

¹⁰ Average monthly exchange rate was 1USD=108.07Yen in September 2014 and 1USD=117.20Yen in November 2014.

changes of design were applied during implementation, construction was completed as planned in the revised G/A.

JICA understood that the teachers' house and the corridor, which were excluded from the scope of Japanese aid, must be constructed under the responsibility of MOH. However, those components have not been realized. And there is no concrete schedule to do so in near future. The understandings of MOH at the time of ex-post evaluation was, "the teachers' house and the corridor would be constructed when the budget was available, and it was not required to

Table 2: Project Outputs (Plan and Actual)

Plan (Revised Grant Agreement on July, 2015) ¹¹	Actual (turnover on July, 2016)
<p>【Works by Japanese Side】</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Total floor area : 8,903.40 m² ➤ 2 Buildings for Laboratory & Classroom (2,228.58 m²) ➤ Building for Teachers' room & Classroom (1,128.16 m²) ➤ Building for Library & Administration 1 (1,023.65 m²) ➤ 3 Toilet facilities (320.54 m²) ➤ Auditorium (514.95 m²) ➤ Cafeteria (649.25 m²) ➤ 2 Student dormitories (Male/Female, totally 2,790.48 m²) ➤ Car garage & Guardroom (totally 174.00 m²) ➤ Water tower (21.29 m²) ➤ Water tank, Electric room (52.50 m²), Flagpole, Septic tank 	<p>【Works by Japanese side】</p> <p>As planned.</p>
<p>【Works by Mozambican side】</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Teachers' house (apartment house for 4 families, 481.60 m²) ➤ Corridor (386.25 m²) ➤ Clearance of existing facilities, trees, etc. in the site ➤ Construction of wall on border, ditch (along the road), gate ➤ Construction of access road ➤ Setting internet equipment & LAN facility ➤ Others (furniture, office materials, dishes, clothes, etc. 	<p>【Works by Mozambican side】</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Clearance of existing facilities, trees, etc. in the site ➤ Construction of wall on border, drainage (along the road), gate ➤ Construction of access road ➤ Others (furniture, office materials, dishes, clothes, etc.
<p>【Equipment】</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ For a humanistic laboratory ➤ For a multidisciplinary laboratory ➤ For an odontological laboratory ➤ For a laboratory of equipment maintenance ➤ For the facility operations 	<p>【Equipment】</p> <p>As planned.</p>

Source: documents provided by JICA

¹¹ As for "Plan" to evaluate the project efficiency, it is obedient to JICA's policy that is "the project scope, cost and period of the time when additional grant aid extended shall be utilized as the project plan, because those are recognized as justifiable and reasonable changes by conclusion of the revised G/A.

complete them within the project period”. Since there was no confirmation letter about this changed scope between JICA and MOH, it seems that the communication between the two sides were hindered. Therefore, in this ex-post evaluation, it is considered that the teachers’ house and the corridor should be completely removed from the overall project scope. The fence works, gate works, and entrance paving road works, which were borne by MOH, were not finished at the time of project completion, but were implemented immediately after that. Connecting to the internet was not realized due to the budget shortage. As mentioned above, the works borne by MOH were mostly completed as planned although some components have still not been implemented.

As for the procurement of equipment, units or specifications were revised according to the design changes. Even after the detailed design, some items of equipment, such as projector and PC, etc., were subject to model changes due to suspension of production by the manufacturers. However, such changes are deemed to be very minor and the equipment was delivered without any changes from the plan of revised G/A.

3.2.2 Project Inputs

3.2.2.1 Project Cost

The first tender for construction borne by Japanese aid was cancelled because the tender price was above the ceiling, and the re-tender was conducted after removing the components of male dormitory, teachers’ house and corridor from the scope of Japanese aid. Thereafter, the construction of male dormitory was, as mentioned before, added in the project scope for Japanese aid and the revised E/N and G/A were concluded to increase the amount. As a result, the grant amount for construction borne by Japanese aid was changed from 1,635 million yen to 1,861 million yen, and the actual expenditure became 1,860 million yen, which was within the plan.

The cost to be borne by the Mozambican side was estimated as 326 million yen according to the JICA documents when the additional grant aid was decided for construction of the male dormitory. However, such an amount of 326 million yen including the teachers’ house and the corridor was not recognized by MOH. According to MOH, the actual expenditure by Mozambican side on the project completion was about 5 million Mt.¹² for clearance of structures in the project area before construction started and 19.8 million Mt. during the project period, but it did not include the amount of bank charge or tax exemptions. Therefore, the total project cost for construction is unknown. Meanwhile, the cost of detailed design, project supervision and equipment supply was not changed very much.

As mentioned above, the project cost should be evaluated only with the cost borne by Japanese side. It means that the cost was within the plan.

¹² Currency in Mozambique “Meticais”. The exchange rate at the time of ex-post evaluation in January 2020 is 1 Mt. = 1.748 Yen.

Table 3: Project Cost (unit: Million Japanese Yen)

	Plan (Revised Grant Agreement on July 2015)	Actual (turnover on July 2016)
Detailed Design	84	83
Work Supervision	76	76
Construction	1,861	1,860
Equipment	134	133
Cost in Japanese side	2,155	2,152
Cost in Mozambican side	326	unknown
Total	2,481	—

Source: documents provided by JICA

3.2.2.2 Project Period

The detailed design was commenced two months after the conclusion of G/A and the first tender for construction borne by Japanese aid was opened in September 2014. However, the tender was cancelled due to the excess budget and the re-tender was done in January 2015. Although it took a time to review the project scope and cost during the preparation of re-tender, the construction was commenced in January 2015 as planned. When the re-tender was done, the schedules for preparatory work and for inspection before the turnover was reviewed realistically and the entire project period was changed from 15 months to 18 months. Eventually, the construction contract was concluded to complete the work in July 2016.

This contract was changed in July 2015 to add construction of the male dormitory. Since the contractor which had already done the female dormitory knew the material procurement and the construction management, it was possible to complete the work within the period set in the contract. Therefore, the direct appointment for the additional component was appropriate. As a result, although some of components implemented by Mozambican side were left over, the project was completed and transferred to the Mozambican side in July 2016 as planned in the revised G/A.

As for the procurement of equipment, the contract was concluded in January 2015 and the equipment was supplied and installed according to the construction schedule. The procurement of equipment was also completed in July 2016.

There was a concern in Mozambican side about budgetary allocation for tax exemption measure in the project planning stage. Actually, the refunding procedure of tax exemption was not implemented smoothly. Therefore, the contractor transferred the project after receiving a letter from MOH, which confirmed that MOH refunded the tax at the time of project transfer. Thereafter, the refund was completed.

As described above, the project cost was within the plan and the project period was as

planned. Therefore, efficiency of the project is high.¹³

3.3 Effectiveness and Impacts¹⁴ (Rating: ②)

3.3.1 Effectiveness

3.3.1.1 Quantitative Effects (Operation and Effect Indicators)

(1) Operation and effect indicators set in the plan

Table 4 shows a comparison between the plan and actual in terms of the operation and effect indicators that were set in the project planning stage. The number of graduates in 2019 from the courses of odontology and equipment maintenance was 50 against 48 in the plan and 26 against 24 in the plan, respectively. However, based on the project background and objective, since those indicators just explain a part of the project effectiveness, another analysis on the graduates from ICSI and ICSM must be done as described below.

The number of classes per classroom collectively in ICSI and ICSM was 2.0 in 2019, almost as planned. However, since ICSI and ICSM are operated independently, the analysis should be separately done. The findings are as follows;

- 15 classrooms are available in ICSI. Since 24 classes were operated in 2019, the number of classes per classroom was 1.6. ICSI applied a system of two shifts per day, so the number of classrooms in ICSI was enough in 2019. It is said that the classrooms were full in the morning session but six classrooms were not used in the afternoon.

Table 4: Operation and Effect Indicators

	Baseline	Target	Actual		
	2013	2019	2017	2018	2019
	(ICSM only)	3 Years After Completion	1 Year After Completion	2 Years After Completion	3 Years After Completion
No. of Yearly Graduates from Dental Technician Course in ICSI	(0)	48	0	0	50
No. of Yearly Graduates from Equipment Maintenance Course in ICSI	(0)	24	0	0	26
No. of Classes per Classroom at ICSI and ICSM	(6.7)	2.0	2.2	1.9	2.0
(Reference) ICSI only	—	—	(0.9)	(1.2)	(1.6)
(Reference) ICSM only	(6.7)	—	(5.3)	(3.5)	(2.8)

Source: documents provided JICA, ICSI and ICSM

¹³ Since the teachers' house and the corridor which were expected to be implemented by the Mozambican side were considered to be excluded from the overall Project scope, those components are not evaluated as the subjects which should be completed within the Project period.

¹⁴ Sub-rating for Effectiveness is to be put with consideration of Impacts.

- In ICSM, the six classrooms are available. Since 17 classes were operated in 2019, it was 2.8 classes per classroom¹⁵, which did not reach the target. Since the number of classes per classroom in ICSM was 6.7 before the project implementation, the situation was improved very much.

(2) Graduates from ICSI and ICSM

In light of the project objective to expand mid-level health care professionals, it is important to compare the planned and the actual number of graduates from both ICSI and ICSM. As shown in Table 5, although the entire number of graduates exceeded the plan in 2017 and in 2018, it was limited to about 70% of the target in 2019. Moreover, the contribution of ICSM was large. The respective numbers of graduates from ICSI and ICSM are different from the planned number, and the reasons for this are considered as follows;

- On the assumption that some of the courses operated in ICSM would be transferred completely from ICSM to ICSI, ICSI planned on receiving students learning in ICSM. However, only courses of public nurse (preventive medicine) and odontology were actually transferred from ICSM, while courses for nurses, midwives, medical technicians, laboratory technicians and pharmacists, etc. remained in ICSM. The reasons were that MOH decided to reduce the number of classes for improvement in the quality of education.
- Although ICSI planned to receive students from the 2nd semester starting in July 2016, the facilities were not completed in time for that. In addition, time was required to recruit the teachers, the staff members, etc. to prepare for opening the institute. Eventually, ICSI was opened from the 1st semester starting in February 2017.

Table 5: Number of Graduates and Completed Classes in ICSI and ICSM

		Plan			Actual		
		2017	2018	2019	2017	2018	2019
ICSI	No. of Graduates	258	464	413	/	229	161
	No. of Completed Classes	10	18	16		9	7
ICSM	No. of Graduates	103	77	77	468	337	175
	No. of Completed Classes	4	3	3	19	13	9
Total	No. of Graduates	361	541	490	468	566	336
	No. of Completed Classes	14	21	19	19	22	16

Source: documents provided by JICA, ICSI and ICSM

¹⁵ ICSM has secured another three classrooms in another building. When these are taken into account, the number of classes per classroom becomes 1.9 in 2019.

- Although the number of courses operated in ICSI was as planned, the number of classes and students in ICSI fell below the plan. On the other hand, classes and students in ICSM were more than planned. (See Table 6)

As mentioned in (3) below, if the numbers of students in ICSI and ICSM continue to decrease in the future, it may be difficult to achieve the target number of yearly graduates.

(3) Numbers of courses, classes and students in ICSI and ICSM

Table 6 shows the comparison between the plan and the actual in ICSI and ICSM concerning the numbers of courses, classes and students. ICSI planned to operate 27 to 29 classes under nine courses¹⁶ with more than 800 students in 2017 and 34 to 37 classes with more than 1,000 students in 2018. This was based on the assumption that some courses such as those for nurses, midwives, medical technicians, etc., would be transferred from ICSM to ICSI. The number of courses was actually as planned, but the numbers of classes and students were much lower than the plan. The reasons are, as mentioned before, that MOH holds down the number of classes operated in ICSI, and MOH, in PNDRHS (2016-2025), set the targets shown in Table 7 to emphasize on the improvement in the quality of education. Although this project was planned with 30 students per class (30 students × 15 classrooms × 2 shifts = 900 students), PNDRHS (2016-2025) expected 20 students per class in 2020 and 16 in 2025. According to this target, the number of students in ICSI may be 600 (= 20 students × 15 classes × 2 shifts). Actually, the change in the number of ICSI students shown in Table 6 is in line with this target. Furthermore, MOH intends to change the system of two shifts per day to one shift per day from 2020 in order to enrich self-learning by students and opportunities for practical training. If it is applied, the number of students would decrease even more.

Table 6: Number of Courses, Classes and Students in ICSI and ICSM

		Plan			Actual		
		2017	2018	2019	2017	2018	2019
ICSI	No. of Courses	9	9	unsettled	9	9	9
	No. of Classes	27~29	34~37		14	18	24
	No. of Students	810~870	1020~1110		414	541	594
ICSM	No. of Courses	8	5		16	10	10
	No. of Classes	9~13	7~12		32	21	17
	No. of Students	270~390	210~360		851	524	362

Source: documents provided by JICA, ICSI and ICSM

¹⁶ ICSI operates nine courses, namely 1) nurse, 2) midwife, 3) medical technician, 4) public nurse (preventive medicine), 5) laboratory technician, 6) pharmacist, 7) equipment maintenance, 8) odontology technician and 9) nutritionist.

Table 7: Standards of Number of Students per Class

	2015 (Basis)	2020	2025
No. of Students per Class	30	20	16

Source: PNDRHS (2016-2025)

The improvement in the quality of education must be a very important issue and such a course of action is considered right. However, it is also a fact that the demand for human resources in the health sector is very big in Mozambique. A difficult issue concerns how to promote the policy with a balance between quality and quantity. Even if ICSI tries to increase the number of classes, there is the difficulty of ensuring the number of competent teachers and the budget restrictions. Therefore, this situation mentioned above will continue for a while.

(4) Dormitory use in ICSI

The situation concerning dormitory use in ICSI is shown in Table 8. At the beginning, the construction of dormitory was recognized as a very necessary component to receive the students transferred from ICSM and from all over the country for the courses of odontology, equipment maintenance, etc. Although the male dormitory was removed once from the scope of Japanese grant aid due to the financial restriction, it was realized with the additional grant aid. Notwithstanding that, the dormitory is not utilized well. According to the explanation by Mozambican side, it is because no students moved from ICSM and the number of students is limited for improvement in the quality of education. In addition, it becomes unnecessary for the students living in the local area to come up to Maputo for the training since public or private training centers are recently available in the local area. It is also difficult for ICSI to increase the number of students living in the dormitory due to the budget restrictions since ICSI fully supports their living expenses including meals. Since the dormitory building may be deteriorated if it is not utilized, it is necessary to improve the utilization rate with some measures, for example, permission to use the dormitory for students living in Maputo who suffers from inconvenience in coming to the institute or a review of a board and lodging charges, etc.

Table 8: Dormitory Use in ICSI

	2017		2018		2019	
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
No. of Students	51	19	51	22	18	37
Total	70		73		55	
Rate of Occupation	23%		24%		18%	

Source: documents provided by ICSI

3.3.1.2 Qualitative Effects (Other Effects)

The following improvements in the educational environment are recognized.

- Since lectures can be visualized with the projectors set in each classroom, this gives a good impact to the practical training since students can easily conduct image training. The teachers have sufficient space in four teacher's rooms to prepare the lectures.
- The students are also satisfied with the study environment because they have enough time and space for self-learning in the PC room or the library.
- The teachers and students are basically satisfied with the laboratory equipment, which is the latest in Mozambique. The practical training hours can be ensured according to the curriculums prepared for each course. It is also highly evaluated that the internship system at the hospital has been improved.

However, the internet system is not available yet. It is effective as a tool for teachers and students to obtain information broadly. The efficiency of office work is also expected with the internet. As the demands from teachers and students is strong, it is desired to realize the internet system soon. Although it is good for them to receive the practical training in ICSI with the latest ones, it is also heard that students may get confused after graduation because the medical equipment used in hospitals is never the latest models.

3.3.2 Impacts

3.3.2.1 Intended Impacts

The impact expected from this project is “improvement in the quality of health medical services”. Based on the idea that it should be concluded to “patient's satisfaction”, the interview survey was conducted at two hospitals where the ICSI graduates were working.

Most of patients responded that there was basically no complaint about the health service, although waiting time were long to spend about a half day at the hospital and receiving medicines, and stocks of specific medicines were sometimes not enough. They also said that the nurses and other mid-level health care professionals were very kind and communicated with them very well. Although it seemed the patient's satisfaction was relatively high, there were certain constraints for the interviews. (See 2.3 Constraints during the Evaluation Study)

On the other hand, graduates from ICSI are highly valued by directors and doctors in the hospitals. Graduates master basic knowledge and skills and make feedback what they learned in ICSI for other colleagues in the hospital training activities. Therefore, the working motivation of other nurses is increased and this gradually contributes to the improvement of service quality in the hospitals.

However, at the present stage, where ICSI has produced a total of 390 graduates during three years' operation, it was difficult to evaluate “the improvement in the quality of health medical services” considered as the long-term project impact.

3.3.2.2 Other Positive and Negative Impacts

Since the land of ICSI was owned by MOH the resettlement or the land acquisition was not necessary. Drainage and treatment of waste materials are properly conducted in the operational stage and there are no complaints from the surrounding residents.

ICSI organizes community activities, such as preventive/sanitary guidance and the nutrition/cooking instruction for the surrounding residents every three months, and the teachers and students participate in these activities. For students on the public nurse (preventive medicine) course, since most of their work targets the community and they study how to teach the necessary knowledge to people, this is a good opportunity for them to practice on surrounding residents. The nutrition/cooking instruction is also welcomed by the people.

The technical assistance implemented by JICA, namely the Project for Strengthening Pedagogical and Technical Skills of Teachers of Health Training Institute (2012-2016) and the Project for Strengthening Pedagogical and Technical Skills of Health Personnel in Mozambique (2016-2019), aimed to ensure the quality of human development through the standardization of curriculums and teaching manuals, the improvement in capacity for pedagogy, and the monitoring for improvement in the quality of education. In fact, the review of curriculums has so far been done for four courses¹⁷. The curriculums of other courses will be revised successively and they will be utilized in ICSI. Also the National Vocational Training Authority (*Autoridade Nacional de Educação Profissional*, hereinafter referred as “ANEP”) under the Ministry of Science and Technology started a system to issue the qualification certificate by three grades, namely “A” for staff members who have no bachelor’s degree and have attended the training program, “B” for staff members who have graduated from university, and “C” for managers with the certificate B and the bachelor’s degree. As mentioned above, the effects of JICA technical assistance are being realized and are directly contributing to improving the educational quality in ICSI. (See 3.4.2 Technical Aspect of Operation and Maintenance)

As described above, this project has almost achieved the operation and effect indicators set in the plan. However, the total number of graduates from ICSI is only about 40% of the planned number and the facilities are not well utilized. In addition, it is difficult to evaluate the project impact, namely “improvement in the quality of health medical services”, for the time being. Therefore, effectiveness and impacts of the project are fair.

3.4 Sustainability (Rating: ②)

3.4.1 Institutional / Organizational Aspect of Operation and Maintenance

Based on the policy of decentralization, the administration of ICSs or training centers was transferred in 2013 to the Health Department under each provincial government in which they

¹⁷ The courses of nurse, midwife, medical technician and public nurse (preventive medicine).

were located. Therefore, ICSI now belongs to the government of Maputo City¹⁸. The budget is allocated by the Ministry of Economy and Finance through the government of Maputo City and the staff members are also managed by the government of Maputo City. However, the facilities and equipment are still owned by MOH, and ICSI and ICSM are respectively operated as independent institutes. Since MOH instructs the number of courses, classes, and students every year to each ICS or training center, ICSI has no authority to decide them. As mentioned above, it is a fact that the present feature of decentralization has two pillars, i.e. the staff members and the budget controlled by the government of Maputo City and the actual operation by MOH.

The institution of ICSI has been operated generally with 100 staff members since 2017 when ICSI started its operation. This is about 70% of the planned scale. Considering there are fewer classes and students compared to the plan, the number of staff members must be at a minimum level. ICSI thinks that 138 staff members (of which 58 are full-time teachers) are ideal.

Table 9: The Number of Staff Members for Operation & Maintenance in ICSI (unit: persons)

	Plan	Actual			
		2016	2017	2018	2019
Director 1, Deputy Director 2	3	3	3	3	3
Full-time Teachers	60	8	47	45	44
Staffs in Administrative Section	32	5	27	27	21
Staffs in Service Section	51	3	27	27	22
Total	146	19	104	102	90

Source: documents provided by ICSI and JICA

On the other hand, PNDRHS (2016-2025) aims at the enrichment of full-time teachers as shown in Table 10. The number of full-time teachers per class was 1.83 and the full-time teachers per student was 1/9 in ICSI in 2019. Since those figures are a little lower than the targets, ICSI will be required to increase the teachers in the future. In that case, it may come to be an issue how to ensure the qualified teachers.

Table 10: Posting Full-time Teachers

	2015(basis)	2020	2025
Full-time teachers per class	2 teachers	2.5 teachers	4 teachers
Full-time teachers per student	1/15	1/8	1/4

Source: PNDRHS (2016-2025)

Based on the above, there are a few problems in regard to secure personnel in the institutional/organizational aspects in ICSI.

3.4.2 Technical Aspect of Operation and Maintenance

It was planned that ICSI would be operated by 146 staff members, of which 83 staff members

¹⁸ Maputo city is treated as a special ward, equivalent to the state government.

would be transferred from ICSM and another 63 staff members transferred within MOH, and then it was expected that ICSI would be operated by many experienced personnel. This assumed that personnel changes would be controlled by MOH. However, under the policy of decentralization, the government of Maputo City recruited staff members for ICSI, and as a result, about 90% of staff members were newly employed.

As for the teachers in ICSI, seven teachers were transferred from ICSM in the beginning, but only one teacher has remained. ICSI employed three teachers with master's degree, 11 with bachelor's degree and another 30 teachers with mid-level educational background, hence the level of ICSI teachers is not necessarily high.^{19 20} Therefore, ICSI positively conducts training for teachers. In December 2019, all required teachers attended lectures of course "A"²¹ in ANEP to improve their level of knowledges as well as the pedagogy. ICSI also makes an effort continually to improve the level of teachers such as pedagogical training among the teachers for one week at the beginning of each semester. In the equipment maintenance course newly established in ICSI, the teachers learned the pedagogy from the maintenance specialist dispatched from the Regional Health Development Center.

For the administrative staff members in the early stage of operation, the training and the workshop were implemented through the staff exchange with other institutes. So far, no problems are reported in operation.

In-hospital practical training is implemented mainly in three hospitals²² about 10 minutes by car from ICSI, and the training for the courses of odontology and equipment maintenance newly established in ICSI is also implemented smoothly. However, it was explained that, since it is preferable to implement in-hospital practical training in the morning when many patients are at the hospitals, it is necessary to coordinate the curriculum schedule.²³ Therefore, it is the fact that the in-hospital practical training is implemented while devising the timetable.

As for laboratory equipment for use in the equipment maintenance course, although the guidance on how to use it was done when introducing it, the teachers do not know how to use some items, such as Defibrillator Analyzer or Ventilator Function Tester. Therefore, those items are not utilized. Since JICA has been continuously supporting the health sector in Mozambique it is desirable that a relevant expert is able to guide them directly when the occasion arises.

The record of asset management in terms of facilities and equipment is available. The method of maintenance basically follows the manual. The periodic maintenance for PCs, refrigeration equipment, generators, etc. is implemented by outsourcing and the maintenance records are kept.

¹⁹ For full-time teachers in ICSM, 3 teachers with master's degree, 32 with bachelor's degree and 15 others.

²⁰ According to PNDRHS (2016-2025), although the share of teachers with bachelor's degree was 46% in 2015 it aims to improve this to 60 % in 2020 and 80% in 2025.

²¹ Training program for those who are not eligible for university graduation.

²² Jose Macamo Hospital, De Mavalane Hospital and Psiquiatrico De Infulene Hospital.

²³ The share of practical in-hospital training in the curriculum of each course is 52% for nurses, 45% for midwives, 29% for medical technicians, 25% for public nurses (preventive medicine), 31% for laboratory technicians, etc.

The staff members in charge of maintenance for equipment include teachers of the equipment maintenance course.

The accreditation system was introduced in 2019 and ANEP is now doing the screening of documents for eighteen public ICSs and training centers in total, including ICSI. Since the accreditation especially attaches importance to the quality of education, it often points out the issues of quality of education, curriculum and pedagogy. Since this accreditation system is quite effective in ensuring and maintaining the quality of education in the institute, the periodical accreditation should continue to be conducted in the future.

As described above, there are a few problems with the capacity of ICSI teachers in the technical aspect.

3.4.3 Financial Aspect of Operation and Maintenance

Table 11 shows the sources of ICSI finance. As mentioned before, the national budget is distributed by the Ministry of Economy and Finance through the government of Maputo City. The Global Fund, which is controlled by MOH, is an external fund contributed by some donors and allocated when the national budget is not enough. ICSI received it in the past three years. In addition, the Health Collaboration Center (*Centro de Colaboração em Saúde*, hereinafter referred as “CCS”) is an NGO working in the area around Maputo and is funded by some donors, mainly from the United States. Both Global Fund and CCS support some specific classes operated in ICSI. Since those funds are not always available or not a stable source for ICSI, the commitment of national budget is highly required as a stable source of finance.

Table 11: Financial Sources in ICSI (unit: 1,000 Mt.)

	2017		2018		2019	
	Budget	Actual Expenditure	Budget	Actual Expenditure	Budget	Actual Expenditure
National Budget	9,360	9,360	22,850	22,456	32,386	31,608
Global Fund	4,089	4,089	11,890	11,308	12,329	4,309
CCS	15,914	15,081	14,969	14,809	-	-
Other	185	-	3,084	3,034	1,481	-
Total	29,548	28,530	52,793	51,607	46,196	35,917

Source; documents provided by ICSI

Table 12 shows the actual expenses for operation and maintenance in ICSI. It was estimated as 27,781,000 Mt. (in 2013 basis²⁴) in the plan and the actual figure was 31,699,000 Mt. in 2019. That expense was almost the same level as in the plan when considering the inflation²⁵ and that the number of students is about two thirds of the plan during the operational period. However,

²⁴ The exchange rate in the Project planning stage in March 2013 was 1Mt. = 3.02 Yen and 1Mt. = 1.74 Yen on average in 2019.

²⁵ According to IMF World Economic Outlook Databases (October, 2019), the inflation rate was 2.56% in 2014, 3.55% in 2015, 19.85% in 2016, 15.11% in 2017, 3.91% in 2018 and 5.57% in 2019 (estimation as of October 2019)

there is a big difference between the requested budget and the expenditure, making it difficult for ICSI to conduct the desirable operation. This is substantiated by the interviews to teachers. The common issue was found to be budget shortages, as indicted below.

- In the odontology technician course, the operation cost is high because most of the materials and equipment must be imported;
- In the pharmacist course, alternative medicines are often used because it is difficult to procure the real ones;
- The supplementation of consumables used for practical training is not sufficient;
- No air-conditioner in the multidisciplinary laboratory may affect the materials or the examinations.

Table 12: Operation and Maintenance Cost in ICSI (unit: 1,000 Mt.)

	Plan	2017		2018		2019	
		Requested Budget	Expenditure	Requested Budget	Expenditure	Requested Budget	Expenditure
Personnel Expenses	20,570	58,651	14,932	43,474	22,271	49,995	26,000
Fuel & Lighting	841	5,410	1,008	4,385	1,563	4,893	1,631
Foods/Consumables	3,352	16,960	3,049	15,504	15,168	5,673	3,151
Maintenance for Facility/ Equipment	3,018	1,875	629	1,550	986	2,751	917
Total	27,781	82,896	19,618	64,913	39,988	63,312	31,699

Source: documents provided by ICSI

As described above, there are a few problems with the financial aspect for operation and maintenance.

3.4.4 Status of Operation and Maintenance

Since the facilities and equipment of ICSI were utilized for three years after the project completion, no serious damage was recognized, nor was it time to replace facilities and equipment. Therefore, the usual maintenance is conducted at present.

The installation of sterilizer, which was planned to be implemented by Mozambican side in the time of operation, because a colon bacillus was detected from the well water in the planning stage, has not yet been done due to the high cost. And since the well water contains salt, it may cause the corrosion or the rust on the facilities and equipment. These are top-priority issues to be improved before a specific damage is actualized. Therefore, the budget should be ensured to do it.

Although some PC equipment was stolen in December 2016, this damage has been already discharged. After that, ICSI has been thorough in locking each room, and patrols by a security company are adequately conducted. Currently, there are 23 PCs in the PC room, two PCs in the library where 10 PCs were planned to be set, and others are used for office work. Some PCs

were purchased with ICSI's own budget. As for the shuttle buses for practical training at hospitals, although three busses were supplied, one of them was kept in the MOH Service Center and has not yet returned to ICSI. Since the number of students was small from the beginning and the place for in-hospital practical training was relatively near ICSI, there were no major operational problems. The status of bus operation and maintenance is also properly recorded and managed. Some problems were also pointed out before, for example, the omission of cleaning the grease trap, the planting to protect the slopes of ditches, the removal of sand in ditches, furnishing curtains in each room, etc. ICSI is continuously trying to make improvements within the budget availability.

Based on the above, there are a few problems with the current status of operation and maintenance.

On the whole, some minor problems have been observed in terms of the institutional and organizational aspect, technical aspect, financial aspect and current status. Therefore, sustainability of the project effects is fair.

4. Conclusion, Lessons Learned and Recommendations

4.1 Conclusion

The project was implemented to newly construct ICSI and to supply the necessary equipment, in addition to the existing ICSM, with the objective of improving the training circumstances for mid-level health care professionals, thereby contributing to improving the quality of health medical services through the expansion of health care professionals who have mastered the appropriate skills. In Mozambique which had serious problems regarding the shortage of health care professionals, the training of health care professionals was an important issue at the times of ex-ante as well as ex-post evaluation, so the project was highly consistent with the development policy and needs. It also corresponded to the Government of Japan's aid policy at the time of plan, which emphasized support of the health sector. Therefore, the relevance of the project is high. The project scope was almost realized as planned and the cost and period were within the plan. Therefore, the project efficiency is high. As for the operation and effect indicators set in the plan, the number of graduates in 2019 from the odontology and the equipment maintenance courses achieved the target, and the number of classes per classroom in ICSI and ICSM was also improved very much. However, since MOH aims to decrease the number of operated classes and to organize 20 students per class based on a policy of "improving the quality of education", the facilities designed on the assumption of 30 students per class are not fully utilized, and the overall number of graduates in ICSI and ICSM does not reach the target. Therefore, the project effectiveness and impacts are fair. As for the operation and maintenance, some problems can be partly recognized in each aspect of

institution/organization, technique, finance and status. It is necessary to provide continuous training for the teachers, resolve the perennial budget shortages, secure teaching materials and consumables, install a well water sterilizer, connect to the internet and so on. Therefore, the project sustainability is fair. Considering the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

4.2 Recommendations

4.2.1 Recommendations to MOH

- (1) Based on the policy to improve the quality of education, MOH instructs ICSI to operate with fewer classes and students than the project plan. As a result of that, the facilities of ICSI are not fully utilized. MOH should consider how to utilize the ICSI facilities more effectively by reviewing the operational policy of ICSI, including the operational condition of ICSM and the budgetary issue, taking into account of the balance between quality of education and human development needs.

4.2.2 Recommendations to ICSI

- (1) For a sound operation and maintenance, ICSI should continue to ensure the national budget through the government of Maputo City and strengthen the approach of using the donor fund held by MOH and others. The omission of water treatment system directly affects the health of ICSI staff members and students, and the salty water may damage the facilities and equipment. No air-conditioning in the multidisciplinary laboratory must affect the accuracy of the practices. In addition, the lack of internet connection does not contribute to the effective and efficient study for students and office works for staff members. Therefore, to implement adequate operation and maintenance continuously, it is important to allocate budget with clear priorities.
- (2) The number of classes and students is almost two-thirds compared to the plan in 2019, so the ICSI facilities are not utilized fully. Flexible discussions should be conducted about the effective utilization of facilities, including activities which ICSI can do at its own discretion. In addition, since the occupancy rate of the dormitory is very low, it may be a subject of discussion to change the policy, for example, allowing students living in Maputo City to stay in the dormitory in case where students feel inconvenience coming to the institute.

4.2.3 Recommendations to JICA

- (1) MOH is now applying a policy to improve the quality of education by decreasing the number of classes and students in the ICSs. As a result of that, the number of classes and students in ICSI falls below the plan and the ICSI facilities will continue to have spare capacity for quite a while. Therefore, considering this MOH policy, JICA should discuss with MOH about more effective utilization of the ICSI facilities and try to promote the

necessary measures.

4.3 Lessons Learned

(1) Responding to policy changes during the Project implementation

In the project, the facilities are not utilized as much as planned due to the policy change of the recipient country just before project completion, and this situation will continue in the future. As long as the policy change is justified, it is difficult to request the recipient country to modify it and it is neither realistic to change the project plan or the facility design just before project completion. Therefore, JICA should obtain the information about policy changes of the recipient country earlier and analyse how they will affect the on-going project. Then, JICA should consider how to utilize the facilities more effectively based on the policy changes through holding discussions with the recipient country.

(2) Improvement of direct communication with the project executing agency

In the project, some components were excluded from the project scope supported by JICA due to the upper limit of the grant amount. At that time, JICA understood that those excluded components should be implemented under the responsibility of executing agency within the project period. However, the executing agency recognized that the components were completely deleted from the entire project scope and they might be constructed when the budget was available. A document to confirm this matter was not exchanged between JICA and the executing agency. It can be said that there were discrepancies of recognition and communication between the two sides. In project supervision for JICA grant aid, the consultant assumes an important role. However, as for important changes in scope and incidental revisions to project cost, schedule, etc., JICA should communicate directly with the executing agency and exchange a document to confirm the basic agreement for project change management.

Republic of Honduras

FY 2019 Ex-Post Evaluation of Japanese Technical Cooperation Project “The Project for Capacity Development in the Western Region of the Republic of Honduras (FOCAL)”

External Evaluator: Hajime Sonoda, Global Group 21 Japan, Inc.

0 Summary

“The Project for Capacity Development in the Western Region of the Republic of Honduras (FOCAL)” (hereinafter referred to as “the Project”), a technical cooperation project, was implemented for the purpose of “establishing an appropriate model to properly socialize, formulate, execute, manage, operate and maintain projects concerning the consolidation of social infrastructure (hereinafter referred to as “the FOCAL model”) in the Inter-municipal Council of Higuito (hereinafter referred to as the “CIH”) and member municipalities.¹ The overall goal was to apply the FOCAL model in a sustainable form in the CIH and member municipalities as a consequence of the strengthening of the local and inter-municipal capacity. In terms of the national policy/plan and development needs of the Republic of Honduras (hereinafter referred to as “Honduras”), at the time of both the planning and termination of the Project, it was important to develop the capacity of local governments which were the recipients of decentralization. The Project was relevant to Japan’s ODA policy at the time of its planning. Therefore, the relevance of the Project is high. Through the implementation of the Project, the FOCAL model capable of properly formulating, executing, operating and maintaining social infrastructure consolidation projects with resident participation was developed and is still used at the time of ex-post evaluation. This situation suggests that the Project has facilitated the provision of basic services through the optimization and cost reduction of municipal projects. Moreover, wide-ranging positive impacts have been confirmed such as strengthening of a relationship of mutual trust between the municipal administration and residents, enhancement of the capacity of municipalities as well as communities and the acquisition of external funding. Therefore, the effectiveness and impact of the Project are high. Meanwhile, the period of cooperation significantly exceeded the planned period, partly because of the need to find unplanned funding sources to cover the cost of the pilot projects for social infrastructure consolidation and other reasons, and the project cost also exceeded the planned cost. As such, the efficiency of the Project is low. In regard to the sustainability of the Project, although the small number of full-time staff members of the CIH can be pointed out, no major problems have been observed in policy/political, institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is high.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

¹ “FOCAL” is the abbreviation of the project title in Spanish, meaning “capacity development of local areas”. The development model formed under the Project is called “FOCAL” in Honduras. Accordingly, the model itself is described as “the FOCAL model” and the series of processes contained in this model” is described as “the FOCAL process” in this report.

1 Project Description



Project Locations



Pilot Project: A primary school in the Municipality of La Union

1.1 Background

Since the inauguration of the Maduro Administration (2002-2006) in 2002, Honduras promoted a decentralization and local development program for effective implementation of poverty reduction policies. The Lobo Administration which was inaugurated in January 2010 placed its emphasis on local development and poverty reduction and maintained the basic stance of decentralization, including a shifting of the revenue stream from central government to local government. As part of this decentralization trend, the Honduran Social Investment Fund (hereinafter referred to as “the FHIS”) responsible for the development of social infrastructure launched the Decentralized Project Cycle Operation Program (hereinafter referred to as “the DOCP”), delegating the planning, implementation and management responsibility for development projects to local (municipal) governments along with the necessary funds. However, municipal governments in Honduras had only limited budget, manpower and administrative capacity and their insufficient implementation capacity posed a problem. To compensate for this shortcoming, many inter-municipal councils combining a number of municipalities were formed throughout the country.² There were some 50 inter-municipal councils nationwide and most cities in Honduras belonged to one or more councils, making a financial contribution towards the operation of the councils while receiving technical assistance for municipal administration. The technical capacity of these councils was quite limited, making the enhancement of such capacity essential.

Under these circumstances, the JICA Honduras Office organized a seminar on the Millennium Development Goals jointly with the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) in 2003 in the very poor southwestern part of Honduras. Taking this seminar as an opportunity, JICA

² Local administration in Honduras is the responsibility of 298 municipalities. Even though there are departments which are administrative units between the central government and municipalities, these departments are administrative units of the central government and are not local governments. Inter-municipal councils are non-profit organizations serving the interests of residents as stipulated by the Municipal Administration Act (*Ley de Municipalidad*). Each municipality is free to join the council of its choice and is also allowed to leave freely. As of April, 2019, there are 46 inter-municipal councils across the country and more than 90% of the municipalities nationwide are members of one or more councils.

searched for ways to alleviate poverty in the Western Region of Honduras together with local stakeholder organizations, formulating a project to strengthen the capacity of municipal governments. Having recognized the necessity for the implementation of such project, the Government of Honduras made a request for technical cooperation to the Government of Japan in the latter's fiscal year of 2004. In response, JICA dispatched the first preparatory study mission to Honduras in 2005, followed by the dispatch of a "pipeline" expert for a period of one year to examine the desirable contents of a cooperation mechanism for the project. The second preparatory study mission was dispatched to Honduras in 2006 and agreed with the relevant organization in Honduras on the implementation of the Project.

1.2 Project Outline

The Project was implemented for the purpose of "establishing an appropriate model to properly socialize, formulate, execute, manage, operate and maintain projects for the consolidation of social infrastructure in the CIH with its principal focus on the strengthening of the human resources and organization of the CIH and its member municipalities.

The direct counterpart organization for the Project was the CIH which was composed of 13 municipalities in the Western Region. Under the Project, a baseline survey in six pilot municipalities (Output 1) was conducted and a participatory development plan was formulated along with the formulation and implementation of social infrastructure consolidation projects (Output 2). Based on the results of these activities, similar activities were conducted in four extension municipalities for dissemination (Output 3) for the purpose of the subsequent compilation and verification of the FOCAL model integrating the previous experiences (Outputs 4 and 5). This was followed by the preparation of manuals and reports in anticipation of the dissemination of the said model and convening of a seminar (Output 6). To improve the practicality of the model through the feed-back of the actual experience of implementing the model and also to sufficiently raise the capacity of the CIH as the counterpart, the development and application of the FOCAL model under the Project were conducted in three stages. The first stage was the preparation of a draft model. The second stage was the implementation of the model in pilot municipalities jointly supported by the CIH and Japanese experts working for the Project. The third stage was the implementation of the model supported by the CHI in the extension municipalities. The population of the 10 selected municipalities involved in the Project in 2006 varied from some 3,700 to 12,900 (average of some 7,900).

Under the FOCAL model, the first step is to conduct a baseline survey (LB: a complete survey involving all houses) aimed at identifying the needs of each community. Based on the findings of this survey, the second step is the formulation of a community development plan (PDC: listing projects with priority ranking) with resident participation, and the selection of priority projects with resident participation from the PDCs prepared by individual communities. The third step is the preparation of a municipal development plan (PDM). Municipal public projects are

implemented in accordance with an annual investment plan (PIMA), in turn formulated based on the PDM.

Overall Goal		Projects to consolidate the social infrastructure will be socialized, formulated, executed, managed, maintained and operated in a sustainable form in the CIH and member municipalities, as a consequence of the strengthening of local and inter-municipal capacity.
Project Purpose		Establishment of an appropriate model to properly socialize, formulate, execute, manage, operate and maintain projects for the consolidation of social infrastructure in the CIH and member municipalities.
Outputs	Output 1	The development situation and problems of the communities and member municipalities of the CIH will be recognized and analyzed.
	Output 2	The process of the formulation of a PDM and social infrastructure projects based on the plan, as well as the establishment of a normative system of a results-oriented institutional plan for the municipal administration (annual operation plan and budget) and financial and administrative management of the DOCP and other funds will be improved.
	Output 3	After analysis of the results obtained by conducting LB and formulation of PDM, the problems and effective methods will be recognized.
	Output 4	After analysis of the results obtained by implementing the Projects Executed by Community (PECs), problems and effective methods will be recognized.
	Output 5	After analysis of the results obtained by implementing the Projects Executed by Municipality (PEMs), problems and effective methods will be recognized.
	Output 6	The experience gained through the appropriate process of municipal and community management will be identified and disseminated.
Total Cost (Japanese Side)		242 million JPY
Period of Cooperation		September 2006 - October 2010 (of which the period from April 2009 to October 2010 was the extended period of cooperation)
Project Area		Inter-municipal Council of Higuito in the Western Region of Honduras
Implementing Agencies		Honduran Social Investment Fund (FHIS); Inter-municipal Council of Higuito (CIH)
Other Relevant Agencies/Organizations		Ministry of Planning and External Cooperation (SEPLAN), Ministry of Internal Affairs and Justice (SGJ), Ministry of Social Development (SDS), Honduran Municipalities Association (AMHON)
Supporting Agency/Organization in Japan		None
Related Projects		Project for Strengthening of the Capacity Development of Local Governments for Regional Development (October 2011 - November 2016 by JICA); Advisor for Local Governance Capacity Strengthening (June 2017 - June 2019 by JICA)

1.3 Outline of the Terminal Evaluation

1.3.1 Achievement Status of Project Purpose at the Time of the Terminal Evaluation

The project purpose is largely achieved as the capacity of the member municipalities of the CIH has been strengthened through assistance by the CIH so that they can implement the process from the implementation of a LB to the formulation of a participatory PDM and the implementation of small-scale infrastructure consolidation projects (FOCAL process), resulting in the formulation of an appropriate model (FOCAL model).

1.3.2 Achievement Status of Overall Goal at the Time of the Terminal Evaluation (Including Other Impacts)

The FOCAL model has been firmly established at the CIH and its member municipalities. As the capacity of not only staff members of the CIH and member municipalities but also representatives of communities have been strengthened, there is a strong likelihood of the successful achievement of the Overall Goal.

1.3.3 Recommendations at the Time of the Terminal Evaluation

(1) Issues to be considered during the project period

- The CIH must provide sufficient support for the completion of the social infrastructure consolidation project in each of the pilot municipalities, as well as for the elaboration of PDCs and PDMs and the completion of the social infrastructure consolidation projects in the extension municipalities.
- The Project Team should continue its efforts to improve the capacity of the relevant staff members of the CIH in order to provide technical support for member municipalities, to conduct retraining at those municipalities where the staff members in charge have been replaced and to complete the preparation of various manuals.
- The Project Team should compile the knowledge and experience obtained through the Project and organize workshops to disseminate the FOCAL model.

(2) Issues to be considered to sustain self-help efforts after the termination of the Project

- Continuous technical support by the CIH for member municipalities
- Periodic review of PDCs and PDMs
- Classification of projects which can be implemented by communities themselves within the framework of the PDC
- Utilization of data obtained by the LB
- Gathering of information by the CIH regarding resources of other sectors to provide support
- Utilization of the CIH as a resource organization and development of supporting system and mechanism at the central government level for the dissemination of the FOCAL model

2 Outline of the Evaluation Study

2.1 External Evaluator

Hajime Sonoda (Global Group 21 Japan, Inc.)

2.2 Duration of Evaluation Study

The ex-post evaluation study for the Project was conducted over the following period.

Duration of the Study: September 2019 - November 2020

Duration of the Field Survey: 14th January - 11th March, 2020

2.3 Constraints During the Evaluation Study

The second field survey scheduled to be conducted in April and May 2020 could not be done because of the global spread of COVID-19. As a result, additional information gathering, consultation with the implementing agencies and other work were conducted through the local field survey assistant.

3 Results of the Evaluation (Overall Rating: B³)

3.1 Relevance (Rating: ③⁴)

3.1.1 Relevance to the Development Plan of Honduras

As already described in 1.1 Background, Honduras was planning to intensify its efforts to alleviate poverty at the time of project planning (2006) by means of increasing the flow of funds from the central to municipal governments under its decentralization policies. “The Government Plan 2006 – 2010” of Honduras listed governance as one of its planning axes, emphasizing the facilitation of the decentralization process and strengthening of municipal governments. Under the policy of “concentration, improved efficiency and impacts of public investment”, which was one of the policies adopted by this plan for poverty reduction, several methods were considered to be effective to achieve much impact with small investment, which included; (i) the expected outcomes of the programs and services to be implemented were clearly defined, informed to residents and monitored, (ii) communities were involved in the supervision and management of schools, hospitals and water supply, sewerage and other services and (iii) municipal governments were involved in decision making and supervision relating to programs and services.

At the time of project termination (2010), Honduras was promoting local development through decentralization to develop an appropriate environment for the effective implementation of its own Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) and achievement of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). As part of such efforts, the transfer of financial resources from the central government to municipalities was taking place through the use of the Poverty Reduction Fund, DOCP by the FHIS and central government grants.

In view of the above, the Project, which aimed at the strengthening of municipalities acting as recipients of decentralization and also realizing efficient social infrastructure consolidation projects with resident participation, was highly relevant to the development policy of Honduras at the time of both project planning and termination.

³ A: Highly satisfactory; B: Satisfactory; C: Partially satisfactory; D: Unsatisfactory

⁴ ③: High, ②: Fair, ①: Low

3.1.2 Relevance to the Development Needs of Honduras

As already described in 1.1 Background, municipalities in Honduras at the time of project planning were vulnerable, facing such constraints as; (i) almost total absence of revenue sources except grants from the central government, (ii) lack of a sufficient number of municipal employees, (iii) almost entire replacement of the mayor and other municipal employees following a change of the administration, and (iv) absence of a system to facilitate the smooth succession of the work following a change of municipal employees. The decentralization process in Honduras, including the DOCP by the FHIS, was being implemented without an established system on the part of municipalities, making strengthening of the capacity of the human resources as well as organization of municipalities and inter-municipal councils supporting municipalities urgent. As such, the relevance of the Project to the development needs of Honduras was high at the time of planning.

Moreover, as shown later in 3.2 Effectiveness and Impact, the FOCAL model introduced under the Project is effective for the appropriate planning and implementation of social infrastructure consolidation projects by municipalities. In Honduras, the Ministry of Planning and External Cooperation (currently the Ministry of General Coordination) led the preparation of their own strategic development plan by municipalities in the middle of the first decade of the 21st century. According to the Ministry of Decentralization and AMHON, the entire work was entrusted to consulting firms because of the high professional level of the planning method involved, causing a severe financial burden on smaller municipalities. Some problems also emerged, such as the planning of projects which did not correspond to the actual needs because of reliance on limited existing information and the adoption of another municipality's plan without alteration. In contrast, the FOCAL model is a simpler, less expensive and more realistic planning model than the municipal strategic development plan and better matches the actual needs of municipalities even if it involves such extra work as a LB and participatory process on the part of residents.

Unlike the central and municipal governments, the inter-municipal councils do not suffer from the massive replacement of their employees due to a change of the ruling parties and are less liable to any impacts caused by such a change.⁵ In the case of the CIH, although the mayor and municipal employees in many cities were replaced after the change of ruling parties in January 2010, it was able to continuously provide technical support. As such, it was appropriate for the

⁵ Honduran society is strongly linked to political parties and many people openly express which political party they support. There is preferential treatment by administrations (national and municipal) for supporters of the ruling party in terms of the recruitment of civil servants and the provision of public services. Because of this, a change of the ruling party after an election leads to a change of the mayors as well as almost all municipal employees. In contrast, the change of staff of inter-municipal councils is modest as members of the general assembly or board of directors which is responsible for decision-making are always representatives of multiple political parties even if the mayors of individual member municipalities change after a mayoral election. There is also a tacit understanding among member municipalities that the inter-municipal council should not be politicized and the operating section of the inter-municipal council makes conscious efforts to eliminate political influence as much as possible.

Project to aim at conducting technology transfer to the CIH. At the time of the said changes of ruling parties in 2010, the CIH had a relatively well-established organizational system despite the fact that the level of poverty was high in the area of its governance and it was highly motivated to implement the Project. As such, the selection of the CIH as the counterpart for the Project was appropriate.

3.1.3 Relevance to Japan's ODA Policy

At the time of project planning, “development of rural areas” which was a priority area for Japan's country assistance program for Honduras called for “Japan's assistance for local development and poverty reduction focusing on the Western departments where the poorest municipalities are concentrated by means of providing assistance for the development of local social infrastructure, development of the administrative capacity of municipalities and improvement of the livelihood of residents while taking the trend of decentralization into consideration and advancing cooperation with other donors operating in these departments”. The Project was highly relevant to such ODA policy of Japan.

Based on the above, the Project was highly relevant to the country's development plan and development needs as well as Japan's ODA policy. Therefore, its relevance is high.

3.2 Effectiveness and Impact⁶ (Rating: ③)

3.2.1 Effectiveness

3.2.1.1 Project Outputs

(1) Activities and outputs in six pilot cities

In the six pilot municipalities, municipal staff members (12 full-time employees) and facilitators (13 contract employees) who had undergone training in accordance with the training manual prepared under the Project prepared some 300 community leaders as field researchers. These researchers then conducted a complete count LB which identified the actual socioeconomic conditions of each community that were unclear based on existing data (the survey was completed in September, 2017).⁷

Using the results of this LB, 160 PDCs were prepared with resident participation.⁸ Each plan included a list of social infrastructure consolidation projects with priority ranking. This was

⁶ Effectiveness is rated upon also taking impact into account.

⁷ Prior to the Project, the JICA Honduras Office was examining a viable method to conduct a community-based participatory social survey (a complete count LB using each household as the counting unit) in the Western Region of Honduras by employing a local consultancy firm. The survey was conducted against the background that the absence of reliable statistical data in local areas at the time was a matter of concern for donors assisting the achievement of the MDGs. This method became the forerunner for the FOCAL model.

⁸ The participants to elaborate a PDC include officials of the residents' association (usually five officials), representatives of the water committee, communal organizations of pupils' guardians, women/mothers, producers and residents in charge of local health and sanitation, teachers and staff members of health centers. Many residents interested in the plan may also attend.

followed by a PDM for individual municipalities (completed in March, 2008). Priority projects under PDCs are compiled in the PIMA from 2008 - 2015. During this period of eight years, a total of 733 social infrastructure consolidation projects were planned in six municipalities. During the process of formulating a PDM, the vision for municipal development and projects benefitting more than one community or the entire municipality were examined among others with the participation of community leaders and citizens' groups.

The FHIS and CIH concluded an agreement to substantially simplify the FHIS's project implementation procedure and eight priority projects contained in the PDMs of six municipalities were implemented as pilot projects. These projects involved the improvement or expansion of a school, health center, water supply facility or sanitation facility and the project budget was some 150 to 450 million JPY. Of these eight projects, six were the projects executed by the community (PECs) and two were projects executed by municipality (PEMs). In every project, residents shouldered part of the project cost through the provision of simple labor and some funds. For these PECs, organized residents were in charge of financial administration as well as procurement and project management. However, because of the delayed disbursement of funds by the FHIS, some projects relied on other funding sources, including the Poverty Reduction Fund of the Government of Honduras and other donors (Switzerland and Sweden) (the projects were completed between January 2009 and September 2010).

Through the activities described above, draft manuals were prepared for each step (planning and implementation of the LB, PDC, PDM and social infrastructure consolidation plan), strengthening the FOCAL model-related capacity of the counterpart personnel of the CIH and staff members in charge of the Project in the pilot municipalities.

(2) Activities and achievements in extension municipalities

The staff members in charge and facilitators in the four extension municipalities received training primarily led by counterpart personnel at the CIH and they conducted the LB and prepared PDCs for their respective municipalities. The work to prepare a PDM was not completed within the period of cooperation, partly because some mayors lost interest as they did not trust the results of the LB and partly because there was not sufficient follow-up by the counterpart personnel of the CIH due to their busy involvement in other projects.⁹

Along with the above activities, four social infrastructure consolidation projects (1 PEC and 3 PEMs) in line with the FOCAL model were implemented in these four extension municipalities. Apart from the extension municipalities, one PEM each was implemented in two municipalities. While all of these projects were funded by another donor (Spain), none of them were completed within the period of cooperation for the Project.¹⁰

⁹ See 3.2.2.1 Achievement of Overall Goal, (1) Implementation situation of the FOCAL model.

¹⁰ The present ex-post evaluation confirmed that three projects were completion after the termination of the Project. The completion of the other three projects was also confirmed but the completion time could not be verified.

Based on the experience with the extension municipalities, the necessary improvements were made to the FOCAL model (draft manuals). The capacity of the counterpart personnel of the CIH to support municipalities for the FOCAL model was strengthened and the capacity of staff members in charge at the extension municipalities regarding the FOCAL model was also strengthened.

(3) Arrangement and dissemination of the FOCAL model

The FOCAL model formed through a series of activities described above was improved based on the related practical experience obtained in the pilot and extension municipalities. Several manuals and a booklet including good practices, lessons learned and recommendations relating to the FOCAL model were compiled after a workshop held for the purpose of standardizing and disseminating the FOCAL model. There were a series of discussions and meetings with the SGJ and SEPLAN with a view to urging the new administration elected in January 2010 to share and disseminate the outputs of the Project. In addition, final local forums were convened in the target area of the Project and the capital, Tegucigalpa, to share good practices, lessons learned and recommendations.

3.2.1.2 Achievement of Project Purpose

The project purpose was to “establish an appropriate model to socialize, formulate, execute, manage, operate and maintain properly the projects of consolidation of social infrastructure in CIH and member municipalities” and the relevant objectively verifiable indicators were set to be ① “number of manuals and guidelines for the management (formulation, implementation, operation, maintenance, etc.) of infrastructure projects that have been revised and adapted to local conditions and demonstrated officially in their application” and ② “number of infrastructure projects executed efficiently at financial level, on time and in form”.

Table 1 shows the achievement situation of the indicators for the project purpose. In regard to Indicator ①, a total of 11 manuals and documents were prepared, nine of which were officially applied. Even though there was no numerical target for manuals, the completed manuals cover the formulation, execution, management and maintenance aspects of social infrastructure consolidation projects in line with the FOCAL model. As such, it is safe to judge that Indicator ① was achieved. In regard to Indicator ②, 14 social infrastructure consolidation projects (7 PECs and 7 PEMs) were implemented in line with the FOCAL model. Of these 14 projects, six projects in four extension and two other municipalities started the work during the period of cooperation but did not finish them by the time of the termination of the Project. There was no numerical target for Indicator ②. Since none of these PECs and PEMs were completed within the period of cooperation despite their commencement in the said period, it is judged that Indicator ② was partially achieved.

Table 1 Situation of Achievement of the Project Purpose

Project Purpose	Establish an appropriate model to properly socialize, formulate, execute, manage, operate and maintain the projects of consolidation of social infrastructure in CIH and member municipalities.
Indicators	Actual Performance
① Number of manuals and guidelines for the management (formulation, implementation, operation, maintenance, etc.) of infrastructure projects that have been revised and adapted to local conditions and demonstrated officially in their application (no numerical targets)	<p>The following manuals and documents were prepared. All manuals except “Capacity Development and Evaluation Manual” and “Collection of Good Practices, Lessons Learned and Recommendations” (both indicated by an asterisk) were officially applied.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Four manuals explaining the methodology of and training for the LB - Two manuals explaining the methodology and training to prepare a PDC - One manual explaining the methodology to prepare a PDM - One manual explaining the methodology to prepare a PDC - One manual explaining the implementation, operation and management of a social infrastructure consolidation project - One manual explaining capacity development and evaluation* - One collection of good practices, lessons learned and recommendations*
② Number of infrastructure projects executed efficiently at financial level, on time and in form (no numerical targets)	<p>The following infrastructure consolidation projects were implemented.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Six pilot municipalities: 6 PECs and 2 PEMs (The following projects were completed after the period of cooperation.) - Four extension municipalities: 1 PEC and 3 PEMs - Two other municipalities: 2 PEMs

When looking at the contents of the model developed, the advantages of introducing the FOCAL model can be summarized as follows based on the results of a series of interviews during the ex-post evaluation process with current mayors and staff members of the CIH and its member municipalities, community leaders and the Chief Advisor of the Project.¹¹

➤ With the introduction of the FOCAL model, through the following processes, it became possible to formulate an orderly and appropriate plan of public projects in response to the priority needs of each community as well as the overall situations of the municipality.

① LB visualizes the situation of each community, confirming the actual problems and needs.

Previously, there was no information indicating the problems and needs of individual

¹¹ During the field survey at the time of ex-post evaluation, a series of interviews were held with seven mayors, four deputy mayors and 31 (current) staff members of the 10 selected municipalities of the Project. 34 community leaders were also interviewed during the site visits to learn about social infrastructure consolidation projects (including those implemented after the termination of the Project) in these municipalities.

communities.

- ② The residents themselves examine and propose priority projects for their own community and a PDC is formulated based on the collective will of the residents.
- ③ PDM is formulated with the participation of community leaders and citizens' groups.
- ④ The municipality formulates PIMA and implements various projects in accordance with the PDM.

In the past, most mayors arbitrarily planned public projects based on limited information. The annual public projects plan tended to be decided by the mayor based on petitions made by some residents and the mayor's own campaign promises and it was common for the mayor to give preferential treatment to supporters of his/her own political party. DOCP projects were similarly planned by outsiders based on limited information. Because of this, public project plans in the past did not necessarily conform to the needs of communities. With the introduction of the FOCAL model, a public projects plan became a plan conforming to the needs of residents as well as a medium-term outlook of the PDM. (Increase of the "relevance" of social infrastructure consolidation projects)

➤ As infrastructure projects are implemented with the consensus of the community, they can obtain more active contributions (in terms of labor, materials and funding) from residents. In the past, residents were accustomed to projects from which they would only receive something and were not motivated to make their own contribution. Even though DOCP projects included some resident contributions, materials and professional human resources were procured at the central government level at a high cost. In the case of the FOCAL model, as materials and human resources are procured locally, the project cost is lower. In the case of a PEC where the finance is managed by the residents themselves, as the saved funds can be used by the residents, reduction of the project cost is accelerated. As a result of the above, it is believed that the same level of funding has produced many more positive outcomes under the FOCAL model. (Increase of the "efficiency" of social infrastructure consolidation projects)

➤ Through resident participation, social consent is obtained for the formulation of a plan. The greater ownership of residents of social infrastructure consolidation projects implemented in individual communities has ensured a high level of commitment on the part of residents to the operation and maintenance of these projects. (Increase of the "sustainability" of social infrastructure consolidation projects)

➤ Based on the above, social infrastructure consolidation projects planned and implemented using the FOCAL model enjoy a higher level of "relevance", "efficiency" and "sustainability" which are believed to lead to higher "effectiveness" and "impact".

The overall judgement based on the above is that the project purpose of "establishing an appropriate model to socialize, formulate, execute, manage, operate and maintain properly the

projects of consolidation of social infrastructure in the CIH and member municipalities” was achieved even though some of the planned activities in the extension municipalities were not completed within the period of cooperation.

The capacity development of the CIH and member municipalities was one of the important objectives of the Project although it was not clearly stated in either the project purpose or relevant indicators.¹² It is believed that the CIH and some municipalities acquired sufficient capacity through the Project to support municipalities in regard to the FOCAL process.

- The CIH could not conduct follow-up activities to help the extension municipalities formulate their PDMs because of its inability to deploy sufficient manpower for a period of approximately one year after the termination of the Project. However, it has since provided technical support (training, field guidance and advice) without external help for four member municipalities other than the 10 selected municipalities of the Project and two other inter-municipal councils.
- In two municipalities where the mayor and the technicians in charge at the time of the implementation of the Project are still in their positions at the time of the ex-post evaluation, the PDM was revised in 2011 and 2016 using the FOCAL model after the termination of the Project with hardly any external help.

To summarize the effectiveness of the Project based on the above, the situation of achievement of the planned outputs has been generally positive and the project purpose has been achieved even though some activities in the extension municipalities were not completed within the period of cooperation. Taking the successful capacity development of the CIH and some member municipalities into consideration, the effectiveness of the Project is judged to be high.

3.2.2 Impact

3.2.2.1 Achievement of Overall Goal

The overall goal of the Project is “projects to consolidate the social infrastructure will be socialized, formulated, executed, managed, maintained and operated in a sustainable form in the CIH and member municipalities as a consequence of the strengthening of the local and inter-municipal capacity”. It was assumed that the overall goal would be achieved 3 to 5 years after the termination of the Project. As the time of planning, several indicators were set for the overall goal but all of these were either qualitative indicators or quantitative indicators without a target value. Some of them were not clearly defined. At the time of the terminal evaluation (May 2010), the achievement level of these indicators was not analyzed and the prospect of achieving the overall goal was judged, focusing on “the successful development of the capacity among the CHI and

¹² This assessment is supported by the facts that the title of the Project includes “capacity development” and that the Project was implemented in three stages with the capacity development of the CIH in mind. It is also confirmed by the interview with the chief advisor.

target municipalities to continually implement the FOCAL model” and “the firm establishment of the FOCAL model”. Based on the above, it is understood for the purpose of ex-post evaluation that the overall goal was “the continuous implementation of the FOCAL model in the 10 target municipalities”, and the achievement level of this overall goal is analyzed based on the implementation situation of the FOCAL model after the termination of the Project.

(1) Implementation situation of the FOCAL model

In four municipalities (Corquin, Dolores, San Agustin and San Pedro) out of the six pilot municipalities, the mayors have considered the FOCAL model to be important and have continually utilized the FOCAL model up to the present while revising their respective PDMs as required. The implementation situation of such processes as a participatory LB and formulation of a PDC and PDM has been favorable. The mayors of San Agustin and San Pedro in particular have repeated the FOCAL process every 4 or 5 years to revise their PDMs, indicating that the FOCAL model has been fully used as a planning tool. In the other two municipalities, new mayors who took their seats after the formulation of a PDM under the Project did not consider resident participation to be important and the PDMs formulated by the previous mayors were abandoned. However, as the result of the implementation of the FOCAL model becoming a statutory requirement in 2013 with the encouragement of the succeeding project (Project for Strengthening of the Capacity Development of Local Governments for Regional Development)¹³, these two municipalities formulated their own new PCDs in 2018 with the assistance of the CIH and have implemented social infrastructure consolidation projects based on their respective PCDs.

As mentioned earlier, PCDs were not formulated within the period of cooperation of the Project in four extension municipalities. Following the later institutionalization of the FOCAL model, in 2017, LB was again conducted in each municipality with the help of the CIH and PDCs were formulated. In 2018, PDM was formulated in all of these municipalities and social infrastructure consolidation projects have been subsequently implemented based on each PDM.

Based on the above, it can be judged that the FOCAL model is continuously implemented in all 10 target municipalities of the CIH, and the overall goal of the Project has been achieved. Four other municipalities of the CIH have formulated PDMs through the FOCAL model as well and are implementing projects in accordance with them at the time of ex-post evaluation. Moreover, as described in the section on “effectiveness”, the CIH has acquired sufficient capacity to apply the FOCAL model. The member municipalities have maintained capacity regarding the use of the FOCAL model with the support of the CIH even though the mayor and/or engineer in charge have been replaced in some municipalities.

¹³ In September 2013, the Ministry of Decentralization promulgated the “Regulations for the formulation of a PDM, incorporating a land use program” which stipulated that the formulation of a PDM based on the FOCAL model would be a condition to receive a central government grant. This ordinance was enforced in FY 2016 after the preparatory period.

(2) Factors Affecting Achievement of the Overall Goal

Principal factors affecting the achievement of the overall goal have been identified as described below through interviews with the CIH, member municipalities, community leaders, etc. As mentioned above, while the overall goal has been achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation, these factors still affect the timing for the introduction of the FOCAL model and the quality of the plans and their implementation with the FOCAL model.

- Institutionalization of the FOCAL model: The government ordinance promulgated in 2013 made it a de facto obligation to use the FOCAL model, facilitating the use of this model in municipalities which have been reluctant to do so.
- Understanding and political will of the mayor: For the allocation of the necessary manpower and budget for the implementation of the FOCAL model and the implementation of projects in line with the formulated PDM, it is extremely important for the mayor to have a proper understanding of the purpose of the FOCAL model and a personal commitment to the implementation of the FOCAL model. There are enthusiastic mayors who actively participate in residents' meetings for the formulation of a PDC and/or who secure a number of staff members in charge and funding for various activities but there are also mayors who simply entrust the entire work to staff members in charge with the allocation of limited resources or who intend to implement projects not included in the PDM.
- Resident participation: Resident participation is the most important element of the FOCAL model along with fact-finding through the LB. For elaboration of PDC, one condition to ensure the quality of the PDC is the participation of residents and resident organizations capable of reflecting the knowledge and opinions of the entire community in a well-balanced manner. The principal factors hindering the participation of residents (including response to the LB) are movements geared towards boycotting the activities of political parties other than one's own party, considering the implementation of the FOCAL model to be a political activity, and general indifference in urban areas.
- Number and capacity of staff members in charge: The presence of staff members with a good understanding of the FOCAL model is essential. In Honduras, as most staff members are replaced when the mayor is replaced, the length of their service is short except in some municipalities. As such, most newly appointed staff members have no previous experience of the FOCAL model. The component of the FOCAL model with the highest work volume is the LB, followed by the formulation of PDC. As the strength of full-time staff members is insufficient, extra personnel are contracted on a short-term basis to implement the FOCAL model in many municipalities. Most full-time staff members involved in the FOCAL model have other work responsibilities as well.

Under these circumstances, when the mayor and staff members in charge are replaced, staff members of the CIH provide training and guidance to that the municipal capacity to implement the FOCAL model can be maintained. While such staff members of the CIH have sufficient capacity, there is only one full-time staff member conducting this work at the time of ex-post evaluation. There was an occasion after the termination of the Project where the support of the CIH for municipalities was temporarily suspended because it was impossible for the CIM which was very involved in other projects to provide a sufficient number of full-time staff members dedicated to FOCAL model-related activities.

In elaborating PDCs, the crucial factor to determine their quality is whether or not there are sufficient human resources capable of presenting appropriate solutions (i.e. technical options) to deal with the needs (problems) recognized by residents. In the case of developing PDM, it is essential to formulate a strategy by analyzing the problems and development potential of the municipality from a comprehensive, wide area and medium to long-term perspective. The quality of the plan is determined by whether or not people involved are conversant with the social, economic and technical aspects of the planning. It is desirable for such people to form a planning team. The issue here is whether or not a municipality can secure the services of people with professional capabilities or the CIH can provide the necessary support.

3.2.2.2 Other Impacts

(1) Impacts of the FOCAL model on municipal administration and communities

- Strengthening of the relationship of trust between the municipal administration and residents: The relationship of mutual trust between the municipal administration and residents is strengthened when the general opinions of the residents are reflected on the municipal plan in a well-balanced manner and projects proposed in this way are implemented by the municipal administration as planned. There have been cases where the active use of the FOCAL model has actually assisted the successful re-election of the mayor. In contrast, when resident participation is insufficient or proposals by the resident side are ignored or not realized, the relationship of trust is damaged. The strengthening of such relationship, together with compilation of the municipal ledger for the fixed property tax (in some municipalities, this work is done utilizing the results of the LB), is believed to have led to an improved tax payment rate, boosting the strengthening of the municipality's financial base.¹⁴
- Capacity development of municipalities: It is believed that understanding on the significances of “resident participation”, “transparency of decision-making” and “planning” in municipal administration has improved on the part of the mayor and municipal employees

¹⁴ A major increase of the fixed property tax collected by the municipality is reported by all of the municipalities visited for the ex-post evaluation.

thanks to their experiences of the FOCAL model. Because of this, “a culture of planning” which is said to have previously been absent, is believed to have been progressively established. LB is used not only for the preparation of PDC or PDM but also for various municipal administrative services. It has been pointed out that the implementation process of the FOCAL model has provided the opportunity for the capacity development of municipal employees in a variety of aspects, including technical and legal understanding, communication, presentation and handling of paperwork.¹⁵

➤ Acquisition and coordination of external funds by the municipality and communities: PDM and LB in line with the needs of a municipality and its communities can be used as materials to obtain funding from external organizations (NGOs and donors). Some municipalities have established an organizational setup to coordinate with multiple external organizations and have actively acquired external funding for the implementation of their PDM. PDM and LB have occasionally been used by the CIH to get external funding.¹⁶

➤ Capacity development of communities: Residents who have correctly recognized the purpose of PDC through their participation in the implementation of the FOCAL model sometimes actively monitor whether or not the municipality has been implementing social infrastructure consolidation projects in line with the PDC or make a request for implementation of such projects. It has been reported that some communities have successfully invited projects sponsored by NGOs, etc. by presenting their own PDC. Some communities also have achieved unification of residents and residents’ organizations, promotion of the participation of women and an increase of the awareness of self-help efforts and mutual help.

(2) Impacts of social infrastructure consolidation projects

With the application of the FOCAL model, it is believed that basic services in communities have been achieved more appropriately as well as more efficiently through the improvement of roads, educational and health care facilities, water supply and sewerage facilities, etc. compared to the case without the application of the FOCAL model.¹⁷ The ex-post evaluation has discovered the following situations regarding social infrastructure consolidation projects implemented under the Project.

➤ An improvement and expansion of water supply facilities have made it possible to provide an adequate water supply service which meets the population increase. The volume of

¹⁵ Based on the report for the Ex-Post Fact-Finding Survey implemented in 2013 under the FOCAL II Project.

¹⁶ According to the CIH, its reputation has been improved because of the implementation of the Project, resulting in successful bids for many projects sponsored by donors or NGOs. As a result, the number of employees and financial scale of the CIH have considerably increased.

¹⁷ This judgement is based on the fact that municipal public projects plans have become more adequate and the projects become less costly. However, because some 10 years have passed since the implementation of social infrastructure consolidation projects, it is difficult to concretely compare and assess the situation of social infrastructure before and after the introduction of the FOCAL model.

water supply was insufficient before but it is now available 24 hours a day. (Municipality of Corquin)

- A primary school has been newly constructed and children who used to commute to school in a nearby village now attend the new school in their own village. (Municipality of La Unión)
- The rehabilitation of the roof and floor of a health center has improved the sanitary environment for medical examination. (Municipality of San José)
- Introduction of a sanitary landfill disposal site has initiated the classified collection of solid waste. In suburban areas, the incidence of dengue fever has decreased. (Municipality of San Pedro)
- With a PEC, the classrooms of a primary school were constructed at half the cost of similar work undertaken by the central government. (Municipality of Cucuyagua)

(3) Dissemination of the FOCAL Model Outside the Target Area

With Japan's technical cooperation succeeding the Project, the FOCAL model has been disseminated to 30 inter-municipal councils and some 130 municipalities through the Ministry of Decentralization. The CIH has made its own contribution by providing technical support for two other councils. The institutionalization of the implementation of the FOCAL model in 2013 has made it compulsory for all municipalities to use the FOCAL model (see Footnote 13). Another JICA technical cooperation project titled "Advisor for Strengthening of Local Government Capacity" was subsequently implemented for further dissemination, and PDM using the FOCAL model was formulated in some 250 of 298 municipalities nationwide by June 2019.

(4) Environmental and Social Impacts

No direct impact on the natural environment by the Project has been observed. The Project did not necessitate the relocation of residents. Although the acquisition of some land was necessary as part of some social infrastructure consolidation projects (water supply project and sanitary landfill project), no problems emerged due to the purchase of land by either a municipality or community.

Based on the above, the Project achieved its purpose of "establishing an appropriate model to properly socialize, formulate, execute, manage, operate and maintain projects for the consolidation of social infrastructure in the CIH and member municipalities". Furthermore, the continuous use of the FOCAL model is confirmed in connection with the overall goal and the intended outputs have been achieved. Therefore, the effectiveness and impact of the Project are high.

3.3 Efficiency (Rating: ①)

3.3.1 Inputs

The planned and actual inputs of the Project are shown in the table below.

Inputs	Planned	Actual (at the time of project completion)
(1) Experts	Long-term: 1 (Chief Advisor) (other experts are dispatched as required)	Long-term: 3 (Chief Advisor and Work Coordinators (92 persons-month) Short-term: 1 (capacity development and evaluation: 2.7 persons-month)
(2) Trainees received	Unknown	Training in Honduras (total of some 260 persons)
(3) Equipment	Necessary equipment, etc. for technology transfer	Vehicle, PC, copier, etc.
(4) Others (Operational expenses, etc.)	Unknown (local consultant, etc.)	48.8 million JPY (printing and binding cost of manuals, etc.; training and workshop cost; travelling cost; local consultant cost; other)
Total project cost (Japanese side)	180 million JPY	242 million JPY
Operational expenses (Honduras side)	Unclear (training cost; infrastructure investment and maintenance cost; other)	Infrastructure investment cost: 24 million JPY (including 8 million JPY provided by other donors)

3.3.1.1 Elements of Inputs

The dispatch of experts and assignation of counterpart personnel within the CIH were conducted as planned and almost all of the planned activities to calculate the outputs were appropriately conducted. Even though the activities in the target municipalities were affected by a change of the staff members in charge following a change of their respective mayors, its impact was kept to a minimum by the support provided by the CIH which was less affected by the election results and also by the approach with residents' participation. Moreover, the Chief Advisor (long-term expert) was already involved in preparations for the Project as he had been dispatched to Honduras for one year as "a pipeline expert" prior to the commencement of the Project, while, the local consultant employed by the Project had already examined the LB methodology, i.e. forerunner of the FOCAL model as requested by the JICA Honduras Office prior to the commencement of the Project. Such continued involvement of the expert and consultant from the preparatory stage made a positive contribution to the efficient implementation of activities.

3.3.1.2 Project Cost

The planned funding level by the Japanese side for the Project was 180 million JPY but the actual spending of 243 million JPY exceeded the planned amount (135% of the plan) due to extension of the period of cooperation as described later and other reasons. The social infrastructure consolidation projects implemented under the Project were originally assumed to be implemented as DOCP projects of the FHIS and their costs were not included in the Project inputs. In reality, however, the funding for DOCP projects was not realized at the planned timing

and the Poverty Reduction Fund of the Government of Honduras and funding by other donors were used for these projects. While it can be said that the Project was efficiently implemented using external funding sources, such use was a factor for the extended period of cooperation of the Project as described later.

3.3.1.3 Period of Cooperation

It was originally planned to complete the Project in 30 months from September 2006 to March 2009. In reality, the progress of the Project was hindered as many social infrastructure consolidation projects were implemented using unplanned funding sources due to the delayed disbursement of the planned FHIS funds for nearly one year. The activities led by the CIH targeting the extension municipalities were also delayed because the Japanese input was kept to a minimum from the viewpoint of facilitating the capacity development of the counterpart organization to ensure the sustainability of these activities. As a result, the period of cooperation was extended to October 2010 but the PCMs and social infrastructure consolidation projects in the extension municipalities could not be completed within this extended period. Because of this extension, the actual period of cooperation (i.e. project period) was 49 months, far exceeding the originally planned period of cooperation (163% of the planned period).

Under the Project, it was planned to repeatedly implement such processes of the FOCAL model as the development of the model (Step 1), implementation of the LB, formulation of development plans and implementation of social infrastructure consolidation plans in pilot municipalities (Step 2) and in extension municipalities (Step 3). As the implementation of the FOCAL process, including the implementation of social infrastructure consolidation projects, is believed to require one and a half years to complete, the original plan of completing the FOCAL process in all of the selected municipalities in two and a half years appears to be rather unreasonable.

As is described above, both the project cost and project period significantly exceeded the plan. Therefore, efficiency of the project is low.

3.4 Sustainability (Rating: ③)

As described earlier, the overall goal of the Project was the continuous implementation of the FOCAL model in the selected municipalities and this goal has been achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. The sustainability of the Project is evaluated here by analyzing the related policy/political, institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspects.

3.4.1 Policy and Political Commitment for the Sustainability of Project Effects

After the enactment of the Municipal Administration Act (*Ley de Municipalidad*) in 1995, Honduras proceeded with decentralization through local development under a poverty reduction

strategy program after Hurricane Mitch in 1998, social infrastructure consolidation by the FHIS and the transfer of authority for various public services, including education and health care, to local administrations. An official decentralization policy was formulated in 2012, clearly establishing such directions for decentralization that the process of decentralization should be facilitated with emphasis on fairness, transparency, resident participation, sustainability, etc. and that the authority and financial sources to implement public services would be gradually transferred to municipalities while making efforts to strengthen the relevant capacity of municipal governments. Further in 2013, the implementation of the FOCAL model was institutionalized (see Footnote 13) and the work to formulate PDMs using the FOCAL model has been in progress nationwide. As such, the sustainability of the Project in terms of the policy and institutional aspect is high.

3.4.2 Institutional/Organizational Aspects for the Sustainability of Project Effects

(1) FHIS

The FHIS is a government organization established under an act with a limited period of validity. It merged with another organization in 2014 and became part of the Ministry of Community Development, Water and Sanitation (*Secretaria de Desarrollo Comunitario, Agua y Saneamiento*: SEDECOAS). At present, it is involved in the development of social infrastructure, especially in the education sector, across the country. At the time of ex-post evaluation, the FHIS is not directly involved in the implementation of the FOCAL model by the CIH and selected municipalities.

(2) CIH

The CIH is composed of 13 municipalities (at the time of ex-post evaluation) and its decisions are taken by the General Assembly (*Asamblea General*) made up of assemblymen of member municipalities and the Board of Directors (*Junta Directiva*) made up of mayors of member municipalities. Its administrative division has theme-specific units, such as capacity development, economic development, social infrastructure consolidation and local planning units, with full-time staff members. In addition, the CIH has contract employees serving specific projects. At the time of the implementation of the Project, the CIH had only nine full-time staff members but has subsequently strengthened this number to 14 full-time and 33 contract employees at the time of ex-post evaluation. As inter-municipal councils are less prone to the impacts of elections compared to municipalities, their staff organization is relatively steady (see Footnote 5).

Of the eight technical staff members of the CIH who were directly involved in the Project, six have left because of job-hopping and other reasons. The relatively low level of wages compared to those working for a donor or NGOs, etc. is believed to be the reason for such job-hopping even though the level of wages at the CIH is higher than that of municipal employees. Meanwhile, one staff member of a member municipality who was directly involved in the

application of the FOCAL model under the Project was recruited by the CIH and is responsible for FOCAL-related works on a full-time basis. However, it appears difficult for one person to cater for the needs of all member municipalities.¹⁸

(3) Municipalities

Each target municipality has theme-specific sections, ranging from technology (infrastructure consolidation), community development, women, environment, economic development, land register, planning, etc. with one or two staff members being assigned to each section. The FOCAL model is usually implemented with the collaboration of multiple sections. For activities such as LB with a high work volume, short-term contract employees are often recruited. It is worth noting that a community development section was established in all of the selected municipalities under the Project. It is a common practice in Honduras for most municipal staff members to be replaced when the mayor is replaced. In two selected municipalities where the mayor at the time of termination of the Project is still in office at present, some staff members working at the time of the implementation of the Project are still working at the time of ex-post evaluation.

Based on the above, there are no major problems in regard to the organizational aspect for the sustainability of the project effects even though the number of staff members allocated at the CIH causes concern.

3.4.3 Technical Aspects for the Sustainability of Project Effects

(1) CIH

As mentioned above, the CIH had lost most of the counterpart personnel involved in the Project by the time of ex-post evaluation but has newly recruited one person with rich experience of the FOCAL model in one selected municipality. Despite such change of personnel, the CIH has not only continued its technical support for the FOCAL model for member municipalities but has also provided technical cooperation on the introduction of the FOCAL model for other inter-municipal councils. As such, the CIH is believed to have maintained strong technical capability.

(2) Municipalities

As already mentioned in “3.2.2 Impact”, most municipal employees had no previous experience of the FOCAL model when they faced the FOCAL model in their work but have acquired the necessary capacity through the training and technical support provided by the CIH. A series of interview with municipal employees found that most of them are able to implement

¹⁸ According to the guidelines of the Ministry of Decentralization, it is recommended that an inter-municipal council assign one staff member responsible for the FOCAL model for every five municipalities, making it necessary for the CIH to have three full-time staff members for FOCAL-related work. Although the CIH still has persons who worked as counterpart personnel for the Project, they are not responsible for the FOCAL model full-time because of their involvement in other projects at the time of ex-post evaluation.

the model without any problem after a while even if they had no previous knowledge of the model. While it is desirable to have people conversant with social, economic and technical aspects to form a planning team for the formulation of a good quality plan, the results of interviews with municipal officials suggest that not many target municipalities of the Project have such people.

As stated in “3.2.2 Impact”, it is essential that the mayor correctly understands the purpose and advantages of the FOCAL model and is actively and responsibly involved in the process to ensure its proper implementation. The training provided by the CIH has mainly focused on municipal employees and no special orientation or training has been arranged for individual mayors. Appropriate support by the CIH to improve mayors’ awareness and understanding is essential.

Based on the above, there are not major problems concerning the technical aspect for the sustainability of the project effects even though there is a recognizable need for the consolidation of awareness raising and training on the part of mayors.

3.4.4 Financial Aspects for the Sustainability of Project Effects

(1) CIH

The revenue sources for the CIH are contributions by member municipalities, budget for projects to be implemented by the CIH (external funding) and its own revenue (rents, service fees, etc.) The total revenue in FY 2019 was approximately US\$ 660,000 while the total spending was approximately US\$ 550,000. The municipal contribution is based on the population size of each municipality (average of approximately US\$ 780/month/municipality with the annual total of some US\$ 140,000) which is used to pay the wages of full-time employees and to meet the cost of various technical services (including those related to the FOCAL model) provided by sectoral units for member municipalities. The project budget (approximately US\$ 510,000 per year) is provided by donors, NGOs and central government organizations to implement their projects through the CIH and includes wages for contract employees. As municipal contributions alone cannot cover the spending for technical support for member municipalities, the shortfall is compensated by savings on the project budget and rental income (approximately US\$ 6,000 per year). The revenue sources for the CIH have no extra room for the raising of more funds which forms part of the background for the insufficient number of full-time staff members dealing with the FOCAL model.

(2) Municipalities

The principal revenue sources of municipalities are the fixed property tax collected by each municipality and a central government grant. Small municipalities like those targeted by the Project mainly rely on the central government grant as its revenue source. As described in “Impact”, the Project is believed to have contributed to increased revenue from the fixed property

tax in the target municipalities. The institutionalization of FOCAL model now means that the implementation of the model is a condition to receive the central government grant. As such, the implementation of the FOCAL model is closely related to the strengthening of the financial base of the target municipalities.

Interviews with the target municipalities found that each municipality is always forced to formulate its PIMA under budget constraints due to its limited spending capacity compared to the necessary investment amount for the implementation of its PDM. Because of this situation, all of the target municipalities are constantly searching for external funding sources, such as donors, NGOs, etc. While the implementation of the FOCAL model requires a certain amount of spending, it is believed that the actual amount is not large enough to oppress a municipality's financial capacity in view of the fact that the model has been successfully implemented when the mayor has a strong will to do so. As also described in "3.2.2.2 Other Impacts", the Project is believed to have contributed to the acquisition of external funding by those municipalities and communities involved in the Project.

Based on the above, there are no problems in regard to the financial aspect. To summarize, no major problems have been observed in policy/political, institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is high.

4 Conclusion, Lessons Learned and Recommendations

4.1 Conclusion

The Project was implemented for the purpose of "establishing an appropriate model to properly socialize, formulate, execute, manage, operate and maintain projects concerning the consolidation of social infrastructure (the FOCAL model) in the CIH and member municipalities. The overall goal was to apply the FOCAL model in a sustainable form in the CIH and member municipalities as a consequence of the strengthening of the local and inter-municipal capacity. In terms of the national policy/plan and development needs of Honduras, at the time of both the planning and termination of the Project, it was important to develop the capacity of local governments which were the recipients of decentralization. The Project was relevant to Japan's ODA policy at the time of its planning. Therefore, the relevance of the Project is high. Through the implementation of the Project, the FOCAL model capable of properly formulating, executing, operating and maintaining social infrastructure consolidation projects with resident participation was developed and is still used at the time of ex-post evaluation. This situation suggests that the Project has facilitated the provision of basic services through the optimization and cost reduction of municipal projects. Moreover, wide-ranging positive impacts have been confirmed such as strengthening of a relationship of mutual trust between the municipal administration and residents, enhancement of the capacity of municipalities as well as communities and the acquisition of external funding. Therefore, the effectiveness and impact of the Project are high. Meanwhile, the

period of cooperation significantly exceeded the planned period, partly because of the need to find unplanned funding sources to cover the cost of the pilot projects for social infrastructure consolidation and other reasons, and the project cost also exceeded the planned cost. As such, the efficiency of the Project is low. In regard to the sustainability of the Project, although the small number of full-time staff members of the CIH can be pointed out, no major problems have been observed in policy/political, institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is high.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

4.2 Recommendations

4.2.1 Recommendations for the Implementation Agency (Consejo Intermunicipal Higuito)

The CIH should increase the number of full-time employees working for the FOCAL model from the present one employee so that it can provide appropriate technical support for all member municipalities implementing the FOCAL model. The recruitment of two more employees to make a three-man team as suggested by the guidelines of the Ministry of Decentralization is desirable. Strengthening of its revenue sources, including an increase of the contribution from member municipalities, should be considered if such a move is judged to be necessary to strengthen the manpower.

4.2.2 Recommendations to JICA

None

4.3 Lessons Learned

Setting of a period of cooperation with an adequate margin taking external conditions into consideration

In the second half of the Project, a period was set for the CIH to play a leading role in supporting the extension municipalities with a view to sufficiently enhancing the capacity of the CIH. As part of the capacity development, social infrastructure consolidation projects were implemented using funds of the FHIS. However, because of the delayed disbursement of such funds by the FHIS, it was decided that those projects planned for the second half of the Project would be implemented using other funding sources, necessitating an extension of the period of cooperation. In addition, the CIH became busy with other projects and activities in the extension municipalities were delayed. As a result, some social infrastructure consolidation projects and PDMs of extension municipalities were not completed within the cooperation period, and efficiency of the Project was judged low. At the time of planning, the timely disbursement of the FHIS's funds was not clearly recognized as an external condition.

In view of the experience of the Project described above, it is important to specifically confirm

external conditions which may become risk factors, possibly constraining the attainment of the planned outputs, to evaluate the probability of these conditions becoming constraints and, then, to set a period of cooperation with an adequate margin.

Republic of Honduras

FY 2019 Ex-Post Evaluation of Japanese Technical Cooperation Project

“The Project for Strengthening of the Capacity Development of
Local Governments for Regional Development (FOCAL II)”

External Evaluator: Hajime Sonoda, Global Group 21 Japan, Inc.

0. Summary

“The Project for Strengthening of the Capacity of Local Governments for Regional Development (FOCAL II)” (hereinafter referred to as “the Project”), a technical cooperation project, was implemented for the purpose of “the FOCAL process is applied in the selected municipalities through the collaboration of the associations of municipalities (hereinafter referred to as “the AMs”), in order that the use of local funds and human resources is optimized and people can participate in local development”.¹ The overall goal was “to establish the system of implementation of the FOCAL process at the national level through the AMs and the municipalities within the framework of the National Vision and the National Plan”. At the time of both the planning and termination of the Project, in view of the national policy/plan and development needs of the Republic of Honduras (hereinafter referred to as “Honduras”), it was very important to develop the capacity of local governments which were the recipients of decentralization as well as a method capable of planning and implementing municipal public investment projects in an appropriate manner. The Project was highly relevant to Japan’s ODA policy at the time of its planning. Therefore, the relevance of the Project is high. Through the Project, the FOCAL process was applied with resident participation, achieving optimization of municipal plans and reduction of the project cost, among others. As such, the purpose of the Project was achieved. Moreover, a scheme for implementing the FOCAL process was established nationwide and institutionalized, achieving the overall goal of the Project. Therefore, the effectiveness and impact of the Project are high. However, as almost 15 years have passed since the first introduction of the FOCAL process, a comprehensive review of its methodology and operation is recommended. Although the project period was within the plan, the project cost exceeded the plan. Therefore, the efficiency of the Project is fair. In regard to the sustainability of the project effects, although the need to consolidate the manpower strength to operate the FOCAL process can be pointed out, no major problems have been observed concerning the policy background and organizational, technical and financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is good. In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

¹ The term “FOCAL” is an abbreviation of the project title in Spanish, meaning “the capacity development of local areas (*Fortalecimiento de Capacidades Locales*)” of the previous “Project for Capacity Development in the Western Region of the Republic of Honduras”. The previous project established “an appropriate model to properly socialize, formulate, execute, manage, operate and maintain projects for the consolidation of social infrastructure” and the present Project disseminated such model nationwide. The method involved is called either the FOCAL model or FOCAL process in Honduras. In this report, the term “FOCAL process” is used as it was commonly used in the Project.

1. Project Description



Project locations



Street improved through resident participation
(Municipality of El Porvenir)

1.1 Background

After the inauguration of the Maduro Administration (2002 - 2006) in 2002, Honduras promoted a decentralization process by means of transferring authority and financial resources from the central government to local governments with a view to achieving the effective implementation of the poverty reduction policy. However, local governments (municipalities) as the recipients of decentralization had a limited budget, manpower and administrative capacity and their capacity development was an urgent task. To compensate for this shortcoming, some 50 AMs were established nationwide and each AM provided technical support for member municipalities² even though its technical capacity was limited.

Under these circumstances, JICA implemented “the Project for Capacity Development in the Western Region of the Republic of Honduras”, a technical cooperation project (hereinafter referred to as “the previous technical cooperation”) from September 2006 to October 2010, targeting the Inter-municipal Council of Higuito (*Consejo Intermunicipal Higuito, CIH*) in Western Honduras. During the previous technical cooperation period, the FOCAL process was developed and capacity development was conducted with the CIH and target municipalities so that the experimental introduction as well as sustained implementation of the process could become possible with technical support by the CIH in the target municipalities (10 municipalities among the member municipalities of the CIH). In the FOCAL process, a baseline survey (LB: complete count survey involving all houses) is conducted to identify the needs of communities with the cooperation of community leaders³ and a community development plan (PDC: list of projects

² Local administration in Honduras is the responsibility of 298 municipalities. Even though there are departments which are administrative units between the central government and municipalities, these departments are administrative units of the central government and are not local governments. Association of municipalities (AMs) are non-profit organizations serving the interests of citizens as stipulated by the Municipal Administration Act (*Ley de Municipalidad*). Each municipality is free to join an AM of its choice and is also allowed to leave freely. As of April 2019, there are 46 AMs across the country and more than 90% of the municipalities nationwide are members of one or more AMs. The operation of each AM is financed by contributions from its member municipalities.

³ Community leaders include officials of residents’ associations (*Patronato*), representatives of various residents’ groups (water committee, organization of pupils guardians, women’s group, etc.), church leaders and representatives of the education and health care sectors (village teachers, nurses, doctors, etc.)

with priority ranking) is formulated with resident participation. A municipal development plan (PDM) covering a period of 5 to 8 years is then compiled with the participation of community leaders and representatives of various residents' groups, following the process of selecting priority projects from the PDCs of all communities. Public investment projects in each fiscal year are then conducted based on an annual investment plan, in turn formulated based on the PDM.

In the previous technical cooperation, the introduction of the FOCAL process not only enabled the formulation of a public investment plan corresponding to the priority needs of residents and reduction of the cost of public investment projects through resident participation and the utilization of local resources but also contributed to ensuring the transparency of the municipal administration, strengthening of the relationship of trust between the municipal administration and residents, facilitation of the successful acquisition of external funding from NGOs and donors and development of the capacity of both the municipality and residents.⁴ Such benefits of the FOCAL process led various stakeholders of the central government to show a strong desire for the continuation of Japan's technical cooperation at a seminar held at a later stage of the previous technical cooperation and the Association of Municipalities of Honduras (*Asociación de Municipios de Honduras, AMHON*) and multiple AMs throughout the country shared their interest in the introduction of the FOCAL process.

On receipt of a request for the Project aimed at disseminating the FOCAL process throughout Honduras, JICA worked jointly with the Secretary of Human Right, Justice, Governance and Decentralization (*Secretaria de Derechos Humanos, Justicia, Gobernación y Descentralización, SDHJGD*) and conducted a detailed design study in 2011 and agreed with the Honduran side on the implementation of the Project.

1.2 Project Outline

The Project was implemented for its stated purpose of “the FOCAL process is applied in the selected municipalities through the collaboration of the AMs, in order that the use of local funds and human resources is optimized and people can participate in local development”. Under the Project, the capacity concerning the FOCAL process was strengthened at the SDHJGD (Output 1), 30 target AMs (Output 2) and 136 target municipalities (Output 3) through technical support based on training sessions and travelling guidance as provided by the SDHJGD to the AMs and then by the AMs to the municipalities. Moreover, these activities led to the sharing of information on the FOCAL process between the AMHON and other stakeholder organization as well as the AMs (Output 4).

⁴ Refer to the Project Termination Report and Ex-Post Evaluation Report for the previous technical cooperation.

Overall Goal	Establish the system of implementation of the FOCAL process at the national level through the AMs and the municipalities within the framework of the National Vision and the National Plan.	
Project Purpose	The FOCAL process is applied in the selected municipalities through the collaboration of the AMs, in order that the use of local funds and human resources is optimized and people can participate in local development.	
Outputs	Output 1	The SDHJGD, in coordination with other institutions, is able to extend the FOCAL process.
	Output 2	The selected associations are strengthened through the FOCAL process and can provide technical assistance to municipalities.
	Output 3	The selected municipalities acquire skills through the FOCAL process and the capacities for local development are strengthened.
	Output 4	SDHJGD in cooperation with AMHON and other related organizations is able to support the sharing and dissemination of knowledge and experience about FOCAL process among local governments.
Total Cost (Japanese Side)	379 million JPY	
Period of Cooperation	October 2011 - November 2016	
Project Area	Entire Honduras	
Implementing Agency	SDHJGD (reorganized from the Ministry of the Interior and Population at the time of the start of cooperation)	
Other Relevant Agencies/ Organizations	Presidential Directorate for Strategic Planning, Budget and Public Investment of the General Government Coordination (DPPEPIP - SCGG), AMHON	
Supporting Agency / Organization in Japan	None	
Related Projects	The Project for Capacity Development in the Western Region of the Republic of Honduras (September 2006 - October 2010 by JICA), Advisor for Strengthening of Local Governance Capacity (June 2017 - June 2019 by JICA)	

1.3 Outline of the Terminal Evaluation

1.3.1 Achievement Status of Project Purpose at the Time of the Terminal Evaluation

The project purpose is judged to have essentially been achieved, partly because its indicators have generally been achieved and partly because the application of the FOCAL process, i.e. the purpose of the Project, has significantly advanced in the selected municipalities.

1.3.2 Achievement Status of Overall Goal at the Time of the Terminal Evaluation (Including Other Impacts)

The indicators for the overall goal are expected to be achieved immediately after the termination of the Project, partly because projects were implemented in the selected

municipalities in line with their respective PDM with positive outcomes and partly because the rules safeguarding the implementation of the FOCAL process have been institutionalized.

1.3.3 Recommendations at the Time of the Terminal Evaluation

- (1) Points to consider during the period of cooperation
 - Clarification of a concrete system and method for implementing public relations exercises by the SDHJGD and AMHON to share good practices of the FOCAL process.
 - Examination of the feasibility of using the FOCAL process for decentralized sectoral service deliveries.

- (2) Points to consider regarding the sustainability of autonomous activities after the termination of the Project
 - Examination of possible monitoring and evaluation by the SDHJGD to ensure the formulation and implementation of PDMs in a sustainable manner
 - Strategy to disseminate the FOCAL process to new AMs and municipalities
 - Establishment of a sustainable training system to serve AMs and municipalities

2. Outline of the Evaluation Study

2.1 External Evaluator

Hajime Sonoda (Global Group 21 Japan, Inc.)

2.2 Duration of Evaluation Study

The ex-post evaluation study for the Project was conducted over the following period.

Duration of the Study: September 2019 - November 2020

Duration of the Field Survey: 14th January - 11th March, 2020

2.3 Constraints during the Evaluation Study

The second field survey scheduled in April and May 2020 could not be conducted because of the global spread of COVID-19. As a result, additional information gathering, consultation with the implementing agency and other work were conducted through the local consultant. From March to April 2020, a questionnaire survey using e-mail communication was conducted with 30 AMs and 136 municipalities. The reply ratio was low, however, due to suspension of administrative functions in general of these bodies for the same reason as only 15 AMs and 41 municipalities replied.

3. Results of the Evaluation (Overall Rating: A⁵)

3.1 Relevance (Rating: ③⁶)

3.1.1 Relevance to Development Plan of Honduras

As already described in 1.1 Background, Honduras was planning to intensify its efforts to alleviate poverty at the time of project planning (2011) by means of increasing the flow of funds from the central to municipal governments under the policy of decentralization. The promotion of decentralization was clearly indicated as an important policy for national as well as local development in “the Country Vision (2010 - 2038)” which was the long-term national policy at the time, “the National Plan (2010 - 2022)” which was a medium-term plan indicating the strategy and targets to be achieved in the plan period of 12 years and “the Government Plan (2010 - 2014)” which listed various issues for the government to achieve in four years. All of these emphasize poverty reduction and list resident participation and the improvement of transparency as important issues to promote projects to better meet the needs of the poor. After the commencement of the Project, the Government of Honduras announced a decentralization policy in 2012, setting an integral direction for decentralization which had previously been dealt with by individual ministries. Although the government changed in 2014, the above policy was still maintained at the time of the termination of the Project (2016). Therefore, the Project was highly relevant to the development plan/policy of Honduras at the time of both planning and termination.

3.1.2 Relevance to the Development Needs of Honduras

As already described in 1.1 Background, municipalities in Honduras at the time of project planning were vulnerable, facing such constraints as (i) heavy dependence on grants from the central government as revenue sources, (ii) lack of a sufficient number of municipal employees, (iii) almost entire replacement of the mayor and other municipal employees following a change of the ruling party and (iv) absence of a system to facilitate the smooth succession of the work following a change of municipal employees. Such situation was still prevalent nationwide at the time of the termination of the Project.

The FOCAL process introduced under the Project is effective for the appropriate planning and implementation of public investment projects of municipalities as shown in 3.2 Effectiveness and Impact. In Honduras, the SEPLAN (currently the Ministry of General Coordination) led the preparation of their own municipal development strategic plans by municipalities in the middle of the first decade of the 21st century. According to the SDHJGD and AMHON, the entire work was entrusted to consulting firms because of the high professional level of the planning method involved, causing a severe financial burden on smaller municipalities. Some problems also emerged, such as the planning of projects which did not correspond to the actual needs because

⁵ A: Highly satisfactory; B: Satisfactory; C: Partially satisfactory; D: Unsatisfactory

⁶ ③: High, ②: Fair, ①: Low

of reliance on limited existing data and the adoption of another municipality's plan without alteration. In contrast, the FOCAL process is a simpler, less expensive and more realistic planning method than the municipal development strategic plan and better meets the actual needs of municipalities even if it involves such extra work as LB and participatory work on the part of residents.

Based on the above, the Project was highly relevant to the development needs of Honduras at the time of both planning and termination.

3.1.3 Relevance to Japan's ODA Policy

At the time of project planning, Japan's Medium-Term Policy for ODA pointed out the importance of assistance for systems and policies designed to achieve poverty reduction. As the Project intended to contribute to improvement of the efficiency and effects of public services as well as social investment related to the implementation of municipal poverty reduction policies in line with the framework of Japan's ODA policy, the Project conformed to the purpose of Japan's ODA policy. The Project also conformed to "sustainable local development" as one priority area of Japan's assistance for Honduras and also to the action plan of the "Tokyo Declaration" adopted at the Japan-Central America Summit Meeting in August, 2005.

Based on the above, this project was highly relevant to the country's development plan and development needs as well as Japan's ODA policy. Therefore, its relevance is high.

3.2 Effectiveness and Impact⁷ (Rating: ③)

3.2.1 Effectiveness

3.2.1.1 Project Outputs

(1) SDHJGD

For a period of one year from the termination of the previous technical cooperation to the commencement of the Project, the staff member in charge of the FOCAL process at the JICA Honduras Office held almost weekly meetings with those in a similar position at the SDHJGD and visited the target areas of the previous technical cooperation with them to facilitate their understanding of the FOCAL process.⁸ Meanwhile, viable measures to make the FOCAL process more useful were examined. These included simplification of the LB and emphasis on the concept of "Life Improvement Approach".⁹ Furthermore, the FOCAL process was introduced to new

⁷ Sub-rating for Effectiveness is to be put with consideration of Impact.

⁸ According to the JICA Honduras Office, there were altogether some 40 meetings with the SDHJGD. During this process, the local consultant in charge of the FOCAL process for the previous technical cooperation conducted the training of staff members of the SDHJGD.

⁹ The Life Improvement Approach means that the administration pushes the efforts of the residents themselves to find problems in their lives and collectively try to solve such problems using resources accessible by the community. Residents are required to change their mindset from "what do we want the administration to do" to "what can we

municipalities with the initiative of the SDHJGD in preparation for a smooth start of the Project.

After the commencement of the Project, the SDHJGD with the assistance of a JICA expert revised the manuals for the application of the FOCAL process prepared in the previous technical cooperation based on the results of the examination mentioned above. The counterpart personnel who had undergone trainer's training on "LB", "PDC" and "PDM" provided training for those in charge of the FOCAL process at the target AMs and provided advices and supervision on the introduction of the FOCAL process by these AMs to the target municipalities. Although some counterparts had been replaced due to dismissal following a change of the government in January 2014 and subsequent staff reshuffling, the SDHJGD still had five staff members with experience of advising on and supervising the promotion and implementation of the FOCAL process when the Project was terminated. Throughout the period of cooperation for the Project, the SDHJGD strengthened the capacity of the target AMs and assisted their introduction of the FOCAL process to their member municipalities.

The SDHJGD also concluded a cooperation agreement with many organizations, including the Ministry of Health, Ministry of Development and Social Inclusion, international organizations (World Food and Agriculture Organization and World Food Programme), other donors (Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation and Spanish Agency for International Cooperation) and NGOs and many staff members of these organizations acquired know-how of the FOCAL process.

Based on the above, Output 1: "the SDHJGD, in coordination with other institutions, is able to extend the FOCAL process" was achieved.

(2) Associations of municipalities (AMs)

The target AMs established the FOCAL process implementation system through the assignation of dedicated staff members and the allocation of activity funds, acquired the capacity to provide training, supervision, advice, quality control of products, etc. to their member municipalities concerning the FOCAL process and its method. At the time of the termination of the Project, 30 AMs were individually providing training and on-site guidance on the FOCAL process to their own member municipalities. Based on this, Output 2: "the selected associations are strengthened through the FOCAL process and can provide technical assistance to municipalities" was achieved.

(3) Municipalities

136 target municipalities gradually started the introduction of the FOCAL process after the establishment of the relevant implementation system through the assignation of staff members in

do using the available resources in our village". As part of the Project, a short-term expert on the Life Improvement Approach was dispatched.

charge and securing of activity funds following the training by their respective AM. By the time of the termination of the Project, 101 municipalities had completed LB and preparation of LB reports, 89 municipalities had formulated PDCs and 82 municipalities had formulated PDMs, of which 76 PDMs were approved by the SDHJGD. 78 municipalities were implementing public investment projects in line with their own PDMs while 38 communities had started voluntary activities using the Life Improvement Approach. Based on the above, Output 3: “the selected municipalities acquire skills through the FOCAL process and the capacities for local development are strengthened” was achieved.

(4) Sharing and dissemination of knowledge and experience of the FOCAL process

As part of the Project, good practices of the FOCAL process were compiled with the cooperation of AMHON. At the same time, the network among AMHON, target AMs and municipalities was strengthened and the application of good practices by the target AMs and target municipalities was promoted through technical exchange meetings and the establishment of a knowledge website. With the cooperation of the AMHON and various organizations mentioned earlier, technical exchange meetings, seminars, etc. were held 13 times. The pioneering AMs provided technical assistance for other AMs and good practices were introduced through the network of the technical units of the AMs and the websites. Based on the above, Output 4: “SDHJGD in cooperation with AMHON and other related organizations is able to support the sharing and dissemination of knowledge and experience about FOCAL process among local governments ” was achieved.

3.2.1.2 Achievement of Project Purpose

The stated purpose of the Project was “the FOCAL process is applied in the selected municipalities through the collaboration of the AMs, in order that the use of local funds and human resources is optimized and people can participate in local development”. The first part of this purpose refers to the desirable situation of its application and the second part refers to the advantages of the FOCAL process. For the second part, “the continuous implementation of municipal development projects for two years through the application of the FOCAL process in at least 45 municipalities” was set as the indicator.

As described below, the project purpose is judged to have been achieved based on the analysis results of (i) the application situation of the FOCAL process as revealed by its relevant indicator and (ii) the advantages of the FOCAL process.

(1) Application of the FOCAL process

The achievement situation of the project purpose is shown in Table 1. When the procedure to formulate PDM using the FOCAL process in order to set projects is strictly applied, it is judged

that the project purpose was not fully achieved (projects were implemented in 36 municipalities against the target of 45 municipalities: 80% achievement rate). However, in the case where priority projects are confirmed in the FOCAL process but PDM has not yet been formulated, projects may be directly included in the annual investment plan based on PDCs and are implemented. In nine municipalities where one or more projects were included in their respective annual investment plans in 2015 and were implemented, these projects were actually implemented in accordance with the PDM formulated in 2016. This situation can be interpreted that projects were implemented for two continuous years following the FOCAL process. This means that the number of municipalities meeting the indicator increases from 36 to 45, achieving the numerical target. In 2016, 71 municipalities, including these 45 municipalities, implemented projects based on their respective PDM. Based on this fact, it is considered that part of the project purpose, i.e. “the FOCAL process is applied in the selected municipalities through the collaboration of the AMs”, was generally achieved.

Table 1 Achievement of the Project Purpose

Project Purpose	The FOCAL process is applied in the selected municipalities through the collaboration of the AMs, in order that the use of local funds and human resources is optimized and people can participate in local development.
Indicator	Actual Performance
Continuous implementation of municipal development projects for two years through the application of the FOCAL process in at least 45 municipalities.	In the two-year period from 2015 to 2016, 36 municipalities implemented projects included in their PDMs. In addition, nine municipalities implemented projects directly from PDCs in 2015 and projects based on the PDM only in 2016. Combined together, these make up 45 municipalities.

(2) Advantages of the FOCAL Process

The advantages of applying the FOCAL process are summarized below based on the results of the detailed examination of existing documents, interviews with AMs, municipalities and communities and the questionnaire survey.¹⁰ Therefore, the second part of the project purpose, i.e. “the use of local funds and human resources is optimized and people can participate in local development”, is judged to have been achieved.

- **Optimization of the public investment plan:** In the FOCAL process, the situation of each community is visualized by LB, leading to the confirmation of problems and needs,

¹⁰ During the field survey at the time of ex-post evaluation, a series of interviews were held with 11 mayors, one deputy mayor and 42 staff members in charge of the FOCAL process at six CIs and 14 municipalities out of 30 selected CIs and 136 selected municipalities of the Project in addition to 32 community leaders interviewed during the study visits to sites of infrastructure consolidation projects (including those implemented after the termination of the Project) implemented in individual municipalities. 15 CIs and 41 municipalities replied to the questionnaire survey.

examination and proposal of priority projects for the community by the residents themselves and formulation of PDC with the collective will of residents. This is followed by the formulation of a medium-term PDM with the participation of community leaders and resident groups and the implementation of public investment projects in accordance with this PDM. Previously, it was often the case that the mayor almost dogmatically planned public investment projects with some political considerations based on limited information, including petitions made by specific residents. Through the application of the FOCAL process, an orderly and appropriate public investment plan is now formulated based on the priority needs of each community with resident participation and also based on the medium-term prospect of the development of the entire municipality.

➤ Reduction of the project cost: As infrastructure projects are implemented with the consensus of the community, they can obtain more active contributions (in terms of labor, materials and funding) from residents. In the past, residents were accustomed to projects from which they would only receive something and were not motivated to make their own contribution. In addition, in the case of projects implemented by the central government, their cost was very high as materials and specialists were procured at the central level. In the case of the FOCAL process, as materials and human resources are procured locally, the project cost is lower. In the case of a Project Executed by Community (PEC) where the finance is managed by the residents themselves, as the saved funds can be used by the residents, reduction of the project cost is accelerated.¹¹ As a result of the above, it is believed that the same level of funding has produced many more positive outcomes under the FOCAL process.

➤ Resident participation: Through resident participation, social consent is obtained for the formulation of a plan. The greater ownership of residents of social infrastructure consolidation projects implemented in individual communities can ensure a high level of commitment on the part of residents to the operation and maintenance of these projects. In some communities, the levels of awareness of the available resources, self-help efforts and mutual help within the community were increased through the examination of “activities not requiring funding” and “activities to raise funds” through the Life Improvement Approach. As a result, collective work (for road cleaning, etc.) and business start-up (tourism, food processing, etc.) are observed.¹²

¹¹ Infrastructure consolidation projects implemented by municipalities are classified into two types, i.e. PECs and PEMs. While both types involve resident participation in terms of simple labour and funding to bear part of the project cost, a PEC is a relatively small infrastructure consolidation project. In a PEC, the resident’s organization opens a bank account to directly manage the project funds to control procurement and project operation. However, PECs are not widely implemented because of the need for the municipal authority to provide training, supervision and support to prepare suitable organizational capacity on the part of residents.

¹² Interviews at the community level, however, found that there were not many villages where the conventional way of thinking of “what we need and what we want to be done” has been changed to “what resources do we have and what can we do ourselves” except in those communities where a short-term expert on the Life Improvement

Moreover, through the analysis of various themes for the formulation of PDC, wide-ranging issues which were not previously discussed in the community are now being examined.

The questionnaire survey with selected AMs and municipalities found that the most popular advantage of the FOCAL process was “the implementation of projects in accordance with residents’ needs and priorities” (see Table 2), followed by “secured transparency” and “facilitation of resident participation” in that order.

Table 2 Advantages of the FOCAL Process According to AMs and Municipalities
(Ratio of AMs and municipalities responding in the affirmative)

Advantages of the FOCAL Process	AMs	Municipalities
• Implementation of projects in accordance with residents’ needs and priorities	87%	90%
• Secured transparency in planning and implementing projects	73%	59%
• Facilitation of resident participation	60%	54%
• Strengthening of the relationship of trust between the municipality and residents	27%	46%
• Facilitation of obtaining external funding by NGOs, donors, etc.	33%	29%
• Advancement of the empowerment of residents		
• Facilitation of obtaining central government grants	13%	15%
• Strengthening of the municipality’s own funding sources	0%	0%
• Others	0%	0%
	0%	0%

Source: Questionnaire survey as part of the ex-post evaluation (15 AMs and 41 municipalities responded)

Note: The respondents were given all choices and asked to select up to three.

Changes of Municipal Governance and Communities Due to Introduction of the FOCAL Process

According to the MANCURISJ (an AM) located in the central western part of Honduras, there was nothing qualified as a municipal plan prior to the introduction of the FOCAL process and each mayor simply implemented his/her pledges made at the time of election. Those projects which did not match the political plan of the mayor were not implemented. As such, many projects were implemented in voting districts favorable to the mayor. It was also a common practice for a project to be replaced by another in response to strong petitioning by one village or another.

In the Municipality of Yamaranguila which belongs to the MANCURISJ, investment plans used to be formulated which incorporated projects proposed by the mayor or a member of the city council and approved by the council. According to municipal staff, however, as there were no clear criteria for project approval, the acceptance or non-acceptance of a project was largely determined in reflection of the political party or bargaining power of a village representative. Consequently, many projects of low relevancy were implemented. The introduction of the FOCAL process has brought discipline and a medium-term perspective to municipal development planning, resulting in the adoption of more appropriate projects

Approach directly provided training.

based on the needs and collective will of the residents.

A PDM formed through the FOCAL process is valuable material to obtain the support from donors and NGOs. In the Municipality of Yamaranguila, with the initiative of the mayor, organizations conducting their activities in the municipality are considered as development partners and a technical forum has been established to coordinate their support right from the planning stage to improve the efficiency of investment. Looking back at the municipal development, the mayor says:

“When I became mayor, I thought about selling my own ideas for municipal development to donors and NGOs to obtain their financial support so that many beneficial projects could be implemented. However, once a PDM was formulated, I realized that my ideas did not necessarily reflect the needs of the citizens. As we have the FOCAL process now, the concept of a mayor leading municipal development is no longer tenable. It has become crystal clear that residents play a central role in development. I fully understand that the role of a mayor is to facilitate the participation of citizens and to act as a traffic controller. Meanwhile, the attitude of residents has been changing from simply waiting for external assistance.”

In the case of the village of Los Mangos in Yamaranguila, projects which tried to attract external assistance used to be limited to infrastructure projects and their implementation was dependent on their compatibility with the ruling party (party to which the mayor belongs) and bargaining power of the village leader. In the past, the mayor was not accountable for projects and blindly followed the guidance of a government ministry or donor. It often happened that one house wastefully had multiple toilets provided by different projects. Hardly any contribution to projects was made by the village as the villagers were completely passive.

In 2015, a PDC was prepared for Los Mangos under the Project. Having undergone training on the livelihood improvement approach provided by a short-term expert, the villagers united together to start looking at what they could do for themselves and the available village resources. The serving of traditional village dishes at a food festival and a municipal resident meeting convinced the villagers that their village had potential for rural tourism. The subsequent development of a restaurant and farmhouse accommodation led to visits by some 5,000 tourists to the village by the end of 2019. Meanwhile, the toilet construction project of a NGO initially had a budget to serve only 20 households on the grounds that external materials would be used. However, the proposal to use village resources (adobe bricks, stones, villagers as laborer, etc.) led to the installation of a toilet at all 48 households in the village using the same budget. Compared to the old toilets which are no longer properly functional and used for storage, etc., the new toilets are properly used with appropriate hygiene management under the guidance of the village leader and others. The village is currently working with central government organizations with a view to promoting a new agricultural project to materialize the projected image of the village in 30 years’ time presented in the PDC. Below are words of the village leader:

“The PDC reflects not the needs of the mayor but our own needs. Although it is not easy for ordinary villagers to fully understand development theories, the practical implementation of our own methodology for livelihood improvement is not very difficult. Because we can do things ourselves, we no longer need to ask for help like beggars. Our village has rich resources, the existence of which we simply did not recognize before.”

In the Municipality of El Porvenir which is located in the northern part of Honduras and which belongs to the MAMUCA (an AM), the draft PIMAs prepared by the mayor and municipal staff in charge in response to petitions made by some limited villages used to be approved by the council without any changes.

Those municipal staff currently in charge of the FOCAL process point out that some half of the projects in such plan may not have been relevant because of the limited availability of information which formed the basis of the PIMA.

According to those staff involved in the initial introduction of the FOCAL process, the mayor did not like a theoretical methodology and time-consuming process and was suspicious about the FOCAL process. However, the mayor understood the importance of the FOCAL process through training and was moved by the sight of municipal staff working closely together with residents to formulate a PDM. As residents who had hitherto been indifferent to municipal government began to listen with much expectation to the voice of the mayor, the mayor at long last started to actively support the FOCAL process. Today, the mayor visits villages and appeals the importance of the FOCAL process directly to residents. Because each public undertaking is given a priority ranking under the FOCAL process and also because the cost of each project is reduced due to the contribution of residents, the city has achieved remarkable progress in the fields of education, health care and infrastructure development among others, and is now examining the possibility of developing local tourism.

In the case of the village of Lopez Bonito of El Porvenir, the biggest problem for the residents had been an unpaved road running through the center of the village which was dusty when dry and muddy when wet. Residents asked the municipal office to improve the road using heavy machinery whenever the situation grew worse while believing that the central and municipal governments were responsible for solving the problem. Leading members of the village were shocked when they saw a video of a livelihood improvement project in Japan as part of the training on the FOCAL process in which Japanese people, particularly women, in post-war Japan were actively engaged in work to improve their livelihood. They realized that they can develop their village on their own if they unite together. In their PDC, while paving of the central road was one of the highest priority projects, the municipal budget would only cover a road section of 200 m which would not reach the village center from the village entrance. Through negotiations with the municipal government, it was agreed that the paving would cover 360 m, long enough to reach the central point, with the same budget as the residents would provide the labor and materials (stones). The entire labor was apportioned to individual households. Men transported the stones, cement, etc., young people were at the forefront of the heavy labor and women prepared food and drink. Even children participated in arranging the stones. The following year, as the residents' contribution increased, a further section of 650 m was paved with the same budget. The entire residents of the village are currently engaged in collaborative road cleaning several times a year. Careful attention is paid to road maintenance by introducing a speed bump and prohibiting transit of heavy machinery and the chopping of firewood on the road. Completion of the paving work has eliminated the problem of dust and mud and the resulting increase of shops and appraised value of land and houses along the road greatly satisfy the residents. The high level of unity among the residents has led to smooth collaboration between various village organizations for education, health care, water use, etc. with the village's residents' association at the top. Residents have learned how to obtain assistance through negotiations with the Church and NGOs. Meanwhile, as residents have also become aware of the budget size of the municipal government, the existence of priority projects for other villages and limitation of their dependence on the municipal government, they now concentrate their efforts on obtaining funding from other external bodies. The head of the residents' association says that her love for her village has strengthened on seeing the awakening and increased self-esteem of residents and she will ensure the solidarity of residents and work with the municipal government as well as many other supporting organizations.

3.2.2 Impact

3.2.2.1 Achievement of Overall Goal

The overall goal of the Project was “to establish the system of implementation of the FOCAL process at the national level through the AMs and the municipalities within the framework of the National Vision and the National Plan”. In association with this overall goal, three indicators were set: (i) the institutionalization of the FOCAL process makes progress, (ii) an annual investment plan (PIMA) is formulated in accordance with the relevant PDM in at least 80 municipalities, and (iii) the improvement of these two indicators is verified in the second LB. The detailed examination of existing documents, interviews with AMs, municipalities and communities and a questionnaire survey found the impacts relating to these indicators as described below. Because of such impacts, it is judged that the overall goal had been achieved by the time of ex-post evaluation.

(1) Institutionalization of the FOCAL process and its nationwide dissemination

Encouraged by the Project, the SDHJGD promulgated “the Regulation for the Formulation of PDM Incorporating a Land Use Program” in September, 2013, making the formulation of PDM based on the FOCAL process a condition to receive a government grant. This ordinance was enforced in FY 2016 after a preparatory period. Following this ordinance, the SDHJGD checks PDM of each municipality, and approves the PDM if it was prepared following the FOCAL process, then proceeds with the procedure to provide a grant for only those municipalities where there is conformity between the PIMA and the approved PDM. As this government grant is an indispensable revenue source for municipalities, the implementation of the FOCAL process has essentially become an obligation for municipalities.

Interviews with the Chief Advisor for the Project (a long-term expert), officer in charge of the Project at the JICA Honduras Office and the SDHJGD, the early achievement of the institutionalization of the FOCAL process can be attributed to the following factors.

- Favorable outcomes of the introduction of the FOCAL process have been accumulated over time since the implementation of the previous technical cooperation and these outcomes have been presented at a series of national events.
- The CA and officer in charge of the Project at the JICA Honduras Office repeated their visits to the relevant government ministries and met such top officials as the Minister and Deputy Minister to appeal the need for the institutionalization of the FOCAL process.
- Information on the interests and trends of relevant government ministries was constantly gathered and the contents of the ordinance were carefully prepared to avoid any objection by other ministries, taking the interests of individual ministries into consideration.
- The FOCAL process was continually introduced at donor’s meetings relating to

decentralization and governance, advancing the understanding of the FOCAL process among other donors. LB, PDC and PDM based on the FOCAL process were used for project formulation by donors and NGOs and were welcomed. As donors play a significant role in the development of Honduras, their opinions influenced the government. The government itself welcomed the progressive use of external funds due to the adoption of the FOCAL process by donors.

➤ The AMHON which promotes local autonomy and has a strong influence on government affairs thoroughly supported the FOCAL process and worked on the government to institutionalize this process. A member of parliament who was once a mayor involved in the previous technical cooperation pushed the institutionalization of the FOCAL process.

Meanwhile, supported by the follow-up technical cooperation “Advisor for Strengthening of Local Governance Capacity” (June 2017 - June 2019), the SDHJGD further disseminated the FOCAL process through many more AMs. As a result, the SDHJGD had approved PDMs formulated by the FOCAL process by 247 municipalities by April 2020, out of 298 municipalities nationwide.

(2) Implementation of public investment projects in line with PDM

In the target municipalities of the Project, public investment projects are implemented in line with PDMs. As these public investment projects based on the FOCAL process are highly compatible with the needs of residents and the project cost are compacted as described earlier, it is safe to assume that the public investment projects for the improvement of roads, educational and health care facilities, water supply and sewerage facilities, etc. are conducted in a more appropriate and efficient manner than before. However, the steady implementation of these projects by each municipality in accordance with its own PDM is the condition to achieve such improvement. The actual performance is determined by the level of commitment by the mayor to abide by the FOCAL process and the size of the resources to which the municipality has access.

(3) Impacts of social infrastructure consolidation projects

As the planning of public investment projects to be conducted by a municipality has become more appropriate together with a lower project cost, the consolidation of basic services is believed to have been more appropriately and efficiently achieved through the improvement of roads, educational and health care facilities, water supply and sewerage facilities, etc. compared to the case where the FOCAL process is not applied. One example is the improvement of indicators related to basic services when the results of LB conducted more than once are compared in those municipalities where the FOCAL process has been implemented in two or more cycles. Moreover, in the questionnaire survey, 93% of AMs and 85% of municipalities replied that the introduction

of the FOCAL process had “strongly facilitated” socioeconomic development.

In the questionnaire survey with the selected AMs and municipalities, the respondents selected “the political will and opinion of the mayor” and “appropriate resident participation” as the most important conditions for the FOCAL process to succeed.¹³ The factors influencing the FOCAL process and problems are summarized below, taking the results of interviews with AMs, municipalities and communities into consideration.

- Understanding and political will of the mayor: For the allocation of the necessary manpower and budget for the implementation of the FOCAL process and the implementation of projects in line with the formulated PDM, it is extremely important for the mayor to have a proper understanding of the purpose of the FOCAL process and a personal commitment to the implementation of the FOCAL process. Some mayors appear not to have understood that the FOCAL process is a useful tool for development and are only interested in making the formats in place to receive a government grant.
- Resident participation: Resident participation is the most important element of the FOCAL process along with fact-finding through LB. For examination of PDCs, one condition to ensure their quality is the participation of residents and resident organizations capable of reflecting the knowledge and opinions of the entire community in a well-balanced manner. The principal factors hindering the participation of residents (including replies to LB) are movements geared towards boycotting the activities of political parties other than one’s own party, considering the implementation of the FOCAL process to be a political activity, and general indifference to the FOCAL process in urban areas.
- Strength and capacity of staff members in charge: The presence of staff members with a good understanding of the FOCAL process is essential. In Honduras, as most staff members of municipality are replaced when the mayor is replaced¹⁴, and the length of their service is short except in some municipalities. As such, most newly appointed staff

¹³ As a condition for the success of FOCAL process application, 93% of AMs and 76% of municipalities selected “the political will and opinion of the mayor” while 80% of AMs and 78% of municipalities selected “appropriate resident participation”. (The respondents were given several options to choose from and were asked to choose up to a maximum of three.)

¹⁴ Honduran society is strongly linked to political parties and many people openly express which political party they support. There is preferential treatment by administrations (national and municipal) for supporters of the ruling party in terms of the recruitment of civil servants and the provision of public services. Because of this, a change of the ruling party after an election leads to a change of the mayors as well as almost all municipal employees. In contrast, the change of staff of an AM is modest as members of the general assembly or board of directors which is responsible for decision-making are always representatives of multiple political parties even if the mayors of individual member municipalities change after a mayoral election. There is also a tacit understanding among member municipalities that AMs should not be politicized and the operating section of AMs makes conscious efforts to eliminate political influence as much as possible.

members have no previous experience of the FOCAL process. The component of the FOCAL process with the highest work volume is LB, followed by the formulation of PDCs. As the strength of full-time staff members is insufficient, extra personnel are contracted on a short-term basis to implement the FOCAL process in many municipalities. Most full-time staff members involved in the FOCAL process have other work responsibilities as well. In contrast, many AMs have technical staff members with much experience of the FOCAL process and provide technical support for their member municipalities. Even though not many staff members are replaced because of an election result, some AMs do not have a sufficient number of staff members in charge of the FOCAL process compared to the number of member municipalities.

For the examination of PDCs, the crucial factor to determine the quality of a PDC is whether or not there are sufficient human resources capable of presenting appropriate solutions (i.e. technical options) to deal with the needs (problems) recognized by residents. When examining PDM, it is essential to formulate a strategy by analyzing the problems and development potential of the municipality from a comprehensive, extensive and medium to long-term perspective. The quality of the plan is determined by whether or not people involved are conversant with the social, economic and technical aspects of the planning. It is desirable for such people to form a planning team. The issue here is whether or not a municipality can secure the services of people with professional capabilities, or the AMs can provide the necessary support.

➤ Issues with the planning method: The results of the questionnaire survey show that 73% of AMs and 46% of municipalities replied that some modifications would be desirable with the planning and operating methods of the FOCAL process. The major points for suggested modification are listed below (based on free answer).

- ◇ Simplification of the method (elimination of duplication and simplification of the process in table formats and procedures, etc.)
- ◇ Introduction of a sampling survey in LB (in urban areas, etc.)
- ◇ Assured flexibility in elaboration of a project list in PDM
- ◇ Introduction of a monitoring mechanism for the implementation situation and development impacts of a development plan

There has been a strong request for the simplification of the FOCAL process¹⁵ as the

¹⁵ In contrast, some municipal technical staff members expressed the opinion that even though it took some time to understand the FOCAL process, it was not very difficult to apply once they became familiar with it. There are examples where the repeated application of the FOCAL process by the same mayor and staff members improved their understanding of the process and allowed them to efficiently complete the process in a short period of time.

procedures in certain aspects are complicated and time-consuming. To be more precise, examples of such complicated procedures are the implementation of LB as a complete count survey, evaluation of projects proposed for PDC based on specific evaluation criteria in each of 14 different fields, and a similarly complicated procedure to select priority projects for PDM.

It has often been pointed out that an increase of the population, number of communities or areas of a municipality leads to an increased LB cost. While the FOCAL process was originally designed under the previous technical cooperation for application to smaller municipalities, the nationwide dissemination of its application, even for larger municipalities, has resulted in such problems as a significant cost burden of the complete count survey and difficult to obtain the participation of residents, particularly in urban areas.

As far as confirmation made by the field survey is concerned, many municipalities and communities implementing the FOCAL process for the second time did not conduct a detailed comparison of the results of the first and second LBs, failing to sufficiently examine the development strategy based on the results of a comparative analysis. Some of those in charge of the FOCAL process at AMs and municipalities have voiced the opinion that there should be guidelines for a comparative analysis method for two LBs and also for the utilization of the comparative analysis results for planning.

The data from LB is directly input to a web system developed by the AMHON but it is necessary to secure access to the raw data of each municipality so that municipalities can use such data for their own purposes.¹⁶ It is believed that the use of LB data by the central government and coordination between PDMs and central government plans can be facilitated by making the items and indicators used for LB comparable with the indicators used by the central government in each field.¹⁷

➤ Issues with project implementation: The projects listed in PDM are implemented through PIMA prepared each year by the municipal administration. The SDHJGD examines the contents of these PIMAs every year and does not provide a government grant to those municipalities of which the PIMA contents do not sufficiently conform to those of the PDM. However, after getting approval of the PIMA by the SDHJGD, each municipality may alter

There are also examples where repeated experience of the FOCAL process on the part of residents strengthened their participation as well as discussions. It must be noted that the evaluation and priority ranking of proposed projects are conducted in line with multiple evaluation criteria but this process does not include the viewpoint of cost effectiveness. The addition of the viewpoint of cost effectiveness is believed to be useful for the more efficient investment by municipalities.

¹⁶ At present, municipalities can only access aggregate data. At the time of the field survey, the AMHON was preparing modification of the system to enable access to raw data in coordination with the SDHJGD.

¹⁷ The indicators for LB were set with the MDGs in mind under the previous technical cooperation and with SDGs in mind under the Project. The background for this was the need to urge the use of the results by LBs conducted by donors in Honduras where donors play an important role in the country's development. On the other hand, the central government has set different indicators for each sector. At the time of the field survey, efforts were in progress in the education field to make LB indicators and those of the Ministry of Education compatible.

the contents of the PIMA as many times as it wants with a resolution passed by the municipal assembly. Because of this, the level of conformity may significantly decline in the end in such a case where the mayor does not respect the PDM.¹⁸ Moreover, the conformity level also declines in the case where it is necessary to deal with needs not clearly recognized at the time of formulating the PDM or newly emerging needs, and in the case where a municipal contribution is required for a project of the central government or donor. One important issue here is to maintain conformity between PDM and PIMA while ensuring a certain level of flexibility.

The results of the field survey indicate that the delayed disbursement of a government grant because of the time-consuming procedure in some municipalities is a constraint for the implementation of projects as planned. The transfer of revenue sources to municipalities has been slow and the resulting financial constraint is the biggest obstacle to the implementation of a PDM.¹⁹ In regard to a government grant, the proportion of its use for individual fields is instructed to be uniform for all municipalities. Such an arrangement may be useful to a certain extent to prevent the misuse of the grant in municipalities with poor planning capacity. However, as the actual spending needs essentially vary from one municipality to another, this arrangement is an obstacle to the rational use of the grant in municipalities with adequate planning capacity.

3.2.2.2 Other Impacts

Other impacts of the FOCAL process can be pointed out as described below based on the results of the interviews with AMs, municipalities and residents during the field survey and those of the questionnaire survey with AMs and municipalities.

- Strengthening of the relationship of trust between the municipal administration and residents: The relationship of mutual trust between the municipal administration and residents is strengthened when the general opinions of the residents are reflected on the municipal plan in a well-balanced manner and projects proposed in this way are implemented by the municipal administration as planned. There have been cases where the active use of the FOCAL process has actually assisted the successful re-election of the mayor. In contrast, when resident participation is insufficient or proposals by the resident side are ignored or not realized, the relationship of trust is damaged. It has been pointed out that the strengthening of such relationship, together with compilation of the municipal ledger for the fixed property tax (in some municipalities, this work is done utilizing the

¹⁸ There have been cases where a new mayor has ignored the PDM formulated by the previous mayor to realize his/her own election promises or a mayor has accepted a petition made by some residents to alter the contents of the PDM.

¹⁹ There is a policy to set aside 11% of the national budget for this grant for local municipalities but the real percentage is approximately half of this level.

results of the LB), have led to an improved tax payment rate, boosting the strengthening of the municipality's financial base.²⁰

➤ Capacity development of municipalities: It is believed that understanding of the significance of “resident participation”, “transparency of decision-making” and “planning” in municipal administration has improved on the part of the majority of municipal employees due to their experience of the FOCAL process. Because of this, “a culture of planning” which is said to have previously been absent, is believed to have been progressively established. Information from LB can be used not only for the preparation of PDC or PDM but also for various municipal services.

➤ Acquisition and coordination of external funds by the municipality and communities: PDM and LB in line with the needs of a municipality and its communities can be used as materials to obtain funding from external organizations (NGOs and donors). Some municipalities have established an organizational setup to coordinate with multiple external organizations and have actively obtained external funding for the implementation of their PDM.

➤ Capacity development of communities: In some communities, residents who have correctly recognized the purpose of PDC through their participation in the implementation of the FOCAL process sometimes actively monitor whether or not the municipality has been implementing social infrastructure consolidation projects in line with the PDC or make a request for such monitoring. It has been reported that some communities have successfully invited projects sponsored by NGOs, etc. by presenting their own PDC. Some communities also have achieved the unification of residents and residents' organizations, promotion of the participation of women and an increase of the awareness of self-help efforts and mutual help.

Based on the above, the Project achieved its purpose of “the FOCAL process is applied in the selected municipalities through the collaboration of the AMs, in order that the use of local funds and human resources is optimized and people can participate in local development”. Furthermore, regarding the overall goal, the implementation system of the FOCAL process was established nationwide and the expected impacts have been realized. The Project caused neither direct impacts on the environment nor the resettlement of residents. Therefore, the effectiveness and impact of the Project are high.

²⁰ A major increase of the fixed property tax collected by the municipality is reported by all of the municipalities visited for the ex-post evaluation.

3.3 Efficiency (Rating: ②)

3.3.1 Inputs

The planned and actual inputs of the Project are shown in the table below.

Inputs	Planned	Actual (at project completion)
Dispatch of Experts	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Long-term: 3 (chief advisor / local administration, work coordination / strengthening of inter-municipality cooperation, training plan / strengthening of monitoring) • Short-term: 1 - 2/year (capacity evaluation, livelihood improvement, etc.) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Long-term: 3 (110 M/M) (chief advisor / local administration, work coordination / strengthening of inter-municipality cooperation) • Short-term: 4 (33 M/M) 17 times (capacity development / evaluation, livelihood improvement / village development, planning of local development / projects and facilitation of plan implementation)
(2) Trainees received	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training in Japan: once/year (local administration) • Third country training (participatory development) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training in Japan: total of 10 times with a total of 26 participants (on strengthening of local administration, livelihood improvement approach, etc. 25 also participated in supplementary training overseas) • Third country training: 1 (PCM training)
(3) Equipment	Equipment required for technology transfer	Vehicle, PC, office equipment, etc. (equivalent to 12 million JPY)
(4) Others (Operational expenses, etc.)	Cost unknown (training cost and consultant fee, etc. in Honduras)	105 million JPY
Total project cost (Japanese side)	330 million JPY in total	379 million JPY in total
Operational expenses (Honduras side)	Cost unknown (training cost, project office cost, etc.)	Cost unknown <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SDHJGD: wages, travel allowance for counterpart personnel, vehicle maintenance cost, etc. • AMs and municipalities: wages, travel allowance/cost, training cost, survey cost, etc.

3.3.1.1 Elements of Inputs

The Chief Advisor and principal local consultant had been already involved in the formulation and dissemination of the FOCAL process under the previous technical cooperation and, therefore, they had detailed knowledge and rich experience of the themes dealt with by the Project. It is believed that the full utilization of their experience with the previous technical cooperation led to the efficient implementation of the Project.

For a period of one year from the termination of the previous technical cooperation to the commencement of the Project, the JICA Honduras Office conducted training as part of the weekly meeting with the likely counterparts of the SDHJGD as a preparatory step for the Project. It is believed that this practice led to the swift start-up and efficient implementation of the Project.²¹

²¹ The JICA Honduras Office also played an important role in facilitating cooperation between the Project and other sector-specific organizations as well as other projects by means of conducting various activities, including participation in donor meetings with the Chief Advisor to assist the dissemination of the progress and outcomes of

Under the Ministry of Interior and Population (*Secretaria del Interior y Población: SEIP*), the predecessor of the SDHJGD, nine counterparts were assigned as full-time staff members for the Project. After its reorganization into the SDHJGD, five staff members, including the project manager (the post held concurrently by the Director of Local Planning and Governance), were assigned as full-time counterparts for the Project. At the time of the change of the central government in 2014, the activities of the SDHJGD temporarily stagnated, causing the suspension and restart of the FOCAL process in some of the selected municipalities, in turn reducing the efficiency of the activities related to the FOCAL process.

3.3.1.2 Project Cost

The planned funding amount by the Japanese side for the Project was 330 million JPY but the actual spending of 379 million JPY exceeded the planned amount by 49 million JPY (115% of that planned). One major factor for this increase was the higher spending for the operational expenses of some 24 million JPY than that planned because of the unexpected rental fee for a vehicle due to flood damages of the vehicles, cost of additional activities conducted to enhance the sustainability of the FOCAL process before and after the year of general election and other reasons.²²

3.3.1.3 Period of Cooperation

The Project was planned to complete in 62 months from October 2011 to November 2016 and the actual period of cooperation was as planned.

In summary, although the project period was within the plan, the project cost exceeded the plan. Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

3.4 Sustainability (Rating: ③)

As described earlier, the overall goal of the Project was the establishment of a system to implement the FOCAL process at the national level and this goal was achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. The sustainability of the Project is evaluated here by analyzing the related policy/political, institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspects.

3.4.1 Policy and Political Commitment for the Sustainability of Project Effects

Honduras formulated a decentralization policy in 2012, clearly establishing the direction for decentralization in that this process of decentralization should be facilitated with emphasis on

the Project to other donors.

²² Based on the termination evaluation of the Project. Because the breakdown of the planned budget was not clearly given, it was impossible to make more detailed analysis.

fairness, transparency, resident participation, sustainability, etc. and that the authority and financial sources to implement public services would be gradually transferred to municipalities while making efforts to strengthen the relevant capacity of municipal governments. However, it is taking long time to determine how to change the status of national public servants to local public servants under the Decentralization Act based on the decentralization policy, and this Act has not yet been approved by the President as of the time of ex-post evaluation. Neither has the transfer of financial sources to municipalities progressed much (see Footnote 19). Nevertheless, the actual situation is that these delays do not hinder the implementation of the FOCAL process itself and the sustainability of the Project in terms of the policy and institutional commitment is judged to be high.

3.4.2 Institutional/Organizational Aspects for the Sustainability of Project Effects

During the implementation period of the Project, the “Regulations for the formulation of a PDM incorporating a land use program” was promulgated, making the formulation of PDM based on the FOCAL process a condition to receive a central government grant (see 3.2.2.1 Achievement of Overall Goal). This ordinance was enforced in FY 2016 and the FOCAL process is being implemented throughout the country.

Meanwhile, the Ministry of General Coordination (*Secretaría de Coordinación General de Gobierno*; SCGG) has been introducing the Municipal Strategic Plan with Performance Evaluation (*Plan Estratégico Institucional con Gestión per Resultados*) targeting large municipalities based on a government ordinance enforced in 2018. This Strategic Plan is designed to plan and evaluate the activities of municipal governments and its purpose differs from that of the FOCAL process which leads to the planning of municipal development proper. However, this Strategic Plan coexisted with the FOCAL process in some of the selected municipalities, causing confusion on the part of municipalities for a short while. Since 2019, the SDHJGD and SCGG have been examining a framework to integrate and implement these two processes together.²³

The section of the SDHJGD in charge of the FOCAL process is the Municipality Planning Unit (*Unidad de Planificación Municipal*) controlled by the Deputy Minister for Governance and Decentralization and this unit consists of the head and four technical staff members. The unit is currently preparing to add one extra staff member in view of the increasing work volume to supervise and assist the implementation and renewal of PDMs by municipalities. The field survey and questionnaire survey for the ex-post evaluation found a strong request on the part of municipalities for considerable support from the Unit, including more frequent on-site visits. To ensure the sustainability of the project effects, it is hoped that the Unit secures an adequate staff strength through the recruitment of additional personnel while maintaining the current well-

²³ A new government ordinance is expected to be issued some time in 2020 and is expected to preserve such important elements of the FOCAL process as resident participation, LB, PDC and PDM.

experienced staff members in charge.

In general, full-time staff members of various units of the administration department of AMs provide technical assistance for their member municipalities. Although not many staff members of AMs are changed after an election (see Footnote 14), the number of the staff members in charge of the FOCAL process at some AMs cannot be said to be sufficient to serve a number of their member municipalities. A municipality has various sections, such as technical (infrastructure consolidation), community development, women, the environment, economic development, land register, planning sections, and the FOCAL process is usually implemented with the collaboration of multiple sections. In some municipalities, sections such as “municipal planning (*Planificación Municipal*)” and “FOCAL” are established as dedicated sections for the FOCAL process but the number of such municipalities is small. Meanwhile, the Technical Secretariat for Municipal Administrative Career (*Secretaría Técnica de la Carrera Administrativa Municipal: SETCAM*) in charge of the dissemination and promotion of the local public servant system facilitates the long service and uninterrupted employment of human resources by means of certifying those with rich experience and competence regarding municipal administrative work for their preferential treatment at the time of selection. As this system has just been introduced in some municipalities, it is still too soon to measure its effect.

Based on the above, there are no major problems concerning the technical aspect for the sustainability of the project effects. However, the necessity to enhance the staff strength of the Municipality Planning Unit of the SDHJGD can be pointed out.

3.4.3 Technical Aspects for the Sustainability of Project Effects

Of the head and four staff members of the Municipality Planning Unit of the SDHJGD, the head and three technical staff members were counterparts for the Project and the remaining technical staff member was the counterpart for the succeeding technical cooperation. As the Unit is continuously providing guidance and training on the FOCAL process for municipalities since the termination of the succeeding technical cooperation, the Unit is believed to have maintained a high level of technical capacity.

The target municipalities of the Project have been implementing projects based on their own PDMs up to the time of ex-post evaluation with the help of AMs while revising the PDM as required. Although some municipalities have seen staff members with FOCAL process-related capacity leave their positions, most AMs have maintained their capacity to provide technical assistance for municipalities as far as the field survey for ex-post evaluation revealed. In those municipalities where the mayor was replaced after an election, new technical staff were employed in most cases and these municipalities are implementing the FOCAL process with the technical assistance of their respective AMs. The SETCAM has programs to train professional staff specializing in internal control, procurement, contracts, environmental law, municipal planning,

etc. to strengthen the capacity of municipalities and proceeds with such human resources development, making the best use of distance education.²⁴

As described above, the capacity of the target AMs and municipalities regarding the FOCAL process is believed to have been generally maintained, posing no major problems in relation to the sustainability of the technical aspect of the Project, while it can be pointed out that it is necessary to secure an adequate support system (deployment of necessary personnel) on the part of the SDHJGD and AMs to maintain the technical capacity of municipalities of which the staff members are frequently replaced. As described before, in order to improve the quality of planning, it is also important to ensure that municipalities secure the service of people with the required professional knowledge and skills, and that AMs can provide such support when necessary.

3.4.4 Financial Aspects for the Sustainability of Project Effects

The Municipality Planning Unit of the SDHJGD handles the central government grant for municipalities and its staff members spend almost half of their working hours on guidance and training for AMs and municipalities. Because of the limited budget for the field activities of this Unit, it sometimes requests AMs and municipalities to pay for the travel costs of its staff members or invites target persons to Tegucigalpa, the capital of Honduras, for training. According to the Unit, there has been little financial leeway to meet the travel cost of its staff members' visits to local areas since the termination of the succeeding technical cooperation which was providing financial support to cover the operation cost in Honduras.

The revenue sources for AMs are primarily contributions by member municipalities and the budgets for projects to be implemented by AMs (funded by donors, NGOs, etc.). However, the actual financial situation varies from one AM to another. Although no serious financial constraints were expressed during interviews and questionnaire survey with AMs, it was observed that the full-time manpower level of staff members handling the FOCAL process was insufficient at some AMs due to financial constraints.

The principal revenue sources of municipalities are the fixed property tax collected by individual municipalities and a government grant. Small municipalities rely on the central government grant. Institutionalization of the FOCAL process has made the implementation of the process a condition to receive the central government grant. As described in "3.2.2 Impact", the Project may have contributed to the increased collection of the fixed property tax by the target municipalities. As such, the implementation of the FOCAL process is closely related to the strengthening of the financial base of the target municipalities. The interviews and questionnaire

²⁴ Human resources development efforts related to the FOCAL process were suspended after the termination of the succeeding technical cooperation, partly because of the suspension of trainer dispatch by the SDHJGD, in turn due to a shortage of suitable personnel, and partly because of budgetary constraints experienced by the SETCAM. Because of this, 42 trainees have been unable to complete their training. In addition, more than 400 people are waiting for training.

survey with municipalities found that the revenue was insufficient to cover the necessary investment amount to implement the PDM formulated by the FOCAL process. For this reason, each municipality is forced to formulate its PIMA under budget constraints and it is continually searching for external funding sources, such as donors, NGOs, etc. A survey and the work to formulate a plan using the FOCAL process require a certain amount of expenditure. It is believed that the actual amount is not large enough to oppress a municipality's financial capacity as the FOCAL process has been implemented when the mayor has a strong will to do so.

Based on the above, there are no major problems concerning the financial aspect of the sustainability of the project effects. However, it can be pointed out that it is necessary to enhance the budget to secure the capacity of the SDHJGD and AMs to support municipalities as well as the budget for the implementation of PDMs.

Based on the above, no major problems have been observed in policy/political, institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspects. Therefore, sustainability of the project effects is high.

4 Conclusion, Lessons Learned and Recommendations

4.1 Conclusion

The Project was implemented for the purpose of “the FOCAL process is applied in the selected municipalities through the collaboration of the AMs, in order that the use of local funds and human resources is optimized and people can participate in local development”. The overall goal was “to establish the system of implementation of the FOCAL process at the national level through the AMs and the municipalities within the framework of the National Vision and the National Plan”. At the time of both the planning and termination of the Project, in view of the national policy/plan and development needs of Honduras, it was very important to develop the capacity of local governments which were the recipients of decentralization as well as a method capable of planning and implementing municipal public investment projects in an appropriate manner. The Project was highly relevant to Japan's ODA policy at the time of its planning. Therefore, the relevance of the Project is high. Through the Project, the FOCAL process was applied with resident participation, achieving optimization of municipal plans and reduction of the project cost, among others. As such, the purpose of the Project was achieved. Moreover, a scheme for implementing the FOCAL process was established nationwide and institutionalized, achieving the overall goal of the Project. Therefore, the effectiveness and impact of the Project are high. However, as almost 15 years have passed since the first introduction of the FOCAL process, a comprehensive review of its methodology and operation is recommended. Although the project period was within the plan, the project cost exceeded the plan. Therefore, the efficiency of the Project is fair. In regard to the sustainability of the project effects, although the need to

consolidate the manpower strength to operate the FOCAL process can be pointed out, no major problems have been observed concerning the policy background and organizational, technical and financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is high. In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

4.2 Recommendations

4.2.1 Recommendations to Implementation Agency (SDHJGD)

(1) Review of the methodology and operation of the FOCAL process

The FOCAL process was originally formulated for its application to smaller member municipalities of the CIH under the previous technical cooperation starting in 2006 for the purpose of conducting social infrastructure consolidation projects by central government organizations in an appropriate manner. Since 2010, efforts have been made to disseminate the FOCAL process nationwide through the Project targeting the SDHJGD and succeeding technical cooperation and the FOCAL process has been institutionalized as a condition for municipalities to receive the central government grant. On the other hand, efforts are being made to combine the FOCAL process with the Municipal Strategic Plan promoted by the SCGG at the time of ex-post evaluation. The FOCAL process has, therefore, undergone major changes in terms of its context of application in its 15-year history. During this period, many AMs and municipalities are believed to have accumulated various experiences. Therefore, it is high time to undertake a complete review of the methodology and operation of the FOCAL process. It is advised that the SDHJGD, by organizing workshops or other meetings inviting those in charge of the FOCAL process at AMs and municipalities throughout the country, consolidate various experiences and opinions from the field and review the methodology and system of the FOCAL process primarily based on the following viewpoints.

- Synchronization of planning cycle and cycle of municipal administration: The municipal administration has a cycle of four years in tune with the mayoral election. The feasibility of matching between this cycle and the planning cycle using the FOCAL process should be examined. Even though, as it is undesirable to examine a municipal development strategy from a short-term viewpoint, a municipal development strategy may well be planned with a target period of 8 - 10 years in mind while the target period of PIMA is restricted to four years.²⁵ In this way, it is hoped that each municipal government will steadily implement its own PDM based on its own commitment. As the application of the FOCAL process to municipal planning every four years becomes routine, it can be expected that the culture of

²⁵ In this case, it is suggested that the first year of the current municipal administration be used for planning with the PIMA to be implemented in the following four years (remaining three years of the current municipal administration in the office and first year of the next administration).

planning, periodic monitoring of changes of the socioeconomic conditions, and mastering and increased efficiency of the planning work due to repetition will smoothly progress. Meanwhile, simplification of the methodology of the FOCAL process poses a challenge to change the current situation where much manpower and cost are required for surveying and planning work. In the case where planning work is conducted throughout the country every four years, it is necessary to have a system in place to enable the SDHJGD and AMs to adequately assist municipalities.

- Guidelines for plan renewal: The compilation of guidelines to analyze changes of the socioeconomic conditions and needs by comparing the results of multiple LBs and accurately reflect the analysis results into new plans. It is also necessary to determine where to describe the results of such analysis in PDC or PDM. Furthermore, a method to conduct LB at the time of plan renewal (scope of indicators to be renewed, utilization of past survey results, etc.) should be examined.

- Simplification and improved efficiency: The elimination of duplication on survey formats and the simplification/integration of the work format should be examined along with simplification of the work of which the necessity is not strong. Based on the experience so far of each municipality, inventive ideas and know-how to efficiently conduct surveys/work should be shared.

- Secured quality of the plan: The quality of a plan formulated using the FOCAL process is believed to be determined by the quality of the resident participation and composition of the team of municipal staff in charge.²⁶ It is desirable that the SDHJGD issues clear guidelines in this respect and that information to help the SDHJGD verify such quality when evaluating and approving the PDM is included in the PDM document.

- Review of indicators: It is believed to be useful to communalize the indicators related to the FOCAL process to those used by national organizations in individual fields from the viewpoint of analyzing the degree of contribution by the FOCAL process to national targets and also of facilitating the coordination of planning with national programs.

- Cost effectiveness: Adding of the viewpoint of cost effectiveness to the process of

²⁶ What are required to be checked regarding resident participation are (i) the participation of officials of the residents' association, representatives of communal organizations and representatives of educational and health care sectors, (ii) the balanced participation of political party representatives and (iii) a reasonable ratio (not too small) of participating residents against the total number of residents. It is desirable for the municipal team to include technical staff members with experience and knowledge of the social, economic and technical aspects of PDM.

examining the priority ranking of projects should be considered.

(2) Consolidation of human resources to operate the FOCAL process

The Municipality Planning Unit of the SDHJGD is required to maintain the current well-experienced staff and also to improve its manpower level so that it can adequately supervise and support the operation of the FOCAL process (surveys, planning and project implementation) by AMs and municipalities. This Unit should make efforts to help the establishment of a dedicated section to the FOCAL process (Municipal Planning Section) in all municipalities. The Unit should also endeavor to develop human resources at the municipality level by means of dispatching staff members as lecturers to the remote education program of the SETCAM to develop specialist personnel and/or recommending those staff members of AMs or municipalities who are well-experienced with the FOCAL process as lecturers.

(3) Others

It is necessary for the SDHJGD to make the following efforts with a view to further enhancing the positive impacts of the FOCAL process.

- The SDHJGD should enhance the training targeting mayors (current and candidate) and municipal assembly members in collaboration with the AMHON, AMs for the purpose of firmly establishing a culture of planning in the municipal administration and facilitating adequate resident participation, and should also examine public relations activities targeting residents.
- In view of the fact that both the Life Improvement Approach and the Project Executed by Community (PEC) can significantly benefit from the advantages of the FOCAL process, the SDHJGD should provide sufficient training, including the sharing of good practices, for AMs and municipalities with a view to widely disseminating them.
- The SDHJGD should analyze the causes of the delayed disbursement of the central government grant to municipalities and implement adequate measures so that the public investment projects planned in PDM are steadily implemented. The SDHJGD should also examine the flexible handling of the item-wise budgetary proportion of the central government grant reflecting the improvement of the planning capacity of municipalities.

4.2.2 Recommendations to JICA

JICA should monitor the implementation situation of the above recommendations made to the SDHJGD and urge the SDHJGD to actually implement them. JICA should bear these recommendations in mind in its future technical cooperation for the FOCAL process.

4.3 Lessons Learned

Continuation of technical cooperation for creation and dissemination of a model

The previous technical cooperation developed a model for the FOCAL process which was then disseminated nationwide under the Project and succeeding technical cooperation. The following factors can be pointed out for this.

- Because the planning method required by the local administration was developed (conformity with the needs) in the previous technical cooperation and achieved a visible outcome in some areas (demonstration of its usefulness), interest in the FOCAL process increased on the part of the central government, AMs and municipalities throughout the country.
- There was long-term technical continuity as the Chief Advisor and principal local consultant were involved in the process throughout the previous technical cooperation and the Project for nearly 10 years.
- The continuous appealing by the JICA Honduras Office of the usefulness of the FOCAL process to the Government of Honduras and other donors pushed forward the institutionalization of the FOCAL process.

Based on the experience described above, what appear to be important in a technical cooperation project which aims at creating and disseminating a model are (i) demonstration of the usefulness of the model conforming to the actual needs and wide sharing of its outcomes to develop momentum for its dissemination, (ii) maintaining the continuity of the technical aspect even in the case of long-term assistance, and (iii) systematic and continual working on decision-makers and those with influence regarding policies when the institutionalization of a model is aimed at.

Roles of the JICA overseas office in the preparatory period for technical cooperation

For a period of one year from the termination of the previous technical cooperation to the commencement of the Project together with the SDHJGD which was the new implementing agency for the Project, the person in charge of the FOCAL process at the JICA Honduras Office had repeated meetings with his counterparts at the SDHJGD as preparatory work to equip these counterparts with sufficient knowledge and experience of the FOCAL process. This is believed to have led to the swift and efficient implementation of the Project.

The lesson here is that when a period of interruption occurs with continuous technical cooperation projects, especially when a new implementing agency and/or new counterpart personnel are planned, it is desirable to consider it as a preparatory period for the sharing of as much information as possible with the prospective counterparts in order to enhance their motivation prior to the commencement of the actual technical cooperation.